

# **Historic Preservation Commission**

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street January 25, 2023 2:00 PM MINUTES

# January 25, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

A Pre-meeting was held at 1:30pm. Items on the agenda were presented by staff, as time permitted, and the Commission asked questions. No testimony was received, and no votes were taken.

**Members Present**: Virginia Mobley, Chair

Darren Bagley-Heath

Mae Bowley Kiersten Connor Kathy Ledvina Jeff Notrica Robin Williams

Members Absent: Rebecca Fenwick

Staff Present: Melanie Wilson, Executive Director

Leah Michalak, Historic Preservation Director Caitlin Chamberlain, Senior Historic Planner

Ethan Hageman, Assistant Planner Jamie Zerillo, Assistant Planner Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant

Julie Yawn, Systems Analyst

- I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME
- **II. SIGN POSTING**
- **III. CONSENT AGENDA**

#### **VICTORIAN DISTRICT**

1. Petition of PIP Group- Lena Sells | 22-005570-COA | 105-107 East Gwinnett Street | Rehabilitation and Alterations

#### **Motion**

The Historic Preservation Commission approved the petition for removal of asbestos siding and restoration of wood siding for the property located at 105 East Gwinnett Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and

meets the standards.

- 1. Provide staff with a conditions report of the wood siding prior to starting restoration work;
- 2. Test a sample of the siding for asbestos and utilize an asbestos abatement company for the safe removal of the shingles in accordance with OSHA asbestos standards.

#### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams
Second: Kathy S. Ledvina

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

2. Petition of Proper Construction | 22-005697-COA | 311 East Park Avenue | New Construction, Small (Parts I & II)

#### **Motion**

The Historic Preservation Commission approved New Construction, Small (Parts I & II) of a carriage house in the rear of the property located at 311 East Park Avenue as requested, because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams Second: Kathy S. Ledvina

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present

Virginia Mobley - Abstain

Robin Williams - Aye

Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

#### **CUYLER-BROWNVILLE DISTRICT**

# 3. Petition of Susie Bull- Ward Architecture + Preservation | 22-005694-COA | 606 West 42th Street | Rehabilitation

#### **Motion**

The Historic Preservation Commission approved rehabilitations to the single-family building located at 606 West 42nd Street with the following condition, because otherwise the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Utilize an asbestos abatement company for the safe removal of the shingles in accordance with OSHA asbestos standards.

#### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams Second: Kathy S. Ledvina

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

# 4. Petition of Susie Bull- Ward Architecture + Preservation | 22-005695-COA | 634 West 42nd Street | Rehabilitation

#### **Motion**

The Historic Preservation Commission approved the request for rehabilitation work to the single-family house located at 634 West 42nd Street as requested, because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

#### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams Second: Kathy S. Ledvina

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye

Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

#### STREETCAR DISTRICT

#### 5. Petition of Boyce's Handyman Services | 22-004612-COA | 528 East 37th Street | Addition

#### **Motion**

The Historic Preservation Commission approved for the request of an addition to the accessory dwelling unit located at 528 East 37th Street as requested, because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

#### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams
Second: Virginia Mobley

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present

Virginia Mobley - Abstain

Robin Williams - Aye

Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Aye

Kiersten Connor - Aye

Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

# 6. Petition of VP2 Design, LLC. | 22-005865-COA | 301 West 40th Street | Alterations

#### **Motion**

Mae Bowley

The Historic Preservation Commission approved for alterations to create new openings for windows on the first floor of the carriage house located in the rear of 301 West 40th Street with the following condition, because otherwise the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

- Not Present

Revise Window B on the lane elevation to be taller than it is wide.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams Second: Kathy S. Ledvina

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present

Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

#### IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

# 7. Adopt the January 25, 3023 Agenda

#### **Motion**

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to adopt the January 25, 2023 HPC agenda as presented.

# Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Darren Bagley-Heath Second: Kiersten Connor

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

#### V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

# 8. Approve November 21, 2022 HPC Meeting Minutes

#### **Motion**

The Historic Preservation Commission approved the November 21, 2022 HPC Meeting Minutes as presented.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams Second: Kathy S. Ledvina

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present

Virginia Mobley - Abstain

Robin Williams - Aye

Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

# VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

#### **VII. CONTINUED AGENDA**

9. Petition of GM Shay Architects | 22-005068-COA | 916 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. | New Construction (Large) Part I and Special Exception Request

 4.	
otion	

Continue

### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kiersten Connor Second: Jeff Notrica

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

10. Petition of J. Elder Studio | 22-004597-COA | 414 West 42nd Street | Demolition of Non-Contributing Buildings and New Construction, Small (Parts I and II)

#### **Motion**

Continue.

#### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kiersten Connor Second: Jeff Notrica

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye
Brian Arcudi - Not Present

# 11. Petition of Heather Halverson | 22-000966-COA | 671-673 West 34th Street | After-the-Fact Rehabilitation and Alterations

# **Motion**

Continue.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kiersten Connor Second: Jeff Notrica

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

#### 12. Petition of Michelle L. Wilmore | 22-004598-COA | 905 West 38th Street | Rehabilitation/Alterations

# **Motion**

Continue.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kiersten Connor Second: Jeff Notrica

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

# 13. Petition of VP2 Design, LLC. | 23-000062-COA | 306 East 34th Street | New Construction: Small (Parts I & II)

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street
January 25, 2023 2:00 PM

Motion	MINUTES
Continue.	
Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Kiersten Connor	
Second: Jeff Notrica	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Not Present
Virginia Mobley	- Abstain
Robin Williams	- Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
Jeff Notrica	- Aye
Mae Bowley	- Not Present
Kiersten Connor	- Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Aye
Brian Arcudi	- Not Present

# 14. Petition of Empwr Solar, Jesse Adams | 22-005833-COA | 511 East Anderson Street | Solar Panels and Variance Request

Motion		
Continue.		
Vote Results ( Approved )		
Motion: Kiersten Connor		
Second: Jeff Notrica		
Rebecca Fenwick	- Not Present	
Virginia Mobley	- Abstain	
Robin Williams	- Aye	
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye	
Jeff Notrica	- Aye	
Mae Bowley	- Not Present	
Kiersten Connor	- Aye	
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Aye	
Brian Arcudi	- Not Present	

# 15. Petition of Empwr Solar, Jesse Adams | 22-005824-COA | 308 East 41st Street | Solar Panels and Variance Request

Motion	
Continue.	
Vote Results ( Approved )	

# Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street January 25, 2023 2:00 PM

MINUTES

Motion: Kiersten Connor

Second: Jeff Notrica

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

# 16. Petition of ADT Solar, Amanda Cude | 22-005850-COA | 604 West 31st Street | Solar Panels

#### **Motion**

Continue.

# Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Kiersten Connor Second: Jeff Notrica

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

# 17. Petition of Juan Allen Eady | 22-005445-COA | 503 East 34th Street | Rehabilitation and Alterations

#### **Motion**

Continue.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kiersten Connor Second: Jeff Notrica

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

#### **VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION**

#### IX. REGULAR AGENDA

#### **CUYLER-BROWNVILLE DISTRICT**

18. Petition of PIP Group- Lena Sells | 22-005696-COA | 724 West Victory Drive | Rehabilitation and Alterations

**Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain** presented the petitioner's request to rehabilitate the building at 724 West Victory Drive. They would like to repair or replace the windows, replace the roof, and repair or replace in-kind the wood lap siding, some of which has been severely damaged by fire. 724 West Victory Drive was built in 1930 and is a contributing resource within the National Register Cuyler-Brownville Historic District and the local Cuyler-Brownville Historic District. It is situated directly next to 726 West Victory Drive, which suffered severe fire damage in January 2022, and was subsequently demolished. The west elevation of 724 West Victory Drive is directly next to 726 West Victory Drive was also irreparably damaged by the fire. This house is currently condemned.

The earliest Sanborn Map that shows this property is from 1953 and shows that at the rear, there was a section of the building on the northwest corner that extended out further than the rest of the elevation. This is also the case on the 1955-1966 Sanborn map. It is not clear when the house was changed but this is no longer evident. A one-story wood framed porch existed on the front of the house and on the northeast portion of the rear there was a two-story wood framed porch, neither of which remains. The one-story garage to the rear of the property line also no longer exists.

Staff recommended approval for rehabilitation and alterations to the house at 724 West Victory Drive with the following conditions because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Ensure that exterior alterations do not destroy character defining historic materials.
- 2. Submit a door schedule to staff for review prior to the start of the project.
- 3. Provide information to staff about the state of the boarded up windows and whether they will be repaired or replaced prior to the start of the project.
- 4. Provide staff with information about access to the rear door prior to the start of the project.
- 5. Provide staff with information about the plan for the foundation prior to starting the project.

### **PETITIONER COMMENTS:**

The petitioner was not present.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

There were no public comments.

# **BOARD COMMENTS:**

Mr. Bagley-Heath stated he agrees with the Staff recommendation and should be continued, as so much information is missing. Ms. Connor agrees but does not think it needs to return to the Commission. Ms. Mobley stated she lacks confidence in the petitioner to perform properly. Mr. Williams stated it should be amended and that it is explicit that the petitioner work with Staff, and does not need to return before the Commission. Ms. Ledvina agreed with that. The windows need to be approved by Staff - all of the windows, not just the boarded windows. Ms. Connor stated that due to the comments of the other Board members, she does agree it should return to the Commission. Mr. Bagley-Heath stated the petitioner does much work in the area and would like clarity.

