

# **Historic Preservation Commission**

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street
October 26, 2022 3:00 PM
MINUTES

# October 26, 2022 Historic Preservation Commission

A Pre-meeting was held at 2:30pm. Items on the agenda will be presented by staff, as time permits, and the Commission asked questions. No testimony was received, and no votes were taken.

The Sub-Committee reviewed discussion from the September 28, 2022 1:30 p.m. sub-committee meeting.

**Members Present**: Virginia Mobley, Chair

Darren Bagley-Heath Kiersten Connor Rebecca Fenwick Kathy Ledvina Robin Williams

**Members Absent:** Mae Bowley

Jeff Notrica

**Staff Present**: Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director

Leah Michalak, Historic Preservation Director Caitlin Chamberlain, Senior Historic Planner

Ethan Hageman, Assistant Planner Jamie Zerillo, Assistant Planner Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant

Julie Yawn, Systems Analyst

- I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME
- **II. SIGN POSTING**
- **III. CONSENT AGENDA**

### **VICTORIAN DISTRICT**

- 1. Petition of Nathaniel Snyder | 22-004209-COA | 220 East Park Avenue | New Construction, Small (Parts I and II)
  - Submittal Packet- 220 E. Park Ave..pdf
  - Staff Research 220 E. Park Ave..pdf
  - Staff Recommendation 22-004209-COA 220 E Park Ave (2).pdf

## **STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends <u>approval</u> for the New Construction, Small Parts I & II, for the property located at 220 East Park Avenue <u>with the following conditions</u> because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Provide specific details on materials and location of all exterior lighting prior to installation.

### **Motion**

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned for approval of the New Construction, Small Parts I & II, for the property located at 220 East Park Avenue with the following condition because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1.Provide specific details on materials and location of all exterior lighting prior to installation.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams
Second: Kiersten Connor

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Not Present

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

- 2. Petition of Nathaniel Snyder | 22-004208-COA | 222 East Park Avenue | New Construction, Small (Parts I and II)
  - Staff Research 222 East Park.pdf
  - Submittal Packet- 222 E. Park Ave..pdf
  - Staff Recommendation 22-004208-COA 222 E Park Ave.pdf

## STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends <u>approval</u> for the New Construction, Small Parts I & II, for the property located at 222 East Park Avenue <u>with the following condition</u> to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Provide specific details on materials and location of all exterior lighting prior to installation.

### Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned for approval for the New Construction, Small Parts I & II, for the property located at 222 East Park Avenue with the following condition because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Provide specific details on materials and location of all exterior lighting prior to installation.

### **Vote Results (Approved)**

Motion: Robin Williams
Second: Kiersten Connor

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Not Present

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

- 3. Petition of Roy Maynard | 22-004594-COA | 309 West Duffy Street | Amendment to Previous COA
  - Submittal Packet
  - Amendment Changes
  - Materials
  - Previous Submittal Packet
  - Board Decision of Previous COA
  - Staff Research
  - Staff Recommendation- 22-004594-COA 309 West Duffy Street

# **STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

<u>Approval</u> to an amendment to a previously approved COA (22-001107-COA) for the vacant parcel located at 309 West Duffy Street <u>with the following condition</u> to be submitted to staff for final review and approval:

1. The gable end rakes must overhang at least eight (8) inches.

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historical Preservation Commission does hereby approve an amendment to the previously approved COA (22-001107-COA) for the vacant parcel located at 309 West Duffy Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval:

1. The gable end rakes must overhang at least eight (8) inches.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams Second: Kiersten Connor

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Aye

Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Not Present

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

#### IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

# 4. Adopt the October 26, 2022 Agenda

### **Motion**

Adopt revised agenda

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Rebecca Fenwick Second: Kathy S. Ledvina

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Not Present

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

# V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

## 5. Approval of September 28, 2022 HPC Meeting Minutes

## **Ø** 09.28.22 MEETING MINUTES.pdf

### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission motioned to approve the September 28, 2022 meeting minutes.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kiersten Connor Second: Robin Williams

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye

Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Not Present
Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

# VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

#### VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

6. Petition of Michelle L. Wilmore | 22-004598-COA | 905 West 38th Street | Rehabilitation/Alterations

### **Motion**

Continue.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kathy S. Ledvina

Second: Darren Bagley-Heath

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Not Present

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

- 7. Petition of J. Elder Studio | 22-004611-COA | 1930 Montgomery Street | Addition and Alterations
- 8. Petition of J. Elder Studio | 22-004597-COA | 414 West 42nd Street | Demolition of Non-Contributing Buildings and New Construction, Small (Parts I and II)
- 9. Petition of Boyce's Handyman Services | 22-004612-COA | 528 East 37th Street | Alteration
- 10. Petition of Eddie Urioste | 22-003881-COA | 211 East Duffy Street | Shed and Fences/Walls
- 11. Petition of Live Oak Energy Systems | 22-004232-COA | 410 E Victory Drive | Solar Panels
- 12. Petition of Heather Halverson | 22-000966-COA | 671-673 West 34th Street | After-the-Fact Rehabilitation and Alterations
- 13. Petition of First Mount Bethel Missionary Baptist Church | 22-002169-COA | 124 West Anderson Street | After-the-Fact Fence
- 14. Petition of Noble L. Boykin | 22-002599-COA | 217 East 38th Street | Addition and Rehabilitation
- 15. Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 22-003188-COA | 1825 Montgomery Street | New Construction: Part

