

Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room January 10, 2018 1:00 p.m. Meeting Minutes

JANUARY 10, 2018 SAVANNAH HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW REGULAR MEETING

A Pre-Meeting will be held at 12:00 PM in the Jerry Surrency Conference Room, 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda will be presented by Staff, as time permits, and the Board may ask questions. No testimony will be received and no votes will be taken.

Members Present: Becky Lynch, Chair

Dwayne Stephens, Vice-Chair

David Altschiller Debra Caldwell Scott Cook Jennifer Deacon Mic Matson Melissa Memory Nan Taylor

Member Absent: Kellie Fletcher

MPC Staff Present: Ellen I. Harris, Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation

Leah Michalak, Senior Historic Preservation Planner Sara Farr-Newman, Historic Preservation Planner Alyson Smith, Historic Preservation Planner Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

1. Call to Order and Welcome

Mrs. Lynch called the meeting to order at 1:05 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. She outlined the role of the Historic District Board of Review and explained the process for hearing the various petitions. Staff will present each application with a recommendation. The petitioner will have the opportunity to respond to the recommendation. The petitioners are asked to limit their presentation to 10 minutes or less and only address the items identified as inconsistent with the ordinance and questions raised by the Board. The public will have the same allotted time, 10 minutes, to comment. The petitioner will be given the opportunity to respond to the public comments.

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

2. C1 - Approve Consent Agenda Items

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the Consent Agenda Items.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Mic Matson

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present
Becky Lynch - Abstain
Scott Cook - Aye
Dwayne Stephens - Aye
Mic Matson - Aye
Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye

3. C2 - Petition of Ward Architecture + Preservation | 17-007018-COA | 514-516 East Hall Street | Rehabilitation

- Aye

Aerial View.pdf

Nan Taylor

- Mercer Ward.pdf
- Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Project Narative.pdf
- Drawings.pdf
- Specifications.pdf
- Staff Recommendation.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the rehabilitation of 514-516 East Hall Street to include the demolition of a non-contributing outbuilding and concrete front porch, and the addition of front stoops, and dormers on the rear of the building with the following conditions:

- 1. Provide a brick and mortar sample;
- 2. Provide an elevation of the new section of fencing proposed along 514 East Hall Street's west property line;
- 3. Provide color samples for the paint and roofing materials;
- 4.Ensure the hog board penning is recessed so that the piers are distinguishable;
- 5. Ensure the distances between balusters does not exceed four inches and the height of the railing does not exceed 36";

6.Ensure that an encroachment permit is obtained from the City for the front stoops;

Because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the preservation and design standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Mic Matson

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Aye

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

Mic Matson - Aye

Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Aye

4. C3 - Petition of Homeline Architecture | 17-007036-COA | 524 East Harris Street | Addition

- Submittal Packet Photos and Drawings.pdf
- Submittal Packet Materials and Specs.pdf

Motion

Nan Taylor

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a two-story addition for the property located at 524 East Harris Street with the following condition because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the preservation and design standards:

- Aye

-Redesign the roof line of the addition to be lower than the eave of the historic building's roof so that it is clearly an appendage, does not damage or obscure the historic roof line, and is reversible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Mic Matson

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Aye

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

Mic Matson	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye

5. C4 - Petition of Homeline Architecture | 17-007038-COA | 6 East Liberty | Alterations and Addition

- Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Context Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Submittal Package.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations at 6 East Liberty Street with the following conditions to be provided for staff approval:

- 1. The window type for the existing opening is specified and is operable;
- 2.A specification is provided for the new stucco and mineral coating;
- 3. Any new equipment is screened if visible;

Because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Mic Matson

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye

6. C5 - Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 17-007040-COA | 38 Montgomery Street | Sign

- Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Package.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a projecting principal use

sign at 38 Montgomery Street, because it meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Mic Matson

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

7. Adopt the January 10, 2018 Agenda

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby adopt the January 10, 2018 Agenda

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Debra Caldwell Second: David Altschiller

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

- Not Present Kellie Fletcher Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

