

CHATHAM COUNTY-SAVANNAH

METROPOLITAN PLANNING COMMISSION

Planning the Future - Respecting the Past

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room September 16, 2014 1:30 P.M. MINUTES

September 16, 2014 Regular MPC Meeting

Members Present: W. Shedrick Coleman, Chairman

Murray Marshall, Vice-Chairman James B. Blackburn, Jr., Secretary

Lacy Manigault, Treasurer

Ellis Cook Ben Farmer Timothy Mackey Tanya Milton W. James Overton J. Adam Ragsdale Joseph Welch

Members Not Present: Stephanie Cutter

Susan Myers W. Lee Smith

Staff Present: Thomas Thomson, P.E. AICP, Executive Director

Melony West, CPA, Director, Finance & Systems Gary Plumbley, Director, Development Services Charlotte Moore, Director of Special Projects Christy Adams, Director, Administration Bri Finau, Administrative Assistant Julie Yawn, IT Systems Analyst

Advisory Staff Present: Robert Sebek, County Zoning Administrator

Geoff Goins, City Zoning Administrator

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

II. INVOCATION and PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

III. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

1. Approve AMENDED Agenda

Board Action:	
Approve amended Agenda as presented.	- PASS
Vote Results	
Motion: Ben Farmer	
Second: Tanya Milton	
James Blackburn Jr.	- Nay
Shedrick Coleman	- Aye
Ellis Cook	- Aye
Stephanie Cutter	- Not Present
Ben Farmer	- Aye
Timothy Mackey	- Aye
Lacy Manigault	- Aye
Murray Marshall	- Aye
Tanya Milton	- Aye
Susan Myers	- Not Present
James Overton	- Aye
Adam Ragsdale	- Aye
W. Lee Smith	- Not Present
Joseph Welch	- Aye

IV. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS and ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Notice(s)

2. <u>September 16, 2014 MPC Finance Committee Meeting at 11:30 AM in the West Conference Room, 110 East State Street.</u>

Financial Statements and Independent Auditor's Report for year ended December 31, 2013 were presented to the Board.

- 3. <u>September 30, 2014 MPC Bylaws Committee Meeting at 11:30 AM in the West Conference Room, 110 East State Street.</u>
- 4. <u>September 30, 2014 MPC Planning Meeting at 1:00 PM in the Arthur A. Mendonsa</u> Room, 112 East State Street
- 5. October 7, 2014 Regular MPC Meeting at 1:30 P.M. in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, 112 E. State Street.

Acknowledgement(s)

6. Staff Introductions - Thomas Thomson

James Small - Administrative Assistant

Sarah Far - Preservation Planner

Information Item(s) for Board Members

7. Reading of Development Plans Submitted for Review

Attachment: Review Log September 16.pdf

V. PRESENTATIONS

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

Amended Master Plan / General Development Plan

8. <u>Abercorn at Wilshire General Development Plan | Grocery Store & Fuel Station | File</u> No. 14-004184-PLAN

File No. 14-004184-PLAN

Abercorn at Wilshire General Development Plan / Grocery Store & Fuel Station

19 and 10 Wilshire Boulevard

Property Identification Nos: 2-0649-04-(1-10); 2-0649-05-(1-9); 2-0649-

06-004-(4-15) 10.37 acres

Aldermanic District: 6 (Thomas)

County Commission District: 5 (Shabazz)

Existing Zoning District: P-B-C Proposed Zoning District: P-B-C Applicant: Polestar Development, LLC

Agent: Robert B. Brannen, Jr.

Continued to October 7, 2014 Regular MPC Meeting per petitioner's request.

Mr. Ragsdale abstained to vote due to representing petitioner.

Board Action:

Postpone Item - October 7, 2014 Regular MPC - PASS

Meeting

Vote Results

Motion: Ellis Cook Second: Tanya Milton

James Blackburn Jr.- AyeShedrick Coleman- AyeEllis Cook- Aye

Stephanie Cutter - Not Present

Ben Farmer - Aye
Timothy Mackey - Aye
Lacy Manigault - Aye
Murray Marshall - Aye
Tanya Milton - Aye

Susan Myers - Not Present
James Overton - Aye

Adam Ragsdale - Abstain
W. Lee Smith - Not Present

Joseph Welch - Aye

Zoning Petition - Map Amendment

9. <u>Amendment to Abercorn at Wilshire Master Plan | Multiple Lots | File No. 14-004130-ZA</u>

Attachment: Staff Report-Sept 16.pdf

Attachment: MAPS.pdf

Attachment: <u>Amended Master Plan.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>B-N & B-C Use List.pdf</u>

Attachment: City Council Minutes-Sept 6 2001.pdf

Attachment: Exhibit A-Property List & Owner Authorizations.pdf

File No. 14-004130-ZA

Abercorn Street / Wilshire Boulevard / Redwood Circle

Property Identification Nos: 2-0649-04-(1-10); 2-0649-05-(1-9); 2-0649-06-

004 (4-15) 10.37 acres

Aldermanic District: 6 (Thomas)

County Commission District: 5 (Shabazz) Existing Zoning District: P-B-C with master plan

Proposed Zoning District: P-B-C with amended master plan

Petitioner: Polestar Development, LLC

Agent: Robert B. Brannen, Jr.