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby continue the proposed rehabilitation and alterations at 724 West Victory Drive, so that the applicant may directly address staff conditions 1, 2, 4 and 5 and modify condition 3 to include the state of all windows on the property, within ninety (90) days of this decision. The conditions are as follows:

- 1. Ensure that exterior alterations do not destroy character defining historic materials.
- 2. Submit a door schedule to staff for review and approval prior to the start of the project.
- 3. Provide information to staff for review and approval regarding the state of all windows on the property and whether they will be repaired or replaced, prior to the start of the project.
- 4.Provide staff with information about access to the rear door for review and approval prior to the start of the project.
- 5. Provide staff with information about the plan for the foundation for review and approval prior to the start of the project.

#### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams
Second: Kiersten Connor

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present

Virginia Mobley - Abstain

Robin Williams - Aye

Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye

Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

# 19. Petition of PIP Group- Lena Sells | 22-005714-COA | 726 West Victory Drive | New Construction

**Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain** presented the petitioner's request for New Construction, Small Parts I & II on the site of a house that suffered extreme fire damage on January 18, 2022, and was subsequently demolished. The applicant requests rebuilding the property in the

same manner as the original house. The only historic feature of the property that still TES exists is portions of the front porch, which will be retained and incorporated into the new construction.

The proposed rehabilitation of this contributing building was first heard by the Board on **March 24, 2021.** Per the Board Decision from **March 24, 2021** [File No. 21-001217-COA]:

On **June 25, 2019**, the MPC made the decision to <u>continue</u> the petition for demolition of a contributing building in the Cuyler-Brownsville Historic District located at 726 West Victory Drive [File No. 19-002821-COA]. The order for demolition made by the Recorder's Court of Chatham County was ordered in the name of the defendant and property owner Jesus Castillo (Mayor and Alderman of the City of Savannah v. Jesus Castillo). It appeared the City of Savannah had no legal standing to apply for the demolition based on this court order because the defendant named on the legal document is the property owner Jesus Castillo. The court ordered demolition did not vest ownership of the property to the City of Savannah. The applicant (The City of Savannah) was told to go to The Recorder's Court of Chatham County to retain a new order either vesting ownership of the property to the City of Savannah or go through the process of having the property deemed as a blighted property and the authority be given to the City for its demolition.

On **May 14, 2020**, Staff was provided a document via Lester B. Johnson, III, Assistant City Attorney explaining the legal standing of the City of Savannah allowing for heirs of a deceased property owner to act as personal representatives (executors) of a property in cases of demolition.

On **June 30, 2020**, the Board made the decision to <u>continue</u> the petition to demolish the building located at 726 West Victory Drive to the September 23, 2020, Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting to allow for the building to be included at the September 8, 2020, Tax Sale. Staff was contacted by Historic Savannah Foundation on August 26, 2020, and were informed that the September Tax Sale was rescheduled for November 3, 2020 due to the ongoing global Covid-19 pandemic.

On **September 23, 2020**, the Board made the decision to continue the petition to demolish the building located at 726 West Victory Drive to the December 21, 2020, Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting to allow for the building to be included at the November 3, 2020, Tax Sale.

On **November 3, 2020**, the property was included within the Judicial In Rem Tax Foreclosure Sale and was purchased by a private citizen. The property is now in new ownership. Staff has spoken to the new owner, and she intends to rehabilitate the property.

On **December 21, 2020**, The Board made the Decision to deny the petition to demolish the building located at 726 West Victory Drive because the property was found to be under new ownership due to its sale during the November 3, 2020, Judicial In Rem Tax Foreclosure Sale, and the new owner intended to rehabilitate, instead of demolishing the contributing building.

On **February 16, 2021**, Staff became aware that the property had been sold once again and that the new owner is now Mark Feldman.

On February 25, 2021, Staff received an application for Rehabilitation of 726 West

Victory Drive.

On **March 24, 2021**, the Board approved the petition for the rehabilitation of 726 West Victory Drive [File No. 21-001217-COA], with the following condition, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Ensure that all work is undertaken utilizing the gentlest means possible.

On **June 23**, **2021**, the ownership of the building changed. The full extent of the work that was undertaken between **March 24**, **2021**, and **June 23**, **2021**, is unclear, but no longer relevant due to the fire and demolition.

On January 18th, 2022, a fire caused extensive damage to the building. On January 21, 2022, Michael Rose with the City of Savannah conducted a building observation and noted on the City's Inspection Worksheet that there was, "Extensive structural damage to majority of property, only portions of the front walls and roof are intact, yet structurally compromised. Remainder has been burned and collapsed. Recommend demolition." On January 21, 2022, Joshua Downs with the City of Savannah's Code Compliance Department informed Staff of the recent events. Officer Downs asked for the petition to be reviewed as a demolition request and remain on the docket for the January 26th HPC Meeting. On January 26, 2022, the HDBR approved the petition for demolition of the contributing building at 726 West Victory Drive [File No. 22-000066-COA] with the following condition because otherwise the standards are met.

