



SAVANNAH HISTORIC DISTRICT
BOARD OF REVIEW

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room
June 10, 2015 1:00 p.m.
Meeting Minutes

JUNE 10, 2015 HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW REGULAR MEETING

HDRB Members Present: Keith Howington, Chair
Ebony Simpson, Vice-Chair
Zena McClain, Esq., Parliamentarian
Debra Caldwell
Dr. Henry Nicholas
Andy McGarrity
Stephen Merriman, Jr.
Majorie Weibe-Reed
Tess Scheer

HDRB Members Not Present: Justin Gunther
Dr. Robin Williams

MPC Staff Present: Tom Thomson, Executive Director
Ellen Harris, Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation
Leah G. Michalak, Historic Preservation Planner
Sara Farr, Historic Preservation Planner
Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

1. [Call to Order, Welcome and Introduction of New Board Member](#)

Mr. Howington called the meeting to order at 1:05 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. He outlined the purpose and role of the Historic District Board of Review. Mr. Howington introduced new Board member Andy McGarrity.

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

2. [Petition of Neil Dawson | 15-002100-COA | 118 W Hall Street | Fence](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Application.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Package.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the fence at 118 West Hall Street, because it is visually compatible and meets the standards. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

Second: Marjorie W Reed

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye

3. [Petition of John Deering, Greenline Architecture | 15-002093-COA | 201 West Bay Street | Alterations](#)

Attachment: [15-002093-COA Revised Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- application.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Drawings.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- project description.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations to 201 West Bay Street to include the new brick signage structure, metal canopy, new wood and glass doors, replacement of four additional sashes, replacement of the handrail, color change on the canopy, and the revised awning frame supports with the following conditions:

1. Ensure the canopy installation bolts are located within the mortar joints rather than stone; - PASS
2. Provide a door specification and color to staff;

3. Provide a mortar sample for the brick signage structure;

4. Provide a detail of the handrail replacement on the Barnard Street façade.

Because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results

Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

4. [Petition of Jamie Douglas | 15-002461-COA | 211 W River Street | Sign](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a projecting sign for Black Dog at 211 West River Street, because it is visually compatible and meets the standards. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

5. [Petition of Joshua Beckler | 15-002572-COA| 410 E Broughton Street | Sign](#)

- Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Submittal 1 - Photograph.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Submittal 2 - Sign.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Submittal 3 - Sign and Awning.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a principal use facade sign at 410 East Broughton Street, because it meets the standards and is visually compatible. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

6. [Approval for Adoption of June 10, 2015 Agenda](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby adopt the June 10, 2015 Meeting Agenda. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Zena McClain, Esq.

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye

Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

7. [Approval of May 13, 2015 Meeting Minutes](#)

Attachment: [05-13-2015 Minutes.pdf](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the May 13, 2015 Meeting Minutes. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Marjorie W Reed

Second: Tess Scheer

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Nicholas Henry - Aye

Andy McGarrity - Aye

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Aye

Marjorie W Reed - Aye

Tess Scheer - Aye

Ebony Simpson - Aye

Keith Howington - Abstain

Zena McClain, Esq. - Abstain

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

8. [Petition of Gavin Macrae-Gibson | 14-003508-COA | 31 East Jones Street | Fence Alteration](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Nicholas Henry - Aye

Keith Howington - Abstain

Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

9. [Petition of Christian Sottile for Sottile & Sottile | 14-005099-COA | 215 West Broughton Street | New Construction: Part 2 Design Details](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested by the petitioner. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

10. [Petition of Neil Dawson, Dawson Architects | 14-005106-COA | 512 West Oglethorpe Avenue | New Construction Hotel: Part II, Design Details](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested by the petitioner. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain

Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

11. [Petition of Patrick Shay for Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 15-001384-COA | 600 East Bay Street | Demolition and New Construction Part 1: Height and Mass](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested by the petitioner. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

12. [Petition of Clegg Ivey | 15-002129-COA | 514 MLK, Jr. Blvd. | Trellis and Fence](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested by the petitioner. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye

Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

13. [Petition of Steve Minish | 15-002687-COA | 518 East Gaston Street | After-the-Fact Fences](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested by the petitioner. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

14. [Petition of Linda Ramsay | 15-002695-COA | 20 East Taylor Street | New Construction Carriage House: Part I, Height and Mass](#)

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested by the petitioner. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

VIII. REGULAR AGENDA

15. [Overview of the Association for Preservation Technology \(APT\)- Rebecca Fenwick](#)

This item was moved to the beginning of the agenda at the request of Marjorie Weibe-Reed.

