



SAVANNAH HISTORIC DISTRICT  
BOARD OF REVIEW

---

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room  
February 8, 2017 1:00 P.M.  
Meeting Minutes

**FEBRUARY 8, 2017 HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW REGULAR MEETING**

**HDRB Members Present:** Stephen Merriman, Jr., Chair  
Debra Caldwell  
Jennifer Deacon  
Kellie Fletcher  
Keith Howington  
Becky Lynch  
Tess Scheer

**HDRB Members Not Present:** Zena McClain, Esq., Vice- Chair  
Justin Gunther  
Andy McGarrity

**MPC Staff Present:** Ellen Harris, Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation  
Sara Farr, Historic Preservation Planner  
Alyson Smith, Historic Preservation Planner  
Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

**I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME**

1. [Call to Order and Welcome](#)

**Mr. Merriman** called the meeting to order at 1:05 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. He outlined the role of the Historic District Board of Review and explained the process for hearing the various petitions. Staff will present each application with a recommendation. The petitioner will have the opportunity to respond to the recommendation. The petitioners are asked to limit their presentation to 10 minutes or less and only address the items identified as inconsistent with the ordinance and questions raised by the Board. The public will have the same allotted time, ten minutes, to comment. The petitioner will be given the opportunity to respond to the public comments.

The Board will then go into Board discussion at which time no further testimony is received

unless specifically requested by the Chair. Each Board member will be given two minutes twice to provide comments, if they so desire.

## II. SIGN POSTING

## III. CONSENT AGENDA

### 2. [Petition of Adam Purser | 16-007071-COA | 455 Montgomery Street | Sign](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Package.pdf](#)

#### **Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a sign at 455 Montgomery Street with the condition it provides a minimum of 10 feet of clearance above the sidewalk, because otherwise it meets the sign standards and is visually compatible. - PASS

#### **Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Nay

Tess Scheer - Aye

### 3. [Petition of Eastern Excavating Co., Inc. | 17-000053-COA | 111 Ann Street | Demolition](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Package.pdf](#)

#### **Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for demolition of 111 Ann Street, because it is not a contributing building or eligible for historic designation. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Tess Scheer - Aye

4. [Petition of Daniel E. Snyder | 17-000119-COA | 41 MLK Jr. BLVD. | Awnings](#)

Attachment: [17-000119-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet- drawings.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Sample installation photographs.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Awning Fabric Policy.pdf](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request to install Trivantage Patio 500 vinyl awning panels in “Timber” between existing rafters of the pergola in the Ships of the Sea Museum’s North Garden due to its very limited visibility, distance from the public right-of-way and lack of graphics or other signage; because it is visually compatible and meets the design standards. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Tess Scheer - Aye

5. [Petition of Eric Walsnovich | 17-000194-COA | 660 East Broughton Street | Fence](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Package.pdf](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the proposed fence at 660 East Broughton Street, because it meets the standards and is visually compatible. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Tess Scheer - Aye

6. [Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 17-000197-COA | 1 East Gordon Street | Alterations and Additions](#)

Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Historic Image 1935.pdf](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations and additions at 1 East Gordon Street with the following conditions to be submitted for staff approval:

1. Any historic windows removed for the additions be retained on site;
2. Specify that the shutters will be operable and hinged;
3. Provide specifications for the gutters and paint colors; - PASS
4. Ensure the standing seam metal roof has seams no higher than 1 inch;

5. Baluster spacing is specified and all railings are a maximum of 36 inches tall;

Because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

**IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

**V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

7. [Approve December 9, 2016 Retreat Meeting Minutes](#)

Attachment: [12-9-2016 Retreat Minutes.pdf](#)

**Board Action:**

Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve December 9, 2016 Retreat Minutes. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Debra Caldwell

Second: Jennifer Deacon

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

8. [Approve January 11, 2017 Meeting Minutes](#)

Attachment: [01-11-2017 Minutes.pdf](#)

**Board Action:**

The Historic District Board of Review does hereby - PASS  
approve January 11, 2017 Meeting Minutes.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Debra Caldwell

Second: Jennifer Deacon

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Tess Scheer - Aye

**VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA**

**VII. CONTINUED AGENDA**

9. [Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 15-001384-COA | 600 East Bay Street | New Construction: Part II, Design Details](#)

**Board Action:**

The Historic District Board of Review does hereby - PASS  
continue the petition as requested.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Becky Lynch

