

Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room April 11, 2018 1:00 P.M. Meeting Minutes

APRIL 11, 2018 SAVANNAH HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW REGULAR MEETING

A Pre-Meeting will be held at 12:00 PM in the Jerry Surrency Conference Room, 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda will be presented by Staff, as time permits, and the Board may ask questions. No testimony will be received and no votes will be taken.

Members Present: Becky Lynch, Chair

Dwayne Stephens, Vice-Chair

David Altschiller Debra Caldwell Scott Cook Jennifer Deacon Kevin Dodge Kellie Fletcher Mic Matson Melissa Memory Nan Taylor

MPC Staff Present: Ellen Harris, Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation

Leah Michalak, Senior Historic Preservation Planner Sara Farr-Newman, Historic Preservation Planner Alyson Smith, historic Preservation Planner Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

1. Call to Order and Welcome

Ms. Lynch called the meeting to order at 1:05 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. She outlined the role of the Historic District Board of Review and explained the process for hearing the various petitions. Staff will present each application with a recommendation. The petitioner will have the opportunity to respond to the recommendation. The petitioners are asked to limit their presentation to 10 minutes or less and only address the items identified as inconsistent with the ordinance and questions raised by the Board. The public will have the same allotted time, 10 minutes, to comment. The petitioner will be given the opportunity to respond to the public comments.

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

2. C1 - Approve all Consent Agenda items

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the Consent Agenda Items

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens Second: Melissa Memory

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye - Abstain Becky Lynch Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye David Altschiller - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

3. C2 - Petition of Jasper Design Services, LLC | 18-000916-COA | 519 East Gordon Street | New Construction, Part II: Design Details

- @18-000916-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- ∅ 1916 Sanborn Map.pdf
- Submittal Packet Drawings.pdf
- Submittal Packet Photographs.pdf
- Submittal Packet Mass Model.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for Part II, Design Details to add a second story dwelling to an existing one-story garage at the rear of the property located at 519 East Gordon Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.Ensure that the baluster spacing does not exceed 4 inches and another new post at the landing.
- 2. Provide the HVAC unit and refuse storage locations; ensure that they are screened from the public rights-of-way.
- 3. Provide specifications for the doors, windows, and standing seam metal roof. Ensure that the selected products meet all standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens Second: Melissa Memory

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye

4. C3 - Petition of SAI Entrepreneurs LLC | 18-001260-COA | 225 West Broughton Street | Sign: After-the-fact

- Photo.pdf
- Staff Recommendation.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for an under-awning sign at 225 West Broughton with the following conditions:

- -Reduce the size of the under-awning sign so that it does not exceed 6 square feet;
- -Provide at least 8 feet of clearance between the bottom edge of the sign and the sidewalk;
- -Remove the lighting under the awning;

Because otherwise the sign is visually compatible and meets the preservation standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens Second: Melissa Memory

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye - Abstain Becky Lynch Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

Mass - Carriage House

- Project Information 24 East Taylor Street 18-001475-COA.pdf
- Submittal Packet_.pdf
- Monterey Ward.pdf
- Historic Context Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps.pdf
- Aerial View.pdf
- Staff Recommendation.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass to construct a two-story carriage house at 24 East Taylor Street with the condition that additional information regarding the location of the electrical meters be submitted for review by the Board with Part II, Design Details, because otherwise the proposal is visually compatible and meets the design standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens Second: Melissa Memory

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

6. C5 - Petition of Ellsworth-Hallett Home Professionals | 18-001473-COA | 601 Whitaker Street | Alterations

- ∅ 18-001473-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Packet Photographs.pdf
- Submittal Packet Project Description, Drawings, and Details.pdf
- Context Sanborn Maps.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations to the property located at 601 Whitaker Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review

and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Provide color selections for the mechanical screening, shutters, stoop railing, and the garage doors.
- 2. Provide specifications for the garage doors and the shutters.
- 3. Provide a height for the stoop railing and a baluster detail.
- 4.Ensure that the new window is inset not less than 3 inches or matches the inset of the other existing windows.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens Second: Melissa Memory

