

BOARD OF REVIEW

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room January 14, 2015 1:00 p.m. Meeting Minutes

JANUARY 14, 2015 HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW REGULAR MEETING

HDRB Members Present: Keith Howington, Chair

Ebony Simpson, Vice-Chair

Debra Caldwell
Justin Gunther
Dr. Nicholas Henry
Stephen Merriman, Jr.
Marjorie Weibe-Reed

Tess Scheer

Robin Williams, Ph.D

HDRB Members Not Present: Zena McClain, Esq., Parliamentarian

MPC Staff Present: Tom Thomson, Executive Director

Ellen Harris, Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation

Leah G. Michalak, Historic Preservation Planner

Sara Farr, Historic Preservation Planner Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

1. Call to Order

Mr. Howington called the meeting to order at 1:05 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. He outlined the purpose and role of the Historic District Board of Review.

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

2. Petition of Blake Hardee | 14-005280-COA | 409 East Bay Street | Signs

Attachment: Staff Recommendation.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - Fascia Sign.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - Fascia Sign Location.pdf

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for window decals and a principal use fascia sign at 409 East Bay Street for Hawg Scooters with the condition that the fascia sign's size be reduced to a maximum of 31.5 square feet.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry Second: Tess Scheer Debra Caldwell

- Ave Justin Gunther - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye Keith Howington - Abstain Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye Marjorie W Reed - Aye **Tess Scheer** - Aye **Ebony Simpson** - Aye Robin Williams - Aye

3. Petition of James Beasley | 14-005862-COA | 121 West Broughton Street | Signs

Attachment: Staff Recommendation.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - 121 West Broughton Street 14-005862-COA.pdf

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the projecting principal use signs at 121 West Broughton Street - PASS with the condition that the number of signs is reduced to one.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry Second: Tess Scheer

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Justin Gunther - Aye
Nicholas Henry - Aye
Keith Howington - Abstain
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye

| Marjorie W Reed | - Aye |
|-----------------|-------|
| Tess Scheer | - Aye |
| Ebony Simpson | - Aye |
| Robin Williams | - Aye |

4. Petition of Vincent Delmonte | 14-005909-COA | 510 East Charlton Street | Signs

Attachment: Staff Recommendation.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Package - Application.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Package - Drawings.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Package - Photo 1.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Package - Photo 2.pdf

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for two building identification signs at 510 East Charlton street,

because they are visually compatible and meet the

standards.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry Second: Tess Scheer

Debra Caldwell - Aye Justin Gunther - Ave Nicholas Henry - Aye Keith Howington - Abstain Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye Marjorie W Reed - Aye Tess Scheer - Aye **Ebony Simpson** - Aye **Robin Williams** - Aye

5. Petition of Canady Signs for Crystal Beer Parlor | 14-005932 | 301 West Jones Street | Signs

- PASS

Attachment: <u>Staff Recommendation.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Package.pdf</u>

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a principal use and directional free standing sign at 301 West Jones Street for the Crystal Beer Parlor, because

the signs meet the standards and are visually

compatible.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry

| Second: Tess Scheer | |
|-----------------------------|-----------|
| Debra Caldwell | - Aye |
| Justin Gunther | - Aye |
| Nicholas Henry | - Aye |
| Keith Howington | - Abstain |
| Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. | - Aye |
| Marjorie W Reed | - Aye |
| Tess Scheer | - Aye |
| Ebony Simpson | - Aye |
| Robin Williams | - Aye |

6. <u>Petition of Amy L. Copeland | 14-006017-COA | 602-604 Montgomery Street | Rehabilitation,</u> Alterations, and Addition

Attachment: Staff Recommendation.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - 602 - 604 Montgomery Street 14-006017-COA.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - Drawings.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet - Photographs.pdf
Attachment: Previous Board Decision 2012.pdf

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for rehabilitation and an addition at 602-604 Montgomery Street with the following conditions:

- 1. Methods, materials and specifications for repointing must be submitted and verified to be in accordance with Preservation Brief 2: Repointing Mortar Joints in Historic Masonry Buildings, and adopted Board procedures and a four by four test patch is provided for approval.
- 2. Provide specifications for hydraulic lift.
- 3. Incorporate operable windows in the street-PASS fronting façade of the addition.
- 4. Place the awning within the existing storefront opening provided that the eight foot minimum required vertical clearance above the sidewalk is met.
- 5. Preserve the historic signs.

Otherwise, the petition meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results

| Motion: Nicholas Henry | |
|-----------------------------|-----------|
| Second: Tess Scheer | |
| Debra Caldwell | - Aye |
| Justin Gunther | - Aye |
| Nicholas Henry | - Aye |
| Keith Howington | - Abstain |
| Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. | - Aye |
| Marjorie W Reed | - Aye |
| Tess Scheer | - Aye |
| Ebony Simpson | - Aye |
| Robin Williams | - Aye |

7. Petition of Jerry Lominack for Lominack Kolman Smith Architects | 14-006035-COA | 660 East Broughton Street | Additions

Attachment: Staff Recommendation 14-006035-COA.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet- Application, Drawings, Photographs, and Specifications.pdf

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve of the proposed addition and rehabilitation to 660 East Broughton Street with the condition that the windows are inset not less than three inches from the façade or match the historic window inset, because the project is visually-PASS

compatible, and meets the preservation and design

standards.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry Second: Tess Scheer

Debra Caldwell - Aye Justin Gunther - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye - Abstain **Keith Howington** Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye Marjorie W Reed - Aye **Tess Scheer** - Aye **Ebony Simpson** - Aye Robin Williams - Aye

8. Petition of Doug Bean Signs for Mamie Ruth | 14-006062-COA | 107 West Liberty Street | Signs

Attachment: Staff Recommendation.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - 107 W. Liberty St. 14-006062-COA.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - Final Sign.pdf

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the principal use sign at 107 West Liberty Street for Mamie Ruth, because the sign meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry Second: Tess Scheer Debra Caldwell - Aye Justin Gunther - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye **Keith Howington** - Abstain Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye Marjorie W Reed - Aye Tess Scheer - Aye **Ebony Simpson** - Aye Robin Williams - Aye

9. Petition of Flint North | 14-006064-COA | 230 Bull Street | Signs

Attachment: <u>Staff Recommendation.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Package - Sign 1.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Package - Sign 2.pdf</u>

Attachment: <u>Submittal Package - Mounting Detail.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Package - Sign Details.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Package - Street Frontage.pdf</u>

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for two fascia principal use signs at 230 Bull Street for KS Fine Art sized 6 square feet on the Bull Street façade and 3 square feet on the McDonough Street façade, - PASS because the signs meet the standard and are visually compatible.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry Second: Tess Scheer

| Debra Caldwell | - Aye |
|-----------------------------|-----------|
| Justin Gunther | - Aye |
| Nicholas Henry | - Abstain |
| Keith Howington | - Aye |
| Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. | - Aye |
| Marjorie W Reed | - Aye |
| Tess Scheer | - Aye |
| Ebony Simpson | - Aye |
| Robin Williams | - Aye |

10. Petition of Flint North | 14-006066-COA | 36 West Broughton Street | Signs

Attachment: Staff Recommendation.pdf

Attachment: <u>Submittal Package - Building Frontage.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Package - Cafe Sign Details.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Package - Cafe Sign.pdf</u>

Attachment: Submittal Package - Entrance Sign Details.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Package - Entrance Sign.pdf

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for two new projecting principal use signs at 36 West Broughton Street, because the signs meet the standards and are visually compatible.