1. The front porch must remain in situ, and the new house shall be constructed behind it.

726 West Victory Drive was built in 1925 and was a contributing resource within the National Register Cuyler-Brownville Historic District and the local Cuyler-Brownville Historic District. The property was a representative example of the bungalow-form house built in the southern portion of the Cuyler-Brownville Historic District. The first Sanborn Map that the property appears on is the 1953 update to the 1916 map. It is a largely residential area, which is still the case today. The map shows how the original one-story wood framed structure was set on the property, and included two smaller wood framed one-story structures, one of which was a garage at the rear of the lot. The 1955-1966 map shows no changes to the dwelling, but the two outbuildings were no longer in existence by this time. It is possible that the concrete porch was a later addition, sometime after 1966, as both Sanborn Maps indicate a wooden porch.

Staff recommended approval for New Construction, Small Parts I & II to rebuild the house at 726 West Victory Drive with the following conditions because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

Change the proposed fixed window to a double-hung window to meet the ordinance. Provide staff with a brick sample for review prior to starting the project.

Provide staff with any exterior lighting details for review prior to starting the project.

# **PETITIONER COMMENTS:**

**Mr. Steve Lieberman**, petitioner, stated that matching the transom above the front door will be the same as the original; provided the brick sample. Has not received an answer from client about the outside lighting.

**Mr. Bagley-Heath** stated he agreed with Staff recommendation because it follows the Ordinance regarding new construction.

# **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

There were no public comments.

## **BOARD COMMENTS:**

**Ms. Connor** stated 715 W Victory has fixed window with 1 over 1; similar to applicant's property. Double hung should not be required.

There was discussion of the window originality.

**Mr. Lieberman** stated all the windows were broken out. But the pattern of the window provides guidance as to what was there.

### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve New Construction, Small Parts I & II to rebuild the house at 726 West Victory Drive with the following conditions because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Change the proposed fixed window to a double-hung window to meet the ordinance.
- 2. Provide staff with a brick sample for review prior to starting the project.
- 3. Provide staff with any exterior lighting details for review prior to starting the project.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Darren Bagley-Heath

Second: Robin Williams

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye
Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

20. Petition of Eco Friendly Construction and Consulting | 22-004617-COA | 823 West 39th Street | After-the-fact Rehabilitations, Variance Recommendation Request

**Mr. James Zerillo** presented the petitioner's request of approval for an after-the-fact addition and alterations and a variance recommendation for the property located at 823 West 39th Street.

Partial demolition of this new addition is proposed to reduce the depth and the width. The front door, windows, siding, and porch have been altered as part of the after-the-fact alterations. A rear yard fence has also been constructed. The petitioner is also requesting a recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard regarding rear yard setbacks in **Article 5 - Base Zoning Districts**:

Rear yard 20 (min)

To allow for a rear-yard setback of approximately 6 feet.

This property was initially brought to staff's attention in October of 2021. Correspondence between staff and the contractor was recorded to document the changes undertaken without a COA. A COA was applied for under file number 21-005652-COA and 21-006061-COA but both expired as complete applications were never received. This application was heard prior at the October 26, 2022, HPC meeting wherein the following decision was made by the HPC:

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby <u>continue</u> the afterthe-fact addition and alterations for the property located at 823 West 39th Street <u>with the following conditions</u>:

- 1. The removal of T-111 and replacement with a permitted material.
- 2. Revise the rear addition window to be visually compatible with the other rectangular windows on the block.
- 3. Revise the depth of the addition to be visually compatible with the block face on Moray Street.
- 4. Provide the window specification for the replaced windows and ensure that they are of the same materials and configuration as the historic windows which were replaced.
- 5. Provide the specification for the replaced door and ensure that they are of the same materials and configuration as the historic door which was replaced.
- 6. Provide a door specification for the new door on the rear of the property.
- 7. Provide the materials, dimensions, and before and after photos for the after-the-fact porch alterations.
- 8. Provide the porch materials and specifications for the rear-yard porch and ensuring they meet the standards.
- 9. Provide documentation of the previous roof material prior to alterations.

#### AND

<u>Continue</u> the recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard regarding rear yard setbacks in Article 5 - Base Zoning Districts:

"Traditional Residential Districts - Cuyler-Brownville.

TR- Development Standards for Permitted Uses. Development in any TR-district shall meet the development standards as set forth below.

TR-3.
Building Setbacks (ft).
Rear yard 20 (min)"

To allow for a rear yard setback of approximately 3 feet for the petitioner to provide a dimensioned site plan to show the new rear yard setback.

The applicant has addressed the conditions with the following alterations to the submission:

- 1. T-11 is no longer being utilized.
- 2. Two rectangular windows were added to the rear façade.
- 3. The depth has been revised from the initial submission on both the rear façade and the east and south facades of the addition.
- 4. A window brand was not provided; however, the new proposed windows are to be wood.
- 5. A wood door is proposed, the configuration is based off historic precedence within

the surrounding context.