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

7. C6 - Petition of Hansen Architects | 18-001474-COA | 110 Anne Street | Demolition

- Submittal Package.pdf
- Additional Pictures.pdf
- Staff Recommendation.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the demolition of 110 Ann Street with the following conditions:

- 1. The building is documented per the MPC Documentation Policy prior to demolition;
- 2.A demolition permit will not be issued until a COA is approved for the new building;

Because otherwise the work meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens Second: Melissa Memory

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

8. Adopt the April 11, 2018 Agenda

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby adopt the April 11, 2018 Agenda.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: David Altschiller

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- 9. Approve March 14, 2018 Briefing Minutes and March 14, 2018 Regular Meeting Minutes
 - March 14, 2018 HBR Briefing Minutes.docx
 - @ 03-14-2018 Minutes.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve March 14, 2018 Briefing Minutes and March 14, 2018 Regular Meeting Minutes.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Kevin Dodge	
Second: Dwayne Stephens	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

10. Continue All Items to Next Regular Meeting

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the items to the next regular agenda

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

11. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 15-001384-COA | 600 East Bay Street | New Construction: Part II, Design Details

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

12. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006851-COA | 620 East River Street (Hilton Hotel) | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

13. Petition of Gunn, Meyerhoff, Shay | 17-002122-COA | 620 East River Street (Hotel Anne) | New Construction Part 1: Height and Mass

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

14. Petition of Greenline Architecture | 17-002904-COA | 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested..

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

15. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects | 17-003634-COA | 300 and 326 West Bay Street | New Construction Hotel: Part I, Height and Mass

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

16. Petition of Studio Architects | 17-005582-COA | 601 Indian Street | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

17. Petition of General Services Administration | 17-006639-COA | 120 and 124 Barnard Street | New Construction Part 1: Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye - Abstain Becky Lynch Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

18. Petition of CED Architecture | 17-007046-COA | Berrien and Purse Streets | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye - Abstain Becky Lynch Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye - Aye Melissa Memory David Altschiller - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

19. Petition of Signs By James LLC | 18-000265-COA | 414 West Broughton Street | Sign

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

20. Petition of Cadman Designs | 18-000918-COA | 311 East Charlton Street | New Construction Carriage House: Part II, Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

VIII. REGULAR AGENDA

21. D1 - Petition of Dawn Jones | 18-000860-COA | 520 East Gwinnett Street | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Mercer Ward.pdf

- Aerial View.pdf
- Historic Context Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Context Photos.pdf
- Mass Model-Revised.pdf
- Sample Board Materials & Colors.pdf
- Drawings.pdf
- Staff Recommendation.pdf

Ms. Dawn Jones was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Smith gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for new construction, Part 2: Design Details, of a two-story, single family building at the vacant lot located at 520 East Gwinnett Street. The residence will orient south towards East Gwinnett Street. The building will feature front and rear covered stoops. The property does not have access to a lane. The building's front façade will be the only elevation that will be fully visible from the public right-of-way.

Ms. Smith stated that on March 14, 2007, the Historic District Board of Review approved Part I: Height and Mass, and Part II: Design Details for the new construction of a single family residence at 520 East Gwinnett Street [File No. H-07-3761-2]. The 2 ½ story building had a height of 32-feet and was proposed to be built at the 0-lot line with a stoop to encroach into the public right-of-way. The building was never constructed and differs in design from what is currently petitioned.