Vote Results

Robin Williams

Motion: Nicholas Henry

Second: Tess Scheer Debra Caldwell - Aye Justin Gunther - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye - Abstain Keith Howington Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye Marjorie W Reed - Aye **Tess Scheer** - Aye **Ebony Simpson** - Aye

11. Petition of Clegg Ivey | 14-006069-COA | 514 MLK Jr Boulevard | Signs

Attachment: <u>Staff Recommendation.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet.pdf</u>

- Aye

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a new 25 square foot projecting principal use sign illuminated by two 120 Volt bulbs in bullet lights, two new window decals and new awning signage not to exceed 6 inches at 514 Martin Luther King Jr. - PASS Boulevard, because the signs meet the standards and are visually compatible.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry Second: Tess Scheer Debra Caldwell - Aye Justin Gunther - Aye Nicholas Henry - Ave Keith Howington - Nay Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye Marjorie W Reed - Aye **Tess Scheer** - Aye **Ebony Simpson** - Aye **Robin Williams** - Aye

12. <u>Peition of Natalie Aiken for Hansen Architects | 14-006075-COA | 228 West Broughton Street |</u> Color Change and Signs

Attachment: Staff Recommendation.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Package - Elevation.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Package - Signage Details.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Package - Window Signs.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Package - Facade Photograph.pdf

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a principal use projecting sign, three window signs and an address sign at 228 West Broughton Street, as well as a - PASS color change to Glidden Onyx Black (GLN 62) for the alcoves and wood façade and Benjamin Moore Classic Burgundy (26) for the entrance door.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry Second: Tess Scheer

Debra Caldwell - Aye

| Justin Gunther | - Aye |
|-----------------------------|-----------|
| Nicholas Henry | - Aye |
| Keith Howington | - Abstain |
| Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. | - Aye |
| Marjorie W Reed | - Aye |
| Tess Scheer | - Aye |
| Ebony Simpson | - Aye |
| Robin Williams | - Aye |

13. Approval of Consent Agenda

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

14. Adopt January 14, 2015 Agenda

| Dagard | A ~ | 4. | |
|--------|-----|----|----|
| Board | AC | uo | n: |

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review - PASS does hereby adopt January 14, 2015 Agenda.

Vote Results

Motion: Marjorie W Reed Second: Robin Williams

Justin Gunther - Aye Debra Caldwell - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye **Keith Howington** - Abstain Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye Marjorie W Reed - Aye Tess Scheer - Aye Ebony Simpson - Aye Robin Williams - Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

15. Approve Minutes of December 10, 2014

Attachment: 12-10-2014 Minutes.pdf

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the Meeting Minutes of

- PASS

December 10, 2014.

Vote Results

Motion: Tess Scheer

| Second: Robin Williams | |
|-----------------------------|-----------|
| Debra Caldwell | - Aye |
| Justin Gunther | - Aye |
| Nicholas Henry | - Aye |
| Keith Howington | - Abstain |
| Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. | - Aye |
| Marjorie W Reed | - Aye |
| Tess Scheer | - Aye |
| Ebony Simpson | - Aye |
| Robin Williams | - Aye |

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

16. Petition of Facilicare Southeast | 14-005083-COA | 317 East Broad Street | Fence

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

17. <u>Petition of Christian Sottile for Sottile & Sottile | 14-005099-COA | 215 West Broughton Street | New Construction: Part 1 Height and Mass</u>

| Board Action: Continue the petition at petitioner's request. | - PASS |
|---|-----------|
| Vote Results | |
| Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. | |
| Second: Tess Scheer | |
| Debra Caldwell | - Aye |
| Justin Gunther | - Aye |
| Nicholas Henry | - Aye |
| Keith Howington | - Abstain |
| Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. | - Aye |
| Marjorie W Reed | - Aye |
| Tess Scheer | - Aye |
| Ebony Simpson | - Aye |
| Robin Williams | - Aye |

18. <u>Petition of Neil Dawson, Dawson Architects | 14-005106-COA | 512 West Oglethorpe Avenue | New Construction Hotel: Part II, Design Details</u>

| Board Action: Continue the petition at petitioner's request. | - PASS | |
|---|--------|--|
| Vote Results | | |

| Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. | |
|-------------------------------------|-----------|
| Second: Tess Scheer | |
| Debra Caldwell | - Aye |
| Justin Gunther | - Aye |
| Nicholas Henry | - Aye |
| Keith Howington | - Abstain |
| Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. | - Aye |
| Marjorie W Reed | - Aye |
| Tess Scheer | - Aye |
| Ebony Simpson | - Aye |
| Robin Williams | - Aye |

19. <u>Petition of Neil Dawson for Dawson Architects | 14-005575-COA | 501 East Bay Street | Part 2: Design Details New Construction</u>

| Board Action: Continue the petition at petitioner's request. | - PASS |
|---|-----------|
| common are personal are personal as requests | 11100 |
| Vote Results | |
| Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. | |
| Second: Tess Scheer | |
| Debra Caldwell | - Aye |
| Justin Gunther | - Aye |
| Nicholas Henry | - Aye |
| Keith Howington | - Abstain |
| Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. | - Aye |
| Marjorie W Reed | - Aye |
| Tess Scheer | - Aye |
| Ebony Simpson | - Aye |
| Robin Williams | - Aye |

20. <u>Petition of Pat Shay for Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects | 14-006036-COA | 229 West Congress Street | Amendment to Part 1: Height and Mass, Signs and Awnings</u>

| Board Action: | | |
|--|--------|--|
| Continue the petition at petitioner's request. | - PASS | |
| | | |
| Vote Results | | |
| Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. | | |
| Second: Tess Scheer | | |
| Debra Caldwell | - Aye | |
| Justin Gunther | - Ave | |

| Nicholas Henry | - Aye |
|-----------------------------|-----------|
| Keith Howington | - Abstain |
| Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. | - Aye |
| Marjorie W Reed | - Aye |
| Tess Scheer | - Aye |
| Ebony Simpson | - Aye |
| Robin Williams | - Aye |

