



SAVANNAH HISTORIC DISTRICT  
BOARD OF REVIEW

---

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room  
October 12, 2016 1:00 P.M.  
Meeting Minutes

**OCTOBER 12, 2016 HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW REGULAR MEETING**

**HDRB Members Present:** Stephen Merriman, Jr., Chair  
Justin Gunther, Vice-Chair  
Debra Caldwell  
Jennifer Deacon  
Dr. Betsey Dominguez  
Kellie Fletcher  
Keith Howington  
Tess Scheer

**HDRB Members Not Present:** Zena McClain, Esq., Parliamentarian  
Becky Lynch  
Andy McGarrity

**MPC Staff Present:** Ellen Harris, Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation  
Leah G. Michalak, Historic Preservation Planner  
Sara Farr, Historic Preservation Planner  
Alyson Smith, Historic Preservation Planner  
Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

**I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME**

1. [Order and Welcome](#)

**Mr. Merriman** called the meeting to order at 1:05 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. He outlined the role of the Historic District Board of Review and explained the process for hearing the various petitions. Staff will present each application with a recommendation. The petitioner will have the opportunity to respond to the recommendation. The petitioners are asked to limit their presentation to 10 minutes or less and only address the items identified as inconsistent with the ordinance and questions raised by the Board. The public will have the same allotted time, ten minutes, to comment.

The petitioner will be given the opportunity to respond to the public comments. The Board will then go into Board discussion at which time no further testimony is received unless specifically requested by the Chair. Each Board member will be given two minutes twice to provide comments, if they so desire.

## II. SIGN POSTING

## III. CONSENT AGENDA

### 2. [Approval of Consent Agenda October 12, 2016](#)

#### **Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the Consent Agenda for October 12, 2016. - PASS

#### **Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington  
Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

### 3. [Petition of Reardon Design | 16-004016-COA | 125 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd | New Storefront](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Rendering.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Drawing.pdf](#)

#### **Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the alterations at 125 Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard with the following conditions:

1. Remove the divided lites;
2. Provide material and color samples for the gas lanterns, storefront windows, and doors, - PASS storefront base staff approval;

Because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

4. [Petition of Russell Lee | 16-004824-COA | 236 Drayton Street | Sign](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the two principal use signs for the separate uses at 236 Drayton Street as proposed because the signs meet the standards and - PASS are visually compatible.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

5. [Petition of Andrew Davis for Sign D'Sign | 16-005062-COA | 111 West Bay Street | Sign](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the projecting principal use sign at 111 West Bay Street as proposed because the sign meets the standards and is visually compatible. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Dr. Betsy Dominguez - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Justin Gunther - Aye

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Not Present

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Tess Scheer - Aye

**IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

6. [Adoption of Agenda for October 12, 2016 Meeting](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby adopt the October 12, 2016 Meeting Agenda. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Tess Scheer

Second: Justin Gunther

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Dr. Betsy Dominguez - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Justin Gunther - Aye

Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

## V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

### 7. [Approval of September 14, 2016 Meeting Minutes](#)

Attachment: [9-14-2016 Minutes.pdf](#)

#### **Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the meeting minutes of September 14, 2016. - PASS

#### **Vote Results**

Motion: Justin Gunther  
Second: Jennifer Deacon

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

## VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

## VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

### 8. [Continue All Items to Next Regular Meeting](#)

#### **Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the requested petitions to the meeting of November 9, 2016. - PASS

#### **Vote Results**

Motion: Debra Caldwell  
Second: Keith Howington

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye

Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

9. [Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 15-001384-COA | 600 East Bay Street | New Construction: Part II, Design Details](#)

<b>Board Action:</b>	
The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.	- PASS
<b>Vote Results</b>	
Motion: Debra Caldwell	
Second: Keith Howington	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

10. [Petition of Gary Sanders | 16-003487-COA | 305 West Wayne Street | New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass](#)

<b>Board Action:</b>	
The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.	- PASS
<b>Vote Results</b>	
Motion: Debra Caldwell	
Second: Keith Howington	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye

Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

11. [Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects | 16-003492-COA | 607 Drayton Street | New Construction: Part II, Design Details](#)

<b>Board Action:</b>	
The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.	- PASS
<b>Vote Results</b>	
Motion: Debra Caldwell	
Second: Keith Howington	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

12. [Petition of King Chau | 16-005167-COA | 8 East Broughton Street | Sign](#)

<b>Board Action:</b>	
The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.	- PASS
<b>Vote Results</b>	
Motion: Debra Caldwell	
Second: Keith Howington	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye

Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

13. [Petition of Gregory Beck | 16-005197-COA | 409 East Charlton Street | Alterations](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Debra Caldwell

Second: Keith Howington

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Dr. Betsy Dominguez - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Justin Gunther - Aye

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Not Present

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Tess Scheer - Aye

**VIII. REGULAR AGENDA**

14. [Petition of Barnard Architects | 16-002725-COA | 202 East Gaston Street | Alterations and Additions](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Photographs.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet- historic research.pdf](#)

Attachment: [REVISED Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [REVISED Submittal Packet - Renderings, Color, Drawings, Specs.pdf](#)

**Mr. John Clegg and Mr. Scott Barnard** were present on behalf of the petition.

**Ms. Leah Michalak** gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting multiple alterations to both the main house and the carriage house at 202 East Gaston Street, as follows:

**General**

- All facades will be cleaned and painted with an elastomeric paint.
- New paint colors are proposed on all elements.



## **Main House**

### **South (Gaston) façade:**

- Third floor (top floor) windows will be repaired as needed.
- Second floor doors and transoms will be replaced with new two-over-two windows.
- The second floor wood rails will be removed and replaced with iron railings.
- Parlor floor main door, transom, and lintel will be moved to the west to align with the window above. The door and transom will be replaced with a new door and transom to be more similar to the doors and transom on 204 and 206 East Gaston Street.
- The parlor floor wooden railing will be replaced with iron railings.
- The parlor floor existing nine-inch diameter wood columns will be replaced with ten-inch diameter tapered HB&G columns.
- The ground floor masonry railing will be partially removed and replaced with iron railing on the upper portion.

### **West (Abercorn) façade:**

- All windows will be repaired as needed.
- The parlor floor door and transom will be replaced with a new door and transom to match the new front entry.
- The existing cast iron railing will be replaced with new iron railing.
- The ground level existing door will be removed and will be infilled with masonry and stucco to match existing.
- The diamond shaped pattern in the stucco on the north and south sides of the raised stoop will be removed and “smoothed” out.

### **North (rear) façade:**

- All windows will be repaired as needed.
- Add new one-over-one window at parlor level.
- Add new door opening and door with an uncovered bridge at parlor level that connects to the carriage house.
- Add new door opening and door at ground level (not visible).

### **Rooftop:**

- New mechanical equipment is proposed to be installed on the southern half of the roof near the front façade’s parapet wall. The petitioner contends that the equipment will not be visible from any public right-of-way.
- A new stair access and trellis is proposed to be installed on the northern half of the roof near the rear façade’s parapet wall.

## **Courtyard**

- The existing concrete block wall along Abercorn Street that currently encloses the courtyard will be removed and replaced with a new 8'-2" high brick wall with a double gate. The existing shed within the courtyard will be removed/demolished completely.
- Beyond the wall, on the east property line, a new bridge will connect the parlor level of the house to the second floor of the carriage house.
- Above the bridge, a privacy wall of fixed shutters is proposed along the east property line at a height of approximately 16'-3".
- A water feature is proposed below the bridge which will not be visible.

### **Carriage House**

#### **South (courtyard) façade:**

- Remove non-historic addition.
- Convert existing door opening to a one-over-one window.
- Add new door opening and door with an uncovered bridge at the second floor that connects to the parlor level of the main house.

#### **West (Abercorn) façade:**

- All windows will be repaired as needed.
- The infilled door opening will be removed and replaced with smooth textured stucco.

#### **North (lane) façade:**

- On second floor, the existing six-over-six window will be replaced with two-over-two window.
- A new garage door opening and new man door opening will be added.

**Ms. Michalak** stated that the petitioner is requesting multiple alterations to both the main house and the carriage house at 202 East Gaston Street, as follows:

### **General**

- All facades will be cleaned and painted with an elastomeric paint.
- New paint colors are proposed on all elements.

### **Main House**

#### **South (Gaston) façade:**

- Third floor (top floor) windows will be repaired as needed.
- Second floor doors and transoms will be replaced with new two-over-two windows.
- The second floor wood rails will be removed and replaced with iron railings.
- Parlor floor main door, transom, and lintel will be moved to the west to align with the window above. The door and transom will be replaced with a new door and transom to be more similar to the doors and transom on 204 and 206 East

Gaston Street.

- The parlor floor wooden railing will be replaced with iron railings.
- The parlor floor existing nine-inch diameter wood columns will be replaced with ten-inch diameter tapered HB&G columns.
- The ground floor masonry railing will be partially removed and replaced with iron railing on the upper portion.

