

BOARD OF REVIEW

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room April 13, 2011 2:00 P.M. Meeting Minutes

APRIL 13, 2011 HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW REGULAR MEETING

HDRB Members Present: Brian Judson, Chair

W. James Overton, Vice Chair

Reed Engle

Dr. Nicholas Henry Sidney Johnson Linda Ramsay Ebony Simpson

HDRB Members Not Present: Ned Gay

Gene Hutchinson Robin Williams, Ph.D

MPC Staff Present: Sarah Ward, Historic Preservation Director

Christy Adams, Administrative Services Director

Julie Yawn, Systems Analyst

Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

City of Savannah Staff Present: Mike Rose, City Building Inspector

Tiras Petrea, City Zoning Inspector

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

1. Call to Order

Mr. Judson called the HDBR meeting to order at 2:15 p.m. He welcomed Ms. Adrienne Birge-Wilson and the Historic Preservation 101 class from SCAD visiting the meeting today.

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

2. Approve March 9, 2011 Meeting Minutes

Attachment: 03-09-2011 Minutes.pdf

Board Action:

Approval of March 9, 2011 Meeting Minutes. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Reed Engle

Second: Sidney J. Johnson

Reed Engle - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye

Gene Hutchinson - Not Present

Sidney J. Johnson - Aye
Brian Judson - Abstain
W James Overton - Aye
Linda Ramsay - Aye
Ebony Simpson - Aye

III. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

IV. SIGN POSTING

3. Posting of Signs

Mr. Engle reported that he did not see a sign posted at 433 Tattnall Street and at 108 West Gordon Street the sign was behind a plastic drop cloth.

Ms. Ramsay stated that she saw a sign at 108 West Gordon Street.

Mr. Judson explained that the purpose of the signs are to notify the public of what is going on in their neighborhood and ensure due process in notifying the neighbors of the hearing. He informed the Board that he was open to suggestions as how to proceed with the petition at 433 Tattnall Street.

Mr. Engle stated that the petitioners are given two signs.

Ms. Ward stated that the day after the signs were required to be posted, staff went out to review the projects. She recalls seeing the sign on Tattnall Street. She could not recall seeing a sign on Gordon Street. When she returned to the office, she emailed reminders to all the petitioners informing them that if they had not already posted their signs, to please post them immediately.

Mr. Judson asked what type of notifications are given to the petitioners explaining the requirement of posting the signs.

Ms. Ward gave the Board a copy of the notification requirement.

Mr. Judson said the notification requirement needs to be reworded explicitly informing the petitioners about the posting of the signs. He will work with staff to come up with a new notification to the petitioners regarding the posting of the signs.

Ms. Ramsay said if the Board members go out and don't see a sign posted, they should notify Ms. Ward immediately. The posting notification needs to be clearer.

Mr. Engle suggested that prior to mailing out the packages to the Board, they need a list of all the addresses where the signs are to be posted for that upcoming meeting. This would give the Board more time to go out and review the signs.

Mr. Overton moved that the Board hear the Tattnall Street petition today, but next month if an address is not in full compliance with the sign posting requirements, the Board will not hear that petition. This was seconded by **Ms. Ramsay** and carried.

V. CONTINUED AGENDA

VI. CONSENT AGENDA

4. Petition of Sign Mart, Inc. | H-11-4397-2 | 220 West Broughton Street | Sign

Attachment: <u>Staff Report.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet.pdf</u>

Board Action:

Approval for the principal use facia sign. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: W James Overton Second: Linda Ramsay

Reed Engle- AyeNicholas Henry- AyeGene Hutchinson- Not Present

Sidney J. Johnson- AyeBrian Judson- AbstainW James Overton- AyeLinda Ramsay- AyeEbony Simpson- Aye

5. Petition of William W. Roelle | H-11-4401-2 | 529 East Liberty Street | Fence

Attachment: Staff Report.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet.pdf

Board Action:

Approve the petition for the wooden privacy fence. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: W James Overton Second: Linda Ramsay

Reed Engle - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye

Gene Hutchinson - Not Present

Sidney J. Johnson - Aye
Brian Judson - Abstain
W James Overton - Aye
Linda Ramsay - Aye
Ebony Simpson - Aye

6. <u>Petition of American Clearing for Connors Temple Baptist Church | H-11-4402-2 | 731 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. | Demolition</u>

Attachment: <u>Staff Report.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet.pdf</u>

Board Action:

Approve for the demolition of the non-historic structure at 731 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: W James Overton Second: Linda Ramsay

Reed Engle - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye

Gene Hutchinson - Not Present

Sidney J. Johnson - Aye
Brian Judson - Abstain
W James Overton - Aye
Linda Ramsay - Aye
Ebony Simpson - Aye

