

Historic Preservation Commission

Virtual Meeting January 26, 2022 3:00 PM MINUTES

January 26, 2022 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

A Pre-Meeting was held virtually at 2:30 PM. No testimony was received and no votes were taken.

Members Present: Virginia Mobley, Chair

Chelsea Jackson-Greene, Vice-Chair

Darren Bagley-Heath Rebecca Fenwick J. Haley Swindle Robin Williams

Staff Present: Pamela Everett, Esq., Assistant Executive Director

Leah Michalak, Historic Preservation Director

Olivia Arfuso, Assistant Planner Aislinn Droski, Assistant Planner Monica Gann, Assistant Planner Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant

Julie Yawn, Systems Analyst

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

STREETCAR DISTRICT

- 1. Petition of Shannon Taylor | 21-006446-COA | 532 East 32nd Street | New Construction, Small, Parts I and II
 - Staff Recommendation 21-006446-COA 532 E 32nd St.pdf
 - Submittal Packet Drawings.pdf
 - Staff Research.pdf
 - ₱ HPC Board Decision 21-006446-COA 532 E 32nd St.pdf
 - Previous Submittal Packet Drawings.pdf

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to APPROVE a new construction, two-story carriage house for the property located at 532 East 32nd Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval, because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Move the window on the left side of the eastern elevation to be centered beneath the second-floor deck.

2. Provide the dimension of the overhang of the eaves in the final drawings.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Rebecca Fenwick

Second: Darren Bagley-Heath

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye

Virginia Mobley - Abstain

Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye

Robin Williams - Aye

Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

J. Haley Swindle - Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

2. Adopt the January 26, 2022 Agenda

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motion to APPROVE the January 26, 2022 HPC agenda as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Darren Bagley-Heath Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
J. Haley Swindle - Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

3. Approve November 22, 2021 HPC Meeting Minutes

∅ 11.22.21 MEETING MINUTES.pdf

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motion to APPROVE the November 22, 2021 HPC Minutes as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Chelsea Jackson-Greene

Second: J. Haley Swindle

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye

Virginia Mobley	- Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
J. Haley Swindle	- Aye

4. Approve of December 20, 2021 HPC Meeting Minutes

∅ 12.20.21 MEETING MINUTES.pdf

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motion to APPROVE the December 20, 2021 HPC Minutes as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Chelsea Jackson-Greene

Second: J. Haley Swindle

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
J. Haley Swindle - Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

5. Petition of City of Savannah | 21-006750-COA | 813 Carter Street | Carver Village: Demolition of a Contributing Building

Ms. Michalak stated this structure was found not to be a contributing historic structure (circa 1990s), thus a COA is not required.

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motion to APPROVE the demolition as requested, as it is not under historic designation.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Darren Bagley-Heath

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
J. Haley Swindle - Aye

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

6. Petition of Principals of Design | 22-000067-COA | 2309 Burroughs Street | Rehabilitation / Alterations and Addition

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to APPROVE request for continuance.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Chelsea Jackson-Greene

Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
J. Haley Swindle - Aye

7. Petition Sawyer Design | 21-006064-COA | 208 West 37th Street | Rehabilitation

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to APPROVE request for continuance.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Chelsea Jackson-Greene

Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
J. Haley Swindle - Aye

8. Petition of Shirley Mitchell-Mays | 21-004416-COA | 613 West 41st Street | Rehabilitation

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to APPROVE request for continuance.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Chelsea Jackson-Greene

Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain

Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
J. Haley Swindle	- Aye

9. Petition of Eco Friendly Contracting | 21-005411-COA | 616 West 40th Lane | After-the-Fact Addition

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to APPROVE request for continuance.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Chelsea Jackson-Greene

Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
J. Haley Swindle - Aye

10. Petition of Eco Friendly Contracting | 21-005589-COA | 632 West 39th Street | After-the-Fact Rehabilitation

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to APPROVE request for continuance.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Chelsea Jackson-Greene

Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
J. Haley Swindle - Aye

11. Petition of Eco Friendly Contracting | 21-004454-COA | 615 West 40th Street | After-the-Fact Addition and Rehabilitation

Motion

Continue.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Chelsea Jackson-Greene

Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye

Virginia Mobley - Abstain

Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye

Robin Williams - Aye

Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

J. Haley Swindle - Aye

12. Petition of Joseph L Sr. & Lydia S. Young | 21-006061-COA | 823 West 39th Street | After-the-Fact Rehabilitation / Alterations and Rear Addition

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to APPROVE request for continuance.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Chelsea Jackson-Greene

Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
J. Haley Swindle - Aye

13. Petition of Michelle Wilmore | 21-006053-COA | 905 West 38th Street | Removal of Rear Addition and Alterations

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to APPROVE request for continuance.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Virginia Mobley
Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
J. Haley Swindle - Aye

14. Petition of A Fox Construction, Inc. | 21-006460-COA | 903 West 38th Street | Rehabilitation / Alterations and Addition

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to APPROVE request for continuance.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Chelsea Jackson-Greene

Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye

Virginia Mobley - Abstain

Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye

Robin Williams - Aye

Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

J. Haley Swindle - Aye

15. Petition of GM Shay Architects | 21-006437-COA | 1716 Montgomery Street | New Construction: Part II, Design Details

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to APPROVE request for continuance.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Chelsea Jackson-Greene

Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
J. Haley Swindle - Aye

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

16. Petition of GM Shay Architects, Patrick Shay | 21-001940-COA | 1700 Drayton/1705 Abercorn Streets | 60 Day Deferral Request

- Staff Recommendation- 60-day deferral request.pdf
- Submittal Packet- petitioner's written request.pdf

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to APPROVE for a 60-day deferral for, New Construction: Part II, Design Details for 1700 Drayton Street and 1705 Abercorn Street as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Rebecca Fenwick
Second: Darren Bagley-Heath

Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
J. Haley Swindle	- Aye

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

VICTORIAN DISTRICT

17. Petition of Wubbena Architects | 21-006867-COA | 120 East Duffy Street | New Construction (Small): Parts I and II

- Staff Recommendation 21-006867-COA.pdf
- Submittal Packet Photos, Samples, and Specs.pdf
- Submittal Packet Drawings.pdf
- Windows Brochure Updated 6-2021.pdf
- Permit Drawings 18-004765-COA.pdf
- @ Drawings 19-005624-COA.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request for approval for New Construction, Small: Parts I and II for a 3-story residential building to be located on the vacant parcel at 120 East Duffy Street.

