

**SAVANNAH HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
VICTORIAN HISTORIC DISTRICT
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

PETITIONER: Lynch Associates Architects

FILE NO.: 21-004442-COA

PROPERTY ADDRESS: 1201 Bull Street

PIN: 20044 36001

ZONING: TC-2

STAFF REVIEWER: Leah G. Michalak

DATE: October 27, 2021

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting approval for rehabilitation and alterations for the two buildings located at 1201 Bull Street. These two buildings are located on the same parcel and the buildings facing Duffy Street is known as 11 West Duffy Street. Per the applicant:

1201 Bull Street, located at the intersection of Bull Street and Duffy Street, is in poor repair with broken and deteriorated windows and cracked stucco, and will have minor modifications to its façade facing Bull Street to accommodate the multiple tenants of the building. The current condition of the facade reflects this difference between the two original “buildings” in the storefront design – with the wood storefront to the north and the curved façade and inset aluminum storefront to the south. The modifications for the two sides are as follows:

On the south end, the (broken) aluminum storefront will be replaced in kind. The second story windows will be replaced with casement windows to match the existing casement windows on the rear and in keeping with the curved Art Deco storefront. All replacement windows will be Quaker Historic series, aluminum clad. At the entry door to the second story stair a new metal canopy is proposed.

On the north side, the wood storefront will remain in place. The long fabric awning will be removed and replaced with smaller awnings over the storefront windows and doors. The second story (non-original) double hung windows will be replaced with 2 over 2 double hung aluminum clad windows in keeping with the wood storefront character. The parapet for the north building will be raised slightly to enhance this stylistic difference and screen to rooftop mechanical equipment.

On the Duffy Street elevation of 1201 Bull Street there are some more significant modifications proposed. The raised parapet will carry around the corner to screen the roof equipment. Four of the existing windows will be replaced with aluminum clad 2 over 2 windows to match the front elevation. The west end of the side elevation will provide an entry to the second floor; subsequently, the small windows and mis-aligned door will be enlarged to create a better street presence, with storefront windows at the ground floor and double casement windows at the second floor. The roof at the one story portion to the back will be removed and replaced with a roof terrace, trellis, and a slightly raised parapet. Behind the roof terrace within the courtyard, a new elevator shaft is proposed. It will be minimally visible from the street and will be accessed from a small second floor lobby at the corner of the roof terrace.

Between the two buildings, an 8'-0" wall and gate will screen a central courtyard beyond. Matching gates and screen wall are proposed on the lane side as well. Two small roof areas on the rear of 1201 Bull Street will also be converted into roof terraces with a trellis. These areas will be minimally visible from the street as they face onto the courtyard. In addition, on the lane side and rear of the building, the second floor windows will be replaced to match the windows on the south end of the Bull Street facing façade.

11 West Duffy Street will also forego [sic] (staff believes the applicant meant "undergo") a façade renovation. The existing storefront will be removed as will the stucco and masonry below the existing sill. New Quaker Historic Series storefront will be installed within the existing openings with a 20" metal panel sill. A new metal canopy is proposed over the entry and the center portion of the parapet will be raised slightly to make room for future signage (to be submitted separately). The stucco will be repaired or replaced in kind as necessary.

CONTEXT:

The Bull Street building(s) was constructed in 1950 (per the survey card on file at the MPC); the Duffy Street building sometime after 1973 as it does not appear on any of the Sanborn Maps. Neither are contributing resources within the National Register Victorian Historic District or the local Victorian Historic District. Staff could not locate any photographs earlier than 2006; the Bull Street building looked the same at that time that it does now. The Sanborn Maps indicate that the Bull Street building has a brick-faced first floor and a concrete block second floor; over the years it contained a variety of businesses on the ground floor; they never indicate the second floor's use. The 1973 map indicate a wood canopy or cornice wrapped around the front and a portion of the south facades. A number of one-story portions of the building were eliminated or altered between 1954 and 1973.

