



CITY OF SAVANNAH

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Petitioner: Sophia Fiske

MPC File No.: 26-002103-COA

Address: 415 & 419 West 42nd Street

PIN: 20074 18003

Zoning: TC-1

Staff Reviewer: Alexander Merced

Date: May 27, 2026

NATURE OF REQUEST:

On 415 West 42nd Street the applicant would like to repair part of the existing second floor porch deck and replace the existing plywood trim above the front porch with sealed wood trim. On 419 West 42nd Street, the applicant would like to repair two sections of siding in-kind. The initial application included roof replacement and foundation repointing, but after further review by the applicant it was determined that the roofs and foundations are in good condition and do not need work at this time.

CONTEXT/SURROUNDING AREA:

It should be noted that this application consists of external rehabilitations to two different houses on the street, 415 West 42nd Street and its immediate neighbor to the west, labeled as 419 West 42nd Street on Google Maps, and as 417 West 42nd Street on the Streetcar Historic Building Map. These are labeled with a single parcel ID under SAGIS, and this is why these have been submitted as one single application.

The buildings were constructed in 1920 and are contributing resources within the Thomas Square-Streetcar National Register Historic District and the local Streetcar Historic District. They sit on a block with a mix of contributing and non-contributing structures, including a newly built apartment building immediately adjacent to the East.

FINDINGS:

The following standards from the Sec 7.11 - Streetcar Historic District Ordinance apply:

Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation. Material changes to contributing resources and resources that are eligible for listing as contributing shall be evaluated by use of the current edition of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation as published by the U.S. Department of the Interior. In

considering proposals for alterations to contributing resources, the documented original design of the resource may be considered.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 2– Historic Character. *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

Very little historic material will be removed, and that which will be removed will be replaced in-kind with the same materials. The standard is met.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 6– Deteriorated Features. *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

The majority of the work will be repair, with only deteriorated features being replaced. The standard is met.

Visual Compatibility Criteria. *To maintain the special character of the Streetcar Historic District as identified in the architectural survey and visual analysis, new construction and any material change in appearance shall be consistent with the standards, criteria and guidelines developed for the district. The applicable criteria below shall be used to assess new construction and material changes. These criteria shall not be the basis for appeal to any board, commission or administrator described in this Ordinance, or to the Mayor and Aldermen.*

Materials. *The relationship of materials and textures of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with the contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

Most original material will be repaired, and that which will be replaced will be done in-kind with materials that are visually compatible with surrounding contributing resources. The standard is met.

Streetcar Historic District Design Standards.

New Construction, Additions, and Alterations. *The intent of these standards is to ensure appropriate new construction, additions, and alterations within the Streetcar Historic District. They are not intended to promote copies of the architectural designs of the past, but to encourage contemporary designs that protect and complement existing contributing resources. They are further intended to protect the historic integrity of the contributing resource.*

The following design standards shall apply to new construction, additions, alterations to contributing and non-contributing resources, and site alterations, unless otherwise specified. Though certain building materials are prescribed below, the Historic Preservation Commission may approve alternative materials that are not listed as prohibited upon a showing by the applicant that the material or product is visually compatible with historic building materials and has performed satisfactorily in the local climate.

Exterior walls, Alterations to contributing resources. The intent of these standards is to ensure that exterior building walls reflect and complement the traditional materials and construction techniques of the district's architecture.

Exterior walls shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director and the replacement wall shall be of the same materials and configuration as the original wall.

Two small sections of existing deteriorated wood siding on 419 W 42nd Street will be repaired in-kind with 1x8 pine lap siding to match the existing. The standard is met.

Prohibited materials, Exterior walls, Alterations to contributing resources. Vinyl siding, aluminum siding, rolled asphalt, precast concrete panels, fiber cement wood siding, EIFS, one-part stucco over insulation and/or wood or metal framing, and T-111.

The standard is met.

Porches, Stoops, Balconies and Decks, Alterations to contributing resources.

Porches shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director, and the new porch materials and configuration shall be of the same material and configuration as the original.

If the original porch material and/or configuration is unknown, the new porch material and configuration shall be based on historic context.

Currently the top of the first-floor porch of 415 West 42nd Street is framed with plywood. This will be replaced with sealed wood that is more aligned with historic context and brings it into visual compatibility with contributing resources within the district. Additionally, a small part of the second-floor porch deck will be replaced in-kind. The standard is met.

Prohibited materials, Porches, Stoops, Balconies and Decks, Alterations to contributing resources. Fiberglass (including Perma-Cast), vinyl and PVC.

The standard is met.

Staff Report - Certificate of Appropriateness
MPC File No. 26-002107-COA
415-419 W. 42nd St.
May 27, 2026

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approve the rehabilitation work at 415 and 419 West 42nd Street as requested because it is visually compatible and meets the standards.

MW: CC: APM

Note: This recommendation could change subject to new information provided at the Historic Preservation Commission meetings. Final decisions will be made by the Historic Preservation Commission at the public hearing based on information provided at the meeting, as well as information submitted for the staff recommendation.