

BOARD OF REVIEW

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room March 8, 2017 1:00 P.M. Meeting Minutes

MARCH 8, 2017 HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW REGULAR MEETING

HDRB Members Present: Stephen Merriman, Jr., Chair

Zena McClain, Esq., Vice-Chair

Debra Caldwell Jennifer Deacon Kellie Fletcher Keith Howington Becky Lynch Andy McGarrity

MPC Staff Present: Ellen Harris, Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation

Sara Farr, Historic Preservation Planner Alyson Smith, Historic Preservation Planner Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

1. Call to Order and Welcome

Mr. Merriman called the meeting to order at 1:05 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. He outlined the role of the Historic District Board of Review and explained the process for hearing the various petitions. Staff will present each application with a recommendation. The petitioner will have the opportunity to respond to the recommendation. The petitioners are asked to limit their presentation to 10 minutes or less and only address the items identified as inconsistent with the ordinance and questions raised by the Board. The public will have the same allotted time, ten minutes, to comment. The petitioner will be given the opportunity to respond to the public comments.

The Board will then go into Board discussion at which time no further testimony is received unless specifically requested by the Chair. Each Board member will be given two minutes twice to provide comments, if they so desire.

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

2. Approval of Consent Agenda March 8, 2017

Board Action:

Approve Consent Agenda March 8, 2017. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Zena McClain, Esq. Second: Kellie Fletcher

Keith Howington - Aye Becky Lynch - Aye Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye Andy McGarrity - Aye Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye

3. Petition of Sign Man Inc. | 17-000316-COA | 216-218 West Broughton Street | Signs

Attachment: <u>Staff Recommendation.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Package.pdf</u>

Attachment: Supplemental Information.pdf

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a principal use fascia sign at 216-218 West Broughton Street with the condition that it does not project more than 15 inches from the façade of the building, because otherwise it meets the standards and is visually

compatible.

Vote Results

Motion: Zena McClain, Esq. Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye
Kellie Fletcher - Aye
Keith Howington - Aye
Becky Lynch - Aye

Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye
Andy McGarrity - Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

4. Petition of Stafford's Public House | 17-000461-COA | 301 West River Street | Sign

Attachment: Submittal Packet.pdf
Attachment: Staff Photos.pdf

Attachment: New Franklin & Wharf Lots Ward.pdf

Attachment: Staff Recommendation.pdf

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition of the proposed fascia sign at 301 West River Street because the sign is visually compatible and meets the River Street-Factors Walk Sign Section.

Vote Results

Motion: Zena McClain, Esq.

Second: Kellie Fletcher Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Keith Howington - Aye Becky Lynch - Aye Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye Andy McGarrity - Aye Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

5. Petition of Sign D'Sign | 17-000597-COA | 325 East Bay Street | Sign

Attachment: <u>Staff Recommendation.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Package.pdf</u>

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a projecting principal use sign at 325 East Bay Street with the condition that the sign is attached to the mortar joints in the building.

Vote Results

Motion: Zena McClain, Esq. Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain

6. Petition of Tollison & Co | 17-000664-COA | 574 Indian Street | Sign

Attachment: Staff Recommendation.pdf

Attachment: Images.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Package.pdf

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a projecting principal use sign at 574 Indian Street with the following conditions:

- 1. The sign does not project more than 6 feet;
- 2. The sign provides a minimum of 10 feet of PASS clearance above the sidewalk;
- 3. Install the bracket only into the mortar;

Because otherwise the sign meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results

Motion: Zena McClain, Esq. Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Keith Howington - Aye Becky Lynch - Aye Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye Andy McGarrity - Aye Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

7. Petition of Lowcountry Signs | 17-000668-COA | 135 West Bay Street | Signs

Attachment: <u>Staff Recommendation.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Package.pdf</u>

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review

does hereby approve the petition for a projecting principal use sign and supplemental ID sign at 135 West Bay Street, because the signs meet the standards and are visually compatible.