8. Continue All Items to Next Regular Meeting

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue all the continued requested items to Next Regular Meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Becky Lynch - Aye
Scott Cook - Aye
Dwayne Stephens - Aye
Mic Matson - Aye
Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye

9. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 15-001384-COA | 600 East Bay Street | New Construction: Part II, Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye David Altschiller - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye

I: Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition to the next meeting as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye David Altschiller - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye

11. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006851-COA | 620 East River Street (Hilton Hotel) | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye David Altschiller - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye

12. Petition of Gunn, Meyerhoff, Shay | 17-002122-COA | 620 East River Street (Hotel Anne) | New Construction Part 1: Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present - Abstain Becky Lynch Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye

13. Petition of Greenline Architecture | 17-002904-COA | 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District does hereby continue the petition to the next meeting as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye

14. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects | 17-003634-COA | 300 and 326 West Bay Street | New Construction Hotel: Part I, Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye David Altschiller - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye

15. Petition of The Bohemian Hotel | 17-005051-COA | 102 West Bay Street | Sign

Motion

Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition due to incomplete application.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

- Not Present Kellie Fletcher Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye

16. Petition of Studio Architects | 17-005582-COA | 601 Indian Street | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye

17. Petition of Whitfield Signs | 17-006556-COA | 412 Williamson Street | Signs

Motion

The Savannah Historic District does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye

18. Petition of KRA Architecture | 17-006600-COA | 27 Barnard Street | Demolition & Porch Addition

Motion

The Savannah Historic District does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye

19. Petition of General Services Administration | 17-006639-COA | 120 and 124 Barnard Street | New Construction Part 1: Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye

20. Petition of CED Architecture | 17-007046-COA | Berrien and Purse Streets | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Voting)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Not Voted

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present
Becky Lynch - Not Voted

Scott Cook - Aye

Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye

VIII. REGULAR AGENDA

21. D1 - Petition of Smith Dalia Architects | 17-003644-COA | 701 Montgomery Street | New Construction: Part II, Design Details

- Staff Recommendation 17-003644-COA.pdf
- Part I Photographs and Drawings.pdf
- Submittal Packet Materials and Specifications.pdf
- Submittal Packet Renderings and Precedents.pdf
- Submittal Packet Part II Drawings.pdf
- Context Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Gaston Ward Map.pdf

Mr. Brian Whitfield was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for New Construction: Part II, Design Details of a 4-story building for the property located at 701 Montgomery Street. The property is an entire city block and faces MLK Jr. Blvd. to the west, West Hall Street to the north, Montgomery Street to the east, and West Hall Lane to the south with a footprint of 22,617 square feet. The western half of the property lies within a 5-story height zone while the eastern half of the property lies within a 4-story height zone.

Ms. Michalak explained that the Board approved Part I, Height and Mass, with conditions, at the November 2017 HDBR meeting *(responses are italicized):*

- 1. Ensure that all parapets do not exceed 4 feet in height. The applicant clarified that the design did not/does not have any parapets over 4 feet high. No parapets extend more than 1'-6" above the top of the finished roof. The building has not grown in overall height.
- 2. Further define the "top" of the building at the two tallest corner volumes. A more substantial header course and additional rows of brick detailing have been added between the 3rd and 4th floors to further define the top of the building. Additionally, three rows of alternating course projections have been added under the brick cornice detail.
- 3. Provide the storefront base height and material. Ensure that it is between 18-24 high and of a contrasting material. The storefront base has been removed. The bottom rail of the storefront now sits on the finished floor. There is still not a true sill material other than the storefront sill itself.
- 4. Ensure that the storefront glazing, window sashes, and door frames are inset not less than 4 inches from the face of the building. *These insets are correctly dimensioned on the sections.*
- 5. Incorporate a string course at all parapet walls. A string course has been incorporated.
- 6. Ensure that the garage door openings on the lane façade do not exceed 12 feet in width. The garage doors have been replaced with human doors. The standard no longer applies.
- 7. Ensure that the leasable spaces along Montgomery and MLK are a minimum of 30 feet deep from the property lines. *Dimensions have been added to the floor plan and indicate that the leasable*

- spaces are 30 feet deep from the property lines.
- 8. If, during construction, it is found that any roof HVAC units are visible from any public right-of-way (including the lane) provide a screening detail to staff and screen all units.