**West (Abercorn) façade:**

- All windows will be repaired as needed.
- The parlor floor door and transom will be replaced with a new door and transom to match the new front entry.
- The existing cast iron railing will be replaced with new iron railing.
- The ground level existing door will be removed and will be infilled with masonry and stucco to match existing.
- The diamond shaped pattern in the stucco on the north and south sides of the raised stoop will be removed and “smoothed” out.

**North (rear) façade:**

- All windows will be repaired as needed.
- Add new one-over-one window at parlor level.
- Add new door opening and door with an uncovered bridge at parlor level that connects to the carriage house.
- Add new door opening and door at ground level (not visible).

**Rooftop:**

- New mechanical equipment is proposed to be installed on the southern half of the roof near the front façade’s parapet wall. The petitioner contends that the equipment will not be visible from any public right-of-way.
- A new stair access and trellis is proposed to be installed on the northern half of the roof near the rear façade’s parapet wall.

**Courtyard**

- The existing concrete block wall along Abercorn Street that currently encloses the courtyard will be removed and replaced with a new 8’-2” high brick wall with a double gate. The existing shed within the courtyard will be removed/demolished completely.
- Beyond the wall, on the east property line, a new bridge will connect the parlor level of the house to the second floor of the carriage house.
- Above the bridge, a privacy wall of fixed shutters is proposed along the east property line at a height of approximately 16’-3”.
- A water feature is proposed below the bridge which will not be visible.

**Carriage House**

**South (courtyard) façade:**

- Remove non-historic addition.
- Convert existing door opening to a one-over-one window.
- Add new door opening and door with an uncovered bridge at the second floor that connects to the parlor level of the main house.

**West (Abercorn) façade:**

- All windows will be repaired as needed.
- The infilled door opening will be removed and replaced with smooth textured stucco.

**North (lane) façade:**

- On second floor, the existing six-over-six window will be replaced with two-over-two window.
- A new garage door opening and new man door opening will be added.

**Ms. Michalak** reported that staff recommends a continuance in order for the petitioner to address the following:

1. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation #s 2-6 are not met in regards to: **a)** the replacement of the doors and transoms on the second floor of the south façade, relocating the entry door and replacing the transom on the south façade; **b)** replacing the upper portion of the masonry stair rail with iron on the west façade; **c)** replacing the door and transom on the raised stoop on the west façade, removing the diamond patterning on the raised stoop base; **d)** replacing the existing cast iron railing on the portico with new metal railing; and **e)** adding a new garage door and man door to the north façade of the carriage house. While these features may not be original to the building, they appear to have acquired historic significance and contribute to the historic character of the building. Without definitive evidence of what existed historically, the proposed alterations cannot be considered a "restoration" and are speculative. Staff recommends that these features be retained/replaced if needed in the same configuration as currently exists.
2. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation #7 is not met regarding the application of elastomeric paint to the building. Staff recommends not utilizing elastomeric paint.
3. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation #7 is not met regarding the stucco mix proposed for repair and the door infill areas on both the main and carriage house- a Portland cement based stucco formula is proposed. The stucco mix should match the stucco on the main house which is likely a lime-based stucco.
4. Simplify the design of the courtyard entrance to be more visually compatible with other courtyard entrances.
5. Redesign the bridge and privacy wall to be visually compatible with the rhythm of structures and not alter the spatial relationship of the main house/carriage house relationship. Ensure that the demising wall is not greater than 11 feet.
6. Ensure wood columns are proposed on the front porch.
7. Ensure that new doors and windows are inset not less than three inches from the façade of the building, or match the historic door and window inset.
8. The new front façade windows are proposed to have a 2-over-2 lite pattern and the rear façade

window is proposed to be 1-over-1; staff requests clarification as to why these lite patterns were chosen by the petitioner.

9. Redesign the proposed carriage house openings to match the original entry dimensions.
10. Ensure the carriage house apron is not erected on the public right-of-way.
11. Ensure the electric meters are located at the lane.
12. If, after installation, the HVAC units are visible from the public right-of-way, submit screening to staff for review and approval.

#### **PETITIONER COMMENTS**

**Mr. Clegg** said the first issue concerns the doors and transoms. The building was built together as three units; 202, 204, and 206 East Gaston Street. They believe that a lot of the windows on the other units are older, more original and more appropriate to the style. Therefore, this is what prompted them to suggest that the doors and transoms be replaced with 2-over-2 windows to be similar to what was on the other units. He said the masonry railings on the front porch was discussed with HPD and they felt that this was not a part of period of significant which is from 1733 to 1934. However, they are suggesting that they retain the concrete copings and lower them to approximately 18 inches and then add metal railings.