21. <u>Petition of Jim Wubbena, Wubenna Architects | 14-006061-COA | 615 Montgomery Street | New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass</u>

| Board Action: | |
|--|-------|
| Continue petition at petitioner's request. | - |
| | |
| Vote Results | |
| Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. | |
| Second: Tess Scheer | |
| Debra Caldwell | - Aye |
| Justin Gunther | - Aye |
| Nicholas Henry | - Aye |
| Keith Howington | - |
| Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. | - Aye |
| Marjorie W Reed | - Aye |
| Tess Scheer | - Aye |
| Ebony Simpson | - Aye |
| Robin Williams | - Aye |

VIII. REGULAR AGENDA

22. Petition of Shedrick Coleman for SHEDDarchitecture | 14-003482-COA | 407 and 409 East McDonough Street | New Construction: Part II Design Details

Attachment: Staff Recommendation 14-003482-COA.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet- Drawings.pdf

Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet- Material Specifications.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet- Photographs reduced.pdf</u>

Attachment: Aerial.pdf

Attachment: Crawford Ward.pdf

Attachment: Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf

Mr. Shedrick Coleman was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval of Part 2 Design Details for new construction on a vacant lot at 407 and 409 East McDonough Street. The new construction consists of a four story duplex with parking on the ground floor, accessed from East Perry Street. Similar petitions were heard by the Board on August 13,

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room January 14, 2015 1:00 p.m. Meeting Minutes

2014 and September 10, 2014 and were continued. Ms. Harris said that on October 8, 2014 Part 1 Height and Mass were approved with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II, Design Details:

- 1. Increase the width of the lintels. [Completed.]
- 2. Revise the two stoops to be one adjoined stoop and enclose the underside of the stoops at ground level. [Partially completed- the stoops have been adjoined but remain unclosed].
- 3. Retain only one vehicular access point along the street to the west of the project with a human door along the opposite street (subject to approval from Traffic Engineering. [Not completed.]
- 4. Add a stringcourse to the parapet wall. [Completed.]
- 5. Reduce the width of the fire wall and continue the coping across its face. [Completed.]
- 6. Dimension the height of all balustrades and railing; also dimension all baluster spacing. [Completed.]
- 7. Ensure that the apron to the garage is not located on the public right-of-way. [Completed].
- 8. Revise the site plan to indicate that the sidewalk will continue across all driveways in materials, configuration and height. [Completed.]

Ms. Harris stated that the Board also recommended approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the 30 foot structured parking setback requirement which was granted on December 18, 2014. The Zoning Board of Appeals also granted 14% lot coverage variance from the 75% requirement should the petitioner decide to subdivide in the future. The project as proposed, without the subdivision, meets the 75% lot coverage requirement.

Ms. Harris explained that additional revisions beyond the Part 1 conditions are as follows:

- 1. The duplex has moved approximately five feet to the east on the lot;
- 2. The vertical glass tower on the east façade has been eliminated;
- 3. Stair towers to the roof are on both units.

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends approval for Part II, Design Details with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval, Design Details because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards:

- 1. Select a mortar color with a buff or browner hue rather than grey;
- 2. Add gates to the driveways at Perry and McDonough Streets to create a wall of continuity;
- 3. Separate the stoops into two as previously proposed;
- 4. Reduce the railing height to 36 inches to meet the standard;
- 5. Provide the material of the stair treads and risers; and
- 6. Provide a fence section.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of

Review does hereby approve Part II, Design Details with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval, Design Details because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards:

- Add gates to the driveways at Perry and McDonough Streets to create a wall of continuity;
- 2. Separate the stoops into two as previously PASS proposed;
- 3. Reduce the railing height to 36 inches to meet the standard;
- 4. Provide the material of the stair treads and risers; and
- 5. Provide a fence section.

Vote Results

Motion: Justin Gunther Second: Robin Williams

Debra Caldwell - Aye Justin Gunther - Aye - Aye Nicholas Henry **Keith Howington** - Abstain Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye Marjorie W Reed - Aye **Tess Scheer** - Aye **Ebony Simpson** - Aye **Robin Williams** - Aye

23. <u>Petition of Andy Lynch, Lynch Associates Architects, PC | 14-005105-COA | 515 Montgomery Street | New Construction Part 2: Design Details</u>

Attachment: Staff Recommendation 14-005105-COA.pdf

Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet- Drawings.pdf</u>
Attachment: Material Board Photo.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet- Specifications.pdf

Attachment: Aerial.pdf

Attachment: Gaston Ward.pdf

Attachment: Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf

Mr. Andrew Lynch was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval of Part II Design Details for new construction of a 59 unit, four story multi-family building. The building primarily fronts onto Montgomery Street, with a small façade facing West Gaston

Street. Parking is surface and partially under the building and is accessed from West Huntingdon Street.

Ms. Harris said that on November 12, 2014 the Savannah Historic District Board of Review approved the request to demolish two existing non-contributing buildings at 515 Montgomery and 408 West Huntingdon Streets because they do not meet the criteria for historic designation. The HDBR continued the petition for Part 1 Height and Mass at the request of the petitioner. On December 10, 2014 the Savannah Historic District Board of Review approved Part 1 Height and Mass for new construction at 515 Montgomery Street with the condition that the low walls in front of the entrances restudied to be more visually compatible. The configuration of the low walls has been revised to be more consistent along the street.

Ms. Harris stated that the Board continued Part 2 Design Details of new construction at 515 Montgomery Street at the request of the petitioner to address the following:

- 1. Provide the current proposed lot coverage; [Incomplete]
- 2. Submit mortar colors, gate colors, metal accent on fence colors; [Incomplete]
- 3. Change the hardi siding to have a smooth finish; [Incomplete]
- 4. Ensure that the proposed doors are inset at least three inches; [Complete]
- 5. Replace the fiber cement panels be replaced with a different material; [Complete]
- 6. Ensure the square windows are double hung, awning or casement; [Complete]
- 7. Ensure the storefronts extend from a sill along the Montgomery and Gaston Streets. [Complete]
- 8. Ensure that the storefront glazing is inset at least four inches from the façade. [Complete]
- 9. Ensure that all sections of the building have a stringcourse; [Complete]
- 10. Change the stair material from concrete to an approved material to meet the standard; [Complete]
- 11. Change the brick wall color to match that of the main structure; [Partially complete. The tall brick wall is the same color as the main structure but the low brick walls utilize a different brick color.]
- 12. Ensure that the sidewalk continues to serve as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration and height; [Complete]
- 13. A "security fence" is noted along the western parcel boundary but specific information was not provided. Provide additional information regarding the security fence; [Complete]
- 14. The Montgomery Street façade incorporates 49% masonry materials. Staff recommends that the quantity of types of materials be reduced and the masonry be increased to meet the standard; [Completed].
- 15. Ensure that all window and door insets meet the four inch standard. [Complete]

Ms. Harris stated that additional revisions include revising the window and door configuration in the central courtyard along Montgomery Street, changing the maple hardi plank on the rear elevation and south facades to a smooth painted hardi plank (color not provided), and changing the maple hardi to mahogany hardi (sample not provided).

