CITY OF SAVANNAH HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

PETITIONER: David A. Levy & Associates

345 Springside Drive Akron, OH 44333

FILE NUMBER: 13-000382-COA

ADDRESS: 38 Montgomery Street

PIN: 2-0016-15-006

ZONING: B-C-1 (central business)

DATE: February 13, 2013

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting approval to replace the existing windows and doors on the ground floor and for new signage at the property located at 38 Montgomery Street.

Windows and Doors

Montgomery Street

All existing brick arched openings on the Montgomery Street façade will be repaired, in-kind, as necessary. There are nine (9) existing arched openings along this façade with existing wood framing at the perimeter and across the arch, creating transom areas. All of this wood will be removed, but the size and location of the transom areas will remain the same.

The third opening from the north will be the new main entrance doors. The custom six panel paired entrance doors will be six feet wide by nine feet high (6'x9'), constructed of solid reclaimed wood with a clear finish. The hardware is custom metal in a signature tree branch design. The door frame is wood with a solid wood raised panel in the transom. The panel/frame is set back four and one-half inches $(4\frac{1}{2}')$ from the face of the building.

Six (6) of the openings will have custom wood framed clear glazed picture windows, six feet wide by seven feet-five inches high (6'x7'-5''). The frame will have solid wood raised panels on both sides and across the base. The panels on either side are approximately six inches (6'') wide, the base is one foot-seven inches high (1'-7''), and a solid wood raised panel in the transom. The panel/frame is set back four and one-half inches $(4 \frac{1}{2}'')$ from the face of the building.

Staff Recommendation - Petition David A. Levy & Associates File No. 13-000382-COA February 13, 2013 Page 2

The remaining two (2) openings will be the same as the above six (6) openings except the transom will have a wood framed clear glazed picture window. The frame is set back five and one-quarter inches (5 $\frac{1}{4}$ ") from the face of the building.

All new wood window and door framing elements and panels are to be painted "Benjamin Moore, HC168 Chelsea Grey."

West Congress Street

The first level of the façade will be painted to match the color of the existing stucco on the levels above. Two (2) of the seven (7) existing window/door openings will be infilled with material to match existing. The remaining five (5) openings will be infilled with custom made picture windows. The three (3) openings with existing sills on the west end of the façade will have clear laminated glass with clear-coated one inch (1") hot rolled steel frames. The two (2) openings on the east end of the façade will have clear laminated glass with clear-coated one inch (1") hot rolled steel frames and continuous one foot (1') high hot rolled steel plate base. The frames will be set back approximately eight inches (8") from the face of the building.

West Congress Lane

Translucent "Decolite, MT-200-X" window film will be applied to the existing double-hung windows on the second level.

Signage Package

The applicant is requesting approval for a principal use projecting sign, a building identification sign, and window signs.

Principal Use Projecting Sign

Location: The double-sided sign will be located at the northwest corner of

the building on the Montgomery Street façade. The business maintains 90 linear feet of frontage along Montgomery Street and 60 linear feet of frontage along West Congress Street. Ten (10') feet of clearance above the pedestrianway is provided. The sign projects two feet-six inches (2'-6") from the face of the building.

Text: The sign reads: "ANTHROPOLOGIE" in eight inch (8") high one-

quarter (1/4") thick HRS (steel) letters.

Size: The sign is two feet wide by 13 feet high for a total of 26 square

feet.

Materials/Mounting: The sign is framed by two inch (2") wide and four inch (4") thick

steel, the sign background material is three-eighths (3/8") inch wire glass, and the letters are pin attached to the wire glass in materials as described above under "Text." The sign is mounted to the side

Staff Recommendation - Petition David A. Levy & Associates

File No. 13-000382-COA

February 13, 2013

Page 3

of the building with three inch (3") diameter HRS (steel) sleeve

standoffs at the top, middle, and bottom of the sign.

