



CITY OF SAVANNAH

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Petitioner: Felder and Associates, Cathryn Sinclair

MPC File No.: 26-002076-COA

Address: 422 West 43rd Street

PIN: 20074 18011

Zoning: TC-1

Staff Reviewer: Rohan Urs

Date: August 26, 2026

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The petitioner is requesting approval for New Construction, Part II: Design Details, associated with the previously approved two-story addition and rehabilitation of the contributing structure located at 422 West 43rd Street within the Streetcar Historic District.

The proposed addition is located within the footprint of the existing non-contributing covered courtyard and is connected to the contributing building by a glazed connector. The Part II application includes exterior materials, windows, doors, foundation and porch details, roofing, shutters, lighting, and other architectural details associated with the addition.

The project also includes rehabilitation of the contributing structure, including restoration of historic wood siding and trim, replacement of non-historic siding with six-inch wood lap siding, repair of existing historic double-hung windows, retention and repair of the existing front porch and entry, and enclosure of the non-historic second-floor rear balcony. The proposed improvements are associated with the adaptive reuse of the property as a post-production sound design studio.

CONTEXT/SURROUNDING AREA:

The subject property is located at the corner of West 43rd Street and Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard near the southwestern boundary of the Streetcar Historic District and is zoned TC-1. The original two-story building was constructed circa 1920 and is identified as a contributing resource. The existing covered courtyard and associated later structures are identified as non-contributing.

The surrounding area contains a mix of residential and commercial development of varying scale and architectural character. An existing parking area is located along the interior portion of the property.

PROJECT HISTORY:

At the May 27, 2026 Historic Preservation Commission meeting, the Commission continued the Part I application because the proposed massing required additional differentiation between the contributing building and the new addition. The Commission also recommended approval of a variance from the TC-1 minimum building frontage requirement.

The applicant subsequently revised the addition by reducing its height and mass, modifying the roof form, and extending the glazed connector between the contributing resource and the new construction.

On June 24, 2026, the Historic Preservation Commission approved the rehabilitation of the historic structure and New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass. The approved addition has an approximate height of 24 feet 5 inches compared with approximately 29 feet for the contributing structure and is differentiated through its reduced massing, stepped-back placement, revised roof form, and glazed connector.

The building frontage variance has subsequently been approved. The present application is for review of Part II design details associated with the previously approved project.

FINDINGS:

The following standards from the Sec 7.11 - Streetcar Historic District Ordinance apply:

Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation. Material changes to contributing resources and resources that are eligible for listing as contributing shall be evaluated by use of the current edition of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation as published by the U.S. Department of the Interior. In considering proposals for alterations to contributing resources, the documented original design of the resource may be considered.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 2– Historic Character. *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

The proposed rehabilitation retains the primary historic form and character-defining features of the contributing resource. Existing historic windows, trim, entry door and transom, front porch, and roof are proposed to remain and be repaired as necessary. Non-historic siding is proposed to be removed and replaced with six-inch wood lap siding compatible with the historic character of the building. The proposed work preserves the visual prominence and historic character of the contributing resource. Standard met.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 9– New Additions to not Damage. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

The overall massing and relationship between the contributing building and addition were approved as part of Part I. The Part II design further defines this relationship through the use of a transparent glazed connector and differentiated exterior materials and detailing. The new work remains distinguishable from the historic resource while maintaining compatibility in form, materials, openings, and architectural character. Standard met.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 10– New Additions Reversible. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

The addition is connected to the contributing structure through a limited glazed connector and occupies an area previously developed with non-contributing courtyard construction. The proposed design retains the essential form and integrity of the contributing structure and is consistent with the findings approved under Part I. Standard met.

