



SAVANNAH HISTORIC DISTRICT
BOARD OF REVIEW

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room
April 8, 2015 1:00 p.m.
Meeting Minutes

APRIL 8, 2015 HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW REGULAR MEETING

HDRB Members Present: Keith Howington, Chair
Ebony Simpson, Vice-Chair
Dr. Henry Nicholas
Stephen Merriman, Jr.
Marjorie Weibe-Reed
Tess Scheer
Dr. Robin Williams

HDRB Members Not Present: Zena McClain, Esq., Parliamentarian
Debra Caldwell
Justin Gunther

MPC Staff Present: Tom Thomson, Executive Director
Ellen Harris, Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation
Leah G. Michalak, Historic Preservation Planner
Sara Farr, Historic Preservation Planner
Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

City of Savannah Staff Present: Lorie Odom, Downtown Zoning Inspector

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

1. [Call to Order](#)

Mr. Howington called the meeting to order at 1:05 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. He outlined the purpose and role of the Historic District Board of Review.

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

2. [Petition of Pat Shay for Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects | 14-006036-COA | 229 West Congress Street | Signs and Awnings](#)

- Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Submittal Package - Awnings.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Submittal Package - Drawings.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Submittal Package - Floor Plan.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for awning colors, canopy colors, signage and graphics at 229 West Congress Street, because the colors, signage and materials meet the standards and are visually compatible. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry
Second: Robin Williams

Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

3. [Petition of Sam Carroll | 15-000744-COA | 111 West Gordon Street | Addition](#)

- Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Photographs.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Submittal Packet 1.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Submittal Packet 2.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Submittal Packet 3.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the proposed new addition at 111 West Gordon Street with the following conditions:

1. The proposed fiberglass doors and window are revised to an approved material, because otherwise, the addition meets the standards and is visually compatible; - PASS

2. The HVAC units be screened from the public right-of-way with screening approved by staff.

Recommend approval of the lot coverage variance to the Zoning Board of Appeals, because the variance criteria are met.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry

Second: Robin Williams

Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

4. [Petition of Gary Webb | 15-001022-COA | 411 East York Street | Signs](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet 1.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet 2.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the projecting principal use sign at 411 East York Street, because the sign meets the standards and is visually compatible. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry

Second: Robin Williams

Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

5. [Petition of Roger Kuneyl | 15-001281-COA | 115 East Congress Street | Signs](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet 1.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet 2.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for two new projecting principal use signs at 115 East Congress Street. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry
Second: Robin Williams

Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

6. [Petition of Lisa S. Pritchard | 15-001343-COA | 301 Tattnall Street | Signs, Awnings](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Package 1.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Package 2.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a projecting principal use sign and awning at 303 Tattnall Street, - PASS because they meet the standards and are visually compatible.

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams
Second: Nicholas Henry

Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Abstain
Ebony Simpson	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

7. [Petition of Scot Morrison | 15-001365-COA | 521 East Charlton Street | Alterations](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations to the rear porch at 521 East Charlton Street with the condition that the siding has a smooth finish. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry

Second: Robin Williams

Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

8. [Petition of Leslie Belliveau | 15-001376-COA | 548 East Jones Street | Addition and Fence](#)

Attachment: [Staff Report.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a fence, a rear porch addition, and to replace the windows on the three dormers for the property located at 548 East Jones Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval: - PASS

- Increase the size of the rafters to 2-by-6, increased the size of the posts to 6-by-6, add posts on either side of the stair, and add simple caps and bases to the posts.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry

Second: Robin Williams

Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye

Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

9. [Petition of Kevin Johnson | 15-001379-COA | 10 West Liberty Street | Signs](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Drawings.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the free-standing principal use sign at 10 West Liberty Street with the condition that the site is approved by the city traffic engineer and park and tree director, because otherwise it meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry
Second: Robin Williams

10. [Petition of Dawson Architects | 15-001383-COA | 512 West Oglethorpe Avenue | Amendments to New Construction Parking Garage](#)

Attachment: [Staff Report.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for an amendment to a previously approved New Construction Parking Garage for the vacant property located at 512 West Oglethorpe Avenue with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards. - PASS
- Ensure that the new service door is inset not less than 3 inches from the building face.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry
Second: Robin Williams
Nicholas Henry - Aye
Keith Howington - Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye

Marjorie W Reed	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

11. [Adopt April 8, 2015 Agenda](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby adopt the April 8, 2015 Meeting Agenda. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Marjorie W Reed
Second: Tess Scheer
Nicholas Henry - Aye
Keith Howington - Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye
Marjorie W Reed - Aye
Tess Scheer - Aye
Ebony Simpson - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

12. [Approve March 11, 2015 Meeting Minutes](#)

Attachment: [03-11-2015 Minutes.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve March 11, 2015 Meeting Minutes. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Tess Scheer
Second: Marjorie W Reed
Nicholas Henry - Aye
Keith Howington - Aye
Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye
Marjorie W Reed - Aye

Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

13. [Petition of Teresa Partridge | 15-001323-COA | 5 Whitaker Street | Balcony Addition](#)

Board Action:

Remove the petition from the meeting of April 8, 2015 at the request of the petitioner. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry

Second: Robin Williams

Nicholas Henry - Aye

Keith Howington - Abstain

Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye

Marjorie W Reed - Aye

Tess Scheer - Aye

Ebony Simpson - Aye

Robin Williams - Aye

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

14. [Petition of Christian Sottile for Sottile & Sottile | 14-005099-COA | 215 West Broughton Street | New Construction: Part 2 Design Details](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition to the May 13, 2015 Meeting at the petitioner's request. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Marjorie W Reed

Nicholas Henry - Aye

Keith Howington - Abstain

Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye

Marjorie W Reed - Aye

Tess Scheer - Aye

Ebony Simpson	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

15. [Petition of Neil Dawson, Dawson Architects | 14-005106-COA | 512 West Oglethorpe Avenue | New Construction Hotel: Part II, Design Details](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition at the request of - PASS the petitioner.

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams
Second: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.
Nicholas Henry - Aye
Keith Howington - Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye
Marjorie W Reed - Abstain
Tess Scheer - Aye
Ebony Simpson - Aye
Robin Williams - Aye

VIII. REGULAR AGENDA

16. [Petition of Gavin Macrae-Gibson | 14-003508-COA | 31 East Jones Street | Fence Alteration](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

This petition was moved from the Consent agenda to the Regular agenda at the request of a member of the public.

Ms. Harris informed the Board that the petitioner was unable to come to the meeting today, and therefore requested a continuance.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the project for fence alterations at 31 East Jones Street. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry

Second: Robin Williams	
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Ebony Simpson	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye

17. [Petition of Wubbena Architects | 14-006061-COA | 615 Montgomery Street | New Construction: Parts I and II](#)

- Attachment: [Staff Report.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Context Images.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Historic Building Map - Gaston Ward.pdf](#)
Attachment: [SAGIS Map.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Drawings.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Specs, Materials, and Colors.pdf](#)

Mr. Jim Wubbena and Mr. Clegg Ivey were present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for New Construction Part I and Part II of a 2-story commercial building to be located on the vacant portion of the lot at 615 Montgomery Street. A 1-story brick building, which was built in 1990, exists on the northernmost portion of the lot. It was originally built for use by a church group and now houses the "The Guild Hall." This new construction project will be an expansion of the Guild Hall's services. The building is designed to face Montgomery Street with access to the area and to the parking from Ell Street. The building's footprint is proposed to be approximately 7,440 square feet, which does not qualify as Large Scale Development. The petitioner attended an SPR meeting on January 22, 2015; no comments pertained to this review.