Vote Results

Motion: Zena McClain, Esq. Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Keith Howington - Aye Becky Lynch - Aye Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye Andy McGarrity - Aye Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

8. Petition of Pantheon ADC | 17-000743-COA | 124 West Taylor Street | Demolition, Addition, Fence

Attachment: Aerial map.pdf

Attachment: Chatham Ward Map.pdf
Attachment: Context -Sanborn Maps .pdf

Attachment: Specifications.pdf

Attachment: Staff Photos -124 West Taylor St..pdf

Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Staff Recommendation.pdf</u>

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition of the addition, demolition of the non-contributing carport, and construction of a brick privacy wall at 124 West Taylor Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to construction:

- Reduce the size of the apron trim, below the window sills at the addition, so that the width of the flat trim around the headers is not-PASS equal to the apron's dimension;
- 2. Ensure that the window sashes are inset not less than three inches from the exterior façade;
- 3. Revise the height of the wall and archway above the pedestrian gate so that there is a

consistent wall height along the lane.

Because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results

Motion: Zena McClain, Esq. Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Keith Howington - Aye Becky Lynch - Aye Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye Andy McGarrity - Aye Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

9. Petition of Eric Walsnovich | 17-000745-COA | 660 East Broughton Street | Signs and Fences

Attachment: <u>Staff Recommendation.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Package.pdf</u>

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the proposed fence and signs at 660 East Broughton Street with the condition that the material for the arch is revised and the color for the concrete submitted for - PASS staff approval, because otherwise the fence and signs meet the standards and are visually compatible.

Vote Results

Motion: Zena McClain, Esq. Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye **Keith Howington** - Aye Becky Lynch - Aye Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye Andy McGarrity - Aye Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

$10.\ \underline{Petition\ of\ Coastal\ Heritage\ Society\ |\ 17\text{-}000746\text{-}COA\ |\ 342\ Purse\ Street\ |\ Alterations\ and\ \underline{Additions}}$

Attachment: <u>Staff Recommendation.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Submittal Package.pdf</u>

Attachment: <u>Drawings.pdf</u>

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations and additions at 342 Purse Street with the following conditions to be submitted for staff approval:

- 1. If physical evidence of the front stoop is found alter the stoop design to reflect this evidence;
- 2. Samples of the brick and mortar are PASS provided;
- 3. Specify if infill will be used on the foundation, and if so the type and inset;
- 4. Ensure the seam on the roof does not exceed 1 inch:

Because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results

Motion: Zena McClain, Esq. Second: Kellie Fletcher Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye
Kellie Fletcher - Aye
Keith Howington - Aye
Becky Lynch - Aye
Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye
Andy McGarrity - Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

11. Approval of January 18, 2017 Special Called Meeting Minutes

Attachment: <u>01-18-2017 Minutes Special Called Meeting.pdf</u>

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve January 18, 2017 Special Called Meeting Minutes.

- PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Debra Caldwell Second: Keith Howington

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Keith Howington - Aye Becky Lynch - Aye Zena McClain, Esq. - Abstain Andy McGarrity - Abstain Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

12. Approval of February 8, 2017 Meeting Minutes

Attachment: 02-08-2017 Minutes.pdf

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review

does hereby approve February 8, 2017 Meeting - PASS

Minutes.

Vote Results

Motion: Debra Caldwell Second: Keith Howington

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Keith Howington - Aye Becky Lynch - Aye Zena McClain, Esq. - Abstain Andy McGarrity - Abstain Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

13. Continue All Items to Next Regular Meeting

Board Action:

Continue all items to the next meeting. - PASS

Vote Results

Motion: Becky Lynch

Second: Debra Caldwell	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain

14. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 15-001384-COA | 600 East Bay Street | New Construction: Part II, Design Details

Board Action:	
The Savannah Historic District Board of Review	- PASS
does hereby continue the petition as requested.	- 1 ASS
Vote Results	
Motion: Becky Lynch	
Second: Debra Caldwell	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain

15. <u>Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006848-COA | 501 Montgomery Street | New Construction:</u>
<u>Part II Design Details</u>

Board Action:	
The Savannah Historic District Board of Review	- PASS
does hereby continue the petition as requested.	- 1 ASS
Vote Results	
Motion: Becky Lynch	
Second: Debra Caldwell	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye

Becky Lynch	- Aye
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain

16. <u>Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006849-COA | 607 Drayton Street | New Construction: Part II Design Details</u>

Board Action: The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.	- PASS
Vote Results	
Motion: Becky Lynch	
Second: Debra Caldwell	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain

 $17.\ \underline{Petition\ of\ Gunn\ Meyerhoff\ Shay\ |\ 16\text{-}006851\text{-}COA\ |\ 620\ East\ River\ Street\ |\ New\ Construction}}\\ \underline{Hotel:\ Part\ I,\ Height\ and\ Mass}}$