Colors: Frame: Black

Background: Clear glass with imbedded wire

Text: Brass finish

Lighting: Internally concealed LED flat strip perimeter lighting inside the

HRS (steel) sign frame.

Building Identification Projecting Sign

Location: The sign will be located on the Montgomery Street façade to the

south of the main entrance. It is located three feet-ten inches (3'-10") above the pedestrianway to the bottom of the sign and projects approximately one inch (1") from the face of the building.

Text: The sign reads: "ANTHROPOLOGIE."

Size: The sign is two feet-three and three-eighths inches (2'-3 3/8") wide

by 18 inches high for a total of 3.5 square feet.

Materials/Mounting: The sign will be constructed from an 11 gauge hot rolled steel

panel with a clear coat finish. The text will be laser cut in to the sign face. It will be attached to the face of the building with four

(4) brass sleeve standoffs and fasteners at each corner.

Lighting: The sign will not be lit.

Window Signs

Six (6) white vinyl decals reading: "ANTHROPOLOGIE" will be adhered to the interior face of the display windows along Montgomery and West Congress Streets. They are two inches high by two feet-nine-inches wide for a total of one-half square foot each.

BACKGROUND:

The historic building, located at 38 Montgomery Street, was constructed in 1855 and is a rated structure with the Savannah National Historic Landmark District. A rehabilitation project was approved by the Historic District Board of Review on May 13, 2009 [File No. H-09-4134-2]. This work includes window repair/replacement, stucco repairs, pressure washing, and repairs to the stone lintels. The majority of the work appears to be complete. Another project was approved on October 14, 2009 [File No. H-09-4134-2], for alterations and an addition, but this work never commenced.

Limited historic research by staff did not locate any historic photographs of the building.

Staff Recommendation - Petition David A. Levy & Associates File No. 13-000382-COA February 13, 2013 Page 4

FINDINGS:

The following standards from the *Historic District Section* (8-3030) of the City of Savannah zoning ordinance, the *Historic District Sign Section* (8-3121) of the City Zoning Ordinance, and the Exempt Signs Section (8-3116) of the City Zoning Ordinance apply:

Section 8-3030

Preservation of historic structures within the historic district. An historic structure, and any outbuildings or any appurtenance related thereto, visible from a public street or lane, including but not limited to walls, fences, light fixtures, steps, paving, sidewalks, and signs, shall only be moved, reconstructed, altered, or maintained in a manner that will preserve the historical and exterior architectural feature of the historic structure or appurtenance thereto and are consistent with the current edition of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation published by the U.S. Department of the Interior. The visual compatibility factors and the design standards shall apply.

For the purposes of this section, exterior architectural features shall include but not be limited to the architectural style, scale, general design, and general arrangement of the exterior of the structure, including the kind and texture of the building material, the type and style of all roofs, windows, doors and signs. In considering proposals for the exterior alterations of historic structures in the historic district the documented original design of the structure may be considered.

Applicable Secretary's Standards:

2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

The standard is met. The only potentially historic materials proposed to be removed are the window frames; these are not distinctive materials that could alter the character of the property.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

The standard is met. The only potentially historic materials proposed to be removed are the window frames; these are not distinctive materials that could alter the character of the property.

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

The standard is met. The original entry doors and ground floor windows no longer exist and were replaced long ago with modern storefront. Historic images could not be located that document

Staff Recommendation - Petition David A. Levy & Associates File No. 13-000382-COA February 13, 2013 Page 5

the original design but the entry door location is consistent with documentation that indicated Montgomery Street as the main address. Therefore, Montgomery Street would be the historic location of the building's main entry doors.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The standard is met. The proposed doors and windows will not destroy historic materials and the design differentiates them from the old, yet are still compatible with historic materials, features, size, scale, proportion, and massing.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in a such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The standard is met. The proposed doors and windows can be removed in the future without impairing the essential form and integrity of the building.

Visual Compatibility Factors:

Relationship of materials, texture, and color. The relationship of materials, textures, and color of the façade of a structure shall be visually compatible with the predominate materials, textures, and colors used on contributing structures to which the structure is Visually Related.