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Tess Scheer - Aye

10. [Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006847-COA | 405 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | Demolition and New Construction Part 1 Height and Mass](#)

**Board Action:**

The Historic District Board of Review does hereby - PASS  
continue the petition as requested.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Becky Lynch

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Tess Scheer - Aye

11. [Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006848-COA | 501 Montgomery Street | New Construction: Part II Design Details](#)

**Board Action:**

The Historic District Board of Review does hereby - PASS  
continue the petition as requested.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Becky Lynch

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Tess Scheer - Aye

12. [Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006849-COA | 607 Drayton Street | New Construction: Part II Design Details](#)

**Board Action:**

The Historic District Board of Review does hereby - PASS  
continue the petition as requested.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Becky Lynch

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Tess Scheer - Aye

13. [Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006851-COA | 620 East River Street | New Construction](#)  
[Hotel: Part I, Height and Mass](#)

**Board Action:**

The Historic District Board of Review does hereby - PASS  
continue the petition as requested.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Becky Lynch

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present

Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Tess Scheer - Aye

14. [Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006852-COA | 630 East River Street | New Construction](#)  
[Parking Garage: Part I, Height and Mass](#)

**Board Action:**

The Historic District Board of Review does hereby - PASS  
continue the petition as requested.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Kellie Fletcher



Second: Becky Lynch	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

15. [Petition of Gary Sanders | 16-003487-COA | 305 West Wayne Street | New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass](#)

**Board Action:**

The Historic District Board of Review does hereby - PASS  
continue the petition as requested.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Kellie Fletcher  
Second: Becky Lynch

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

16. [Petition of Gary Sanders | 17-000198-COA | 315 West Wayne Street | Demolition of a Non-Contributing Building](#)

**Board Action:**

The Historic District Board of Review does hereby - PASS  
continue the petition as requested.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Kellie Fletcher  
Second: Becky Lynch

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye

Becky Lynch	- Aye
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

## VIII. REGULAR AGENDA

### 17. [Petition of Wubbena Architects and Design and Liberty Townes, LLC | 16-006295-COA | 529 East Liberty Street | Part II: New Construction Design Details](#)

Attachment: [16-006295-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Aerial.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Sanborn Maps- Context.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Drawings.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Garage walkways.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Materials Board.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Supplementary Information.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Submittal Packet- Specifications.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Public Comment- Jarden.pdf](#)

**Mr. Ed Hoffman and Mr. James Wubbena** was present on behalf of the petition.

**Ms. Ellen Harris** gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for New Construction, Part 2: Design Details of eight townhomes and carriage houses at 529 East Liberty Street. The proposed townhomes are three stories with a raised stoop configuration. The carriage houses are two stories and feature two garage doors.

**Ms. Harris** reported that staff recommends approval of Part II: Design Details of eight townhomes and carriage houses at 529 East Liberty Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval:

1. Provide a window specification;
2. Ensure that the shutters are wood or composite wood;
3. Ensure the garage doors do not have a faux wood grain;
4. Ensure the gate at the entrance to the carriage houses is included and provide a specification;
5. Increase the height of the fence along the east property line to screen the deck beyond;
6. Consider revising the fence on the east elevation to brick;
7. Ensure the wood fence is painted or stained;
8. Screen the HVAC units located on the roof if they are visible from the public right-of-way;

Because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards.

#### **PETITIONER COMMENTS**

**Mr. Hoffman** said they appreciate all the comments and feedback they have gotten from the staff. They want to discuss the design details. They have made a careful study of the other buildings on Liberty Street. He pointed out that they carefully chose a brick that closely resembles Savannah old grey brick. This brick is commonly found throughout Savannah on construction projects. Mr. Hoffman said they are in agreement with the staff's comments. He did not get the impression that the wood fence would be visible on Liberty Street. He showed the Board some photos of wood fences in the area. He said he also took a photo of the rear of a house on East Huntingdon Street which was recently finished a couple of years ago. Mr. Hoffman said they are grateful to work with the Review Board to create a wonderful addition to the streetscape.

