

## **Historic Preservation Commission**

Virtual Meeting February 24, 2021 3:00PM Meeting Minutes

## FEBRUARY 24, 2021 HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

A Pre-Meeting was held at 2:30 p.m. before this meeting. The Board asked questions pertaining to the items on the February 24, 2021 Regular Agenda. No testimony was received and no votes were taken.

Members Present:	Virginia Mobley, Chair Chelsea Jackson-Greene, Vice-Chair Kendra Clark Rebecca Fenwick Darren Bagley-Heath T. Jerry Lominack J. Haley Swindle Dr. Robin Williams
Staff Present:	Pamela Everett, Esq., Assistant Executive Director Leah Michalak, Historic Preservation Director Ryan Jarles, Cultural Resources Planner Aislinn Droski, Assistant Planner Olivia Arfuso, Assistant Planner Sally Helms, Administrative Assistant Julie Yawn, Systems Analyst

#### I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

#### 1. Call to order and Welcome

**Ms. Mobley** called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. She outlined the role of the Historic Preservation Commission and explained that staff will present each application with a recommendation; and then the petitioner will present his/her comments. The public will make comments. The petitioner will be given the opportunity to respond to the public comments. Then the HPC will make its decision.

#### **II. SIGN POSTING**

#### **III. CONSENT AGENDA**

#### STREETCAR DISTRICT

- 2. Petition of Hansen Architects P.C. | 21-000659-COA | 226-228 West 38th Street | Alterations
  - Streetcar Staff Recommendation 21-000659-COA.pdf
  - Submittal Packet Drawings and photographs.pdf

#### Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the alterations and the additions of a 2-story porch and stairs at 226 and 228 West 38th Street with the following conditions to be provided to staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Ensure that the infill between the piers is recessed a minimum of 3 inches.

2. Provide material specifications for the doors, windows, screen, and mortar.

3. Provide the building coverage and ensure that it does not exceed 60 percent

Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Rebecca Fenwick	
Second: Kendra Clark	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Jerry Lominack	- Aye
Kendra Clark	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
J. Haley Swindle	- Aye

#### 3. Petition of J. Elder Studio LLC | 21-000661-COA | 410 East 37th Street | Rehabilitation

- Streetcar Staff Recommendation 21-000661-COA.pdf
- Ø Submittal Packet.pdf
- Previously Continued Submittal Packet.pdf
- Preservation Brief 46\_ The Preservation and Reuse of Historic Gas Stations.pdf

#### Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve to rehabilitate the historic service station building located at 410 East 37th Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

#### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Rebecca Fenwick	
Second: Kendra Clark	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Jerry Lominack	- Aye
Kendra Clark	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye

Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
J. Haley Swindle	- Aye

#### **IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

#### 4. Adopt the February 24, 2021 Agenda

## Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby adopt the February 24, 2021 Agenda.

Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Rebecca Fenwick	
Second: Kendra Clark	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Jerry Lominack	- Aye
Kendra Clark	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
J. Haley Swindle	- Aye

#### V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

#### 5. Approval of the January 27, 2021 Meeting Minutes

#### @ 01-27-2021 Minutes.pdf

#### Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the the Meeting Minutes of January 27, 2021.

## Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Rebecca Fenwick	
Second: Robin Williams	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Jerry Lominack	- Aye
Kendra Clark	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye

#### VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

#### **VII. CONTINUED AGENDA**

6. Petition of Vanessa L. Walthour | 20-005437-COA | 1209 Barnard Street | Alterations and Sign Package

#### Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Rebecca Fenwick	
Second: Kendra Clark	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Jerry Lominack	- Aye
Kendra Clark	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
J. Haley Swindle	- Aye

#### 7. Petition of Eco-Friendly Contracting | 20-004890-COA | 301 West 33rd Street | Alterations

#### Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Rebecca Fenwick	
Second: Kendra Clark	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Jerry Lominack	- Aye
Kendra Clark	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
J. Haley Swindle	- Aye

#### 8. Petition of Eco Friendly Contracting | 21-000077-COA | 2204-2210 Burroughs Street | Rehabilitation

#### Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve to continue the petition for a rehabilitation of the property located at 2204-2210 Burroughs Street as requested in order for the applicant to address the following:

1. Provide a material specification for the brick repairs.

2. Ensure that any repair or replacement of historic wooden features be done in-kind and in the same configuration as the original.