Ms. Rebecca Fenwick came forward and gave an overview of the Association for Preservation Technology (APT). The APT is a cross-disciplinary, membership organization dedicated to promoting the best technology for conserving historic structures and their settings. Ms. Fenwick stated that as the Board is aware, the Zoning Board of Appeals (ZBA) gave its approval for the demolition of the building at 600 East Bay Street. The APT has a wealth of information at their finger tips that could assist in matters such as this. The APT Building Technology Heritage Library is an on-line, digitized collection of architectural and construction trade catalogs and related publications available for use by the public at no charge.

Mr. Howington thanked Ms. Fenwick for sharing the information with Board.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Ms. Reed said she attended the Zoning Board of Appeals meeting when they heard the petition of 600 East Bay Street and granted the demolition request. She said it was painfully evident that the ZBA was looking for additional data to support not to demolish the building. The staff does not have the resources to do an environmental study. What resources does the Board have?

Mr. Howington said the HBR voted against the demolition. The Board did all that it could do. He said Ms. Meunier might wish to comment on this issue.

Ms. Meunier said that the HSF did reach out to petitioner/owner and offered to conduct an additional study more towards the preservation aspect as opposed to some of the environmental study that was done. But, the petitioner/owner felt they had done the studies that needed to be done.

Mr. Howington reported that Dr. Williams has done research on the buildings that are not on the building map. Maybe the Board can get a list of these buildings from him.

Mr. Thomson stated that from what he heard, the petitioner had two different experts look at the asbestos issue of the building. Maybe some of the issues might need to be looked at earlier by expert groups such as APT before it comes to the Historic Review Board because when it comes before this Board or the Zoning Board of Appeals, it is too late.

Even if this had gone to City Council, they probably would have given their approval to demolish the building as asbestos is a hot button.

Mr. Howington stated that the Board allowed this item to be moved to the beginning of the agenda today, but in all fairness they will not approve to do this again because the other petitioners will have to wait longer for their petition to be heard. The petitions will be heard in the order as shown on the agenda.

16. [Petition of Michael Neumann | 15-002688-COA | 216 W Broughton Street | Color Change, Awnings, Alterations, Signs](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Supplemental information.pdf](#)

Ms. Alexis Aubuchon of Hansen Architects, P.C. was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Sara Farr gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting an approval for alterations, signs, and a color change at 216 West Broughton Street. The work will include new storefront entry doors, new storefront glazing, new awnings, and restoration of storefront cornice, column capitals, corbels and bracket details and new storefront signage. There will also be a new fresh air intake duct installed on the rear façade, which will project to the same height as an existing fresh air intake duct on the rear of the building and be one foot wide.

Ms. Farr explained that the proposed storefront will include a marble vestibule with the Club Monaco Crest in a brass finish. The central double doors will be 6 feet 4 inches wide total and 8 feet tall and flanked by storefront windows each 6 feet ½ inch wide. The entrance will be recessed 4 feet. There will be a light mounted above the doors. It will be a Cornelius Flushmount Light with a copper finish. The new doors will be wood with glazing painted with Fine Paints of Europe Brilliant Hi-Gloss paint in British Standard Colors Black (BS00E53). The door hardware will be Baldwin Richmond Pull Model 2575.050 in oil-rubbed bronze. Each window in the doors will have a small Club Monaco Logo. There will also be a transom above the door with the address in the central window. The storefront will also be constructed of wood with a base. The existing cast iron pilasters will remain and a cornice detail will be added to match historic precedent. These will all be painted Valspar High Gloss in Bleached Slate (7004-20). Each storefront window will have a window cling sized approximately 3 feet by 4 inches. There will also be windows above the storefront windows and storefront door that will be constructed of reclaimed prismatic glass. The central prismatic glass window will be sized 6 feet 10 inches by 3 feet 2 inches and will be flanked by two prismatic glass windows each 5 feet 1 ½ inches by 3 feet 2 inches.

