

Historic Preservation Commission

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, 112 East State Street September 27, 2023 3:00 p.m. MINUTES

September 27, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

A Pre-meeting was held at 2:30 pm. Items on the agenda were presented by staff, as time permitted, for the Commission to ask questions. No testimony was received, and no votes were taken.

- Members Present: Kathy Ledvina, Chair Darren Bagley-Heath Kiersten Connor Rebecca Fenwick Kathy Ledvina Pamela Miller Virginia Mobley Jeff Notrica
- Members Absent: Mae Bowley Robin Williams
- Staff Present:Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director
Leah Michalak, Historic Preservation Director
Caitlin Chamberlain, Senior Planner
Bri Morgan, Historic Preservation Administrative Assistant
Hind Patel, IT Assistant

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

CUYLER-BROWNVILLE DISTRICT

- 1. Petition of GM Shay Architects | 23-004700-COA | 1901 Florance Street | Rehabilitation & Alterations
 - Staff Report 23-004700-COA 1901 Florance St.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 1901 Florance St.pdf

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain prepared the applicant's request of approval for rehabilitation of Building E, the non-historic community building and leasing office of the Heritage Place Apartments complex.

The scope of work includes:

-Refurbishment of non-historic windows

- -Relocation and replacement of one non-historic window
- -Replacement of roof shingles
- -Minor refurbishment of site fencing

1901 Florance Street, Building E, was built in 2002 and is a non-contributing resource in the National Register Cuyler-Brownville Historic District and the local Cuyler-Brownville Historic District. It functions as the leasing office and community building for the Heritage Place Apartments.

Staff recommended to approve the proposed rehabilitation work and window relocation for the property located as 1901 Florance Street, Building E, as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the proposed rehabilitation work and window relocation for the property located as 1901 Florance Street, Building E, as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Virginia Mobley	
Second: Kiersten Connor	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Not Present
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
Jeff Notrica	- Aye
Mae Bowley	- Not Present
Kiersten Connor	- Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Abstain
Pamela Miller	- Aye

STREETCAR DISTRICT

2. Petition of Homestead Architecture | 23-004696-COA | 218 West 35th Street | Rehabilitation and New Construction, Small (Parts I & II)

- Submittal Packet 218 West 35th.pdf
- Staff Report 23-004696-COA 218 W 35th St.pdf
- Staff Research 218 W 35th St.pdf

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain prepared the applicant's request of approval for rehabilitation work on the historic house, and the construction of a new accessory dwelling unit for the property located at 218 West 35th Street.

The scope of the rehabilitation work includes:

- -Restore wood porch railing
- -Repair historic wood windows
- -Replace non-historic windows with appropriate windows

-Restore historic front door

- -Repair horizontal wood lap siding or replace in kind where needed
- -Restore brick chimneys and metal flashing
- -Install new architectural asphalt shingles
- -Addition of lattice to all foundation pier openings
- -Install new painted wood water table

218 West 35th Street was built in 1901 and is a contributing resource within the National Register Thomas Square Streetcar Historic District. It is situated between Jefferson and Barnard Streets and is surrounded by a variety of two-story wood frame dwellings of the same time period. The Sanborn Maps of 1916, 1953, and 1955-1966 show no major changes to the main house, except that the rear one-story porch appears to have been enclosed and a second story added at some point after 1966. On the 1953 Sanborn, there is a small side porch represented in the drawing, but it is not seen on the 1955-1966 map. The outbuildings at the rear of the lot changed over time, where in 1916 there was a small, one-story wood frame outbuilding, but by the 1950s it appears that a second structure was added next to that one, both noted as garages, as well as another rectangular wood one-story structure in front of the garages. The Cadastral survey map of 1937 notes a three-car garage on the property. None of these outbuildings remain today.

Staff recommended to approve the request for rehabilitation work on the historic house and New Construction, Small (Parts I & II) for an accessory dwelling unit at the rear of the property located at 218 West 35th Street with the following conditions for staff review and approval prior to starting the work, because the project otherwise is visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Provide information about the stucco type to be used for the foundation infill and the mortar type for the repointing work on the foundation and chimneys.
- 2. Provide information regarding the distance between the fence and the adjacent building on the east side of the north elevation.