Prior to the adoption of the new zoning ordinance in September 2019 and the creation of the Historic Preservation Commission in 2020, the Planning Commission (MPC Board) approved this project (with conditions) on September 18, 2018 [File No. 18-004765-COA]. Again, due to the expiration of the previous COA, prior to the adoption of the new zoning ordinance in September 2019 and the creation of the Historic Preservation Commission in 2020, the Planning Commission (MPC Board) approved this project (with no conditions) on October 29, 2019 [File No. 19-005624-COA]. The approval expired on October 29, 2020. This project will now be reviewed under the new zoning ordinance.

The site has been vacant since 1994 when the historic building on this lot and the now vacant lot to the east were demolished. The surrounding historic context consists mainly of 2 and 3-story residential buildings; there are some contributing religious buildings as well and non-contributing 1-story commercial buildings. The historic residential buildings are mostly constructed from wood siding with brick foundations and a variety of roof shapes from mansard to hip to complex forms. The architectural styles mainly consist of Victorian-era styles such as Italianate, Queen Anne, and Second Empire.

The lot is pre-existing at 35 feet wide by 105 feet deep for 3,675sf. The proposed coverage is 42%. The building frontage calculations were not provided. The lot is 35 feet wide, the open space totals 10'-8" wide, and the building is 24'-4" wide; therefore, the building frontage is 69.4286%. Contact the city's building permitting department to determine whether this number is rounded up for the purposes of their review; if it is not,

Virtual Meeting January 26, 2022 3:00 PM MINUTES

increase the building width to meet the standard. For example, if the building is 25 feet wide, the frontage will be 71.4286%. The height, to the ridgeline, is 36'-2".*** The "Plan Review Data" on the cover page of the drawings has not been updated to reflect the new zoning ordinance base zoning standards. This information must be updated before staff will stamp the COA drawings for a building permit. *** The setbacks and, therefore, the rhythm of the building to the open space is visually compatible. All openings are proposed to be taller than they are wide which is visually compatible. The side hall plan and entrance with a front stoop is visually compatible.

This is a common building form within the district and typical for buildings of the Second Empire style, especially in Savannah. The materials and textures are visually compatible. The roof is proposed to be standing seam metal. The siding is proposed to be smooth Hardie lap siding with a 7-inch exposure. The windows are proposed to be PlyGem 400 Series which is a composite product and has simulated divided lites. The continuous foundation is proposed to be brick. All railings, columns, and other details (such as eave brackets) will be painted wood. When this project was first approved under the previous ordinance, the PlyGem 400 Series windows were permitted; however, since that time, the HPC has determined that this PlyGem series is permitted only in the Cuyler-Brownville Historic District (see attached Windows Brochure, updated 6-2021). Select a different previously approved window from the brochure or select a new window that meets the ordinance and provide a full sized window sample for review.

A specification for Trex decking was provided with the submittal packet; however, it is unclear where it is proposed to be located on the building. Staff recommends that it only be used on the rear porch floors and not on the front stoop floor in order to be visually compatible with visually related front stoop floor materials.

The mansard roof shape is visually compatible. The first floor is 11'-1", the second is 11'-4" to the top of the eave fascia, and the third is 10 feet. The standard is met. Brick is proposed. No piers are proposed. The height is 3'-4" which is the average height of contributing buildings on the block face. Because the front is a stoop and not a porch, the standard does not apply. Although the elevations appear to meet this standard, wall section 1/A5.1 shows the brick foundation (with water table) forward of the building plane. This wall section shall be revised so that the brick foundation is recessed from the building plane.

The PlyGem 400 Series is a wood composite product. When this project was first approved under the previous ordinance, the PlyGem 400 Series windows were permitted; however, since that time, the HPC has determined that this PlyGem series is permitted only in the Cuyler-Brownville Historic District (see attached Windows Brochure, updated 6-2021). Select a different previously approved window from the brochure or select a new window that meets the ordinance and provide a full-sized window sample for review.

All windows are taller than they are wide and are double-hung. The exterior elevations show the appropriate trim with a header, surrounds, and pronounced sill. The bay windows on the front extends to the ground.

No calculations were provided; however, the standard does not appear to be met for the rear or west side façade. Increase the transparent features to a minimum of 30% on the ground floor and provide the calculations. The old zoning ordinance did not have this standard.

The doors are proposed to be wood. A front covered stoop is proposed. The front stoop is

4'-10" deep and 11'-4" wide. The railing height is 36" with the appropriate rails and baluster spacing. Standing seam metal is proposed. The seam height was not provided with the submittal packet. This is a true mansard roof. Meters are proposed at the rear of the east façade. Ground mounted HVAC is proposed in the east side yard setback and screened from the street. The refuse storage area is proposed in the rear yard; however, it is not screened from the public right-of-way, which includes the lane. No light fixtures are indicated. A paver sidewalk is proposed. The standard is met as this is an appropriate material. Parking is proposed in the rear yard, accessed only from the lane, and this is a three-family dwelling. No fences are proposed.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. James Wubbena, petitioner, stated he agrees with Staff recommendation. He stated he does not think the rear stair will add anything positive, nor is it required by code. The stairs are not required to be had and not concerned about it.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Mr. Ryan Arvay, of the Historic Savannah Foundation, complimented the traditional design of the building: detail of the brackets around the house. The fascia seems to be flat rather than typical crown and 3/4 molding; these details will help, particularly with the dormers. Improve flat dormers and simple porch; conflicts with style of house. Chamfur the posts and add spindles. The balusters and eave appear unfinished to compliment the structure. **Mr. Wubbena** stated he is open to speak with owners to improve fascia, railings, and dormers.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