Ms. Michalak explained that the Board reviewed Part I for this project at the February 11, 2015 HDBR meeting. The petition was continued at the petitioners request with the understanding that the project could return to the March 11, 2015 HDBR meeting with Parts I and II. The petitioner returned with Parts I and II to the March 11, 2015 HDBR meeting. Both parts were continued at the petitioner's request. The Board requested that the petitioner consider the following items (the petitioner and/or staff responses are italicized below each item):

1. New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass:
 - a. Restudy the ground floor punched openings on the brick portions of the buildings; storefront is more appropriate for this building and more visually compatible.
All punched openings on the ground floor, front façade, have been replaced with the storefront.

b. Revise the design of the two recesses; the stucco material and window design are not appropriate, full curtain wall without stucco would be most appropriate.
The recesses are now designed with curtain wall, spandrel glass between the floors, a cast stone base at the bottom, and brick above.

c. Restudy the reveals on the stucco portion of the building.
The stucco reveals have been restudied and reduced in quantity.

d. Continue the contemporary string course on the stucco portion of the building over the curtain wall/storefront windows on the second floor (both on the east and north facades).
The string course now continues above the storefront windows.

e. Remove the cast stone base from the curtain wall on the ground floor within the northernmost stucco recess.
Because the whole design of the stucco recesses has been changed, cast stone has been added to both recesses instead of removing.

f. Revise the sill height of the curtain wall on the rear façade to relate more directly to the brick water table.
The curtain wall now begins above the brick water table and continues to the underside of the brick parapet.

g. Add an awning over the center, second floor window on the northernmost brick portion of the building.
An awning has been added.

h. Revise the lite divisions within the curtain wall, in the stucco recesses, to match that of the lite divisions on the stucco portion of the building. This includes adding curtain wall sections over the door within the southernmost recess.
The lite divisions have been revised and are consistent throughout the building.

2. New Construction: Part II, Design Details:

a. Revise the stucco finish to be "fine sand" and reselect the stucco paint color selection to be more compatible with the contemporary nature of the building design.
The stucco finish is now a fine finish (aggrelime) and the color has been revised to be "420 white."

b. Reselect the brick and mortar textures and colors to be more compatible with the contemporary nature of the building design.
The brick is now "Hanson, Carolina Collection, Oxford, Monroe" which is a wire cut, smoother, red and brown brick. The mortar remains the same - "Argos Savannah Ivory" which is the same color as the stucco.

c. Revise the proposed colors for the storefront, parapet cap, drip edges, scuppers, downspouts, and hollow metal doors and frames to be more consistent with each other or, at a minimum, within the same color range.
All metal on the building will now be "black."

- d. Provide the following missing information:
- Stucco sample; *Provided as described above.*
 - Cast stone sample, spec, and color selection; *Provided; cast stone has a smooth finish in "White" by "The Cast Stone Company."*
 - Window color selection; *Black.*
 - Storefront window/storefront door/curtain wall specifications. *Provided; "YKK, YHS 50 FS" system in "black."*
 - Garage door specifications and color selection.
 - Metal awning color selection and sample.
- e. Revise the drawings to show the proposed design and locations for all scuppers and downspouts.

The project has been redesigned to have an internal gutter system (roof drains); therefore, there are no gutter or downspouts.

- f. Provide a section that indicates that all door frames are inset not less than 3 inches from the exterior face of the building. (Only applies to the hollow metal man doors on the rear and the man doors on the front façade, southernmost section of the building.

Provided; the inset is 3 inches from the face of the building to the door frame and 12 inches from the face of the building the garage door.

- g. Reselect the casement windows to be a wood or clad product.

The windows are now "Anderson, 400 Series, Casement Window." This is a PVC clad, solid wood sash window that has previously been approved by the Board for use on the new construction, additions, and non-contributing buildings.

- h. Provide a section that indicates that casement windows sashes are inset not less than 3 inches from the exterior of the face of the building.

Provided; the section indicated that the window is inset 3 inches from the face of the building to the window frame.

- i. Revise the north fence/wall section from brick to stucco.

This wall has been revised to be a stucco wall (stucco to match the building) that is 6 feet-4 inches high and has a cast stone cap (to match building's cast stone).

Ms. Michalak reported that staff recommends approval of the New Construction Part I, Height and Mass and Part II, Design Details for the 2-story commercial building to be located on the vacant portion of the lot at 615 Montgomery Street because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the design standards.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for New Construction: Part 1, Height and Mass and Part II, Design Details for the 2-story commercial building - PASS to be located on the vacant portion of the lot at 615

Montgomery Street because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the design standards.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry

Second: Robin Williams

Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

18. [Petition of Wubbena Architects | 15-001381-COA | 302 Williamson Street | Addition](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation 15-001381-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Revised.pdf](#)

Attachment: [SW7069 Iron Ore - Sherwin-Williams.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Photograph of existing conditions.pdf](#)

Mr. Jim Wubbena was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval to remove the existing, non-historic, uncovered stoop and stairs at 302 William Street on Factors Walk and replace with a larger uncovered stoop with two sets of stairs as well as replace one door.