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the request for rehabilitation work on the historic house and New Construction, Small (Parts I & II) for an accessory dwelling unit at the rear of the property located at 218 West 35th Street with the following conditions for staff review and approval prior to starting the work, because the project otherwise is visually compatible and meets the standards. 1.Provide information about the stucco type to be used for the foundation infill and the mortar type for the repointing work on the foundation and chimneys.

2.Provide information regarding the distance between the fence and the adjacent building on the east side of the north elevation.

Vote Results (Approved)

Mation Virginia Mahla

Motion: Virginia Mobiey	
Second: Kiersten Connor	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Not Present
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye

Jeff Notrica	- Aye
Mae Bowley	- Not Present
Kiersten Connor	- Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Abstain
Pamela Miller	- Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

3. Adopt the September 27, 2023 Agenda

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to adopt the September 27, 2023 Meeting agenda as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Rebecca Fenwick	
Second: Pamela Miller	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Not Present
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
Jeff Notrica	- Aye
Mae Bowley	- Not Present
Kiersten Connor	- Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Abstain
Pamela Miller	- Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

4. Approve the August 23, 2023 Historic Preservation Meeting Minutes as presented.

@ 08.23.23 MEETING MINUTES.pdf

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission motioned to approve the August 23, 2023 HPC Meeting Minutes as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Virginia Mobley	
Second: Kiersten Connor	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Not Present
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye

Jeff Notrica	- Aye
Mae Bowley	- Not Present
Kiersten Connor	- Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Abstain
Pamela Miller	- Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

5. Petition of BMP Doctor, LLC | 23-002366-COA | 306 West 40th Street | New Construction, Small (Parts I & II)

Motion	
Continue.	
Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Virginia Mobley	
Second: Jeff Notrica	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Not Present
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
Jeff Notrica	- Aye
Mae Bowley	- Not Present
Kiersten Connor	- Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Abstain
Pamela Miller	- Aye

6. Petition of Brown Design Studio | 23-003048-COA | 117 West 42nd Street | New Construction, Small: Parts I and II / Variance Recommendation Request

7. Petition of GM Shay Architects | 23-003509-COA | 916 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. | New Construction, Part II: Design Details

8. Petition of Darren Bagley-Heath | 23-004727-COA | 501 East Waldburg Street | Amendment to New Construction

9. Petition of Amerigo Contini, Savannah Star, LLC | 23-001060-COA | 16 East 37th Street | After-the-Fact Brick Painting

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

VICTORIAN DISTRICT

10. Petition of Ethos Preservation | 23-004692-COA | 103 East Park Lane | New Construction (Small), Special Exception and Variance Recommendation Requests

Staff Report - 23-004692-COA 103 E Park Ln.pdf

Submittal Packet - 103 E Park Ln.pdf

Staff Research - Sanborn Maps.pdf

**Ms. Rebecca Fenwick and Ms. Kiersten Connor recused themselves from this petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the applicant's request of approval for New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) for a two-story single-family residence for the vacant property located at 103 East Park Lane. The applicant is also requesting a Special Exception from the standard that reads:

On single-family detached, single-family attached and two-family attached dwellings, a front porch a minimum of six (6) feet in depth shall be required over a minimum of 50% of the front façade.

To allow for a stoop that is 4 feet deep by 6 feet wide.

The applicant is requesting a Variance Recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals from the standard that reads:

TN-1, Building Setbacks (ft). For blocks with contributing structures. Rear yard: 30 (min).

To allow a 5-foot rear yard setback.

Per the Sanborn Maps, the parcel has been subdivided in its current configuration since sometime between 1898 and 1916; it was likely divided when the one-story duplex that is indicated on the maps was constructed. This one-story duplex was demolished sometime after 1966 and the lot has been vacant since then.

