

Historic Preservation Commission

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street

March 22 2023 3:00 PM

MINUTES

March 22, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

A Pre-meeting was held at 1:30pm. Items on the agenda were presented by staff, as time permitted, and the Commission asked questions. No testimony was received, and no votes were taken.

Members Present: Kathy Ledvina, Chair

Darren Bagley-Heath Kiersten Connor Rebecca Fenwick Kathy Ledvina Pamela Miller Virginia Mobley Jeff Notrica Robin Williams

Members Absent: Mae Bowley

Staff Present: Melanie Wilson, Executive Director

Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director Leah Michalak, Historic Preservation Director

Caitlin Chamberlain, Senior Planner Ethan Hageman, Assistant Planner Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant Warren Durrer, Administrative Assistant

- I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME
- **II. SIGN POSTING**
- **III. CONSENT AGENDA**

VICTORIAN DISTRICT

- 1. Petition of Jeff Whitlow | 23-000773-COA | 205 West Duffy Street | Alterations
 - Submittal Packet 205 W. Duffy St..pdf
 - Staff Report 23-000773-COA 205 W Duffy St.pdf
 - @Staff Research 205 W. Duffy St..pdf
 - ** Ms. Miller voted in favor of the motion.

Motion

Approval for the proposed alterations to the non-contributing accessory dwelling unit at the rear of 205 West Duffy Street with the following conditions because the project otherwise is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Contact the City of Savannah Real Estate Services Department to determine whether an encroachment permit is necessary for the shed roof.

Choose a door made from permitted materials and submit to staff for review and approval prior to installation.

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the proposed alterations to the non-contributing accessory dwelling unit at the rear of 205 West Duffy Street with the following conditions because the project otherwise is visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1.Contact the City of Savannah Real Estate Services Department to determine whether an encroachment permit is necessary for the shed roof.
- 2.Choose a door made from permitted materials and submit to staff for review and approval prior to installation.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Abstain

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

CUYLER-BROWNVILLE DISTRICT

- 2. Petition of Eric Taylor | 23-001047-COA | 601 West 37th Street | Amendment to New Construction
 - Staff Report 23-001047-COA 601 W 37th St.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 601 E 37th St.pdf
 - Previous stamped permit set.pdf
 - Staff Research.pdf
 - **Ms. Miller voted in favor of the motion.

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve an amendment to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness (File No. 21-004031-COA) for a new construction carriage house for the property located at 601 West 37th Street as requested because the proposed changes are visually compatible and meet the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams
Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Abstain
Brian Arcudi - Not Present

STREETCAR DISTRICT

- 3. Petition of Juan Allen Eady | 23-000545-COA | 513 East 34th Street | New Construction, Small (Parts I and II)
 - Submittal Packet 513 East 34th Street.pdf
 - Staff Report -23-000545-COA 513 E 34th St.pdf
 - Staff Research 513 East 34th Street.pdf
 - Lauren Gallett Opposition.pdf

Neighbor Lauren Gallet states the signs were not posted the entire 15 days; work started before COA was provided. She submitted pictures and videos through e-mail, as noted below.

My name is Lauren Gallet, we briefly spoke a little while ago at the COA meeting. I am the property owner of 519 East 34th street. I have cc'd my lawyer in this email.

Please find below photos ranging from February to today. I have them dated in my photo album.

As you can see, construction started in February after hours the same day the COA request sign was put up.

Below videos show active construction same day sign was posted.

Post storm

5 days after storm

Today:

I am very opposed to this building as are most of the residents and homeowners in the area. The developer has already put up 5 new construction homes on this block, greatly reducing green space (the back portions of these properties have been paved in with concrete), removing old many trees and created congestion in the area.

My property has very old trees along the west property line - as you can see in the photos, construction already damaged major root lines to my large gum tree. I hired a certified arborist to create a survey on the trees and damages they'd receive should a house be built with its current foundation - the survey suggests an alternative foundation with pillars to avoid killing my trees whose values exceed \$15,000. Plus cost yo remove, remove fence and rebuild it, and cost to replace with trees of equal value.

In addition to losing beautiful green trees, another building will increase water run-off and flooding onto my property. Trees are major aids in water absorption - you can see how flooded the next door lot became in the photos above. The trees provide beauty, shade from summer heat and irreplaceable homes to local wildlife.

Please let me know if you need anything else.

Sincerely,

Lauren Gallet

The petitioner states the signs were posted and the front sign was torn in half. He stated the rear sign is still up, but there is no evidence to support it.

The petition was continued from the March 22, 2023 for lack of meeting posting requirements, to the April 26, 2023 HPC Meeting.

Motion

Remove petition from the March 22, 2023 from the Consent agenda due to improper posting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Virginia Mobley

Second: Darren Bagley-Heath

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye Virginia Mobley - Aye Robin Williams - Aye Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye Jeff Notrica - Nay

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye Kathy S. Ledvina - Abstain

^{**} Ms. Miller voted in favor of the motion.

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

4. Adopt the March 22, 2023 Agenda

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission motioned to adopt the March 22, 2023 agenda.