Continued to October 7, 2014 Regular MPC Meeting per petitioner's request.

Mr. Ragsdale abstained to vote due to representing petitioner.

Board Action:	
Postpone Item - October 7, 2014 Regular MPC	- PASS
Meeting.	- 1 ASS
Vote Results	
Motion: Ellis Cook	
Second: Tanya Milton	
James Blackburn Jr.	- Aye
Shedrick Coleman	- Aye
Ellis Cook	- Aye
Stephanie Cutter	- Not Present
Ben Farmer	- Aye
Timothy Mackey	- Aye
Lacy Manigault	- Aye
Murray Marshall	- Aye
Tanya Milton	- Aye
Susan Myers	- Not Present
James Overton	- Aye
Adam Ragsdale	- Abstain
W. Lee Smith	- Not Present
Joseph Welch	- Aye

The Consent Agenda consists of items for which the applicant is in agreement with the staff recommendation and for which no known objections have been identified nor anticipated by staff. Any objections raised at the meeting will result in the item being moved to the Regular Agenda. At a 12:30 briefing, the staff will brief the Commission on Consent Agenda items and, time permitting, Regular Agenda items. No testimony will be taken from applicants, supporters or opponents, and no votes will be taken at the briefing.

VII. CONSENT AGENDA

Approval of MPC Meeting Minutes and Briefing Minutes

10. August 26, 2014 MPC Meeting and Briefing Minutes

Attachment: 08.26.14 MEETING MINUTES.pdf

Attachment: 08-26-14 MPC BRIEFING MINUTES.pdf

Board Action:

Recommend **APPROVAL** of the MPC Meeting - PASS

and Briefing Minutes as submitted.

Vote Results

Motion: Lacy Manigault Second: Tanya Milton

James Blackburn Jr.- NayShedrick Coleman- AyeEllis Cook- Aye

Stephanie Cutter - Not Present

Ben Farmer - Aye
Timothy Mackey - Aye
Lacy Manigault - Aye
Murray Marshall - Aye
Tanya Milton - Aye

Susan Myers - Not Present

James Overton - Aye Adam Ragsdale - Aye

W. Lee Smith - Not Present

Joseph Welch - Aye

Victorian District - New Construction

11. <u>Petition of Wubbena Architects | 14-004119-COA | 207 East Anderson Street | New Construction: Duplex</u>

Attachment: Context Maps.pdf

Attachment: Staff Site and Context Photographs.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet - Application.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet - Photographs.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet - Drawings.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - Specifications and materials.pdf

Attachment: Staff Report.pdf

Board Action:

Approval for new construction of a two-story main building and two-story carriage house to be located on the vacant parcel at 207 East Anderson Street

because the proposed work is visually compatible.

Vote Results

Motion: Lacy Manigault Second: Tanya Milton

James Blackburn Jr.- NayShedrick Coleman- AyeEllis Cook- Aye

Stephanie Cutter - Not Present

Ben Farmer - Aye
Timothy Mackey - Aye
Lacy Manigault - Aye

Murray Marshall	- Aye
Tanya Milton	- Aye
Susan Myers	- Not Present
James Overton	- Aye
Adam Ragsdale	- Aye
W. Lee Smith	- Not Present
Joseph Welch	- Ave

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

Master Plan

12. 644 East Broughton Street - Trustees Garden Proposed Master Plan

Attachment: Proposed Trustees Garden Master Plan.pdf

Attachment: Photos.pdf

Attachment: Staff Report 0916.pdf

Attachment: Email from adjacent property owner.pdf

Petitioner: Evan Bennett, Agent

Randolph Street Development, LLC, Owner

10 East Broad Street

Pin(s) 2-0005-06-010, 012, 013, 014, & 2-0005-22-002

9.9 Acres

Aldermanic District: 2

County Commission District: 2 MPC File No. 14-003770-PLAN

Mr. Marcus Lotson, MPC Project Planner, presented the petitioner's request for approval of a Master Plan for 9.9 acres of land in the northeast portion of the Landmark District identified as Trustees Garden. The petitioner is requesting a 201 off street parking space variance from the 396 space requirement. Staff recommends **approval** of the proposed Master Plan and parking variance for Trustees Garden.

Mr. Harold Yellin, representative of the petitioner, stated the staff recommendations are agreeable to the petitioner.

