



CITY OF SAVANNAH

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Petitioner: Kim Campbell

MPC File No.: 25-006145-COA

Address: 2309 Drayton Street

PIN: 20065 39008

Zoning: TN-2

Staff Reviewer: Jodie Brown, AICP

Date: January 28, 2026

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The applicant is proposing to restore the exterior of subject building.

CONTEXT/SURROUNDING AREA:

Located on the northwest corner of Drayton and 40th Streets within the Wadley Ward. It is 2-story building with commercial on the 1st floor and residential on the 2nd floor. Originally constructed in 1899, it operated as Gartelmann Grocer with the family living on the 2nd floor. It was designed in the Italianate style with Queen Anne influences. Currently, the exterior is OSB and stucco on the first floor and original siding and window on the 2nd floor.

The building features a rectangular footprint with a chamfered entrance at the southeast corner directly below a small balcony. The balcony features a hipped roof sheathed with a SSM, a boxed eave with decorative brackets, spindlework, simple wood posts and partial railing. Access to the balcony is via a 2/4 door-sized window. Radiating out from the balcony are 2/2 double hung windows with simple surrounds. Similar windows are placed sporadically on the north and west side on both the upper and lower floors.

The subject building is listed as a contributing resource within the Thomas Square-Streetcar National Register Historic District and the local Streetcar Historic District.

FINDINGS:

The following standards from §7.11 - Streetcar Historic District Ordinance apply:

Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation. Material changes to contributing resources and resources that are eligible for listing as contributing shall be evaluated by use of the current edition of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation as published by the U.S. Department of the Interior. In

considering proposals for alterations to contributing resources, the documented original design of the resource may be considered.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 2– Historic Character. *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

The applicant has done extensive research on the property and the original configuration of the store front. They were unable to locate historic photos of the site, but with select demolition and a core sample of the concrete floor, storefront framing and examples of other similar buildings in Savannah, they were able to construct an appropriate storefront. The historic materials that remain in place will be repaired while the new materials will match. The proposed work is consistent with Standard 2.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 3– Physical Record. *Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.*

The applicant has done extensive research on the property and the original configuration of the store front. They were unable to locate historic photos of the site, but with select demolition and a core sample of the concrete floor, storefront framing and examples of other similar buildings in Savannah, they were able to construct an appropriate storefront. The historic materials that remain in place will be repaired while the new materials will match. The proposed work is consistent with Standard 3.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 4– Historic Changes. *Most properties change over time; those changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.*

The first floor was reconfigured in the 1960s and it has been mothballed since prior to 2017. Prior to mothballing, the storefront was boarded up. The current configuration and previous appearance are not historically significant. The applicant is proposing to restore the facades based on existing evidence and historic context. The proposed work is consistent with Standard 4.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 5– Distinctive Features. *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*

While the storefront configuration has been significantly altered, the second floor retains several distinctive features. The windows were restored by a previous owner, and the current owner intends to restore the remaining features which include the balcony, siding, etc. The proposed work is consistent with Standard 5.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 6– Deteriorated Features. *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

In addition to the restoration of the storefront, the applicant is proposing to repair siding, restoration of missing brackets, re-installing shutters, repairing the porch, repairing the roof flashing, and painting the exterior. The work is intended to address a number of the deteriorated elements, and the work is consistent with Standard 6.

Visual Compatibility Criteria. *To maintain the special character of the Streetcar Historic District as identified in the architectural survey and visual analysis, new construction and any material change in appearance shall be consistent with the standards, criteria and guidelines developed for the district. The applicable criteria below shall be used to assess new construction and material changes. These criteria shall not be the basis for appeal to any board, commission or administrator described in this Ordinance, or to the Mayor and Aldermen.*

Openings. *The rhythm and solid-to-void ratio of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

The 2nd floor window openings will be maintained and openings that were previously enclosed with OSB will be maintained with closed shutters. Two door openings at the north façade will be restored, one of which will be fixed. The mixture of restored openings and faux openings will maintain the existing solid-void pattern. The work will be consistent with this criterion.

Materials. *The relationship of materials and textures of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with the contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

The applicant is proposing to use materials that are consistent with what was historically present on the building. The work is consistent with this criterion.

Streetcar Historic District Design Standards.

New Construction, Additions, and Alterations. The intent of these standards is to ensure appropriate new construction, additions, and alterations within the Streetcar Historic District. They are not intended to promote copies of the architectural designs of the past, but to encourage contemporary designs that protect and complement existing contributing resources. They are further intended to protect the historic integrity of the contributing resource.

The following design standards shall apply to new construction, additions, alterations to contributing and non-contributing resources, and site alterations, unless otherwise specified. Though certain building materials are prescribed below, the Historic Preservation Commission may approve alternative materials that are not listed as prohibited upon a showing by the applicant that the material or product is visually compatible with historic building materials and has performed satisfactorily in the local climate.