** Ms. Miller voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams Second: Virginia Mobley

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Abstain
Brian Arcudi - Not Present

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

5. Approve February 22, 2023 HPC Meeting Minutes

Ø 02.22.23 MEETING MINUTES.pdf

Motion

Approve the February 22, 2023 HPC Meeting Minutes

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Virginia Mobley
Second: Rebecca Fenwick

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Abstain
Brian Arcudi - Not Present

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

6. Petition of Heather Halverson | 22-000966-COA | 671-673 West 34th Street | After-the-Fact Rehabilitation and Alterations

M	ot	in	n

Conitnue.

** Ms. Miller voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Darren Bagley-Heath

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Abstain
Brian Arcudi - Not Present

7. Petition of Empwr Solar, Jesse Adams | 22-005824-COA | 308 East 41st Street | Solar Panels

Motion

Continue.

** Ms. Miller voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Darren Bagley-Heath

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Abstain
Brian Arcudi - Not Present

8. Petition of Harambee House | 23-000952-COA | 1115 Habersham Street | Solar Panels

Motion			
Continue.			
** Ms. Miller voted in favor of the motion.			
Vote Results (Approved)			
Motion: Robin Williams			
Second: Darren Bagley-Heath			
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye		
Virginia Mobley	- Aye		
Robin Williams	- Aye		
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye		
Jeff Notrica	- Aye		
Mae Bowley	- Not Present		
Kiersten Connor	- Aye		
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Abstain		
Brian Arcudi	- Not Present		

9. Petition of Greenline Architecture | 23-001059-COA | 1705 Abercorn Street | New Construction: Small (Parts I & II) & Variance Recommendation Request

Motion				
Continue.				
** Ms. Miller voted in favor of the motion.				
Vote Results (Approved)				
Motion: Robin Williams				
Second: Darren Bagley-Heath				
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye			
Virginia Mobley	- Aye			
Robin Williams	- Aye			
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye			
Jeff Notrica	- Aye			
Mae Bowley	- Not Present			
Kiersten Connor	- Aye			
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Abstain			
Brian Arcudi	- Not Present			

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

VICTORIAN DISTRICT

10. Petition of Empwr Solar, Jesse Adams | 22-005833-COA | 511 East Anderson Street | Special Exception, Solar Panels

- Ø Staff Research 511 E. Anderson St..pdf
- Submittal Packet 511 E. Anderson St..pdf
- Staff Report 22-005833-COA 511 E Anderson St.pdf

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the petitioner's request for a special exception for approval of the installation of solar panels on the east, west and south (rear) sides of the roof and east porch roof of the historic resource located at 511 East Anderson Street.

Per the applicant:

"The proposed project includes the installation of twenty-four roof-mounted Hanwha Q.PEAK DUO BLK ML-G10+400 solar modules."

511 East Anderson Street was built in 1900 and is a contributing historic resource within the National Register Victorian Historic District and the local Victorian Historic District. It is located within a residential area that contains similar wood framed two-story houses and a mix of contributing and non-contributing resources.

Staff recommends to approve the request for the installation of solar panels on the west and south roof elevations at 511 East Anderson Street, because the panels are visually compatible and meet the standards.

AND

to approve the Special Exception Request for the installation of solar panels that are visible from the East Anderson Street view with the following condition because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Revise, remove or reduce the amount of proposed solar panels on the east roof elevation and porch roof, and submit redesign to staff for review and approval prior to starting the project.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Jesse Adams stated the integrity of the roof, has certified structural engineer on staff, stated it was approved for solar panels. Regarding the height, it is 30 feet.

Mr. Collin Lemmon, Regional Manager, stated the panel on the east side although visual, it is a one-way street which is most visible to pedestrians. It gets more sunlight from proposed the location. They are built to sustain Category 4 hurricanes and strengthens the roof.

Ms. Ledvina asked about the overall height from roof. **Mr.** Lemmon stated it is 4 inches total; stationary, following slope of the roof. Black panels to blend in with roof.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Mobley asked if this was visually compatible according to the Ordinance. **Ms. Chamberlain** stated for solar panels, the lane is not it included. She stated the front would be most visible. **Ms. Mobley** stated that we are threatening the historic

integrity. **Mr. Bagley-Heath** stated solar panels are reversible; not as permanent as the building itself. **Ms. Connor** stated that is the purpose of it coming to the Board. **Ms. Ledvina** stated they are obtrusive and stated there are other options, such as solar shingles. The Board agreed that Staff Recommendation is a compromise.

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the request for the installation of solar panels on the west and south roof elevations at 511 East Anderson Street, because the panels are visually compatible and meet the standards.