Ms. Smith explained that on March 14, 2018, the Historic District Board of Review approved Part 1: Height and Mass, for a two-story single family building at 520 East Gwinnett Street and recommended approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the second story building height design standard with the following conditions:

- 1. Align the face of the front stoop with the face of the adjacent stoop to the west; *The condition is met.*
- 2. Provide additional information regarding the location of electrical and meter boxes; The condition is met. The electrical and meter boxes will be located on the building's rear façade at the
 - 3. Ensure that the front portico's column capitals extend outward of the porch architrave and the distance between balusters does not exceed four inches:

The condition is met.

north elevation.

- 4. Obtain an encroachment permit from the City for the front stoop;
- 5. Ensure that a parking variance is obtained from the Zoning Board of Appeals for the absence of the required off-street parking space;

The owner is working towards meeting these conditions, and obtaining an encroachment permit from the City, and variances from the Zoning Board of Appeals for a parking variance, and a variance from the design standard that relates to the height of residential buildings and the exterior expression of the height of the second story.

Ms. Smith reported that staff recommends approval of the petition for new construction, Part 2: Design Details, of a two-story, single family building at the vacant lot located at 520 East Gwinnett Street with the following conditions to be reviewed by staff for approval:

- 1. Submit a revised brick specification that features a finished surface texture without an aged patina;
- 2. Submit a specification for the front door and transom window;
- 3. Ensure that the *Hardie* siding has a smooth finish, and that the columns are constructed of word or wood composite and feature base molding;
- 4. Ensure that the window muntins are no wider than 7/8 inch and that the muntin profiles simulate traditional putty glazing;
- 5. Ensure that the hog pen beneath the front stairs is inset at least one inch;

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room April 11, 2018 1:00 P.M. Meeting Minutes

- 6. Obtain an encroachment permit from the City for the front stoop;
- 7. Ensure that a parking variance is obtained from the Zoning Board of Appeals for the absence of the required off-street parking space;
- 8. Ensure that a variance is obtained from the Zoning Board of Appeals for the variance from the design standard that relates to the height of residential buildings and the exterior expression of the height of the second story;

Because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the design standards.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Ms. Jones stated that the brick to be used on the house was delivered to the office a few days ago. She asked if this was the brick that the Board just viewed.

Ms. Smith answered that they do have the brick, but there was a different specification that did not match the image that she received. She passed the brick to the Board for them to review it.

Ms. Lynch asked if this brick was the alternate selection.

Ms. Jones answered yes. She explained that she is on the ZBA's April 26, 2018 agenda for the variances. She also has an application for the encroachment that is being sent to the City Engineering Department.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for new construction, Part 2: Design Details, of a two-story, single family building at the vacant lot located at 520 East Gwinnett Street with the following conditions to be reviewed by staff for approval:

- 1. Submit a revised brick specification that features a finished surface texture without an aged patina;
- 2. Submit a specification for the front door and transom window;
- 3.Ensure that the Hardie siding has a smooth finish, and that the columns are constructed of word or wood composite and feature base molding;
- 4.Ensure that the window muntins are no wider than 7/8 inch and that the muntin profiles simulate traditional putty glazing;
- 5. Ensure that the hog pen beneath the front stairs is inset at least one inch;
- 6. Obtain an encroachment permit from the City for the front stoop;
- 7.Ensure that a parking variance is obtained from the Zoning Board of Appeals for the absence of the required off-street parking space;
- 8.Ensure that a variance is obtained from the Zoning Board of Appeals for the variance from the design standard that relates to the height of residential buildings and the exterior expression of the height of the second story;

Because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the design standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens Second: David Altschiller

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye

22. D2 - Petition of A. Thagne Schreyer | 18-000917-COA | 301 East Charlton Street | Alterations and Addition

- <u>∅</u> 18-000917-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Packet- revised drawings.pdf
- Project Description.pdf
- Submittal Package.pdf
- Context Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Construction Photos.pdf
- Context Photos.pdf

Mr. Thagne Schreyer was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Sara Farr-Newman gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for an addition and alterations at 301 East Charlton Street. The work includes an enclosed sun room and open deck addition on the rear of the building. The existing rear wall of the building is proposed to be rebuilt and stuccoed to match the existing wall. Other work includes a new roof, landscaping, and screening of existing mechanical equipment. Additionally, on the front façade of the house the existing stucco partition walls will be removed to show the original cast iron columns.