The following standards from the Sec 7.11 - Streetcar Historic District Ordinance apply:

Visual Compatibility Criteria. *To maintain the special character of the Streetcar Historic District as identified in the architectural survey and visual analysis, new construction and any material change in appearance shall be consistent with the standards, criteria and guidelines developed for the district. The applicable criteria below shall be used to assess new construction and material changes. These criteria shall not be the basis for appeal to any board, commission or administrator described in this Ordinance, or to the Mayor and Aldermen.*

Openings. *The rhythm and solid-to-void ratio of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

The proposed addition incorporates vertically proportioned double-hung windows organized in a consistent rhythm. The glazed connector provides a visually lighter transition between the historic structure and the addition. Existing historic window openings on the contributing structure are retained, with existing historic double-hung windows proposed for repair. The proposed openings maintain a compatible solid-to-void relationship while allowing the addition to remain distinguishable from the historic resource. Standard met.

Projections. *Entrances, porches, and other projections of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

The proposed porch, entrance elements, roof overhangs, and other projections are appropriately scaled to the addition and maintain a residential architectural character compatible with the contributing structure and surrounding district. The original front porch on the contributing building is retained and repaired. Standard met.

Materials. *The relationship of materials and textures of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with the contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

The rehabilitation of the contributing structure includes retention and restoration of historic wood siding and trim and replacement of non-historic exterior siding with six-inch wood lap siding. The addition incorporates Hardie Artisan six-inch lap siding, stucco-finished masonry foundation elements, architectural asphalt shingles, painted wood porch elements, clad wood windows, and a glazed connector. The proposed materials provide compatibility with the historic resource while maintaining a distinguishable contemporary addition. Standard met.

Roof Shapes. *The roof shape of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

The overall roof form was approved as part of Part I. The Part II drawings provide additional detail, including a 4:12 hip roof on the principal addition, a 2:12 subordinate porch roof, and a low roof at the glazed connector. These forms maintain the previously approved distinction between the contributing building and addition while remaining compatible with roof forms within the district. Standard met.

The following standards from the Sec 7.11 - Streetcar Historic District Ordinance apply:

Streetcar Historic District Design Standards.

New Construction, Additions, and Alterations. The intent of these standards is to ensure appropriate new construction, additions, and alterations within the Streetcar Historic District. They are not intended to promote copies of the architectural designs of the past, but to encourage contemporary designs that protect and complement existing contributing resources. They are further intended to protect the historic integrity of the contributing resource.

The following design standards shall apply to new construction, additions, alterations to contributing and non-contributing resources, and site alterations, unless otherwise specified. Though certain building materials are prescribed below, the Historic Preservation Commission may approve alternative materials that are not listed as prohibited upon a showing by the applicant that the material or product is visually compatible with historic building materials and has performed satisfactorily in the local climate.

Foundation Configuration, New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

In single-family detached, single-family attached, two-family attached, three-family/four-family, and townhouse dwellings, foundations shall be the average height of foundations on contributing buildings on the block face, or if no contributing buildings exist, shall have a minimum finished floor height of 30 inches above grade.

Front porches shall have expressed piers.

Beneath a wood frame building, the foundation shall be recessed and not project forward of the building plane.

The addition is proposed with a stucco-finished CMU foundation. The submitted drawings illustrate the new porch and foundation configuration; however, the Streetcar Historic District standards require front porches to incorporate expressed piers. The drawings should be revised or clarified to demonstrate that the required piers are clearly expressed within the proposed porch foundation design.

Standard can be met with condition.

Exterior walls, Alterations to contributing resources. *The intent of these standards is to ensure that exterior building walls reflect and complement the traditional materials and construction techniques of the district's architecture.*

Exterior walls shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director and the replacement wall shall be of the same materials and configuration as the original wall.

If the original wall material and/or configuration is unknown, the new wall material and configuration shall be based on historic context.

Historic wood siding and trim are proposed to be retained and restored where present. Existing non-historic siding is proposed to be removed and replaced with six-inch wood lap siding compatible with the historic exterior character of the contributing resource. The proposal avoids unnecessary removal of identified historic exterior materials. Standard met.