Exterior walls, Alterations to contributing resources. *The intent of these standards is to ensure that exterior building walls reflect and complement the traditional materials and construction techniques of the district's architecture.*

Exterior walls shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation shall be photographically

documented and verified by the Planning Director and the replacement wall shall be of the same materials and configuration as the original wall.

If the original wall material and/or configuration is unknown, the new wall material and configuration shall be based on historic context.

The applicant is proposing to restore the exterior walls. There are areas where the siding will need to be repaired and areas where the siding was previously replaced inappropriately which will be removed and reinstalled with wood siding. The inappropriate concrete storefront elements will be removed and replaced with a wood storefront system consistent with the historic context and physical evidence at the site. The proposed work is consistent with the historic district design standards.

Prohibited materials, Exterior walls, Alterations to contributing resources. Vinyl siding, aluminum siding, rolled asphalt, precast concrete panels, fiber cement wood siding, EIFS, one-part stucco over insulation and/or wood or metal framing, and T-111.

The applicant is not proposing to use any prohibited materials.

Windows, Alterations to contributing resources.

Windows shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation of each window shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director, and the new window shall be of the same materials and configuration as the original (including single-glazed and true-divided lights, when appropriate).

If the original window material and/or configuration is unknown, or if a new window is proposed in an unoriginal opening, the new window material and configuration shall be based on historic context.

A previous owner restored several 2nd floor windows which will be painted as necessary with this project. At the north and west façades are windows that were previously enclosed. The applicant is proposing to install closed shutters to indicate where the windows were originally located. The proposed work is consistent with this historic district design standard.

Storefronts, Alterations to contributing resources.

Original storefronts shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director, and the new storefront shall be of the same materials and configuration as the original.

If the original storefront material and/or configuration are unknown, or if a new storefront is proposed in an unoriginal opening, the new storefront material and configuration shall be based on historic context.

As noted, the original storefront was reconfigured in the 1960s and more recently it was mothballed. The applicant unsuccessfully researched historic photos and used evidence present on the building and historic context to reconstruct the storefront façade. The project was also reviewed by the National Park Service (NPS) in 2022 in anticipation of using Federal Tax Credits for it. The proposed work is consistent with the historic district design standards.

Doors/Entrances, Alterations to contributing resources.

Doors shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation of the door shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director and the new door shall be of the same material and configuration as the original.

If the original door material and/or configuration is unknown, or if a new door is proposed in an unoriginal opening, the new door material and configuration shall be based on historic context.

The entrance to the second floor is at the southwest corner of the building. It is recessed slightly with a few steps leading to the door. It appears that the applicant is proposing to replicate the single wood and glass door with sidelights and a transom. The original door can be seen in the 2016 Google street view images. It is not clear if that door is still present and can be repaired. The applicant should clarify what is going on with the 2nd floor entrance.

Mechanical Equipment and Refuse. *The intent of these standards is to ensure that mechanical equipment and refuse is appropriately sited to provide the least negative visual impact. In addition to the requirements set forth in Sec. 9.5, Screening and Buffers, mechanical equipment and refuse shall comply with the following:*

Electrical vaults, meter boxes, communications devices, and satellite dishes shall be located on the secondary or rear façades and shall be minimally visible.

Refuse storage areas for dumpsters and compactors shall be located within a building or to the side of rear of the building and screened from the public right-of-way.

The mechanical equipment is located at the rear of the building at the northwest corner. The applicant is proposing a low wood fence around the units to conceal them.

The trash receptacles will be located on the west side of the house which is between this building and the neighbor. The trash receptacles will be located behind an existing fence.

The proposed work is consistent with the historic district design standards.

Fencing and Walls. *The intent of these standards is to ensure that walls and fences define outdoor spaces appropriately, separate private and public realms and add architectural interest to a building's façade. In addition to compliance with the requirements set forth in Sec. 9.6, Fences and Walls, fences and walls shall also comply with the following standards:*

Fencing and Walls, Permitted Materials. *Wood, iron, brick, true stucco over concrete block, smooth fiber cement, and extruded aluminum.*

Chain link may be permitted in the rear yard but not along any street. Plastic or metal slats use in chain link shall not be permitted.

The applicant is proposing a 5' tall wood fence to conceal the HVAC units. The fence will be located at the northwest corner of the house. The proposed work is consistent with the historic district standards.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

APPROVE the request for the restoration of the exterior of the property at 2309 Drayton Street WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITION to be reviewed and approved by staff prior to starting the project, because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the Standards.

- 1. Clarify whether the work to the 2nd floor entrance can be repaired or will need to be replaced.**

MW: CC: JB

Note: This recommendation could change subject to new information provided at the Historic Preservation Commission meetings. Final decisions will be made by the Historic Preservation Commission at the public hearing based on information provided at the meeting, as well as information submitted for the staff recommendation.