Board Action: The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.	- PASS
Vote Results	
Motion: Becky Lynch	
Second: Debra Caldwell	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Jennifer Deacon	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Aye
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain

18. <u>Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006852-COA | 630 East River Street | New Construction Parking Garage: Part I, Height and Mass</u>

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results

Motion: Becky Lynch Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Keith Howington - Aye Becky Lynch - Aye Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye Andy McGarrity - Aye Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

19. <u>Petition of Gary Sanders | 16-003487-COA | 305 West Wayne Street | New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass</u>

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results

Motion: Becky Lynch Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye
Kellie Fletcher - Aye
Keith Howington Becky Lynch - Aye
Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye
Andy McGarrity - Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

20. <u>Petition of Gary Sanders | 17-000198-COA | 315 West Wayne Street | Demolition of a Non-Contributing Building</u>

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results

Motion: Becky Lynch Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye **Keith Howington** - Aye Becky Lynch - Aye Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye Andy McGarrity - Aye Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

21. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006847-COA | 405 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | Demolition and New Construction Part 1 Height and Mass

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results

Motion: Becky Lynch Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Keith Howington - Aye Becky Lynch - Aye Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye Andy McGarrity - Aye Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

VIII. REGULAR AGENDA

22. Petition of Stacey Ritchie | 17-000380-COA | 122 East Liberty Street | Awning Signage

Attachment: <u>Aerial Map.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Brown Ward.pdf</u>
Attachment: Submittal Packet.pdf

Attachment: 122 East Liberty Street Staff Images.pdf

Attachment: Staff Recommendation.pdf

Ms. Stacey Ritchie was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Smith gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting after-the-fact approval for the installation of a new awning with signage at 122 East Liberty Street. The existing awning faces south on East Liberty Street and extends the length of the main entrance and storefront. The signage on the blue awning reads, "J. Christopher's". The text is yellow with an orange circle. The business occupies approximately 50 linear feet along East Liberty Street. A COA application for the subject awning was submitted and then withdrawn by the applicant on November 16, 2016 [File No. 16-006060-COA].

Ms. Smith said that *Google Earth* features archived images of the building featuring an awning since 2007. During this time, the building also had a principal use sign painted on the building. Staff was unable to find approvals for the awning or signage. The property features an awning in the most recent *Google Earth* image available from April 2016. However, this awning was removed sometime between April and November 2016 when staff documented the building without signage or an awning.

Ms. Smith explained that the petitioner is also requesting a variance from the *Awning Signage/Graphics Standard* which only permits awning signage within nonresidential zoning districts. The subject building is located within a residential zoning district, RIP-A, therefore, awning signage is not permitted.

Ms. Smith reported that staff recommends approval of the awning at 122 East Liberty with the following condition:

1. The awning shall not include the proposed signage because it is not permitted within districts other than nonresidential zoning districts;

Because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Ms. Smith additionally reported that staff recommends denial to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard in the Historic District Section (8-3030) of the City of Savannah Zoning Ordinance which states:

Awning Signage/Graphics. Within nonresidential zoning districts, in addition to the permitted principal use sign, one canopy or awning principal use sign shall be permitted for each entrance providing public access. Such sign shall not exceed a size of more than one square foot of sign face per linear foot of canopy or awning, or a maximum of 20 square feet, whichever is lesser; provided, however, that the aggregate total principal use sign area for the subject use is not exceeded along that street frontage. Signs on the opposite ends of an awning shall be considered a single sign. Individual letters or symbols not to exceed six inches indicating use, address, or an exit or entrance, painted, stenciled or otherwise applied directly to any awnings, or canopy within the historic district, shall be exempt from this provision.

Because the subject property does not have a special condition and the proposed variance is not consistent with the intent of the Ordinance.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Ms. Ritchie respectfully asked the Review Board to approve their request for the signage variance. The prior sign was painted on the front of the building. But, after ll years of being in business, the awning is torn and the painted sign is faded from the weather. They decided to paint the entire building and, therefore, the signage was removed. Ms. Ritchie said they have not gotten any complaints on the signage. She showed the Board some pictures of nearby businesses in the area that have similar signage. All of the businesses are within two to four blocks of their location. These business, too, are in different districts that do not allow signage. Ms. Ritchie said she understood that some of the signs may be grandfathered in. However, their zoning was changed. They are merely trying to coordinate with the City and maintain the historic beauty of Savannah.