Ms. Farr-Newman explained that the application was continued on March 14, 2018 to address the following:

- -Provide additional construction details, particularly on the railings;
- -Reduce the overhang of the addition's roof;
- -Provide additional evidence to clarify which portions of the rear wall are historic.

Ms. Farr-Newman reported that staff recommends approval of the proposed alterations and addition with the following conditions to be reviewed approved by staff:

- 1. The roof overhang is reduced;
- 2. Reduce the railing height to 36";
- 3. Provide window specifications;

Because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Schreyer said regarding the overhang, as he stated at the last meeting, they are to reflect as much light as possible into the building. It is a dark house as a side wall is here. They want the house to be

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room
April 11, 2018 1:00 P.M.
Meeting Minutes

energy efficient. They have shown a quick scale model of the structure. The guardrail is three feet above the brick. The bottom rail system is below the height of the wall and is not visible from the public right-of-way. He stated that he did not really understand what is the problem with the system.

Ms. Lynch explained that the guidelines states that the railing be no taller than three feet.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussed the height of the railing and found that the height standard was met. The railing portion that extends above the floor is 36 inches and the bottom portion won't be visible. The Board also found the overhang to be visually compatible as proposed due to the contemporary nature of the addition and the fact that it differentiates the addition. Additionally, the applicant provided photos showing clearly which portions of the wall were historic and which were not.

The Board also requested additional details for the steel windows and connections for staff to review to ensure they meet the standards prior to construction.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition for the proposed addition and alterations at 301 East Charlton Street to address the following:

- 1.Provide addition design details including the structural details of the addition and the spacing of the baluster railings;
- 2.Provide additional evidence is provided to clarify which portions of the rear wall are historic.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Scott Cook Second: Mic Matson

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Nay Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye Dwayne Stephens - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye David Altschiller - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

23. D3 - Petition of Diversified Designs | 18-000920-COA | 312-314 West Gwinnett Street | New Construction, Part I and Part II

- ∅ 18-000920-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- @Gaston Ward.pdf

- Aerial January 2017.pdf
- March HDBR Meeting Drawings.pdf
- Submittal Packet Color Selections.pdf
- Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Submittal Packet Current Site Photographs.pdf
- Submittal Packet Context Photographs.pdf
- Submittal Packet Mass Model.pdf
- Submittal Packet Drawings.pdf
- Submittal Packet Rendering.pdf

Mr. Jeff Cramer was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass and Part II, Design Details of a two-story duplex along West Gwinnett Street known as 312-314 West Gwinnett Street. This is one part of a larger project consisting of six (6) buildings on the site which is a full city block from West Hall Lane on the north, Jefferson Street on the east, West Gwinnett Street on the south, and Montgomery Street on the west. The parcels were recombined and then subdivided into 15 individual lots with a shared parking lot in the center that is accessed from the lane.

Ms. Michalak explained that at the March 14, 2018 HDBR Meeting, the Board continued Part I, Height and Mass for this project in order for the petitioner to consider the following:

- 1. Increase the foundation height so that the building is more compatible with the height of the building on either side and so the building has better proportions.
- 2. Redesign the triple window to have a more compatible bay rhythm or add a box or bay window around the triple window.
- 3. Redesign the recessed 2-story front porch to be a more typical front stoop that projects forward of the front façade.
- 4. Reduce the balustrades to a maximum of 36 inches high.

Additionally, the Board determined that the petitioner could return to the April HDBR Meeting (this meeting) with both Part I and II for review.