3. Provide information regarding the existing windows on the first floor. If the windows are wood, staff requests that they be repaired and/or replaced with wood in a historically appropriate configuration.

4. Provide information regarding what is existing and what is proposed for the boarded-up doors on the front facade.

5. Revise the material for the roof replacement to be a standing seam metal roof in the same configuration as the original and a metal drip edge covering all edges.

6. Ensure that any repair to the eaves and soffit is done in-kind, using wood.

#### Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Rebecca Fenwick	
Second: Kendra Clark	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Jerry Lominack	- Aye
Kendra Clark	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
J. Haley Swindle	- Aye

# 9. Petition of Coastal Development Partners | 21-000044-COA | 202 West 42nd Street | New Construction, Small (Parts I and II)

#### Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve to defer the petition as requested.

## Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Rebecca Fenwick Second: Kendra Clark Rebecca Fenwick

- Aye

Jerry Lominack	- Aye
Kendra Clark	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
J. Haley Swindle	- Aye

10. Petition of Coastal Development Partners | 21-000046-COA | 204 West 42nd Street | New Construction, Small (Parts I and II)

## Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve to defer the petition as requested.

Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Rebecca Fenwick	
Second: Kendra Clark	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Jerry Lominack	- Aye
Kendra Clark	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
J. Haley Swindle	- Aye

#### **VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION**

#### IX. REGULAR AGENDA

#### **VICTORIAN DISTRICT**

<u>11. Petition of CDH Construction Group | 20-005853-COA | 407 East Anderson Lane | New Construction,</u> Small (Parts I and II) and Variance Recommendation

- Victorian Staff Recommendation 20-005853-COA.pdf
- Submittal Packet Drawings and Narrative.pdf
- Staff Research.pdf

Mr. Jason Hendricks was present on behalf of the petition.

**Ms.** Aislinn Droski gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for New Construction Small (Parts I and II) located at 407 East Anderson Lane. The New Construction building is to be 25'-10" in height, 25'-10" in width, and 41' -0" of which is a covered stoop over the front door. She stated that the applicant is also requesting a recommendation to the Zoning board of Appeals from the Article 5 - Base Zoning District standard that reads:

Rear yard: 20 (min.)

To allow for a 10"-0" rear yard setback.

**Ms. Droski** gave the following background data on the structure. The Sanborn Maps indicate that in 1954 and 1973, there was a wood-frame, two-story residential dwelling located at 407 East Anderson Lane. The dwelling was situated on an individual lot with a front stoop. The neighboring dwelling, at 409 East Anderson Lane, was also two-stories with a front stoop. While the lot at 409 East Anderson Lane was combined with the lot directly in front, the existing lot at 407 East Anderson Lane appears to have maintained its historic size.

**Ms. Drosk**i reported that staff recommends Approval of the New Construction Small (Parts I and II) located at 407 East Anderson Lane with the following\_conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Increase the eastern side yard setback to meet the 3-foot minimum.
- 2. Revise the foundation material, including the stoop piers, to be of one material, either brick or stucco.
- 3. Revise the foundation infill material on the front stoop to be a minimum of one-half inch thick lattice boards.
- 4. Center the two windows on the eastern side of the front façade horizontally between the entry door and the garage door.
- 5. Provide details regarding the window sill and ensure that it is pronounced.
- 6. Ensure all wooden stoop elements are painted or stained.
- 7. Ensure that the light source for the exterior flood lights is white light.

And

Recommend approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the Article 5 – Base Zoning District standards:

Rear yard: 20 (min).

To allow for a 10'-0" feet setback in the rear yard because the variance complies with the variance criteria for approval.

Ms. Droski entertained questions from the Commission.

Dr. Williams pointed out that on Sheet 9, it appears that the eastern yard setback is 3' - 2".

Ms. Droski answered that staff needs to switch this. She was referring to the western setback.

Ms. Fenwick asked for clarification, if it was stated that one side is brick and the other side is stucco.

**Ms. Droski** explained that the applicant is proposing brick for the front foundation and stucco on the back and side. Staff is requesting that the applicant use one material for the structure.