The Board expressed concern about lack of rear stair. The Petitioner stated it is not required and they are not concerned about it; there is an interior stair. Brackets should be at the top of a two story bay. Detailing needs consistency. The absence of rear stairs and windows; the glass lites on the doors are not properly divided - not visually consistent with historic pattern. Balance needs to be had.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

<u>Approval</u> for New Construction, Small: Parts I and II for a 3-story residential building to be located on the vacant parcel at 120 East Duffy Street <u>with the following conditions</u> to be submitted to staff for review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Contact the city's building permitting department to determine whether the building frontage percentage is rounded up for the purposes of their review; if it is not, increase the building width to meet the standard of 70% minimum building frontage.
- 2. Update the "Plan Review Data" on the cover page of the drawings to reflect the new zoning ordinance base zoning standards. This information must be updated before staff will stamp the COA drawings for a building permit.
- 3. Reselect the proposed window to be one previously approved by the Commission for use on new construction or select a new window that meets the ordinance and provide a full-sized window sample for review.
- 4. The Trex decking shall only be utilized on the rear porches, not on the front stoop.
- 5. Revise wall section 1/A5.1 so that the brick foundation is recessed from the building plane.
- 6. The transparent features on the rear and east side facades shall be increased

to a minimum of 30% on the ground floor; provide the calculations.

- 7. The standing seam metal roof shall have a maximum seam height of 1 inch.
- 8. The refuse storage area shall be screened from the public right-of-way, which includes the lane.

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to APPROVE New Construction, Small: Parts I and II for a 3-story residential building to be located on the vacant parcel at 120 East Duffy Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.Contact the city's building permitting department to determine whether the building frontage percentage is rounded up for the purposes of their review; if it is not, increase the building width to meet the standard of 70% minimum building frontage.
- 2.Update the "Plan Review Data" on the cover page of the drawings to reflect the new zoning ordinance base zoning standards. This information must be updated before staff will stamp the COA drawings for a building permit.
- 3.Reselect the proposed window to be one previously approved by the Commission for use on new construction or select a new window that meets the ordinance and provide a full-sized window sample for review.
- 4. The Trex decking shall only be utilized on the rear porches, not on the front stoop.
- 5.Revise wall section 1/A5.1 so that the brick foundation is recessed from the building plane.
- 6. The transparent features on the rear and east side facades shall be increased to a minimum of 30% on the ground floor; provide the calculations.
- 7. The standing seam metal roof shall have a maximum seam height of 1 inch.
- 8. The refuse storage area shall be screened from the public right-of-way, which includes the lane.
- 9.Remove the railing and, therefore, the doors, at the 3rd floor of the rear façade porch.
- 10.Add a stair to the ground at the rear porch.

11.Redesign the trim details, fascias, columns, and brackets to be more consistent with the Second Empire architectural style.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams
Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
J. Haley Swindle - Aye

CUYLER-BROWNVILLE DISTRICT

- 18. Petition of Principals of Design | 22-000066-COA | 726 West Victory Drive | Demolition of a Contributing Building
 - Staff Recommendation 22-000066-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet Application and Checklist.pdf
 - HPC Board Decision 21-001217-COA.pdf
 - City of Savannah Code Compliance (Email).pdf
 - City of Savannah Development Services (Email).pdf
 - Correspondence with Property Owner.pdf
 - City of Savannah Inspection Worksheet.pdf
 - Documentation of Fire Damage.pdf

Ms. Olivia Arfuso presented the petitioner's request for the demolition of a contributing building located at 726 West Victory Drive.

The rehabilitation of this building was on the docket for the January 26th HPC Meeting; however, a fire occurred on January 18th, 2022, and significantly damaged the building's structural soundness and integrity. Due to the circumstances, the nature of this request has shifted to the demolition of this contributing building.

The historic building was constructed in **1925** and is a contributing resource within the National Register Cuyler-Brownville Historic District and the local Cuyler-Brownville Historic District. On **January 18th, 2022**, a fire caused extensive damage to the building. On **January 21, 2022**, Michael Rose with the City of Savannah conducted a building observation and noted on the City's Inspection Worksheet that there was, "Extensive structural damage to majority of property, only portions of the front walls and roof are intact, yet structurally compromised. Remainder has been burned and collapsed. Recommend demolition."

On January 21, 2022, Joshua Downs with the City of Savannah's Code Compliance

Department informed Staff of the recent events. Officer Downs asked for the petition to be reviewed as a demolition request and remain on the docket for the January 26th HPC Meeting. The extensive fire damage has resulted in a threat to public health and public safety. Therefore, to alleviate these negative implications, the demolition of the remaining structure is proposed.

Staff is not requesting that the application requirements, listed above, be submitted for review due to the nature of this situation. Although this has not been deemed an emergency demolition, Staff has determined that the extent of the fire damage qualifies as an immediate threat. The building's current condition is dangerous, hazardous, and unsafe.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Steve Lieberman, petitioner, stated the fire prohibits the submitted plans, therefore demolition is necessary. The owners would like to rebuild to the original plan of the structure. **Mr. Bagley-Heath** stated he appreciated the owner's effort to initially rehabilitate and now to rebuild. **Ms. Fenwick** stated there are deconstruction companies that can assist.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

No public comment.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

Board suggested building the new structure behind existing porch; the existing porch should remain. The Board was concerned that the surviving front porch may have historic integrity worth retaining / preserving. Since the property owner plans to rebuild the preexisting building.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

<u>Approve</u> the demolition of the contributing building at 726 West Victory Drive <u>as</u> requested.