Ms. Harris explained that a similar petition was approved by the Board on May 14, 2014, but that project did not materialize. At that meeting, the Board's discussion focused mostly on the alterations to the Factors Walk bridging. The petition today does not include alterations to the Factor's Walk bridging.

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends to continue the petition for the petitioner to address the following:

1. Provide additional clarification on the drawings regarding the existing door opening and proposed door size.
2. Ensure that the decking, stair, slats wood spindles and posts all be painted SW Iron Ore.
3. Ensure that the door frame is inset not less than three inches.
4. Provide a specification on replacement door. Should the east door, which is in very poor condition, be replaced, provide staff with a size, specification and color.
5. Provide additional information as to the treatment of the east window which is located within the "area of refuge."
6. Provide the distance between balusters.
7. Provide additional information on the detailing for the railing, particularly the balusters.
8. Ensure that the height of the railing on the stairs is not taller than the height of the

- railing on the deck.
9. Provide clarification and detailing as to the railing configuration and include a cap and base molding.
 10. Revise the top railing which extends one foot past the bottom step to include a wooden post at the bottom of the steps.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board's discussion centered on the wood railings and whether alterations would be made to the brick and stucco on the north façade.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic Board of Review does hereby continue the petition for a deck and other alterations for the petitioner to address the following:

1. Provide additional clarification on the drawings regarding the existing door opening and proposed door size.
2. Ensure that the decking, stairs, slats wood spindles and posts all be painted SW Iron Ore.
3. Ensure that the door frame is inset not less than three inches.
4. Provide a specification on replacement door. Should the east door, which is in very poor condition, be replaced, provide staff with a size, specification and color.
5. Provide additional information as to the treatment of the east window which is located within the "area of refuge."
6. Provide the distance between balusters.
7. Provide additional information on the detailing for the railing, particularly the balusters.
8. Ensure that the height of the railing on the stairs is not taller than the height of the railing on the deck.
9. Provide clarification and detailing as to the railing configuration and include a cap and base molding.

- PASS

10. Revise the top railing which extends one foot past the bottom step to include a wooden post at the bottom of the steps.

11. Revise the wood railings to metal.

12. Ensure that no alterations are made to the brick and stucco on the north façade.

The Board further approved for the revisions requested to be reviewed at staff level.

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Ebony Simpson

Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

19. [Petition of Neil Dawson | 15-001382-COA | 130 Habersham Street | Alterations](#)

Attachment: [Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Picture 1.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Ms. Weibe-Reed recused from participation in this petition. She serves as a consultant to Dawson Architects.

Mr. Neil Dawson was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Sara Farr gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting an approval for a color change and alterations to the front stoop of 130 Habersham Street. The alterations include replacement of the existing house entry stair. The stairs are not historic and are currently concrete. They will be replaced with granite. The existing newel post and railing will remain. The front stoop will also be altered. The changes include infilling with stucco walls to match the existing stucco at the garden level entry. The existing wood columns will be replaced with stucco piers. The iron gate at the garden level door will be relocated to the adjacent to the sidewalk. The existing wood columns and trim on the front stoop will be painted Porpoise (SW 7047) and the existing house and proposed stucco walls will be painted Dove-tail (SW 7018).

Ms. Farr explained that a previous application for alterations at 130 Habersham Street (14-

006076-COA) denied the removal of windows for balcony access and approved the replacement of the concrete stair treads with Bluestone. Alterations to the addition and the replacement of the roof was also approved at staff level (15-000084-COA). The Sanborn Maps show that this stoop, which first appears in the 1916 Sanborn Map, has never been enclosed. Also, the existing wood columns replaced historic iron columns per a COA approval in 1992 (HBR 92-0278). At this time, the arched panel was also added to the stoop.