Staff recommended to continue the request for New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) for a two-story single-family residence for the vacant property located at 103 East Park Lane for a maximum of 90 days in order for the petitioner to address the following:

- 1. Increase the rear yard setback to lessen the request variance.
- 2. New construction shall include a private sidewalk that connects the main entrance of the principal structure to the public sidewalk.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Ellen Harris, petitioner, highlighted each request, including for a variance for a 5-foot rear yard setback. The property was subdivided over 100 years ago. The setbacks are different. The rear yard setback request is to accommodate the two-bedroom necessity. The special exception is to allow for a stoop instead of a porch.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Ms. Carmen Curties, area resident, expressed concern with ability to set out trash. She stated the petitioner's structure is on the property line; asked how they will be able to put a ladder up. She also expressed concerns with the variance.

Ms. Harris responded that the water issues will be addressed on City level. The owner has made sure the other property owners to have access for their trash, that's why there is no fence.

COMMISSION COMMENTS:

Mr. Notrica expressed sympathy for existing property owners/neighbors, but likes the project.

Ms. Mobley asked about an easement. Ms. Michalak stated it is not their purview.

Ms. Harris stated they want to be on record that no fence will be built; access to the lane for trash receptacles will remain as is.

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby continue the request for New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) for a two-story single-family residence for the vacant property located at 103 East Park Lane for a maximum of 90 days in order for the petitioner to address the following:

1. Increase the rear yard setback to lessen the requested variance.

2.Redesign the roofline to tie the top of the building to the bottom.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Virginia Mobley	
Second: Pamela Miller	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Abstain
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Not Present
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
Jeff Notrica	- Aye
Mae Bowley	- Not Present
Kiersten Connor	- Abstain
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Abstain
Pamela Miller	- Aye

11. Petition of Array Design | 23-004701-COA | 1319 Jefferson Street | Rehabilitation and New Construction, Small (Parts I & II)

- Staff Report 23-004701-COA 1319 Jefferson St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 1 1319 Jefferson St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 2 1319 Jefferson St.pdf

Petitioner Presentation.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the applicant's request of approval for New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) for a three-story building and for rehabilitation and alterations of the historic building on the parcel for the property located at 1319 Jefferson Street.

Per the applicant:

The cottage at 1319 Jefferson Street was constructed between 1898 - 1916 and is a contributing structure (#304).

Little is known about the history of the cottage, but it appears first on the Sanborn Maps in 1916. At that time the cottage was not part of the current parcel but was adjacent to three dwellings that front the lane. By 1955 and as shown on the map below, the lane dwellings were removed. Also, of note and according to the 2015 -2017 GHR Survey, the cottage was at one time an office for the stables located at an adjacent property. So, the history of the site is multifamily as well as mercantile.

The original form of the cottage has experienced multiple alterations including those made during the period of significance.

Although not immediately adjacent, three-story contributing buildings, similar to the one proposed, do exist in the visually related context. 217-219 West Henry Street is similar in form to the proposed building with a side-gable roof and a two-story front porch.

Staff recommended approval for New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) for a three-story building and for rehabilitation and alterations of the historic building on the parcel for the property located at 1319 Jefferson Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. The minimum building frontage must be 70 percent.
- 2. The horizontal boards between the piers on the existing building must be recessed a minimum of 3 inches behind the front edge of the foundation piers.
- 3. Reselect the window proposed for the existing building from the windows brochure or provide additional information regarding the "Elevate" windows and ensure that it meets the standards.
- 4. Retain the front door on the existing building; if the door cannot be retained, reselect the proposed door to be more visually compatible.
- 5. Electrical meter boxes shall be located on the secondary or rear façades and shall be minimally visible.
- 6. New construction shall include a private sidewalk that connects the main entrance of the principal structure to the public sidewalk.
- 7. The building footprint of the accessory dwelling unit shall be a maximum of 40% of the building footprint of the principal dwelling not to exceed 700 square feet.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Holly Kincannon, petitioner, expressed their desire to rehabilitate the cottage to the 1980's work. They would like to integrate it into the historic district. Ms. Kincannon highlighted the plans to rehabilitate to the Commission in response to Staff's recommendations.

There was discussion about not projecting a false sense of history yet complimenting to the area.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

COMMISSION COMMENTS:

The Commission presented various methods for the applicant to achieve their goal acceptably to the area.

Motion

COMMISSION DECISION:

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby continue the request for New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) for a maximum of 90 days for a three-story building and for rehabilitation and alterations of the historic building on the parcel for the property located at 1319 Jefferson Street with the following conditions:

- 1.Re-examine the overall height.
- 2.Reselect the doors on the new construction.