**Mr. Wubbena** stated that he is the principal architect on this project. He said the shutters are true

wood. The information on the windows will be sent to the staff. They will have a discussion with the staff about the wood fence versus brick on the east elevation. However, whatever the staff recommends regarding the fence, they will follow it. Mr. Wubbena said they have met all the conditions from the last meeting.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

**Mr. Robert Rosenwald** of 504 East McDonough Street wanted information on the carriage house.

**Ms. Danielle Meunier of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF)** stated the HSF agrees with the staff's comments. The design has been revised since the prior submittal and has more variation. The continuous rhythm seems to create a little bit of monotony on the façade. It is quite rare to have eight units in a portion of a block; this many units are seen in a full block. The HSF suggested that possibly to break up some of that monotony would be to pair the stoops. There are an even number of units; and therefore they believe the pairing would work.

**Ms. Meunier** said the HSF suggests that further study of the balusters and stairs be done. Having posts on the landings were not complete in details on the elevations and plans. Some more substantial posts are needed on the landings. The HSF also suggested that further study of the brick fence be done. They recognize and appreciate the study that has been done by the petitioner, but they want to encourage the petitioner to look a little closer at some examples. They feel that the hue of the brick is too orange; they suggest that a red or brown brick would be closer to the Savannah grey brick. Ms. Meunier said they want to further reiterate the addition of voids and articulation.

**Mr. Wubbena** in response to the public comments stated that the garages are properly aligned. They are not building in the lane. The turn radius to get into the garages is okay. As far as the side elevation, they added some soldier coursing and extended the rowlocks along the top of the soldier coursing of the first and second floors. The side elevations are as they are because they cannot put windows on the zero lot line.

**Mr. Hoffman** said they met with staff regarding the paired stoops. They did not feel comfortable with the paired stoops. The brown Sperry brick is close to bricks in the area. They will look at the height of the fence and possibly raise the screening on the back porch.

#### **BOARD DISCUSSION**

Traffic Engineering will work out the situation with the lane. The Board discussed that the townhomes have the same configurations. Some variation is needed; paired stoops will help or split the stoops according to the number of homes. The east elevation needs attention regarding the screening to break up the masonry walls. If the fence is to remain wooden, it needs to be taller. Mr. Howington is against fake windows, but brick face would be great. The Board agrees with the staff recommendations.

#### **Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for Part II: Design Details of eight townhomes and carriage houses at 529 East Liberty Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval:

1. Provide additional brick detailing to the east façade;
2. Restudy the porch configuration to break up the monotony of the row;
3. Provide a window specification;
4. Ensure that the shutters are wood or composite wood;

5. Ensure the garage doors do not have a faux wood grain;
6. Ensure the gate at the entrance to the carriage houses is included and provide a specification; - PASS
7. Increase the height of the fence along the east property line to screen the deck beyond;
8. Revise the fence on the east elevation to brick;
9. Ensure the wood fence is painted or stained;
10. Screen the HVAC units located on the roof if they are visible from the public right-of-way;

Because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards.

#### **Vote Results**

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

#### 18. [Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 16-006855-COA | 301 Tattnall Street | New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass](#)

- Attachment: [Ward map.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Public Comment Lockwood.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Mass Model Photos.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [General Development Plan.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Aerial View.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Public Comment Colgrove.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Public Comment Rolfes.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Public Comment Gennuso.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Public Comment Colgrove 2.pdf](#)
- Attachment: [Public Comment DNA.pdf](#)

**Ms. Becky Lynch recused herself from participating in this petition. She is an employee of Lynch Associates Architects.**

**Mr. Andrew Lynch** was present on behalf of the petition.

**Ms. Alyson Smith** gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for Part 1: Height and Mass for new construction of a hotel. The demolition plan includes one non-contributing building and a surface parking lot. The hotel's primary entrance is on Tattnall Street with secondary elevations facing Liberty and Jefferson Street. The 8,470 square foot large-scale development is split between the four and five story height districts and seeks a bonus story. The proposed building steps up from the buffered area of an adjacent historic duplex and increases in height from five stories to six stories along Liberty Street.

The petitioner is also requesting a variance from the exterior height expression standard which requires that the exterior expression of the height of the second story not be less than 12 feet and that the exterior expression of the height of each story above the second shall not be less than 10 feet. The proposed floors above the first level do not meet the minimum permitted heights.