Ms. Farr reported that staff recommends denial of the proposed alterations to the front stoop, because they do not meet the standards and are not visually compatible. She reported that staff recommends approval of the replacement of the concrete stairs and landing with granite and color changes, because they meet the standards and are visually compatible.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby deny the petition for the proposed alterations to the front stoop, because they do not meet the standards and are not visually compatible and approve the replacement of the concrete stairs and landing with the granite and color changes, because they meet the standards and are visually compatible. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry

Second: Tess Scheer

Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye
Robin Williams	- Aye

20. [Petition of Patrick Shay for Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 15-001384-COA | 600 East Bay Street | Demolition and New Construction Part 1: Height and Mass](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet Revised.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Aerial.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Opposition to SEPSCO Demolition- Gunther.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Additional Information on Asbestos Abatement- One Consulting Group.pdf](#)

Mr. Howington recused himself from participating in this petition due to a pending project. **Ms. Simpson, Vice Chair, chaired this hearing.**

Mr. Patrick Shay was present on behalf of the petition. Accompanying Mr. Shay were: Ms. Maggie Ward, Mr. David Moore, Mr. Jerome Elder and Attorney Harold Yellin.

Ms. Harris gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval to demolish the existing former Savannah Electric Power Company (SEPCO) office building and new construction Part I, Height and Mass of a six to eight story hotel on the site. The building will be located between Bay and River Streets with a rain garden area behind this building and the adjacent building. the petitioner has expressed their intention is to receive LEED Platinum level certification.

Ms. Harris stated that the SEPCO building is not listed as a contributing structure on the Historic Building Map, but must be evaluated for historic significance prior to demolition approval. The building was constructed in 1962 and is, therefore, 53 years old, surpassing the minimum threshold for historic status. It also embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period of method of construction. While the petitioner identified the architectural style as Industrial Gothic, staff would suggest the more general "Mid-Century Modern" terminology. Architectural historians refer to the style as "New Formalism." Staff does believe the building meets the criteria to be rated as historic significance.

Ms. Harris explained that the petitioner has provided substantial documentation to justify the demolition. One Consulting Group Inc. has provided a letter dated February 18, 2015 detailing the asbestos assessment of the property. The letter notes that "substantial friable asbestos is located in multiple parts of the building including: ceiling texture, floor tile and associated mastic, thermal system insulation and associated mastic; and spray-applied fire proofing. Of particular difficulty, in terms of asbestos removal and remediation, is the spray-applied fire proofing which was used throughout the building including on the metal decking supporting the cast concrete floors, horizontal structural beams, vertical steel and cast concrete structural posts, ceiling and drop ceilings. Due to the method of application, spray-applied, significant overspray is located in the space between the exterior brick and the interior concrete masonry units." The letter states that in order to remove the friable asbestos, as required by federal law, "significant sections of the interior concrete masonry units will have to be removed to facilitate access to and perform abatement of the overspray material within the annular space of the building's exterior walls. Further, the abatement work to remove friable asbestos overspray in the annular space may adversely impact the structural integrity of the exterior walls, and their ability to provide structural support to the exterior brick masonry veneer."

Ms. Harris said that staff believes that the required asbestos mitigation measures would effectively result in the loss of substantial amounts of historic materials to the extent that its historic integrity would be severely compromised. While the following standards apply to buildings already listed as historic on the Historic Buildings Map, and therefore should not be binding to buildings not listed on the Historic Building Map. Ms. Harris said, however, staff has listed it as it may be helpful to the Board when applying them to buildings eligible for historic status as well.

Conditions. A certificate of appropriateness for demolition of a structure rated as historic shall be issued by the Board only when one of the following conditions has been established by clear and convincing evidence pursuant to

criteria established herein.

The demolition is required to alleviate a threat to public health or public safety; and/or

The demolition is required to avoid exceptional practical difficulty or undue hardship upon any owner of any specific property. If the difficulty or hardship claimed is economic, the applicant shall be required to submit sufficient evidence to demonstrate that the application of the standards and regulations of this section deprives the applicant of a positive economic use or return on the subject property.

Ms. Harris said the standard is met. The exceptional practical difficulty in remediating the asbestos will compromise the historic integrity of the building, in a similar way to a building that has been structurally compromised due to loss of historic fabric.

