

**CITY OF SAVANNAH
HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW
REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

PETITIONER: Drew Hill
Hill/Gray Seven, LLC
1350 City View Center
Oviedo, FL 32765

FILE NUMBER: 13-003840-COA

ADDRESS: 540 East Oglethorpe Avenue

PIN: 2-0005 -31-004

ZONING: RIP-A (residential, medium density)

STAFF REVIEWER: Leah G. Michalak

DATE: October 9, 2013

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting approval of alterations and signs for the building located at 540 East Oglethorpe Street as follows:

General:

On the west end of the site, a 23 foot wide section of the building will be completely removed (demolished). The existing building lot coverage is 68.3 percent. With this portion of the building removed, the building lot coverage will be 54.5 percent. The existing curb cut along East Oglethorpe Avenue will be removed. The existing curb cut along Houston Street will be expanded to provide two (2) 12 foot wide drives – one for entering the parking area and one for exiting the parking area.

Existing Building:

The west and south facades of the concrete block building will receive new stucco with a “limestone” finish in “Dover Sky.” Precast stone will be added to the building for a cornice, pilasters, a continuous water table/sill around the building, and window headers. The precast stone will have a light sandblasted finish in “Aspen White.” The cornice will be capped with an aluminum “dark bronze” flashing. A new gray TPO roof will be installed; because of the existing parapet wall, the roof will only be visible from East York Lane at the north side. The new mechanical units will be installed on the roof, behind the parapet wall, and will be visible from the lane. The mechanical units will be 50 inches high and screened with corrugated vertical metal panels in a “dark bronze” finish that are a minimum of 60 inches high. The existing brick façade

on the north (lane) elevation will be painted to match the color of the stucco proposed on the west and south elevations.

West (Houston Street) Façade:

The existing building will receive a new façade on the west elevation, where a portion of the building was removed. New glass block transom windows will be added to match the existing glass block transom windows along East Oglethorpe Ave. The façade will be divided into five (5) architectural bays through the use of the precast stone pilasters. Each bay will have aluminum storefront, “YKK AP Pro Tex Storefront System,” with a dark bronze finish. The center bay will have an entrance door centered within the bay.

All of the bays will have aluminum canopies over each storefront bay in a clear anodized finish. The canopies will be suspended from the top with aluminum poles and plates at the walls.

The center canopies will extend six feet (6') from the face of the building and be nine feet-six inches (9'-6") above the sidewalk. The four (4) flanking canopies will extend four feet (4') from the face of the building and be nine feet-six inches (9'-6") above the sidewalk. Gooseneck light fixtures with a “galvanized” finish by Barn Light Electric will be located at the center of every pilaster. They will extend 24 inches from the face of the building to the center of the fixture and be eight feet (8') above the sidewalk.

South (East Oglethorpe Avenue) Façade:

This façade will be divided into five (5) architectural bays through the use of the precast stone pilasters. Each bay will have aluminum storefront, “YKK AP Pro Tex Storefront System,” with a dark bronze finish. The two easternmost bays will have entrance doors. All bays will have aluminum canopies over each storefront bay in a clear anodized finish. The canopies will be suspended from the top with aluminum poles and plates at the walls. They will extend four feet (4') from the face of the building and be nine feet-six inches (9'-6") above the sidewalk. Gooseneck light fixtures with a “dark bronze” finish by Barn Light Electric will be located at the center of every pilaster. They will extend 24 inches from the face of the building to the center of the fixture and be eight feet (8') above the sidewalk. The existing glass block windows are deteriorated beyond repair and will be replaced in-kind.

North (East York Lane) Façade:

This façade will receive two (2) new door openings. The doors will be flush hollow metal with metal frames, will be dark bronze in color, and will be inset four inches (4") from the face of the building. Seven (7) downspouts will be equally spaced across this façade. Both the gutters and downspouts will be pre-finished aluminum in dark bronze. The electric service will be located on the northwest corner of this façade.

Fences

East Oglethorpe Avenue: A continuous fence is proposed along East Oglethorpe Avenue, in front of the parking area. The fence is six feet high (6') with an 18 inch high stucco base. The stucco

will be “Dover Sky” with a limestone finish. The stucco base will have a four inch (4”) precast stone cap in “Aspen White.” The fence will have four (4), equally spaced, 18 inch square stucco piers with a four inch (4”) precast stone cap in “Aspen White.” Between the piers, on top of the stucco base, will be an aluminum fence with decorative picket caps in a “dark bronze” finish.