The new construction includes the development of five existing recombined lots. At the January 11, 2017 HDBR Meeting, the Board approved the demolition of the two-story non-contributing building located at 303 Tattnall Street and continued the proposal for Part 1: Height and Mass for new construction of a hotel with the following conditions:

1. Reduce the height of the first story to reduce the overall height;  
*The petitioner states that, "The expression of the first floor has been reduced from 19'6" to 16' on all elevations. The head height of all storefront glazing has been reduced and additional masonry and solid panels have been added above the first floor storefronts to reduce the visual expression of the first floor." The overall height of the building has been reduced by six feet. The condition is met.*
2. Provide the dimension for the proposed awnings' vertical clearance above the public right-of-way;  
*The awnings above Liberty Street will have a vertical clearance of 13 feet and the awnings along Tattnall Street will have a vertical clearance of 15'6". All other cantilevered awning features will also be installed above the minimum vertical clearance required above a public right-of-way. The condition has been met.*
3. Provide dimensions for the screen wall located at the roof garden;  
*The height of the screen wall be 42 inches. The condition has been met.*
4. Provide dimensions for the roof's overhang;  
*The roof's horizontal overhang will extend 3 feet from the building. Where the building offsets back 3 feet on Jefferson street, the projection increases to 6 feet. The condition is met.*
5. Add voids to the south facing recessed wall at the primary entrance along Tattnall Street;  
*2'x2' windows have been added at each floor. The condition is met.*
6. Ensure that the curb cut does not exceed 20 feet in width and that the sidewalk serves as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration and height;  
*Jefferson Street will feature a 15' curb cut. The petitioner has added that the curb cut will comply with the standards to serve as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration and height; however, the current drawings currently do not reflect this.*
7. Reduce the length of continuous height on the central mass along the west and east

elevation;

*The petitioner states that, "There are three roof heights that correspond to the varying building masses and material changes. The façade of the east and west elevation are broken into multiple planes with offsets in the plan of 3' and added pilasters that offset 1'. While the roof along the Jefferson Street elevation is more continuous, the offsets in the building plane, roof overhang and detailing meet the intent of the requirement to break down the roof mass." The intent of the condition is met.*

8. Revise the bay widths to be between 15 and 20 feet to meet the standard;

*The condition is met. The visual expression of the bay widths read between 15 and 20 feet.*

9. Ensure that the parapet feature a string course and coping;

*The condition is met. A string course and coping are currently shown on the drawings.*

10. Ensure that the window sashes, door frames, and storefronts are inset not less than four inches;

*The condition is met. The inset dimensions are shown on the drawings to be 4-1/2".*

11. Revise the following uses: laundry, delivery center, and office. Proposed uses should be active and accessible to the general public;

*The condition is met. The laundry, delivery center, and office have been omitted from the ground floor active use plan. A retail use has been added to the ground floor plan and will be accessible from the Jefferson Street façade.*

12. Submit the percentage of space the mezzanine will encompass.

*The condition is met. The mezzanine percentage is 31.6%.*

**Ms. Smith** reported that staff recommends approval of Part 1: Height and Mass for new construction of a hotel at 301 Tattnall Street with the following condition:

1. Ensure that the drawings reflect that the sidewalk along Jefferson Street will serve as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration and height;

Because otherwise the project is visually compatible and meets the standards.

**Ms. Smith** reported additionally that staff recommends approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard in the Historic District Section (8-3030) of the City of Savannah Zoning Ordinance which states:

*The exterior expression of the height of the second story shall be not less than 12 feet.*

*The exterior expression of the height of each story above the second shall not be less than 10 feet.*

Because the existing exterior expression of the height of the second story and each story above that as proposed will result in an overall reduced building height that is visually

compatible and the variance criteria have been met.

**Ms. Smith** stated that the staff received several letters in opposition to this petition. The letters are attached to today's agenda. She stated additionally that several members of the public provided a letter of opposition as well.

**Mr. Howington**, for clarification, asked Ms. Smith to restate the variance request for the second floor. His main concern is the visual expression on the second floor.

**Ms. Smith** answered that the staff was looking at the actual literal dimension.

#### **PETITIONER COMMENTS**

**Mr. Lynch** stated that they do not have any objections to the staff comments. They plan to provide the materials for the driveway and ensure that it is a continuous lane. Their only comment is as Mr. Howington raised. He stated that the expressions on the second floor was actually a little below. They are only seeking a variance on the third, fourth and fifth floor. The top floor is actually in compliance with the code.