***Additional Stipulations.** In granting a certificate of appropriateness for demolition, the Board may impose such reasonable and additional stipulations as will best fulfill the purposes of this ordinance.*

Ms. Harris stated that the petitioner has documented the building through measured drawings and has stated that these can be provided to a historic repository. Staff recommends that these drawings be provided to the City's Library and Municipal Archives. Additionally, staff recommends that the building be documented photographically and the photographs be archived with the City's Library and Municipal Archives.

***Replacement.** A certificate of appropriateness for demolition of a structure rated as historic shall not be issued by the Board until a certificate of appropriateness has been issued approving the replacement structure, except in the case of emergency demolition.*

Ms. Harris said that the petitioner has applied for Part 1: Height and Mass of the replacement structure.

Ms. Harris explained that Board Member Gunther is unable to be at the meeting today. Mr. Gunther sent a letter to the Board outlining his opposition to the demolition. Mr. Shay has sent information regarding the encapsulation method that Mr. Gunther suggested in his letter.

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends approval of the demolition of the SEPCO building because, while the building meets the criteria for historic status, the asbestos mitigation measures required would result in a substantial loss of historic integrity; with the condition that the building be documented with measured drawings and photographs to be deposited with the City's Municipal Library and Archives. She reported that staff recommends approval of Part I Height and Mass with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II: Design Details:

1. Incorporate additional voids to the white spaces on the north, River Street façade, and the west, East Broad Street ramp façade, perhaps similar to the narrow, tall voids on the south and west facades.
2. Incorporate additional articulation to the east façade, in the form of windows,

material change, green walls, or similar architectural device, particular towards the north and south of the façade where it will be more visible from River and Bay Streets respectively.

3. Incorporate an additional walkway along the proposed building's east façade, parallel with the previously approved stairway, and with the rain garden in the center.
4. Incorporate an additional entrance along both Bay and River Streets.
5. Ensure that the vertical dividers between the balconies are transparent above each balcony railing.
6. Incorporate additional solids on the ground level between the two supporting columns to better form a wall of continuity at the valet parking area along River Street.
7. Revise the seven foot tall solid wall along the rain garden area on the River Street façade to be more transparent so that the passage between the two buildings is further accentuated, particularly if a second, parallel stair is incorporated into the design.
8. Add a transparent fence along the rain garden adjacent to East Bay Street to better form a wall of continuity.
9. Ensure that the parapet wall has a stringcourse and coping.

Because the building is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards.

PETITIONER PRESENTATION/BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Shay showed the Board a video from One Consulting Group, Inc. outlining their assessment of the asbestos situation with the SEPCO building.

The Board's discussion focused on the building meets the criteria of historic status and the information provided regarding the asbestos abatement does not justify the demolition.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby deny the petition for the demolition of 600 East Bay Street, also known as the SEPCO building, because the building meets the criteria for - PASS historic status and the information provided regarding asbestos abatement does not justify the demolition.

Vote Results

Motion: Marjorie W Reed
Second: Robin Williams
Nicholas Henry

- Nay

Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Abstain
Robin Williams	- Aye

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition for Part I: Height and Mass of a new building at 600 East Bay Street at the request of the petitioner. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams

Second: Nicholas Henry

Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Not Present
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Abstain
Robin Williams	- Aye

IX. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

21. [Petition of Tracey Harvey | 14-002767-COA | 612 Price Street | Staff Approve - 12-Month Extension](#)

Attachment: [COA 612 Price Street 14-002767-COA 12-month extension.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

22. [Petition of Michael Cannon | 15-001157-COA | 124 East McDonough Street | Staff Approved - Roof](#)

Attachment: [124 E McDonough St Permit Heyward Gignilliat \(2\).pdf](#)

Attachment: [COA - 124 E. McDonough Street 15-001157-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [IMG_4170.pdf](#)

Attachment: [IMG_4171.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

23. [Petition of Doug Patten for City of Savannah | 15-001204-COA | 104 East Bryan Street | Staff Approved - Guardrails](#)

Attachment: [COA - 104 East Bryan Street 15-001204-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 104 East Bryan Street 001204-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

