

**HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW
REGULAR MEETING
112 EAST STATE STREET**

ARTHUR A. MENDONSA HEARING ROOM

June 10, 2009

2:00 P.M.

MINUTES

HDRB Members Present:

**Dr. Malik Watkins, Chairman
Brian Judson, Vice-Chairman
Reed Engle
Ned Gay
Dr. Nicholas Henry
Gene Hutchinson
Sidney J. Johnson
Richard Law, Sr.
James Overton
Linda Ramsay**

HDRB Members Not Present:

Joseph Steffen

City of Savannah Staff Members Present: Tiras Petrea, Zoning Officer

HDRB/MPC Staff Members Present:

**Thomas L. Thomson, P.E./AICP, Executive Director
Beth Reiter, Historic Preservation Director
Julie Yawn, System Analyst
Janine N. Person, Administrative Assistant**

RE: CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

The meeting was called to order at 2:00 p.m.

RE: SIGN POSTING

All signs were properly posted.

RE: CONTINUED AGENDA

**RE: Continued Petition of Coastal Heritage Society
Alexis Aubuchon
H-08-4086-2
PIN 2-0031-47-001
301 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard
Addition**

Continue to July 8, 2009, at the request of the petitioner.

**RE: Continued Petition of BWBF, Incorporated
Richard Guerard
H-09-4118-2
PIN 2-0032-07-001
342 Drayton Street
New Construction Design Details - Part II**

Continue to July 8, 2009, at the request of the petitioner.

**RE: Continued Petition of Dr. Lance Hemberger
H-09-4129-2
PIN 2-0033-01-021B
548 East Taylor Street
Covered Deck Addition**

Continue to July 8, 2009, at the request of the petitioner.

HDRB ACTION: Mr. Judson made a motion that the Savannah Historic District Board of Review approve the Consent Agenda items as submitted. Mr. Gay seconded the motion and it was passed unanimously.

RE: CONSENT AGENDA

**RE: Petition of Cilantro's
c/o Sign-A-Rama
H-09-4147-2
PIN 2-0004-13-006
135 West Bay Street
Sign**

The Preservation Officer recommends **approval**.

**RE: Petition of Sara Barczak and Anthony Jernigan
H-08-4020-2
PIN 2-0033-03-042
518 East Gaston Street
One-Year Extension**

The Preservation Officer recommends **approval**.

HDRB ACTION: Mr. Gay made a motion that the Savannah Historic District Board of Review approve the Continued Agenda items as submitted. Mr. Hutchinson seconded the motion and it was passed unanimously.

Dr. Watkins announced that the Board met at the SCAD museum site for a walk-thru and to view some on-site mock-ups of the window coverings, glass samples, and paving samples. He stated that there was no Board discussion.

He also said that the Board would move forward with the e-agenda, moving away from the paper packets.

RE: REGULAR AGENDA

**RE: Continued Petition of Savannah College of Art and Design
Mr. Christian Sottile
H-08-4068-2
PIN 2-0031-47-004
301 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard
Rehabilitation/Alteration and New Construction Part II
– Design Detail**

The Preservation Officer recommends **approval with conditions**.

Present for the petition was Mr. Christian Sottile.

Ms. Reiter gave the Staff report.

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The applicant requests Part II Design Detail approval for a rehabilitation/new construction project for the north shed of the Central of Georgia Railroad Building at 233 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard.

FINDINGS:

1. Part I Height and Mass was approved on March 11, 2009, with the condition that there be further articulation along Turner Street in the design development phase.
2. Please refer to applicant's submittal application Pages 3 and 4 for application of standards. The proposed structure falls under the Monumental Building classification.
3. The following Staff comments are in addition to and will illuminate applicant's application.
 - A nine-foot-wide glass curtain wall is proposed as a connector between the new museum wall and Kiah Hall. The curtain wall is recessed 1'-4" from the sidewalk and that space is paved with bluestone.
 - An eight-inch high back illuminated transparent band is recessed 3½ inches at the base of the new cast concrete museum wall. Aluminum mulls are placed on five-foot centers to hold the glass. (Museum of Art p.15.)
 - The rectangular wall openings in the existing brick wall will be infilled with a polished stainless steel panel recessed in the existing opening with a 1½-inch light reveal around it. This applies to several rectangular door openings as well. Thus, the rhythm of the openings is retained along Turner Street (Museum of Art p. 22.)