7. Petition of Ameir Mustafa for Signs for Minds | H-11-4411-2 | 109 West Broughton Street | Sign

Attachment: <u>Staff Report.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet.pdf</u>

Board Action:

Approval for the illuminated principal use projecting sign. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: W James Overton Second: Linda Ramsay

Reed Engle - Aye

Nicholas Henry	- Aye	
Gene Hutchinson	- Not Present	
Sidney J. Johnson	- Aye	
Brian Judson	- Abstain	
W James Overton	- Aye	
Linda Ramsay	- Aye	
Ebony Simpson	- Aye	

VII. REGULAR AGENDA

8. Petition of The Time Machine Portrait Company | H-11-4394-2 | 205 West River Street | Sign

Attachment: Staff Report.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet.pdf
Attachment: Addendum.pdf

Mr. Tracy Grant was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ward gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for two principal use signs for the business; an illuminated principal use fascia sign and a free standing sign.

Ms. Ward reported that staff recommends elimination of the fascia sign which is not located on the signable area of the building. A bracket that is incompatible with the character of the iron balcony was constructed to support the sign and it obscures the shape of the balcony from the street. Staff recommends a restudy of the color scheme of the freestanding sign to match the existing sign for Scarlett's, which is below the proposed sign on the standard.

Ms. Ward stated that the bracket in the Scarlett's sign was originally designed to hold two fascia signs on the structure. Therefore, staff recommends approval of the amended sign package with the condition that they bring it into compliance with the ordinance, which means that the Scarlett sign must be ten feet above grade and the top of the new sign for Old Savannah Photo does not exceed the 16 feet of height.

Mr. Judson asked Ms. Ward if the Board was being asked to approve an after-the-fact approval for the principal use fascia sign that is above the balcony.

Ms. Ward answered no. The petitioner installed the sign temporarily for staff to review and for him to provide a picture of it. The petitioner then removed the sign.

Ms. Ramsay wanted to know if the math has been done to determine that if the sign is raised ten feet that it will still be in compliance.

Ms. Ward said each sign can be no more than three feet. There is six feet of height to work with. The original full sign did allow for the two signs to be on there. Therefore, she believes the petitioner might be able to use the height, but through his drawings, he will only have to raise the entire sign one-half foot.

Mr. Engle wanted to know which option the staff is recommending approval for.

Ms. Ward said the staff was recommending approval of option two which shows the free standing signs with the condition that the petitioner agrees to come into compliance with the ordinance.

Dr. Henry asked about the sandwich board.

Ms. Ward said this would be a question to ask the petitioner.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Tracy Grant, General Manager, said they originally were going to put the sign onto the doorway, but there is not enough space. Therefore, they will put the sign on the front of the property. An existing balcony is here and they created a bracket system to hold up the sign. They only put it up initially for them to take pictures of the sign. Presently, they do not have a sign up. The second proposal they came up with was to remove the sign onto the street. Scarlett is another business and is on the first floor below them. He is not sure how their sign was originally designed. If Scarlett reduces the size of their sign, both signs should be able to fit. Mr. Grant said a sandwich board is presently here, but there is no signage on it, just pictures.

Mr. Tiras Petrea, City of Savannah Zoning Inspector, stated that the sandwich board is still considered to be a sign and is not permitted. Mr. Petrea said he will work with the petitioner to let it remain until the new sign is installed.

Mr. Engle said the two signs could be built up. The bottom of the Old Savannah Portrait sign is ten feet. The overall height is twelve feet-six inches and the sign is two and one-half feet tall. The height of the sign is ten feet; therefore, the two signs should be able to be placed here.

Mr. Grant said the first sign designed was to be the same size and shape as Scarlett's sign. They wanted to keep the same symmetry. If they move this sign, they will only have the smaller sign versus the two signs.

Mr. Engle stated that maybe Mr. Grant missed his point, but the other sign could go on a pole. They are showing an overall height of twelve feet-six inches. The sign will be two-feet-six inches, therefore, the sign is ten feet. The pole could be raised.

Ms. Ward stated the pole is already here.

Mr. Engle said maybe the Scarlett sign could be pushed down a little and the Old Savannah Portrait sign could be pushed upward.

Mr. Grant said the pole is already existing with Scarlett's sign on it. As he has stated, this is another business not associated with them. Scarlett has signage on their awnings above their doorway and they have a sign in the front.

Mr. Judson said presently the Board is trying to come up with a resolution for the Old Savannah Portrait sign. But, the Board cannot render a decision on the Scarlett sign.

Mr. Grant stated that he will discuss Scarlett's sign with them today.