## I, Height and Mass

#### VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

### IX. REGULAR AGENDA

16. Petition of Wubbena Architects, James F Wubbena | 22-004404-COA | 2305 Whitaker Street | New Construction, Small (Parts I and II)

- Submittal Packet
- Specification Sheet
- Staff Research
- Staff Recommendation- 22-004404-COA 2305 Whitaker Street

This petition was removed from the Consent Agenda. Ms. Adrian Dickerson, adjacent property owner, requested removal.

**Mr. Ethan Hageman**, staff member, presented the petitioner's request of approval for New Construction Small (Parts I & II) of a new duplex and a carriage house on the vacant parcel located at **2305 Whitaker Street**. The petitioner also requested a recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from a variance to allow for a 1'-6" side yard setback.

Staff recommendation was presented as approval for New Construction Small (Parts I & II) of a new duplex/ carriage house on the vacant parcel located at 2305 Whitaker Street with the following condition to be revised and submitted to staff for final approval.

1. The front porch foundation must have expressed piers with the infill materials being recessed a minimum of three inches behind the front edge of the pier.

## **AND**

Recommend approval for the recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard to allow for a 1'-6" side yard setback because the variance criteria are met.

# **PETITIONER COMMENTS**:

**Mr. James Wubbena**, petitioner, stated he has worked with Staff to get it the project as it should be for years. He stated there is no problem with piers, recesses, and has no problem with moving the porch and rear yard setbacks as Staff requested. Will seek variance for side-yard setback because it fits the neighborhood. Willing to submit everything to the Board to meet the requirements.

## **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

**Ms. Adrian Dickerson**, resident north of the petitioned property, has concern with size, scope, and scale. The original building was a smaller, two-story, one-family structure. She expressed concern about the variance - it will only be 18 inches on the sides, which is not enough space between property lines, particularly for a building this large. The roof overhang will be over property line. Requests the variance to be denied.

**Mr. Wubbena** stated everything works fine with other structures on the street (meters, maintenance, etc.). The run-off will be on the petitioner's property not hers. It fits within the neighborhood. Will reduce only if variance not granted. Will get it one way or another. The roof overhang is 1 foot 6; the water will be on the property line, as it is with the adjacent

buildings.

**Mr. Williams** asked if depth of soffits on the roof can be done for the neighbor. **Mr. Wubbena** replied yes, did not want to do it too much. The goal was to be like the contributing buildings on the block. Stated they will get with Staff about overhang and does not want to go backwards regarding getting the recommendation from the Board because of timeline.

**Ms. Mobley** asked can the roof line be moved back a few inches. **Mr. Wubbena** replied yes, has considered reducing the width slightly; six inches on each side.

**Mr. Bagley-Heath** asked is there room for fire safety. Ms. Michalak stated the fire code can go up to the property line if the walls are fire rated. The minimum eave depth is 12 inches.

# **BOARD COMMENTS:**

**Ms. Connor** recommended the Board indicate the adjustments for Staff and the petitioner to work together.

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historical Preservation Commission does hereby approve the petition for New Construction Small (Parts I & II) of a new duplex/ carriage house on the vacant parcel located at 2305 Whitaker Street with the following conditions to be revised and submitted to staff for final approval.

- 1. The front porch foundation must have expressed piers with the infill materials being recessed a minimum of three inches behind the front edge of the pier.
- 2. The soffit depth be reduced to 12 inches.
- 3. Move the rear yard setback to 5 feet for the carriage house.

## AND

Recommend approval for the recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard that reads:

Building Setbacks (ft)

Side yard (interior):3 (min)

To allow for a 2' side yard setback because the variance criteria are met.

### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams
Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Not Present

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

#### VICTORIAN DISTRICT

- 17. Petition of J. Elder Studio | 22-004595-COA | 1018 Abercorn Street | New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) and Variance Recommendation Request
  - Submittal Packet and Materials
  - Previous Staff Decision 22-002376-COA 1018 Abercorn Street
  - Staff Research Sanborn Maps.
  - Staff Recommendation- 22-004595-COA 1018 Abercorn Street

Mr. Ethan Hageman presented the petitioner's request of approval for New Construction, Small (Parts I & II) of a mixed-use building on the parcel located at 1018 Abercorn Street. The project description is as per the petitioner: "New Construction of a three story 2,100 sf building, with commercial space on the first floor and residential units on the second and third floor. Applicant requests a variance for rear setback to be reduced from 10'-0" to 7'-4" so as to have rear façade align with adjacent structure's (1020 Abercorn) back wall." The petitioner is also requesting a recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard regarding rear yard setbacks. The proposed rear yard setback will be 7'-4".