#### PETITIONER COMMENTS

**Mr. Hendricks** explained that it was their intent with the foundation was to have brick on the piers and the remaining foundation was to be stucco. They will comply with the recommendation regarding this. He addressed that the western setback as shown on sheet 9 is 2 feet. They actually meet the 3 feet setback, but inadvertently labeled it as 2 feet. They will make the changes.

#### PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Ryan Arvay of the Historic Savannah Foundation [HSF] said the HSF primarily agrees with staff

recommendations. They believe that the foundation piers should be brick, which is generally the historic precedent, especially on the lane. He was pleased to hear that the applicant is in agreement to use one or the other. He explained that the shutters on the second story front facade need to be on all the windows or don't put shutters at all. They agree with staff that the first floor window on the front facade should be better centered. They realize that this corresponds to the interior slab, however, their understanding is that the window is not the only problem as there is a real inconsistency in the fenestration on the building. Mr. Arvay stated that there seems to be various sized openings and placements which seems to be haphazard. On the rear facade there is one smaller window [he realizes these intend to be bathroom windows], but HSF preference is that this be cleaned up. They recommend that a better garage door be obtained if this is supposed to be in the tradition of an accessory structure or what is traditionally called a "carriage house."

#### **COMMISSION DISCUSSION**

**Mr. Lominack** stated that he did not find the rhythm of windows on the front, side, and rear façade to be visually compatible and expressed that the applicant should re-study the size and position of the windows. In response to Mr. Lominack's comments, Dr. Williams expressed that the variety of window shapes and positions proposed are consistent with structures that face a lane and read as accessory dwelling units and found the openings to be visually compatible and historically appropriate. Mr. Bagley-Heath and Ms. Fenwick agreed with Dr. Williams's assessment.

The Commission noted that staff made a mistake in labeling the western side-yard setback as "eastern". The applicant indicated that the 2-foot western side-yard setback was a labeling error. But, the Commission elected to keep the condition with the revision of the cardinal direction in order to ensure that the applicant revised this label in the final drawings.

#### Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the New Construction Small (Parts I and II) located at 407 East Anderson Lane with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Increase the western side yard setback to meet the 3-foot minimum.
- 2. Revise the foundation material, including the stoop piers, to be of one material, either brick or stucco.
- 3. Revise the foundation infill material on the front stoop to be a minimum of one-half inch thick lattice boards.
- 4. Center the two windows on the eastern side of the front facade horizontally between the entry door and the garage door.
- 5. Provide details regarding the window sill and ensure that it is pronounced.
- 6. Ensure all wooden stoop elements are painted or stained.
- 7. Ensure that the light source for the exterior flood lights is white light.

## And

Recommend approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the Article 5 - Base Zoning District standards:

Rear yard: 20 (min).

To allow for a 10' -0" feet setback in the rear yard because the variance complies with the variance criteria

for approval.

## Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Robin Williams	
Second: Chelsea Jackson-Greene	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Jerry Lominack	- Nay
Kendra Clark	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
J. Haley Swindle	- Aye

12. Petition of Matt Stein | 21-000297-COA | 412 East Duffy Street | Infill of Rear Window Opening for Meter Installation

- Victorian Staff Recommendation 21-000297-COA.pdf
- Submittal Packet- Application and Checklist.pdf
- Submittal Packet- Narrative and Photos.pdf
- Staff Research.pdf
- Signed Decision Packet 20-005257-COA.pdf
- Signed Decision Packet 20-005537-COA.pdf
- Window Replacement Locations (Email).pdf

Mr. Matthew Stein was present on behalf of the petition.

**Ms. Olivia Arfuso** gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for the infill of a historic window opening to allow for the installation of an electric meter, and the replacement of (4) windows at 412 East Duffy Street. The current electric meter location is no longer to code. The meter is proposed to be moved so that is is situated 3-feet, 6 inches above the deck and 5-feet away from the nearest window opening. The first-floor window, to the left of the rear door, is proposed to be removed. The opening will be infilled and sided over to match the exterior of the home.

**Ms. Arfuso** explained that (4) windows are also proposed to be replaced with "VictorBilt" Historic Series, wood, double-hung, single-pane windows. One window on the rear will be replaced, as well as three side windows.