Houston Street: Three (3) fence sections, between and flanking the entrance and exit drives to the parking area, are proposed along Houston Street. The fence is six feet high (6’) with an 18 inch high stucco base. The stucco will be “Dover Sky” with a limestone finish. The stucco base will have a four inch (4”) precast stone cap in “Aspen White.” The fence sections are flanked with 18 inch square stucco piers with a four inch (4”) precast stone cap in “Aspen White.” Between the piers, on top of the stucco base, will be an aluminum fence with decorative picket caps in a “dark bronze” finish. The entrance and exit drives will have sliding metal gates by Duraweld Metalworks, in dark bronze, that compliment the design of the adjacent fences.

Dumpster Enclosure: A 12 foot deep by 17 foot wide dumpster is located at the northwest corner of the property. It will be enclosed on the rear and sides with an eight foot high (8’) stucco wall in “Dover Sky” with a limestone finish and have an eight inch (8”) precast stone cap in “Aspen White.” The front will have double gates constructed from metal panels (to match the design of the mechanical screening) to a “dark bronze” finish.

Signage

Two (2) principal use fascia signs are proposed on the building as follows:

Location: One sign will be located at the east end of the East Oglethorpe Street façade and one sign will be located on the Houston Street façade, centered on the façade. The business maintains 98 feet-nine inches along Oglethorpe and 90 feet along Houston Street.

Size: The signs are two feet high by 10 feet wide for a total of 20 square feet each.

Materials/Mounting: The signs are constructed from an aluminum framed sign box with an acrylic sign face. The background will be an opaque dark bronze and the letters will be translucent white. They will be mounted to the building with L-brackets, screwed through the face of the building.

Lighting: The letters on the sign faces will be illuminated.

FINDINGS:

This petition was reviewed and continued at the September 11, 2013 HDBR meeting for the petitioner to consider the following (the petitioner’s response are bolded):

1. Change the color of the proposed TPO roof from white to a more neutral color that will blend in with the building. **The color has been changed to “Gray” to better blend with the building. See sheets A-1, A-3, and included physical sample.**
2. Provide clarification on the height of the mechanical screening. Ensure that it will screen the entire unit. **The roof top units will be a total of 50 inches tall and the mechanical screening will be a minimum of 60 inches tall, which will fully conceal the units. This is clarified on sheets A-1, A-2, and the included roof top unit cut-sheet.**
3. Increase the distance from the bottom of the light fixtures to eight feet (8') clear above the sidewalk. **The bottoms of the light fixtures have been raised to be eight feet (8') clear above the sidewalk.**
4. Ensure that the new doors on the north (lane) façade are inset not less than three inches (3") from the face of the building. **The new doors on the north (lane) façade are now inset four inches (4") from the face of the building. See detail 5/A-4.**
5. Ensure that the proposed four inch (4") setback for the new glass block windows on the Houston Street facade matches the setback of the existing glass block windows on the East Oglethorpe façade. **The new glass block windows will be inset a minimum of four inches (4") from the face of the building. See detail 6/A-4.**
6. Reduce the height of the “walk-under canopy” addition on the Houston Street façade to be subordinate to the main structure. **The “walk-under canopy” addition has been removed and replaced with a metal awning to match all of the other new awnings.**
7. Relocate the entrance to the parking area to be from the lane instead of Houston Street, and provide a continuous fence along Houston Street
*If the above condition is met, the following conditions will not apply:
 - Provide a continuous wall of enclosure along Houston Street in front of the parking area (examples: sliding gates, more fence section, etc.)
 - Ensure that the sidewalks extend across the entrances driveways on Houston Street, and serve as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration, and height. **A continuous wall of enclosure has been added along Houston Street by utilizing sliding metal gates at the entrance drives. These gates will remain open during normal business hours. The sidewalks along Houston Street are existing and currently serve as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveways.**
8. Reduce the additional decoration applied to the exterior even further, including: the pilasters, canopies, cornice, and change the walk-under entrance addition to a metal canopy. **The additional decoration applied to the exterior was reduced to better reflect the desired mid-century look of the building. This includes reducing the size**

of the cornice and simplifying its design, removing the “walk-under canopy,” and the pilasters were reduced in height to terminate at the top of the glass block windows to better emphasize the horizontal nature of the building.