- 6. The new rear door is a wood door.
- 7. This information has been provided in the submittal packet drawings.
- 8. The new rear porch is to be constructed of wood.
- 9. This information was provided, the previous roof was an asphalt shingle roof.

The historic building was constructed in 1920 and is a contributing resource within the National Register Cuyler-Brownville Historic District and the local Cuyler-Brownville Historic District. The 1955 Sanborn Maps do show an addition on the rear of the property which is integrally connected via a doorway or opening to the main structure. This addition is not the same depth as the existing, new addition. Based on photos prior to the work it is likely this historic addition was demolished or otherwise deteriorated.

Staff recommended approval the after-the-fact addition and alterations for the property located at 823 West 39th Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final approval, because the work otherwise meets the standards and is visually compatible.

- 1. Provide a window brand for all new windows.
- 2. Provide the dimension of the height of the rear-yard fence.
- 3. Revise the front door lite to not include a faux leaded lite design.

# **AND**

Approve the recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard regarding rear yard setbacks in Article 5 - Base Zoning Districts:

TR-3. Building Setbacks (ft). Rear yard 20 (min)"

To allow for a rear yard setback of approximately 6 feet because it meets the criterion. **Ms. Ledvina** asked about the siding.

#### **PETITIONER COMMENTS:**

Mr. Andre Gadson (virtually), answered Board questions during Board discussion.

# **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

There were no public comments.

#### **BOARD COMMENTS:**

Ms. Ledvina asked about balusters on porch being on center. Mr. Zerillo stated they are proposing to be removed. Ms. Mobley asked what it will be replaced with. Mr. Zerillo stated it will remain without railing. Mr. Bagley-Heath concurred that could be done. Ms. Connor asked if original awning screens are staying in place on front facade. Mr. Gadsen stated it was pre-existing; not to be removed. Window built from trash; there will be no brand. Ms. Ledvina asked about porch railing. Mr. Gadsen stated he was made to change the height and they will be replaced per the drawings. The Board stated there are no drawings provided regarding that. Mr. Zerillo stated there is a condition to be added that railing info be provided.

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the after-the-fact addition and alterations for the property located at 823 West 39th Street with the following conditions to be submitted to

staff for final approval, because the work otherwise meets the standards and is visually compatible.

- 1. Provide a window brand for all new windows.
- 2. Provide the dimension of the height of the rear-yard fence.
- 3. Revise the front door lite to not include a faux leaded lite design.
- 4. Provide a dimensioned drawing for the proposed front porch railing, which meets the standards, to be reviewed by staff.

#### AND

Approve the recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard regarding rear yard setbacks in Article 5 - Base Zoning Districts:

TR-3. Building Setbacks (ft). Rear yard 20 (min)

To allow for a rear yard setback of approximately 6 feet because it meets the criterion.

#### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kathy S. Ledvina Second: Robin Williams

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

# 21. Petition of Susie Bull- Ward Architecture + Preservation | 22-005693-COA | 620 West 42nd Street | Rehabilitation

Mr. Ethan Hageman presented the petitioner's request of approval for rehabilitations to the single-family house located at 620 West 42nd Street.

The project description is located below, per the petitioner:

"Exterior modifications include constructing a new front porch and rear kitchen addition and replacing the asphalt shingle roof. All exterior windows will be retained. A new wood paneled door will be installed in the front entry. Windows in the new addition will be clad, 2/2 SDL windows, and a new wood/glass door will be installed in the rear entry. The existing asphalt roof will be removed and replaced with a new asphalt shingle roof. The new front porch will be like the historic porch removed circa 2017 and will include 8" round wood columns supporting a low hipped roof and wood T&G decking. The porch piers will be smooth stucco over CMU. There will also be repairing and/or replacement of damaged wood framing, siding and trim where necessary on the exterior. All exterior wood will be painted."

620 West 42nd Street is a historic one-story wood framed, single-family shotgun house existing on an interior lot. The front porch was in disrepair and removed from the house around 2017 according to the petitioner. The petitioner is seeking to rebuild the front porch to historic context while adding a subordinate rear addition for a bathroom. The 1916 and 1955 Sanborn Maps show a larger building coverage of the lot with a wood-framed, one-story addition in the rear. Additionally, a wood-framed automobile garage existed in the rear yard fronting the lane.

Staff recommended approval for rehabilitations to the single-family house located at 620 West 42nd Street with the following conditions, because otherwise the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Apply for a front yard setback variance (3'-3") at the Savannah Zoning Board of Appeals, because the proposed set back is visually compatible and is built to historic context.
- 2. Apply for a side (interior) yard setback variance (0'-4") at the Savannah Zoning Board of Appeals because the proposed side yard setback is visually compatible and is built to historic context.

**Ms. Mobley** asked if the porches in the area are consistent with petitioner's request. **Mr. Hageman** replied yes.

**Ms. Ledvina** stated she does not understand the door. **Mr. Hageman** deferred to petitioner.

#### **PETITIONER COMMENTS:**

**Mr. Josh Ward** stated the spec door with 3 panels below is what they will use, with light above, similar to the other shotguns on the street.