3. The minimum building frontage must be 70 percent.

4. The horizontal boards between the piers on the existing building must be recessed a minimum of 3 inches behind the front edge of the foundation piers.

5.Reselect the window proposed for the existing building from the windows brochure or provide additional information regarding the "Elevate" windows and ensure that it meets the standards.

6.Retain the front door on the existing building; if the door cannot be retained, reselect the proposed door to be more visually compatible.

7.Electrical meter boxes shall be located on the secondary or rear façades and shall be minimally visible.8.New construction shall include a private sidewalk that connects the main entrance of the principal structure to the public sidewalk.

9. The building footprint of the accessory dwelling unit shall be a maximum of 40% of the building footprint of the principal dwelling not to exceed 700 square feet.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Rebecca Fenwick	
Second: Virginia Mobley	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Not Present
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
Jeff Notrica	- Aye
Mae Bowley	- Not Present
Kiersten Connor	- Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Abstain
Pamela Miller	- Aye

12. Petition of Naser Jaber | 23-004694-COA | 537 1/2 East Anderson Street | After the Fact Addition

- Staff Research 537.5 East Anderson St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 537.5 E Anderson St.pdf

Staff Report - 23-004694-COA 537.5 E. Anderson St.pdf

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the applicant's request of approval for an after-thefact second-story addition to a one-story rear addition on the property located at 537 $\frac{1}{2}$ East Anderson Street.

537 ½ is one half of a duplex constructed in 1904 and is a contributing resource within the National Register Victorian Historic District and the local Victorian Historic District. The house is one of many similar wood-framed houses from the same era within this residential block of East Anderson Street, along with three new construction houses also of similar styles. The first Sanborn Map this structure appears on is in 1916, where a onestory wood frame porch is noted. The 1936 Cadastral survey notes wood siding as the original material and shows that at that time the one-story porch with a shed roof was still intact. The later Sanborn Maps of 1953 and 1955-1966 also show no structural changes to the property. There had also been a nearly identical structure next door (522-535 E. Anderson St.) with the same small additions at the rear but it appears that was demolished several years ago. Both sides of the duplex have had differing non-historic alterations such as metal porch columns and railings at 537 $\frac{1}{2}$, whereas 537 has non-historic wood posts and wood railings. 537 $\frac{1}{2}$, until recently, featured a decorative wood trim along the fascia boards, porch roof, front door and front windows- which was not original to the building. Original front doors and widows also appeared to have been replaced at some point, possibly when the decorative trim was completed.

There was an existing one-story rear addition that is seen in Google Street view photos between 2007 and 2022. The Sanborn Maps from 1916, 1953, and 1955-1966 all show the same small one-story addition at the rear of both addresses and the Cadastral Survey from 1936 shows a one-story shed roof addition on the rear but it is one addition that falls in the center of both addresses. In both cases, the noted one-story additions are recessed inwards, not flush with the outer walls. However, the one-story addition for 537 $\frac{1}{2}$ seen in the Google images is flush with the outer wall of the house and at 537 there is a two-story rear addition now. It appears that the original additions at the rear of both 537 and 537 $\frac{1}{2}$ were no longer in existence or had already been altered before the current second story addition was undertaken.

The applicant has had two previously approved COAs this year, one for replacing nonhistoric aluminum porch columns and railings, rotted siding, and removal of non-historic decorative wood trim [23-001788-COA], and another for windows [23-003190-COA], as the then-existing windows were aluminum replacements of the originals, likely from the 1970s. They had become non-functional. More recently, a citation was issued by Code Compliance due to an addition placed on the rear of the property, which occurred prior to the current owner's purchase of the property.