Ms. Farr stated that there will also be a retractable awning installed over the entrance. The awning will extend to the outside of the new storefront windows and provide 10 feet of clearance above the sidewalk. It will include graphics above the entrance that read "Club Monaco" sized approximately 5 feet by 3 ½ inches. The awning will be covered with Sunbrella cloth in Silver. A principal use façade sign is proposed above the awning.

Ms. Farr reported that staff recommends approval of the awnings, a sign and new

storefront with the following conditions:

1. The storefront is inset a minimum of four inches from the façade;
2. The prismatic glass windows are inset a minimum of three inches from the façade;
3. The prismatic glass transom is redesigned as to not create a false sense of history and submitted to staff for review and approval:

because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Ms. Aubuchon clarified their proposed prismatic glass transom which is their preferred option. She explained that the inset requirement will be met.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussed the proposed alternative that the petitioner presented at the meeting that simplified the prismatic glass transom. The proposed alternative closely mimics the historic layout of the transom from historic photographs and uses a ribbed glass that the Board felt would not create a false sense of historic development since it would not be used reclaimed materials.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for awnings, a sign and new storefront with the following conditions:

1. The storefront is inset a minimum of four inches from the façade;
2. The prismatic glass windows are inset a minimum of three inches from the façade; - PASS
3. The prismatic glass transom is redesigned so as to not create a false sense of history and submitted to staff for review and approval.

because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results

Motion: Nicholas Henry

Second: Tess Scheer

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Nicholas Henry - Aye

Keith Howington - Abstain

Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye

Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

17. [Petition of Andy Lynch, Lynch Associates Architects, PC | 15-002705-COA | 15 East Gordon Street | Addition](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation 15-002705-COA.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Drawings.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Project Narrative.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Application.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Cable railing specification.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Monterey Ward.pdf](#)
Attachment: [1980s photographs.pdf](#)

Mr. Andrew Lynch was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for alterations to the rear porch of the main house including removing the wooden railing system on the third floor and replacing with a cable railing system, removal of a non-historic metal staircase, adding a new staircase in a different configuration, and adding a walkway from the main house to the roof of the accessory building.

Ms. Harris explained that on the accessory building, the petitioner is proposing to remove the gable roof and replace with a flat roof. There will be a three foot tall metal planter above the lane façade of the accessory building, and a sail canvas canopy with metal posts is proposed to cover the new roof of the accessory building. The wall of the adjacent carriage house will be covered with a new eight foot, four inch tall aluminum framed wall with horizontal stained wood and a light fixture.

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends approval of the additions and alterations at 15 East Gordon Street with the following conditions:

1. Revise the planter material to be more visually compatible with its context and allow the planter element to "read" as a parapet wall;
2. Provide an awning color sample to staff for review and approval;
3. Provide additional details on the proposed wall structure and light fixture to staff for review and approval;

Because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

PETITIONER PRESENTATION

Mr. Lynch stated that they have no exceptions to staff recommendations. The planter will be flush with the wall below.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussion focused on staff recommendations which included:

1. Revise the planter material to be more visually compatible with its context and allow the planter element to "read" as a parapet wall;
2. The petitioner provide an awning sample to staff for review and approval;
3. The petitioner provide additional details on the proposed wall structure and light fixture to staff for review and approval.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Ms. Danielle Meunier of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) stated that they agree with staff that the planter material should be more visually compatible.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for additions and alterations at 15 East Gordon Street with the following conditions:

1. Revise the planter material to be more visually compatible with its context and allow the planter element to "read" as a parapet wall;
2. Provide an awning color sample to staff for review and approval; - PASS
3. Provide additional details on the proposed wall structure and light fixture to staff for review and approval;

Because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results

Motion: Marjorie W Reed

Second: Tess Scheer

- | | |
|-----------------------------|-----------|
| Debra Caldwell | - Aye |
| Nicholas Henry | - Aye |
| Keith Howington | - Abstain |
| Zena McClain, Esq. | - Nay |
| Andy McGarrity | - Aye |
| Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. | - Nay |
| Marjorie W Reed | - Aye |

Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Nay

18. [Petition of Patrick Phelps for Hansen Architects | 15-002710-COA | 200 Block East McDonough Street | New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass \(North Building\)](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation 15-002710-COA.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Revised Submittal Packet- Drawings.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Entrance analysis.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Application checklist.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Application.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- BROWN WARD ANALYSIS.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Compliance Checklist.pdf](#)

Mr. Howington laid out the ground rules for the hearing of this petition. The petitioner will have 10 minutes to give their presentation and the public will have 10 minutes to make their comments.