- The museum entrance on Turner Street is located at the foot of Papy Street. Clear laminated five-inch thick glass fins extend from the glass enclosure around the entrance for a total of 5'-6" from the existing brick wall. The entry is surrounded by blue stone paving that extends up to the existing brick wall. At the arched passage a metal grating is set into the floor as a transition from the outside bluestone to the inside floor. The cast concrete wall is set within the arched opening and there is a lighted reveal between the historic brick and the cast concrete surface. (Museum of Art pp.18-19.)
- The arched glass bays on Turner Street will be encased by a 2'-4" projecting structural glass bay enclosure. As the interior plans are finalized some of these windows will open into active spaces within the building and some will be used for display (such as at the museum shop) giving life to the street and sharing the interior activities of the building with the exterior sidewalk activity. (Museum of Art pp. 19-20.)
- A second glass curtain wall west of the main entry breaks up the infill cast concrete wall. Where there is a remnant of the base of a portion of the historic brick wall it will be capped with bluestone and used as a bench. (Booklet p. 20-21.)
- Glass storefront system monitors are proposed over the second story classroom and studio spaces. (Museum of Art pp. 5,6,23.)
- A garden entry gate will be inserted within the existing iron fence on MLK. This will be an arched wood gate within a cast concrete entrance reflective of a similar gate at the Scarborough House and now demolished Marshall Mansion at MLK and Oglethorpe Avenue. A similar gate will be used in a new cast concrete wall on Fahm Street. This wall will have woven metal inset panels with a hedge in the foreground. (Booklet p. 24.)
- A lantern with horizontal channel glass extends 86 feet above the entrance and projects 5'-6" over the entry. An internal steel frame supports the glass. The lantern functions as a skyline feature and beacon that will draw pedestrians from the railroad buildings and Children's Museum from the south through the project, from Oglethorpe Avenue to the project from the north, and from MLK and beyond from the east. This contrasting feature places further emphasis on the classical architecture of the MLK structures and the industrial appearance of the warehouses and ruins. Each can be understood without competition. This intersection of Turner and Papy Streets will hopefully become an exciting urban civic space and transition point to further development in the western expansion area.

PETITIONER'S COMMENTS:

Mr. Christian Sottile gave an overview of the details regarding the SCAD museum.

Ms. Ramsay stated that on page 6 of the floor plans that the stairwell on the left side appeared to have a door that opened outward toward Turner Street, but on the elevation on page 10 under detail number 16, there appeared to be a stainless steel infill panel.

Mr. Sottile stated that the panel would be added to the fire exit door.

Ms. Ramsay asked if the lantern assembly had been tested for hurricane force winds.

Mr. Sottile replied that the channel glass is a structural glass and has been tested in hurricane conditions.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Mr. Daniel Carey (Historic Savannah Foundation - HSF) stated that HSF remained in support of the concept and design of the proposed art museum. However, they had questions concerning the framed light boxes over the openings on Turner Street and the effect on how the arches are perceived. He stated that they may need to look at the mock-up on site. He said they also had questions about the lighted reveals between the historic brick and the new cast concrete surfaces. He asked how it would be handled.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

Dr. Henry asked what the material of the roof of the lantern was and if it would be translucent.

Mr. Sottile stated it would be an opaque built-up roof.

Ms. Ramsay asked if the light boxes could be revisited or were they part of the Height and Mass approval.

Dr. Watkins stated that they were part of Height and Mass.

Mr. Engle disagreed and stated that in his opinion the window coverings were detail.

Mrs. Reiter reminded the Board that the policy for Height and Mass is to think of the form that would result if the building was shrink-wrapped.