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends approval of Part I Height and Mass for new construction at 515 Montgomery Street with the condition that the low walls in front of the entrances be either eliminated or further restudies to be more visually compatible and

reviewed with Part II: Design Details. At a minimum, they should be the same color as the main building.

Ms. Harris additionally reported that staff recommends continue Part II: Design Details to meet the following conditions:

- 1. Provide
 - a. A Sample of the tertiary brick;
 - b. A sample of the mahogany with wood grain texture (should the Board decide to approve it);
 - c. The color of the smooth fiber cement siding and the fiber cement accent features;
 - d. The gate color and metal accent of fencing;
 - e. A sample of the cast stone steps.
- 2. Revise the hardi siding to have a smooth finish. As a relatively new product, staff does not feel there has been sufficient time to determine satisfactory performance in the local climate.
- 3. Revise the steel fence to include a masonry base.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby:

- Approve Part 1 Height and Mass for new construction at 515 Montgomery Street with the condition that the low walls in front of the entrances be eliminated and the entrance design be reviewed with Part II: Design Details.
- 2. Approve Part II: Design Details with the following conditions:
 - a. Provide the following:
 - The color of the smooth fiber cement siding and the fiber-PASS cement accent features;
 - ii. The gate color and metal accent of fencing;
 - iii. A sample of the cast stone steps;
 - b. Revise the steel fence to include a masonry base;
 - c. The revised entrance design may be reviewed by staff.

Because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards.

Vote Results

Motion: Robin Williams Second: Justin Gunther

Debra Caldwell - Ave Justin Gunther - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye Keith Howington - Abstain Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye Marjorie W Reed - Aye **Tess Scheer** - Aye **Ebony Simpson** - Aye **Robin Williams** - Aye

24. Petition of Neil Dawson, Dawson Architects | 14-005113-COA | 512 West Oglethorpe Avenue | New Construction Parking Garage: Part II, Design Details

Attachment: Staff Report.pdf

Attachment: Previously Approved Part 1 - Drawings and Photographs.pdf

Attachment: Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf
Attachment: Aerial - Facing North.pdf

Attachment: Historic Building Map - South Oglethorpe Ward.pdf

Attachment: ALOFT prototype image.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - Mass Model Photos.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - Drawings and Photographs.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - Photograph of Material Samples.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - Project Narrative and Specifications.pdf

Attachment: Petitioner Response to Staff Recommendations.pdf

Ms. Weibe-Reed recused from participation in this petition. She serves as a consulting architect for Dawson Architects.

Ms. Jennifer Deacon was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for New Construction: Part II, Design Details for a 5-story parking garage (7 levels of parking) for the vacant property located at 512 West Oglethorpe Avenue (135 MLK, Jr. Blvd.). The garage fronts Ann Street and Alton Street, and is oriented to face Ann Street. The project qualifies as large-scale development.

Ms. Michalak stated that on November 12, 2014, the Board approved Part I with the condition that the entrance and exit drives be revised to serve as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration, and height. Per a note on the site plan, this condition is met. The Board also recommended approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals (ZBA) for the following variances:

a. Storefront glazing shall extend from the sill or from an 18 to 24 inch tall base of

contrasting material, to the lintel.

To allow the storefront glazing to extend to the ground.

- b. Access to parking shall be from lanes or north-south service streets. When a property does not front a lane or north-south service street, parking may be accessed from east-west connecting streets or trust streets.
 To allow for one-way exiting from the parking garage to be along Alton Street which is an east-west street. (The one-way entrance to the parking garage is along Ann Street which is a north-south street.)
- c. Structured parking within the first story of a building shall be setback a minimum of 30 feet from property lines along all public rights-of-way (not including lanes).
 To allow for a 0 foot structured parking setback along Alton Street and a 24 foot-8 inch structured parking setback along Ann Street. The physical parking spaces along Ann Street are setback 46 feet from the Ann Street façade.
- d. A minimum of one (1) primary entrance shall be provided for every 60 feet of street frontage, excluding lanes. Intervals between entrances shall not be less than 15 feet nor exceed 90 feet.

To exclude primary entrances on the Alton Street façade.

Ms. Michalak said that the ZBA approved the variances at their meeting of December 18, 2014 meeting [File No. 14-005734-ZBA].

Ms. Michalak stated that additionally, the following Part I elements have been revised since the previous approval:

- An awning element has been added to the Ann Street elevation in response to Staff and Board comments that the base of the building needed further definition. Also, metal panels at the first floor level between pilasters further delineate the separation of the first floor from the middle and top of the building. An additional horizontal member has been added to the screening elements to continue the line of the new awnings.
- Bay spacing at the Ann Street elevation has changed slightly from the previous submission, but still falls within the requirements of the Historic District Ordinance, which requires that exterior walls create multiple bays not less than 15 feet nor more than 20 feet in width. These changes are the result of structural coordination for the parking garage.
- Bay spacing at the Alton Street elevation has changed slightly from the previous submission. The widths of two bays are in excess of 20 feet. However, at the Part I meeting, Alton Street was determined to serve as a lane, which does not involve the same bay spacing requirements. These changes are the result of structural coordination for the parking garage.
- Bay spacing and screening configuration at the east elevation (facing toward Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd) have changed. Screening elements visible from MLK Blvd. are similar in configuration to what was previously approved. However, the portion of the garage that is shielded from view by the Fairfield Inn uses a larger screening system to cover the ramped portion of the garage. This is not a street fronting elevation.
- The height of the elevator shaft has been raised from 74'-3" to 77'-3" to accommodate elevator equipment and clearance.
- The south elevation of the garage has been included in this submission. It was not

included in the Part I submission for the garage and hotel as the two buildings abut each other at a shared wall. The outline of the hotel is indicated on the south elevation The Part II Design submission for the Aloft hotel is intended to be submitted for the March 2015 HDBR meeting.