**Mr. Clegg** showed the Board an interior view of the side porch which faces Abercorn Street. He said it has a strange arts and crafts feel to it. A plywood panel is here; it is not glass nor is it painted. The door is flimsy and they do not believe that it warrants saving. It should be replaced with a style that is more compatible with the other doors and transoms on the front of the building. The door looks black, but a screen door is on top of it. The railings are in poor condition. It seems to be a "hodge-podge" of different materials. They are suggesting that the balusters are too ornate for the building, they are not original according to Sanborn and oral history. They are suggesting that they replace these railings with simple metal railings that matches the front porch for consistency. Mr. Clegg had a photo that showed the existing railings were metal at both the parlor level and the level above.

**Mr. Clegg** explained that the garage at the rear originally had an arched opening and a vertical core joint. It had an arched top. They are not suggesting to recreate the arch as they believe it will give a false impression, but what they would like to do is create a garage door for the owners using the historic opening; but not creating the arch, just the flat top similar to what is here. It will only be about eight feet. The main issue is the client really wants to be able to park his car off the lane. He said they agree with the staff's recommendation regarding not utilizing elastomeric paint.

**Mr. Clegg** said regarding the double gate entrances, they believe it is appropriate to highlight the entry into the courtyard. This is an existing gate on East Gordon Street that has some fairly nice ironwork; it has arched ironwork over the top. The fence is obscured with vegetation; it is masonry. Regarding the bridge and privacy wall, there is an existing wall that is approximately 11 feet tall. There is a footbridge that connects the main house to the carriage. However, they want to give the neighbor privacy, therefore; they added a five foot tall screen wall [not a solid wall] that will allow natural light to shine through to the neighbor's yard. If the footbridge is acceptable, they do need a handrail for safety purposes on both sides of the footbridge.

**Mr. Clegg** said the 1-over-1 lite pattern was suggested by HPD. Since they are new windows, they did not want to confuse anyone with thinking that the windows were historic.

**Mr. Scott Barnard** came forward and said the owners are doctors and are not present because they are approximately four days behind schedule at the hospital due to the Hurricane. The owners personally went to Atlanta and met with the staff at HPD. When they got the staff's comments

they contacted the HPD. The HPD conferred that they did not have a problem with the comments. HPD felt all of the comments were appropriate, but they felt that they reached a reasonable compromise of respecting the historic fabric and understanding the evolution that this house has gone through and allowing these improvements to be, yet, another evolution to modernize it and make it livable in today's day and time.

**Dr. Dominguez** asked the petitioner that regarding the garage door that they are proposing, what is the rationale for not recreating the arch?

**Mr. Clegg** answered that they felt if the arch was recreated that it would give a false impression that it was the original material. They believed that a good compromise would be to recognize the width of the original opening [about 8 feet wide] and put in a flat top.

**Ms. Deacon** asked staff that due to the opening, if they were unaware of the location of the existing door or if they were comfortable with approving this if it was a historical reopening and existing opening?

**Ms. Michalak** answered that the petitioner's proposal exceeds the width of the opening at 10 feet; but it sounds, though, that the petitioner is willing to decrease it to an 8 feet width, but also add another opening. If this is what is being said about being a flat top, but narrowing the width, she felt the arch should be an extra restoration of the opening.

**Mr. Howington** asked the petitioner to clarify what was said about lowering the front stoop wall. Will this be 18 inches above the steps? He asked if the choice of brick was chosen to show a modern revision to the wall.

**Mr. Clegg** explained that the copings would be lowered, but would cover the steps. They will be approximately 18 inches. He said the brick size was chosen to the similarity of what is already at the carriage house. The color was chosen as it is fairly neutral as it would be compatible to the paint color already here.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

**Ms. Danielle Meunier of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF)** said they are still trying to decipher some of the tax credit information and the way SHPO is interpreting the Secretary's Standards. The HSF agreed with staff about the elastomeric paint, but now it appears that the petitioner is in agreement to remove it. Ms. Meunier said the HSF believes that the design of the metal railings to be used on the porch and west stoop, could actually be "beefed up" in terms of the detailing. As proposed, they are very simple. She realized that the petitioner said they want to do something that was contemporary, but they feel that because of the style of the building, they could be a little more detailed. The petitioner pointed out that the new gate they are proposing is fairly decorative. This does not need to mimic the existing cast iron railing that is on the west façade, but maybe have a little more detail there.