Ms. Ramsay asked if Scarlett's sign is grandfathered in.

Ms. Ward answered no. The petitioner's original approval was based on the condition that they ensure a ten foot clearing.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Judson stated that he believes the Board should make a decision regarding the principal use fascia sign as to whether they believe it is appropriate.

Mr. Engle questioned the awning sign.

Ms. Ward stated she believes that the petitioner would have to address the graphic that would be applied to the sign. She said a business is allowed to have a principal use sign and in addition, they can have an awning sign. There are a multitude of signs that are permitted.

Mr. Judson asked Mr. Grant to please clarify Mr. Engle's question about the awning sign.

Mr. Grant clarified that the awning sign is temporary.

Board Action:

Approve the amended petition for the freestanding sign with the condition that it not exceed three feet-six inches in height nor extend more than 16 feet above the ground and the facia sign and sandwich sign are eliminated. Zoning Inspector Tiras Petrea stated that the sandwich board sign could remain on private property until the principal use sign was installed.

Vote Results

Motion: W James Overton Second: Nicholas Henry

Reed Engle - Aye
Nicholas Henry - Aye
Gene Hutchinson - Not Present

Sidney J. Johnson - Aye Brian Judson - Abstain

W James Overton	- Aye
Linda Ramsay	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

9. Petition of Gary Udinsky | H-11-4398-2 | 530 East Liberty Street | Exterior Alterations

Attachment: <u>Staff Report.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet.pdf</u>

Upon motion of **Ms. Ramsay**, seconded by **Mr. Johnson** and carried, this petition was moved from the Consent Agenda to the Regular Agenda.

Mr. Gary Udinsky was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Sarah Ward gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for exterior alterations as follows: removal of the 12 foot by 14 foot industrial garage door; installation of a new storefront entry in the existing garage door opening with a three bay division.

Ms. Ward reported that the staff recommends approval to replace the garage opening with a storefront entry.

PETITIONER COMMENT

Mr. Udinsky stated that he has worked very closely with Ms. Ward and staff to come up with the plan for the project.

Ms. Ramsay wanted to know what kind of materials would be used.

Mr. Udinsky said the materials are wood and fiberglass. They will be painted and then you would not be able to tell what they are.

Ms. Ramsay stated she believes the Board has issues with non-wood columns on the ground floor. Would there be sidelights or panels?

Mr. Udinsky said they put a piece of wood against the wall and build the panels. The panels will be on the second floor.

Ms. Ramsay said she was somewhat confused with the drawings.

Mr. Udinsky said it is a wood based material. On the inside will be glass.

Ms. Ramsay asked what is immediately above.

Mr. Udinsky answered panels will be on the second floor.

Mr. Engle asked if they are changing the concrete blocks. He agrees that the columns need to be simplified.

Mr. Udinsky answered no; the blocks will remain the same. Whatever the Board wants

them to do they will do it.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation stated that they will be happy to consult with the petitioner on his project. They will be happy to share some drawings with him. Mr. Carey stated that he agrees that it is a simple modest building and they would not like to see too much done with it.

Board Action:

Approve the petition to replace the garage door with storefront with the condition that the columns are simplified and resubmitted to staff for final approval.

Vote Results

Motion: Reed Engle Second: W James Overton

Reed Engle - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye

Gene Hutchinson - Not Present

Sidney J. Johnson- AyeBrian Judson- AbstainW James Overton- AyeLinda Ramsay- AyeEbony Simpson- Aye

10. Petition of Steve Minish | H-11-4403-2 | 518 East Gaston Street | New Construction, Parts I and II

Attachment: Staff Report.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet.pdf

Ms. Ward gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for new construction, Parts I and II, of a two-story wood frame carriage house on the rear of the property at 518 East Gaston Street. A General Development Plan was submitted on March 9, 2011. The Plan has been accepted by most of the infrastructure departments with minor comments from Traffic Engineer and Streets Maintenance to show lighting and concrete pad on the plan.

The petitioner provided the staff with a model and Ms. Ward passed it to the Board for their review.

Ms. Ward reported that the staff recommends that a restudy of the window sizes be enlarged on the north elevation; revise the drawings to show a wooden stair, landing, and

support; the trim details match the main house with a header, side trim and sills; the color pallet match the main house for trim, stairs and landing, doors, windows; and roof.

Ms. Ramsay asked what will be the roofing materials.