Permitted materials, Exterior walls, New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources, and additions. *Brick, stone, wood, true stucco, and wood or fiber cement siding.*

The proposed addition utilizes smooth Hardie Artisan six-inch lap siding with compatible trim and corner boards. The material is permitted for new construction and additions within the Streetcar Historic District and provides a compatible exterior treatment while allowing the addition to remain distinguishable from the historic wood-sided structure. Standard met.

Windows, Alterations to contributing resources.

Windows shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation of each window shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director, and the new window shall be of the same materials and configuration as the original (including single-glazed and true-divided lights, when appropriate).

If the original window material and/or configuration is unknown, or if a new window is proposed in an unoriginal opening, the new window material and configuration shall be based on historic context.

Existing historic double-hung windows are proposed to remain and be repaired as necessary, and historic wood window trim is proposed for restoration. The proposed rehabilitation maintains the existing historic window openings and configuration. Standard met.

Windows, New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources, and additions.

Materials, Windows, New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources, and additions.

Window casings and sashes shall be made of PVC, metal, wood or clad wood material.

Window glass shall be transparent with no dark tints or reflective effects (except for stained glass windows). This provision does not preclude the use of Low Emissivity or laminated glass.

Solid vinyl windows are prohibited.

The addition incorporates Marvin Ultimate double-hung clad wood windows. The proposed windows are vertically proportioned and utilize a traditional double-hung configuration compatible with the historic district. Window openings are provided with appropriate surrounds and trim and are arranged in a consistent pattern across the addition. Standard met.

Shutters.

Exterior shutters shall consist of a durable wood species.

Shutters shall be sized to fit the window opening and operable (hinged and able to be closed over the window).

The placement of the horizontal rail(s) shall correspond to the location of the meeting rail(s) of the window.

The submitted elevations and details identify several proposed shutters as faux or false shutters. Shutters within the district are required to function as compatible architectural elements associated with the window openings. The proposed faux shutters should therefore be replaced with compatible operable shutters appropriately sized and configured for the associated windows.

Standard can be met with condition

Storefront, New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

Storefront materials, New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

Storefronts shall be constructed of wood, cast iron, Carrera glass, aluminum, steel or copper as part of a glazed storefront system.

Storefront bases shall consist of wood, bronze, glazed brick or tile.

Exterior burglar bars, fixed or roll-down security devices or similar security devices shall not be permitted.

The proposed connector between the contributing structure and the addition is designed as a transparent glazed storefront system. The connector provides a visually lightweight transition and reinforces the distinction between historic and new construction that formed the basis of the approved Part I design. The glazed system is appropriately subordinate to both principal building masses and supports the architectural differentiation required for the addition. Standard met.

Doors/Entrances, Alterations to contributing resources.

Doors shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation of the door shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director and the new door shall be of the same material and configuration as the original.

If the original door material and/or configuration is unknown, or if a new door is proposed in an unoriginal opening, the new door material and configuration shall be based on historic context.

Doors/Entrances, New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

Doors/Entrances, Materials, New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

Doors shall be made of glass, wood, clad wood or steel (without wood grain simulation).

Doors shall not have a decorative diamond inset or half-moon inset.

The existing primary entry door and transom on the contributing structure are proposed to remain and be repaired and painted as necessary. New doors associated with the addition are proposed in Quarter Sawn White Oak. Entrances remain appropriately oriented and integrated within the overall design. Standard met.

Porches, Stoops, Balconies and Decks, Alterations to contributing resources.

Porches shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director, and the new porch materials and configuration shall be of the same material and configuration as the original.

If the original porch material and/or configuration is unknown, the new porch material and configuration shall be based on historic context.

Front porches shall not be enclosed. Side and rear porches may be enclosed with fine wire mesh, glass or shutters, provided the porch continues to read as a porch and character-defining features (including but not limited to columns, balustrades, entablature and similar features) are retained and not obscured or damaged.