 The applicant does not believe that the units will be visible but has agreed to provide screening if found to be visible during construction.

Ms. Michalak additionally explained that the applicant has identified some Part I elements have changed since the approval. They are as follows:

-The applicant states that their Part I drawings were conceptual in nature and did not take into account the true thickness of material assemblies; therefore, some overall bay widths have changed slightly. For example: The Montgomery Street façade was 130'-11 3/4" and is now 130'-8".

Ms. Michalak reported that staff recommends approval of the request for New Construction: Part II, Design Details of a 4-story building for the property located at 701 Montgomery Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval because the proposed project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Select a different brick color than the black brick- one that is lighter in color and/or has greater variation in color.
- 2. Add a precast still, or another material, under the bottom storefront rail.
- 3. Ensure that the stucco has a sand finish.
- 4. Ensure that the window muntin is a maximum of 7/8" wide and simulates traditional putty glazing.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Whitfield said they do not have any objections to the staff's recommendations. The windows will be restored as previously designed.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

None

BOARD DISCUSSION:

The Board identified that two items were changed since the Part I approval: all upper floors windows on the lane façade have been removed and the metal portion of the fence along the lane has been removed. These items need to be reinstated.

Motion

Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for New Construction: Part II, Design Details of a 4-story building for the property located at 701 Montgomery Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval because the proposed project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

Select a different brick color than the black brick- one that is lighter in color and/or has greater variation in

col	l∩r
CO	ıvı

Add a precast still, or another material, under the bottom storefront rail.

Ensure that the stucco has a sand finish.

Ensure that the window muntin is a maximum of 7/8" wide and simulates traditional putty glazing;

Reinstate the windows on the lane façade that were removed after the Part I approval and/or further define the corners of the building through materials;

Reinstate the top metal portion of the fence along the lane that was removed after the Part I approval.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Jennifer Deacon Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Becky Lynch - Aye
Scott Cook - Aye
Dwayne Stephens - Aye
Mic Matson - Aye
Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye

22. D2 - Petition of LS3P and Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 17-004307-COA | 630 Indian Street | New Construction Part II: Design Details

- Submittal Packet- Drawings sm2.pdf
- Submittal Packet- Cover Letter.pdf
- Submittal Packet- Drawings- Sections.pdf
- Submittal Packet- Materials Narrative.pdf
- Submittal Packet- Materials Specs.pdf
- Submittal Packet- Drawings floor plans.pdf
- Submittal Packet- Solar information.pdf
- Submittal Packet- Narrative.pdf
- Aerial.pdf
- Context Sanborn Maps.pdf

NOTE: Mr. Cook recused himself from participating in this petition. He is an employee of LS3P.

Mr. Richard Gowe was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for revisions to New Construction Part 1: Height and Mass and Part II: Design Details of a seven-story apartment building on the site bounded by River Street to the north, Fahm Street to the east, Indian Street to the south, and McGuire Street to the west. The footprint of the building is approximately 57,000 square feet and includes three floors of partially underground parking. The building encompasses the entire block. The request also includes a bonus story. The building proposes retail, live/work, and amenity spaces on the ground floor and residential apartments above.

Ms. Harris stated that the project was initially reviewed by the Historic District Board of Review on August 9, 2017 and again on November 8, 2017. The Board approved the request for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II Design Details:

1. Revise the fenestration on all balconies to feature punched openings, rather than storefront/curtain wall, more typical of contributing buildings.

The condition has been met. The fenestration on the balconies has been revised to a double door configuration.

2. Add voids on the side elevations of all step-down areas.

The condition has been met.