Mr. Williams asked about pressure-treated steps. Mr. Ward explained the wood stair will be in-kind. The concrete in the area is replaced from wood. Mr. Williams requested the work to be consistent with what is on the street. Mr. Ward stated he will consider that.

**Ms. Connor** stated she understands Mr. Williams concern but does not think it all needs to be all wood.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

**Mr. Ryan Jarles,** HSF, stated the HSF holds an easement on the property and agrees with Mr. Ward: a wooden porch is indicated but not stair type.

#### **BOARD COMMENTS:**

**Ms. Connor** stated the majority of the homes in the area have non-original porches and have newer masonry materials.

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve rehabilitations to the single-family house located at 620 West 42nd Street with the following conditions, because otherwise the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Apply for a front yard setback variance (3'-3") at the Savannah Zoning Board of Appeals, because the proposed set back is visually compatible and is built to historic context.
- 2. Apply for a side (interior) yard setback variance (0'-4") at the Savannah Zoning Board of Appeals because the proposed side yard setback is visually compatible and is built to historic context.

Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Kiersten Connor

Second: Darren Bagley-Heath

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

#### STREETCAR DISTRICT

# 22. Petition of Savannah Stucco | 22-004985-COA | 302 West 32nd Street | After the Fact, Alterations

**Mr. Ethan Hageman** presented the petitioner's request of approval for after-the-fact alterations made to the front porch of the building located at **302 West 32nd Street.** Below are the events of contact with the petitioner:

- -October 1, 2020- Building Permit Approved for front porch repairs.
- -December 7, 2020- Petitioner receives written Certificate of Completion from the City of Savannah.
- -September 22, 2022- Property owner is cited by Code Compliance for not obtaining a COA and Debris in the front yard (original columns).
- -September 29, 2022- Petitioner and staff speak regarding pending citation from Code Compliance for removal of round columns laying in front yard. Porch was altered due to deterioration and collapse of second floor and overhanging roof. The petitioner received a building permit, but never applied for a COA.
- -October 4, 2022- Incomplete COA application is received, staff begins to work with petitioner on complete application. Petitioner is told the porch will most likely need to be rebuilt to historic context instead of what is existing.
- -November 4, 2022- Staff contacts petitioner to obtain dimensions of the existing altered porch.
- -November 14, 2022- Staff continues petitioner to next months meeting due to insufficient information.
- -November 25, 2022- Petitioner submits drawings of altered porch. Several dimensions are still missing.

The historic building was constructed in **1907** and is a contributing resource within the Thomas Square-Streetcar National Register Historic District and the local Streetcar Historic District.

Staff recommended to approve the petition for alterations at 109 West 34th Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street

January 25, 2023 2:00 PM

MINUTES

Provide dimensions for the existing door opening.

Revise the soffits to not be sloping in plane with the porch roof. Staff also recommended to approve the petitioner for a special exception from a section (7.9.10.vii.2.c.i) of the Victorian Historic District Design Standards which states:

On single-family detached, single-family attached, and two-family attached dwellings, a front porch a minimum of six (6) feet in depth shall be required over a minimum of 50% of the front façade.

To allow for a front porch with measures less than six (6) feet in depth, because the request meets the Special Exception criteria.

# **PETITIONER COMMENTS:**

**Mr. Burke Abwui** stated there was discussion was 14 years ago. No one mentioned the porch had to return with columns. Wanted to use treated lumber. The City approved it and he received certificate of occupancy. He stated he later received citing of non-compliance, so he is now asking for forgiveness. No one told them how it should be done or that it was done improperly, and it's now two years later.

**Ms. Wilson** stated that only as consequence, this recommendation does not set precedence of visual compatibility because it's City approved, though not correct.

**Ms. Connor** asked if the columns were removed then cited. **Mr. Hageman** stated the columns on for the porch was found in debris on the property, the petitioner was then cited for not having a COA. The columns were repaired in 2020. Ms. Ledvina asked about the signed permit Mr. Abwui presented all of his signed documentation. He said no plans were provided to inspector; Mr. Heath Lloyd approved after completion. Everything was done with approval and direction from inspectors.

### **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, wanted to offer assistance if the situation is found true.

#### **BOARD COMMENTS:**

Mr. Williams asked if the City would have record of the petitioner's approvals.

Ms.Wilson stated any complaints or issuance from the City, would be recorded.

Mr. Bagley-Heath stated petitioner needs to provide record of City approval of work.

During Board Discussion, the Board acknowledged the existing front porch does not meet the Preservation Standards, Visual Compatibility Standards, and Design Standards; however, acknowledged it is not through any fault of the petitioner that the City issued a building permit and a Certificate of Occupancy. The Board showed hesitancy on not making this approval a precedent.