**Ms.** Arfuso gave the following background information. On October 29, 2020, staff approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for the in-kind reconstruction/replacement of the rear porch, including the relocation of the stairs to the north-west corner of the porch [File No. 20-005257-COA] with the following conditions:

1. Ensure that all work is undertaken using the gentlest means possible to avoid damage to any historic material.

2. Ensure that all wood is painted or stained.

Staff determined that Condition #2 has not been met.

**Ms. Arfuso** stated that on November 16, 2020, staff approved an amendment to the previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness [File No. 20-5257-COA] to include the relocation of the HVAC condensers and the installation of gas, tank-less water heaters [file No. 005537-COA] with the following conditions:

1. Ensure that all work is undertaken using the gentlest means possible to avoid-damage to any historic materials. Ensure that the proposed installation of the gas, tank-less water heater does not damage any historic materials that characterize the property.

2. Ensure that, both, of these locations are sufficiently screened from any public-right-of-way [including the lane]. Submit evidence of adequate screening to staff for review and approval.

3. Ensure that the tank-less water heaters do not encroach on the neighboring property line.

**Ms. Arfuso** reported that staff recommends approval of the replacement of (4) windows at 412 East Duffy Street with the following conditions because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Ensure that the (4) proposed windows are replaced using the gentlest means possible to avoid damage to any historic materials.

2. Ensure that all replacement windows have transparent glass with no dark tints or reflective affects, and that the existing window opening dimensions, lite patterns, and wood framing members remain.

## AND

Deny the infill of a historic window opening to allow for the installation of an electric meter, with the following conditions because the work is not visually compatible and does not meet the standards:

1. Ensure that an alternative spot (on the side or rear), or a freestanding electric meter pole, is submitted to staff for review and approval prior to installation.

2. Staff recommends considering decreasing the size of the deck, so that it is inset from the east corner of the rear façade. Therefore, the meter can be accessed from the ground, in its current location.

Ms. Arfuso entertained questions from the Commission.

## PETITIONER COMMENTS

**Mr. Stein** explained that they received staff approval for the deck that was a replacement to what was existing on the property. Now, with a slight modification of the stairs, it now runs off the back of the property. This was approved previously and this is the reason they went forward with the replacement to be in the exact footprint that was there. The electric meters on the back of the property have to be per Georgia Power's ruling on the rear of building. They can not put the meter on the side of the house. This is in accordance with Georgia Power's new code. Mr. Stein said they have done everything they can do and they have been previously approved.

Mr. Lominack asked Mr. Stein if the meters were existing before the deck was built.

**Mr. Stein** answered yes. They have not changed the electric meters. When he purchased the property, the deck that they now was constructed was built with the exact dimensions as the deck that was previously on the property.

Mr. Lominack asked if the deck was in the same location.

Mr. Stein answered yes.

**Mr. Lominack** asked that due to the fact that the meters are closer to the windows [less than five feet], he guessed they are grandfathered in. He did not know if rebuilding the deck in the same location meets the exact same configuration.

**Mr. Stein** explained that the only adjustment that has been made is the staircase because originally it went off on the right side of the house and now it goes to the rear because the property was parceled off and is not two separate parcels.

Mr. Lominack asked Mr. Stein if Georgia Power has been reading the meter standing on the deck.

**Mr. Stein** answered yes, but in accordance with Georgia Power's new code, they will not let the meter remain there.

**Ms. Mobley** asked staff if the design of the deck is for review or is this an after-the-fact request. Did Georgia Power or the property owner generate this request?

**Ms. Arfuso** explained that staff reviewed the rear deck in October, 2020. It was an in-kind construction of the deck with the dimensions of the preexisting deck. At the time, staff was unaware of the electric issues with the electric meter. This was brought to staff's attention when the applicant applied.

**Ms. Mobley** asked staff where were the stairs located when they approved the in-kind repair of the deck.

**Ms. Arfuso** answered that the stairs were on the right side. But, since the lot was parceled off, the stairs were relocated.