AND

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the Special Exception Request for the installation of solar panels that are visible from the East Anderson Street view with the following condition because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1.Revise, remove or reduce the amount of proposed solar panels on the east roof elevation and porch roof, and submit redesign to staff for review and approval prior to starting the project.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Rebecca Fenwick Second: Robin Williams

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Nay
Kathy S. Ledvina - Abstain
Brian Arcudi - Not Present

- 11. Petition of Ethos Preservation Kim Campbell | 23-000587-COA | 538 East Bolton Street | Rehabilitation, Addition, New Construction, Small (Parts I and II)
 - Submittal Packet 538 East Bolton.pdf
 - Ø Staff Research 538 East Bolton.pdf
 - Staff Report 23-000587-COA 538 E Bolton St.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request for rehabilitation, additions, and new construction, small (parts I and II) at 538 East Bolton Street. All rehabilitations are proposed to be in-kind. The existing, non-historic rear addition is proposed to be demolished and replaced with the new proposed addition. The new addition will be recessed from the principal building.

Per the petitioner the scope of work is as follows:

Main House:

^{**}Ms. Miller voted in favor of the motion.

^{**} Ms. Kiersten Connor and Ms. Rebecca Fenwick recused themselves.

- -Decking, railings, and columns at the front porches to be repaired and replaced in kind as needed.
- -The front door (not original) to be replaced with a custom historically accurate door to match original side lite.
- -The front door at second story porch (not original) to be replaced with a full lite door.
- -Existing Windows to be repaired or replaced in kind as needed.
- -Window sashes to be painted SW 6235 Foggy Day
- -Window trim to be painted SW 7004 Snowbound
- -Two windows in the proposed kitchen will be shortened to match a previously shortened window in the home to allow for countertops no altered windows are visible from the street or the lane.
- -Existing siding and corner boards to be repaired and replaced in kind as needed.
- -Siding and Trim to be painted SW 7004 Snowbound
- -Existing roof structure to remain and repaired as needed Roofing to be replaced with 5V metal to reflect original tin roof noted in the 1937 Cadastral Survey
- -Addition and Carriage House

Addition and Carriage House

- -The homes original addition from the 50s is in extremely poor condition and is to be removed and replaced with a new construction addition.
- -There will be a break in the façade to express the separation between the original home and the new addition.
- -Windows will be casement windows sized to reflect the original windows of the home.
- -Windows to be Aluminum Clad, Color Bronze
- -Window Trim to be painted SW 6236 Grays Harbor
- -Siding to be Hardie Artisan Shiplap siding with a 9" exposure which will be double the scale of the original home's siding.
- -Siding to be painted SW 6235 Foggy Day
- -The roof of the addition and Carriage house will be a low slope TPO roof with a parapet.
- -An adjustment is requested for the Carriage House stair, which extends 1' into the side setback and will be fire rated.

This petition was initially heard on February 22nd, 2023. At the meeting, the Historic Preservation Commission voted to <u>continue</u> the petition to address the following conditions:

- 1. Revise the height of the accessory dwelling unit to be subordinate to the addition and principal building, as well as visually compatible in height with the surrounding lane context.
- 2. Revise the height of the new addition, so that it is subordinate in height to the principal building.
- 3. Provide a dimension for the height of the railing on the rear stair and ensure it meets the standard.
- 4. Provide a dimension for the width of the garage door opening.
- 5. Revise the proposed fence to conform to the standard which states that five (5) feet must be provided between a fence and building wall where they are parallel.

The conditions have been addressed with the following revisions:

1. The height of the accessory dwelling unit has been reduced from 22 feet and 3

inches to 21 feet, from the top of the parapet.

- 2. The height of the addition has been reduced from 22 feet to 21 feet and 6 inches.
- 3. The height of the railing on the rear porch stair has been dimensioned at 36 inches.
- 4. The width of the garage door has been dimensioned at 9 feet.
- 5. The new fence has been removed. The petitioner is proposing to utilize the existing fence on the property.

The historic building was constructed in 1913 and is a contributing resource within the Victorian Local Historic District. The 1916-1953 Sanborn Map shows the principal building's historic footprint, before the construction of the non-historic addition. There is a wood-frame auto structure on the rear of the property, abutting the lane. Several adjacent properties are shown to have wood-frame outbuildings, most of which are now no longer existing. The 1955-1966 Sanborn Map shows little change on the property itself, though two adjacent outbuildings to the west are shown as being demolished between 1953-1966. The surrounding lane context is primarily new construction and non-contributing resources. There is a row of adjacent garages on the other side of the lane which are all new construction. There is one contributing lane resource at 524-528 East Gwinnett Lane. The visibility of the rear of the property is also obscured by adjacent foliage. The context on East Bolton Street is primarily contributing, with most principal buildings being two-story American Foursquare residences. There are also examples of non-contributing modern construction, such as 522 East Bolton Street and 525 East Bolton Street.

Staff recommended to approve rehabilitation, additions, and new construction, small (parts I and II) at 538 East Bolton Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Ellen Harris, petitioner, made herself available for questions; none were presented.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board expressed appreciation of the petitioner's compliance with Board concerns/conditions.