9. The mid-century spirit of the building is not longer apparent with this design. Appears more as a 1980s Post-Modern style building. **We made revisions to the design to better emphasize the mid-century spirit of the building by: reducing the size of the cornice and simplifying its design, removing the “walk-under canopy,” and the pilasters were reduced in height to terminate at the top of the glass block windows to better emphasize the horizontal nature of the building.**
10. The new pilasters that continue all the way up the façade interrupt the inherent horizontality of the building’s design. Simplify the pilasters and stop them at the top of the glass block windows. **The pilasters were reduced in height to terminate at the top of the glass block windows to better emphasize the horizontal nature of the building, the “walk-under canopy” was removed and replaced with a metal awning, and the pilasters were also simplified by removing the decorative capital and terminating at a simple banding instead.**
11. The cornice design, like the proposed banding, needs to be more delicate. **The cornice design was decreased in size and simplified to be more delicate and similar to that of the proposed banding.**
12. Center the entrance door on Houston Street. **The drawings have been revised to locate the exterior door at the center of the building/opening on Houston Street.**

The following standards from the *Historic District Section (8-3030) of the City of Savannah Zoning Ordinance* and the *Historic District Sign Section (8-3121) of the City Zoning Ordinance* apply:

Section 8-3030

Visual compatibility factors.

Proportion of openings. *The relationship of the width of the windows to height of windows within a structure shall be visually compatible to the contributing structures to which the structure is Visually Related.*

Rhythm of solids to voids in front facades. *The relationship of solids to voids in the facades visible from the public right-of-way of a structure shall be visually compatible with the contributing structures to which the structure is Visually Related.*

Rhythm of entrance and/or porch projection. *The relationship of entrances, porch projections, and walkways to structures shall be visually compatible with the contributing structures to which they are Visually Related.*

Relationship of materials, texture and color. *The relationship of materials, texture and color of the facade of a structure shall be visually compatible with the predominate materials, textures, and colors used on contributing structures to which the structure is Visually Related.*

Scale of a building. *The mass of a structure and size of windows, door openings, porches column spacing, stairs, balconies and additions shall be visually compatible with the contributing structures to which the structure is Visually Related.*

The standards are met. The proposed alterations to the existing non-historic commercial building are visually compatible with other mid-century, one-story commercial buildings within the district.

Walls of continuity. *Appurtenances of a structure such as walls, wrought iron, fences shall form consistent walls of enclosure along a street.*

The standard is met. The fences and gates along both street fronts form consistent walls of enclosure along the streets.

Design standards.

Entrances. *Building entrance locations shall comply with the following:*

Location.

A building on a tithing block shall locate its primary entrance to front the east-west street.

Staff recommends approval. The primary entrance fronts the parking area and Houston Street, which is the north-south connecting street. However, secondary entrances have been added to face East Oglethorpe Avenue, which is the east-west through street.

Placement. *Door frames shall be inset not less than three (3) inches from the exterior surface of the façade of a building, excluding façades with wood siding.*

The standard is met. The new door openings long the lane are inset four inches (4") from the exterior surface of the building.

Materials

Permitted: Doors shall be made of wood, clad wood, glass, or steel. For commercial storefronts see Section (n)(7).

Prohibited: Vinyl doors; steel-pressed doors simulating wood grain; half-moon, semi-circular, diamond or similar glass insets in doors; boarded-up doors or entrance ways.

The standard is met. The new doors proposed on the north (lane) elevation are steel.

Windows, Shutters, and Commercial Storefronts. *The following standards shall apply to all development.*

Windows

Windows facing a street shall be double or triple hung, awning, casement or Palladian.

Staff recommends approval of the proposed glass block transom windows proposed on the Houston Street façade because they match the existing glass block transom windows on the East Oglethorpe façade scheduled to be replaced in-kind.

Window sashes shall be inset not less than three inches from the exterior facade of a building, excluding exterior surfaces with wood siding.

The standard is met. The new glass block windows are inset four inches (4") from the exterior face of the building.

Commercial Storefronts

Storefront windows and doors

Storefront glazing in subdivided sashes shall be inset a minimum of four inches from the face of the building; ...

The standard is met. The proposed storefronts are subdivided and are inset four inches (4") to the framing from the face of the building.

Materials

Storefronts shall be constructed of wood, cast iron, Carrera glass, aluminum, steel or copper as part of a glazed storefront system; bronze, wood, masonry, glazed brick or tile as a base for the storefront.