#### PUBLIC COMMENTS

**Mr. Ryan Arvay of the Historic Savannah Foundation [HSF]** stated that they concur with the staff recommendations on this petition. It is a difficult situation. The HSF is sympathetic to the property owner; Georgia Power can be difficult to work with and very uncompromising. They have found themselves in similar situations on projects that they have worked with. However, the HSF supports the staff recommendation to deny closing the window. Mr. Arvay said he understood having your utility services on a freestanding pole may not be aesthetically pleasing, but it has no adverse effect on the physical structure; which is the center of this debate. The historic window should remain.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

**Ms. Fenwick** asked if there is a specific range that the meters need to be off the ground. The Stein stated that the meters need to be more than three and one-half feet off the ground. She asked if the meters could be below the deck. Mr. Lominack asked if a site plan accompanied this request and is there a side yard. Staff stated that a site plan was not received. Mr. Stein said a side yard does not exist.

The Commission was in agreement with the staff recommendations.

#### Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the replacement of (4) windows at 412 East Duffy Street with the following conditions, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Ensure that the (4) proposed windows are replaced using the gentlest means possible to avoid damage to any historic materials.

2. Ensure that all replacement windows have transparent glass with no dark tints or reflective affects, and that the existing window opening dimensions, lite patterns, and wood framing members remain.

## AND

Denial of the infill of a historic window opening to allow for the installation of an electric meter with the following conditions, because the work is not visually compatible and does not meet the standards:

1. Ensure that an alternative spot (on the side or rear), or a freestanding electric meter pole, is submitted to Staff for review and approval prior to installation.

2. Staff recommends considering decreasing the size of the deck, so that it is inset from the east corner of the rear facade. Therefore, the meter can be accessed from the ground, in its current location.

Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Kendra Clark	
Second: Darren Bagley-Heath	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Jerry Lominack	- Aye
Kendra Clark	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
J. Haley Swindle	- Aye

## 13. Petition of Laura Garcia-Culler | 21-000607-COA | 503 East Bolton Street | Addition

Victorian Staff Recommendation 21-000607-COA.pdf

- Submittal Packet Drawings.pdf
- Submittal Packet Photos.pdf
- Submittal Packet Narrative.pdf
- Submittal Packet Materials.pdf
- Petitioner Material Spec in Response to Recommendation
- Petitioner Response to Recommendation.pdf

#### Ms. Laura Gracia-Culler and Mr. Scotty Snipes were present on behalf of the petition.

**Mr. Ryan Jarles** gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for a rear addition at 503 East Bolton Street. The rear addition is proposed to be two [2] stories in height and the full width of the existing historic rear façade. The addition is proposed to include a rear uncovered wooden deck that will not be visible from the public right-of-way due to an existing privacy fence. The property appears as one large double lot; however, the property is two separate lots that have not been combined to staff's knowledge. Although not recombined, the lots are owned by the same person, the applicant. All requirements are

based on Lot 17, shown within the site plan provided within the submittal.

**Mr. Jarles** reported that staff's initial recommendation was to continue the petition for a rear addition at 503 East Bolton Street to the March 24th HPC Regular Meeting to allow for the petitioner to meet the following conditions:

1. If the setback on the east side is smaller than the minimum 3 feet allowed, revise the setback to meet the standard or apply for a Special Exception to the HPC to allow for the reduced setback.

2. Ensure that the existing openings on the first and second story remain in their existing size and configuration and that a new means of entry to the second level be created to allow for the existing historic window opening to remain intact.

3. Ensure that all work is undertaken utilizing the gentlest means possible.

4. Redesign the roofline of the addition to be subordinate to and delineated from the historic roof.

5. Delineate the accent windows from the lower doors and windows on the first story of the addition with a larger trim to create a separation and include windows on either side of the large, proposed window and door combination on the rear face to allow for a more coherent solid to void ratio. Ensure the windows, other than the accent windows, are operable.

6. Provide material specifications for brick and mortar, lighting, doors, and windows, and ensure that the muntins are 7/8 inches or less.

7. Ensure that all electrical, HVAC, and refuse locations are provided within the drawings.

**Mr. Jarles** explained that the petitioner provided an updated submittal packet to staff prior to this meeting. The updated submittal packet addressed and met staff's original conditions 1, 2, 3, 4, and 7 in their entirety. The only items within the conditions of staff's original approval that were not addressed were the last sentence of condition 5 and the entirety of condition 6. He stated that due to the updated submittal, staff has changed their recommendation to be for approval of the petition with the conditions; the conditions being the last sentence of staff's original condition 5, and the entirety of staff's original condition 6.