**Ms. Meunier** said they also agree with staff that the bridge that connects the main house, the carriage house, and the accompanying screening should be restudied to be visually compatible both with the rhythm of structures and not alter the spatial relationship of the main house to the carriage house; because it is so visible it is above the height of the wall on Abercorn Street. The petitioner needs to ensure that the demising wall is not above 11 feet. They believe the proposed screening is too tall. Ms. Meunier said recognize that the rooftop additions would not be visible from the front façade, but they feel they would be visible from many points along Abercorn Street. Therefore, they recommend that these elements be restudied to reduce the visibility as much as possible.

#### **BOARD DISCUSSION**

The Board agreed with most of the revisions the petitioner has done to the design. They agreed with

staff regarding the elastomeric paint. The screen will be visible, maybe this could be minimized or eliminate this to a handrail. They discussed the brick. The Board suggested that maybe the design needs to be simplified and go with a little less ornament would make the proposed rail and gate better. The way the railing terminates at the end of the stoop is a little strange. They discussed the 6-over-6 windows. Mr. Gunther said currently, this appears to be half rehabilitation and half restoration. This needs to be restudied to provide clarification based on staff's recommendations. The Board agreed that a continuance would be appropriate. Mr. Gunther said he was not in agreement with HPD's comments about the removal of the transoms and early 1900 changes, unless there was a clear argument about what is exactly the period of significant for the property.

**Mr. Merriman** asked Mr. Barnard that after hearing the Board's discussion, if he was in favor of asking for a continuance or a vote.

**Mr. Barnard** said the client would be happy to concede everything except the garage door. They want to move forward and not continue.

**Mr. Merriman** explained that the petitioner is in favor of conceding everything in the staff's recommendation with the exception of the garage door and man door opening. He entertained a discussion from the Board on this aspect.

**Ms. Deacon** said her concern is with the courtyard entrance. She believes this needs to come back to the Board.

**Mr. Merriman** explained that there are some concerns with the courtyard entrance, the railings and the coping. The stairs need to be restudied. The petitioner wants to make the new openings where they believe the historic openings have been with the man door. He asked the Board if there were any other concerns?

**Dr. Dominguez** asked if the opening is restored so that it is eight feet wide would it be functional for the homeowners?

**Mr. Barnard** said they talked with the owners about the eight foot wide opening. It is tight, but they will make it work with a small car.

**Dr. Dominguez** said she had no problem with making it 10 feet wide opening, but is this an issue?

**Mr. Gunther** said if a 10 foot opening was approved, would it only be the garage door or would the petitioner want an additional access door?

**Mr. Barnard** answered they want a man door.

#### **Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for multiple alterations to both the main house and the carriage house at 202 East Gaston Street with the following conditions:

Submit to staff for final review and approval:

1. Do not use elastomeric paint.
2. The new front façade windows are proposed to have a 2-over-2 lite pattern and the rear façade window is proposed to be 1-over-1;

staff requests clarification as to why these lite patterns were chosen by the petitioner.

3. If, after installation, the HVAC units are visible from the public right-of-way, submit screening to staff for review and approval.

Submit to the Review Board for final review and approval:

1. Redesign all porch and stoops railings to be more compatible or leave all existing railings in place. - PASS
2. Redesign the design of the courtyard entrance wall and gate to be more visually compatible with other courtyard entrances.
3. Redesign the demising wall to be visually compatible with the rhythm of structures and not alter the spatial relationship of the main house/carriage house relationship. Ensure that the demising wall is not greater than 11 feet high.
4. Ensure that the new garage door width matches the width of the historic opening; approximately 8 feet wide.
5. Define and/or clarify whether a “restoration” or a “rehabilitation” are proposed; if a restoration is proposed provide the proposed Period of Significance.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Dr. Betsy Dominguez	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Justin Gunther	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye



15. [Petition of LS3P Dawson | 16-003490-COA | 10 East Broad Street | New Construction: Part I Amendment and Part II, Design Details](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Aerial.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Previous Drawings.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Mass Model.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Photographs and Drawings.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Specifications.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Trustees' Garden.pdf](#)

**NOTE: Ms. Deacon recused from participation in this petition. She is an employee of LS3P Dawson.**

**Mr. James Gallucci of LS3P Dawson** was present on behalf of the petition.

**Ms. Leah Michalak** gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for amendments to Part I: Height and Mass and for Part II: Design Details of a new, 2-2½ story parking garage and event space on a vacant lot within the Trustees' Garden area at 10 East Broad Street. The building is located on an internal portion of the site and is significantly setback from all public right-of-ways, though it will be visible from East Broad Street, East Bay Street, Randolph Street, General McIntosh Blvd., East Broughton Street, and East St. Julian Street. Access to the site will be through a drive on the north side of the Pirate's House Restaurant parking lot, an easement drive from East Broughton Street, and a private drive which extends East St. Julian Street. The building is divided into two masses that are connected overhead by two vehicular bridges.