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to APPROVE the demolition of the contributing building at 726 West Victory Drive with the following condition, because otherwise the standards are met:

1. The front porch must remain in situ, and the new house shall be constructed behind it.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Darren Bagley-Heath

Second: Chelsea Jackson-Greene

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
J. Haley Swindle - Aye

STREETCAR DISTRICT

- 19. Petition of Michael Blakemore | 21-006436-COA | 218 West 37th Street | Rehabilitation
 - Staff Recommendation 21-006436-COA 218 West 37th Street.pdf
 - Submittal packet- revised narrative and materials.pdf
 - Submittal Packet-revised drawings.pdf
 - Staff Research.pdf

Ms. Monica Gann presented the petitioner's request of approval for rehabilitation of and alterations to the main residence, the two-story carriage house, and the one-story garage for the property located at 218 West 37th Street.

Per the applicant:

MAIN RESIDENCE:

- 1. REPAIR/RESTORE ALL EXISTING SIDING AND TRIM
- 2. REPAINT METAL ROOFING
- 3. REPAIR/RESTORE ALL ORIGINAL WINDOWS AND DOORS
- 4. REMOVE ALL EXISTING "MODERN" VINYL WINDOW(S)
- 5. RECONFIGURE REAR FAÇADE
- 6. NEW WINDOWS AND DOORS AT REAR FACADE
- 7. REPAIR/RESTORE EXISTING PORCH(S)
- 8. REPLACE EXISTING ELECTRICAL SYSTEM AND SUBPANELS
- 9. REPLACE EXISTING MECHANICAL SYSTEMS
- 10. REPLACE EXISTING PLUMBING SYSTEM TO PROPERTY LINE/METER

CARRIAGE HOUSE:

- 1. REPAIR/RESTORE ALL EXISTING SIDING AND TRIM AT ORIGINAL CARRIAGE HOUSE
- 2. DEMOLISH FRAMING AT PRIOR ADDITIONS
- 3. NEW FRAMING PER PLAN
- 4. NEW EXTERIOR FINISHES AT NEW WORK
- 5. REPLACE ROOFING
- 6. REPURPOSE ORIGINAL WINDOWS AND DOORS TO GARAGE
- 7. RECONFIGURE FRONT AND REAR FAÇADE
- 8. REPLACE EXISTING EXTERIOR STAIR AND PORCH
- 9. NEW WINDOWS AND DOORS
- 10. NEW CARRIGE DOORS AT GARAGE ENTRANCES FROM THE LANE
- 11. REPLACE EXISTING ELECTRICAL SYSTEM AND SUBPANELS
- 12. REPLACE EXISTING MECHANICAL SYSTEM
- 13. REPLACE EXISTING PLUMBING SYSTEM

GARAGE:

- 1. REPAIR/RESTORE ALL EXISTING SIDING AND TRIM
- 2. REPLACE ROOFING
- 3. INSTALL ORIGINAL WINDOWS AND DOORS FROM CARRIAGE HOUSE
- 4. NEW CARRIGE DOORS AT GARAGE ENTRANCES FROM THE LANE
- 5. NEW ELECTRICAL SYSTEM AND SUBPANEL

SITE:

- 1. DEMO ALL EXISTING CONCRETE SLABS PER PLAN
- 2. NEW BRICK PATIOS AND WALKWAYS PER PLAN
- 3. UNDERGROUND POWER TO GARAGE SUBPANEL FROM MAIN RESIDENCE
- 4. NEW LANDSCAPE IN A FORMAL GARDEN STYLE

The historic main building was constructed in 1919 and is a contributing resource within the Thomas Square-Streetcar National Register Historic District and the local Streetcar Historic District. The carriage house and garage dates of construction are unknown and have had several modifications and additions and are listed as non-contributing buildings on the Contributing Resources Map. Both buildings appear on the 1955 and 1966 Sanborn Maps; the modifications occurred sometime after 1966.

On the first floor of the rear façade, the majority of the rear wall is proposed to be removed to accommodate a bank of 4 windows and relocation of the door opening. On the second floor of the rear façade, a window opening is proposed to be infilled, a door opening is proposed to be infilled, and a new door opening is proposed. On the second floor of the east façade, a single window is proposed to be increased to a double window. The window proposed to be removed on the second floor of the rear façade will be relocated here. These alterations to the historic walls, window openings, and door openings removes an excessive amount of historic materials. Additionally, these changes create a false sense of historical development because the new openings are not proposed to be differentiated from the historic openings. Staff recommends that these facades be redesigned to retain more of the historic walls and historic openings.

The partial porch of the north (rear) façade on the second floor has gained historic significance and is proposed to be retained and preserved. This porch was partially infilled c.1940.

The proposed new openings for the carriage house and garage are visually compatible with contributing buildings to which it is visually related. The alterations proposed to the main residence (historic walls, window openings, and door openings) removes an excessive amount of historic materials. Additionally, these changes created a false sense of historical development because the new openings are not proposed to be differentiated from the historic openings. Staff recommends that these facades be redesigned to retain more of the walls and openings. The proposed windows on the main house are not visually compatible with contributing buildings to which it is visually related. Windows shall match the historic in design, materials, and configuration.

Main House:

Paint- main house -Farrow & Ball Cook's Blue, trim, railings, and porch ceilings- all white, porch decking -front and rear porches- Farrow & Ball, pavilion gray, shutters black

Windows- Anderson model 400 series Woodwright clad, black, grills full divided light 4 over 1 Shutters- Timberlane, model-fixed louvre with matching midpoint horizontal division, full functioning with hinges and locks

Doors- Anderson, 400 series Woodwright Clad, full divided light-4 panes over 1 configuration Roof- color match repaint western states metal roofing, cool tech 500pvdf charcoal grey matte finish

All materials proposed for the carriage house and garage are visual compatible with contributing building to which it is visually related.

Carriage House:

Paint- Farrow & Ball-cook's blue, trim and porch ceilings white, windows and doors- black, porch decking-pavilion gray, shutters- black, roof charcoal

Virtual Meeting January 26, 2022 3:00 PM MINUTES

Windows- Anderson model 400 series Woodwright clad, black, grills full divided light 4 over 4 Shutters- Timberlane, model-fixed louvre with matching midpoint horizontal division, full functioning with hinges and locks

Doors- Anderson, 400 series Woodwright Clad, full divided light-4 panes over single wood panel configuration

Roof- GAF Royal Sovereign- three-tab shingles

Garage:

Paint- buildings, trim, windows and doors – Farrow & Ball Railings (dark gray), roofing-charcoal

Roof- GAF roll roofing

The proposed new roof shape of the carriage house is visually compatible with the contributing buildings to which it is visually related. The existing roof is two side by side gable roofs; the new is proposed to be one complex roof for the entire building.

