

Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room October 11, 2017 1:00 p.m. Meeting Minutes

OCTOBER 11, 2017 SAVANNAH HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW REGULAR MEETING

A Pre-Meeting will be held at 12:00 PM in the Jerry Surrency Conference Room, 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda will be presented by Staff, as time permits, and the Board may ask questions. No testimony will be received and no votes will be taken.

HDBR Members Present: Stephen Merriman, Jr., Chair

Debra Caldwell Scott Cook Jennifer Deacon Keith Howington Becky Lynch Mic Matson Dwayne Stephens

HDBR Members Absent: Zena McClain, Esq., Vice-Chair

Kellie Fletcher

MPC Staff Present: Ellen Harris, Director of Urban Planning and

Historic Preservation

Leah Michalak, Senior Preservation Planner Sara Farr-Newman, Preservation Planner Alyson Smith, Preservation Planner Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

1. Call to Order and Welcome

Mr. Merriman called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. He outlined the role of the Historic District Board of Review and explained the process for hearing the various petitions. Staff will present each application with a recommendation. The petitioner will have the opportunity to respond to the recommendation. The petitioners are asked to limit their presentation to 10 minutes or less and only address the items identified as inconsistent with the ordinance and questions raised by the Board. The public will have the same allotted time, 10 minutes, to comment. The petitioner will be given the opportunity to respond to the public comments.

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

2. C1 - Petition of Tim Geiken | 17-005486-COA | 317 Lorch Street | Fence

- Submittal Packet 317 Lorch Street 17-005486-COA.pdf
- Staff Recommendation.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a fence at 317 Lorch Street because the fence is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Mic Matson

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington- AyeBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMic Matson- Aye

3. C2 - Petition of Ellsworth-Hallett Home Professionals | 17-005581-COA | 213 East Gaston Street | Alterations

- Project Narrative, Photos, Window Specification.pdf
- Submittal Packet Drawings 213 East Gaston Street 17-005581-COA.pdf
- Sanborn Maps.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for window and door replacements on the rear elevation at 213 East Gaston Street with the following condition:

-Ensure that the French doors proposed for the historic structure are inset not less than three inches from the exterior surface;

Because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Mic Matson

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Stephen Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Scott Cook - Aye

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

Mic Matson - Aye

4. C3 - Petition of Ellsworth-Hallett Home Professionals | 17-005590-COA | 408 Bull Street | Alterations

- Submittal Packet 408 Bull Street 17-005590-COA.pdf
- Historic Building Map_Monterey Ward.pdf
- Staff Recommendation.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for stucco treatment on the southeast portion of the rear concrete block wall at 408 Bull Street as proposed because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Mic Matson

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington- AyeBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMic Matson- Aye

5. C4 - Petition of Brooks Signs | 17-005593-COA | 12 West Oglethorpe Avenue | Sign

- Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Package.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a freestanding sign at 12 West Oglethorpe, because the sign is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Mic Matson

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington- AyeBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMic Matson- Aye

6. C5 - Petition of Sheehan Company | 17-005619-COA | 213-219 East Broad Street | Alterations

- Aerial Map.pdf
- Historic Building Map Crawford Ward.pdf
- Submittal Packet 213 219 East Broad Street 17-005619-COA.pdf
- Staff Recommendation.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations at 213 – 219 East Broad Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to construction:

1.Ensure the storefront glazing is transparent and inset a minimum of four inches from the face of the building; 2.Provide a specification for the East Hull Street replacement door and ensure that the door is installed at least three inches from the face of the building;

Because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Mic Matson

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington- AyeBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMic Matson- Aye

7. C6 - Petition of Hansen Architects | 17-005620-COA | 255 & 256 East Perry Street | Signs

- Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Package.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for signage at 255 & 256 East Perry Street with the following conditions:

- 1.Reduce the awning signage to a maximum of 8.6 square feet per sign;
- 2. Ensure the windows for sign FF2 are not tinted or otherwise covered;

Because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Mic Matson

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington- AyeBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMic Matson- Aye

8. Approve Consent Agenda

Motion

The Savannah District Board of Review does hereby approve the Consent Agenda of October 11, 2017.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Mic Matson

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Stephen Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Scott Cook - Aye

Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

9. Approval of September 20, 2017 Briefing Minutes.

September 20, 2017 HBR Briefing Minutes.docx

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve September 20, 2017 Briefing Minutes.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Scott Cook

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington- AyeBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMic Matson- Aye

10. Approval of September 20, 2017 Meeting Minutes

@09-20-2017 Minutes.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve September 20, 2017 Meeting Minutes.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Scott Cook

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Stephen Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Scott Cook - Aye

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

Mic Matson - Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

11. Continue All Items to Next Regular Meeting

Motion

Continue All Items to Next Regular Meeting

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Keith Howington Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington- AyeBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMic Matson- Aye

12. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 15-001384-COA | 600 East Bay Street | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested to the next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Keith Howington Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington- AyeBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMic Matson- Aye

13. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006847-COA | 405 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition to to the next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Keith Howington Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington- AyeBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMic Matson- Aye

14. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006851-COA | 620 East River Street (Hilton Hotel) | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition to the next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Keith Howington Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington- AyeBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMic Matson- Aye

15. Petition of Gunn, Meyerhoff, Shay | 17-002122-COA | 620 East River Street (Hotel Anne) | New Construction Part 1: Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition to the next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Keith Howington Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington- AyeBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMic Matson- Aye