The standard is met. The proposed storefront is constructed from aluminum.

Awnings. *Awnings within the public right-of-way may be permitted with the approval of the encroachment by the Mayor and Aldermen and provided that the following criteria are met:*

Awnings extending above the public right-of-way shall have a minimum vertical clearance of eight feet (8') above the sidewalk.

Non-residential awnings shall be constructed of canvas, other equivalent cloth, metal, or glass.

Awnings shall be integrated structurally and architecturally into the design of the façade ...

The following shall be prohibited:

A single continuous awning that connects two buildings.

Back-lit or internally lit awnings.

The standards are met.

Roofs. *Roofs shall comply with the following:*

Parapets shall have a string course and a coping.

The standard is met.

Roofs shall be covered with standing seam metal, slate, tile or asphalt shingles.

Staff recommends approval of the proposed TPO roof because it is behind a parapet wall, is a gray color to be compatible with the building, and is only visible from the lane.

Fences, Trellises and Walls. *Fences, trellises and walls shall comply with the following:*

Fences, trellises and walls shall not extend beyond the facade of the front elevation...

The height of any fence, trellis, or wall shall not exceed 11 feet or the maximum permitted in Section 8-3051.

Walls and fences facing a public street shall be constructed of the material and color of the primary building; provided, however, iron fencing may be used with a masonry structure.

A masonry base shall be used with iron fencing.

The standards are met.

Parking Areas. *Parking areas shall comply with the standards set forth in Section 8-3081 through Section 8-3083 and the following:*

Access to parking shall be from lanes or north-south service streets. When a property does not front a lane or north-south service street, parking may be accessed from east-west connecting streets or trust streets.

Curb cuts shall be permitted only where access to a lane does not exist.

Staff recommends approval of the parking access from Houston Street, which is a north-south service street, even though there is lane access to this site because:

1. They are removing street access from Oglethorpe Avenue.
2. The access from Houston Street is existing.
3. If the parking is accessed from the lane, they cannot meet their off-street parking requirements.
4. They have walls of continuity (fences and gates) along both streets.

Curb cuts shall not exceed 20 feet in width.

The standard is met. The proposed curb cuts along Houston Street are 12 feet wide each.

Where intersected by a new driveway, the sidewalk shall serve as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration, and height.

The standard is met. The sidewalk and access drives along Houston Street are existing and currently serve as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway.

Service Areas, Utilities and Mechanical Systems. *Service Areas, Utilities and Mechanical Systems shall comply with the following:*

Electrical vaults, meter boxes, and communications devices shall be located on secondary and rear facades and shall be minimally visible from view.

HVAC units shall be screened from the public right-of-way.

Refuse storage areas shall be located within a building or shall be screened from the public right-of-way.

The standards are met.

Section 8-3121

Sign clearance and height. *Maximum sign heights shall be provided as follows:*

Facia and projecting signs shall be erected only on the signable area of the structure and shall not project over the roofline or parapet wall elevation of the structure.

The standards are met.

Lighted signs. *Lighted signs of an enclosed lamp, neon or exposed fluorescent design are not permitted within any "R" zoning district. However such lighted signs, except for those of exposed fluorescent design, are permitted within the nonresidential zoning districts. Such signs shall be in scale and harmony with the surrounding structures and open spaces. The use of reversed silhouette or "cut-out" letters is encouraged to reduce glare where back lighting is applied.*

The standard is met. The sign uses "cut-out" letters.

Principal use sign requirements. *Except as provided in subsection (15) below, for each nonresidential use, one principal use sign shall be permitted. Such sign shall not exceed a size of more than one square foot of sign area per linear foot of frontage along a given street or shall meet the following size requirements whichever is the most restrictive:*

Location	Maximum Sign Area for Facia Sign (sq. ft.)	Maximum Size Area for Projecting or Freestanding Sign (sq. ft.)	Maximum Projection of Outer Sign Edge for Projecting or Freestanding Signs
All "R" zoning districts	(1)20	12	5 **

Staff Recommendation - Petition of Drew Hill for Hill/Drew Seven, LLC
540 East Oglethorpe Avenue
File No. 13-003840-COA
October 9, 2013
Page 10

All nonresidential zoning districts	40*	30*	6 **
-------------------------------------	-----	-----	---------

The standards are met.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approval of alterations and signs for the building located at 540 East Oglethorpe Street because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the design standards.

EIH: lgm