Staff recommended approval for New Construction, Small (Parts I & II) of a mixed-use building on the parcel located at 1018 Abercorn Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Ensure the casement windows have light divisions.
- 2. The first-floor exterior expression must be increased to 13'-0".
- 3. Provide location of where the refuse storage area will be.

#### AND

Recommend approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard to allow for 7'-4" rear yard setback because the variance criteria is met.

**Mr. Williams** asked if the request is to make first floor higher than the others. **Mr. Hageman** stated that is correct, it is not a residential floor and that is what the design standards require. Staff suggested Special Exception.

# **PETITIONER COMMENTS:**

**Mr. Jerome Elder**, petitioner, stated they agree with staff comments, but would like to keep 12 feet for the first floor. Would also like an approval with condition to return with Special Exception.

**Ms. Ledvina** asked about intention of roof. **Mr. Elder** stated it will have HVAC equipment and walkable. Will also house mechanical equipment for whatever first floor user turns out to be (example: hood if the first floor is a restaurant).

# **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

**Mr. James Hundsrucker**, stated he has concerns about distance between the buildings. He is concerned that the roof top will become a fourth floor; it should be restricted from anything beyond maintenance. The height of building is blocking light of other buildings on the east and west sides. **Mr. Hageman** stated there is no side yard setback for TC-1 zoning, nor is a building on the west side, it is currently a parking lot.

**Ms. Connor** asked what existed on the property.

## **BOARD COMMENTS:**

**Ms. Fenwick** asked if they spoke to the neighbors. **Mr. Elder** stated yes, spoke with the southern corner owners: they are aware and fine with the proposals. They also spoke with the owners to the north, there has been no response. He assured there is ample space for maintenance.

**Ms. Ledvina** asked about the rooftop and will there be lights on it or anything that will cause a disturbance for the neighbors. **Mr. Elder** stated no; access is for maintenance purposes only.

**Ms. Mobley** asked about light and air movement. **Mr. Elder** stated the existing structures are not affected by his project.

**Ms. Mobley** there has not been a structure that tall on that property, historically. This could affect historical integrity of properties on north & south.

**Ms. Connor** stated the petitioner should take into consideration that the adjacent buildings were not that high because they have side windows.

Mr. Williams stated losing light is part of development.

Mr. Elder stated they are making certain gutters are included.

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historical Preservation Commission does hereby approve the petition for New Construction, Small (Parts I & II) of a mixed-use building on the parcel located at 1018 Abercorn Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval, because otherwise the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.Ensure the casement windows have light divisions.
- 2. Provide location of where the refuse storage area will be.
- 3. Apply for a special exception for the first-floor exterior expression to remain 12'-0".

AND

Recommend approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard that reads: Building Setbacks (ft).

Rear yard:10 (min)

To allow for 7'-4" rear yard setback because the variance criteria is met.

### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Rebecca Fenwick Second: Robin Williams

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Not Present

Mae Bowley - Aye

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye
Brian Arcudi - Not Present

18. Petition of Nathaniel Snyder | 22-004207-COA | 210 East Park Avenue | New Construction, Small (Parts I and II)

- **SUBMITTAL PACKET.pdf**
- Staff Research.pdf
- Staff Recommendation.pdf

Mr. James Zerillo presented the petitioner's request of approval for new construction, small (parts I and II) and demolition of a non-historic addition at 210 East Park Avenue. Staff recommended approval for New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) at 210 East Parke Avenue with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the work otherwise is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Revise the exterior stair design to incorporate posts at each landing.
- 2. Provide plans for repair and possible infill following the demolition of the non-historic addition.
- 3. Provide the roof pitch and ensure it meets the standards.
- 4. Increase the amount of transparent features on the facades visible from the public right of way
- 5. Provide the location of refuse storage and mechanical equipment on the site plan.

# **PETITIONER COMMENTS:**

Mr. Matthew Farrar, petitioner, stated he was agreeable to staff recommendations.

**Ms. Ledvina** asked about dormer dimensions. **Mr. Farrar** responded 6 feet. **Ms. Ledvina** asked why flat roof dormer rather than as other historic structures. **Mr. Farrar** responded because of height restrictions.

# **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

**Mr. James Hundsrucker**, stated there is a carriage house next to it. He asked how will access between the carriage house and main house be provided; the piers are supporting the staircase. **Mr. Farrar** stated there will be walkway by the carriage; there will be five feet of space. **Ms. Michalak** stated it was common to walk underneath requested door.

**Ms. Fenwick** asked about neighboring carriage house aligning with property line. Asked has there been consideration to square it. **Mr. Farrar** stated they have no concerns with it; felt it is presented as best scenario.

**Ms. Ledvina** asked about the door of the main house; fill existing wall or addition. **Mr. Farrar** will keep existing wall and return door to window.