**Mr. Lynch** said they looked at this project as a "by right" for five stories using the minimum standard for floor to floor and then adding a parapet of some height. The height where they are now is 65 feet, going five feet off of where the "by right" would be at 60 feet. This is using the minimum for floor-to-floor height. They have gotten as close as they can or as low as they can. While they really don't want to ask for the variance to lower the floor-to-floor height, the owners have agreed to do so. He stated that he will work with staff and the neighborhood to try to mitigate the height as much as possible. Mr. Lynch entertained questions from the Board.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

**Mr. Tom Colgrove** resides at 212 West Harris Street stated that his home is approximately one-half block from the location. This proposed hotel is in the Currie Ward as stated by staff, but across the street is the Pulaski Ward. This building is one block from Pulaski Square. Multiple weddings are held in Pulaski Square almost every weekend year round. Mr. Colgrove's concern is with the overall massing of the hotel. The hotel as designed goes from sidewalk to sidewalk using the maximum available space (75%) for the buildings footprint with a main entrance on Tattnell Street. This new six story glass and steel hotel is planned to be shoe-horned into a small block from the beautiful and historic Pulaski Square. Mr. Colgrove asked the Board not to approve the sixth floor.

**Mr. Robert Rosenwald** came forward and stated that he lives at 504 East McDonough Street. Mr. Rosenwald said he believes the Downtown Neighborhood Association has sent the Board a letter. He said they have a number of issues concerning this proposed hotel. Retail spaces are mostly incidental to the hotel. They have heard that the petitioner needs a variance in order to accommodate a bonus floor. Mr. Rosenwald stated that they ask the Board to look at the garden which has not been detailed. They are hopeful that they don't run into the same situation as the Homewood Suites. Consequently, the Board needs to give serious thoughts as to how this garden will look.

**Attorney Dolly Chisholm** stated that she was representing Gary Arthur, a resident in this area, who is out of town, and the Beehive Foundation. Attorney Chisholm said that Mr. Arthur owns a house across from this project and owns other properties in this area. He is the president of the Beehive Foundation who owns three buildings on Harris Street near Tattnell Street. These buildings are three stories. Concerning visual compatibility, the ordinance says "new construction in the Historic District shall be visually compatible with the structures where some places to which they are visually related." She believed that by

this model by the number of residents that are present, there seems to be more three stories structures and buildings that are visually related to this than there are the parking garage which is to the west. To the east is the two story building and behind are the three stories. Consequently, this appears to be a three story neighborhood. Secondly, and this is her legal argument, the ordinance further states that "in an R zoning district, the maximum of one-story may be permitted." The ordinance does not say "shall or must" be permitted. Therefore, the Board has the power to say this does not have to be, especially if it is not visually compatible. Attorney Chisholm said, therefore, the visually compatibility warrants enough to deny this mass when everything else in the area is three story.

**Ms. Susan Colgrove** stated that her husband and she moved here two years ago and bought a home on Harris Street one-half block away from this proposed hotel. They made a decision to live in this area because of the charm, education, music, arts and for all those reasons. She walks the area all the time. Ms. Colgrove is not opposed to the hotel, she is opposed to the height and mass and box like design of the building. The zoning here does allow a restaurant, but it cannot be a "standalone" restaurant. They want a five story visually more compatible hotel in their area.

**Ms. Danielle Meunier of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF)** stated that although the height has been reduced, HSF still thinks that the building is too tall and is not visually compatible. Specifically, predominately small scale residential buildings are directly to the south and east. While the petitioner may have met the criteria to be eligible for a bonus story, based on the language of the ordinance as Attorney Chisholm pointed out, the HSF does not believe that this entitles the petitioner to get the bonus story. The HSF believes it is the Board's decision to make a determination if the bonus story is visually compatible in this location. Ms. Meunier stated that if they simply relied on the ordinance which is the rule that guides them, they could judge all projects to see if they met the standards or not. But, they feel that it is the Board's job to be here to determine on a case-by-case basis if something is ultimately visually compatible. Therefore, it is well within the purview of the Board to decide if this bonus story should be allowed. The Board's grounds for making this decision are simple. This location cannot support the height being proposed because a large part of the immediate surrounding context is a considerably smaller scale.