Mr. Engle stated that he had problems with the lighting and materials and that this was a landmark structure even if it was a ruin.

Mr. Sottile stated that they had made full-scale architectural studies on-site in order to understand the Height and Mass before developing the details. All elements forward of the wall would be glass with point metal fittings. In the evening hours the historic brick would be a lighted feature. The concrete sleeve at the portal created a contrast with the historic materials. A life-size study was done in the field which the Board viewed on Monday. The original arch remained fully exposed.

HDRB ACTION: Mr. Judson made a motion that Savannah Historic District Board of Review approve the petition with the condition that as stabilization progresses in the field, that Staff is brought in as the stabilization process proceeds, particularly regarding the exposed ends of the brick walls. Mr. Law seconded the motion. Mr. Engle and Ms. Ramsay were opposed. Mr. Hutchinson recused himself. The motion passed 5 to 2.

**RE: Continued Petition of Paul Robinson
H-09-4137-2
PIN 2-0004-4011
18 & 20 West State Street
Rehabilitation/Alteration**

Present for the petition was Mr. Paul Robinson.

The Preservation Officer recommends approval.

Ms. Reiter gave the Staff report:

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The applicant requests approval to replace the existing storefront with a new metal and glass storefront. The historic brick façade material on either side of the storefront and the transom are original and will be retained.

FINDINGS:

18-20 West State Street was constructed between 1898 and 1916 and replaced a frame shop. It was built with a commercial ground floor use and lodging above. The brick sill under the current storefront windows is not historic; neither is the current aluminum entry door and sidelight, nor the modern glass shop windows. (New South Associates: A Cultural Resource Assessment of Proposed Sites, U. S. Courthouse Annex, Savannah, Georgia, 1996.) Upon further inspection of the framing above the recessed entry, the tin ceiling extends all the way uninterrupted to the front door. In addition, several historic buildings within this ward had flush storefronts with side entries.

It is proposed to shift the recessed entry door opening to the east, replace the door with a glass door, and drop the glass storefront to the ground for a more visible display area. It was pointed out in the last meeting that the ordinance as currently written states that the door should be centered and recessed. She said it is not known if that was the original design for this storefront. She said several people had contacted her to say that the ordinance proposed changes had not yet been adopted so the centered recessed entry binds the Board. She said if that was the case the petitioner has submitted an alternative with a centered all glass recessed door. It is staff's opinion that the side entry could be approved based on the other examples in the ward, but staff recommended approval of the alternative design as well.

Colors: Window trim: Benjamin Moore 2163-70 "Winter Sky"; Wood door to upstairs: Benjamin Moore 2000-10 "Red"; gutter and downspout: Benjamin Moore 2119-20 "Black Berry".

BOARD COMMENTS:

Mr. Engle stated that the ordinance required that the glass sit on a sill or an 18-inch to 24-inch base. He said what was shown was glass going right to the ground. There were two commercial design standards that the proposal did not meet. The examples that were shown all have a sill.

Mrs. Reiter stated that if the Board chooses to approve the alternative plan, that they could condition it to have a sill.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Judson asked with regard to the alternative centered plan, if the petitioner would be amenable to placing the glass on a slight sill.

Mr. Robinson answered yes, with an 8-inch to 12-inch base.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were none.

HDRB ACTION: Mr. Engle made a motion that the Savannah Historic District Board of Review approve the amended petition with the condition that the storefront incorporate an eight-inch to twelve-inch sill, and that final drawings be brought to Staff. Mr. Judson seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

**RE: Amended Petition of DC4, LLC
Lukejohn Dickson
H-09-4125-2
PIN 2-0032-17-003
117 West Jones Street
Deck Addition**

Present for the petition was Mr. LukeJohn Dickson.

The Preservation Officer recommends **approval**.

Ms. Reiter gave the Staff report.

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The applicant requests approval to add a rear deck at the second floor level. Also, to convert a window into a door and add an additional window. All remaining windows to be replaced with appropriate 6/6 windows to match the rest of the house.