Ms. Ward answered that the roof will be asphalt shingles. The proposal is that the materials match the materials on the main building.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

- Mr. Steve Minish was present on behalf of the petition.
- **Ms. Simpson** asked the petitioner if the panel doors are one-over-one.
- Mr. Minish answered yes.
- **Mr. Judson** stated that the petitioner has given the Board his design model. However, in looking at the photo, he asked if the fourth building was across the lane.
- Mr. Minish answered that is the garage.
- **Mr. Engle** said a gutter is shown on the roof edge, but it is not required.
- **Mr. Minish** stated that gutters are not shown in the picture.
- Ms. Ramsay asked the staff if there is history of a two-story building being on the lane.
- **Ms. Ward** answered that on the lane, there was a one-story building. The Sanborn map shows that a one and one-half building was across the lane at one time.
- **Ms. Ramsay** asked why is the petitioner proposing to use a nine foot ceiling on the first floor.
- **Mr. Minish** answered that the owner wants the ceiling to be nine feet. A washer and dryer will be located here.
- **Ms. Ramsay** asked if only a washer and dryer will be here and no living space.
- **Mr. Minish** said no living space is on the first floor.
- **Ms. Ramsay** stated with just a washer and dryer on the first floor and no living space, a nine foot ceiling seems unnecessary.
- **Mr. Engle** said if the ceiling was lowered to eight feet, the roof would have a better pitch.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Daniel Cary of Historic Savannah Foundation stated they agree with the staff's recommendation and everything else that has been said thus far. Their only additional point is the choice of the garage panel doors. The petitioner is showing six panel doors, but

the HSF Architectural Review Committee is suggesting four panel garage overhead doors. However, they don't want to impose a hardship on the petitioner.

Board Action:

Approval of the two-story carriage house with the following conditions to be resubmitted to staff for final approval: 1. Enlarge the windows on the north elevation; 2. Revise drawings to show a wooden stair, landing, and supports; 3. Trim details to match the main house with a header, side trim and sills; 4. Confirm that color pallet will match the main house for trim, stairs and landing, doors, windows, and roof; and 5. Install four panel flush overhead garage doors.

- PASS

Vote Results

Motion: W James Overton Second: Nicholas Henry

Reed Engle - Aye
Nicholas Henry - Aye
Cone Hytchingen

Gene Hutchinson - Not Present Sidney J. Johnson - Aye

Sidney J. Johnson - Aye
Brian Judson - Abstain
W James Overton - Aye
Linda Ramsay - Nay
Ebony Simpson - Aye

11. Petition of John T. Scott | H-11-4404-2 | 210 West Hall Street | Addition

Attachment: Staff Report.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet.pdf

Mr. John T. Scott was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Sarah Ward gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting after-the-fact approval for a rear addition within the existing second floor at 210 West Hall Street. The addition consists of an eight foot by seven foot room clad in wood lap siding with five and one-half inch exposure to match the existing wood siding on the rear of the building. It features a four foot wide by four foot tall wood frame metal clad window with a 32 inch wide wood door on the east and west sides. The hip roof will be surfaced in asphalt shingles and feature a one-by-eight wood fascia and soffit.

Ms. Ward reported that staff recommends after-the-fact approval of the addition with the condition that the window be replaced to meet the standards and be resubmitted to staff for final approval.

Mr. Engle said he was a somewhat confused with drawing nine. The elevation shows a gable roof, but a section shows a hip roof with skylights on the roof.

Ms. Ward stated that she believes it is actually a hip roof. She believes the elevation is incorrect, but the petitioner can clarify this.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Scott stated that in 2008 Ms. Reiter approved the addition. When she approved it, he did the addition. He used vinyl windows.

Mr. Judson asked Ms. Ward what kind of materials were listed to be used on the project.

Ms. Ward stated that the paperwork submitted to staff shows that the materials would be wood clad windows; it could be wrapped in vinyl.

Mr. Engle said the drawing on page eight shows the gable roof with something in the gable. He asked if this is skylights.

Mr. Scott answered that it is a hip roof with one skylight.

Mr. Engle asked if wood or vinyl will be used.

Mr. Scott stated vinyl.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Daniel Carey of Historic Savannah Foundation asked if additional fees are assessed for after-the-fact approval.

Mr. Judson answered "no" to Mr. Carey's question regarding whether additional fees are assessed for after-the-fact approval. However, the Board has discussed the after-the-fact approval additional fees many times. This petition is probably not the prime example, but the Board has had many frustrations with the after-the-fact approvals. The Board's involvement in after-the-fact approval is whether or not the design falls within their purview. The Board has no jurisdiction with the additional fees.

Mr. Judson explained that the petitioner made reference to Ms. Reiter approval of the third floor addition or some other addition.

Ms. Ward stated that Ms. Reiter made a determination that it was not visible from the public right-of-way.