At the August 25, 2021, HPC Meeting, the Commission continued the petition until the off-street parking requirements are resolved. Staff received a letter to the owner's attorney from the Planning & Zoning Liaison, dated September 22, 2021, stating: "There are no vehicle and/or bicycle parking

spaces required for the Property because the parcel was developed prior to the adoption of the original zoning ordinance and a change in ownership has not occurred.”

FINDINGS:

The following standards from the Article 5 - Base Zoning Districts apply:

Traditional Commercial Districts – Cuyler-Brownville, Streetcar, and Victorian.

TC- Development Standards for Permitted Uses. *Development in any TC- district shall meet the development standards as set forth below.*

There is no minimum side yard (interior) setback for properties adjacent to any TC zoning district.

This property is not adjacent to a TC zoning district; however, the only interior side yard is the west property line which is an existing condition not proposed to change.

TC-2. *For TC-2-S Districts see Appendix A-3 of the City of Savannah Zoning ordinance for additional standards.*

Lot Dimensions (min).

Nonresidential.

Lot area per unit (sq. ft.): *None*

Lot width per unit (ft.): *20*

The lot width is an existing condition.

Building.

Building Coverage (max): *None*

Building frontage (min): *70%*

Building footprint (max sq. ft.): *10,000*

The standards are met.

Building Setbacks (ft).

For blocks with contributing structures.

Front yard: *average of block face*

Side yard (interior): *10 (min)*

Side yard (corner): *average of block face*

Rear yard: *10 (min)*

Building Separation. *See Fire Code*

Height (max).

3 stories up to 45 ft.

The setbacks and building height are existing conditions.

The following standards from the Sec 7.9 - Victorian Historic District Ordinance apply:

Visual Compatibility Criteria. To maintain the special character of the Victorian Historic District as identified in the architectural survey and visual analysis, new construction and any material change in appearance shall be consistent with the standards, criteria and guidelines developed for the district. The applicable criteria below shall be used to assess new construction and material changes. These criteria shall not be the basis for appeal to any board, commission or administrator described in this Ordinance, or to the Mayor and Aldermen.

Height. The overall height and the height of individual components of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.

Width. The proportion of the overall width and the width of individual components of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible to the contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.

Setbacks. The setbacks of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with setbacks of contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.

Rhythm. The relationship of a building or structure to the open space between it and adjacent buildings or structures shall be visually compatible with the open spaces between contributing buildings or structures to which it is visually related.

The height, width, setbacks, and rhythm are existing conditions.

Openings. The rhythm and solid-to-void ratio of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.

All new openings are taller than they are wide and are visually compatible.

Materials. The relationship of materials and textures of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with the contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.

Revise the brake (break) metal storefront base to be a visually compatible material and one that is permitted by the storefront design standards.

Roof Shapes. The roof shape of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.

The parapets of varying height are visually compatible.

Scale. The overall scale and the scale of individual components of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible to the contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.

The overall scale of the project is visually compatible.

Signs. *Signs, where permitted, shall be visually compatible with contributing buildings and structures to which they are visually related.*

Signs indicated on the drawings are not part of this review.

Victorian Historic District Design Standards.

New Construction, Additions, and Alterations. *The intent of these standards is to ensure appropriate new construction, additions, and alterations within the Victorian Historic District. They are also intended to protect the historic integrity of contributing resources. Designs for new construction are to be consistent with contributing resources from the district's Period of Significance (1870-1923).*

The following design standards shall apply to new construction, additions, alterations to contributing and non-contributing resources, and site alterations, unless otherwise specified. Though certain building materials are prescribed below, the Historic Preservation Commission may approve alternative materials that are not listed as prohibited upon a showing by the applicant that the material or product is visually compatible with historic building materials and has performed satisfactorily in the local climate.

Exterior walls.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that exterior building walls reflect and complement the traditional materials and construction techniques of the district's architecture.

New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources, and additions.

Permitted Materials: *Brick, stone, wood, true stucco, and smooth fiber cement horizontal lap siding.*

Prohibited Materials: *Vinyl siding, aluminum siding, rolled asphalt, precast concrete panels, EIFS, T-111, corrugated metal, unpainted exposed CMU blocks, fiber cement panels, and metal panels.*

The existing buildings are stucco which are proposed to be repaired in-kind. New elements are also proposed to be stucco. The standards are met.