FINDINGS:

1. Deck to be constructed of pressure treated wood. A detail of the handrail has been provided. The piers will be made from brick salvaged from elsewhere on the property.
2. Custom made door - 15 true divided light, single-pane with transom above.
3. Replace existing non-historic rear windows with custom-made wood, single-paned, double-hung, true divided light 6/6 windows. Install new window at second floor.
4. Trim color to match existing house.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Mr. Gay asked why the door was not at the same height as the two windows.

It was asked if there were other decks in this block.

Mr. Judson answered yes.

Ms. Ramsay asked if it was intended to paint the deck.

Mrs. Reiter answered yes. She said it would match the trim color.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Gay asked about the height of the door.

Mr. Dickson stated that it would be the same height as the windows.

Mr. Gay stated that there was not an additional window on the third floor.

Mr. Dickson stated that they had originally considered a false window, but Staff had said that it wasn't necessary.

Mr. Gay asked Staff why.

Mrs. Reiter stated that in her opinion a fake window was an unnecessary maintenance item.

Mr. Dickson stated that the homeowner was open to putting in a fake window.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Cassie Dolecki (Historic Savannah Foundation – HSF) stated that they wanted to see symmetry on the back and recommended the removal of the transom. She suggested bringing the height of the door to the height of the windows.

HDRB ACTION: Mr. Gay made a motion that the Savannah Historic District Board of Review approve the petition with the conditions that a false window be placed between the windows on the third floor; that the transom be eliminated over the new second floor door, and that the door opening be extended in height to match the height of the adjacent windows. A revised drawing is to be brought to Staff. Dr. Henry seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

**RE: Petition of Bull Street Chophouse
Pino Venetico
H-09-4146-2
PIN 2-0004-38-007
2 East Broughton Street
Signs**

Present for the petition was Mr. Pino Venetico.

The Preservation Officer recommends **approval with conditions.**

Mrs. Reiter gave the staff report.

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The applicant requests approval of two internally illuminated projecting principal use signs for the Bull Street Chop House located at Bull and Congress Lane.

FINDINGS:

The following standards apply:

Standard	Proposed	Comment
One principal use sign shall be permitted for each business establishment. Where a business establishment fronts on more than one street, one principal use sign for each frontage shall be permitted.	One sign will be located at the second floor level over the canopy adjacent to the entry to the restaurant on Bull Street. The second sign will be located at the second floor level over the canopy at the east end of the Broughton Street façade.	This standard is met.
Projecting signs shall be permitted one-square-foot of display area per linear-foot of frontage occupied by the principal use up to a maximum sign area of 45 square feet. The outer edge shall not extend more than six feet.	The signs are each 12 square feet and project four feet-five inches.	This standard is met.
Materials: Paper and cardboard shall not be used.	A brushed aluminum cabinet 10 inches wide with a Lexan light box is proposed.	Reverse silhouette lighting is preferred in the Historic District. To reduce the “milk bottle” effect of white background back lighted signs it is suggested that the background be tinted and/or the wattage reduced to reduce the glare.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Ramsay asked if the petitioner was in agreement with Staff’s recommendation.

Mr. Pino Venetico stated that he may go with a light gray tint to reduce the glare.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were none.

HDRB ACTION: Mr. Judson made a motion that the Savannah Historic District Board of Review approve the petition with the condition that the background be tinted and/or the wattage be reduced to reduce the glare of the background, and that the final design be submitted to Staff. Ms. Ramsay seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

**RE: Petition of Stephen Lufburrow
H-09-4150-2
PIN 2-0005-15-011
541 East Congress Street
New Construction Part I – Height and Mass**

Present for the petition was Mr. Stephen Lufburrow.

The Preservation Officer recommends **approval**.

Ms. Ramsay recused herself.

Ms. Reiter gave the Staff report.

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The applicant requests approval of a two-story carriage house.