# **BOARD COMMENTS:**

**Ms.** Ledvina expressed concern regarding the size of dormer, it is dominant on the carriage house. She stated a hip dormer would be more appropriate and blending, or a

front gable as suggested by Mr. Williams.

**Mr. Williams** asked about screened later addition: could there be deconstruction rather than demo. **Mr. Farrar** stated the materials not historic in value but can use a deconstruction company if preferred.

**Ms.** Ledvina asked petitioner if he is agreeable to front gable or hip dormer. **Mr.** Farrar stated what is presented is the best compromise for visual compatibility and usable space.

**Ms. Connor** asked how a gabled roof would affect the height of the dormer. **Mr. Farrar** stated it would have to make it higher and it doesn't provide visual compatibility and but greater amount of unusable space. **Ms. Connor** stated she is agreeable to what is presented.

### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) at 210 East Park Avenue with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the work otherwise is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Revise the exterior stair design to incorporate posts at each landing.
- 2. Provide plans for repair and possible infill following the demolition of the non-historic addition.
- 3. Provide the roof pitch and ensure it meets the standards.
- 4.Increase the amount of transparent features on the facades visible from the public right of way.
- 5. Provide the location of refuse storage and mechanical equipment on the site plan.
- 6.Utilize deconstruction as opposed to demolition for the non-historic addition and salvage material where possible.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kiersten Connor Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Not Present

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

19. Petition of Wubbena Architects, James F Wubbena | 22-004405-COA | 0 Jefferson Street | New Construction, Small (Parts I and II)

- **SUBMITTAL PACKET.pdf**
- Staff Research.pdf
- Staff Recommendation.pdf

**Mr. James Zerillo** presented the petitioner's request of approval for new construction, small (parts I and II) at 0 Jefferson Street which is at the intersection of West Gwinnett Lane and Jefferson Street. Staff presented a recommendation of approval for New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) at 0 Jefferson Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the work otherwise is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Revise the side yard setback to be 3 feet to meet the standards.
- 2. Provide the dimension for the second story railing height and ensure it meets the standards.
- 3. Provide the dimension for the distance between balusters and ensure it meets the standards.
- 4. Provide the material for the porch columns and ensure it meets the standards.
- 5. Provide a specified window brand that has been previously approved per the MPC window brochure or provide a full-size sample of the proposed window.
- 6. Ensure that there is no building code requirement to include a handrail on the first-floor porch.
- 7. Provide a dimension for the extension of the eaves beyond the supporting wall.
- 8. Revise the front porch to have expressed piers with infill between recessed a minimum of 3 inches.
- 9. Provide clarification for the railing material and revise so that the railings, from front to rear porches, are consistent in material.
- 10. Increase the amount of transparent features on the side façade to meet the 30% minimum.

**Ms.** Ledvina asked about the cornice line detail and bracket dimensions. **Mr.** Zerillo stated it is a condition requesting it. There was discussion regarding the roof deck.

# **PETITIONER COMMENTS:**

**Mr. James Wubbena** provided detail information regarding staff conditions. Agrees with staff recommendation and conditions.

**Mr. Williams** stated bracketing usually on the upper deck of Italianate Design. Mr. Wubbena stated they can do that; the intent was to detract from the upper deck.

# **PUBLIC COMMENTS**:

**Mr. James Hundsrucker** stated this is a subdivided end lot and provided its history along with its subdivision. He stated the Victorian Historic district is being lost. The roof type is being designed for activity, it is not on any other structure and does not want to set a precedent.

**Mr. Williams** stated this property is out of the Oglethorpe Plan. **Mr. Hundsrucker** stated it is a continuance of the City's plan. Asked when the preservation of material starts.

## **BOARD COMMENTS:**

**Ms. Fenwick** does not want to set a precedent with the roof top deck. **Ms. Ledvina** agrees, hesitant about rooftop decks. It's visible and questionable safety.

# **Motion**

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve for New Construction, Small (Parts

I and II) at 0 Jefferson Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the work otherwise is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Revise the side yard setback to be 3 feet to meet the standards.
- 2. Provide the dimension for the second story railing height and ensure it meets the standards.
- 3. Provide the dimension for the distance between balusters and ensure it meets the standards.
- 4. Provide the material for the porch columns and ensure it meets the standards.
- 5. Provide a specified window brand that has been previously approved per the MPC window brochure or provide a full-size sample of the proposed window.
- 6. Ensure that there is no building code requirement to include a handrail on the first-floor porch.
- 7. Provide a dimension for the extension of the eaves beyond the supporting wall.
- 8. Revise the front porch to have expressed piers with infill between recessed a minimum of 3 inches.
- 9. Provide clarification for the railing material and revise so that the railings, from front to rear porches, are consistent in material.
- 10.Increase the amount of transparent features on the side façade to meet the 30% minimum.
- 11.If a railing is required to be added the design shall come back to the HPC for approval
- 12.Add in-scale brackets to the penthouse cornice

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Rebecca Fenwick Second: Robin Williams

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Not Present
Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

20. Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 22-004602-COA | 1400, 1408, 1410 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. and 409 West 31st Street | Amendment/Addition

- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Previous Submittal Packet.pdf
- Staff Recommendation 22-004602-COA 1400, 1408, 1410 MLK 409 W 31st.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request of approval for amendments to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to the buildings located at 1400, 1408, 1410 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. and 409 West 31st Street [File Nos. 20-001453-COA, 20-001457-COA and 20-001460-COA]. The work includes further alterations to buildings as well a bathroom building addition and canopy between two existing metal building; the addition is minimally visible. Staff recommended approval for amendments to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to the

buildings located at 1400, 1408, 1410 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. and 409 West 31st Street [File Nos. 20-001453-COA, 20-001457-COA and 20-001460-COA] with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed amendments are otherwise visually compatible and meet the standards:

- 1. Provide additional information regarding location, size, shape, and operability for the window shown in the wall section on drawing sheet A9.
- 2. Add headers, surround trim, and pronounced sills (windows) to all new window and door openings.
- 3. Window sashes must be inset a minimum of 3 inches and storefront glazing must be inset a minimum of 4 inches.
- 4. Revise the polycarbonate roof to be a roof material permitted by the ordinance.
- 5. Screen the HVAC equipment proposed on the addition roof if visible from the right-of-way during construction.

# **PETITIONER COMMENTS:**

**Ms.** Mariel Hamer, petitioner, apologized for not providing window info, as it was not visible from the right-of-way; will provide. Polycarbonate would be in keeping with industrial. It has more of a glass visual than polycarbonate. Will provide drawings.

# **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

**Mr. Ryan Jarles** stated the polycarbonate roofing can be synthetic material, could be appropriate for this location if it is the more durable version of polycarbonate.

# **BOARD COMMENTS:**

The Board felt this was appropriate for location.

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historical Preservation Commission does hereby approve amendments to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to the buildings located at 1400, 1408, 1410 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. and 409 West 31st Street [File Nos. 20-001453-COA, 20-001457-COA and 20-001460-COA] with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed amendments are otherwise visually compatible and meet the standards:

- 1.Provide additional information regarding location, size, shape, and operability for the window shown in the wall section on drawing sheet A9.
- 2.Add headers, surround trim, and pronounced sills (windows) to all new window and door openings.
- 3. Window sashes must be inset a minimum of 3 inches and storefront glazing must be inset a minimum of 4 inches.
- 4. Screen the HVAC equipment proposed on the addition roof if visible from the right-of-way during construction.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Rebecca Fenwick Second: Darren Bagley-Heath

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Not Present

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye

Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

#### **CUYLER-BROWNVILLE DISTRICT**

21. Petition of Eco-Friendly Construction and Consulting | 22-004617-COA | 823 West 39th Street | After-the-Fact Alterations and Addition with Variance Recommendation Requests

- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Previous Info from Expired COA.pdf
- Staff Research.pdf
- Staff Recommendation.pdf

Mr. James Zerillo presented the petitioner's request of approval for an after-the-fact addition and alterations for the property located at 823 West 39th Street. Partial demolition of this new addition is proposed to reduce the depth and the width. The front door, windows, siding, and porch have been altered as part of the after-the-fact alterations. A rear yard fence has also been constructed. The petitioner is also requesting a recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard regarding rear yard setbacks in Article 5 - Base Zoning Districts to allow for a rear-yard setback of approximately 3 feet. Staff recommended to continue the after-the-fact addition and alterations for the property located at 823 West 39th Street with the following conditions:

- 1. The removal of T-111 and replacement with a permitted material.
- 2. Revise the rear addition window to be visually compatible with the other rectangular windows on the block.
- 3. Revise the depth of the addition to be visually compatible with the block face on Moray Street.
- 4. Provide the window specification for the replaced windows and ensure that they are of the same materials and configuration as the historic windows which were replaced.
- 5. Provide the specification for the replaced door and ensure that they are of the same materials and configuration as the historic door which was replaced.
- 6. Provide a door specification for the new door on the rear of the property.
- 7. Provide the materials, dimensions, and before and after photos for the after-the-fact porch alterations.
- 8. Provide the porch materials and specifications for the rear-yard porch and ensuring they meet the standards.
- 9. Provide documentation of the previous roof material prior to alterations.

and continue the recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard regarding rear yard setbacks to allow for a rear yard setback of approximately 3 feet for the petitioner to provide a dimensioned site plan to show the new rear yard setback.

The design standards were not adhered to regarding the after-the-fact addition.

# **PETITIONER COMMENTS:**

**Mr. Andre Gadson**, petitioner, stated he inherited the project. There are no pictures of property to revert to original. Compatible materials for the area can be applied.

**Ms.** Ledvina stated observing area properties for cues as found on GoogleMaps. The front door and porch configurations are visible.

**Ms. Michalak** stated the only way to fix the after-the-fact is to remove the addition, which engulfs the historic property. The roof was extended rather than dropped as it should have been.

## **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

There were no public comments.