Ms. Michalak reported that staff recommends approval for New Construction: Part I and Part II of a two-story duplex along West Gwinnett Street known as 312-314 West Gwinnett Street because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Cramer thanked the staff and Board for reviewing their petition. They believe they have addressed all the comments. Mr. Cramer said they are happy with the project. He entertained questions from the Board.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for New Construction: Part I and Part II of a two-story duplex along West Gwinnett Street known as 312-314 West Gwinnett Street because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Dwayne Stephens Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye David Altschiller - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

24. D4 - Petition of Bergmann Architects Engineers Planners | 18-001170-COA | 300 West Broughton Street | Alterations

- Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Ø 2018-03-21 Historic Board Submission Package.pdf
- Exterior Elevations 2018-03-21.pdf
- ∅ 03. Project Description.pdf
- Aerial View.pdf
- Historic Context Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps.pdf
- Historic Context Photos.pdf

Mr. Jonathan Braddock was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Smith gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval to make alterations to the mixed-use commercial building located at 300 West Broughton Street. These alterations include replacement of the storefront system along West Broughton Street, removal of the rolling coil door along Jefferson Street, in exchange for an open area with separate tenant entrances, and replacement of the terrazzo floor, where necessary, surrounding the primary entrance on West Broughton Street. The storefronts along Jefferson Street will not be altered. An existing elevator will be replaced, and new compressors and refrigeration equipment will be added to the roof.

Ms. Smith reported that staff recommends approval of the alterations at 300 West Broughton Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval:

- 1. Incorporate a storefront door to enclose the existing opening along Jefferson Street;
- 2. Preserve existing terrazzo flooring and submit a specification for infill flooring:
- 3. Revise the sliding doors to a stand-swing, pedestrian door-type;
- 4. Submit a material specification for the base of the recessed portion of the storefront;
- 5. HVAC units and rooftop mechanical equipment shall be screened if visible from the public right-ofway:
- 6. Ensure that the refuse storage s located within the building, or is screened from the public right-of-way;
- 7. Ensure that the storefront glazing is inset a minimum of four inches from the face of the building and that the gazing is transparent;

Because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the preservation and design standards.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Braddock said they are okay with the swinging doors instead of the sliding doors. He discussed the terrazzo flooring. They will have to infill some of the portions. Their original image rendering mislabeled the storefront intent along Jefferson, but they corrected it in their drawings.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussion focused on the terrazzo flooring. The petitioner needs to follow the Secretary's Standard when working with and cleaning the terrazzo flooring. They discussed the storefront. A detail of how the vertical black granite material will work needs to be submitted to staff. The back door will be changed to a sliding glass door and a different light pattern will be here. Also a detail on how this will look needs to be submitted to staff. Ms. Lynch stated that since the storefront configuration is different than the terrazzo that is remaining, it would be important to have a contrasting material in the areas.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations at 300 West Broughton Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval:

- 1.Incorporate a storefront door to enclose the existing opening along Jefferson Street;
- 2.Preserve existing terrazzo flooring, submit a specification for infill flooring & ensure that the surface cleaning of the terrazzo flooring is undertaken using the gentlest means possible;
- 3. Revise the sliding doors to a standard-swing, pedestrian door-type;
- 4.Submit a material specification for the base of the recessed portion of the storefront;
- 5.HVAC units and rooftop mechanical equipment shall be screened if visible from the public right-of-way;
- 6.Ensure that the refuse storage is located within the building, or is screened from the public right-of-way;
- 7.Ensure that the storefront glazing is inset a minimum of four inches from the face of the building and that the glazing is transparent;

Because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the preservation and design standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Aye

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

Mic Matson - Aye

Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye

25. D5 - Petition of Ward Architecture + Preservation | 18-001476-COA | 116 East Jones Street | Addition

- ∅ 18-001476-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Packet Photographs and Drawings.pdf
- Context Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Submittal Packet Project Description and Specifications.pdf
- Mr. Josh Ward was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval to construct a three-story rear addition for the property located at 116 East Jones Street. The addition will be the full-width of the rear façade and extend into the courtyard 11 feet. The view of the rear of the house is obscured by the carriage house and is only visible from the lane behind the neighbor's house because a carriage house doesn't exist in that location. The ground floor is completely obscured by the existing brick fence on the side property line and a wood screen wall is proposed on top of the brick wall to further obscure the addition.