The applicant provided a following timeline of the project, highlights from which are noted below:

- -Global Investment Traders purchased 537 ½ E. Anderson St. on March 7, 2023
- -*City of Savannah stopped the work* (from the approved COAs) *and placed a hold on an existing permit on or about 8/9/2023.*
- -Follow-ups from the meeting between Naser Jaber (property owner) and Peter Ghilarducci at the City of Savannah (on or around 8/14/23): Determine next steps within the City of Savannah to release permit for final inspections- the city was mainly concerned with the firewall rating and asked for an architect to submit plans that showed where fire ratings are required.Peter asked that we meet with the HPC to review what was needed to clear the property from what the previous owners had done to the rear of the property.The meeting between Global Investment Traders and the HPC [MPC Staff] resulted in the application to obtain a COA for work done by previous owners of the property which included extension of the second floor.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Nasar Jaber, petitioner, asked for the petition to be approved.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

There was no public comment.

COMMISSION COMMENTS:

The Commission stated it is currently incompatible. There was discussion regarding flipped properties by owners that make unapproved alterations and sell without consequence, sets an opportunity for abuse with shell companies. The conditions can be handled on Staff-level.

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the after-the-fact second-story addition at 537 ½ East Anderson Street, with the following conditions, because the second-story addition is not reversible. 1.Provide product information about the second story opening.

2.Consider options to add more fenestration.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Jeff Notrica	
Second: Pamela Miller	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Not Present
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
Jeff Notrica	- Aye
Mae Bowley	- Not Present
Kiersten Connor	- Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Abstain
Pamela Miller	- Aye

STREETCAR DISTRICT

13. Petition of Derst Hardscape Design | 23-004686-COA | 1711 Price Street | Wall and Special Exception Request

- Submittal Packet, Part I 1711 Price Street.pdf
- Submittal Packet, Part 2 1711 Price Street.pdf
- Submittal Packet, Part 3 1711 Price Street.pdf
- Staff Report 23-004686-COA 1711 Price St.pdf

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the applicant's request for approval to construct a wooden living partition wall to cover a small portion of the front façade, and for the installation of an externally illuminated sign for the property located at 1711 Price Street.

The applicant is requesting approval for a Special Exception from the standard that reads:

Fences and Walls

Fences and walls no more than three feet in height may be installed in the front yard.

To allow for the placement of a 7'11" living partition wall covered in bougainvillea vine in front of an area covering less than 15% of the building frontage.

Per the applicant:

1711 Price Street is the new home of Bowen Schmidt, an entertainment law firm. The work of this firm has been instrumental in drawing multi-million dollar film and television productions to Savannah. Our request for an exception arises from the need to not only improve the visual appeal of the building (a non-contributing resource) and the surrounding neighborhood, but also to ensure the privacy, security, and comfort of the crucial meetings that will be taking place in the conference room behind the

proposed wooden wall."

Another portion of the project deals with landscape design, which is not reviewed in the historic overlay, but will provide context to the overall scope of the project. This includes removal of the existing overgrown shrubs and replanting with subtropical plants native to the area, as well as retaining walls as part of the design, which is for aesthetics but also functional to help with drainage.

1711 Price Street was built in 1950 and is a non-contributing resource within the National Register Thomas Square Streetcar Historic District and the local Streetcar Historic District. It most recently functioned as offices for Weichert Realtors prior to the current ownership by the entertainment law firm, Bowen Schmidt.

The initial submittal for this project did not include a living wall element but after discussions with MPC staff to come up with a way that may add more visual compatibility to the project, a solution was to have this become a living wall. The applicant has since revised the drawings to include bougainvillea vine to grow continuously on the wall, save for the portion where a proposed sign for the business will be placed.

Staff recommended to approve the request to install a living wood partition wall and externally illuminated wall sign for the property located at 1711 Price Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to starting the project because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Ensure that the lighting all has a white light source.

AND

<u>Approve</u> the Special Exception request from the standard that reads:

Fences and Walls

Fences and walls no more than three feet in height may be installed in the front yard.

To allow for the placement of a 7'11" living partition wall covered in bougainvillea vine in front of an area covering less than 15% of the building frontage at 1711 Price Street because the Special Exception criteria are met.

There was commission discussion as to whether the living wall is considered a sign.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Boston Derst, petitioner, answered Commision questions regarding the proposed bougainvillea, how the vines will grow. He stated the proposed foliage does well in this area, though deciduous.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

COMMISSION COMMENTS:

There was no Commission discussion.