Mr. Howington asked when was the zoning changed.

Ms. Smith answered that she was not aware that the zoning was changed.

Ms. Harris explained that the other signs are in different zoning districts. The only exception is Clary's, which is in an RIP-A district and is grandfathered in. All of the others are in zoning districts that allow signage. If it is 6 inches are less and just have the name, it is acceptable.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussed the signage and variance request. This is an after-the-fact approval request for the installation of a new awning with signage. They understood that this business is down the street from business who have similar signage, but the zoning classification is different. The Board was in agreement with the staff recommendation.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition of the awning at 122 East Liberty with the following condition:

1. The awning shall not include the proposed signage because it is not permitted within districts other than nonresidential zoning districts;

Because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby recommend denial to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard in the Historic District Section (8-3030) of the City of

Savannah Zoning Ordinance which states:

Signage/Graphics. Within Awning nonresidential zoning districts, in addition to the permitted principal use sign, one canopy or awning principal use sign shall be permitted for each entrance providing public access. Such sign shall-PASS not exceed a size of more than one square foot of sign face per linear foot of canopy or awning, or a maximum of 20 square feet, whichever is lesser; provided, however, that the aggregate total principal use sign area for the subject use is not exceeded along that street frontage. Signs on the opposite ends of an awning shall be considered a single sign. Individual letters or symbols not to exceed six inches indicating use, address, or an exit or entrance, painted, stenciled or otherwise applied directly to any awnings, or canopy within the historic district, shall be exempt from this provision.

Because the subject property does not have a special condition and the proposed variance is not consistent with the intent of the Ordinance.

Vote Results

Motion: Keith Howington Second: Zena McClain, Esq.

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Keith Howington - Aye - Aye Becky Lynch Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye Andy McGarrity - Aye Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

23. Petition of Olde Harbour Inn | 17-000503-COA | 508 East Factors Walk | Signs

Attachment: New Franklin Lofts Ward.pdf

Attachment: <u>Submital Packet.pdf</u>

Attachment: Staff Recommendation.pdf

Ms. Susan Powers was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Alyson Smith gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval to install a new directory sign at the Lincoln Street ramp that transfers traffic from Bay Street to River Street. The new sign will be constructed of wood and will feature text that will read, "Olde Habour Inn" with a directional arrow below. The text will be red and the background will be blue. The sign will be installed to an existing pole that features directory signage for other properties. The sign will measure two feet by two feet.

Ms. Smith stated that the petitioner is also requesting a variance from the River Street-Factors Walk Sign Standard that permits one directory sign per establishment so long as the signs do not exceed a distance of 400 feet from its principal entrance. The principal entrance for the *Olde Harbour Inn* is 967 feet from the signage location and exceeds the maximum distance permitted.

Ms. Smith reported that staff recommends approval of the directory sign with the condition that the Zoning Board of Appeals grant the variance because the sign is visually compatible. She additionally reported that staff recommends approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard in the Historic District Section (8-3030) of the City of Savannah Zoning Ordinance which states:

Directory signs shall be located within 400 feet of its principal entrance, as measured by the nearest sidewalk.

Because the sign is visually compatible and meets the variance standards.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Ms. Powers explained that they do not know what happened to their original sign. It disappeared in November, 2016. They want to be sure that the sign meets the Review Board standards. The only glitch is they need to ask for a variance as the distance is 900 feet from the entrance.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board agreed with staff recommendations. The sign is visually compatible and meets the variance standards.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the directory sign with the condition that the Zoning Board of Appeals grant the variance because the sign is visually compatible.

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby recommend approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard in the Historic District Section (8-3030) of the City of Savannah Zoning Ordinance which states: - PASS

Directory signs shall be located within 400 feet of its principal entrance, as measured by the nearest sidewalk.

Because the sign is visually compatible and meets the variance standards.

Vote Results

Motion: Zena McClain, Esq. Second: Jennifer Deacon

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Keith Howington - Aye Becky Lynch - Aye Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye Andy McGarrity - Aye Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

24. Petition of Wubbena Architects | 17-000712-COA | 217 East Charlton Street | Stoop Alterations

Attachment: Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf

Attachment: <u>Lafayette Ward.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Staff Photos.pdf</u>

Attachment: Staff Recommendation.pdf

Attachment: Specifications.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet.pdf

Mr. James Wubbena was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Alyson Smith gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval to demolish an existing non-historic front porch and to reconstruct the original historic porch using historic photographic documentation at 217 East Charlton Street. The existing front door, lights, and mailbox will remain.