Windows and Storefronts.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that windows, shutters, and storefronts reinforce a sense of rhythm and continuity in architecture and enhance pedestrian activity at the street level.

Windows.

New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources, and additions.

Materials.

Window casings and sashes shall be made of metal, wood or clad wood material.

Window glass shall be transparent with no dark tints or reflective effects (except for stained glass windows). This provision does not preclude the use of Low Emissivity or laminated glass.

Solid vinyl windows are prohibited.

The new windows are proposed to be Quaker Historical Series (H600) which is a metal clad product with clear glass. This product has previously been approved for use on new construction within the Streetcar Historic District which has the same window standards as the Victorian District. The standards are met.

Configuration.

Windows shall be taller than they are wide, except for accent windows, which may be round or other shapes.

Individual windows within new window openings are taller than they are wide. The standard is met.

Windows shall be single-hung, double-hung, triple hung, awning, or casement, except for accent windows which may also be fixed or hopper. Casement windows shall have light divisions.

Windows in new and existing openings are proposed to be casement and double-hung. Casement windows are proposed to have light divisions. The standard is met.

Simulated divided light windows shall be permitted provided that the muntin is 7/8 inches or less, the muntin profile shall simulate traditional putty glazing, the lower sash rail shall be wider than the meeting and top rails, and there shall be a spacer bar in between double panes of glass. Between-the-glass, snap-in or applied muntins shall not be permitted.

The standards are met. The bottom rail for this window line is wider and the drawings note that the muntins will be 7/8" or less.

Framing members shall be covered with appropriate trim; trim shall feature a header, surrounds, and pronounced sill where appropriate.

The standards are met. Existing window openings have only sills at the windows (no header or surrounds); therefore, new window openings are proposed to be the same.

Window sashes shall be inset a minimum of three (3) inches from the façade of a building, except for wood frame buildings.

The drawings note that all windows will be inset 3 inches.

Retail uses shall incorporate transparent features (windows and doors) over a minimum of 70% of the ground floor façade.

The transparent features in the existing retail spaces along Bull Street are not proposed to change.

All other nonresidential facades shall incorporate transparent features (windows and doors) over a minimum of 50% of the ground floor façade.

The standard is met where new ground floor openings are proposed.

Storefronts.

New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

Materials.

Storefronts shall be constructed of wood, cast iron, Carrera glass, aluminum, steel or copper as part of a glazed storefront system.

The storefront is proposed to be aluminum.

Storefront bases shall consist of wood, bronze, glazed brick or tile.

The new storefront base is proposed to be brake (break) metal. The standard is not met. Staff recommends that the material be revised to one that is permitted by the standard.

Exterior burglar bars, fixed or roll-down security devices or similar security devices shall not be permitted.

The standard is met.

Configuration.

Storefront glazing in subdivided sashes shall be inset a minimum of four inches from the face of the building.

The drawings note that all storefronts will be inset 4 inches.

Storefront glazing shall extend from an 18-24 inch tall base of contrasting material or design.

Storefront glazing shall be transparent; provided, however, opaque glass may be used in the storefront window transoms.

The base is proposed to be 20 inches high and the glazing transparent. The standards are met.

Doors/Entrances.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that the placement of doors and entrances provides a sense of rhythm and continuity in architecture.

New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

Materials.

Doors shall be made of glass, wood, clad wood or steel without wood grain simulation.

Doors shall not have a decorative diamond inset, half-moon inset, or other prefabricated ornamentation.

Sliding doors shall not be permitted.

Full lite clad doors are proposed. The standards are met.

Configuration.

Entrances shall face the primary street on which the building is located (normally the street from which it takes its address).

Entrances on corner lots shall be oriented in the same direction as entrances of adjacent buildings, toward the corner of the intersection, or based on historic precedent.

There shall be a primary entrance along the primary street at intervals no greater than 60 feet.

The standards are met.

Porches, Stoops, Balconies and Decks.