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the request to install a living wood partition wall and externally illuminated wall sign for the property located at 1711 Price Street with the

following condition to be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to starting the project because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1.Ensure that the lighting all has a white light source.

AND

Approve the Special Exception request from the standard that reads:

Fences and Walls

Fences and walls no more than three feet in height may be installed in the front yard. To allow for the placement of a 7'11" living partition wall covered in bougainvillea vine in front of an area covering less than 15% of the building frontage at 1711 Price Street because the Special Exception criteria are met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Virginia Mobley	
Second: Jeff Notrica	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Not Present
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
Jeff Notrica	- Aye
Mae Bowley	- Not Present
Kiersten Connor	- Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Abstain
Pamela Miller	- Aye

14. Petition of Omega Properties & Investments | 23-004673-COA | 2420 Abercorn Street | After the Fact Porch Alterations

- Submittal Packet 2420 Abercorn St.pdf
- Staff Research 2420 Abercorn Street.pdf

Staff Report - 23-004673-COA 2420 Abercorn St.pdf

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the applicant's request of an after-the-fact approval for the installation of porch columns on the first and second story porch for the property located at 2420 Abercorn Street. 2420 Abercorn Street is a non-contributing resource in the National Register Thomas Square Streetcar Historic District and the local Streetcar Historic District. Based on the Sanborn Maps, the structure was built between 1898 and 1916, as that is the first year it appears. The house appears to have undergone some alterations over time, perhaps explaining why a house that fits the period of significance is considered non-contributing.

The work was done to address a sagging second floor porch that was not adequately supported by the hexagonal decorative columns that had been added sometime in 2001-2002. The intent was to add back a column type that was closer to the Doric column style that was likely there originally. This is evidenced by a column on the side of the house in place, but on an area that is no longer a porch. Staff also found in a picture of 2422

Abercorn Street, there is a glimpse of one porch column on 2420 Abercorn, and it appears to match the existing one on the opposite side of the house.

The project was in progress when Code Compliance issued a citation for the work taking place without a COA. A Google Street View image from May 2022 shows the upper porch railings still in place, and their removal was likely due to the column installation. The scope of work notes part of the project is to return the removed original porch railings and balusters to the first and second floor porch railings.

Staff recommended to approve the after-the-fact porch column installation for the property located at 2420 Abercorn Street with the following conditions to be reviewed and approved by staff prior to starting the work, because it is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Redesign the column caps to be more visually compatible and add base moldings.
- 2. Ensure that the columns are painted.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Joseph Mock, petitioner, stated they wanted to make the replacement columns look as original as possible.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

COMMISSION COMMENTS:

The Commission commented that tapered columns would be better than what is used.

Motion

The Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the after-the-fact porch column installation for the property located at 2420 Abercorn Street with the following conditions to be reviewed and approved by staff prior to starting the work, because it is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1.Redesign the column caps to be more visually compatible and add base moldings.

2. Ensure that the columns are painted.

3. Reinstall the original railings and balusters.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Pamela Miller	
Second: Kiersten Connor	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Not Present
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
Jeff Notrica	- Aye
Mae Bowley	- Not Present
Kiersten Connor	- Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Abstain
Pamela Miller	- Aye

15. Petition of Shane Fatland | 23-004332-COA | 102 East 38th Street | Rehabilitation

- Staff Report 23-004332-COA 102 E 38th St.pdf
- Submittal Packet 102 E 38th St.pdf
- Staff Research Sanborn Maps.pdf

Public Comments - 13 in support.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the applicant's request of approval for rehabilitation of the property located at 102 East 38th Street. In addition to the main building, an existing accessory building is present at the rear of the property; the limited work proposed for this building is to stucco over the concrete block on the three sides where it does not already exist and paint. The scope of work for the main building includes the following (per the applicant):