Board Action:

Staff recommends **approval** of the proposed

Master Plan and parking variance for Trustees - PASS

Garden.

Vote Results

Motion: James Blackburn Jr. Second: Timothy Mackey

James Blackburn Jr. - Aye

Shedrick Coleman	- Aye
Ellis Cook	- Aye
Stephanie Cutter	- Not Present
Ben Farmer	- Aye
Timothy Mackey	- Aye
Lacy Manigault	- Aye
Murray Marshall	- Aye
Tanya Milton	- Aye
Susan Myers	- Not Present
James Overton	- Aye
Adam Ragsdale	- Not Present
W. Lee Smith	- Not Present
Joseph Welch	- Aye

Zoning Petition - Staff Text Amendment

13. Response to City Council Regarding Fences in Tree Lawns

Attachment: Photograph.pdf

Attachment: COA - 554 East Taylor Street13-000388-COA Denied.pdf

Attachment: Staff recommendation.pdf

Attachment: HSF Comments 09-16-2014.pdf

Ms. Ellen Harris, Preservation Planner, stated City Council returned the recommendation for denial of a text amendment to allow a 32" tall wooden fence at 554 East Taylor Street to request that the Metropolitan Planning Commission examine the fence standards of the Historic District Ordinance as related to tree lawns and develop a solution. Staff recommends sending this overview with examples of fencing that may be visually compatible to City Council.

Mr. Blackburn, Jr. suggested defining 'fence'.

Ms. Monique Armstrong, resident of 554 East Taylor Street, presented and defended her fence, which was built to be a trellis. She stated though it is unusual, it is compatible.

Ms. Danielle Meunier, representative of the Savannah Historic Foundation, stated the HSF recommends tree lawns and fencing to be minimal.

Board Action:

Staff recommends sending this overview with

examples of fencing that may be visually	- PASS
compatible to City Council.	11100

Vote Results

Motion: Ben Farmer Second: Lacy Manigault

James Blackburn Jr.- NayShedrick Coleman- AyeEllis Cook- Aye

Stephanie Cutter - Not Present

Ben Farmer - Aye
Timothy Mackey - Aye
Lacy Manigault - Aye
Murray Marshall - Aye
Tanya Milton - Aye

Susan Myers - Not Present

James Overton - Aye Adam Ragsdale - Aye

W. Lee Smith - Not Present
Joseph Welch - Aye

IX. REGULAR BUSINESS

Zoning Petition - Map Amendment

14. <u>920 East Victory Drive | Rezoning from R-6 (One-family Residential) to R-I-P</u> (Residential-Institutional-Professional) | File No. 14-003763

Attachment: Staff Report-Sept 16.pdf

Attachment: Maps.pdf

Attachment: <u>Use Comparison Table.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Petitioner's Letter.pdf</u>

Attachment: Petition in Support of Rezoning.pdf

Attachment: McKellar Email.pdf Attachment: Photos-Sept 16.pdf

File No. 14-003763-ZA

920 East Victory Drive

Property Identification Number: 2-0076-12-002

0.64 acres

Aldermanic District: 2 (Osborne)

County Commission District: 2 (Holmes)

Existing Zoning District: R-6 (One-family Residential)

Proposed Zoning District: R-I-P (Residential-Institutional-Professional)

Petitioner: Sue S. Gouse Owner: Sue S. Gouse **Ms. Charlotte Moore**, MPC Project Planner, presented the petitioner's request to rezone from an R-6 classification to an R-I-P classification. Staff recommends denial of the request to rezone from an R-6 classification to an R-I-P classification because it allows uses that may be atypical for the area.

There was discussion among the Board.

Mr. Harold Yellin, representative of the petitioner, stated they are willing to self-impose certain restrictions to protect the neighborhood and appease staff. They are requesting the change for ease of selling the property.

The Board expressed concern about the possibility of the character of the neighborhood changing if the petition is granted. There was discussion between the Board and petitioner representative for clarity. The petitioner was encouraged to get support or feedback from the neighboring Diocese.

The petitioner requested continuance to the October 7, 2014 Regular MPC Meeting. Mr. Blackburn, Jr. amended the original motion of continuance to request staff to use this time to find alternative solutions, which may include creating a new district for situations involving old large houses.

Board Action:	
Return on October 7, 2014 (with amendment)	- PASS
Vote Results	
Motion: Ben Farmer	
Second: Tanya Milton	
James Blackburn Jr.	- Aye
Shedrick Coleman	- Aye
Ellis Cook	- Aye
Stephanie Cutter	- Not Present
Ben Farmer	- Aye
Timothy Mackey	- Aye
Lacy Manigault	- Aye
Murray Marshall	- Aye
Tanya Milton	- Aye
Susan Myers	- Not Present
James Overton	- Aye
Adam Ragsdale	- Aye
W. Lee Smith	- Not Present
Joseph Welch	- Aye

Amend motion as stated: Postpone item to allow staff to study area and present findings of alternatives and determine necessity of a new

district.