**Ms. Meunier** said she also wanted the Board to consider that they are looking at a variance to reduce the floor-to-floor heights as a means to reduce the overall height. Yet, a bonus story is still being proposed. It seems obvious that eliminating the bonus story would solve this problem. Therefore, they do not agree with the recommendation for a variance because it is unnecessary. Floor to floor heights is also a standard that is put in place to ensure that things have appropriate proportions. Why should they sacrifice that simply for the developer to get an additional floor? The HSF does not believe this is necessary; the height should be reduced; and they do not believe it is compatible.

**Mr. Roger Graham of 324 West Jones Street** stated that his concern is that Pulaski Square is the most beautiful square here. His concern is that the building will be a looming building. A building this large is too much for their neighborhood. He wants the building to be smaller.

**Mr. Lynch** stated, in response to the public comments, he did not have much to add; however, he wanted to clarify that they are meeting the lot coverage requirements. There were five lots originally, but they have recombined all the lots and, therefore, it is a single lot on Liberty Street. It is eligible for the six-story bonus floor across all the lots. He said regarding the visual compatibility issue, he believes it is somewhat absurd that they are not looking at the rest of the Liberty Street corridor. Right next door, there is a seven



story and a six story parking deck. One block away, there is a five story hotel; and another two blocks there is a hotel the same size. Mr. Lynch said they have done everything that they can do; they set the building back 30 feet off the historic property to the south and they have done all they could to try to mitigate the height as much as they can. He said they would prefer not to have the variance, but they offer this as a way to appease the neighborhood and staff on the top three stories. They are reducing these stories one foot on each floor. Mr. Lynch asked that this be considered and not just consider the adjacencies to the south as there are plenty large developments here; especially the parking deck and the Civic Center which are five to six times larger than what they are proposing. Mr. Lynch asked the Board to consider this in their deliberations.

#### **BOARD DISCUSSION**

The Board discussed that a lot of the public's concern is not in their purview such as traffic and parking. The trash will be enclosed, but this is not necessarily in their purview. The mass is large. While they do not personally think this is the ideal location for a hotel, the Board cannot say that a hotel could not be located here. The petitioner and owner have the right to use the land as they want. But, they must meet the ordinance as far as historical elements blending with the surrounding neighborhood. There are some taller buildings in this neighborhood than what is being proposed. Mr. Howington commended the petitioner for doing something that is 21st century architecture. He believes that the petitioner has met all of the ordinance requirements. He said he has a concern with asking for a variance to lower the floors to get the additional story. Ms. Caldwell said the Board's purview is to preserve the Historic District. They will end up with empty hotels which will be an eye sore in the district. Ms. Deacon said there is a possibility that maybe a month from today, they could be looking at a hotel here with one story less, but would essentially be the same size. She stated that she likes the design of the hotel and believes it expresses a new look. The petitioner is meeting the requirements, but variances are her concerns.

**Ms. Harris** explained that based on the conversation last month, the petitioner wanted to bring the overall height down as low as possible. Staff felt that doing this would require a variance to bring it lower, but it would mitigate the height to the adjacent neighborhood; and therefore they felt this was acceptable. Staff recommended approval of that. If the petitioner meets the ordinance requirements, and is meeting the floor to floor height and not asking for a variance, then no variance would be required. It would just mean that the building is a little taller. Staff, therefore, recommended approval. They felt it was more important to mitigate the overall height. The project can move forward and meets all the standards without those floor to floor height variances.

**Mr. Howington** stated that the bonus story is a separate issue. He said while he has reservations about the overall height, the petitioner has done his due diligence to lower the overall height.

**Ms. Caldwell** was still in opposition of this hotel.

**Mr. Howington** said it is not within the purview of the Board to say how many hotels are allowed in the Historic District. If it has ill effect on the Historic District, the Board and the public need to talk to their City Council aldermen.

**Mr. Merriman** said he is sympathetic to what the Board members have said, but it not the purview of the Board to determine whether there are hotels here or not. The Board has to consider what is before them today. Does it meet the ordinance and the visual compatibility criteria? Mr. Merriman entertained a motion.

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve Part 1: Height and Mass for new construction of a hotel at 301 Tattnall Street with the following condition:

1. Ensure that the drawings reflect that the sidewalk along Jefferson Street will serve as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration and height;

Because otherwise the project is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Recommend approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard in the - PASS Historic District Section (8-3030) of the City of Savannah Zoning Ordinance which states:

*The exterior expression of the height of each story above the second shall not be less than 10 feet.*

Because the existing exterior expression of the height of each story above the second story as proposed will result in an overall reduced building height that is visually compatible and the variance criteria have been met.