**Ms. Michalak** explained that Part I: Height and Mass for this project was approved, with conditions, by the Board at the September 14, 2016 HDBR meeting. The conditions were as follows:

1. Incorporate gates at all automobile entrances to better form a consistent wall of enclosure along the west elevation.
2. Reduce the height of the parapet walls to a maximum of 4 feet.
3. Ensure that the metal awnings are not back lit or internally lit.
4. Ensure that each architectural bay is between 15-20 feet wide.
5. Ensure the following standards are met:
  - a. All storefront extends from a sill or an 18-24 inch high base;
  - b. Storefront, doors, and windows (louvers) are inset a minimum of four inches from the face of the building;
  - c. Locate HVAC units on the drawings and ensure they are screened from the public right-of-way;
  - d. Locate refuse storage areas on the drawings and ensure they are located within the building or screened from the public right-of-way;
  - e. The curb cuts at East Broughton and East Broad Streets are limited to 20 feet wide; and,
6. The sidewalk serves as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across all three driveways in materials, configuration, and height.

In addition, the petitioner provided the following information and proposed the following

amendments to Part I: Height and Mass:

- The building has been reduced in scale from a 3-story to a 2-story parking garage. “This change was made to better serve the character area and to improve the pedestrian experience.” The total height has been reduced by 11’-0” making the top of the parapet 31’-6” with higher “pop up” elements for elevator towers and roofline variation.
- Louvered screens have been added in lieu of the punched openings which is a more contemporary interpretation of a window opening and better suits the functionality and programmatic requirements of a parking structure.
- The bay spacing has changed to better fit the structural precast system but all bay spacing visible from the public right-of-way remains between 15’-0” and 20’-0”.
- All parapet heights have been changed from 4’-2” to 4’-0”.
- To achieve better vertical proportions both elevator towers were decreased in width by minimizing stair width and specifying a smaller elevator.
- Roll up gates have been incorporated into all vehicular entrances to improve walls of continuity.

**Ms. Michalak** reported that staff recommends approval of Part I and Part II for a new, 2-2½ story parking garage and event space on a vacant lot within the Trustees’ Garden area at 10 East Broad Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Revise storefront which have bases to be of a contrasting material and add bases or sills to the remainder of the storefronts.
2. Provide a specification and color selection for the roll-up security gates.
3. Ensure the storefront glazing, louvers, and door frames are inset at least four inches.
4. Ensure that the sidewalk serves as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveways in materials, configuration, and height.
5. Reselect the flush metal doors to be less industrial and provide a color selection.

#### **PETITIONER COMMENTS**

**Mr. Gallucci** thanked the Board and staff for reviewing their project. He explained that they changed the height of the building. Generally, they agree with the staff comments. He clarified the pedestrian walkway. They want to maintain zero sills on the locations for uniformity along the façade where they have storefront locations on the building. They have a two-foot base and are willing to work with staff to redesign the detail. Mr. Gallucci said they also have roll-up doors on the north façade. They will work with staff for the specification and color selection for the roll-up security gates as well as provide design details to show that the windows, doors and louvers are inset at the required 4 inches. Mr. Gallucci said some of their louver screens show 8 inches set back, but they do not carry that dimension all the way down. However, this was an oversight on his part. These details will be provided to the staff.

**Mr. Gallucci** said their landscape architect will help to verify the continuous sidewalks. The area on Broughton Street is somewhat outside of their scope, but they will ensure that

the sidewalks remain continuous. He said regarding the metal doors and pedestrian thoroughfare, they will work with staff to resolve this also. Mr. Gallucci entertained questions from the Board.