Mr. Patrick Phelps was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval of Part I: Height and Mass of a new five story building between Drayton and Floyd Streets, and McDonough and Perry Streets. The building orients toward Perry Street. The building is part of a larger redevelopment project which also includes the parcel to the south. The two buildings will share one level of underground parking. The two buildings share similar detailing and design, but will be reviewed separately.

Ms. Harris explained that the petitioner is also requesting variances from the following standards:

1. All Mechanical or Access structures shall be contained within the additional story.
2. Exterior building walls shall use window groupings (including curtain walls), columns, and/or pilasters to create multiply bays not less than 15 feet nor more than 20 feet in width.

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends a continuance of the proposal of a new five story building in the 200 block of East McDonough Street in order to address the following:

1. Reduce the width of the canopy on Perry Street so that it does not extend over the street or reconfigure the parallel entrances;
2. Incorporate an additional entrance in the central bay along McDonough Street;
3. Along the parking drop off area, provide larger planters or otherwise redesign, to better form the wall of continuity;
4. Either vary the roofline to meet the selected massing standard, or select a different standard to break up the massing;
5. Add an exterior entrance to the gym along Floyd Street;
6. Incorporate additional features along Drayton Street such as awnings, canopies

- and/or entrances to better address Drayton Street;
7. Reorient the primary entrance to McDonough Street, as the wider street, and to avoid the congestions that the parallel entrance creates on Perry Street;
 8. Redesign the bay spacing to be between 15 feet and 20 feet in width;
 9. Contain all rooftop elements with the bonus fifth floor;
 10. This building is part of a larger development with the parcel to the south, and both buildings contain very similar detailing and design. Staff recommends incorporating additional differentiation in detailing and design between the two buildings.

Ms. Harris reported also that staff recommends denial of the request for variances from the following standards:

1. All Mechanical or Access structures shall be contained within the additional story.
2. Exterior building walls shall use window groupings (including curtain walls), columns, and/or pilasters to create multiple bays not less than 15 feet nor more than 20 feet in width.

Because the variance criteria have not been meet.

PETITIONER PRESENTATION

Mr. Phelps stated that he would address the staff's comments and provide the resolution that they are proposing to take to address the concerns.

1. Reduce the with of the canopy on Perry Street not to extend over the street.
Petitioner's resolution: Reduce the width of the canopy on Perry Street not to extend over the street, but the edge of the curb for a distance of six feet from the face of the building.
2. Incorporate an additional entrance in the center bay along McDonough Street.
Petitioner's resolution: Additional entrances added along McDonough Street.
3. Along the parking drop off area, provide larger planters or otherwise redesign, to better form a wall of continuity.
Petitioner's resolution: Request to resolve and present as part of Part II Design Details.
4. Either vary the roofline to meet the selected massing standard or select a different standard to break up the massing.
Petitioner's resolution: The ordinance states roofline variation. Frontage may be continuous, provide that the roofline shall be varied through the use of volumetric forms and roof shapes of varying heights. The roofline shall provide a minimum one-half story height variation within the street fronting façade. They will create a modern building.
5. Add exterior entrance to the gym along Floyd Street.
Petitioner's resolution: Exterior entrances will be added to the gym along Floyd Street.
6. Incorporate additional features along Drayton Street such as awnings, canopies,

and/or entrances to better address Drayton Street.

Petitioner's resolution: The typical development patterns in the ward and along Drayton and Whitaker Street (North/South service streets) place entrances along the north and south side of the blocks. Drayton Street is typically reserved for secondary entrances. Primary entrances are typically oriented to the East/West Connecting Streets (Perry Street). They will add an entrance to the restaurant on Drayton Street and will add signage, hardscape, and landscaping to enhance the façade and pedestrian interaction for review at Part II, Design Detail.