## **BOARD COMMENTS:**

**Ms.** Ledvina requested staff to work with petitioner regarding compatible design, then return to HPC Board: piers, transom, handrail, caps.

**Ms. Fenwick** stated it is burdensome regarding properties purchased without knowledge of problems. Believes returning is not necessary once Staff has worked with them.

Ms. Michalak stated if the addition is removed, there is no need for variance.

Ms. Ledvina stated it would still have to come back.

### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby continue the after-the-fact addition and alterations for the property located at 823 West 39th Street with the following conditions:

- 1. The removal of T-111 and replacement with a permitted material.
- 2.Revise the rear addition window to be visually compatible with the other rectangular windows on the block.
- 3. Revise the depth of the addition to be visually compatible with the block face on Moray Street.
- 4.Provide the window specification for the replaced windows and ensure that they are of the same materials and configuration as the historic windows which were replaced.
- 5. Provide the specification for the replaced door and ensure that they are of the same materials and configuration as the historic door which was replaced.
- 6. Provide a door specification for the new door on the rear of the property.
- 7. Provide the materials, dimensions, and before and after photos for the after-the-fact porch alterations.
- 8. Provide the porch materials and specifications for the rear-yard porch and ensuring they meet the standards.
- 9. Provide documentation of the previous roof material prior to alterations.

## AND

Continue the recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard regarding rear yard setbacks in Article 5 - Base Zoning Districts:

"Traditional Residential Districts – Cuyler-Brownville.

TR- Development Standards for Permitted Uses. Development in any TR- district shall meet the

development standards as set forth below.

TR-3.

Building Setbacks (ft).

Rear yard 20 (min)"

To allow for a rear yard setback of approximately 3 feet for the petitioner to provide a dimensioned site plan to show the new rear yard setback.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Darren Bagley-Heath

Second: Robin Williams

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Not Present

Mae Bowley - Aye
Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

22. Petition of Neighborhood Improvement Association | 22-004600-COA | 655 West 34th Street | New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) and Special Exception Requests

- Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Staff Research.pdf
- NIA Cuyler-Brownville Design Standards Relief Support Letter 102022.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf

**Mr. James Zerillo** presented the petitioner's request of approval for New Construction, Small (Parts I & II) and Special Exceptions Requests for the vacant parcel located at 655 West 34th Street. In the listed front elevations, the petitioner has detailed that front elevation 3 will be used for 655 West 34th Street.

The project description is listed below per the petitioner:

"Neighborhood Improvement Association (NIA) is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the lots located at 642 Lavinia and 1708 Florance Streets for which we will build a home for low-to-moderate income individuals/families. Chatham County and the City of Savannah Landbank Authority has approved to sell the combined lots to NIA and Landbank Authority ordered a recombination survey to show that the two lots will be combined as one, with one home being built. The home will be classified as small new construction being that the cumulative footprint will be less than 4,000 square feet- 1,080 Sf House, 144 SF porches and 64 SF storage shed. At the completion of the construction, the home will be sold to a qualified first-time homebuyer with combined gross household income 80% or less of Savannah's median income as established by HUD."

The petitioner is also requesting two (2) Special Exceptions to allow for a first story exterior expression of 10 feet and to allow for less than 30% transparent features on both side facades. Staff recommended approval for New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) at 655 West 34th Street with the following conditions because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. The petitioner must provide a door specification for the materials of the door.
- 2. The distance between the balusters must not exceed four (4) inches on center.
- 3. Revise the proposed portions of fence which are plastic chain link to be a permitted material

AND approval for two (2) Special Exceptions from the design standards to allow for a first story exterior expression of 10 feet because the special exception criteria is met. and to allow for less than 30% transparent features on both side facades because the special exception criteria is met.

**Ms.** Ledvina asked if Special Exception has to be requested each time presented, as standardized drawings are presented to be replicated.

# **PETITIONER COMMENTS:**

**Ms. Deborah Simmons** stated this to be affordable housing.

## **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

**Mr. Ryan Jarles**, HSF, stated the Special Exception is appropriate for affordable housing project. Requested discussion to remove Special Exception requirement for affordable housing.

## **BOARD COMMENTS:**

**Ms.** Ledvina stated she is disappointed that the City could not create a design that is in compliance with the ordinance and not recycled.

### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) at 655 West 34th Street with the following conditions because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. The petitioner must provide a door specification for the materials of the door.
- 2. The distance between the balusters must not exceed four (4) inches on center.
- 3. Revise the proposed portions of fence which are plastic chain link to be a permitted material
- 4.Extend the driveway the full length through the proposed concrete pad.

## **AND**

Approval for two (2) Special Exceptions for the following standards:

In single-family detached, single-family attached, two-family attached, three-family/four-family, and townhouse dwellings, the exterior expression of the height of the first story shall not be less than 11 feet and the height of the upper stories shall not be less than nine (9) feet.

To allow for a first story exterior expression of 10 feet because the special exception criteria is met.

### **AND**

All residential facades visible from a street shall incorporate transparent features (windows and doors) on at least 30% of the ground floor façade.