Mr. Jarles entertained questions from the Commission.

## PETITIONER COMMENTS

**Ms. Garcia-Culler** stated that she appreciated the HPC reviewing their petition. She was hopeful that their petition would be approved. She was in agreement with all of staff's recommendations.

Mr. Snipes said the bricks will be painted [in-kind] to match the bricks that are already painted.

#### PUBLIC COMMENTS

**Mr. Ryan Arvay of the Historic Savannah Foundation [HSF]** complimented the property owner on this property. It is a beautiful Victorian home and is quite a landmark on East Bolton Street. The HSF certainly understands the owner's desire to have more space and the need to adapt these homes to modern living. Therefore, the HSF does not have any objection to sensible additions built onto the rear. Mr. Arvay said the Architectural Review Committee did have a concern about the configuration of the addition. It seems to be a slightly odd configuration with the second story portion being just partial width. He said in other words, they found it to be visually incompatible. Therefore, they believe that this needs to be continued and have the designed studied a little more. They agree with all of staff's recommendations, but feel that something more pleasing and slightly less haphazard in design might be warranted.

**Ms. Garcia-Culler**, in response to public comments, stated that while she understands the internal configuration may not be to HSF's liking, but as far as the visual incompatibility, they have looked at

#### **COMMISSION DISCUSSION**

The Commission discussed the design of the project, the windows, and the roof line. Mr. Bagley-Heath believed the windows should be 2/2 instead of 9/9. Ms. Fenwick asked about the late submission and the revised drawings. She asked staff to clarify what are the rules regarding this.

**Mr. Jarles** explained that the submission was solely in response to the staff's recommendations. The petitioner saw what the staff's recommendations were and she wanted to quickly give staff their updated drawings to be received in time for the Commission meeting. The petitioner was not updating the application, but was submitting their response to staff's recommendation. The petitioner submitted an on time complete application, but she just updated her drawings.

**Ms. Fenwick** asked if the recommendations are not posted until the Friday before the HPC meeting. Is this correct?

Mr. Jarles answered yes, the recommendation has to be done the Friday before the HPC meeting.

**Ms. Mobley** stated that the recommendation can change subject to new information that is provided at the HPC meeting as well as the information submitted for staff recommendation.

Staff presented the HPC with an updated submittal packet that was provided by the petitioner prior to the meeting today. The updated submittal packet addressed and met staff's original conditions 1, 2, 3, 4, and 7 in their entirety. The only items with the conditions of staff's original approval that were not addressed were the last sentence of condition 5 and the entirety of condition 6.

Due to the updated submittal, staff changed their recommendation to be for approval of the petition with the conditions; the conditions being the last sentence of staff's original condition 5, and the entirety of staff's original condition 6.

The Commission, based on information provided at the meeting, concurred with the staff's changed recommendations for approval. They added that the rear windows be 2/2 instead of 9/9.

#### Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the petition for a rear addition at 503 East Bolton Street with the following conditions,

because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Ensure the windows, other than the accent windows, are operable and that the windows on the rear are revised to a 2-over-2 lite pattern configuration.

2. Provide material specifications for brick and mortar, lighting, doors, and windows, and ensure that the muntins are 7/8 inches or less.

#### Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Kendra Clark Second: Darren Bagley-Heath Rebecca Fenwick

- Aye

Jerry Lominack	- Aye
Kendra Clark	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
J. Haley Swindle	- Aye

## CUYLER-BROWNVILLE DISTRICT

14. Petition of Eco Friendly Contracting | 21-000048-COA | 2402-2404 Bulloch Street | After-the-Fact Rehabilitation

- Staff Recommendation 21-000048-COA.pdf
- Submittal Packet 21-000048-COA.pdf

Mr. Andre Gadson, contractor, and Mr. David Gugenhein, property owner, were present on behalf of the petition.

**Mr. Jarles** gave the report. The applicant is requesting approval for the after-the-fact rehabilitation of the property located at 2402 and 2404 Bulloch Street. On January 27, 2021, the Commission made the decision to continue the petition for the after-the-fact rehabilitation of the property that included the following scope of work:

"Existing Roof is GAF Shingles – charcoal gray - shingles will remain. Repairing and painting existing siding – like kind. The painting shall be light yellow in color. Existing front doors will remain. Existing railings on front of the house will remain as is."