7. Reorient the primary entrance to McDonough Street, as the wider street, and to avoid the congestion that the parallel entrance creates on Perry Street.
Petitioner's resolution: The typical development pattern in the ward and along the entire length of McDonough Street is that primary entrances are located on the East/West connecting streets and not the trust street. Entrances along the trust street (if existing) are secondary and service entrances.
8. Redesign the bay spacing to be between 15' - 20' in width.
Petitioner's resolution: General bay spacing complies with the intent of the ordinance. Bay spacing varies from a majority of 14'-2" to a maximum of 23'-4". Mr. Phelps feels that the intent of the ordinance is met. Surrounding historic contributing buildings do not comply with the standard, including Drayton Tower, Parkers, Savannah Theater, Derenne Apartments, and Motorini gas station.
9. Contain all roof elements within the bonus fifth floor.
Petitioner's resolution: The petitioner requests a variance to allow access to the roof and required mechanical equipment. Technically, it is not feasible to have no mechanical roof top equipment or no access. Equipment and access shall be set back to reduce view from public right-of-way. Landscaping at parapet will also soften the view
10. The building is part of a larger development with the parcel to the south, and both buildings contain very similar detailing in design. Staff recommends incorporating additional differentiation in detailing and design between the two buildings.
Petitioner's resolution: Their intent is that the two buildings be treated as a cohesive development occupying two separate blocks. Additional differentiation may be explored and provided for review during Part II Design Detailing.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Nathan Godley of 235 Abercorn Street questioned if anybody gave thought to the impact that this project will cause regarding height and mass to their residential property. He is also concerned about the buildings being built close to the street. Parking will be a nightmare.

Ms. Harris explained that the Height Map allows for four stories on this property. The petitioner is qualifying for a fifth bonus story by incorporating retail on the first floor.

Mr. Kirk Kubista of 233 Abercorn Street said they bought their property in January 2015. They are concerned about the compatibility of their neighborhood and the traffic flow that will be in their area. They will now have a one-way thoroughfare.

Ms. Danielle Meunier of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) said they had the opportunity to meet with the petitioner. The HSF agrees with staff and believes a continuance would be in order.

Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) stated that the HSF has enjoyed the dialogue that they had with the petitioner. As Mr. Phelps said, this is a modern building. The petitioner needs to be allowed to be creative and look at this building in a different way. Mr. Carey said he believes continuing this review is good as it will allow the Review Board and the petitioner the chance to look at this some more.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussion focused on the staff's recommendations which included:

1. Reduce the width of the canopy on Perry Street so that it does not extend over the street or reconfigure the parallel entrances;
2. Incorporate an additional entrance in the central bay along McDonough Street;
3. Along the parking drop off area, provide larger planters or otherwise redesign, to better form the wall of continuity;
4. Either vary the roofline to meet the selected massing standard, or select a different standard to break up the massing;
5. Add an exterior entrance to the gym along Floyd Street;
6. Incorporate additional features along Drayton Street such as awnings, canopies and/or entrances to better address Drayton Street
7. Reorient the primary entrance to McDonough Street, as the wider street, and to avoid the congestions that the parallel entrance creates on Perry Street;
8. Redesign the bay spacing to be between 15 feet and 20 feet in width;
9. Contain all rooftop elements with the bonus fifth floor;
10. This building is part of a larger development with the parcel to the south, and both buildings contain very similar detailing and design. Staff recommends incorporating additional differentiation in detailing and design between the two buildings.

The Board also discussed the petitioner's request for the variance.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition for a new five story building in the 200 block of East McDonough Street as requested of the petitioner. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Zena McClain, Esq.
Second: Nicholas Henry

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby recommend denial to the Zoning Board of Appeals, of the request for variances from the following design standards:

1. All Mechanical or Access structures shall be contained within the additional story.
 2. Exterior building walls shall use window groupings (including curtain walls), columns, and/or pilasters to create multiple bays not less than 15 feet nor more than 20 feet in width.
- PASS

Because the variance criteria have not been met.

Vote Results

Motion: Ebony Simpson

Second: Zena McClain, Esq.

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

[19. Petition of Patrick Phelps for Hansen Architects | 15-002751-COA | 200 Block East Perry Street | New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass \(South Building\)](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation 15-002751-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Revised Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Application.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet- BROWN WARD ANALYSIS.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Compliance Checklist.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)
Attachment: [Correspondance from Traffic Engineering.pdf](#)

Mr. Howington laid out the ground rules for the hearing of this petition. The petitioner will have 10 minutes to give their presentation and the public will have 10 minutes to make their comments.