Ms. Smith reported that staff recommends a continuance of the front porch reconstruction at 217 East Charlton Street in order for the petitioner to restudy the following:

- 1. Submit the dimensions and a detail drawing for the balusters' spacing and height; ensure that the distance between balusters does not exceed four inches, and that the height of the railing does not exceed 36";
- 2. The portico's fascia and soffit must be constructed of wood;
- 3. Redesign the portico to match the historic photo and ghost lines, specifically the following features:
 - The balusters:
 - The square newel posts;
 - The portico's roof shape;
 - The overall proportion and width of the portico should be increased:
 - Include the two porch columns that are closest to the building's façade; as represented in the historic photo;
 - Reduce the length of the stairs and landing.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Wubbena explained that their intention is to bring the stoop back to its original form. They are willing to work with the comments made by staff. The stairs in the photo are not in compliance. They want to see if they will be able to get rid of one or two risers. The roof is a shed roof with a gable bin. They are trying to emulate this. There is no way for them to get the gable in the ridge under the window and have the ghost lines with the shed roof as shown in the photo. Mr. Wubbena said they will be willing to come up with a different scenario and bring up the meeting point on the brick line to provide a little more slope to the roof or work out something with staff. There are some discrepancies here with the roof. They want to see what they can come up with to make this work.

Mr. Wubbena stated as far as the landing and the railings, they will make the adjustments as needed. He asked that the Board approve them to work out these things with the staff so that the timeline for the owner does not get pushed back for a couple of weeks. They will ensure that everyone is happy with the outcomes. He said they want to move forward.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Ms. Danielle Meunier of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) said they appreciate that the petitioner is willing to restore this porch. However, the HSF believes it is important that they look at the relationship with the neighboring duplex. What happens here will certainly impact the neighbor's stoop. If this porch is going to be restored, they believe it should be done together. With looking at the pictures, they agree it appears as a shed roof; yet, the ghost signs on the building could be something from a previous stoop or may be something later. The HSF believes that there is a conflict between the pictures and ghost lines. Therefore, the HSF suggests that further study be done to possibly come to a clearer picture or option.

Ms. Meunier said they have discussed that there could be a way that another gable was included on the side of the shed which has altered the shape close to the ghost lines. Basically, there are some other options that could be possible; they encourage the petitioner to restudy this. Consequently, the HSF agrees with the staff recommendations.

Mr. Wubbena, in response to the public comments, said they are reaffirming the fact that

they are willing to look into the key items so everyone will be happy with the results.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board was pleased that the petitioner is restoring the stoop. There are a number of discrepancies between the proposed design and the historic photos. Mr. Howington said it seems to him that the columns at the back has a flat roof and the cornice wraps around and then back into the wall; a half gable comes down off the roof. This needs to be restudied. The Board agreed with the staff recommendations.

The Board discussed the petitioner working with staff to move this petition forward. Ms. Deacon stated that there are quite a number of comments from staff that needs to be addressed. This is why staff is requesting a continuance.

Mr. Merriman explained to Mr. Wubbena that may be he would like to request a continuance in order for him to work with staff. The petition would not necessarily come back to be heard by the Board as it could be placed on the consent agenda.

Mr. Wubbena asked for a continuance in order to work with staff.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition of the front porch reconstruction at 217 East Charlton Street in order for the petitioner to restudy the following:

- 1. Submit the dimensions and a detail drawing for the balusters' spacing and height; ensure that the distance between balusters does not exceed four inches, and that the height of the railing does not exceed 36";
- 2. The portico's fascia and soffit must be constructed of wood;
- 3. Redesign the portico to match the historic photo and ghost lines, specifically the following features:
 - The balusters:
 - The square newel posts;
 - The portico's roof shape;
 - The overall proportion and width of the portico should be increased;
 - Include the two porch columns that are

closest to the building's façade; as represented in the historic photo;

• Reduce the length of the stairs and landing.