- The first floor height of the garage has been raised 1 foot to ensure proper clearance and drainage within the building. This has raised the overall height of the primary mass of the building by 1 foot as well. The screening elements which make reference to the expressed heights of the building have not been modified from the original design.
- The quantity of pedestrian entrance doors along the Ann Street façade have been reduced from 6 to 2.
- All glazing has been removed from the northwest tower element, facing both Ann and Alton Streets.
- Two (2) louvered openings on the ground floor of the Alton Street façade have been replaced with solid concrete panels.
- Two (2) louvered openings on the ground floor of the Alton Street façade have been replaced with 12 foot wide by 8 foot high metal overhead doors which contain the refuse storage area for the entire site.
- All louvered ground floor openings on the east façade (partially visible from Alton and MLK) have been replaced with solid concrete panels.
- The gap between the proposed garage and the Fairfield Inn to the east has increased from 7 feet to 12 feet-3 inches along Alton Street.
- The single entrance door into the stair tower on the Ann Street façade has changed from a full-lite door to a solid, flush metal door.

Ms. Michalak reported that staff recommends approval of the amendments to New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass for a 5-story parking garage (7 levels of parking) for the vacant property located at 512 West Oglethorpe Avenue with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval:

- a. All ground floor concrete panels on the Alton and MLK facades, which were previously approved to be louvered openings, be returned to louvered openings.
- b. Increase the quantity of primary pedestrian entrances along the Ann Street façade to be not more than 60 feet apart (previously approved with 6 entrances and has been reduced to 2 entrances).

Ms. Michalak said the staff additionally recommends approval of the petition for New Construction: Part II, Design Details for a 5-story parking garage (7 levels of parking) for the vacant property located at 512 West Oglethorpe Avenue with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval.

- a. Provide specifications, materials, and color selections for the steel cable railings.
- b. Restudy the color selections to have a less monotone appearance.
- c. Revise the height and material of the wall/fence along the east property line.
- d. Revise the design and material of the flush metal door on Ann Street façade.
- e. Provide additional scoring, with dimensions, to achieve a human scale (on all

- facades) on the precast concrete panels and composite metal panel.
- f. Provide the depths of all metal awnings.
- g. Provide the inset of the flush metal door on the Ann Street façade (not to be less than 4 inches.

BOARD AND PETITIONER DISCUSSIONS:

Prior to the meeting, the petitioner provided additional information in response to staff recommendations. This included: reinstated the louvers on the Alton Street façade (but not the MLK façade), increased the quantity of entrances on Ann Street, provided all information for the steel cable railings, agreed to restudy the color selections and provide to staff at a later date, agreed to change the stucco wall to brick and raise the height, revised the design and material of the flush metal door on Ann Street, provided the depths of all awnings. The petitioner preferred to keep the concrete panels on the MLK façade and to keep the scoring as presented; the petitioner made their case to the Board. The Board agreed that the MLK façade would be minimally visible and that the concrete panels were acceptable. The petitioner provided dimensions for the concrete panel scoring and the Board agreed that, as designed, the scoring creates a "human scale" and meets the intent of the ordinance.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby:

- Approve the amendments to New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass for a 5-story parking garage (7 levels of parking) for the vacant property located at 512 West Oglethorpe Avenue with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval:
 - a. All ground floor concrete panels on the Alton Street facade, which were previously approved to be louvered openings, be returned to louvered openings.
 - b. Increase the quantity of primary pedestrian entrances along the Ann Street façade to be not more than 60 feet apart (previously approved with 6 entrances and has been reduced to 2 entrances).

- PASS

- Approve the petition for New Construction: Part II, Design Details for a 5-story parking garage (7 levels of parking) for the vacant property located at 512 West Oglethorpe Avenue with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval:
 - a. Provide specifications, materials, and color selections for the steel cable railings.

- b. Restudy the color selections to have a less monotone appearance.
- c. Revise the height and material of the wall/fence along the east property line.
- d. Revise the design and material of the flush metal door on the Ann Street façade.
- e. Provide the depths of all metal awnings.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry Second: Tess Scheer

Debra Caldwell - Ave Justin Gunther - Aye Nicholas Henry - Aye Keith Howington - Abstain Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Ave Marjorie W Reed - Abstain Tess Scheer - Ave **Ebony Simpson** - Aye **Robin Williams** - Aye

25. <u>Petition of John Deering, Homeline Architecture | 14-005945-COA | 9-15 East Macon Street | New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass</u>

Attachment: Staff Recommendation 14-005945-COA.pdf

Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet- Application.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet- Drawings.pdf</u>

Attachment: Aerial.pdf

Attachment: Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf

Attachment: Supplementary Information- Applicant Response to Staff Report.pdf

Attachment: Public Comment- Shaver email.pdf
Attachment: Public Comment- Bousquet Email.pdf

Attachment: Jasper Ward.pdf

Mr. Howington recused from participation in this petition. He is an employee of Greenline Architecture. Ms. Simpson chaired the hearing of this petition.

Mr. John Deering was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for Part I: Height and Mass for new construction of four, four-story townhomes with raised stoops located between Macon and Charlton Streets, and between Bull and Drayton Streets. The proposed townhomes are located on the southeast trust lot of Jasper Ward adjacent to Madison Square and will be oriented to East Macon Street. The petitioner is requesting a variance from the 75% required lot coverage to allow 100% and a variance from the 30 foot structured parking setback.

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends to continue the application Part I: Height and mass for four new row houses at 9-15 East Macon Street to address the following:

- 1. Restudy the stepped back fourth floor with gable roof to be more visually compatible;
 - 2. Restudy the Charlton Street façade to have a more consistent spacing and avoid the central column blocking the only door on the façade;
 - 3. Restudy the railing configuration on the rear porches to be more consistent.
 - 4. On the east, Drayton Street façade, add additional voids.
 - 5. Restudy the stoop height and stair configuration to eliminate the 90 degree stair turn with platform.
 - 6. If approved, ensure that the pitch on the fourth floor gable roof is between 4:12 and 8:12.
 - 7. Ensure that the column capital extends outward of the porch architrave.
 - 8. Ensure that the apron to the garage is not erected on the public right-of-way.
 - 9. Revise the driveways to ensure the sidewalks as a continuous uninterrupted pathway.

Ms. Harris reported further that staff recommends denial of the variance from the 75% lot coverage requirement to allow 100% coverage to the Zoning Board of Appeals because the variance criteria have not been met.