An excessive amount of historic wall material is proposed to be removed from the rear façade of the main residence. Staff recommends that this facade be redesigned to retain more of the walls. The western portion of the second floor of the carriage building is proposed to be demolished and constructed to match the eastern portion. First floor exterior walls are proposed to be shiplap and the second-floor wood shingles.

An excessive amount of historic windows/window openings are proposed to be removed from the rear façade of the main residence. Staff recommends that these facades be redesigned to retain more of the openings. Furthermore, the new/replacement windows are proposed to be Anderson 400 series Woodwright which is a double-paned, clad windows with simulated divided lites, which has been approved for new construction and noncontributing structures not for historic contributing buildings. New windows in unoriginal openings must match the historic windows in *material and configuration*. The carriage house windows are proposed to be Anderson 400 series Woodwright clad, which has been approved for new construction and non-contributing structures. The garage windows are proposed to be replaced with windows from the carriage house. All new window openings are proposed to be double hung and are taller than they are wide.

The carriage house windows are proposed to be Anderson 400 series Woodwright clad, which has been approved for new construction and non-contributing structures. However, information regarding the muntins was not provided. Shutters are proposed to be Timberlane, fixed louvers with matching midpoint horizontal division and fully functioning hinges and locks.

An excessive amount of historic doors/door openings are proposed to be removed from the rear façade of the main residence. Staff recommends that these facades be redesigned to retain more of the walls and openings. The proposed doors are to be Anderson 400 series Woodwright clad full divided light 4 over 4. The proposed door entry faces the courtyard. The carriage house garage doors face the lane. A portion of the side porch on the east is proposed to be removed; however, it is not original or historic; the original configuration is proposed to be reinstated. No porches are proposed to be enclosed. No changes are proposed to the porch on the non-contributing carriage house.

The roof is proposed to be coated with Cool Tech 500 charcoal grey-matte finish coating and the historic roof is proposed to remain beneath. The configuration is not proposed to change. Asphalt 3-tab shingles are proposed for the carriage house and RAF roll roofing for the garage. The various existing roof shapes for the carriage house are proposed to be

Virtual Meeting January 26, 2022 3:00 PM MINUTES

removed (except the gable facing the south) and replaced with a complex hip roof with a 6:12 pitch. The garage roof is not changing. The eaves and rakes information was not provided with the submittal packet. Two garage doors are proposed; they each are less than 12 feet wide.

The proposed fence is to be naturally weathering cedar. Ensure that the fence is painted or stained. The proposed fencing is to be seven feet six inches in height with matching gate.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Michael Blakemore explained the amount of historic material removed, some of which is infill. There will be approximately 2% of historic demolition. Salvage and repurposing will be done.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Ms. Carolyn Guilford, neighbor, expressed concerns about the fence; is it painting or staining? Mr. Blakemore stated the fence is in disrepair; will get surveyor to mark property. Ms. Guilford stated the fence is from the 1930s: would like to keep it in its same place, with strengthening. Ms. Michalak stated Staff was not aware of the north/south fence; historic fences have been covered as historic structures/pertinences of historic buildings. Ms. Mobley stated she hopes they can come to an agreement as neighbors, not Board's purview.

Mr. Ryan Arvay, HSF, stated his presentation shows less demolition than originally understood. The carriage house is of a visually compatible design.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

Queries regarding fence.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

<u>Continue</u> the rehabilitation of and alterations to the main residence, the two-story carriage house, and the one-story garage for the property located at 218 West 37th Street <u>for a maximum of 90 days</u> in order for the petitioner to address the following conditions:

- Must redesign the rear façade alterations so as to reduce the amount of historic material removed and the quantity of window and door openings altered.
- 2. Shall not alter the second-floor window on the east façade.
- 3. Reselect the proposed window manufacturer and series for the main residence; windows are to match the historic in design, materials, and configuration.
- 4. Provide additional information regarding the Woodwright windows; muntins shall be 7/8" or less and have a traditional putty glazing.
- 5. Provide eave depth dimensions for the accessory building; they shall not be less than 8 inches.
- 6. The fence shall be painted or stained.

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to CONTINUE for rehabilitation of and alterations to the main residence, the two-story carriage house, and the one-story garage for the property located at 218 West 37th Street for a maximum of 90 days in order for the petitioner to address the following conditions:

- 1. Must redesign the rear façade alterations so as to reduce the amount of historic material removed and the quantity of window and door openings altered.
- 2. Shall not alter the second-floor window on the east façade.
- 3.Reselect the proposed window manufacturer and series for the main residence; windows are to match the historic in design, materials, and configuration.
- 4.Provide additional information regarding the Woodwright windows; muntins shall be 7/8" or less and have a traditional putty glazing.
- 5. Provide eave depth dimensions for the accessory building; they shall not be less than 8 inches.
- 6. The fence shall be painted or stained.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Chelsea Jackson-Greene Second: Darren Bagley-Heath

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye

Virginia Mobley - Abstain

Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye

Robin Williams - Aye

Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

J. Haley Swindle - Aye

- 20. Petition of Ward Architecture and Preservation | 22-000050-COA | 12 West 38th Street | Rehabilitation
 - Staff Recommendation 22-000050-COA 12 W 38th St.pdf
 - Submittal Packet Project Description and Materials.pdf
 - Submittal Packet Drawings.pdf

Ms. Aislinn Droski presented the petitioner's request of approval for the rehabilitation of the property located at 12 West 38th Street. The historic building was constructed in 1899 and is a contributing resource within the Thomas Square-Streetcar National Register Historic District and the local Streetcar Historic District. Concerns regarding compromising historic pedigree, and presentation of false sense of history.