3. Incorporate a structural component, such as benches or planters, at the setbacks along Indian and Fahm Streets to better provide a wall of continuity.

The condition has been met.

4. Reduce the height of the parapet on the McGuire Street façade to no more than four feet in height.

The condition has been met.

5. Ensure the storefront glazing extends from a sill or from an 18-24 inch tall base of contrasting material.

The condition does not appear to be met.

6. Revise all facades to ensure that each architecturally distinct section is no greater than 60 feet in width.

The condition does not appear to be met. The facades on both River and Indian Street feature architecturally distinct sections which are greater than 60 feet in width.

7. Revise the bay spacing on all facades to be between 15 and 20 feet.

The condition appears to be met.

8. Provide the electric meter location.

The condition is met. The electric meter is proposed to be located within the building.

Ms. Harris said that additional revisions include:

- -The incorporation of a trellis at both of the courtyards and the incorporation of a fireplace chimney on the Indian Street façade;
- Deeper recessed balconies;
- -Some balconies now paired;
- -Minor floorplan alterations; and

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends a continuance of Part II: Design Details for new construction at 630 Indian Street in order for the petitioner to address the following:

- 1. Along the south, Indian Street façade, provide more consistency with the storefront designs, particularly in terms of height.
- 2. Along the Indian Street façade, on the second floor, redesign the height of the doors to the balconies to more closely align with the window heights on the same floor.
- 3. Revise the design so that no section of the building is greater than 60 feet.
- 4. Revise the window and door spacing so that they align vertically on all elevations.
- 5. Provide proud header and sills on the windows and doors within the recesses of the courtyards along River and Indian Streets.
- 6. Select a different red brick, one without so much variation in applied finish/color.
- 7. Revise the storefront openings so that the stone continues the existing pattern and wraps the storefront openings rather than the proposed recessed vertical framing elements at all storefronts.
- 8. Redesign the arched storefronts so that the arched element does not extend so far past the actual storefront opening.
- 9. Eliminate or redesign the very narrow stone column between two storefront systems on the south elevation (east building mass) and the north elevation (west building mass).
- 10. Revise the storefronts to extend from a sill or 18-24 inch tall base.
- 11. Continue the masonry horizontal band separating the top story from the stories below in the same width and profile through the stucco.
- 12. Revise the stringcourse to be lower and separate from the coping.
- 13. Replace stucco with brick in the setback areas at the top floors.
- 14. Ensure the stucco has a smooth finish.
- 15. Provide a full size sample of the Pella 450 Series window. Ensure all windows are operable.
- 16. Select a different garage door with a smooth finish, no lights, and a less residential aesthetic.
- 17. Redesign or eliminate the masonry privacy wall separating the double recessed balconies.
- 18. Redesign the protruding balconies on the second floor to be lighter and not cover the horizontal band- a Juliette balcony or the elimination of the balconies should be considered at these locations.
- 19. Reduce the depth of the protruding balconies to no more than three feet.
- 20. Eliminate the fireplace in the Indian Street courtyard.
- 21. Revise the sidewalk at both the McGuire and Fahm Street parking entrances be a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration and height.
- 22. Redesign the landscaped area along the Fahm Street façade so that there are not two parallel sidewalks.
- 23. Provide additional information regarding the fencing indicated on the landscape plan around the transformer on the northeast corner of the site.

- 24. Provide additional clarification on where the proposed painted masonry lintels are proposed to be utilized.
- 25. Provide samples and/or specifications for the following: cast stone arches, metal mesh in the walls, storefront bases and horizontal dividers.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Gowe introduced the team members accompanying him at today's meeting. He said of the 25 items recommended by staff, 18 are easy to adopt. They are seeking guidance from the Board on the other seven items which are #3, #6, #13, #15, #17; #24; and #25.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation [HSF] said they agree with staff's recommendation for a continuance as they see the need for further refinement. The HSF differs with staff on the brick, but agree with staff that the petitioner needs to be consistent on the height.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue Part II: Design Details for new construction at 630 Indian Street at the request of the petitioner in order to address the following:

- 1. Along the south, Indian Street façade, provide more consistency with the storefront designs, particularly in terms of height.
- 2. Along the Indian Street façade, on the second floor, redesign the height of the doors to the balconies to more closely align with the window heights on the same floor.
- 3. Revise the design so that no section of the building is greater than 60 feet.
- 4. Revise the window and door spacing so that they align vertically on all elevations.
- 5. Provide proud header and sills on the windows and doors within the recesses of the courtyards along River and Indian Streets.
- 6. Select a different red brick, one without so much variation in applied finish/color.
- 7. Revise the storefront openings so that the stone continues the existing pattern and wraps the storefront openings rather than the proposed recessed vertical framing elements at all storefronts.
- 8. Redesign the arched storefronts so that the arched element does not extend so far past the actual storefront opening.
- 9. Eliminate or redesign the very narrow stone column between two storefront systems on the south elevation (east building mass) and the north elevation (west building mass).
- 10. Revise the storefronts to extend from a sill or 18-24 inch tall base.
- 11. Continue the masonry horizontal band separating the top story from the stories below in the same width and profile through the stucco.
- 12. Revise the stringcourse to be lower and separate from the coping.
- 13. Replace stucco with brick in the setback areas at the top floors.
- 14. Ensure the stucco has a smooth finish.
- 15. Provide a full size sample of the Pella 450 Series window. Ensure all windows are operable.
- 16. Select a different garage door with a smooth finish, no lights, and a less residential aesthetic.
- 17. Redesign or eliminate the masonry privacy wall separating the double recessed balconies.
- 18. Redesign the protruding balconies on the second floor to be lighter and not cover the horizontal band- a Juliette balcony or the elimination of the balconies should be considered at these locations.
- 19. Reduce the depth of the protruding balconies to no more than three feet.

- 20. Eliminate the fireplace in the Indian Street courtyard.
- 21. Revise the sidewalk at both the McGuire and Fahm Street parking entrances be a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration and height.
- 22. Redesign the landscaped area along the Fahm Street façade so that there are not two parallel sidewalks.
- 23. Provide additional information regarding the fencing indicated on the landscape plan around the transformer on the northeast corner of the site.
- 24. Provide additional clarification on where the proposed painted masonry lintels are proposed to be utilized.
- 25. Provide samples and/or specifications for the following: cast stone arches, metal mesh in the walls, storefront bases and horizontal dividers.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Mic Matson

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present
Becky Lynch - Abstain
Scott Cook - Abstain
Dwayne Stephens - Aye
Mic Matson - Aye
Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye

23. D3 - Petition of Hansen Architects | 17-006865-COA | 120 Bull Street | Light Poles

Submittal Packet.pdf

Nan Taylor

- 120 Bull Street_proposed elevation image.pdf
- Staff Recommendation.pdf

Mr. Paul Hansen of Hansen Architects, Mr. John Manly, President of the Church Council, and Mrs. Margo Jones, Member of the Preservation Committee, were present on behalf of the petition.

- Aye

Ms. Alyson Smith gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval to install two decorative light poles to direct accent lighting onto the Lutheran Church located at 120 Bull Street. The light poles are to be installed in the public right-of-way on Bull Street to direct light on to the façade, the steeple, and the cross. Each post is proposed to be positioned near two existing light posts. Each lamp is proposed to feature two lamp heads, one to provide general illumination of the façade, and one to spotlight the steeple and cross. The staff approved color changes and stucco repairs to building on July 14, 2017 [17-004267-COA].