The standards are met.

Design Standards:

Entrances.

A building on a tithing block shall locate its primary entrance to front the east-west street.

The standard does not apply. Per section (l), (1) of the ordinance: "In considering proposals for the exterior alterations of historic structures in the historic district the documented original design of the structure may be considered." This building's primary entrance, per the Sanborn Maps, historically faced Montgomery Street, and still does today based on the more elaborate architectural detailing found on the Montgomery Street façade.

Commercial Storefronts.

Retail storefront area glazing shall be not less than 55 percent. Such glazing shall be transparent; provided, however, black glass may be used in the sign area above the

Staff Recommendation - Petition David A. Levy & Associates File No. 13-000382-COA February 13, 2013 Page 6

storefront window transoms. Storefront glazing shall extend from the sill or from an 18 to 24 inch tall base of contrasting material, to the lintel.

Staff recommends that the height of the steel bases on the West Congress Street be increased to a minimum of 18 inches high to meet the above standard.

Storefront glazing in subdivided sashes shall be inset a minimum of four inches from the face of the building;...

The standard is met.

Section 8-3121

Sign clearance and height. Adequate sign clearance shall be provided to assure that pedestrian or vehicular traffic movements and safety are not adversely affected. Minimum clearance shall not be less than ten feet above pedestrianways nor less than 15 feet above areas utilized by motorized vehicles. Maximum sign heights shall be provided as follows:

Facia and projecting signs shall be erected only on the signable area of the structure and shall not project over the roofline or parapet wall elevation of the structure.

The standards are met.

Lighted signs. Lighted signs of an enclosed lamp, neon or exposed fluorescent design are not permitted within any "R" zoning district. However such lighted signs, except for those of exposed fluorescent design, are permitted within the nonresidential zoning districts. Such signs shall be in scale and harmony with the surrounding structures and open spaces. The use of reversed silhouette or "cut-out" letters is encouraged to reduce glare where back lighting is applied.

The standards are met.

Building identification sign. Building identification signs shall be permitted along the signable area of each building facade. The maximum aggregate size of such signs shall not exceed an area of one-half square foot per linear foot of building frontage; provided, however, that the aggregate size of such signs along a single facade shall not exceed an area of 30 square feet within the residential zoning districts nor 90 square feet for the balance of the historic district.

The standards are met. The permitted square footage is 45 square feet and the proposed is 3.5 square feet.

Principal use sign requirements. Except as provided in subsection (15) below, for each nonresidential use, one principal use sign shall be permitted. Such sign shall not exceed a size of more than one square foot of sign area per linear foot of frontage along a given street or shall meet the following size requirements whichever is the most restrictive:

Staff Recommendation - Petition David A. Levy & Associates File No. 13-000382-COA February 13, 2013

Page 7

Location	Maximum Sign	Maximum Size	Maximum Projection of
	Area for Facia Sign	Area for Projecting	Outer Sign Edge for
	(sq. ft.)	or Freestanding	Projecting or
		Sign (sq. ft.)	Freestanding Signs (feet)
All "R" zoning	(1)20	12	5 **
districts			
All nonresidential	40*	30*	6 **
zoning districts			

^{**} Provided that no portion of a sign shall be erected within 2 feet of a curbline.

The standards are met. The permitted square footage is 30 square feet and the proposed is 26 square feet. The maximum projection permitted is six feet (6') and the proposed is two feet-six inches (2'-6").

Section 8-3116.

Window signs on or within windows relating to the business conducted within ... provided no greater than ten percent of any window area is utilized for such signs.

The proposed windows signs are exempt.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

<u>Approval</u> to replace the existing windows and doors on the ground floor and for new signage at the property located at 38 Montgomery Street <u>with the condition</u> that the height of the steel bases on the West Congress Street be increased to a minimum of 18 inches high.

SPW: lgm