The work, per the applicant, is as follows:

"Rotten or deteriorated siding and trim will be replaced 'in kind'. Brick foundations/chimneys will be repointed where necessary. Historic windows will be repaired and made operable. Non-historic windows will be replaced with custom built operable wood double hung TDL windows to fit the original openings. The front porch will receive new wood spindles, columns, and railing to match the architectural style. New wood stairs will be installed up to the porch, which will have turned wood newels. Wood lattice will be installed between the brick piers on the rear to complete the base of the building. Also on the rear, a new stair and porch will be built where there once was once. To differentiate old from new, the columns and spindles will vary from the front porch. All existing roof surfaces will be replaced with new standing seam metal."

The applicant also intends to fire-rate the protruding bay on the west side façade, in order to accommodate the proximity of the property line proposed in the subdivision of the property, for the new construction at 14 West 38th Street. The existing lot on which 12 West 38th Street sits is to be subdivided by the applicant. Contingent upon the approval

Virtual Meeting January 26, 2022 3:00 PM MINUTES

of the subdivision, the applicant is additionally proposing a New Construction, Small, Parts I and II, for the lot created to the left of 12 West 38th Street. The applicant has applied for the new construction alongside the rehabilitation of the historic building [File No. 22-000047-COA].

Additionally, the applicant provided historic research regarding the rehabilitation work proposed for the historic 12 West 38th Street. Sanborn Maps from 1916 to 1966, as well as a Cadastral Survey from 1937, indicate the presence of a porch which wraps around the front and side of the building, as the applicant is proposing. The applicant has additionally provided an excerpt from the 4th edition of the Cottage Souvenir, which was published in 1896. The applicant has indicated that they believe that the building at 12 West 38th Street used the plans (Design No. 154 by architect George F. Barber) or was highly influenced by them and modified them for a more classical Savannah look. The architectural drawings were referenced in the spindles and columns proposed for the rehabilitated porch. Staff was unable to locate historic photographs of the property. There is sufficient evidence that there was historically a rear side porch on the property. This porch, which follows the projecting bay on the side façade, was shown as infilled with lattice on the 1937 Cadastral Survey. The applicant is proposing an open porch in this location, with simple square balusters and wood columns, which will visually differentiate the new rear side porch from the existing portions of the front and side porch, which are to be restored.

While there is a lack of photographic evidence, staff finds that the architectural drawings provided are in the same style as the historic building and provide context for the columns and railing that likely would have existed on this building historically. Staff finds that the columns and balustrade proposed for the restored portions of the porch match the architectural style of the house and are based on evidence, and therefore do not constitute conjectural features.

The existing metal columns, side porch in-fill, roofing material, and several windows on the property are non-historic and were likely installed over time, with the metal columns likely around the 1950s. These elements have not gained historical significance and staff finds their removal and replacement/restoration to be appropriate.

The existing distinctive features of the building will be retained, and the side porch configuration, which was historically a distinctive feature of the property, is to be restored. The existing asphalt shingle roofing material is non-historic and is to be replaced with a standing seam metal roof, as the building had historically. All non-historic windows are to be replaced with wood windows in a 2/2 configuration to match the historic windows. The brick foundation and chimneys will be repointed in-kind, as needed. All deteriorated trim and siding will be replaced in-kind. The exterior walls of the bay window on the west side façade, closest to the new construction at 14 West 38th Street, will be fire rated and all siding will be replaced in-kind. **Provide staff with details as to how the fire-rating of the western bay will occur,** so as not to compromise the historic integrity of the exterior of the building. Staff otherwise finds that the preservation standards are met.

The 'new' side rear porch is to be the same height and width as indicated by the Cadastral Survey and Sanborn Maps, as well as existing evidence within the building. Staff finds the overall scale of the side rear porch to be visually compatible.

The existing opening sizes are not to change with the infill of new custom wood windows. The projection of the existing front/side porch will not be altered. The new side rear porch is to have a projection that will line-up with the existing porch/projecting bay, which

staff finds to be visually compatible.

The following materials are proposed to be utilized:

- -Exterior Walls: Replaced in-kind, with wood, as needed
- -Brick Foundation/Chimney: Repointed in-kind, as needed
- -Windows: Existing historic windows to be repaired in-kind, non-historic windows to be removed and replaced with custom built, operable wood double hung TDL 2/2 windows
- -Restored Porch: 6" decorative wood columns, and decorative balustrade to match provided architectural style, from *American Porch*
- -New Steps: Wood stairs with turned wood newels and spindles to match porch railing by *American Porch*
- -New Side Rear Porch: *YellaWood* 8" square wood columns with corner chamfer and a simple square railing, with wood steps to match
- -Roof: Bridgersteel mechanical lock standing seam metal roof
- -Foundation: Wood lattice infill

Staff finds that the materials proposed are visually compatible.

The existing roof shape(s) shall not be altered with the replacement of the roofing material. The existing asphalt shingle roofing material is not historic and is to be replaced with standing seam metal, with a metal drip edge. The brick foundation is to be repointed inkind where deteriorated. The space between the brick piers on the building is to be infilled with square wood lattice, inset 3" from the front edge of the piers. Where the siding is deteriorated, it is to be replaced in-kind, with wood. All existing original windows are to be scraped, sanded, re-painted, and re-glazed where necessary. All non-historic windows are to be replaced with custom built 2/2 TDL wood windows, to match the existing historic windows. The existing non-historic infill is to be removed and the original porch configuration is to be restored. A new side rear porch is to be built where there was one previously and will be visually differentiated from the existing porch. The columns and balustrade are to match a set of architectural drawings that were likely referenced in the designing of the building and match the historical context/architectural style of the building. There is an existing brick foundation which will be the base for the new side rear porch, which is to be constructed of wood.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Josh Ward, petitioner, stated the bay window will required to be fire-rated if they move the property line. They will preserve historic materials and fire-rate the structure. The front brick stairs are not original to the structure; they would have been wood. They plan to retain the original brick under the porch, though the brick on top is not presumed to be original. There is no rear porch; want to differentiate from the front - simplify but not lacking decorative features.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Arvay, HSF, stated he supports the wood stair and the simplified back porch. They would like more details. The turn posts and balusters should have more details, spindles, as the precedent set by the original architect. Bring the porch close back to its original design. Mr. Ward requested to approve as presented, since it is not known what was actually there. Mr. Arvay stated the turned posts and balusters is the correct avenue to take that the petitioner has elected to not utilize. Tax reviewers (regarding tax credits) should be sympathetic to that.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