Mr. Engle said they can never depend on vegetation screening. It does not last. The next owner may say they don't like crepe myrtle and I am going to cut them down to four feet. The screening by vegetation should not be rational in his opinion.

Mr. Overton asked what was approved on the previous application. Is this petition the same or has something been added?

Ms. Ward explained that what is before the Board today is new. What the petitioner spoke of was three years ago. An application was never submitted and nothing was required.

Mr. Overton asked, therefore, this is a new application.

Ms. Ward answered that this application is entirely new.

Mr. Overton for clarification stated, therefore, the petition was not executed before and now the Board is looking at a new application.

Mr. Engle stated he believes the windows at a minimum do not meet the standards. They should be replaced with wood clad. What about the skylights?

Dr. Henry said from the public right-of-way, he believes the skylights will not be seen.

Mr. Scott said the roof was put on. They have no problems changing the windows. The skylight is not seen from the public right-of-way.

Board Action:

Approve the addition with the condition that the window be replaced to meet the standards and be - PASS resubmitted to staff for final approval.

Vote Results

Reed Engle

Motion: Nicholas Henry Second: Sidney J. Johnson

Nicholas Henry - Aye
Gene Hutchinson - Not Present
Sidney J. Johnson - Aye
Brian Judson - Abstain
W James Overton - Aye
Linda Ramsay - Aye
Ebony Simpson - Aye

12. Petition of Rebecca Lynch for Lynch Associates Architects | H-11-4405-2 | 205 East Hall Street | Exterior Alterations and Additions

- Aye

Attachment: <u>Staff Report.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet.pdf</u>

Ms. Rebecca Lynch was present for the petition.

Ms. Ward gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for exterior

alterations and additions to the property at 205 East Hall Street.

Ms. Ward reported that staff recommends approval on the exterior alterations and additions with verification of the replacement windows materials; the new window profile and the French door specification. She reported that included in the packet on the back of the page of the application was the original submittal. Upon the applicant meeting with staff, staff felt it was important for the petitioner to retain the historic addition on the back of the property and the petitioner revised their submittal to do so. Therefore, it is included for the Board's consideration today.

- **Mr. Overton** asked if the eight feet comes out as far as the duplex house.
- **Ms. Ward** answered that it is supposed to come out further.
- **Mr. Overton** asked if the petitioner is within their lot coverage.
- **Ms.** Ward answered that they are well within the lot coverage.
- **Ms. Ramsay** asked what kind of shutters are being proposed.
- **Ms. Ward** answered that the shutters are double bi-fold.
- **Mr. Engle** said one problem he had is with the siding. He believes it should be different siding. They should not copy exactly the original siding. He understood there is a corner board, but he does not see how it could be said that the standards are met on this when in fact it is the exact copy of the original fabric.
- **Ms. Ward** said she recommended approval because she believes it is a good compromise.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Ms. Lynch stated with regards to the question of the replacement windows, they will provide true divided lights. With regard to Mr. Engle's question about the extension, they were endeavoring to meet the client's needs without making too many different changes on the back of the building. Because it was such a small extension between the porch and the new addition, they tried to break between the materials. Ms. Lynch said they would prefer using the same pattern all the way across because it is such a small addition.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Daniel Carey of History Savannah Foundation stated that they did not have an objection to the eight feet. Ms. Lynch outlined the reasons why this would work better not to change the siding and HSF believes this is a good way to complement it.

BOARD DISCUSSION

- **Mr. Judson** believes there should be some differentiation.
- **Dr. Henry** said he goes for aesthetic. He is familiar with this block.

Board Action:

Approve the exterior alterations and addition with the new window muntin profile, and French door specifications to be submitted to staff for final approval.

- PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Ebony Simpson Second: Linda Ramsay

Reed Engle - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye

Gene Hutchinson - Not Present

Sidney J. Johnson - Aye
Brian Judson - Abstain
W James Overton - Aye
Linda Ramsay - Aye
Ebony Simpson - Aye

13. Petition of Christina Swenson | H-11-4406-2 | 433 Tattnall Street | Exterior Alterations

Attachment: Staff Report.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet.pdf

Ms. Ward gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for exterior alterations to a non-historic addition at 433 Tattnall Street. An amendment for repointing the exterior brick on the historic structure is also being requested for consideration.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

- **Ms. Christina Swenson** was present on behalf of the petition.
- **Mr. Engle** stated that the mortar mixture on the bricks is far too hard. Also it is smeared over the bricks. The problem is approximately one-half of the bricks are completed.
- Mr. Judson asked Ms. Swenson how much of the brick work is already completed.
- **Ms. Swenson** answered that one-half of the north elevation is completed.
- **Mr. Engle** said the past brick work is beige, but what is being done now is white. Therefore, the joint profile does not match the historic condition.
- **Ms. Ramsay** asked what is the material for the sills.
- **Ms. Swenson** answered that it would be an extension of the window and the sills would be wood clad.