**Mr. Jarles** explained that upon Staff's further investigation of the property, it was discovered that the property was entirely rehabilitated (inappropriately) without having received a Certificate of Appropriateness. The work that was undertaken without approval was:

- 1. Replacement of the wood siding with Hardie Board.
- 2. Replacement of windows with prohibited vinyl windows.
- 3. Replacement of doors with metal doors.
- 4. The shingle roof was replaced with a shingle roof.

**Mr. Jarles** stated that additionally, not included in the scope of work within the current petition, the property owner completed work on the rear building also located on the property (known as 805 West 40th Street). The rear building located on the same property was constructed sometime around 1960 and is a non-contributing building. This work included:

- 1. Replacement of windows and doors.
- 2. Shingle roof was replaced with shingle roof.

Mr. Jarles said the petition was continued to allow for the petitioner to meet the following conditions:

- 1. Removal of the prohibited vinyl windows on the contributing building and replacement with wood, single-pane, true divided lite windows previously approved by the Board for use on contributing buildings.
- 2. The window replacement on the contributing building must include the removal of all Hardie Board trim and replacement with compatible wood header, sills, and trim.

- 3. Removal of the metal doors on the contributing and replacement with solid wood doors.
- 4. Ensure that all work is undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
- 5. Removal of the prohibited vinyl windows on the non-contributing building and replacement with windows previously approved by the Board for use on non-contributing buildings.
- 6. Removal of the metal doors on the non-contributing building and replacement with doors made of wood, clad wood, or steel.
- 7. Reconstruction of the historic hipped porch roof.

**Mr. Jarles** reported that staff recommends approval for the petition of the after-the-fact rehabilitation of the property located at 2402 and 2404 Bulloch Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Ensure that all work is undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
- 2. Ensure that all windows include wood trim, headers, and sills.
- 3. Remove the Hardie Board siding from the dormer and replace with wood siding during phase one or two and indicate which phase this will be included.
- 4. Reconstruct the porch roof to match the historic hipped roof shape.
- 5. Provide a site plan showing the exact locations of the fence prior to submitting drawings to be stamped for permitting and ensure the fence is to be painted or stained.

#### <u>AND</u>

Submit an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the after-the-fact door and window replacement at 805 West 40th Street with the following items addressed:

- 1. The windows will be required to be replaced with windows previously approved for use on noncontributing buildings and must meet the window standards.
- 2. Ensure the replacement of the doors with doors made of glass, wood, clad wood, or steel.

Mr. Jarles entertained questions from staff.

Mr. Lominack asked why the strange looking post in the middle of the front slab is there.

Mr. Jarles answered that he believes in the past, the post was put there to support the roof.

#### PETITIONER COMMENTS

**Mr. Gadson** asked if staff was recommending that the windows on the noncontributing building in the rear match the vinyl windows that will be put in the building.

**Mr. Jarles** answered that staff is requesting that the vinyl windows be removed and replaced with windows previously approved for use on noncontributing buildings. He explained that vinyl windows are a prohibited material in the district; it cannot be utilized.

Mr. Gadson asked if it could be wood clad.

Mr. Jarles replied that wood clad is an approved material.

Mr. Gadson stated that he did not see the phases recommendation in staff's recommendations.

**Mr. Jarles** explained that the Certificate of Appropriateness [COA] is good for two years. Therefore, Mr. Gadson may start the second phase in 2022.

**Mr. Jarles** said it was mentioned in the Pre-Meeting how many times he has had to come before the Commission. His name was mentioned about how many times he has appeared before the

Mr. Lominack asked Mr. Gadson if the strange looking post could be removed.

**Mr. Gadson** explained that it is a strange looking thing to have, but a brick handrail is here and also cinderblocks have been here for quite a period of time. He has no idea when it was put there; may be it was put there in 1950s or 1960s. The poles are sitting in concrete slabs. They will check on post.

#### PUBLIC COMMENTS

violations.