24. [Petition of Dominic Ross for City of Savannah | 15-001221-COA | Vicinity of 15 Bull Street | Staff Approved - Install a DC Fast Charger](#)

Attachment: [COA - 0 West Bull \[Vicinity of 15 Bull Street\] 15-001221-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 0 West Bull Street 15-001221-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

25. [Petition of Sadrina Edwards | 15-001288-COA | 510 East Jones Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 510 East Jones Street 15-001288-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 510 E. Jones St. - 15-001288-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

26. [Amended Petition of Gerald Cowart | 15-001302-COA | 322-324 East Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Stucco Window Sill](#)

Attachment: [BERRIEN GROUND FLOOR REVISIONS 2-25-2015 hdrb \(2\).pdf](#)

Attachment: [COA - 322-324 East Broughton Street 15-001302-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

27. [Petition of Judith A. Feedham | 15-001309-COA | 211 West Gordon Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 211 West Gordon Street 15-001309-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 211 West Gordon Street 15-001309-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

28. [Petition of Matthew S. Hallett | 15-001318-COA | 20 West Gaston Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 20 West Gaston Street 15-001318-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 20 West Gaston Street 15-001318-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

29. [Petition of Joshua Beckler for Coastal Canvas Products | 15-001334-COA | 206 West Broughton](#)

Street | Staff Approved - Awning

Attachment: [Fabric Sample - 206 W. Broughton St. - 15-001334-COA.pdf](#)
Attachment: [COA - 206 West Broughton Street 15-001334-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

30. Petition of Chad Zittrouer | 15-001378-COA | 214 West Boundary Street | Staff Approved - Replacement Flag Pole

Attachment: [COA - 214 West Boundary Street 15-001378-COA.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 214 West Boundary Street 15-001378-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

31. Petition of Joshua Beckler for Coastal Canvas Products | 15-001537-COA | 424 East President Street | Staff Approval - Awnings

Attachment: [COA - 424 East President Street 15-001537-COA.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 424 East President Street 15-001537-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

32. Petition of Joshua Beckler for Coastal Canvas Products | 15-001538-COA | 131 West River Street | Staff Approve - Awnings

Attachment: [COA - 131 West River Street 15-001538-COA.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 131 West River Street 15-001538-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

33. Petition of Joshua Beckler for Coastal Canvas Products | 15-001697-COA | 312 West Taylor Street | Staff Approved - Awnings

Attachment: [COA - 312 West Taylor Street 15-001697-COA.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- 312 W. Taylor St. - 15-001697-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

34. Petition of Julian Smith for Solarsmith |15-001784-COA | 347 Abercorn Street | Staff Approved - Photovoltaic Panels

Attachment: [COA - 347 Abercorn Street 15-001784-COA.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 347 Abercorn Street 001784-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

35. Petition of Bart Redmond for Redmond Construction, Inc. | 15-001822-COA | 105 and 107 West Congress Street | Staff Approved - Painting and In-Kind Repairs

Attachment: [COA - 105 and 107 West Congress Street 15-001822-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 105 and 107 West Congress St. 15-001822-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

36. [Report on Work Performed Without a Certificate of Appropriateness](#)

Attachment: [HDBR Michalak Work Without a COA 4-8-15.pdf](#)

Mr. Howington said the staff has given the Board a written report on the work performed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, and ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Notices

37. [Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting - Thursday, April 15, 2015 at 3:30 p.m. in the West Conference Room, MPC, 110 East State Street](#)

38. [Next Meeting - Wednesday, May 13, 2015 at 1:00 p.m. in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, MPC, 112 E. State Street](#)

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

Unfinished Business

39. [A Citizen's Concern](#)

Ms. Melissa W. Ralph resides at 22 West Hull Street came forward and stated she was present today to make a rebuttal to what one of the Board members said at the last meeting regarding change in the Historic District.

Dr. Williams said that the Board is here to shepherd change. They are not here to prevent change.

XV. ADJOURNMENT

40. [Adjourned](#)

There being no further business to come before the Board, Mr. Howington adjourned the meeting at 5:00 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Ellen Harris
Director of urban Planning and Historic Preservation

EIH:mem