The Board asked if the spindles are an option. The Board discussed the conjectural nature of the turned/decorative balusters and columns that the applicant was proposing for the rehabilitation of the front porch, and whether they should directly reference the George Barber architectural drawings on which the building was based. The Board concurred with Historic Savannah Foundation that while the additional decorative elements, present in the Cottage Souvenir catalog, the columns and railing should be restudied to reflect more closely the model by George F. Barber that was used as a basis for the design of the building. The petitioner stated they are trying not to overdecorate the building, based on prior experience with the State. Board reminded that historic fabric is not necessarily original fabric.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

<u>Approval</u> of the rehabilitation of the property located at 12 West 38th Street <u>with</u> the following condition to be submitted to staff for review and approval because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Provide details as to how the fire-rating of the western bay will occur. The work shall not compromise the historic integrity of the building.

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to APPROVE the rehabilitation of the property located at 12 West 38th Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Provide details as to how the fire-rating of the western bay will occur. The work shall not compromise the historic integrity of the building.
- 2.In light of the model used as part of the basis for this design, re-study the railing and column design to more in line with the George F. Barber architectural drawings.
- 3. Retain the front brick steps.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Chelsea Jackson-Greene

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

J. Haley Swindle - Not Present

- 21. Petition of Ward Architecture and Preservation | 22-000047-COA | 14 West 38th Street | New Construction, Small, Parts I and II
 - Staff Recommendation 22-000047-COA 14 W 38th St.pdf
 - Submittal Packet Drawings.pdf
 - Submittal Packet Project Description and Materials.pdf

Ms. Aislinn Droski presented the petitioner's request. of approval for New Construction, Small, Parts I and II, for a new, two-story single-family building at the property located at

Virtual Meeting January 26, 2022 3:00 PM MINUTES

14 West 38th Street. The existing property contains a historic building, 12 West 38th Street, but is to be subdivided to contain two lots. '14 West 38th Street' is the unofficial address for this property until it is officially subdivided. The applicant has also applied for the rehabilitation of the historic property [File No. 22-000050-COA]. The project, per the applicant, is as follows:

"The two story building will be approximately 1,000 SF per floor. The construction type will be wood frame on a raised slab. The CMU base will be surfaced with a smooth coat stucco. The main body will have a smooth fiber cement siding with a 4" exposure on the north, south, and west facades. The east [front] façade will have an alternating exposure of 3" and 7". All trim will be smooth and either wood or fiber cement. The main roof will be architectural asphalt shingles. The front door will be wood paneled with a transom above. The side door will be wood and glass. The windows will be aluminum clad wood double-hung, with several being small square casement types.

The projecting bay is a common architectural element found throughout Savannah's historic residential buildings. This feature enables the building to engage with the street. That projecting bay has been incorporated into the home's design. The bay will be clad with 3" beadboard and 1x trim."

The lot is to be 3,007 square feet with a width of 33.50'. The side-yard setbacks are to be 3 feet, which is consistent with the standards and the average of the block. The rear yard setback is to be 20' and the front yard is to be 17', which is consistent with the average of the block face. The height of the building is to be 2 stories. The new construction building is to be two stories tall and 25'-6" to the eaves. 18 West 38th Street has an eaves height 26'-10" and 12 West 38th Street has an eaves height of 26'-4"; staff recommends increasing the height of the second floor to be between the eave heights of the adjacent historic buildings. The width of the building is to be 22'-4". Staff finds the overall scale of the building and the height and width of the individual components of the building to be visually compatible with the contributing buildings to which it will be visually related.

Staff finds the proposed setbacks to be visually compatible with the setbacks of the surrounding contributing buildings. 14 West 38th Street will be situated between two neighboring historic buildings, 18 West 38th Street and 12 West 38th Street. These are the only buildings on the block, and staff finds the relationship of the new construction building to the open space between it and the existing buildings to be visually compatible with the spacing in the surrounding context.

All openings facing the street are to be taller than they are wide and are in a visually compatible rhythm on the front façade. Three accent windows are proposed for the building, one on the eastern side façade and two on the western side façade. Revise the number of transparent features on the western elevation to be at least 30% of the ground floor façade. Staff otherwise finds the rhythm and solid-to-void ratio created by the proposed openings to be visually compatible.

The new construction building is proposed to have a two-story bay window on the front façade. Both 12 and 18 West 38th Street have bay windows on the front façade which are connected to the porch. Additionally, the building is to have two projecting awnings on the eastern side façade, one over a small, square projecting window and the other over a door leading to a landing and stair. The porch on the front façade is to project over 6'-5" from the building (without the stair). Staff finds the projections of the proposed building to be visually compatible.

The following materials are proposed to be utilized:

- -Roof: GAF 'Timberline' architectural asphalt shingle with drip cap and metal flashing
- -Roof/Awning Bracket: Wood
- -Exterior Walls: Front Façade: *HardiePlank* lap siding with an alternating 3" and 7" exposureAll Other Facades: *Hardie Plank* lap siding with a 4" exposure
- -Foundation: 3-coat smooth finish stucco
- -Windows: Marvin Ultimate 2/1 aluminum clad wood windows
- -Awnings: Wood and architectural asphalt shingle
- -Landing/Stairs: Side Façade: WoodPorch: Stucco over concrete with simple metal handrail by *Architectural Iron Co.*
- -Porch Columns: 8" square wood box column
- -Porch Railing: Square wood balusters and hand rails by Vintage Woodworks

Staff does not find the alternating siding on the front façade to be visually compatible, nor the differing configuration of siding between the front façade and all others. Staff recommends revising the exposure of the siding on the front façade to match the exposure on all other facades. Staff otherwise finds the materials proposed to be visually compatible. The roof is to be a hip shaped roof with a gable roof over the two-story bay window, which is compatible with the contributing buildings to which 14 West 38th Street will be visually related. Staff recommends increasing the height of the second floor to be between the eave heights of the adjacent historic buildings.