To allow for less than 30% transparent features on both side facades because the special exception criteria is met.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kiersten Connor Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Not Present

Mae Bowley - Aye
Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

23. Petition of Neighborhood Improvement Association | 22-004599-COA | 1708 Florance Street | New Construction, Small (Parts I & II) and Special Exceptions Requests

- Submittal Packet
- Project Description & Special Exception Request
- Staff Research
- NIA Cuyler-Brownville Design Standards Relief Support Letter

**Mr. Ethan Hageman** presented the petitioner is requesting approval for New Construction, Small (Parts I & II) and two (2) Special Exceptions Requests for the vacant parcel located at **1708 Florance Street**. The petitioner is proposing Porch 2 for the front elevation and Roof B for the roof.

The project description is listed below per the petitioner:

"Neighborhood Improvement Association (NIA) is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the lots located at 642 Lavinia and 1708 Florance Streets for which we will build a home for low-to-moderate income individuals/families. Chatham County and the City of Savannah Landbank Authority has approved to sell the combined lots to NIA and Landbank Authority ordered a recombination survey to show that the two lots will be combined as one, with one home being built. The home will be classified as small new construction being that the cumulative footprint will be less than 4,000 square feet- 1,080 Sf House, 144 SF porches and 64 SF storage shed. At the completion of the construction, the home will be sold to a qualified first-time homebuyer with combined gross household income 80% or less of Savannah's median income as established by HUD."

The petitioner is also requesting two (2) Special Exceptions to allow for a first story exterior expression of 10 feet and to allow for less than 30% transparent features on both side facades. Staff recommended approval for New Construction, Small (Parts I & II) and the two (2) Special Exceptions Request for the vacant parcel located at 1708 Florance Street with the following conditions to be revised and sent to staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. The petitioner must provide a door specification for the materials of the door.
- 2. The distance between the balusters must not exceed four (4) inches on center. and approval for two (2) Special Exceptions for the following standard to allow for a first story exterior expression of 10 feet because the special exception criteria is met and to allow for less than 30% transparent features on both side facades because the special exception criteria is met.

There were no Petitioner, Petitioner, or Board comments, as the presentation was equivalent to the prior petition.

### **Motion**

The Savannah Historical Preservation Commission does hereby approve the petition for New Construction, Small (Parts I & II) and the two (2) Special Exceptions Request for the vacant parcel located at 1708 Florance Street with the following conditions to be revised and sent to staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. The petitioner must provide a door specification for the materials of the door.
- 2. The distance between the balusters must not exceed four (4) inches on center.
- 3. The driveway must extend through the concrete pad.

AND

Approval for two (2) Special Exceptions for the following standards:

In single-family detached, single-family attached, two-family attached, three-family/four-family, and townhouse dwellings, the exterior expression of the height of the first story shall not be less than 11 feet and the height of the upper stories shall not be less than nine (9) feet.

To allow for a first story exterior expression of 10 feet because the special exception criteria is met. AND

All residential facades visible from a street shall incorporate transparent features (windows and doors) on at least 30% of the ground floor façade.

To allow for less than 30% transparent features on both side facades because the special exception criteria is met.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Rebecca Fenwick Second: Robin Williams

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Not Present

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye

Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

#### STREETCAR DISTRICT

24. Petition of J. Elder Studio | 22-003186-COA | 2613 Montgomery Street | After-the-Fact Demolition of Non-Contributing Buildings, New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass, and Special Exception Request

- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Submittal Packet Property Surveys.pdf
- Staff Research.pdf
- Previous Submittal Packet July meeting (not heard).pdf
- @22-001687-COA Board Decision Denied.pdf
- @22-001687-COA Submittal Packet Denied.pdf
- Staff Recommendation 22-003186-COA 2613 Montgomery St.pdf

**Ms. Leah Michalak** presented the petitioners request for an approval for the after-the-fact demolition of non-contributing buildings and New Construction, Part I, Height and Mass for two (2), 3-story mixed-use buildings for the property located at 2613 Montgomery Street. The applicant is also requesting a Special Exception from the standard within *5.13.5 Development Standards for Permitted Uses to* allow for 'Building 1' to have a footprint of 11,000sf.

Staff recommended approval for the after-the-fact demolition of non-contributing buildings and New Construction, Part I, Height and Mass for two (2), 3-story mixed-use buildings for the property located at 2613 Montgomery Street with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II: Design Details because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. The rear yard setback for 'Building 1' must be 10 feet minimum.
- 2. The side (interior) yard setback on 'Building 2' must be 10 feet minimum.
- 3. Add eaves, soffits, overhangs, and gable end rakes that meet the standards.

and approval for a Special Exception from the standard within 5.13.5 Development Standards for Permitted Uses with the condition that the building footprint be reduced to a maximum of 10,000sf because the Special Exception Criteria are otherwise met.

# **PETITIONER COMMENTS**:

**Mr. Jerome Elder** stated the project was presented to the neighborhood and was well received, as they are trying to increase density. They are in support of multi-family to the area. Increasing the height of the facade walls can be considered.