FINDINGS:

The following Part I Height and Mass Standards Apply:

Standard	Proposed	Comment
Setbacks: No setbacks are required in RIPA zone:	N/A	
Entrances:	A second floor entrance is proposed on the east elevation. This will be visible from the lane.	The entrance is compatible.
Building Height:	The overall height is 23 feet at the highest point. It is less than the adjacent carriage house and while taller than the front cottage, it will not be visible from Congress Street.	The height is compatible. A height comparison drawing was submitted.
Tall Building Principles and Large-Scale Development:	N/A	
Proportion of Structure's Front Façade:	The proportion of the lane façade is consistent with other carriage houses along the lane.	
Proportion of Openings:	The windows have a 3:5 ratio.	This standard is met.
Rhythm of Solids-to-Voids:	A three-bay rhythm is proposed on the lane elevation.	This is a typical rhythm for a lane structure.
Rhythm of Structure on Street:	The carriage house is sited in the same plane as adjacent carriage houses.	The siting is compatible.
Rhythm of Entrances, Porch Projections,	The entrance is on the east side.	The entrance is compatible.

Balconies:		
Walls of Continuity:	The proposed carriage house maintains the wall of continuity along the lane.	It is in-line with adjacent carriage houses and walls.
Scale:		

The following Part II Design Standards Apply:

Standard	Proposed	Comments
Commercial Design Standards:	N/A	
Windows and Doors:	Windows: True Divided light 2/2 double-hung, aluminum clad, Weathershield Life Guard series. A four-raised panel door is proposed.	The windows are compatible with historic windows nearby.
Roof Shape:	Side gable roof with metal, 6” panel standing seam roof with 1¾” rib height, color: Patina Green.	The roof shape and material are compatible.
Balconies, Stoops, Stairs, and Porches:	Wood stair. A railing section has been provided.	The stair material is compatible with the structure.
Fences:	Existing.	
Overlay District Standards:	N/A	
Materials:	Siding: Smoothface HardiePlank	
Color:	Color: Benjamin Moore Pure White No. 7005; Trim and railing Sherwin-Williams Tricorn Black No. 6258; Shutters-Sherwin-Williams Stolen Kiss No. 7586.	The colors are consistent with the main house.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ellis Cook stated he owned the house next door and asked if the first and second floor was just open space. He asked if it was relevant to the Board what the space was being used for.

Mr. Gay stated that the Board did not have purview over use.

Dr. Watkins stated the Board was only concerned with external compatibility.

Mr. Engle asked if there should be articulation on the first floor.

HDRB ACTION: Mr. Engle made a motion that the Savannah Historic District Board of Review approve the petition as submitted. Mr. Gay seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

**RE: Petition of Signs for Minds
H-09-4151-2
PIN 2-0044-01-007
606 Abercorn Street
Sign**

Present for the petition was Mr. Ameer Mustafa.

The Preservation Officer recommends **approval**.

Mrs. Reiter gave the Staff report.

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The applicant requests approval of a 17.2-square-foot projecting sign.

FINDINGS:

1. The lot is zoned RIP-D. A maximum of 12 square feet is permitted for a projecting principal use sign. A Finding-of-Fact will be necessary to send to the Zoning Board of Appeals regarding the variance request.
2. The material is proposed to be aluminum plate with a dark green background. Aluminum cast letters will be attached to the face of the plate. Metal brackets will support the sign which will be indirectly lighted.
3. The sign is to be mounted at the second floor level above the projecting canopy.
4. A 5.2-square-foot sign variance is being requested. The building has been mixed use for over a decade (606, Good Eats, Sweet Leaf). Due to the design of the façade there is a visibility issue with a fascia sign.

The Preservation Officer recommends approval of the design as presented with a Finding-of-Fact that the 5.2-square-foot size variance is visually compatible at this location.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Ramsay asked what the supports were.

Mr. Ameer Mustafa stated that the brackets were metal, four-inch round tubing with a round shaped ball at the end. He said that it would be the same color as the sign.

Ms. Ramsay asked if the brackets were included in the size of the sign.