### **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

**Ms. Danielle Meunier of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF)** said they believe that the reduction in height from 3 1/2 stories to 2 1/2 stories is an improvement. They agree with all of staff's comments. However, additionally, they believe that the cast stone arches as shown on the east façade that the headers over the openings should be restudied to be more similar to the others or make them more substantial so that they have a structural appearance than a visual aesthetic appearance. Ms. Meunier said the HSF also recommends incorporating headers over the vehicular entrances to the garage. This will create a more structural impression. They are requesting that the petitioner give further clarification on the color choice for the brick. The specifications that were passed around indicated red brick [she recognizes that is could be a screen issue], but the renderings appear to be a more neutral grey color. They need to see how the brick color will tie-in with the surrounding context. The HSF thanked the petitioner for adjusting the window screens from the punched openings.

**Mr. Gallucci**, in response to the public comments, said with regards to the brick selection, the renderings are not always exact to the brick selection. He explained that the brick they selected closely matches, but not exactly, the surrounding area buildings. He said most noted is the Charles Moore Center on the north. They wanted to be sure that the brick did not exactly match, but still maintain some contemporary feel.

**Mr. Howington** asked if petitioner wanted to respond to the brick headers instead of cast stone headers.

**Mr. Gallucci** stated that they feel they can revisit the cast stone headers for a little more structural substance. As far as the headers above the openings on the west façade, they feel this is something they can evaluate and look into this.

### **BOARD DISCUSSION**

The Board commended the petitioner for the reduction in height of the building. Mr. Howington agreed with the Historic Savannah Foundation that the headers would probably be more appropriate if they were brick instead of the cast stone. Since this is a parking garage, the Board agreed with not having sills on the non rolls up doors.

#### **Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for Part I and Part II for a new, 2-2½ story parking garage and event space on a vacant lot within the Trustees' Garden area at 10 East Broad Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review

and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Revise storefronts, which have bases, to be of a contrasting material.
2. Provide a specification and color selection - PASS for the roll-up security gates.
3. Ensure the storefront glazing, louvers, and door frames are inset at least four inches.
4. Ensure that the sidewalk serves as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveways in materials, configuration, and height.
5. Reselect the flush metal doors to be less industrial and provide a color selection.
6. Redesign the arched opening headers.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Justin Gunther

Second: Tess Scheer

Debra Caldwell

- Aye

Jennifer Deacon

- Abstain

Dr. Betsy Dominguez

- Aye

Kellie Fletcher

- Aye

Justin Gunther

- Aye

Keith Howington

- Aye

Becky Lynch

- Not Present

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.

- Abstain

Tess Scheer

- Aye

**IX. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION**

16. [Petition of Felder & Associates | 15-006604-COA | 207 West Broughton Street | Request for 12-month extension](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve a 12 month extension of the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) issued on January 13, 2016 for alterations to the storefront at 207 West Broughton Street [File No. 15-006604-COA].

- PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Justin Gunther

Second: Tess Scheer

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Dr. Betsy Dominguez - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Justin Gunther - Aye

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Not Present

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Tess Scheer - Aye

**X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS**

17. [Petition of Andrew Lynch for Lynch Associates Architects | 16-002753-COA | 606 Abercorn Street | Staff Approved - Existing Wood Deck](#)

Attachment: [COA - 606 Abercorn Street 16-002753-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [606 Abercorn\\_hdbr\\_05.19.16.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

18. [Petition of Belina Hunt for Mercury Real Estate Solutions, LLC | 16-004743-COA | 440 Habersham Street | Staff Approved - Restoration](#)

Attachment: [COA - 440 Habersham Street 16-004743-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 440 Habersham Street 16-004743-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

19. [Petition of John Post for Commonwealth Construction | 16-004999-COA | 37 and 39 East Broad Street | Staff Approved - Color Change, Gates and Air Conditioning Shelf](#)

Attachment: [COA - 37 and 39 East Broad Street 16-004999-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 37 and 39 East Broad Street 16-004999-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

20. [Petition of Anne C. Shira | 16-005012-COA | 508 East Perry Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 508 East Perry Street 16-005012-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 508 East Perry Street 16-005012-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

21. [Petition of John Deering | 16-005055-COA | 201 West Bay Street | Staff Approved - Changes to Sculptural Panels](#)

Attachment: [COA - 201 West Bay Street 16-005055-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - SCAD ART Drawings 201 West Bay Street 16-005055-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - SCAD Art Revised Text 201 West Bay Street 16-005055-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - SCAD ART-Brackets 201 West Bay Street 16-005055-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

22. [Petition of Seth Cannon for DPR Construction | 16-005187-COA | 109 West Broughton Lane | Staff Approved - New Storefront](#)

Attachment: [COA - 109 West Broughton Lane 16-005187-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 109 West Broughton Lane 16-005187-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