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve rehabilitation, additions, and new construction, small (parts I and II) at 538 East Bolton Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

**Ms. Miller voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams Second: Virginia Mobley

Rebecca Fenwick - Abstain
Virginia Mobley - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye

Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present
Kiersten Connor - Abstain
Kathy S. Ledvina - Abstain
Brian Arcudi - Not Present

CUYLER-BROWNVILLE DISTRICT

12. Petition of City of Savannah, Code Compliance Officer Danielle Jones | 23-000853-COA | 515 West 37th Street | Contributing Demolition

- Submittal Packet 515 West 37th St.pdf
- @Staff Research 515 W 37.pdf
- Staff Report 23-000853-COA 515 W 37th.pdf
- MPC Documentation Policy.pdf

Mr. Ethan Hageman presented the petitioner's request for approval to demolish a contributing building located at 515 West 37th Street. The demolition is court-ordered.

The historic building was constructed in 1913 and is a contributing resource within the Cuyler-Brownville Historic District. The 1994 Survey Card indicates that the building was constructed for Mrs. C. A. Graham (based on census records, likely Catherine A. Graham) in 1913. The building was altered at some point after its construction with the installation of asbestos shingles. The 1916-1953 Sanborn Map and the 1955-1966 Sanborn Map show that there was a wood, rear-yard lane structure that is no longer present. This lane structure is notated as an auto structure, likely a garage.

Per the petitioner:

"On the morning of February 14th, Code Compliance received report of fire at the property. Upon responding to the area found that the interior of the structure was completely burnt and the roof structure at risk of collapse. City of Savannah Building Official Mike Rose conducted a Building Observation Report in which he stated "Vacant 1 story wood frame single family residence, interior structure fire caused extensive interior damage and wall collapse, exterior wall collapse, extensive damage to roof/rafter system in danger of collapse. Property is open and unsecured, caused damage to neighboring property at 513 West 37th Street as well. Recommend demolition." Due to this recommendation and the ongoing case on the property, Code Compliance had the case scheduled to appear in Recorders Court on February 15th, 2023. At this hearing, Ms. Blackwell [heir of the property] consented to allowing the City of Savannah [to] complete the demolition because of financial constraints. Judge William Broker signed the Demolition Order at that time."

Staff recommended to approve to demolish a contributing building located at 515 West 37th Street with the following condition because the demolition is court ordered:

1. Document the building per the MPC's documentation policy (see attached).

Mr. Williams asked if the porch columns can be salvaged. **Ms. Connor** stated she is not sure if that request can be required. **Mr. Hageman** stated he is not certain if that condition can be mandated. **Ms. Fenwick** explained the Sub-Committee's deconstruction progress, reminding there are contracts in place that must be honored.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Danielle Jones, Code Compliance Officer, stated deconstruction is done by the contractor and that process, along with preserving of the materials.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

There were no public comments.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Miller asked if a recommendation can be made for salvage. **Mr. Williams** responded nothing binding can be stated.

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the request to demolish a contributing building located at 515 West 37th Street with the following conditions, because the demolition is court ordered:

- 1.Document the building per the MPC's documentation policy (see attached).
- 2. Suggest the demolition contractor look into salvaging as much historical material as possible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Virginia Mobley Second: Kiersten Connor

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Abstain
Brian Arcudi - Not Present

STREETCAR DISTRICT

- 13. Petition of Juan Allen Eady | 22-005445-COA | 503 East 34th Street | Rehabilitation and Alterations
 - Staff Research 503 East 34th Street.pdf
 - Staff Report 22-005445-COA 503 E 34th St.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 503 East 34th Street.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request of approval for rehabilitation and alterations to the property at 503 East 34th Street. Specifically, they are proposing to perform in-kind replacement of siding and roof shingles and replace the existing windows with VictorBilt Historic Series, wood double-hung windows with true divided lights. They are also proposing to add a rear yard porch and replace the existing foundation lattice with wood lattice.

^{**}Ms. Miller voted in favor of the motion.

The historic building was constructed in 1920 and is a contributing resource within the Streetcar Local Historic District. On the 1916-1953 Sanborn Map the building is present on the parcel as a wood building with a full-width porch. In the rear of the property is a wood structure that is demarcated as vacant with the address number 503 ½ East 34th Street. On the 1955-1966 Sanborn Map the structure in the rear has been pasted over with a blank paste-over indicating it was demolished sometime between 1955 and 1966.

The 1996 Survey Card indicates that the building has been altered with asbestos siding. A Streetview image from 2008 shows that there are several related buildings across the street that no longer exist. These buildings have the same front-gable 1½ story configuration with dentil molding. These buildings have Ionian capital columns and metal porch railings. 512 East 34th Street was renovated sometime after 2019, after being covered in a brick veneer and the porch being bricked in. 512 East 34th Street was restored to what was existing in 2008 and is a good example of what 503 East 34th Street may have looked like originally. Most of the buildings across the street no longer exist, as several are new construction which were constructed in the last couple of years.

Staff recommended to approve the request for rehabilitation and alterations to the property at 503 East 34th Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Repair the historic windows on the first floor of the front façade and the historic portion of the west facade instead of replacing them.
- 2. Revise the rear porch posts to have cap and base molding.
- 3. Provide a dimension for the extension of the eaves on the porch roof.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Juan Eady, petitioner, stated the porch dimensions were revised and explained them.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD COMMENTS:

There was no Board discussion.