Mrs. Reiter stated that the brackets were not counted in the sign size.

Mr. Engle asked if Mr. Mustafa would consider moving the sign to the end and side mount the sign to the edge to leave the front façade unencumbered.

Mr. Mustafa stated that if the Board required it that the owner would do it.

Staff was asked why the variance was recommended for approval.

Mrs. Reiter stated that this was a commercial corridor and there were several even larger signs nearby. She also pointed out that the recessed entry to the building and the wing walls presented problems for placing a fascia sign in a visible location.

HDBR ACTION: Mr. Engle made a motion that the Savannah Historic District Board of Review make a Finding-of-Fact that a sign installation variance be approved with the following conditions that the sign be shifted to the north and mounted on the edge and at the side of the building, leaving the second floor uninterrupted. Mr. Gay seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

RE: STAFF REVIEWS

1. Petition of Coastal Canvas Products Co., Inc.
H-09-4142(S)-2
303 Drayton Street
Awning
STAFF DECISION: APPROVED
2. Petition of Ramsay-Sherrill Architects
Linda Ramsay
H-09-4143(S)-2
309 East Gordon Street
Color Change/Roof/Existing Windows/Doors
STAFF DECISION: APPROVED
3. Petition of Coastal Canvas Products Co., Inc.
Jennifer Wall
H-09-4144(S)-2
312 West Broughton Street
Awning
STAFF DECISION: APPROVED
4. Petition of Coastal Canvas Products Co., Inc.
Jennifer Wall
H-09-4145(S)-2
41 Whitaker Street
Awning
STAFF DECISION: APPROVED
5. Petition of Savannah College of Art and Design
Martin Smith
H-09-4148(S)-2
318 East Liberty Street
Roof Repair
STAFF DECISION: APPROVED

6. Petition of Gunn, Meyerhoff & Shay
Patrick Shay
H-09-4149(S)-2
201 West Bay Street
Safety Guard Railing
STAFF DECISION: APPROVED

**RE: WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE
OF APPROPRIATENESS**

Mrs. Ramsay stated that she had been asked about work at 120 East Taylor Street. She said that there was a wall with statuary on either side.

Mrs. Reiter stated that she would look into it.

Mrs. Ramsay asked whether the Leopold's Ice Cream shop's ice cream cone was approved.

Mrs. Reiter answered yes.

**RE: NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

Mrs. Reiter announced that the Historic District Ordinance Draft Revisions public comment period had begun and would run through July 12th. She said that there had been a series of briefing meetings with various groups, and that there would be two public meetings on June 15, 2009, and June 25, 2009, in the MPC Hearing Room at 112 East State Street from 6:00 p.m. to 7:30 p.m. She also said that a video was being made for the government channel and a resource manual was available for reading in the MPC Information Room. She also announced the BLOG site at www.savannahdrc.org had been set up to receive comments.

Dr. Watkins asked that a Part I and Part II discussion be included on the Retreat agenda.

Ms. Ramsay asked that a discussion of complete submissions also be added to the agenda.

Mrs. Reiter reminded the Board that there would be a mock e-agenda meeting on Tuesday, August 11th and that the second retreat would be Thursday, August 27th.

Mr. Judson stated that he needed drawings to look at when he is in the field.

Mr. Engle stated that the cost was being shifted from the applicant to the Board members.

RE: OTHER BUSINESS

Dr. Watkins reminded the Board that the microphones were extremely sensitive, that they pick up the noise of drawings being put on top of them, and any extraneous remarks.

Mrs. Reiter asked the Board to return Janine's quorum calls.

**RE: APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS
MEETING – May 13, 2009**

HDRB ACTION: Ms. Ramsay made a motion that the Savannah Historic District Board of Review approve the Minutes of May 13, 2009, with the addition that Mr. Overton was in attendance. Mr. Reed seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.

RE: ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Historic District Board of Review the meeting was adjourned at approximately 3:50 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Beth Reiter,
Preservation Officer

BR/jnp