23. [Petition of Michael Wolfe, Sr. | 16-005191-COA | 11 Jefferson Street | Staff Approved - Fencing](#)

Attachment: [COA - 11 Jefferson Street 16-005191-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 11 Jefferson Street 16-005191-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

24. [Petition of Luis Burgos for Hansen Architects, P.C. | 16-005198-COA | 245 Bull Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 245 Bull Street 16-005198-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 245 Bull Street 16-005198-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

25. [Petition of Cole Holliday | 16-005265-COA | 513 East Harris Street | Staff Approved - Fence](#)

Attachment: [COA - 513 East Harris Street 16-005265-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 513 East Harris Street 16-005265-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

26. [Petition of Glenn Wood | 16-005267-COA | 13 East River Street | Staff Denial - Recover Existing Awning](#)

Attachment: [COA - 13 East River Street 16-005267 Denied.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 13 East River Street 16-005267-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff denied.

27. [Petition of John Post for Commonwealth Construction | 16-005269-COA | 322 East Harris Street | Staff Approved - Replace Siding](#)

Attachment: [COA - 322 East Harris Street 16-5269-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [submittal Packet - 322 East Harris Street 16-005269-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

28. [Petition of Katie Hurley | 16-005270-COA | 107 West Liberty Street - Garden Level | Staff Approved - Color Change and Windows Planters](#)

Attachment: [COA - 107 West Liberty Street 16-005270-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 107 West Liberty Street 16-005270-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

29. [Petition of Nicole Pollock for Alchemy Restoration | 16-005288-COA | 428 East Oglethorpe Avenue | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [428 East Oglethorpe Avenue 16-005288-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 428 East Oglethorpe Avenue 16-005288-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

30. [Petition of James Reardon for Reardon Design, LLC | 16-005292-COA | 216 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Tile Replacement](#)

Attachment: [COA - 216 West Broughton Street 16-005292-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Photo.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

31. [Petition of Andrew Barber for Coastal Canvas Products | 16-005301-COA | 423 East River Street | Staff Approved - Awning](#)

Attachment: [COA - 423 East River Street 16-005301-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 423 East River Street 16-005301-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet 2 - 423 East River Street 16-005301-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

32. [Petition of Matthew Johns for Matthew Johns Construction | 16-005324-COA | 311 East Charlton Street | Staff Approved - Window Replacement](#)

Attachment: [COA - 311 East Charlton Street 16-005324-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 311 East Charlton Street 16-005324-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

33. [Petition of Stacy Ritchie | 16-005331-COA | 122 East Liberty Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 122 East Liberty Street 16-005331-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 122 East Liberty Street \[Paint Sample\] 16-005331-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet 2 - 122 East Liberty Street 16-005331-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

34. [Petition of Abigail Powell for Ellsworth Hallett Home Professionals | 16-005367-COA | 407 East Perry Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 407 East Perry Street 16-005367-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - Trim 407 East Perry Street 16-005367-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

35. [Petition of Stewart Dohrman | 16-005454-COA | 550 East State Street | Staff Approved - Repointing](#)

Attachment: [COA - 550 East State Street 16-005454-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 550 East State Street 16-005554-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

36. [Petition of Ryan Claus for Felder & Associates | 16-005455-COA | 26, 32, and 36 East Bay Street | Staff Approved - Mechanical Unit](#)

Attachment: [COA - 26, 32, and 36 East Bay Street 16-005455-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [proposed revised roof plan.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

37. [Petition of Mallory Teeple for Coastal Canvas Products | 16-005467-COA | 205 West River Street | Staff Approved - Awning Recover](#)

Attachment: [Application and Submittal Packet \[Electronic\] 205 West River Street 16-005467-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [COA - 205 West River Street 16-005467-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

**XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

38. [Report on Work Performed Without a Certificate of Appropriateness](#)

Attachment: [HDBR Michalak Work Without a COA 10-12-16.pdf](#)



**XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF**

**XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, and ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

**Notices**

39. [Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting - Thursday, October 13, 2016 at 3:30 p.m. in the Meyer Conference Room, MPC, 110 East State Street](#)

40. [Next Regular Meeting - Wednesday, November 9, 2016 at 1:00 p.m. in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, MPC, 112 E. State Street](#)

**XIV. OTHER BUSINESS**

**XV. ADJOURNMENT**

41. [Adjournment](#)

There being no further business to come before the Historic District Board of Review, Mr. Merriman adjourned the meeting at 2:40 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Ellen I. Harris  
Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation

EIH:mem