The foundation is to be stucco over concrete block. The height of the foundation is compatible with the foundation heights of contributing buildings on the block face and does not project forward of the building plane. The exterior walls are to be covered with smooth fiber cement horizontal lap siding by *James Hardie*.

All windows are to be taller than they are wide, with the exception of three accent windows on the side façade, which are to be squares. All of the non-accent windows are to be 2/1 double hung windows, and the accent windows are to be casement. All windows are covered with appropriate trim. All bay windows extend to the full length of the floor they are on and meet the top of the foundation.

Staff finds that the standard is not met for the western façade, which contains two small square accent windows and one rectangular window. Staff has determined that this façade will be visible from the public right-of-way, due to the space that will exist between it and the neighboring property. Revise the number of transparent features on the western elevation to be at least 30% of the ground floor façade. The applicant is proposing wood louvers for a small vent opening within the gable above the bay windows. Staff finds the intent of the standards to be met.

The doors are to be constructed of MDF, which is an engineered wood material. The front door is to be a solid, paneled door, with a two-lite transom above. The door on the side façade is to feature a 6-lite glass panel. Staff finds that the intent of the standard is met. The porch is to be constructed of wood with a stucco foundation.

The hip roof of the main building is to be pitched 5:12 and the gable roof over the bay windows on the front façade is to be pitched 8:12. Staff finds the intent of the standards to be met. The awnings on the property are proposed for the eastern side façade and are to be placed over a door and a protruding window. They are to be constructed of wood with asphalt shingles and are not over a public right-of-way. They will be structurally and architecturally integrated into the façade. All mechanical equipment and refuse storage areas are to be located on a secondary façade and will be screened from the public right-of-way by a fence.

The fence is to be constructed of pressure treated wood slats. The fence is to be located behind the front façade of the building and is to be 6'-0" in height. There is an existing fence along the rear that is not proposed to be altered. The property located at 14 West 38th Street does not have access to a lane, and due to the size of the lot and existing historic properties, cannot provide parking that solely exists behind the front façade of the building. The applicant is proposing to implement a parking easement, located on the property line between 12 and 14 West 38th Street, in order to incorporate the required parking for new construction in the TN-2 zoning district. The driveway will be a ribbon strip design that is 8'-6" in width. Staff requests that the area between the strips be planted with grass or plants.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Josh Ward, stated they are happy to comply with Staff recommendations.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Arvay, HSF, stated the petitioner should use round columns, change the front elevation skirting from stucco to brick, and add more scrollwork to brackets under front gable on the bay to soften the structure. It is critical that new construction co-exist with the existing structures in the neighborhood, particularly in between two historic structures. Thinks the windows are an odd choice. **Mr. Ward** stated they are not trying to copy the homes in the neighborhood; it is a new structure in a historic neighborhood.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

Concern regarding stucco foundation. Noticing new trend of square columns and stucco base; not appreciated by neighboring residents.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

<u>Approval</u> of the New Construction, Small, Parts I and II, for a new, two-story single-family building at the property located at 14 West 38th Street <u>with the following conditions</u> to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Increase the height of the second floor to be between the eave heights of the adjacent historic buildings.
- 2. Revise the exposure of the siding on the front façade to match the exposure on all other facades.
- 3. Revise the number of transparent features on the western elevation to be at least 30% of the ground floor façade.
- 4. Plant the area between the strips of the driveway with grass or plants.

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to APPROVE the New Construction, Small, Parts I and II, for a two-story single-family building at the property located at 14 West 38th Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Increase the height of the second floor to be between the eave heights of the adjacent historic buildings.
- 2.Revise the exposure of the siding on the front façade to match the exposure on all other facades.
- 3.Revise the number of transparent features on the western elevation to be at least 30% of the ground floor façade.
- 4. Plant the area between the strips of the driveway with grass or plants.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Darren Bagley-Heath Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

J. Haley Swindle - Not Present

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

- 22. Petition of JDR CONSTRUCTION, Jason Sommers | 21-006869-COA | 611 WEST 39TH STREET | In-kind asphalt roof
 - SIGNED Staff Dec 21-006869-COA 611 W 39th St.pdf
- 23. Petition of JOEL LAUFENBERG | 22-000130-COA | 1207 & 1209 PRICE STREET | In-kind window replacements
 - SIGNED Vic Staff Dec 22-000130-COA 1207, 1209 Price.pdf

XI. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 24. Stamped Drawings January Report
 - January 2022_Report.pdf
- 25. Report on Work Inconsistent With Issued COA for the January 26, 2022, HPC Meeting
 - Work Inconsistent With Issued COA_January Report.pdf
- 26. Report on Work Performed Without a COA for the January 26, 2022 HPC Meeting
 - Work Performed Without a COA_January Report.pdf
- 27. Report on Work That Exceeds Scope of Issued COA for the January 26, 2022, HPC Meeting
 - Work That Exceeds Scope of Issued COA_January Report.pdf
- 28. COA Inspections January Report
- 29. Items Deferred to Staff January Report
 - January 2022 REPORT.pdf

XII. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

- 30. Next Pre-Meeting: February 23, 2022 at 2:30pm HYBRID
- 31. Next Regular Meeting: February 23, 2022 at 3:00pm HYBRID
- 32. Adjourn

There being no further busines to present before the Board, the January 23, 2022 Historic Preservation Meeting adjourned at 5:18 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

J. Haley Swindle

Leah G. Michalak Director of Historic Preservation

/bm

Motion	
Adjourn	
Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Darren Bagley-Heath	
Second: Robin Williams	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Abstain
Chelsea Jackson-Greene	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.

- Not Present