Vote Results

Motion: Zena McClain, Esq. Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Ave Kellie Fletcher - Aye Keith Howington - Ave Becky Lynch - Aye Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye Andy McGarrity - Aye Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

25. <u>Petition of LS3P Dawson | 17-00742-COA | 229 West Congress Street | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass</u>

Attachment: 17-000742-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf

Attachment: Aerial.pdf

Attachment: <u>Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf</u> Attachment: <u>Historic Photograph.pdf</u>

Attachment: Submittal Packet- Application, narrative, photos.pdf

Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet- Drawings.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet- GDP.pdf</u>

Attachment: Submittal Packet - model photos small.pdf

Attachment: <u>Petitioner Response to Staff Recommendations- Drawings.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Petitioner Response to Staff Recommendations- Narrative.pdf</u>

Attachment: Public Comment- Bernstein.pdf

Attachment: Petitioner Response to Staff Recommendations- Rendering.pdf

Ms. Jennifer Deacon recused herself from participating in this petition. She is an employee of LS3P.

Mr. Dave Moore was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval of New Construction: Part 1 Height and Mass of a four story building at the southeast corner of West Congress and Jefferson Streets. Each primary façade, north and west, will feature two entrances. The upper floors will be accessed from the entrance at the northeast corner of the building while the other entrances will serve the two tenant spaces on the ground floor.

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends approval of Part 1 Height and Mass for a new four story building at the southeast corner of Jefferson and West Congress Streets with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II Design Details:

- 1. Reduce the height, mass and scale of the rooftop access structure to the maximum extent possible to allow for maintenance of the mechanical equipment;
- 2. Add additional articulation on the ground floor of the lane façade;
- 3. Eliminate the balconies on the second floor of the center bay along Jefferson Street and redesign the fenestration to match the floors above.

Because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

Ms. Harris stated that earlier, the petitioner provided some revised drawings to illustrate how they intent to meet the staff conditions which will come back with Part II - Design Details. She informed the Board that staff received one public comment which is attached to today's agenda.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Moore explained that unfortunately this building is falling under new criteria related to storm drainage based on a study that was done by the city. The study was done to try to deal with identification of potential flooding hazards in case of the 100 years storm. The requirements are that the storm drainage basically be retained and done in such a way that it does not impact the current proficiency of the existing storm system that serves the site. They are going through the process of working through this requirement. One of the requirements is that any of the storm drainage be covered in 100 percent pervious; therefore, they will need to have a retention for the building. They are doing this by creating a filtration system using landscaping that will filter the water. The roof will be accessed by an elevator and two stairways.

Mr. Moore said they have reduced the stair height and perimeter area by dropping down one-half of the entire stair bay. They have actually stepped back approximately five feet back from the perimeter edge. The roof will be approximately eight feet. They have pulled back the elevator. Currently, what is shown is a gearless elevator and actually requires a higher head clearance because of the overhead hang. He stated that they are proposing to reduce the height from what is shown by another one foot - nine inches by going to a hydraulic elevator which only requires a 12' - 3" clearance.

Mr. Moore said that originally they had a vestibule that included an enclosure on the stairs and elevator, but now they are eliminating the enclosure and have stairs that will become a part of the outdoor space. The only enclosure will be at the elevator for a vestibule that will be glass and reduce the height to eight feet for the enclosure. If the Board has concern with the vestibule, they will get rid of it, but they prefer to keep it because they believe this will be a potential water intrusion issue from the rest of the building. As far as the other components of the building, they are proposing to accept the recommendation of the roof style and eliminate the two balconies which are shown in this perspective image. On the lane side, they have created a patterning of the pilaster wall which emulates the window.

Ms. Lynch asked Mr. Moore to explain the proposed window types.

Mr. Moore stated that on the towers, they are trying to articulate the corners of the building on the four sides. The Congress Street side is actually narrow for this corner. They are trying to turn those corners because they are the strongest lead points as you approach from any street location. They wanted to basically take the corners and strengthen them. The windows will have the same profile shape.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Sam Bernstein said his building is located at 223 West Congress Street, adjacent to the proposed structure. Mr. Bernstein is concern about the distance between the proposed structure and his building.

Ms. Danielle Meunier of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF) said the petitioner met with the HSF. They agree with all the comments that staff made pertaining to the balconies and the articulation on the lane façade. The HSF believes that the revisions the petitioner presented today are an improvement. Ms. Meunier said at the time of their initial review with the architect, they had not considered the point that the staff has made regarding what counts as a story. They agree with staff that the additional stair hallway and vestibule do not meet the intent of the standard. She said, therefore, the HSF suggests that those elements be reduced as much as possible or eliminate them.