- -Original wood windows will be repaired and restored with all new rails, sills, muntins, etc. where necessary, in wood. Windows will be reglazed traditionally with antique reproduction glass. Tempered/safety glass will be installed where required.
- -Doors ... are damaged beyond reasonable repair. Replacements where needed will be of salvaged antique doors to match originals.
- -Some new framing and framing repair is needed due to wood decay, water leaks and termite damage.
- -Exterior siding is in satisfactory condition and will be repaired where needed.
- -Full roof is new (2019) and will not be modified.
- -Existing front porch floor was structurally unsound, dangerous and rotted beyond repair. This has been removed as the stress of the weight of the porch was pulling on the framing of the home, to stop water seepage issues, address safety concerns and to expedite a necessary termite mitigation plan.
 - A new porch with salvaged fir tongue and groove decking to match original will replaced that failed one that has been demoed. The footprint will remain exactly the same as the old one.
- -Two level back porch is badly compromised due to neglect, tenant abuse, water seepage, termite damage and wood decay.
 - Roofline and soffit details shall stay intact, however new framing is required, and appropriate wood windows and door will be added in keeping with the original appearance. No change to footprint or exterior look.

Other notes on the drawings indicate that the front porch is to be reconstructed. The elevation drawings state:

- -Porch height determined by existing markings and flashing on façade.
- -Front porch rebuilt over footprint of existing brick foundation.
- -Corner pediment over stairs styled to existing gables.
- -Spun columns matching style (1880s-1910s?).
- -Railing spindles (36") to match balcony style.

The main building was constructed in 1900 and is a contributing resource within the Thomas Square-Streetcar National Register Historic District and the local Streetcar Historic District. This building first appears on the 1916 Sanborn Map and its footprint remains unchanged through the 1966 map. The other building on the property is listed as non-contributing on the Historic Buildings Map; it first appears in the 1966 Sanborn Map, but its year of construction is unknown.

Staff recommended approval for rehabilitation of the main building, with the exception of the front porch reconstruction, and to stucco and paint the accessory building at 102 East

38th Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

AND

Continue the request for reconstruction of the front porch of the main building at 102 East 38th Street for a maximum of five (5) months to allow the applicant to have detailed architectural drawings created of the reconstruction.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Shane Fatland, petitioner, stated the doors and windows are beyond repair. He stated he was trying to repair as best possible.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

COMMISSION COMMENTS:

The Commission encouraged the petitioner to use existing structures for architectural cues to use on the project rehabilitation.

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve rehabilitation of the main building, with the exception of the front porch reconstruction and restoration of the stained glass, and to stucco and paint the accessory building at 102 East 38th Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

AND

Continue the request for reconstruction of the front porch and restoration of the stained glass at the main building at 102 East 38th Street for a maximum of five (5) months to allow the applicant to have detailed architectural drawings created of the reconstruction.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Darren Bagley-Heath	
Second: Virginia Mobley	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Not Present
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
Jeff Notrica	- Aye
Mae Bowley	- Not Present
Kiersten Connor	- Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Abstain
Pamela Miller	- Aye

16. Petition of RK Construction & Development Co. | 23-003652-COA | 217 East 38th Street | Addition and Alterations

© <u>Staff Report - 23-003652-COA 217 E 38th St.pdf</u> Page 16 of 20

- Submittal Packet 217 E 38th St Drawings.pdf
- Submittal Packet 217 E 38th St Photographs.pdf
- Submittal Packet 217 E 38th St Porch Reference Images.pdf
- Staff Research 2016 Photographs.pdf
- Staff Research Current Photographs.pdf

Staff Research - Sanborn Maps.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request of approval for rehabilitation and an addition for the property located at 217 East 38th Street. The applicant intends to combine the two lots; the addition extends on to what is currently the adjacent vacant lot. The existing building will be rehabilitated.

The existing contributing building is one half of a duplex, constructed c.1900; the eastern half sustained substantial fire damage on June 5, 2014. The building was subsequently boarded and remained vacant. The demolition of 219 East 38th Street was approved by the MPC Board on April 25, 2017, due to a court order [File No. 17-001984-COA]. Prior to the adoption of the new zoning ordinance on September 1, 2019, staff approved a similar project to the one that is now proposed on June 13, 2018 [File No. 18-003057-COA]. The associated conditions consisted of the following:

- 1. The pitch of the addition's 9/12 roof is reduced to a maximum of 8/12;
- 2. The porch on the existing building is reconstructed to match its historic design;
- 3. Door specifications are provided;
- 4. The roof overhangs are specified;
- 5. Specifications for the siding of the addition and new stairs are provided;