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the request for rehabilitation and alterations to the property at 503 East 34th Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.Repair the historic windows on the first floor of the front façade and the historic portion of the west facade instead of replacing them.
- 2. Revise the rear porch posts to have cap and base molding.
- 3. Provide a dimension for the extension of the eaves on the porch roof.

**Ms. Miller voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Rebecca Fenwick

Second: Virginia Mobley	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
Jeff Notrica	- Aye
Mae Bowley	- Not Present
Kiersten Connor	- Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Abstain
Brian Arcudi	- Not Present

- 14. Petition of VP2 Design, LLC | 23-000062-COA | 306 East 34th Street | New Construction: Small (Parts I & II)
 - Staff Report 23-000062-COA 306 East 34th Street
 - Submittal Packet- 306 East 34th Street
 - Staff Research

Mr. Ethan Hageman presented the petitioner's request of approval for demolition of a non-contributing building and New Construction: Small (Parts I & II) of a new carriage house (accessory-dwelling-unit) located in the rear of **306 East 34th Street.**

306 East 34th Street is a two-story wood framed; single family house located within the Streetcar Historic District. 306 East 34th Street was built in **1918** and is a contributing resource within the *Thomas Square-Streetcar National Register Historic District* and the local *Streetcar Historic District*. The rear yard of the building is currently used as parking with access from a mid-block lane. The surrounding buildings are primarily residential and two-story in nature. Currently existing in the rear yard is a 280 square foot CMU block shed. The shed features a hipped style roof with asphalt shingles and does not have any significant architectural features.

Staff recommended approval for demolition of a non-contributing building and New Construction: Small (Parts I & II) of a new carriage house (accessory-dwelling-unit) located in the rear of 306 East 34th Street with the following condition, because otherwise the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Revise the railing height to not exceed 36 inches.

Ms. Mobley asked if the property has lane access from 34th Street. **Mr. Hageman** stated the backyard does abut the lane; it is a maintenance lane not used for parking or pedestrian use. **Ms. Mobley** asked if it's a one-way lane, is there enough turn-space for the garage. **Mr. Hageman** stated with a 15-foot lane, it is useable; there are many examples of lanes smaller than 15 feet in Savannah. **Mr. Hageman** stated there is no existing structure on the other side of the lane right now. **Ms. Wilson** stated the parking dimensions are 9 feet by 15 or 18.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Victor Pluznyck, petitioner, stated there is about 18 feet clearance of the garage. He stated he can ask the homeowner if they want to take it back an additional two to three feet.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Jarles, Historic Savannah Foundation, stated their concern was with the roof dormers; prefer a simpler hipped roof because it is so close to the main structure.

Mr. Pluznyck stated the only dormers are over the windows and porch. The rest is hipped to match the existing home.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board stated the carriage house is to be subordinate to the main structure, thus sympathetic to HSF's position.

Motion

Approval for demolition of a non-contributing building and New Construction: Small (Parts I & II) of a new carriage house (accessory-dwelling-unit) located in the rear of 306 East 34th Street with the following condition, because otherwise the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Revise the railing height to not exceed 36 inches.

**Ms. Miller voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams Second: Kiersten Connor

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Abstain
Brian Arcudi - Not Present

- 15. Petition of Savannah Star LLC. | 23-001060-COA | 16 East 37th Street | Alterations & After-the-Fact
 - Staff Report 23-001060-COA 16 East 37th Street
 - Submittal Packet- 16 East 37th Street
 - Staff Research
 - Preservation Brief 1
 - Preservation Brief 6

Mr. Ethan Hageman presented the petitioner's request of approval for the after-the-fact painting of historic bricks and the removal of historic front porch railings at 16 East 37th

^{*}The petitioner was not present.

Street. A letter from the petitioner regarding the brick painting and railing removal is attached to the last page of the submittal packet.

On February 23, 2022, the Savannah Historic Preservation Commission approved the rehabilitation of 16 East 37th Street 22-000477-COA with the following conditions:

- 1.All repairs / replacements shall match the deteriorated feature in design, location, dimension, configuration, texture, materiality, as well as other visual qualities. All window / door repairs shall be made with wood / transparent glass (appropriately).
- 2. All materials must be provided to Staff for all proposed repairs / replacements. Information regarding the roof repair method shall be provided to Staff for review.
- 3. The space between piers may be filled with heavy gauge wood lattice with at least one-half (0.5) inch thick lattice boards, and the infill material shall be recessed a minimum of three inches behind the front edge of the pier so that the piers are. clearly visible and differentiated.
- 4. Only a white light source shall be used.

However, the HPC continued the request for after-the-fact painting of historic bricks and removal of historic front porch railings at 16 East 37th Street to the April 26, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission meeting with the following conditions:

- 1. Rebuild the historic front porch railing to historic configuration while finding a solution to meet the code set forth in IBC 2018.
- 2. Staff work with the petitioner to identify and test the use of paint removal methods that are of the gentlest means possible and to include means that are less gentle if needed. All tests should be in an inconspicuous location and other community partners could be engaged.