Ms. Harris additionally reported that staff recommends approval of the variance from the 30 foot structured parking setback from Charlton Street to the Zoning Board of Appeals because the variance criteria have been met.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for Part I: Height and Mass of four new row houses at 9-15 East Macon Street with the following conditions to be reviewed with Part II: Design Details:

- 1. Restudy the railing configuration on the rear porches be more consistent.
- On the east, Drayton Street façade, add additional voids.
- 3. Ensure that the column capital extends outward of the porch architrave.
- 4. Ensure that the apron to the garage is not erected on the public right-of-way. PASS
- 5. Revise the driveways to ensure the sidewalks as a continuous uninterrupted pathway.

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby recommend approval of the variance

from the 75% lot coverage requirement to allow 100% coverage and the variance from the 30 foot structured parking setback from Charlton Street to the Zoning Board of Appeals because the variance criteria have been met.

Vote Results

Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

Second: Robin Williams

Debra Caldwell - Ave Justin Gunther - Aye Nicholas Henry - Nay Keith Howington - Abstain Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye Marjorie W Reed - Aye Tess Scheer - Aye **Ebony Simpson** - Aye **Robin Williams** - Aye

26. <u>Petition of Gretchen Callejas for Felder & Associates | 14-006058 | 207 West Broughton Street |</u> Rehabilitation

Attachment: Staff Recommendation.pdf

Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet - Photographs and Drawings.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet - Downspout Specifications.pdf</u>

Attachment: <u>Terrazzo Image.pdf</u>

Ms. Simpson left the meeting at 5:00 p.m

Ms. Gretchen Callejas was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Sara Farr gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting an approval for alterations to the Broughton Street and Broughton Lane facades at 207 West Broughton Street. Historic materials will be retained and new elements will be in-kind replacements of missing historic elements where evidence exists. Work includes the replication of the cast iron sills and lintels on the front façade. The original entablature will be replaced in-kind and the existing pilasters will be exposed and painted. Two new cast iron columns will be built to flank the Broughton Street entrance. The storefront entrance will be recessed 14 feet 6 inches to allow for an outdoor seating area fronting Broughton Street. The existing terrazzo will be replaced with polished concrete. Three new glass light wells will be installed in front of the building to allow light into the basement. New features will be compatible with the adjacent building to which it is an architectural pair.

Ms. Farr explained that the building will receive new windows and doors. The new windows will be VictorBilt Historic Series double hung, single glazed wood windows. Existing brick will be cleaned, repaired and repointed. Awnings will also be installed on the Broughton

Lane façade, and will be made of canvas with 8 feet of clearance. Two stair towers and railings for a roof deck will be added to the roof. The stair towers will be constructed of corrugated steel cladding and a storefront system. They will have angled roofs that have a high point of 10 feet. The railings will be 3 feet tall with less than 4 inches between the horizontal flat steel bars. They will only be minimally visible from State Street and are set back from the edge of the roof. New metal downspouts and scuppers will also be installed on the Broughton Lane façade. The mechanical equipment will be located on the rooftop. The exterior of the windows will be painted ivory. The entry doors and frameless glass system will be an "All Glass" pivoting door entry system by CRL US Aluminum. Any exposed framing or rails will be black. The doors along Broughton Lane will be custom built steel clad solid wood doors with transoms. All signage will be submitted at a later date for approval.

Ms. Farr said that on September 9, 2014 staff approved a COA (14-004489-COA) for selective demolition for the removal of the non-historic metal panels on the front façade in order to assess the remaining historic fabric. The terrazzo located at the entrance reading "Moskin's" cannot be definitively dated. Based on historic photographs and previous research the date range can be estimated at 1955. This is the date Moskin's is first shown at 207 West Broughton Street in the city directory. It is not clear if the terrazzo was installed at the same time as the metal paneling which has been removed in the previous COA.

Ms. Farr reported that staff recommends to continue the application to address the following issues:

- 1. The recessed entrance and seating area design;
- 2. Alterations or removal of the existing entrance terrazzo;
- 3. Provide more information on repointing and a four by four test parch for approval;
- 4. Provide an awning material sample for approval;
- 5. Recess the entrance with the storefront.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

At the meeting, the petitioner presented photographs of recently discovered light wells that exist under the sidewalk as well as the terrazzo at 207 West Broughton Street. The Board encouraged the petitioner to restore the light wells on the sidewalk, but to retain the terrazzo that covers some of these light wells.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition for rehabilitation at 207 West Broughton Street to address the following issues:

- 1. The recessed entrance and seating area design;
- 2. Alterations or removal of the existing entrance terrazzo;
- 3. Provide more information on repointing and a four by four test patch for approval; PASS

- 4. Provide an awning material sample for approval;
- 5. Recess the entrance within the storefront.

Vote Results

Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

Second: Robin Williams

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Justin Gunther - Aye
Nicholas Henry - Aye
Keith Howington - Abstain
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye
Marjorie W Reed - Aye
Tess Scheer - Aye

Ebony Simpson - Not Present

Robin Williams - Aye

27. <u>Petition of Natalie Aiken for Hansen Architects</u> | 14-006074 | 300 West Broughton Street | Windows, Doors

Attachment: Staff Recommendation.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet - Drawings.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet - Window Specs.pdf

Mr. Patrick Phelps was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Sara Farr gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting an approval for windows and doors at 300 West Broughton Street. The proposed work includes the following:

East Facade:

A new opening will be created to install a new storefront window with an inset of 3 inches. The opening is 9 feet 2 inches tall but the width of the opening is not specified. The storefront will be a YHS 50 YKK Storefront system. The existing overhead door will be demolished and a new door installed within the existing opening. The door will be a custom ½ lite wood panel doors with a transom above. The paint color is not specified. On the second and third floors, CMU infill will be removed from existing window openings including two window openings in the stair well. The specific location of these two openings is undetermined. New double hung Marvin Ultimate wood windows will be installed in the openings. The existing awnings and brackets will be removed and the stucco will be patched and painted to match the existing.

South Facade:

On the first floor, the existing awnings and brackets will be removed and the stucco will be patched and painted to match the existing. On the second and third floors the existing windows will be removed and replaced with new double hung Marvin Ultimate wood windows in the existing openings.

The paint color for the windows is not specified. The window locations are based on a historic photograph of the building. Single pane windows will be used.