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the request, although the application for after-the-fact alterations to the front porch of the building located at 302 West 32nd Street are not visually compatible, do not meet the preservation standards, and do not meet the design standards. These after-the-fact alterations will be approved because of the very specific extenuating circumstances that the applicant received a Certificate of Occupancy on December 7, 2020, that was not recorded in the E-Trac system and yet the applicant received a written approval from the city. This approval based on these conditions should not serve as a precedent for subsequent after-the-fact

applications.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams
Second: Kiersten Connor

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

# 23. Petition of CED Architecture and Interiors | 22-004724-COA | 109 West 34th Street | Alterations, Special Exception Request

**Mr. James Zerillo** presented the applicant's request of approval for alterations to the property at 109 West 34th Street and a special exception request. The applicant is seeking a special exception from the section (7.9.10.vii.2.c.i) of the Victorian Historic District Design Standards which states:

On single-family detached, single-family attached, and two-family attached dwellings, a front porch a minimum of six (6) feet in depth shall be required over a minimum of 50% of the front façade.

To allow for a front porch with measures less than six (6) feet in depth.

For alterations, the applicant is proposing to add a front porch to the existing building. The new porch is proposed to be four (4) feet deep and 28 feet and eight (8) inches wide to align with the width of the existing building. A masonry base is proposed with wood columns. The porch roof is proposed to be a hip roof, constructed of wood and painted to match the house, with a metal roof.

This project was initially heard at the November 21st, 2022, HPC meeting where the applicant was requesting approval for alterations which included metal decorative porch columns, an asphalt shingle roof, and a different porch configuration which featured a continuous base and wider spaced balusters. The applicant was also requesting a recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standards that states:

Side yard (interior): 3 (min)

To allow for the north side yard setback for the new porch to be reduced to zero feet to align with the existing building setback.

At the November 21st meeting the Historic Preservation Commission continued the request for alterations with the following conditions:

- 1. Revise the porch foundation to have expressed piers (instead of a continuous foundation).
- 2. Apply for a Special Exception for the porch depth standard.
- 3. Provide a dimension for the distance between the balusters on the proposed new porch railing and ensure it meets the 4-inch standard.
- 4. Provide a porch roof detail which includes the dimension for the extension of the porch roof eaves and the placement of the soffits and ensure that it meets the standards.
- 5. Provide a window specification of a previously approved window brand or provide a full-size physical sample of a window which meets the standards.
- 6. Provide the material for the proposed door and ensure it meet the standards.
- 7. Provide further detail for the decorative porch iron work.
- 8. Provide dimension for the existing door opening.
- 9. Consider keeping the front door in its existing location.

Conditions 1-9 have been addressed by the petitioner with the following revisions:

- 1. The porch foundation has been revised to include expressed piers
- 2. A Special Exception has been applied for
- 3. The balusters were revised to meet the standard
- 4. A roof detail was provided with the extension of the eaves; however, the soffit is sloping in line with the roof.
- 5. Anderson 400 Series wood windows are proposed
- 6. The existing door is proposed to be used
- 7. The porch has been redesigned to feature wood columns, railings, and balusters.
- 8. A dimension was not provided
- 9. The petitioner has explained through photos and conversations with staff that the doors' current location causes the door to swing into the interior stairs. For this reason, the owner is requesting the petitioner to move the door to the proposed location.

The HPC also approved the request for a recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance to the previously mentioned standard.

The building was constructed in 1920 and is not a contributing resource within the Thomas Square-Streetcar National Register Historic District and the local Streetcar Historic District. The 1916-1953 Sanborn Map shows the structure as a concrete outbuilding, utilized as a dwelling and a garage. The same footprint and use is found on the 1955-1966 Sanborn Map. Physical evidence of a garage door is still visible on the structure today.

# **SPECIAL EXCEPTION REQUEST:**

The following standards from the Sec 3.12 Special Exceptions apply:

# Special Exceptions.

**Review by Historic Preservation Commission.** Special Exceptions (as listed below), not to include buildings within the Savannah Downtown Historic Overlay District, shall be considered by the Historic Preservation Commission.

Applicable Special Exceptions.

To increase the maximum building footprint where the footprint is limited in Article 5 or Secs. 8.1-8.8.

To adjust Preservation and Design Standards for local historic districts as follows:

Secs. 7.8.8, 7.9.8, and 7.11.8 Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation.

Secs. 7.8.10, 7.9.10, and 7.11.10 Design Standards.

The applicant is seeking a special exception from the section (7.9.10.vii.2.c.i) of the Victorian Historic District Design Standards which states:

On single-family detached, single-family attached, and two-family attached dwellings, a front porch a minimum of six (6) feet in depth shall be required over a minimum of 50% of the front façade.

To allow for a front porch which measures less than six (6) feet in depth.

Approve the petition for alterations at 109 West 34th Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Provide dimensions for the existing door opening.
- 2. Revise the soffits to not be sloping in plane with the porch roof.