The historic front porch is proposed to remain and be cleaned and repaired as necessary. The project does not propose enclosure or substantial alteration of the primary historic porch. A non-historic second-floor rear balcony is proposed to be enclosed using compatible siding, windows, and trim. Because the enclosure occurs at a non-historic rear feature, it does not result in the loss of identified character-defining historic fabric. Standard met.

Materials, Porches, Stoops, Balconies and Decks, New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

On porches and stoops, piers and base walls shall be of the same material as the foundation wall facing the street.

Porch elements shall be constructed of brick, painted or stained wood, wood composite, precast stone, marble, sandstone, or slate.

Prohibited material: Vinyl.

Configuration, Porches, Stoops, Balconies and Decks, New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

On single-family detached, single-family attached and two-family attached dwellings, a front porch a minimum of six (6) feet in depth shall be required over a minimum of 50% of the front façade.

On three and four-family and townhouse dwellings, a stoop extending a minimum of four (4) feet in depth and six (6) feet in width shall be required.

Wood portico posts shall have cap and base molding.

Balusters shall be placed between upper and lower rails, and the distances between balusters shall not exceed four (4) inches on center. The height of the railing shall not exceed 36 inches for single- and two-family dwelling units.

Front porches shall not be enclosed.

Uncovered decks shall be at the rear of the building or screened from view from the public right-of-way.

The new porch incorporates painted wood columns and railings. Submitted details indicate an approximately 36-inch-high railing with baluster spacing not exceeding four inches. The porch is subordinate to the overall addition and compatible with the architectural character of the property. Compliance with the expressed-pier requirement is addressed separately under Foundation Configuration. Standard met subject to the foundation condition.

Roof, Contributing Resources.

Roof, Materials, Contributing Resources.

Original roof material shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director, and the new

roof shall be of the same material and configuration as the original (except wood or asbestos).

Metal roofs shall have a metal drip edge covering all edges.

The existing roof of the contributing structure is proposed to remain and be repaired as necessary. No alteration to the principal historic roof configuration is proposed. Standard met.

Roof, New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

Roof, Materials, New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

Roof coverings shall be standing seam metal, v-crimp, slate or equivalent synthetic, or architectural asphalt or similar shingles.

Metal roofs shall have a metal drip edge covering all edges.

Roof, Configuration, New construction, alterations to non-contributing resources and additions.

Shed and porch roofs, subordinate and attached to the primary building, shall be pitched between 2:12 and 6:12.

Where historically appropriate, flat roofs may be utilized.

Gable and hip roof shall be symmetrically pitched between 4:12 and 10:12.

Skylights and roof vents may be permitted if integrated into roof design.

Pergolas and roof decks shall not be permitted on the street façade.

Eaves shall extend no less than 12 inches beyond supporting walls.

Gable end rakes shall overhang at least eight (8) inches.

Eaves and rakes on accessory buildings and dormers shall overhang at least eight (8) inches.

Soffits shall be placed perpendicular to the building wall, not sloping in plane with the roof (except for gable end rakes).

Applied mansard roofs shall not be permitted.

The addition incorporates architectural asphalt shingles on the primary roof, with a 4:12 hip roof pitch and a 2:12 subordinate porch roof. The primary roof includes approximately 12-inch eave projections, and the roof configuration is consistent with the previously approved Part I design. The proposed materials and configurations are permitted and compatible with the district. Standard met.

Mechanical Equipment and Refuse. The intent of these standards is to ensure that mechanical equipment and refuse is appropriately sited to provide the least negative visual impact. In addition to the requirements set forth in Sec. 9.5, Screening and Buffers, mechanical equipment and refuse shall comply with the following:

Electrical vaults, meter boxes, communications devices, and satellite dishes shall be located on the secondary or rear façades and shall be minimally visible.

Roof mounted equipment and HVAC units shall be screened from view from the street.