New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

Materials.

Prohibited material: Vinyl and PVC.

Configuration.

Uncovered decks shall be at the rear of the building or screened from view from the public right-of-way.

The roof deck surfaces are not visible; the parapets are used as handrails and trellises (pergolas) that cover the decks are proposed to be metal and stained wood. The standards are met.

Awnings.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that awnings provide cover for pedestrians and reinforce the rhythm of bays and primary entrances within facades.

Materials.

Awnings shall be constructed of canvas, cloth or equivalent, metal (though not corrugated), or glass.

Several awnings are proposed and will be of various materials, including canvas, glass, and metal.

Configuration.

A minimum of eight (8) feet vertical clearance shall be maintained above the public right-of-way.

Clearance varies from 8'-8" to 9'-0". The standard is met.

Awnings shall be structurally and architecturally integrated into the façade and shall not obscure character-defining features.

Back-lit (internally lit) awnings shall be prohibited.

Awnings shall not connect two (2) facades.

The standard is met.

Roof.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that roof forms are designed to provide visual interest and coherence in a manner that is consistent with contributing resources.

New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

Materials.

Roof coverings shall be standing seam metal, v-crimp, slate or equivalent synthetic, or architectural asphalt or similar shingles.

Roof material is not visible behind the parapets.

Mechanical Equipment and Refuse.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that mechanical equipment and refuse is appropriately sited to provide the least negative visual impact. In addition to the requirements set forth in Sec. 9.5, Screening and Buffers, mechanical equipment and refuse shall comply with the following:

Electrical vaults, meter boxes, communications devices, and satellite dishes shall be located on the secondary or rear façades and shall be minimally visible.

Roof mounted equipment and HVAC units shall be screened from view from the street.

Refuse storage areas for dumpsters and compactors shall be located within a building or to the side of rear of the building and screened from the public right-of-way.

Electrical is proposed along the lane as is the enclosed refuse storage area. Roof mounted equipment is proposed to be screened by the parapets. The standards are met.

Lighting.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that light fixtures have appropriate scale, are sited appropriately, are made of appropriate materials and complement the building on which they are located. In addition to the

requirements set forth in Sec. 9.8, Lighting, lighting shall comply with the following:

Materials: *Light fixtures shall be constructed of metal and/or glass.*

Configuration: *Light fixtures shall be compatible with the scale of the subject property and with the character of the district.*

Source Type: *White light source only.*

The standards are met.

Parking and Paving.

The intent of these standards is to create and protect contiguous, active pedestrian street fronts. In addition to the requirements set forth in Sec. 9.3, Off-Street Parking and Loading, parking and paving shall comply with the following:

With regard to the required on-site parking that may be required by the ordinance, although not in the Commission's purview, it may significantly change the design of this project if the site has to rearranged to accommodate parking. The owner's design and legal team, in conjunction with the City Departments, is in the process of determining if on-site parking will be required.

Fencing and Walls.

The intent of these standards is to ensure that walls and fences define outdoor spaces appropriately, separate private and public realms and add architectural interest to a building's façade. In addition to compliance with the requirements set forth in Sec. 9.6, Fences and Walls, fences and walls shall also comply with the following standards:

Materials.

Permitted: Wood, iron, brick, stucco over concrete block, or extruded aluminum.

Prohibited: Chain-link, vinyl, PVC, and corrugated metal.

Configuration.

Fences or walls no more than eight (8) feet in height may be installed within the side or rear yards behind the front façade of the building.

A minimum of five (5) feet must be provided between a fence and a building where they are parallel.

The fence and wall standards are met. The fences/walls proposed to enclose the courtyard between the buildings are stucco walls with wood gates that are 8 feet high.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approval for rehabilitation and alterations for the two buildings located at 1201 Bull Street with the following condition because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Revise the new storefront base material to one permitted by the storefront design standards.**

MW: LGM

Note: This recommendation could change subject to new information provided at the Historic Preservation Commission meeting. Final decisions will be made by the Historic Preservation Commission at the public hearing based on information provided at the meeting, as well as information submitted for the staff recommendation.