Mr. Patrick Phelps was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval of Part I: Height and Mass of a new six story building between Drayton and Floyd Streets and Perry Street and Perry Lane. The proposed building adjoins the one-story contributing building, formally the Smith's Texaco and more recently Motorini, which faces Drayton Street. The proposed building orients toward Perry Street. The building is part of a larger development project which also includes the parcel to the north. The two buildings will share one level of underground parking. The two buildings share similar detailing and design, but will be reviewed separately.

Ms. Harris stated that the petitioner is also requesting variances from the following standards:

1. Variance from the Height Map.
2. Exterior building walls shall use window groupings (including curtain walls), columns, and/or pilasters to create multiple bays not less than 15 feet nor more than 20 feet in width.

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends a continuance of the proposal of a new six story building in the 200 block of East Perry Street in order to address the following:

1. Reduce the height of the building of five stories to be in compliance with the Height Map;
2. Reduce the height of the sixth floor, if a variance for the six floor is granted;
3. Remove the parking access from Perry Street and orient it to Perry Lane (preferred) or Floyd Street.
4. Ensure that the standards for curb cut widths, sidewalks, and garage openings are met;
5. Along the parking drop off area, provide larger planters or otherwise redesign, to better form the wall of continuity;
6. Redesign the bay spacing to be between 15 feet and 20 feet in width;
7. This building is part of a larger development with the parcel to the north, and both buildings contain very similar detailing and design. Staff recommends incorporating additional differentiation in detailing and design between the two buildings.

Ms. Harris reported also that staff recommends denial of the request for variances from the following design standards:

1. A one story variance from the Height Map; and

2. Exterior building walls shall use window groupings (including curtain walls), columns, and/or pilasters to create multiple bays not less than 15 feet nor more than 20 feet in width.

Because the variance criteria have not been met.

PETITIONER PRESENTATION

Mr. Phelps stated that he would address the staff's comments and provide the resolution that they are proposing to take to address the concerns.

1. Reduce the height of the building to stories, to be in compliance with the Height Map.

Petitioner's Resolution: The height variance of one-story requested because the overall building is compatible to other adjacent contributing building within the ward. The additional story softens the height transition north of Drayton Tower and does not have an adverse affect on neighboring contributing buildings.

2. Reduce the height of the sixth floor, if a variance for the sixth floor is granted.
Petitioner's Resolution: The height of the sixth floor has been reduced 2'-6".
3. Remove the parking access from Perry Street and orient it to Perry Lane (preferred) or Floyd Street.

Petitioner's Resolution: Parking is not allowed by Traffic Engineering along Perry Lane. Mid block curb cuts have historic precedent in the area.

4. Ensure that the standards for curb cut widths, sidewalks, and garage openings are met.

Petitioner's Resolution: Standards for cuts, widths, sidewalks and garage openings will be met.

5. Along the parking drop off area, provide larger planters or otherwise redesign, to better form the wall of continuity.

Petitioner's Resolution: Planters at entry and hardscape to be reviewed in Part II, Design Detail.

6. Redesign the bay spacing to be between 15 feet and 20 feet in width.

Petitioner's Resolution: Bay spacing defined to meet the intent of the ordinance.

7. This building is part of a larger development with the parcel to the north, and both buildings contain very similar detailing and design. Staff recommends incorporating additional differentiation in detailing and design between the two buildings.

Petitioner's Resolution: Differentiation between the two buildings may be provided in Part II, Design Detail for review.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Nathan Godley of 235 Abercorn Street stated that he is not opposed to the building. He was excited when he heard they were getting a "blue tooth" hotel. However, he thought it would be a little smaller and a little more compatible with his home. Mr. Godley said he is concerned about Floyd Street. He believes too much is being cramped into this lot. He is concerned about the ordinances, but realizes that the Review Board's hands are tied. Mr. Godley said the developers are going to destroy what makes this beautiful city unique.

Mr. Kirk Kubista of 233 Abercorn Street said he does not know what the top floor will be. Is it glass, a penthouse or a swimming pool? He is concerned about the glass reflection from an easterly sunshine and at the end of the day, it becomes a western issue and will shield most of the sunlight that he and his neighbor enjoy in the afternoon.

Ms. Danielle Meunier of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) stated their comments will echo the same comments that they have referred to for the north building. The HSF believes that there is an opportunity for some different things to be done with this property and they are looking forward to seeing them.

Mr. Greg Parker said he owns the Parker's Market next door to this property. He said that while he is not happy with losing four parking spaces, he is excited about a hotel being built here. He has met with the petitioners and they have been willing to listen to him. It appears that the petitioners are willing to come up with good solutions. He believes this will be a good thing for our city.