**Vote Results**

Motion: Jennifer Deacon

Second: Keith Howington

Debra Caldwell	- Nay
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Not Present
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Tess Scheer	- Aye

**IX. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION**

19. [Petition of Verizon Wireless | 15-005811-COA | 321 West Bay Street | 12-Month Extension](#)

Attachment: [15-005811-COA 12-Month Extension.pdf](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve a 12 month extension of the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) issued on February 16, 2016 for the addition of three concealed antenna locations on the rooftop of 321 West Bay Street to expire on February 16, 2018. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Kellie Fletcher  
Second: Tess Scheer  
Debra Caldwell - Aye  
Jennifer Deacon - Aye  
Kellie Fletcher - Aye  
Keith Howington - Aye  
Becky Lynch - Aye  
Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present  
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain  
Tess Scheer - Aye

20. [Petition of Richard Mopper | 16-002750-COA | 214 West Bay Street | 12-Month Extension](#)

Attachment: [16-002750-COA - 12 Month Extension.pdf](#)

**Board Action:**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve a 12 month extension of the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) issued on June 8, 2016 for the alterations to 214 West Bay Street to expire on June 8, 2018. - PASS

**Vote Results**

Motion: Kellie Fletcher  
Second: Tess Scheer  
Debra Caldwell - Aye  
Jennifer Deacon - Aye  
Kellie Fletcher - Aye  
Keith Howington - Aye  
Becky Lynch - Aye  
Zena McClain, Esq. - Not Present  
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain  
Tess Scheer - Aye

**X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS**

21. [Petition of Hemal Patel | 16-007051-COA | 215 East Gordon Street | Staff Approved - Stucco Repairs](#)

Attachment: [COA - 215 East Gordon Street 16-007051-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

22. [Petition of Sherry Hargett | 17-000042-COA | 519 East Congress Street | Staff Approved - Siding](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 519 East Congress Street 17-000042-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [COA - 519 East Congress Street 17-000042-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

23. [Petition of Robert T. Cross | 17-000048-COA | 224 East Ogletborpe Avenue | Staff Approved - New Roof](#)

Attachment: [COA - 224 East Oglethorpe Avenue 17-000048-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 224 East Oglethorpe Aavenue 17-000048-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

24. [Petition of John Post for Commonwealth Construction | 17-000054-COA | 415 East Huntingdon Street | Staff Approved - New Roof](#)

Attachment: [COA - 415 East Huntingdon Street 17-000054-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 415 East Huntingdon Street 17-000054-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

25. [Petition of John Post for Commonwealth Construction | 17-000055-COA | 618 Price Street | Staff Approved - New Roof](#)

Attachment: [COA - 618 Price Street 17-000055-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 618 Price Street 17-000055-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

26. [Petition of Sam Carroll for Carroll Construction | 17-000068-COA | 5 East Gordon Street | Staff Approved - New Light Fixture](#)

Attachment: [COA - 5 East Gordon Street 17-000068-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 5 East Gordon Street 17-000068-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

27. [Petition of Ginny Billings for Beagle One, Inc., DBA Awning and Sign Contractors | 17-000073-COA | 119 Bull Street | Staff Approved - Awnings](#)

Attachment: [COA - 119 Bull Street 17-000073-COA.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 119 Bull Street 17-000073-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

28. [Petition of Dennis Murphy | 17-000102-COA | 245 Lincoln Street | Staff Approved - Windows](#)

Attachment: [COA - 245 Lincoln Street 17-000102-COA.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 245 Lincoln Street 17-000102-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

29. [Petition of Paul Allen | 17-00145-COA | 514 East Bryan Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 514 East Bryan Street 17-000145-COA.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Paint Colors.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

30. [Petition of Jeff McCoy for Whitco Roofing Company| 17-000147-COA |520 West Bryan Street | Staff Approve - Insulation](#)

Attachment: [COA - 520 West Bryan Street 17-000147-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

31. [Helen Morgan for SCAD | 17-000162-COA | 15 Drayton Street | Staff Approved - Windows](#)

Attachment: [COA - 15 Drayton Street 17-000162-COA.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 15 Drayton Street 17-000162-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