Ms. Ramsay believes that a detail would be better on the stucco underneath the sills.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Daniel Carey of Historic Savannah Foundation stated that their concerns are if there is any way the stucco could be scored as the single mass may be too much with the horizontal lines; has the petitioner considered contemporary light pattern differentiation as well as putting a single side light on the French doors. This would add some balance.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Judson said with the repointing concern, the Board might want to consider this petition into parts.

Mr. Engle stated that the petitioner may wish to request a continuance on the repointing to give the Board the opportunity to view the work thus far. Ms. Swenson would be able to develop a plan to finish the work and provide specifications that are consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of the Historic properties with regard to repointing historic structures.

Mr. Overton wanted to know if the Board has the authority to initiate a stop work order.

Mr. Judson answered no, but the petitioner can do a voluntary stop work order. He explained to Ms. Swenson that the Board does not have the purview or authority to move for a continuance. But they can entertain a request from her for a continuance. Clearly, what is before the Board now are two separate issues. Mr. Judson explained that regarding the repointing, Ms. Swenson may wish to ask for the continuance.

Ms. Swenson requested a continuance on the amendment portion of her petition which is the repointing and after-the-fact approval on the portion that has been completed.

Board Action:

Approve the alterations to the rear addition with the condition that the light pattern in the window and doors be differentiated from the main house and - PASS the stucco feature a scoring pattern and be resubmitted to staff for final approval.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry Second: Sidney J. Johnson

Reed Engle - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye

Gene Hutchinson - Not Present

Sidney J. Johnson - Aye Brian Judson - Abstain

W James Overton	- Aye
Linda Ramsay	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

Board Action:

Continued the request for repointing to May 11, 2011 with no further work to occur on the brick - PASS until a decision is rendered by the Board.

Vote Results

Motion: Ebony Simpson Second: W James Overton

Reed Engle - Aye
Nicholas Henry - Aye
Gene Hutchinson - Not Present
Sidney J. Johnson - Aye
Brian Judson - Abstain
W James Overton - Aye

W James Overton - Aye Linda Ramsay - Aye Ebony Simpson - Aye

14. Petition of Kathy Ledvina | H-11-4407-2 | 323 East Jones Street | Exterior Alterations

Attachment: Staff Report.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet.pdf

Ms Ward gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for exterior alterations. **Ms. Ledvina** could not be present at the meeting and asked that that Item 3 of their petition requesting to install a 42 inch tall railing around the roof-top garden area be continued to the May 11, 2011 meeting in order for her to present samples of the product. Samples were there but it was the wrong product.

Ms. Ward reported that the staff recommends reducing the footprint of the railing to be pulled away from north (Jones Street) and east (Habersham Street) exterior walls to not be visible from the primary streets. Staff also recommends further consultation with the Traffic Engineering Department and Parking Services at the City to determine if the curbcut, drive-way, and removal of off-street parking on Habersham Street can be permitted. The curb may not exceed 20 feet in width and the sidewalk must serve as a continuous uninterrupted pathway.

Mr. Engle said what bothers him is there is no site plan. When he looks at page four, the only thing preventing a vehicle is the rear elevation. The trees are within the garden.

Ms. Ward said the standards for railings are they should not be visible from the front elevation.

Mr. Engles believes that three trees will have to be cut down so the driveway could go on the back.

Ms. Ward was not sure about the trees as this would be a decision of the City departments.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

Board Action:

Approve the exterior modifications to the garden - PASS

level entrance.

Vote Results

Motion: Reed Engle Second: W James Overton

Reed Engle - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye

Gene Hutchinson - Not Present

Sidney J. Johnson- AyeBrian Judson- AbstainW James Overton- AyeLinda Ramsay- AyeEbony Simpson- Aye

Board Action:

Continued the request of the rooftop railing and the modification of the privacy wall along Habersham Street to May 11, 2011 for submittal of a site plan and further consultation with Traffic Engineering, - PASS Parking Services, and Park and Tree to review the appropriateness of the curb cut on Habersham Street.