Ms. Farr reported that the staff recommends approval of the window and door installation and the creation of new openings at 300 West Broughton Street with the following conditions:

- 1. Colors are specified and approved;
- 2. The new door is inset a minimum of 3 inches;
- 3. The windows are inset a minimum of 3 inches
- 4. The storefront window is inset a minimum of four inches and the width of the opening is specified and approved; because the petition otherwise meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for window and door installation and the creation of new openings at 300 West Broughton Street with the following conditions:

- 1. Colors are specified and approved;
- 2. The new door is inset a minimum of 3 inches;
- 3. The windows are inset a minimum of 3 inches:
- 4. The storefront window is inset a minimum of four inches and the width of the opening is specified and approved;

because the petition otherwise meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry Second: Marjorie W Reed

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Justin Gunther - Aye
Nicholas Henry - Aye
Keith Howington - Abstain
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye
Marjorie W Reed - Aye

Tess Scheer - Aye

Ebony Simpson - Not Present

Robin Williams - Aye

28. <u>Petition of Neil Dawson for Dawson Architects | 14-006076-COA | 130 Habersham Street & 412 East York Street | Color Change, Stucco Repair, Windows, Doors, Alterations, and Additions</u>

Attachment: <u>Staff Recommendation.pdf</u>

Attachment: Submittal Package - Narrative.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Package - Drawings and Photographs.pdf

Attachment: Columbia Ward.pdf

Ms. Weibe-Reed recused from participation in this petition. She serves as a consulting architect for Dawson Architects.

Mr. Neil Dawson was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Sara Farr gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting an approval for alterations and additions to the residence at 130 Habersham Street and the carriage house at 412 East York Street as follows:

Main House: All the decking on the balconies will be replaced with IPE wood decking. A frosted glass storm window will also be installed on the interior of the bathroom window on the north façade of the upper floor.

Habersham Street Façade: The existing non-historic concrete treads on the entry stairs will be replaced with new Bluestone reads. The garden and main level entrances doors will be refinished with a walnut finish, and the light fixture at the main entrance will be replaced with a gas lantern. One existing windowwill be removed on the upper level and be replaced with new French doors that will match the existing doors. The windows will be salvaged, and the size of the opening will not change.

York Street Façade: Two windows will be replaced with new balcony access doors. One is located on the main level and one is located on the upper level. Both doors will match the existing doors and will not require a change to the size of the opening. The windows will be salvaged.

Carriage House: A color change to the stucco, trim and shutters is proposed. The stucco will be painted Dovetail by Sherwin Williams (7018), the trim will be painted white to match the existing and the shutters will be painted Porpoise by Sherwin Williams (7047). The existing roof structure will be demolished and replaced with a new parapet wall and rooftop terrace. The parapet will add 11 inches of height to the building. There will be a cable railing behind the parapet that will not be visible from the public right-of-way. The parapet wall will be painted Dovetail. The wood doors will be refinished with a walnut finish.

York Street Façade: A new fixed wall will be constructed behind the existing carriage house garage door. It will be a new milled wood frame glazing wall and inset 4 inches from the façade. The garage door will remain and will be able to be raised or lowered as desired. New garden stairs will be added to access the terrace, but will not be visible from the public right-or-way. Louvered privacy walls will be constructed to conceal these stairs. The privacy

walls will be painted Porpoise. Scuppers and downspouts will be added.

East President Street Façade: A group of three windows will be installed to accommodate a bedroom. The windows will be "Heritage", Jeld-Wen "Tradition Plus Wood Windows" or a similar product with traditional wood design features that meet the standards.

Ms. Farr reported that staff recommends denial of the removal of windows for the balcony access; but that staff recommends approval of the alterations and additions to the residence at 130 Habersham Street and the carriage house at 412 East York Street with the condition that the new window headers on the carriage house extend beyond the width of the window, because otherwise the petition meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby deny the petition for the removal of windows for balcony access and approve the petition for alterations and additions to the residence at 130 Habersham Street and the carriage house at 412 East York Street with the condition - PASS that the new window headers on the carriage house extend beyond the width of the window, because otherwise the petition meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry Second: Justin Gunther

Debra Caldwell - Aye Justin Gunther - Ave Nicholas Henry - Ave Keith Howington - Abstain Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye Marjorie W Reed - Abstain Tess Scheer - Aye **Ebony Simpson** - Not Present **Robin Williams** - Ave

29. Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 14-006079-COA | 7 Drayton Street | Roof Addition

Attachment: Staff Report.pdf

Attachment: 14-000690-COA - Previously Approved Drawings.pdf

Attachment: 14-005568-COA - Previously Denied Drawings and Photographs.pdf

Attachment: Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - Drawings and Photographs.pdf

Attachment: Staff Photographs.pdf

Ms. Becky Lynch was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for a 1-story roof addition for the historic 5-story commercial building located at 7 Drayton Street, also known as the American Building. The addition will be approximately 11 feet high, above the existing parapet wall, at its tallest point. It has an angled footprint that is approximately 39-55 feet wide by 76 feet deep and it set back from the front (Bay Street) and east (Drayton Street facades). The design of the addition is contemporary and uses modern materials.

Ms. Michalak said that on March 12, 2014, the Board approved alterations to the building [File No. 14-000690-COA]. This included alterations to the ground floor, southwest corner recessed entry area and to enclose the existing light well on the west façade of the building with an addition. This work has not been constructed to date; however, this work is indicated on the drawings for the current petition that is under review. This petition modifies the previous approval in design (per the submitted elevations), increasing the infill's height and changing the configuration and design of the infill's materials.

Ms. Michalak stated that on October 8, 2014, the Board denied the request to replace the windows with aluminum clad, double-paned windows [File No. 14-004596-COA]. On December 10, 2014 the Savannah Historic District Board of Review denied a similar petition for a 1-story roof addition on the building because the proposed work did not meet the preservation standards for rooftop additions within Preservation Brief 14-New Exterior Additions to Historic Building Preservation Concerns [File No.14-005568-COA].

Ms. Michalak reported that staff recommends to continue the petition for a 1-story roof addition on the historic 5-story commercial building located at 7 Drayton Street for the petitioner to consider the following:

- 1. Reduce the overall height of the addition and increase the setback along the Bay Street façade to the extent that the addition is not visible from the primary façade (Bay Street) in order to meet the preservation and design standards.
- 2. Provide all material and color selections/samples.
- 3. Indicate that door frames will be inset a minimum of 3 inches from the face of the addition.
- 4. Indicate that storefront glazing will be inset a minimum of 4 inches from the face of the addition.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a 1-story roof addition on the historic 5-story commercial building located at 7 Drayton Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval:

1. Provide all material and color

selections/samples. - PASS

- 2. Indicate that door frames will be inset a minimum of 3 inches from the face of the addition.
- 3. Indicate that storefront glazing will be inset a minimum of 4 inches from the face of the addition.