Ms. Michalak reported that staff recommends approval to construct a three-story rear addition for the property located at 116 East Jones Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Reduce the quantity of historic rear exterior masonry wall removal in order to meet the preservation and design standards.
- 2. Provide all color selections.
- 3. Ensure that the shutter has a horizontal rail and that the shutter is properly designed to be flush with the exterior façade of the building.
- 4. Screen the HVAC units from view from the lane.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Ward thanked the staff for their comments. They will work with staff on screening the HVAC units. He asked that they be allowed to wait until construction is done so they can see if the units are visible as they are not sure of the size of the units. They believe that the new addition will obscure most of what will be on top of roof. He explained that regarding the shutters, they do not have a horizontal rail on the shutters because the existing shutters on the carriage house does not have a horizontal rail. They prefer to keep the false shutters on the addition. But, they will be happy to add the horizontal rail. As soon as the owner selects the colors, they will provide all the color selections to the staff. Mr. Ward said they do not take historic fabric lightly. They prefer to keep the drawings as they are with the newer portion below the masonry walls on the windows. The removal of the historic fabric will follow the guidelines.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Taavo Roos came forward and thanked the Board for reviewing their project. He was reared in Savannah, was gone for approximately 10 years, but he and his family have moved back home. The house will be his family longtime residence. He and his wife will raise their family in this house. Mr. Roos said he understands and agrees to retain as much of the historic fabric as possible. If they could, he would like very much to go with the suggestion of retaining the entire portion of the upper wall and simply just remove the gap between the windows on the first floor. As has been stated, this is only an interior wall; and the addition being made will only be viewed from the lane.

Ms. Taylor asked that with something as significant as this, would this not need to be redesigned and

comeback to the Board? Would this be better as a continuance?

Ms. Harris explained that the petitioner would have to request the continuance. She said it is not a good idea to review conjectural plans that they have not seen nor evaluated.

Ms. Lynch said since this is on the table, she asked Mr. Ward if he wanted to ask for a continuance.

Mr. Ward said he is aware that the Board cannot decide something until they see the drawings, but is this something the staff can look at again with the least amount of historic fabric?

Ms. Michalak stated that staff would not support that; they do not believe that this is the minimal amount that can be removed. This would have to come back to the Board.

Mr. Ward said they were not asking for a continuance.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussed the shutters. They were not opposed to the shutters matching the carriage house. They were in agreement with the staff's remaining three recommendations.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition to construct a three-story rear addition for the property located at 116 East Jones Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.Reduce the quantity of historic rear exterior masonry wall removal in order to meet the preservation and design standards.
- 2.Provide all color selections.
- 3. Screen the HVAC units from view from the lane.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens Second: David Altschiller

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Nay Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Nay

IX. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

26. Petition of Greenline Architects | 17-001566-COA | 134 Houston Street | 12-Month Extension

Staff Recommendation.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve a 12-month extension of the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) issued on April 12, 2017, for repairs and alterations at 134 Houston Street, with the previous conditions to be met, and for the COA to expire on April 11, 2019.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye David Altschiller - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

- 27. Petition of Deloris Lovette | 15-005907COA | 23 Montgomery Street | Staff Approved Windows
 - Victorblt Window.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 28. Petition of Dolores Ann Peisel | 18-001268-COA | 462 Montgomery Street | Staff Approved Install a Canopy at the Rear of the Building
 - COA 462 Montgomery Street 18-001268-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 462 Montgomery Street 18-001268-COA.pdf
 - Drawing-Awning.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 29. Petition of Alton Brecker | 18-001331-COA | 12 West State Street | Staff Approved Sign Face Change