Refuse storage areas for dumpsters and compactors shall be located within a building or to the side of rear of the building and screened from the public right-of-way.

Alternative energy source devices may be permitted on new construction, additions, and alterations to non-contributing resources provided they are integrated in to the building design. Alternative energy source devices may be permitted on contributing resources provided they are not visible from the street and do not damage or obscure any character-defining features.

No substantive alterations to the existing mechanical equipment or refuse areas are proposed as part of this application. Existing conditions are proposed to remain.

Lighting. The intent of these standards is to ensure that light fixtures have appropriate scale, are sited appropriately, are made of appropriate materials and complement the building on which they are located. In addition to the requirements set forth in Sec. 9.8, Lighting, lighting shall comply with the following:

Materials: Light fixtures shall be constructed of metal and/or glass.

Configuration: Light fixtures shall be compatible with the scale of the subject property and with the character of the district.

Source Type: White light source only.

New exterior wall sconces are shown at several locations on the proposed elevations; however, fixture specifications sufficient to confirm compliance with the Streetcar Historic District requirements for fixture material, configuration, and light source were not included in the submitted documentation. The applicant should provide lighting specifications demonstrating compliance with the applicable standards.

Standard can be met with condition.

Additions. In addition to compliance with the Visual Compatibility Criteria and the Victorian Historic District Design Standards, additions to contributing resources shall also comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation and the following standards:

Additions shall be subordinate in mass and height to the resource.

Additions shall not obscure any character-defining features.

Additions shall not be on the primary or front façade of the resource.

The location, height, massing, and overall relationship of the addition to the contributing resource were approved under Part I. The Part II design details reinforce the approved differentiation through the glazed connector, compatible but distinguishable siding treatment, simplified architectural detailing, and subordinate porch and roof elements. The addition remains secondary to the contributing building and does not obscure its primary façade or principal character-defining features. Standard met.

Fencing and Walls. *The intent of these standards is to ensure that walls and fences define outdoor spaces appropriately, separate private and public realms and add architectural interest to a building's façade. In addition to compliance with the requirements set forth in Sec. 9.6, Fences and Walls, fences and walls shall also comply with the following standards:*

Fencing and Walls, Permitted Materials. *Wood, iron, brick, true stucco over concrete block, smooth fiber cement, and extruded aluminum.*

Chain link may be permitted in the rear yard but not along any street. Plastic or metal slats use in chain link shall not be permitted.

Fencing and Walls, Configuration.

Fences or walls no more than 36 inches in height may be installed within the front yard.

Fences or walls no more than eight (8) feet in height may be installed within the side or rear yards behind the front façade of the building.

A minimum of five (5) feet must be provided between a fence and a building where they are parallel.

The existing wood fence is proposed to remain and be repaired and painted as necessary. No new fencing or wall configuration is proposed as part of the Part II application.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approve the rehabilitation of the historic structure and New Construction, Part 2: Design Details, for the addition located at 422 West 43rd Street with the following conditions to be met and submitted for staff review prior to starting the work, as the proposal is otherwise visually compatible and meets the applicable standards.

- 1. Revise the proposed faux shutters to provide compatible operable shutters that comply with the applicable Streetcar Historic District standards.**
- 2. Revise or clarify the proposed front porch foundation detailing to demonstrate clearly expressed piers in accordance with the Streetcar Historic District standards.**
- 3. Provide specifications for the proposed exterior lighting fixtures demonstrating compliance with the applicable Streetcar Historic District standards for fixture material, configuration, and light source.**
- 4. Submit revised drawings and specifications addressing the above conditions to Staff for review and confirmation of compliance prior to final approval and stamping.**

MW: CC: RU

Note: This recommendation could change subject to new information provided at the Historic Preservation Commission meetings. Final decisions will be made by the Historic Preservation Commission at the public hearing based on information provided at the meeting, as well as information submitted for the staff recommendation.