**Ms.** Ledvina asked if a 25-foot garage door was necessary. **Mr.** Elder responded yes, it is for the entrance and exit ways.

**Ms. Fenwick** asked if the north elevation is adjacent to another building. **Mr. Elder** responded yes, that will come before the Board as well as a rehabilitation; it is all a part of the redevelopment. They were able to get the building down to 10,000 sq feet.

# **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

**Mr. Jason Combs**, President of Thomas Square, gave his support for the project. The neighborhood supports the project unanimously.

**Mr. Ryan Jarles**, HSF, commended the petitioner for working with Staff and HPC. Requested to ensure that future Special Exceptions are held to the same standards, as it does fit in with the neighborhood and is visually compatible.

### **BOARD COMMENTS:**

Encourage applicant of deeper balconies and extended gables on east facade.

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the after-the-fact demolition of non-contributing buildings and New Construction, Part I, Height and Mass for two (2), 3-story mixed-use buildings for the property located at 2613 Montgomery Street with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II: Design Details because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. The rear yard setback for 'Building 1' must be 10 feet minimum.
- 2. The side (interior) yard setback on 'Building 2' must be 10 feet minimum.
- 3.Add eaves, soffits, overhangs, and gable end rakes that meet the standards OR revise the roof design to extend the gables as parapets.
- 4. Further articulate the north façade.
- 5. Modify the easy façade to create additional depth at the balconies.

## **AND**

Approval for a Special Exception from the standard within 5.13.5 Development Standards for Permitted Uses, which reads:

"TC-1. Building. Building footprint (max sq. ft.): 5,500"

With the condition that the building footprint be reduced to a maximum of 10,000sf because the Special Exception Criteria are otherwise met.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams Second: Kiersten Connor

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Not Present

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

25. Acknowledge and approve of Staff-approved decisions as presented.

### **Motion**

Approve

# Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion: Rebecca Fenwick Second: Kiersten Connor

- 26. Petition of PURVIS EXTERIORS/KEYSTONE ROOFING, Amanda Cribbs | 22-004358-COA | 210 EAST DUFFY STREET | Roof replacement
  - SIGNED V Staff Dec 22-004358-COA 210 E Duffy.pdf
- 27. Petition of STEVEN BODEK INC., Ashley Field | 22-004446-COA | 3 WEST 36TH STREET | Chimney repair and brick repointing
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 22-004446-COA 3 W 36th.pdf
- 28. Petition of STEVEN BODEK INC., Ashley Field | 22-004581-COA | 311 EAST 40TH STREET | Front porch trim and fascia repair and paint.
  - SIGNED Streetcar Staff Recommendation 22-004581-COA 311 E 40th.pdf
- 29. Petition of FIRST MOUNT BETHEL MISSIONARY CHURCH, Kenneth Jenks, Sr. | 22-002169-COA | 124 WEST ANDERSON STREET | Denial of after-the-fact chain link fence
  - SIGNED Victorian Staff Decision 22-002169-COA 124 W Anderson St.pdf
- 30. Petition of DEBORAH McCORKLE | 22-004228-COA | 102 BRADY STREET | Front porch repair with conditions
  - SIGNED S Staff Rec 22-004228-COA 102 Brady St.pdf

## XI. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 31. Report on Work Inconsistent with an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the October 26, 2022 HPC Meeting
  - Work Incosistent with an Issued COA October 2022 HPC.pdf
- 32. Report on Work Done Without a Certificate of Appropriateness for the October 26, 2022 HPC Meeting
  - Work done without a COA October 2022 HPC.pdf
- 33. Report on Work Done Which Exceeds the Scope of an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the October 26, 2022 HPC Meeting
  - Work Done Which Exceeds the Scope of an Issued COA October 2022 HPC.pdf
- 34. Stamped Drawings October 2022 Report
  - Report on Stamped Drawings October 2022.pdf
- 35. Items Deferred to Staff October 2022 Report
  - Items Deferred to Staff October 2022 Report.pdf

## XII. OTHER BUSINESS

#### **NEW BUSINESS**

## 36. Chair to Appoint Nominating Committee for 2023 Chair and Vice-Chair Positions

Chair Mobley appointed the following Board members as the Nominating Committee: Kathy Ledvina
Kiersten Connor
Mae Bowley

### **XV. ADJOURNMENT**

37. \*NOTE DATE CHANGE: Next Pre-Meeting: Monday, November 21, 2022 at 2:30pm - 112 East State Street: Mendonsa Hearing Room

38. \*NOTE DATE CHANGE: Next Regular Meeting: Monday, November 21, 2022 at 3:00pm - 112 East State Street: Mendonsa Hearing Room

# 39. Adjourn

There being no further business to present before the Board, the October 26, 2022 Historic Preservation Commission meeting adjourned at 6:34 p.m.

Respectfully presented,

Leah G. Michalak Director of Historic Preservation /bm

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.