 - Submittal Packet 12 West State Street 18-001331-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 30. Petition of Brenda Pearson for LS3P | 18-001408-COA | 114 West Bay Street [AKA 117 West River Street] | Staff Approved Exploratory Stucco Demolition
 - ∅ 114 W. Bay Street_HDBR_Exploratory Demo_Application SIGNED.pdf
 - 114 W. Bay Street_HDBR_Exploratory Demo_Photos.pdf
 - COA 114 West Bay Street 18-001408-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 31. Petition of David K. Lerch | 18-001410-COA | 317 Tattnall Street | Staff Approved Existing Fire Escape

 - Submittal Packet 317 Tattnall Street 18-001410-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 32. Petition of Melissa P. Swanson | 18-001423-COA | 405 West Congress Street | Staff Approved Awning

 - Drawing.jpg

No action required. Staff approved.

- 33. Petition of Kevin Quat | 18-001424-COA | 208 East Taylor Street | Staff Approved Repairs

 - @ IMG_1838.jpg
 - @IMG_1839.jpg
 - @IMG_1840.jpg
 - IMG_1841.jpg
 - @IMG_1842.jpg
 - @IMG_1843.jpg

No action required. Staff approved.

- 34. Petition of Jack Newton | 18-001588-COA | 513 East Congress Street | Staff Approved Shutters

 - Submittal Packet 513 East Congress Street 18-001588-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 35. Petition of Calvin Parker | 18-001613-COA | 6 West Harris Street | Staff Approved Stucco Repair Carriage House

 - Site Photos.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 36. Petition of Kevin Norris for American Craftsman Renovations | 18-001683-COA | 426 East St. Julian Street | Staff Approved Wood Siding

@Photos.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 37. Petition of Tony Hensley for SCAD | 18-001733-COA | 224 West Boundary Street | Staff Approved Brick Wall Repair

 - Submittal Packet 224 West Boundry Street 18-001733-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 38. Petition of David Bloomquist | 18-001734-COA | 116 East McDonough Street | Staff Approved Roof Replacement and Brick Repointing

 - Submittal Packet 116 East McDonough St. 18-001734-COA USHG-Heritage-Hydraulic-Lime-Mortar-NHL3.5-Datasheet-002.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 1 116 East McDonough Street 18-001734-COA.jpg
 - Submittal Packet 2 116 East McDonough Street 18-001734-COA.jpg
 - Submittal Packet 3 116 East McDonough Street 18-001734-COA.jpg

No action required. Staff approved.

- 39. Petition of Adam and Joan Gnall | 18-001803-COA | 101 West Perry Street | Staff Approved Wood Window Repair, Replace Wood Siding and Trim

 - Submittal Packet 101 West Perry Street.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 40. Report on Work Performed Without a COA for the April 11, 2018 HDBR Meeting

 - Mr. Cook asked what is the process to discuss the process for code enforcement of a COA.
 - **Ms. Michalak** answered that the Code Enforcement is an entirely new department with a new director. This is why staff met with them. The process is still being defined. But, if some one sees a violation, they can call staff.

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 41. Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting Thursday, April 12, 2018 at 3:30 p.m. in the Meyer Conference Room, MPC 110 East State Street
- 42. Next Pre-Meeting Wednesday, May 9, 2018 at 12:00 p.m. in the Jerry Surrency Room, MPC, 112 East State Street
- 43. Next Regular Meeting Wednesday, May 9, 2018 at 1:00 p.m. in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, MPC, 112 East State Street

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

44. Adjournment

Ms. Fletcher made a report on the plaques. She is waiting to hear from the printing company.

There being no further business to come before the Historic District Board of Review, Ms. Lynch adjourned the meeting at 4:35 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Ellen Harris, Director Urban Planning and Historic Preservation

EIH:mem

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.