Mr. Moore showed, in response to the public comments, their elevation that faces the adjacent property. They are proposing a solid masonry wall as a firewall between the adjacent building and their building with a plaster finish on most of the elevation, except for the corners, where they will actually return the brick as a part of their design to strengthen the corners because of this being the prominent element. The building will not have an impact on the adjacent building. They are aware that there is an existing basement in the adjacent building. Therefore, they will ensure that they not impact the basement. There are some existing structures around the perimeter of the site as well.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The petitioner presented revised drawings which detailed how they propose to meet staff conditions. Board discussion focused on the roof access structure. The building has been reduced quite successfully.

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for Part 1 Height and Mass for a new four story building at the southeast corner of Jefferson and West Congress Streets with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II Design Details:

1. Reduce the height, mass and scale of the rooftop access structure to the maximum

extent possible, as presented at the meeting;

- 2. Add additional articulation on the ground PASS floor of the lane façade;
- 3. Eliminate the balconies on the second floor of the center bay along Jefferson Street and redesign the fenestration to match the floors above.

Because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results

Motion: Keith Howington Second: Becky Lynch

Debra Caldwell - Ave Jennifer Deacon - Abstain Kellie Fletcher - Aye **Keith Howington** - Aye Becky Lynch - Aye Zena McClain, Esq. - Aye Andy McGarrity - Aye Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

IX. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

26. Petition of Hansen Architects | 16-002194-COA | 220 East Bryan Street | 12-Month Extension

Attachment: 16-002194-COA-12 Month Extension.pdf

Board Action:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve a 12-month extension of the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) issued on May 11, 2016 for the demolition of 220 East Bryan Street, a non-contributing, four story brick building to expire on May 11, 2018.

Vote Results

Motion: Becky Lynch Second: Zena McClain, Esq.

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye
Kellie Fletcher - Aye
Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch	- Aye
Zena McClain, Esq.	- Aye
Andy McGarrity	- Aye
Stephen Glenn Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

27. Petition of Chad Scribner for Ben & Jerry's of Savannah | 17-000196-COA | 25 East Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Awning

Attachment: Image of typical Ben & Jerry's awning.pdf

Attachment: awning dimensions.pdf

Attachment: COA - 25 East Broughton Street 17-000196-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved

28. <u>Petition of Abigail Powell for Ellsworth Hallett Home Professionals | 17-000500-COA | 415 Whitaker Street | Staff Approved - Alterations</u>

Attachment: COA - 415 Whitaker Street 17-000500-COA.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet East Elevation - 415 Whitaker Street 17-000500-COA.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet Front Door - 415 Whitaker Street 17-000500-COA.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet Window Details - 415 Whitaker Street 17-000500-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

29. Petition of David "Luke" Gabelman | 17-000560-COA | 518-520 Blair Street | Staff Denial - Wood Fence

Attachment: COA - 518-520 Blair Street 17-000560-COA Denied.pdf
Attachment: Submittal Packet - 518-520 Blair Street 17-000560-COA.pdf

Attachment: 518 520 Blair Street Image.pdf

No action required. Staff denied.

30. Petition of Darcy O'Connor for the Firefly | 17-000608-COA | 321 Habersham Street | Staff Denial - After-the-fact Festoon Lighting

Attachment: Google Images of 321 Habersham Street.pdf

Attachment: <u>Courtesy Violation Notice_324 East Harris Street.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>COA - 321 Habersham Street 17-000608-COA Denial.pdf</u>

No action required. Staff denied.

31. Petition of Tony Hensley for SCAD | 17-000629-COA | 618 Drayton Street | Staff Approved - Roof Repairs

Attachment: COA - 618 Drayton Street 17-000629-COA.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - 618 Drayton Street 17-000629-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

32. Petition of Tony Hensley for SCAD | 17-000630-COA | 622 Drayton Street | Staff Approved - Roof

Attachment: Submittal package.pdf

Attachment: COA - 622 Drayton Street 17-000630-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

33. <u>Petition of Marysue McCarthy | 17-000662-COA | 230 Houston Street | Staff Denial - After-the-fact Security Panels</u>

Attachment: <u>COA - 230 Houston Street 17-000662-COA Denied.pdf</u>
Attachment: <u>Submittal Packet - 230 Houston Street 17-000662-COA.pdf</u>

No action required. Staff denied.