On September 21, 2018, staff denied the request to revise the porch design to a stoop because the design standards were not met. The decision also states that "The new porch should retain its full width and depth, as shown on the 1916 Sanborn Map." [File No. 18-005250-COA]

Staff recommended to approve the rehabilitation and an addition for the property located at 217 East 38th Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Differentiate the siding on the addition either with material or siding exposure dimension in order to further differentiate it from the historic building.
- 2. Provide information regarding the muntins. Ensure they are simulated divided lites that are 7/8" wide or less, that they simulate traditional putty glazing, and that there is a spacer bar between the panes of glass.
- 3. Provide information regarding the porch railings. Balusters shall be placed between upper and lower rails, and the distances between balusters shall not exceed four (4) inches on center. The height of the railing shall not exceed 36 inches for single- and two-family dwelling units.
- 4. Provide the electrical meter location.
- 5. Provide the HVAC unit location and ensure it is screened from view of the street.
- 6. Provide the refuse storage area location and ensure it is screened from the public right-of-way.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Noble Boykin, petitioner, stated this has been a long process due to varying factors, but is happy to present what he believes to be a good project.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

COMMISSION COMMENTS:

There was no Commission discussion.

Motion

The Savannah Historic Preservation Commission does hereby approve the rehabilitation and an addition for the property located at 217 East 38th Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1.Differentiate the siding on the addition either with material or siding exposure dimension in order to further differentiate it from the historic building.

2.Provide information regarding the muntins. Ensure they are simulated divided lites that are 7/8" wide or less, that they simulate traditional putty glazing, and that there is a spacer bar between the panes of glass. 3.Provide information regarding the porch railings. Balusters shall be placed between upper and lower rails, and the distances between balusters shall not exceed four (4) inches on center. The height of the railing shall not exceed 36 inches for single- and two-family dwelling units.

4. Provide the electrical meter location.

5. Provide the HVAC unit location and ensure it is screened from view of the street.

6. Provide the refuse storage area location and ensure it is screened from the public right-of-way.

7.Use new pressed metal shingles on the porch roof.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Virginia Mobley	
Second: Jeff Notrica	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Not Present
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
Jeff Notrica	- Aye
Mae Bowley	- Not Present
Kiersten Connor	- Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Abstain
Pamela Miller	- Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

17. Acknowledgement and approval of Staff-approved petitions.

Motion

Acknowledge and approve of Staff-approved decisions.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Rebecca Fenwick	
Second: Darren Bagley-Heath	
Rebecca Fenwick	- Aye
Virginia Mobley	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Not Present
Darren Bagley-Heath	- Aye
Jeff Notrica	- Aye
Mae Bowley	- Not Present
Kiersten Connor	- Aye
Kathy S. Ledvina	- Abstain
Pamela Miller	- Aye

18. Petition of Your Exterior Pros | 23-004674-COA | 120 E 32nd St | Roof replacement

SIGNED Staff Decision - 23-004674-COA 120 E 32nd St.pdf

19. Petition of Monarch Roofing | 404 E 32nd Street | 23-004699-COA | Roof replacement

SIGNED Staff Decision - 23-004699-COA 404 E 32nd St.pdf

20. Petition of Michael & Jennifer Tood | 23-004783-COA | 116 East 36th Street | Fence

SIGNED Staff Decision - 23-004783-COA 116 E 36th St.pdf

21. Petition of David Hay | 23-004325-COA | 538 East 37th Street | In-kind window replacement

SIGNED Staff_Decision_-_23-004325-COA__538_E_37th_St.pdf

XI. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 22. Inspections Report September 2023
 - Inspections Report September 2023.pdf
- 23. Stamped Drawings Report September 2023
 - Stamped Drawings Report September 2023.pdf

XII. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

24. Next Pre-Meeting: Wednesday, October 25, 2023 at 2:30 PM - 112 East State Street: Mendonsa Hearing Room

25. Next Regular Meeting: Wednesday, October 25, 2023 at 3:00 PM - 112 East State Street: Mendonsa Hearing Room

26. Adjourn

There being no further discussion, the September 27, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission adjourned at 5:58 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Leah G. Michalak Director of Historic Preservation

/bm

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.