32. [Rebecca Fenwick for Lominack Kolman Smith Architects | 17-000180-COA | 2 West Bay Street | Staff Approved - Install Festoon Lighting and Fans](#)

Attachment: [COA - 2 West Bay Street 17-000180-COA.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 2 West Bay 17-000180-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

33. [Petition of Paul Hoover | 17-000193-COA | 419 East Congress Street | Staff Approved - Roof and Skylight](#)

Attachment: [COA - 419 East Congress Street 17-000193-COA.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [roof replacement material - 419 E. Congress.pdf](#)  
Attachment: [419 East Congress Stsketchreport\\_revision\\_2-1.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

34. [Petition of Ryan Claus for Felder & Associates | 2 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Ductwork](#)

Attachment: [2 West Broughton Street 17-000195-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 2 West Broughton Street 17-000195-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

35. [Matthew Hallett for Ellsworth Hallett Home Professionals | 17-000261-COA | 112 West Gaston Street | Staff Approved - Material](#)

Attachment: [COA - 112 West Gaston Street 17-000261-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [112 West Gaston Street - photos.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

36. [Petition of Matthew Hallett for Ellsworth Hallett Home Professionals | 17-000270-COA | 515 East Perry Street | Staff Approved - Door](#)

Attachment: [COA - 515 East Perry Street 17-000270-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Clad Casement Head, Sill, and Jamb \(1\).pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

37. [Petition of K. Gordon Taylor for Whitlow Construction | 17-000286-COA | 116 East Oglethorpe Avenue | Staff Approved - Repoint](#)

Attachment: [COA - 116 East Oglethorpe Avenue 17-000286-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 116 East Oglethorpe Avenue 17-000286-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

38. [Petition of Mallory Teeple for Coastal Canvas Products | 17-000317-COA | 206 East Oglethorpe Avenue | Staff Approved - Awning](#)

Attachment: [COA - 206 East Oglethorpe Avenue 17-000317-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 16834 PERMIT 206 East Oglethorpe Avenue - 140 Abercorn Street 17-000317-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet 2 - 16834 CUP TO CUP 206 E. Oglethorpe Avenue - 140 Abercorn Street 17-000317-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

39. [Petition of Carrie Efrid | 17-000378-COA | 7 Habersham Street - Units 1 and 3 | Staff Approved - Restoration Work](#)

Attachment: [COA - 7 Habersham Street 17-000378-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Resource Photos of 7 Habersham - Historic Savannah Book.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

40. [Petition of Liberty Wallace | 17-000401-COA | 536 East State Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 536 East State Street 17-000401-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 536 East State Street 17-000401-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

41. [Petition of Debbie Smith | 17-000444-COA | 202 East Gwinnett Street | Staff Approved - Balusters](#)

Attachment: [COA - 202 East Gwinnett Street 17-000444-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [202 E. Gwinnett-Images from Historic Savannah Book.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

42. [Petition of Michael Franck for Christ Church Episcopal | 17-000446-COA | 28 Bull Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 28 Bull Street 17-000446-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 28 Bull Street 17-000446-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

43. [Petition of Lori Judge for Judge Realty | 17-000533-COA | 347 Abercorn Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

Attachment: [COA - 347 Abercorn Street 17-000533-COA.pdf](#)

Attachment: [Submittal Packet - 347 Abercorn Street 17-000533-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

**XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

**XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF**

**XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, and ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

**Notices**

44. [Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting - Thursday, February 9, 2017 at 3:30 p.m. in the Meyer Conference Room, MPC, 110 East State Street](#)

45. [Next Pre- Meeting - Wednesday, March 8, 2017 at 12:00 p.m. in the Jerry Surrency Room, MPC, 112 E. State Street](#)

46. [Next Regular Meeting - Wednesday, March 8, 2017 at 1:00 p.m. in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, MPC, 112 E. State Street](#)

**XIV. OTHER BUSINESS**

**XV. ADJOURNMENT**

47. [Adjournment](#)

**Ms. Scheer**, for clarification, asked the staff that if there is an outcry from the public on the way the Board has voted on an item, can they make a case to someone?

**Ms. Harris** explained the Historic District Board of Review decisions can be appealed to the Savannah Zoning Board of Appeals by someone with standing such as an adjacent property owner.

\*\*\*

There being no further business to come before the Board, Mr. Merriman adjourned the meeting at 4:30 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Ellen Harris, Director  
Urban Planning and Historic Preservation