Mr. Mel Wolf stated that he is currently a business owner in this area. From personal experience, he can say that since Drayton Towers has been renovated things have been fine. As a business owner, he believes this will be good.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition for a new six story building in the 200 block of East Perry Street at the request of the petitioner. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Zena McClain, Esq.
Second: Ebony Simpson

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Aye

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby recommend denial to the Zoning Board of Appeals (ZBA), of the request for variances from the following design standards:

1. A one story variance from the Height Map;
and
2. Exterior building walls shall use window groupings (including curtain walls), columns, and/or pilasters to create multiple bays not less than 15 feet nor more than 20 feet in width

- PASS

Because the variance criteria have not been met

Vote Results

Motion: Zena McClain, Esq.

Second: Tess Scheer

Debra Caldwell

- Aye

Nicholas Henry

- Aye

Keith Howington

- Abstain

Zena McClain, Esq.

- Aye

Andy McGarrity

- Nay

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

- Aye

Marjorie W Reed

- Aye

Tess Scheer

- Aye

Ebony Simpson

- Aye

IX. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

20. [Petition of Greenline Architecture | 14-002864-COA | 63 MLK, Jr. Blvd. | 12-month Extension: Non-Historic Demolition](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [COA - 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard 14-002864-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Mr. Howington recused from participation in this petition. He is an employee of Greenline Architecture. Ms. Simpson chaired the hearing of this petition.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a 12 month extension of the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) issued on July 9, 2014 for a demolition of the non-contributing building location at 53 MLK, Jr. Blvd. [File No. 14-002864-COA] to expire on July 9, 2016. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

Second: Nicholas Henry	
Nicholas Henry	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Aye
Marjorie W Reed	- Aye
Tess Scheer	- Aye
Ebony Simpson	- Abstain
Debra Caldwell	- Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

21. [Petition of Paul Joseph Giles | 15-002184-COA | 550 East McDonough Street | Staff Approved - Replace Roof and Windows](#)

Attachment: [COA - 548-550 East McDonald Street 15-002184-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 550 E. McDonough St. - 15-002184-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

22. [Petition of Paul Miller | 15-002448-COA | 224 Houston Street | Staff Approved - Windows](#)

Attachment: [COA - 224 Houston Street 15-002448-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Match Existing.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

23. [Petition of Andre Gadson for Whitlow Construction Co., Inc. | 15-002596-COA | 5 East Macon Street | Staff Approved - Awnings](#)

Attachment: [COA - 5 East Macon Street 15-002596-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 5 East Macon Street 15-002596-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

24. [Petition of Peter Thompson | 15-002597-COA | 529 and 531 East Harris Street | Staff Approved - Color Change and Metal Roof](#)

Attachment: [COA - 529 and 531 East Harris Street 15-002597-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 529 and 531 East Harris Street 15-002597-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

25. [Petition of David "Luke" Gabelman | 15-002686-COA | 518-520 Blair Street | Staff Approved - Repairs](#)

Attachment: [COA - 518-520 Blair Street 15-002686-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 518-520 Blair Street 15-002686-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

26. [Petition of Luis Burgos | 15-002713-COA | 109 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Door Opening](#)

Attachment: [COA - 109 West Broughton Street 15-002713-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 109 West Broughton Street 15-002713-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

27. [Petition of Michelle Roberts for the Fitts Company, Inc. | 15-002715-COA | 339 MLK Jr. Blvd. | Staff Approved - Sign Face Changes](#)

Attachment: [ATM sign panel.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Directional Sign.pdf](#)

Attachment: [COA - 339 Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard 15-002715-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

28. [Petition of Alexandra Trujillo de Taylor | 15-002781-COA | 236 Bull Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 236 Bull Street 15-002781-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

29. [Petition of Andre Gadson for Eco Friendly Contracting | 15-002809-COA | 426 Abercorn Street | Staff Approved - Repair Column](#)

Attachment: [COA - 426 Abercorn Street 15-002809-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 426 Abercorn Street 15-002809-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

30. [Petition of Luis Burgos | 15-002848-COA | 300 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Windows](#)

Attachment: [300 W Broughton St - Additional Info COA Application.pdf](#)