TIMELINE:

- -January 25th, 2023- During the Historic Preservation Commission Meeting, Staff was notified by the Board that the petitioner had exceeded the scope of work for 22-000477-COA.
- -January 26th, 2023- Staff made a site visit to the subject property and confirmed the scope of work had been exceeded.
- -January 26th, 2023- Staff contacted the owner of the subject property and code compliance.
- -February 7th, 2023- Staff receive videos from the owner attempting to use the method of power washing to remove paint from the bricks.
- -February 21st, 2023- Staff receives photos of an attempt to rebuild front porch railings. The railings are currently not rebuilt to historic configuration and do not meet the building code.
- -March 1st, 2023- COA application was received from the property owner for After-the-fact changes and alterations to the rear porch.
- -March 17th, 2023- The petitioner tests *Blue Bear, Soy Gel Paint & Urethane Stripper* on a portion of painted bricks. Staff was onsite during the test.

Staff recommended approval for the after-the-fact painting of historic bricks and removal of historic front porch railings at 16 East 37th Street with the following condition, to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because otherwise the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Rebuild the historic front porch railing to historic configuration while finding a solution to meet the building code set forth in IBC 2018.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

The petitioner was not present at the meeting in person nor virtually.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, stated the petitioner should have contacted staff or utilize EnCode for restrictions/allowances. Material change (paint on the brick) power washing is not the answer. Many resources can assist. Would like the historic brick to return.

Ms. Ellie Isaac, Landmark Preservation, stated the project is in violation. There are multiple resources for paint removal and the petitioner's actions were deliberate. Advocates that the paint be removed safely. Requests specific language in the Ordinance of no paint on historic masonry.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Fenwick stated to make a condition to explore other paint removal options by gentlest means possible.

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the request for the addition of a rear staircase to the rear of the contributing multi-family building located at 16 East 37th Street.

AND

Continue the request for after-the-fact painting of historic bricks and removal of historic front porch railings at 16 East 37th Street to the April 26, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission meeting with the following conditions,

- 1.Rebuild the historic front porch railing to historic configuration while finding a solution to meet the code set forth in IBC 2018.
- 2.Staff work with the petitioner to identify and test the use of paint removal methods that are of the gentlest means possible and to include means that are less gentle if needed. All tests should be in an inconspicuous location and other community partners could be engaged.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Rebecca Fenwick Second: Kiersten Connor

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Aye

Robin Williams - Not Present

Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Abstain
Brian Arcudi - Not Present

^{**} Ms. Miller voted in favor of the motion.

16. Petition of SHEDDArchitecture | 22-003081-COA | 317-323 East 32nd Street | New Construction Parts I and II

- Staff Report 22-003081-COA 317-323 E 32nd St.pdf
- Submittal Packet Drawings 317-323 E 32nd St.pdf
- Previous Submittal Packet 317-323 E 32nd St.pdf
- Public Comment.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request for approval for New Construction Part I and Part II for a new, three-story, mixed used building for the property located at 317 – 323 East 32nd Street. The lots located at 317 through 323 East 32nd Street, within the Thomas Square-Streetcar National Register Historic District and the local Streetcar Historic District, are currently vacant and do not contain a historic or non-historic building.

PROJECT HISTORY:

On July 27, 2022, the HPC voted to <u>continue</u> the project <u>with the following conditions</u> to be submitted for review with the Part II, Design Details submission *(comments in italics)*:

- 1. Decrease the height of the first floor from 20-feet, to be more in scale with the surrounding buildings.
- 2. Revise the Habersham Street façade in its entirety to read as the front façade.
- 3. Decrease the amount of fenestration on the first floor.
- 4. Provide clarification regarding the projecting element on the southern elevation.
- 5. Revise the butterfly roof shape to be a more compatible roof shape.
- 6. Reduce the height of the fence on the East 32nd Street façade.
- 7. Unify the materiality of the building and remove the stucco.
- 8. Provide the refuse storage location with the Part II, Design Details submission.

Most recently, at the February 22, 2023, HPC meeting, the Commission voted to <u>continue</u> Parts I and II <u>with the following conditions</u> (comments in italics):

1. Provide window details indicating that window simulated divided lite muntins are 7/8" wide or less and simulate traditional putty glazing, and that there is a space bar.

The specifications have been bubbled to meet these standards.

2. Revise the storefront base to wood, bronze, glazed brick or tile to meet the standard.

A storefront base is no longer proposed. The precast sill has been removed and the aluminum storefront framing sits directly on grade.

3. Provide a railing detail; balusters shall be placed between upper and lower rails, and the distances between balusters shall not exceed four (4) inches on center.

The railing has been redesigned as to no longer need this standard.

4. Provide light fixture specifications.

Specifications have been provided.

5. Provide a fence detail including material.

A specification, with more details, has been provided.

6. Incorporate transparent features (windows and doors) over a minimum of 50% of all ground floor façades.

This is now incorporated.

7. The upper two floors on the south façade shall have fenestration that is more harmonious with the fenestration on the east and north upper two floors.