Ms. Smith reported that staff recommends denial of the proposed light poles at 120 Bull Street, because

the location and design of the light fixtures are not visually compatible. Other alternatives such as inground and accent lighting should be considered.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Hansen explained that when they began this project approximately 18 months ago, an extensive amount of work needed to be done on the exterior of the church. One of the desires of the congregation was to have better outdoor lighting for the church. It is very dark here in the evenings. They want to enhance the look of the building and the architecture in the evenings. He said they approached the City of Savannah and asked if they would allow them to attach to their existing light poles. Georgia Power agreed to furnish the lighting free of charge, but the City informed them that they would not attach to the City's pole. Mr. Hansen said they looked at inground lighting, but to get the required coverage to illuminate across the steeple, they felt they needed to add additional poles at the curbing location. Because of the intricate design of the façade of the church, they cannot get the necessary lighting to the required height of the steeple and enhance the church's detailing.

Mr. Hansen said they have applied for an encroachment with the City of Savannah, but this is on hold until they get a determination from the Historic District Board of Review.

Mr. Manly said the church has been at this location for more than 275 years. This will be the first time that the exterior of the church will be lit in these years. The idea of lighting the façade is to restore the features. This church is the only church in the Historic District that is not lit at night. They have tried everything they can regarding adding light here. Because their façade is more closer to the curb than some of the other historic churches in the Downtown Historic District, is some of the reason that the inground lighting will not work. It does not cast the appropriate beam to reach the 180 feet.

Ms. Jones said their restoration team has been working on this for quite awhile. They have done research and also SCAD's Research Preservation Department worked with them several years ago. They have engaged some of the preservation graduates in this work. Ms. Jones said they are trying to bring a feeling of security through additional lighting of the area. Also, the lighting will enhance the detailing work of the church.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) agreed with staff to deny the proposed light poles. The HSF is open to assist the petitioners with other light alternatives.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby deny the petition for proposed light poles at 120 Bull Street, because the location and design of the light fixtures are not visually compatible. Other alternatives such as inground and accent lighting should be considered.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Mic Matson

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Aye

Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye

24. D4 - Petition of Homeline Architecture | 17-007037-COA | 224 East Oglethorpe Avenue | Rehabilitation & Rooftop Addition

- Aerial View.pdf
- Anson Ward.pdf
- Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Submittal Packet Drawings.pdf
- Submittal Packet Renderings 224 East Oglethorpe Avenue 17-007037-COA.pdf
- Specifications.pdf
- Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Revised Package 1_9_18.pdf

Mr. John Deering was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Alyson Smith gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for alterations to the main residence and carriage house at 224 East Oglethorpe Avenue. The alterations to the main house include a new rooftop addition, terrace and roof replacement. The alterations to the carriage house include replacing all of the windows at the first and second floors, replacing the exterior door, and adding new mechanical equipment and screening on the roof.

Ms. Smith reported that staff recommends approval of the alterations to the carriage house at 224 East Oglethorpe Avenue to include, mechanical screening, and window and door replacement with the condition that color samples be provided for the windows, doors, and mechanical screening, because otherwise the proposed project is visually compatible and meets the preservation and design standards.

Ms. Smith additionally reported that staff recommends to continuance of the rooftop addition, roof replacement, and alterations at 224 East Oglethorpe Avenue with the following items to be considered:

- 1. Reduce the height of the rooftop addition to minimize the structure's visibility;
- 2. Revise the shape of the rooftop addition's roof, and remove the overhang and slanted screen walls on the rooftop addition's west and east facades:
- 3. Provide a setback from the east and west elevations to retain the essential form of the building;
- Revise the material and color of the addition's exterior walls so that it complements the existing historic fabric and residential character of surrounding buildings;
- 5. Preserve the existing chimneys as-is;
- 6. Provide additional information regarding the material and design of the panel system above the rooftop addition's doors;
- 7. Provide additional information regarding the replacement cornice at the rear portion of the building.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Deering explained that this is a tax credit project. Consequently, the State National Park Services Department and the State Historic Preservation Office will review this project as well. They believe the height of the addition to the rooftop is within the ordinance. This is a five story height zone. A ten foot minimum floor-to-floor height is required and they are at 12 feet' - 9". The addition is visually subordinate to the existing historic structure. The shape of the rooftop addition and the overhang was intentionally done as a modern interpretation of an addition to the rooftop because they felt it is more easily differentiated between the historic structure. The shape is basically taken from the right angle of the existing roof. Mr. Deering said the setbacks are one foot from each side of the townhouses. This is as much as they can do because on the interior there is an historic stair that is quite detailed and leads to the attic. There is a character defining feature on the interior of the building which the National Park Services will be reviewing. The chimneys have already been modified at least once. Their chosen material looks like roofing material. They want it to look like a rooftop rather than a real building.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) said they agree with the staff's recommendations regarding the carriage house, but they do not agree with the proposed changes to the rooftop. The HSF has concerns about rooftop additions on residential buildings. They believe the staff has outlined valid reasons with what they think of violations of the Secretary's Standards. The rooftop does not overwhelm the building, but the HSF believes it overwhelms the rooftop. The staff has recommended a continuance for the rooftop addition, etc., but the HSF believes the rooftop should be denied.

