



CITY OF SAVANNAH

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Petitioner: Ashley Davis

MPC File No.: 26-002247-COA

Address: 209 West Bolton Street

PIN: 20044 17012

Zoning: TN-1

Staff Reviewer: Alexander Merced

Date: May 27, 2026

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The applicant would like to replace the existing deteriorated metal roof with one made of asphalt architectural shingles. The shingles will be GAF Stainguard Plus 30-year shingles and the shape, form, and pitch of the roof will remain the same.

CONTEXT/SURROUNDING AREA:

The building was constructed in 1871 and is a contributing resource within the National Register Victorian Historic District and the local Victorian Historic District. It is located mid-block on the south side of the street and sits between a contributing house to the West and a non-contributing single-story commercial building to the East.

FINDINGS:

The following standards from the Sec 7.9 - Victorian Historic District Ordinance apply:

***Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation.** Material changes to contributing resources and resources that are eligible for listing as contributing shall be evaluated by use of the current edition of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation as published by the U.S. Department of the Interior. In considering proposals for alterations to contributing resources, the documented original design of the resource may be considered.*

***Secretary of the Interior's Standards 2– Historic Character.** The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

The shape, form and pitch of the existing roof will be maintained with the removal of the metal roof and the replacement with asphalt shingles. The proposed change will not negatively impact the historic character of the house or the district. The standard is met.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 6– Deteriorated Features. *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

The extant roofing material is in a deteriorated state and according to the contractor cannot be repaired. As noted in Preservation Brief 16, “While the use of matching materials is always preferred, the Standards purposely allow for the use of substitute materials when the use of original materials is not reasonably possible, such as in consideration of economic and technical feasibility or in new construction. They also provide additional flexibility in the treatment of secondary, less distinctive features that are less important in defining the historic character of the property.” The roof is essentially a utilitarian feature and, in this instance, would be considered a secondary, less distinctive feature of the house. With the replacement of metal to asphalt, the house will continue to convey its “...historical, cultural or architectural values.” The standard is met.

Visual Compatibility Criteria. *To maintain the special character of the Victorian Historic District as identified in the architectural survey and visual analysis, new construction and any material change in appearance shall be consistent with the standards, criteria and guidelines developed for the district. The applicable criteria below shall be used to assess new construction and material changes. These criteria shall not be the basis for appeal to any board, commission or administrator described in this Ordinance, or to the Mayor and Aldermen.*

Materials. *The relationship of materials and textures of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with the contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

The proposed asphalt shingle roofing material is not out of character with the surrounding homes. There are a number of contributing resources that feature asphalt shingle roofing in a variety of colors. The criterion is met.

Roof Shapes. *The roof shape of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

As stated previously, the existing roof shape and dimensions will remain unchanged. The criterion is met.

Victorian Historic District Design Standards.

New Construction, Additions, and Alterations. *The intent of these standards is to ensure appropriate new construction, additions, and alterations within the Victorian Historic District. They are also intended to protect the historic integrity of contributing resources. Designs for new construction are to be consistent with contributing resources from the district's Period of Significance (1870-1923).*

The following design standards shall apply to new construction, additions, alterations to contributing and non-contributing resources, and site alterations, unless otherwise specified. Though certain building materials are prescribed below, the Historic Preservation Commission may approve alternative materials that are not listed as prohibited upon a

May 27, 2026

showing by the applicant that the material or product is visually compatible with historic building materials and has performed satisfactorily in the local climate.

Roof, Contributing Resources.

Roof, Materials, Contributing Resources.

Original roof material shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director, and the new roof shall be of the same material and configuration as the original (except wood or asbestos).

Metal roofs shall have a metal drip edge covering all edges.

The extant roofing material is in a deteriorated condition and is beyond repair. The applicant is proposing to replace the metal roof with asphalt shingles. The use of this material is consistent with other contributing properties within the immediate vicinity. The standard is met.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approve the roof replacement at 209 West Bolton Street as requested because it is visually compatible and meets the standards.

MW: CC: APM

Note: This recommendation could change subject to new information provided at the Historic Preservation Commission meetings. Final decisions will be made by the Historic Preservation Commission at the public hearing based on information provided at the meeting, as well as information submitted for the staff recommendation.