Attachment: [COA - 300 West Broughton Street 15-002848-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

31. [Amended Petition of Michael Connor | 15-002852-COA | 317 East Broad Street | Staff Approved - Awnings](#)

Attachment: [COA - 317 East Broad Street 15-002852-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [rendering of proposed awning \(2\).pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

32. [Petition of Joshua Beckler for Coastal Canvas Products, LLC | 15-002862-COA | 106 West Gwinnett Street - Unit 6B | Staff Approved - Awning](#)

Attachment: [COA - 106 West Gwinnett Street - Unit 6B 15-002862-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 106 West Gwinnett Street Unit 6B 15-002862-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

33. [Petition of Joshua Beckler for Coastal Canvas Products, LLC | 15-002865-COA | 236 Drayton Street | Staff Approved - Awning](#)

Attachment: [COA - 236 Drayton Street 15-002865-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 236 Drayton Street 15-002865-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

34. [Petition of Joshua Beckler for Coastal Canvas Products, LLC | 15-002866-COA | 418 East Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Recover An Awning](#)

Attachment: [COA - 418 East Broughton Street 15-002866-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 418 East Broughton Street 15-002866-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

35. [Petition of Rhondda Netherton | 15-002873-COA | 324 Price Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [20150529_153337.pdf](#)

Attachment: [COA - 324 Price Street 15-002873-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

36. [Petition of John Post for Commonwealth Construction | 15-002900-COA | 407 East Hall Street | Staff Approved - Shutters](#)

Attachment: [COA - 407 East Hall Street 15-002900-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 407 East Hall Street 15-002900-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

37. [Petition of John Post for Commonwealth Construction | 15-002905-COA | 37 East Broad Street | Staff Approved - Repointing](#)

Attachment: [COA - 37 East Broad Street 15-002905-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 37 East Broad Street 15-002905-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

38. [Petition of John Post for Commonwealth Construction | 15-002907-COA | 20 West Oglethorpe Avenue | Staff Approved - Doors](#)

Attachment: [COA - 20 West Oglethorpe Avenue 15-002907-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 20 West Oglethorpe Avenue 15-002907-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

39. [Petition of Bart Redmond for Redmond Construction | 15-002909-COA | 304 East President Street | Staff Approved - Roof Repair](#)

Attachment: [COA - 304 East President Street 15-002909-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 304 East President Street 15-002909-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

40. [Petition of Martin Smith for SCAD | 15-002919-COA | 318 East Liberty Street | Staff Approved - Replace Roof](#)

Attachment: [2015_318EastLibertySt_Existing \(2\).pdf](#)

Attachment: [Capture.pdf](#)

Attachment: [COA - 318 East Liberty Street 15-002919-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

41. [Petition of Joshua Beckler for Coastal Canvas Products, LLC | 407 East River Street | 15-002934-COA | Staff Approved - Awnings](#)

Attachment: [152180 PEANUT SHOP \(2\) 407 East River Street.pdf](#)

Attachment: [COA - 407 East River Street 15-002934-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

42. [Petition of Richard Shirah for T-Mobile South, LLC | 15-003049-COA | 322 East Taylor Street | Staff Approved - Roof Communications equipment and antennas](#)

Attachment: [COA - 322 East Taylor Street 15-003049-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 322 East Taylor Street 15-003049-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

43. [Report on Work Performed Without a Certificate of Appropriateness](#)

Attachment: [HDBR Michalak Work Without a COA 6-10-15.pdf](#)

Mr. Howington said the staff has given the Board a written report on the work performed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, and ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

New Business

44. [Overview of the Economic Impact Report: Beyond Tourism- Historic Preservation in the Economy and Life of Savannah and Chatham County- Daniel Carey](#)

Ms. Danielle Meunier of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) gave the overview of an economic study done by Donovan Rypkema and Briana Paxton with research assistance from Reina Chano. Rypkema is principal of Place Economics, a Washington D. C. based real estate and economic development consulting firm. The title of the study is "*Beyond Tourism Historic Preservation in the Economy and Life of Savannah and Chatham County.*" The goal of the study was to look at the preservation in Savannah not including tourism. They are very pleased with the results of this study.

XV. ADJOURNMENT

45. [Adjourned](#)

There being no further business to come before the Historic District Board of Review, Mr. Howington adjourned the meeting at 5:15 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Ellen Harris
Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation

EIH:mem