34. <u>Petition of Billy McIntosh for JTVS Builders, Inc. | 17-000691-COA | 101 East Oglethorpe Avenue | Staff Approved - Electrical Panel</u>

Attachment: COA - 101 East Oglethorpe Avenue 17-000691-COA.pdf

Attachment: George- New Electrical Sketch 2.10.17.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

35. Petition of Clif Cooper for Pantheon ADC | 17-000744-COA | 1 West Jones Street | Staff Approved - Roof and Stair Access Repairs

Attachment: COA - 1 West Jones Street 17-000744-COA.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - 1 W Jones Roof 17-000744-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

36. Petition of William J. Bremer, III | 17-000765-COA | 408 East Liberty Street | Staff Approved - Pressure Washing and Brick Repointing

Attachment: COA - 408 East Liberty Street 17-000765-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

37. Petition of Sam Carroll for Carroll Construction | 17-000767-COA | Staff Approved - Color Change

Attachment: COA - 123 West Charlton Street 17-000767-COA.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - 123 West Charlton Street 17-000767-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

38. Petition of Lance Cohen | 17-000772-COA | 414 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Replace

Wndows

Attachment: COA - 414 West Broughton Street 17-000772-COA.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - 414 and 418 West Broughton Street 17-000772-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

39. <u>Petition of Lance Cohen | 17-000804-COA | 418 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Replace Windows</u>

Attachment: COA - 418 West Broughton Street 17-000804-COA.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - 418 West Broughton Street 17-000804-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

40. <u>Petition of Dominic B. Yiadom | 17-000975-COA | 538 East Gaston Street | Staff Approved - Color Changes</u>

Attachment: COA - 538 East Gaston Street 17-000975-COA.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - 538 E. Gaston External Paint Colors 17-000975-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

41. <u>Petition of George Lindsay for Cross Roofing and Construction Co. | 17-000976-COA | 308 East</u> Gaston Street | Staff Approved - Roof Repairs

Attachment: COA - 308 East Gaston Street 17-000976-COA.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - 308 East Gaston Street 17-000976-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

42. <u>Petition of George Lindsay for Linwin Corporation, LLC | 17-000977-COA | 237 East Gordon Street | Staff Approved - Roof Repairs</u>

Attachment: COA - 237 East Gordon Street 17-000977-COA.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - 237 East Gordon Street 17-000977-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

43. <u>Petition of George Lindsay for Linwin Corporation, LLC | 17-000979-COA | 310 East Gaston Street | Staff Approved - Roof Repairs</u>

Attachment: COA - 310 East Gaston Street 17-000979-COA.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - 310 East Gaston Street 17-000979-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

44. <u>Petition of Walter Carson for Carson and Company | 17-001013-COA | 218 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Color Change</u>

Attachment: COA - 218 West Broughton Street 17-001013-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

45. <u>Amended Petition of Jodie Quinter for LS3P Dawson | 17-001057-COA | 321 Montgomery Street |</u> Staff Approved - Vestibule Entry

Attachment: COA - 321 Montgomery Street 17-001057-COA.pdf

Attachment: Submittal Packet - 321 Montgomery Street 17-001057-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

46. Amended Petition of John Kern for Kern & Co., LLC | 17-001128-COA | 209 and 219 West St. Julian Street | Staff Approved - Widening Doorway

Attachment: COA - 209 and 219 West St. Julian Street 17-001128-COA.pdf

Attachment: City Market Pedestrian Foot Bridge.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

47. Petition of Michael Higgins | 17-001205-COA | 535-541 East Macon Street | Staff Approved - Roof

Attachment: COA - 535 - 541 East Macon Street 17-001205-COA.pdf

Attachment: Re_Roofing Question.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, and ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Notices

- 48. Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting Thursday, March 16, 2017 at 3:30 p.m. in the Meyer Conference Room, MPC, 110 East State Street
- 49. Next Pre- Meeting Wednesday, April 12, 2017 at 12:00 p.m. in the Jerry Surrencey Room, MPC, 112 E. State Street
- 50. Next Regular Meeting Wednesday, April 12, 2017 at 1:00 p.m. in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, MPC, 112 E. State Street

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

51. Adjournment

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room March 8, 2017 1:00 P.M. Meeting Minutes

There being no further business to come before the Review Board, Mr. Merriman adjourned the meeting at 2:30 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Ellen Harris, Director Urban Planning and Historic Preservation