#### **AND**

Staff recommended to approve the petition for a special exception from a section (7.9.10.vii.2.c.i) of the Victorian Historic District Design Standards which states:

On single-family detached, single-family attached, and two-family attached dwellings, a front porch a minimum of six (6) feet in depth shall be required over a minimum of 50% of the front façade.

To allow for a front porch with measures less than six (6) feet in depth, because the request meets the Special Exception criteria.

#### **PETITIONER COMMENTS:**

**Mr. Daniel Brown** and **Ms. Jennifer Kingsby** stated the front door location hits the stair on interior. As it is not the original door, it is best to infill and relocate as proposed.

**Ms.** Ledvina asked is garage opening recessed or distinguishable. **Mr.** Brown stated it is intended to be placed in block as flat facade; there will be issues if recessed, as the porch is very shallow. Another type of demarcation would be better. **Ms.** Kingsby stated it is currently wood paneling, not even cement block at this time. It contributes to water intrusion. The door traps the upstairs in.

# **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

There were no public comments.

#### **BOARD COMMENTS:**

There were no additional Board comments.

# Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the petition for alterations at 109 West 34th Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street January 25, 2023 2:00 PM MINUTES

- 1. Provide dimensions for the existing door opening.
- 2. Revise the soffits to not be sloping in plane with the porch roof.
- 3. Modifications to the original garage door opening will include a hard mortar joint, fit within the existing frame, to define the edges of the original garage door frame and subsequent doorframe.

#### AND

Approve the petitioner for a special exception from a section (7.9.10.vii.2.c.i) of the Victorian Historic District Design Standards which states:

On single-family detached, single-family attached, and two-family attached dwellings, a front porch a minimum of six (6) feet in depth shall be required over a minimum of 50% of the front façade.

To allow for a front porch with measures less than six (6) feet in depth, because the request meets the Special Exception criteria.

#### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Robin Williams Second: Kathy S. Ledvina

Rebecca Fenwick - Not Present
Virginia Mobley - Abstain
Robin Williams - Aye
Darren Bagley-Heath - Aye
Jeff Notrica - Aye

Mae Bowley - Not Present

Kiersten Connor - Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina - Aye

Brian Arcudi - Not Present

#### X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

24. Acknowledgement of Staff-approved petitions.

#### **Motion**

Acknowledge and approval of Staff-approved petitions.

## Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion:

Second:

- 25. Petition of J. ELDER STUDIO, Jerome Elder | 22-005654-COA | 208 West 37th Street | AMENDMENT: Shutters
- 26. Petition of YOUR EXTERIOR PROS, Jessica Tayeb | 22-005556-COA | 112 E. Duffy Street | Wood rot repair
- 27. Petition of CUSTOMFIT CENTER | 22-005158-COA | 101A West Park Avenue | Window Sign

- 28. Petition of ROOFCRAFTERS | 22-005903-COA | 318 West Park Avenue | In-kind roof repair
- 29. Petition of YOUR EXTERIOR PROS, Jessica Tayeb | 22-005839-COA | 506 East Bolton Street | Front porch step repair, painted or stained
- 30. Petition of MARGIE PRESCOTT | 22-005655-COA | 404 East 36th Street | Window replacement
- 31. Petition of DENZEL SCOTT | 22-005357-COA | 2204 Barnard Street | Metal handrail installation
- 32. Petition of MARY WILLOUGHBY | 22-005652-COA | 1814, 1816 Abercorn Street | Replace chain-link fence with wood board fence
- 33. Petition of SOUTHEAST ROOFING | 22-005653-COA | 532 Indian Street | In-kind roof, gutter, and downspout replacements

#### XI. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 34. Report on Work Done Which Exceeds the Scope of an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the January 25, 2023, HPC Meeting
- 35. Report on Work Done Without a Certificate of Appropriateness for the January 25, 2023, HPC Meeting
- 36. Report on Work Done Which Is Inconsistent with an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the January 25, 2023 HPC Meeting
- 37. Items Deferred to Staff January 25th Report
- 38. Stamped Drawings January 25th Report
- 39. Inspections Completed by Staff January 25th Report

# XII. OTHER BUSINESS

#### **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

40. Nominating Committee - Announce 2023 Chair and Vice-Chair Nominations

The nominating committee, comprised of Ms. Connor, Ms. Ledvina, and Ms. Bowley nomnated the following:

Vice Chair: Mr. Robin Williams Chair: Ms. Kathy Ledvina for 1 year.

#### **XV. ADJOURNMENT**

- 41. Next Pre-Meeting: Wednesday, February 22, 2023 at 2:30 PM- 112 East State Street: Mendonsa Hearing Room
- 42. Next Regular Meeting: Wednesday, February 22, 2023 at 3:00 PM- 112 East State Street: Mendonsa Hearing Room
- 43. Adjourn

There being no further business to present before the Commission, the January 25, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission meeting adjourned at 4:19 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street January 25, 2023 2:00 PM MINUTES

Leah G. Michalak Director of Historic Preservation

/bm

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.