Fenestration has been added to both floors.

8. The transoms over the doors on the north façade shall be full width and in harmony with the other transoms on the building.

The transoms are now full width and are designed to look like other transoms.

In addition to the enumerated conditions, staff found that the Habersham Street façade has been redesigned. The entrance has been moved off-center, towards the lane, with an awning wrapping the corner into the lane. This portion of the building is also accentuated vertically with board & batten and first floor banding with a contrasting design to the banding on the brick portions of the building. The drawings indicate that the banding provides a location for future signage. Lastly, the access structure above the cornice line has been removed from the project.

Staff recommended approval for New Construction Part I and Part II for a new, three-story, mixed used building for the property located at 317 – 323 East 32nd Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Storefront glazing must be inset 4 inches from the face of the building. The awnings must have 8 feet of clearance above the public right-of-way. The shed roof structure must have a pitch between 2:12 and 6:12. Provide the electrical meter(s) location which shall be located on the secondary or rear façade. Provide the HVAC location(s) and screen from view of the street. Revise the fence material to extruded aluminum to meet the standard.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Shedrick Coleman, petitioner, stated they are in agreement with all of staff recommendations. The canopy comes out three feet, to the material change.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, concerns with vertical batten; the material is not compatible in this district. **Mr. Coleman** responded that the metal board batten was to have a maintenance-free material.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board agreed the design was greatly improved. **Ms. Connor** asked about the metal siding. **Ms. Ledvina** stated it is to mimic wood. **Mr. Coleman** stated it is to look like board and batten siding.

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve New Construction Part I and Part II for a new, three-story, mixed used building for the property located at 317 – 323 East 32nd Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Storefront glazing must be inset 4 inches from the face of the building.
- 2. The awnings must have 8 feet of clearance above the public right-of-way.
- 3. The shed roof structure must have a pitch between 2:12 and 6:12.
- 4.Provide the electrical meter(s) location which shall be located on the secondary or rear façade.
- 5. Provide the HVAC location(s) and screen from view of the street.
- 6. Revise the fence material to extruded aluminum to meet the standard.

** Ms. Miller seconded and voted in favor of the motion.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Darren Bagley-Heath

Second:

Rebecca Fenwick - Aye
Virginia Mobley - Aye

Robin Williams - Not Present

Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Abstain
Brian Arcudi - Not Present

17. Petition of Ward Architecture + Preservation | 23-001011-COA | 202 East 38th Street | Variance Recommendation Request

- Staff Report 23-001011-COA 202 E 38th St.pdf
- Previous Board Decision 22-003645-COA 202 E 38th St.pdf
- Previous stamped permit drawings.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request of approval for a variance recommendation request to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a rear yard setback variance for the property located at 202 East 38th Street. The setback variance seeks to reduce the required rear yard setback from 20 feet to 5 feet (Sec. 5.12.5, Development Standards for Permitted Uses) to allow a two-story carriage house to be constructed with the same design as was previously approved by the Historic Preservation Commission (File No. 22-003645-COA). It was unclear at the time of the Certificate of Appropriateness review that this variance would be necessary.

Per the applicant:

IN OUR INITIAL DESIGN AND PROGRAMMING PHASE WE USED ZONING SECTION 5.12.5 FOOTNOTE

2, WHICH SAYS, "FOR BUILDINGS ORIENTED TO NORTH-SOUTH STREETS, THE MINIMUM REAR YARD

SETBACK MAY BE REDUCED TO FIVE (5) FEET." WE UNDERSTOOD 'BUILDINGS' TO BE THE NEW

CARRIAGE HOUSE, AND THUS THOUGHT WE COULD REDUCE THE REAR SETBACK FROM 20' TO

5'. HOWEVER, THE CITY'S PLANS EXAMINER REFERRED US TO SECTION 8.7.4.A.II WHICH SAYS, "AN

ATTACHED ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT SHALL MEET THE SETBACK STANDARDS FOR THE

PRINCIPAL DWELLING." BECAUSE THE PRINCIPAL DWELLING FACES AN EAST-WEST STREET ITS

REAR YARD SETBACK IS 20'. WE WERE NOT AWARE OF THIS RULE DURING THE

DESIGN AND

PROGRAMMING PHASE, OR THE INITIAL COA PROCESS, OTHERWISE WE COULD HAVE ADDRESSED IT THEN.

THIS VARIANCE WILL HELP PRESERVE THE HISTORIC BUILDING PATTERN IN THIS NEIGHBORHOOD.

HISTORICALLY, THREE PROPERTIES AT THIS INTERSECTION HAD ACCESSORY STRUCTURES IN THE

REAR YARD WHICH FACED ABERCORN STREET, WHILE THE PRIMARY DWELLING FACED EAST 38TH

STREET. SEVERAL PROPERTIES TO THE SOUTH STILL RETAIN THIS CONFIGURATION.

FURTHERMORE, HISTORICALLY THERE WAS A 2-STORY WOOD FRAMED CARRIAGE HOUSE AT THIS

EXACT LOCATION ON THIS PROPERTY (OR POSSIBLY EVEN CLOSER TO THE REAR PROPERTY LINE)

FOR WHICH THE CURB CUT STILL EXISTS.