Vote Results

Motion: Reed Engle Second: Ebony Simpson

Reed Engle - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye

Gene Hutchinson - Not Present

Sidney J. Johnson - Aye Brian Judson - Abstain

W James Overton	- Aye
Linda Ramsay	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

15. <u>Petition of Gretchen Callejas for Greenline Architecture | H-11-4408-2 | 108 West Gordon Street | Additions and exterior alterations</u>

Attachment: Staff Report.pdf

Attachment: <u>Application and Submittal Packet.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet Plans and Elevations.pdf</u>

Ms. Sarah Ward gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for an elevator addition on the principal structure at 108 West Gordon Street and to enlarge and add a second story to the non-historic two-car garage fronting Wayne Street. Ms. Ward gave the Board a copy of the addendum for the elevator addition that was submitted to her by the petitioner after the packets were sent to them.

Ms. Ward reported that staff recommends approval of the elevator and garage addition including the pedestrian entry gate.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

- **Mr. John Deering** was present on behalf of the petition.
- Mr. Engle asked Mr. Deering if there would be detailing.
- Mr. Deering answered no.
- **Mr. Engle** said he would love to see more greenery.
- Mr. Deering said they thought about growing ivy on the wall. They will do a green wall.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Daniel Carey of Historic Savannah Foundation said he has talked with the petitioner about the elevator shaft. Mr. Carey said instead of the green wall may be something could be done in a modest way to cover up the shaft.

BOARD DISCUSSION

- **Ms. Ramsay** said she likes the green wall. A modification could be submitted to staff.
- **Mr. Judson** stated that he likes the green wall as well.
- **Mr. Deering** said they will submit a drawing modification to staff.

Board Action:		
Doard Action:		

Approve the elevator and garage additions including the pedestrian entry gate with the condition that a green screen and stucco frame be incorporated on - PASS the south wall of the elevator shaft and be resubmitted to staff for final approval.

Vote Results

Motion: Linda Ramsay Second: W James Overton

Reed Engle - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye - Not Present Gene Hutchinson Sidney J. Johnson - Ave Brian Judson - Abstain W James Overton - Aye Linda Ramsay - Aye **Ebony Simpson** - Aye

16. Petition of Ameir Mustafa for Signs for Minds | H-11-4410-2 | 15 West Broughton Street | Sign

Attachment: <u>Staff Report.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet.pdf</u>

Mr. Ameir Mustafa was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Sarah Ward gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for an illuminated principal use projecting sign at 15 West Broughton Street for the Shipwreck business.

Ms. Ward reported that staff recommends approval upon verification that the dimensions for bracket (thickness and length) are appropriate.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Mustafa stated that the design of the sign has changed since the original submittal, but due to the recent relocation of his office, he could not resubmit the designs for consideration. He said that the sign would be illuminated from two gooseneck lights projecting onto a framed sandblasted sign. The sign will remain two and one-half feet tall by five feet wide.

Mr. Overton asked Mr. Mustafa why the light is not shown.

Mr. Mustafa stated that he and the owner were deciding about the lights. But he will submit the light plan to staff.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Ms. Ramsay asked Ms. Ward if staff was comfortable with approving the lighting plan and the projecting principal use sign revision.

Ms. Ward answered that she is comfortable with approving the light plan. But, she wanted to be sure that the Board is comfortable because the petitioner has indicated that a lot of changes have been made to the sign. Therefore, the sign may not look like what the Board is seeing today.

Board Action:

Approve the projecting principal use sign with the details of the revised design to be submitted to staff for final approval.

- PASS

Vote Results

Motion: W James Overton Second: Sidney J. Johnson

Reed Engle - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye Gene Hutchinson - Not Present

Sidney J. Johnson - Ave Brian Judson - Abstain W James Overton - Aye Linda Ramsay - Aye **Ebony Simpson** - Aye

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSIONS

IX. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

17. Amended Petition of Linda Ramsay | H-10-4307-2 | 122 E. Taylor St. | Color Change

Attachment: Staff Decision 4307-2 (Amended).pdf Attachment: Submittal Packet 4307-2 (Amended).pdf

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

18. Amended Petition of Harley Krinsky | H-110120-4370-2 | 411 West Congress Street | Sign Color Change

Attachment: Staff Decision 4370-2.pdf Attachment: Submittal Packet 4370-2.pdf

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

19. Petition of Alethia Canady for Coastal Canvas | H-11-4386(S)-2 | 341 Bull St. | Awning

Attachment: <u>Staff Decision 4386(S)-2.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet 4386(S)-2.pdf</u>

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

20. Petition of Sign-A-Rama | H-11-4387(S)-2 | 300 Bull St. | Color Change, Sign

Attachment: <u>Staff Decision 4387(S)-2.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet 4387(S)-2.pdf</u>

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

21. Petition of Katheryn Demicco | H-11-4388(S)-2 | 124 E. Oglethorpe Ave. | Stucco Repair

Attachment: <u>Staff Decsion 4388(S)-2.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet 4388(S)-2.pdf</u>