**Mr. Ryan Arvay of the Historic Savannah Foundation [HSF]** stated that they concur with staff recommendations. They are glad to see that the home will be returned to its original state in terms of siding and windows. Mr. Arvay said HSF had not given thought to this, but they like Mr. Lominck's recommendation, although it can not be enforced, the removal of the center post. It appears not to be adding much. The porch will be rebuilt to the original hip configuration. Therefore, with the rebuilding of the porch, it would appear that this would be an opportune time to remove it. Mr. Arvay said he is not certain, but he believes the post was added in the 1960s to support a sagging porch. Consequently, when the porch roof is rebuilt, they want to encourage the owner to remove the post.

#### **COMMISSION DISCUSSION**

The Commission was in agreement with the staff's recommendation. Their discussion included comments from Commission members on their desire for the removal of the 1960s era central porch post.

#### Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the petition of the after-the-fact rehabilitation of the property located at 2402 and 2404 Bulloch Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Ensure that all work is undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

2. Ensure that all windows include wood trim, headers, and sills.

3. Remove the Hardie Board siding and replace with wood siding during phase one or two and indicate which phase this will be included.

4. Reconstruct the porch roof to match the historic hipped roof shape.

5. Provide a site plan showing the exact locations of the fence prior to submitting drawings to be stamped for permitting and ensure the fence is to be painted or stained.

AND

Submit an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the after-the-fact door and window replacement at 805 West 40th Street with the following items addressed:

1. The windows will be required to be replaced with windows previously approved for use on noncontributing buildings and must meet the window standards.

2. Ensure the replacement of the doors with doors made of glass, wood, clad wood, or steel.

Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Rebecca Fenwick	
Second: Darren Bagley-Heath	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Jerry Lominack	- Aye
Kendra Clark	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
J. Haley Swindle	- Aye

## X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

#### 15. Acknowledge Staff Reviews

#### Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby acknowledge the "Approved Staff Reviews."

Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Jerry Lominack	
Second: Darren Bagley-Heath	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Jerry Lominack	- Aye
Kendra Clark	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
J. Haley Swindle	- Aye

16. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 21-000192-COA | 1400 Bull Street | Staff Approved - Non-illuminated wall sign

Victorian Staff SIGNED Decision - 21-000192-COA- 1400 Bull St.pdf

17. Petition of Bobby Phillips | 21-000575-COA | 1901 Abercorn Street | Staff Approved - Sign

#### Streetcar Staff SIGNED Decision - 21-000575-COA - 1901 Abercorn St.pdf

18. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 20-005779-COA | 820 Abercorn Street | Staff Approved - amendment to previously approved COA for Sign

@ 20-005779-COA SIGNED Decision.pdf

19. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 21-000740-COA | 2500 Abercorn Street | Staff Approved - Sign face change

@21-000740-COA SIGNED Decision.pdf

20. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 21-000772-COA | 1400 Bull Street | Staff Approved - Sign

Victorian Staff SIGNED Decision - 21-000772-COA - 1400 Bull St.pdf

21. Petition of Bart Redmond | 21-000930-COA | 1315 Bull Street | Staff Approved - Repairs and Refacing of EIFS with condition.

@ 21-000930-COA SIGNED Decision Packet.pdf

22. Petition of Doug Bean Signs| 21-000891-COA | 618 West Anderson Street | Staff Approved - Sign

@ 21-000891-COA SIGNED Decision Packet.pdf

#### XI. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

#### **XII. OTHER BUSINESS**

## **XV. ADJOURNMENT**

- 23. Next HPC Pre-Meeting: Wednesday, March 24, 2021 at 2:30pm
- 24. Next HPC Regular Meeting: Wednesday, March 24, 2021 at 3:00pm

#### 25. Adjourn

**Ms. Mobley** explained that City Council appointed a new member to the HPC in January, 2021 replacing Mr. Vernon Jones. Several attempts have been made [emails and phone calls] to contact the appointee, but no response has been received. Ms. Mobley asked the HPC to consider making a motion to City Council asking them to reconsider this appointment and make a new appointment to this Commission to bring the HPC in full membership.

Upon motion of Mr. Lominack, seconded by Dr. Williams and carried, the HPC moved to request that City Council reconsider the January, 2021 appointee and reappoint a new person to the HPC as staff has not been able to contact her.

\*\*\*

There being no further business to come before the HPC, Ms. Mobley adjourned the meeting at 4:55 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Leah G. Michalak, Director Historic Preservation

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.