Mr. Deering in response to the public comments, said the rooftop they are requesting is minimal. Their client wishes to add more space and with the lot coverage being as is, they did not want to add to the building. He believes that what they are requesting meets the Secretary's of Interior standards.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

The Board members discussed the addition's material and color, and agreed that it should be restudied. A few Board members specifically stated that they felt the chimneys should be maintained as-is and setbacks should be incorporated so that the chimneys are not engaged with the addition. Some Board members stated that addition contrasted to much from the historic character of the building and should be restudied to better relate to the historic context.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby:

Approve the alterations to the carriage house at 224 East Oglethorpe Avenue to include, mechanical screening, and window and door replacement with the condition that color samples be provided for the windows, doors, and mechanical screening, because otherwise the proposed project is visually compatible and meets the preservation and design standards.

And;

Continue the rooftop addition, roof replacement, and alterations at 224 East Oglethorpe Avenue with the following items to be considered:

- 1.Reduce the height of the rooftop addition to minimize the structure's visibility;
- 2.Revise the shape of the rooftop addition's roof, and remove the overhang and slanted screen walls on the rooftop addition's west and east facades;
- 3. Provide a setback from the east and west elevations to retain the essential form of the building;
- 4.Revise the material and color of the addition's exterior walls so that it complements the existing historic fabric and residential character of surrounding buildings;
- 5. Preserve the existing chimneys as-is;
- 6. Provide additional information regarding the material and design of the panel system above the rooftop addition's doors;
- 7. Provide additional information regarding the replacement cornice at the rear portion of the building.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Debra Caldwell Second: Melissa Memory

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present - Abstain Becky Lynch Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye David Altschiller - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye

25. D5 - Petition of Sottile & Sottile | 17-007039-COA | 200-500 West River Street | Signs

- Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Package Reduced.pdf

NOTE: Mr. Stephens recused himself from participating in this petition. He is employed by the general contractor of the project.

Mr. Christian Sottile, Attorney Harold Yellin, and Mr. Richard Kessler were present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Sara Farr-Newman gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for signs at 200-500 West River Street. The proposed signs include the following:

- -32 lamp post banners
- -2 primary directory signs
- -5 wayfinding directory signs;
- -An above parapet district identity sign;
- A fascia district identity sign.

Ms. Farr-Newman explained that a sign master plan for 200-500 West River Street was previously

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room January 10, 2018 1:00 p.m. Meeting Minutes

brought before the Board on July 12, 2017 (17-003637-COA). The Board approved the signs that met the existing sign standards with the condition staff reviewed them for a COA and recommended a continuance for other sign types not permitted in the existing ordinance. Subsequently, a separate sign ordinance, called the Plant Riverside District sign ordinance was created and adopted by City Council [17-004435-ZA].

Ms. Farr-Newman reported that staff recommends to approve the proposed directory signs and building identification fascia sign, because they are visually compatible and meet the standard, but deny the proposed rooftop sign and banner signs, because they are not visually compatible.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Attorney Yellin explained that they came before the Historic District Board of Review on July 12, 2017 and presented to the Board their intention to create a new sign district. There are other sign districts in Savannah, but they added to the group by creating a Riverside Sign District. They did this because of the scale, character, uniqueness of Plant Riverside. At that time, they informed the Board that Plant Riverside contained 4 acres of land, it has fourteen structures, and 45 uses. They wanted the area to have specific criterion because they wanted to create signage that only would apply to Plant Riverside. A full presentation was given of all the signs that are before the Board today.