Vote Results

Motion: Marjorie W Reed Second: Tess Scheer

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Justin Gunther - Aye
Nicholas Henry - Aye
Keith Howington - Abstain
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye
Marjorie W Reed - Aye
Tess Scheer - Aye

Floory Simmon - Not Pre

Ebony Simpson - Not Present
Robin Williams - Aye

30. Petition of Gretchen Callejas for Felder & Associates | 14-006107 | 21 Houston Street | Window

Attachment: Submittal Package - 21 Houston Application and Letter.pdf

Attachment: <u>Submittal Package - Drawings.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Package - Photos.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Staff Recommendation.pdf</u>

Ms. Gretchen Callejas was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Sara Farr gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting an approval for the addition of a window on the East Bryan Street façade of 21 Houston Street. It will be centered under the existing attic window. It will be a custom built true divided light window that will replicate the existing in material and dimensions. The trim, shutters and shutter hardware will also match the existing.

Ms. Farr explained that two COAs were previously approved for this property. One was for a rear addition, a trellis and brick wall alterations (13-005908-COA). The second was for alterations to the previous approval, which included eliminating the trellis and brick wall alterations, as well as changing details of the addition (14-004490-COA). The petitioner has provided further research about the history of the property. It was moved to its current location from the lane at the northwest corner of Jones (at Charlton Lane) and Habersham in the 1960s. It is not clear if the current window configuration is original, but it does appear to be consistent with the configuration when the house was moved. The siding, framing and studs do not appear to be historic and the walls include gypsum board. The window in the living room is also different from the rest of the building's windows.

Ms. Farr reported that staff recommends denial of the application to install a new window

on the East Bryan Street façade of 21 Houston Street, because it does not meet the preservation standards.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board felt that the addition of a window on the East Bryan Street façade, while highly visible, could be approved as long as the window was slightly differentiated from the existing windows to avoid a false sense of historical development. They also felt that since an addition has already been approved for this house, the window could be approved, as well.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the addition of a window on the East Bryan Street façade of 21 Houston Street with the condition that the new window be differentiated from the existing-PASS windows and submitted for staff approval.

Vote Results

Motion: Marjorie W Reed Second: Tess Scheer Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Justin Gunther - Aye
Nicholas Henry - Nay
Keith Howington - Abstain
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye
Marjorie W Reed - Aye
Tess Scheer - Aye

Ebony Simpson - Not Present

Robin Williams - Aye

IX. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

31. <u>Petition of Doug Patten for City of Savannah | 14-005869-COA | Factors Walk & East Broad Street Ramp | Staff Approved - Enclosure for Trash Compactor and Recycling</u>

Attachment: COA - Factors Walk & East Broad Street Ramp 14-005869-COA.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet - Factors Walk & East Broad Street Ramp 14-005869-

COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

32. <u>Petition of Richard Mopper for Mopper Kelly Realtors | 14-005919-COA | 31 West Congress Street | Staff Approved - Color Change and Awnings</u>

Attachment: Application - 31 West Congress Street 14-005919-COA.pdf Attachment: COA - 31 West Congress Street 14-005919-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

33. <u>Petition of Luis Burgos for Hansen Architects, P.C. | 14-006068-COA | 113-115 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Window, Color Change</u>

Attachment: <u>COA - 113-115 West Broughton Street 14-006068-COA.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet - 113-115 W. Broughton St. 14-006068-COA.pdf</u>

No action required. Staff approved.

34. <u>Petition of Flint North for Speedi Sign | 14-006076-COA | 31 West Congress Street | Staff Approved - Sign Face Change</u>

Attachment: COA - 31 West Congress Street 14-006067-COA.pdf

Attachment: Wall_Mount.pdf
Attachment: Lettering_Specs.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

35. <u>Petition of Josh Beckler for Coastal Canvas | 14-006083-COA | 28 West State Street | Staff Approved - Awning</u>

Attachment: <u>COA - 28 West State Street 14-006083-COA.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet 28 W. State St. - 14-006083-COA.pdf</u>

No action required. Staff approved.

36. <u>Petition of Marija Bumgarner for City of Savannah | 14-006166-COA | Oglethorpe Avenue/MLK Jr. Blvd and Drayton Street | Staff Approved - Directional Signs</u>

Attachment: COA - Various Locations on Oglethorpe, MLK and Drayton Street 14-006166-

COA.pdf

Attachment: phase 2-design.pdf Attachment: phase 4-design.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

37. <u>Petition of Abby Longwater for Wicked Cakes | 15-000045-COA | 38 Whitaker Street | Staff Approved - Sign Face Change</u>

Attachment: COA - 38 Whitaker Street 15-000045-COA.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - 38 Whitaker St. - 15-000045-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

38. Report on Work Performed Without a Certificate of Appropriateness

Attachment: HDBR Michalak Work Without a COA 1-14-15.pdf

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, and ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Notices

39. Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting - Thursday, January 15, 2015 at 3:30 p.m. in the West Conference Room, MPC, 110 East State Street

The Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting will be held on Tuesday, January 20, 2015 at 3:30 p.m.

40. Next Meeting - Wednesday, February 11, 2015 at 1:00 p.m. in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, MPC, 112 E. State Street

41. 2015 Calendar of Meetings

Attachment: HDBR 2015 SCHEDULE OF MEETINGS.pdf

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

Unfinished Business

42. Revise By-Laws to allow the Board to determine a Conflict of Interest

Attachment: Proposed amendment to Code of Conduct and Conflict of Interest Section of By-laws 121914.pdf

Continued from the meeting of December 19, 2014, the Board discussed their concerns regarding revising the By-Laws to allow the Board to determine if a conflict of interest exists. At the Board's meeting of December 10, 2014, Dr. Henry proposed that the Historic District Board of Review adopt DeKalb's County Historic Preservation By-Laws and Provisions to determine if a conflict of interest exists.

The Board's discussion centered around the only difference with their present Code of Ethics and DeKalb's By-Laws is an appendix "A" which would change the individual making that determination to the individual making everyone aware so the Board could discuss it; ask questions and then the Board as a whole would vote on whether they believe a conflict exists.

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room January 14, 2015 1:00 p.m. Meeting Minutes

Dr. Henry withdrew is request for the Board to adopt DeKalb's By-Laws. The Board felt their present Code of Ethics and the Disclosure Form that each member completes when they have a conflict of interest is sufficient.

Mr. Howington asked staff if City Council has reviewed the vacancy that they have on the Review Board since October. The Board will send City Council a memo concerning the urgency of filling the vacancy as their quorum is seven members and presently they are short one member. The Board discussed the possibility of getting the quorum changed from seven members to six members. Ms. Harris explained that the Ordinance states the quorum as seven members, but a Text Amendment could be done to change the quorum to six members.

XV. ADJOURNMENT

43. Adjournment

There being no further business to come before the Board, Mr. Howington adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:30 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Ellen I. Harris Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation

EIH:mem