



CITY OF SAVANNAH

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Petitioner: Allan Stevens

MPC File No.: 26-004186-COA

Address: 620 West 42nd Street

PIN: 20073 33028

Zoning: TR-1

Staff Reviewer: Jodie Brown, AICP

Date: September 23, 2026

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting to restore the exterior of this residence.

CONTEXT/SURROUNDING AREA:

Constructed in 1915, the building is a single-story shotgun style house. The subject property features wood shingles at the gable end and wood lap siding on the body. The front porch is a low-hipped roof that is currently supported by temporary wood posts. Fenestration is all boarded and it appears that the property has been vacant for some time.

The subject building is listed as a contributing resource within the National Register Cuyler-Brownville Historic District and the local Cuyler-Brownville Historic District.

FINDINGS:

The following standards from §7.10 - Cuyler-Brownville Historic District Ordinance apply:

Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation. Material changes to contributing resources and resources that are eligible for listing as contributing shall be evaluated by use of the current edition of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation as published by the U.S. Department of the Interior. In considering proposals for alterations to contributing resources, the documented original design of the resource may be considered.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 2– Historic Character. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

The applicant is proposing to restore the historic materials and install new materials, where necessary. Under the previous owner and approval, the majority of the siding and framing were

completed. The current owner will be completing the siding, restoration of the porch, replacing the roof, repairing the windows, doors and trim or replacing in-kind, as necessary and spot repointing. The proposed work is consistent with Standard 2.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 6– Deteriorated Features. *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

Based on Google Street View, it appears that the house has been vacant over a decade. During that time, the house has deteriorated. The roof leaked, the wood siding and the windows deteriorated, and the front porch was removed. The applicant is proposing to restore the exterior materials in-kind. The proposed work is consistent with Standard 6.

Visual Compatibility Criteria. *To maintain the special character of the Victorian Historic District as identified in the architectural survey and visual analysis, new construction and any material change in appearance shall be consistent with the standards, criteria and guidelines developed for the district. The applicable criteria below shall be used to assess new construction and material changes. These criteria shall not be the basis for appeal to any board, commission or administrator described in this Ordinance, or to the Mayor and Aldermen.*

Openings. *The rhythm and solid-to-void ratio of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

The applicant intends to restore the existing windows. If the existing windows are missing or too deteriorated to repair, they will be replaced in-kind with 2/2 wood double hung windows. The proposed work is consistent with this criterion.

Materials. *The relationship of materials and textures of the proposed building or structure shall be visually compatible with the contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

If the historic materials cannot be repaired, they will be replaced in-kind. The proposed work is consistent with this criterion.

Cuyler-Brownville Historic District Design Standards.

New Construction, Additions, and Alterations. *The intent of these standards is to ensure appropriate new construction, additions, and alterations within the Cuyler-Brownville Historic District. They are not intended to promote copies of the architectural designs of the past, but to encourage contemporary designs that protect and complement existing contributing resources. They are further intended to protect the historic integrity of the contributing resource.*

The following design standards shall apply to new construction, additions, alterations to contributing and non-contributing buildings and structures, and site alterations, unless

otherwise specified. Though certain building materials are prescribed below, the Historic Preservation Commission may approve alternative materials that are not listed as prohibited upon a showing by the applicant that the material or product is visually compatible with historic building materials and has performed satisfactorily in the local climate.

Windows, Alterations to contributing resources.

Windows shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation of each window shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director, and the new window shall be of the same materials and configuration as the original (including single-glazed and true-divided lights, when appropriate).

The applicant intends to restore the existing windows. If the existing windows are missing or too deteriorated to repair, they will be replaced in-kind with 2/2 wood double hung windows. The proposed work is consistent with the historic district design standards.

Doors/Entrances, Alterations to contributing resources.

Doors shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation of the door shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director and the new door shall be of the same material and configuration as the original.

It is not clear that the original doors are behind the boarded openings. At the front façade, the applicant is proposing a wood and glass door that is 2/3s glass and 1/3 wood. The proposed door would have a wide bottom rail. The rear door would have a similar appearance with glass that is divided light. The proposed work is consistent with the historic district design standards.

If the original door material and/or configuration is unknown, or if a new door is proposed in an unoriginal opening, the new door material and configuration shall be based on historic context.

The proposed work is consistent with the historic district design standards.

Porches, Stoops, Balconies and Decks, Alterations to contributing resources.

Porches shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director, and the new porch materials and configuration shall be of the same material and configuration as the original.

Based on Google Street View, it appears that the porch was present in 2014 and gone by 2019. The previous owner partially reconstructed the porch per the approved plans. The roof and decking were completed, but it is only supported by simple wood posts. Per the plans, the balustrade would be reconstructed, and the wood Tuscan columns would be installed. The proposed work is consistent with the historic district design standards.

Prohibited materials, Porches, Stoops, Balconies and Decks, Alterations to contributing resources. Fiberglass (including Perma-Cast), vinyl and PVC.

The proposed work is consistent with the historic district design standards.

Roof, Contributing Resources.

Roof, Materials, Contributing Resources.

Original roof material shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director, and the new roof shall be of the same material and configuration as the original (except wood or asbestos).

The roofing material had reached the end of its life and was actively leaking. The applicant was approved for an emergency roof replacement. The existing asphalt shingle roof was replaced in-kind. The proposed work is consistent with the historic district design standards.

Roof, Configuration, Contributing Resources.

Original roof configuration shall be maintained.

The roof configuration was maintained as a gable over the main body of the house, a shed over the front porch and a hip over a rear addition. The proposed work is consistent with the historic district design standards.

Skylights, roof decks, pergolas and roof vents shall be permitted only on the roof plane opposite the street, or when screened from public view and shall not damage or obscure character-defining features.

The applicant is not proposing any roof additions. The proposed work is consistent with the historic district design standards.

Dormers shall not damage or obscure character-defining features and shall reinforce the existing historic window pattern.

The applicant is not proposing any dormers. The proposed work is consistent with the historic district design standards.

Staff Report - Certificate of Appropriateness
MPC File No. 26-004186-COA
620 West 42nd Street
September 23, 2026

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

APPROVE the request to rehabilitate the existing building at 620 West 42nd Street AS SUBMITTED because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the Standards.

MW: CC: JB

Note: This recommendation could change subject to new information provided at the Historic Preservation Commission meetings. Final decisions will be made by the Historic Preservation Commission at the public hearing based on information provided at the meeting, as well as information submitted for the staff recommendation.