Vote Results

Motion: James Blackburn Jr. Second: Timothy Mackey

James Blackburn Jr.- AyeShedrick Coleman- AyeEllis Cook- Nay

Stephanie Cutter - Not Present

Ben Farmer - Aye
Timothy Mackey - Aye
Lacy Manigault - Aye
Murray Marshall - Aye
Tanya Milton - Aye

Susan Myers - Not Present

James Overton - Aye Adam Ragsdale - Aye

W. Lee Smith - Not Present

Joseph Welch - Aye

15. 413 Whitaker Street | RIP-A to RIP-C | 14-004108-ZA

Attachment: Maps 4108.pdf
Attachment: Images 4108.pdf
Attachment: Staff Report 4108.pdf

Petitioner: Janet Kubista 413 Whitaker Street PIN: 2-0032 -17-026

Acres: 0.048 ac. (2,100 square feet)

Aldermanic District: 2

County Commission District: 3 MPC FILE NO. 14-004108-ZA

Mr. Jack Butler, MPC Comprehensive Planner, presented the petitioner's request to rezone a parcel located at 413 Whitaker Street from the existing R-I-P-A (Residential Medium Density) classification to an R-I-P-C (Residential Medium Density) classification. The petitioner wants to sell packaged alcohol as part of gift baskets, not consumption. Staff recommends **denial** of the petitioner's request to rezone the subject property from an R-I-P-A classification to an R-I-P-C classification. The denial is based on the ability of other inappropriate uses to be open to the area, though the petitioner's particular use is appropriate.

There was discussion about the Future Comprehensive Plan and the Long

Range Plan.

Ms. Janet Kubista, petitioner, stated the imported Italian wine is to be part of the specialty gift baskets they sell.

Ms. Moore stated the City is addressing ancillary wine use. It is not yet connected to the zoning ordinance and more information is needed.

Mr. Steve Day, area resident, stated he doesn't feel everyone in the neighborhood has been notified of their business plan. He is opposed to the rezoning request and does not want alcohol in the neighborhood.

Mr. Philip McCorkle, area resident, has concern with changing the zoning and the possibility of the business changing. He is not in favor of the capability of a bar in the neighborhood. He is in favor of a business being there, but hopes the plan to be revised.

- PASS
- 1 A33
- Aye
- Nay
- Aye
- Not Present
- Aye
- Not Present
- Aye
- Aye
- Aye
- Not Present
- Aye
- Aye
- Not Present

Zoning Petition - Text Amendment

Joseph Welch

16. <u>Amendment to Allow Conforming Billboard Owners the Ability to Erect a Digital Sign</u> Face | Sec. 7-3.C.(5)(c)(9) | File No. Z-140814-00073-1

- Nay

Attachment: Staff Report-Sept 16.pdf

File No. Z-140814-00073-1

Petitioner: Golden Isles Outdoor, LLC

Agent: Phillip R. McCorkle

Ms. Charlotte Moore, MPC Project Planner, presented the petitioner's request for an amendment to allow conforming billboard owners the ability to erect a digital sign face in the ordinance. Such was done by the City in 2013, but not the County. Staff recommends approval of an alternate amendment to allow conforming billboard owners the ability to erect a digital sign face.

Board Action:

Approval of an alternate amendment to allow conforming billboard owners the ability to erect a - PASS digital sign face.

Vote Results

Motion: Ellis Cook Second: Tanya Milton

James Blackburn Jr.- NayShedrick Coleman- AyeEllis Cook- Aye

Stephanie Cutter - Not Present

Ben Farmer - Aye

Timothy Mackey - Not Present

Lacy Manigault - Aye
Murray Marshall - Aye
Tanya Milton - Aye

Susan Myers - Not Present

James Overton - Aye Adam Ragsdale - Aye

W. Lee Smith - Not Present

Joseph Welch - Aye

X. OTHER BUSINESS

17. Report from Nominating Committee

The Nominating Committee nominated as follows:

W. Shedrick Coleman - Chair Murray Marshall - Vice Chair Tanya Milton - Secretary W. James Overton -Treasurer Voting will be during the October 7, 2013 Regular MPC Meeting.

XI. ADJOURNMENT

18. Adjourn Septermber 16, 2014 Regular MPC Meeting

There being no further business to come before the Board, Chairman Coleman entertained a motion to adjourn the August 26, 2014 Regular MPC Meeting at 4:33 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Thomas L. Thomson Executive Director

TLT/bf

Note: Minutes not official until signed.

XII. DEVELOPMENT PLANS SUBMITTED FOR REVIEW

19. Development Plans Submitted for Review

Attachment: Review Log September 16.pdf

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting summary minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.