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

22. Petition of Joanne Forkin | H-11-4389(S)-2 | 22 West Harris St. | Color Change Door Only

Attachment: <u>Staff Decision 4389(S)-2.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet 4389(S)-2.pdf</u>

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

23. Petition of Robert B. Aiken | H-11-4390(S)-2 | 108 East Gaston St. | Color Change

Attachment: <u>Staff Decision 4390(S)-2.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet 4390(S)-2.pdf</u>

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

24. Petition of Kevin Cohen | H-11-4392(S)-2 | 128 East Broughton St. | Color Change

Attachment: <u>Staff Decision 4392(S)-2.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet 4392(S)-2.pdf</u>

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

25. Petition of Commonwealth Construction | H-11-4393(S)-2 | 403 E. Gordon St. | Roof Repair

Attachment: <u>Staff Decision 4393(S)-2.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet 4393(S)-2.pdf</u>

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

26. Petition of Wendell Burns | H-11-4395(S)-2 | 421 Jefferson St. | Color Change

Attachment: <u>Staff Decision 4395(S)-2.pdf</u> Attachment: Submittal Packet 4395(S)-2.pdf

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

27. Petition of Richards Masonry LLC | H-11-4396(S)-2 | 222 E. Jones St. | Roof Repair and Repointing

Attachment: <u>Staff Decision 4396(S)-2.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet 4396(S)-2.pdf</u>

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

28. Petition of Clifford Caldwell | H-11-4399(S)-2 | 326 Price St. | Color Change

Attachment: <u>Staff Decision 4399(S)-2.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet 4399(S)-2.pdf</u>

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

29. Petition of Shannon Lancaster for Ed Wiggins & Associates, Inc. | H-11-4400(S)-2 | 322 E. Harris St. | Roof Repairs

Attachment: <u>Staff Decision 4400(S)-2.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet 4400(S)-2.pdf</u>

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

Ms. Ward was hopeful that the Board remembers that at an earlier time, they received a petition to demolish and reconstruct the carriage house at 322 East Harris Street and it was approved. However, when the petitioner hired a contractor, they decided to use the plans to rehabilitate the building, install the windows and not demolish the building.

30. Petition of Greg Harris and Jane Garnett Harris | H-11-4409(S)-2 | 523/525 E. Harris St. | Color Change

Attachment: <u>Staff Decision 4409(S)-2.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet 4409(S)-2.pdf</u>

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

31. Petition of Neil Dawson | H-11-4412(S)-2 | 28 Drayton St. | Louvers

Attachment: <u>Staff Decision 4412(S)-2.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet 4412(S)-2.pdf</u>

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

32. <u>Petition of Becki Harness for Coastal Heritage Society | H-11-4413(S)-2 | 303 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd | Color Change</u>

Attachment: <u>Staff Decision 4413(S)-2.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet 4413(S)-2.pdf</u>

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

33. Petition of Alex and Robin Moore | H-11-4414(S)-2 | 607 Tattnall St. | Shutters

Attachment: <u>Staff Decision 4414(S)-2.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet 4414(S)-2.pdf</u>

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

34. Petition of Beryl Kemp Moore | H-11-4416(S)-2 | 538 E. Jones St. | Roof Replacement

Attachment: <u>Staff Decision 4416(S)-2.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet 4416(S)-2.pdf</u>

No Action Required. Staff Approved.

X. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

35. Vtrecht Store on MLK

Mr. Judson said in an earlier meeting, the Board discussed that this sign clearly exceeds the sign band.

Ms. Ward said she will pull the plans to see what has happened and will forward a report to the Board.

XI. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

36. Chatham County Courthouse | 124 Bull Street | condensor unit

Attachment: Staff report on county condensor unit 040711.pdf

Ms. Ward stated that the County is aware of the large condensor units on the County Courthouse. The County has not come up with an appropriate solution. She has forwarded a report to the Board of her findings.

XII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, and ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

XIII. OTHER BUSINESS

New Business

37. Resignation of Gene Hutchinson

Mr. Judson reported that he received a letter from Mr. Hutchinson today notifying him that effective immediately, he has resigned from the Historic District Review Board.

The Board asked that the City Clerk be informed that there are two positions on the HBR that need to be filled immediately as this Board has a high quorum number.

XIV. ADJOURNMENT

38. Next Meeting - Wednesday May 11, 2011 at 2:00 p.m. in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, MPC, 112 E. State Street

39. Adjourned

There being no further business to come before the Board, Mr. Judson adjourned the meeting at 5:44 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Sarah P. Ward Preservation Director

SPW:mem

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting summary minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room April 13, 2011 2:00 P.M. Meeting Minutes

interested party.