Mr. Sottile stated that he is the civic design architect for Plant Riverside. This project is without precedent. He appreciates that the staff has been working with them on this project for almost five years. He believes this is the largest project that has been executed in the Savannah Historic Landmark District. As has been stated this project is nearly 4 acres and 650 thousand square feet; 14 buildings with an acre and one-half of open land. This is a large industrial tract and is really being reinvented today for the next 100 years. Every standard they presented to the Board in July 2017 are in the ordinances. The rooftop sign is the same size that was presented in July, 2017 with the same standard.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

The Board focused on the visual compatibility of the signs. They found that due to the industrial nature of the site, including the large historic power plant, as well as the large size of the site, the proposed signs were visually compatible despite the lack of precedent.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for directory signs, a district identity fascia sign, a rooftop sign, and banner signs, because they meet the standards and are visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Debra Caldwell Second: Mic Matson

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present
Becky Lynch - Abstain
Scott Cook - Aye
Dwayne Stephens - Abstain
Mic Matson - Aye
Melissa Memory - Nay

David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Nay

IX. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

26. Petition of L. Bonnie Carnes | 17-006852-COA | 533 East Taylor Street | Staff Approved - Color Changes

No action required. Staff approved.

27. Petition of Walter Freeman | 17-006925-COA | 331 Tattnall Street | Staff Approved - Garage Door Reolacement

No action required. Staff approved.

- 28. Petition of Ray Mitch Hoover for Tech Roof Residential 17-006928-COA | 628 Martin Luther King jr. Boulevard | Staff Approved Roof

No action required. Staff approved.

29. Petition of Mary Watson McAlister | 17-006972-COA | 112 West Taylor Street | Staff Approved - Color Change, Replacing Shutters

No action required. Staff approved.

- 30. Petition of Jonathan Fox for James Hunt Construction Co., Inc. | 120 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved Mechanical units and condensing lines.

 - Structural Calculations 120 West Broughton Street 17-007006-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 120 West Broughton Street 17-007006-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 31. Petition of Benjamin Curran for Unitarian Universalist Church | 17-007008-COA | 311 East Harris Street | Staff Approved HVAC Unit and Screening

 - Drawings.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 32. Petition of Stafford N. Green | 17-007010-COA | 525 Howard Street | Staff Approved Repairs
 - COA 525 Howard Street 17-007010-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 33. Petition of Lindsay Morin for Coastal Canvas | 17-007103-COA | 409 East York Street | Staff Approved Awning Recover

- Submittal Packet 409 East York Street 17-007103-COA.pdf
- Submittal Packet 2 409 East York Street 17-007103-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 34. Amended Petition of Daniel J. Brown for CED Architects | 17-007191-COA | 23 West Gordon Street | Staff Approved Amendments to Carriage House

 - Submittal Packet 23 West Gordon Street 17-007191-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 35. Report on Work Performed Without a COA for the January 10, 2018 HDBR Meeting

Mrs. Lynch stated that staff has given the Board the report on the work performed without a COA. She asked the Board to read the report.

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 36. Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting Thursday, January 18, 2018 at 3:30 p.m. in the Meyer Conference Room, MPC 110 East State Street
- 37. Next Pre-Meeting Wednesday, February 14, 2018 at 12:00 p.m. in the Jerry Surrency Room, MPC, 112 East State Street
- 38. Next Regular Meeting Wednesday, February 14, 2018 at 1:00 p.m. in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, MPC, 112 East State Street

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

39. Adjournment

There being no further business to come before the Historic District Board of Review, Mrs. Lynch adjourned the meeting at 4:30 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Ellen Harris

Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation

EIH:mem

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.