BACKGROUND: OUR PREVIOUSLY APPROVED SUBMITTAL TO THE HPC ILLUSTRATED THAT THE

CARRIAGE HOUSE AND MAIN HOUSE WOULD SHARE A COVERED WALKWAY, WHICH ALLOWS THE

CARRIAGE HOUSE TO BE WITHIN 10' OF THE MAIN HOUSE (ZONING SECTION 8.7.4.A.II). WITHOUT

USING THIS ACCOMMODATION, THE NEW CARRIAGE HOUSE COULD ONLY BE 7' WIDE GIVEN THE

10' BUILDING SEPARATION AND THE 5' REAR YARD SETBACK.

The HPC approved this project on August 24, 2022 with conditions that were met when staff stamped the permit drawings.

- 1. Move the two-story carriage house back from the west property line to have a 3-foot side-yard setback.
- 2. Add a note to the drawings that the fiber cement siding is to have a smooth finish.
- 3. The seam height and panel width of the standing seam metal roof are to match that of the contributing building's roof.

The drawings provided in the submittal packet reflect the conditions of the approval. Therefore, the design of the building has already been approved; nothing has changed with this request. No visual compatibility or design standards are, therefore, addressed; only the variance criteria apply.

A neighbor objected to the project.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Josh Ward, petitioner, stated the neighbor is concerned about views from her second story apartment. They have accommodated by pushing the building back. The variance will allow an appropriate use of the property; there is precedence of accessory structures facing the north.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Mobley stated there is no other carriage house on the block. There are two garage

pads, but none for the carriage house. It should be moved further back from the property line an additional two feet. **Ms. Michalak** stated it cannot be moved, there is nowhere to move it to.

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve a variance recommendation request to the Zoning Board of Appeals to reduce the rear yard setback from 20 feet to 5 feet (Sec. 5.12.5, Development Standards for Permitted Uses) for the property located at 202 East 38th Street as requested because the variance criteria are met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kiersten Connor

Second:

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present

Virginia Mobley - Nay

Robin Williams - Not Present

Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Not Present

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Abstain
Brian Arcudi - Not Present

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

- 18. Acknowledgement of Staff-approved petitions.
- 19. Petition of Hunter Dunlap | 23-000542-COA | 219 West 33rd Street | After-the-Fact baluster installation with condition
 - SIGNED Staff Decision -23-000542-COA 219 W 37th St.pdf
- 20. Petition of Ethos Preservation | 23-000655-COA | 217 West Anderson Street | Amend 22-003184-COA to add dentil moulding around the eaves
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-000655-COA 217 W Anderson St.pdf
- 21. Petition of Design House | 23-000433-COA | 2514 Abercorn Street | Installation of seven window signs
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-000433-COA 2514 Abercorn 110.pdf
- 22. Petition of Roofcrafters | 23-000779-COA | 18 Brady Street | Install new roof with condition
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-000779-COA 18 Brady St.pdf
- 23. Petition of Southeast Roofing Solutions | 23-000849-COA | 1302 Drayton Street | Install new TPO system, coping, gutter, downspouts, drip edge, and slip flashing to the flat roof
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 23-000849-COA 1302 Drayton St.pdf
- 24. Petition of DeGrey-Jones | 23-000948-COA | 209 East Park Avenue | Sash replacement of 12 windows on

^{**} Ms. Miller seconded and voted in favor of the motion.

west elevation

SIGNED Decision 23-000948-COA 209 E Park Ave.pdf

XI. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 25. Items Deferred to Staff March 22nd Report
 - ltems Deferred to Staff March Report.pdf
- 26. Stamped Drawings March 22nd Report
 - Stamped Drawings March 2023.pdf
- 27. Inspections Completed by Staff March 22nd Report
- 28. Report on Work Done Which Exceeds the Scope of an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the March 22nd, 2023, HPC Meeting
 - @Report on Work Which Exceeds the Scope of an Issued COA HPC March 2023.pdf
- 29. Report on Work Done Without a Certificate of Appropriateness for the March 22, 2023, HPC Meeting
 - Report on Work Done Without a COA HPC March 22.pdf
- 30. Report on Work Done Which Is Inconsistent with an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the March 22nd, 2023 HPC Meeting
 - Report on Work Inconsistent with an Issued COA HPC March 22.pdf

XII. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

- 31. Next Pre-Meeting: Wednesday, April 26, 2023 at 2:30 PM 112 East State Street: Mendonsa Hearing Room
- 32. Next Regular Meeting: Wednesday, April 26, 2023 at 3:00 PM 112 East State Street: Mendonsa Hearing Room
- 33. Adjourn

There being no further business to present before the Commission, the March 22, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission meeting adjourned at 6:11 p.m.

Respectfully,

Leah G. Michalak Director of Historic Preservation

/bm

Motion

Adjourn

Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion: Kiersten Connor

Second:

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street
March 22 2023 3:00 PM
MINUTES

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.