16. Petition of Greenline Architecture | 17-002904-COA | 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition to tthe next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Mic Matson

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present
Keith Howington - Abstain
Becky Lynch - Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr. - Abstain
Scott Cook - Aye
Dwayne Stephens - Aye
Mic Matson - Aye

17. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects | 17-003634-COA | 300 and 326 West Bay Street | New Construction Hotel: Part I, Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass at 300 and 326 West Bay Street in order for the petitioner to consider the following:

- 1.Redesign / Revise / Remove:
- a.Redesign the 5-story building, which abuts and covers the historic building at 9 North Jefferson Street, because the proposed design alters distinctive features and spatial relationships that characterize the historic building.
- b.Reduce the overall height of the building, particularly the 5th story and where it abuts 9 North Jefferson Street, to be visually compatible with surrounding contributing buildings which consist of 1 and two story warehouse buildings. The tallest height should be reserved for the corner of the site at Bay and Montgomery Streets where it is both the furthest from the historic buildings and faces other tall non-historic hotel buildings on the south side of Bay Street.
- c.Further break up the building into multiple volumes to be visually compatible with the rows of smaller attached buildings along both Bay and Factors Walk.
- d.Redesign the full glass ground floor to have more solids to be visually compatible with the ground floor openings of contributing buildings on Bay and Factors Walk.
- e.Revise the proportions of the narrow windows on all floors and the tall top floor windows to be visually compatible with adjacent contributing buildings.
- f.Redesign the front façade to emphasize and address Bay Street.
- g.Redesign the entrances, which are recessed deeply into and under the building, to be visually compatible with adjacent contributing buildings.
- h.Redesign the building cantilever and screen wall walkway along Bay Street which is not visually compatible with adjacent contributing buildings. This is a very unusual configuration and isolates the street and public sidewalk from interaction with the building and its interior.
- i.Redesign the recessed human entrances and the vehicular entrances along the Jefferson, Montgomery, and Williamson Street facades to create consistent walls of enclosure along those streets.
- j.Redesign the horizontal character of the western building mass to be visually compatible with related contributing buildings which are more vertical in directional expression.
- k.Redesign the visual expression of the 5th story windows which appear to be taller than the first floor storefront in many locations due to their vertical character and the storefront's horizontal character.
- I.Redesign the access to the parking to be from the north-south service street.
- m.Redesign/remove the interior vehicular "Arrival Court" along the Williamson Street façade so that any parking or vehicle staging within the ground floor of the building is setback a minimum of 30 feet from any property line.
- n.Remove the cut-out in the curb, to be used as a car pull-off, along Montgomery Street.
- o.Redesign the "roofline variation" and "large scale height" for the western building form along the Bay Street façade because a change in parapet height alone does not constitute a one-half story height variation.

- p.Redesign the ground floor to have adequate "active ground floor uses" to be eligible for a bonus story or select another criterion.
- q.Redesign the architectural bays to be between 15-20 feet wide.
- r.Redesign the Bay and Williamson Street façades to have a minimum of one primary entrance for every 60 feet of street frontage.
- s.Redesign the Williamson and Jefferson Street facades to have a minimum of 55 percent windows and doors on the ground floor.

2.Clarify:

- a.It is unclear if any mezzanines are proposed within the building. The tall height of the 5th floor suggests that there may be multiple levels within.
- b.It is unclear whether the front-facing gable roof structures above the 5th floor are habitable spaces.
- c. The building appears to be subdivided into "base, middle, and top" using projecting cantilevered canopies, the screen wall, and material changes; however, it is unclear.
- d.It does not appear that the exterior visual expression of the top story is distinctive from the stories below. Clarification and additional information are needed as the intent may be to accomplish this with material changes.

3.Ensure:

- a.Ensure that the new construction, where it is adjacent to the historic buildings, be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired. Do not physically join the new building to any portion of the historic buildings or alter any of the facades that will be covered by the new building.
- b.Ensure that, where intersected by a new driveway, the sidewalk serves as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration, and height.

4.Provide:

- a. Storefront glazing shall extend from the sill or from an 18 to 24 inch tall base of contrasting material, to the lintel. Provide this information with Part II: Design Details.
- b.Provide the gable roof pitches.
- c.Provide the widths of the parking garage openings along the Williamson Street façade.
- d.Provide electric meter and refuse storage area locations.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Keith Howington Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Stephen Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Scott Cook - Aye

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

Mic Matson - Aye

18. Petition of Christian Sottile | 17-003637-COA | 200-500 West River Street | Master Sign Plan

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition for the sign master plan for all sign types which require a variance.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Keith Howington Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington- AyeBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMic Matson- Aye

19. Petition of Smith Dalia Architects | 17-003644-COA | 701 Montgomery Street | New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested to the next meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Keith Howington

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington- AyeBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMic Matson- Aye

20. Petition of LS3P and Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 17-004307-COA | 630 Indian Street | New Construction Part I Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested to the next meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Keith Howington Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Abstain

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Stephen Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Scott Cook - Abstain

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

Mic Matson - Aye

21. Petition of Sanders, Trowell & Associates Architecture | 17-004925-COA | 123 West Charlton Street | Carriage House New Construction Part 1: Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested to the next regular meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Keith Howington Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington- AyeBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMic Matson- Aye

22. Petition of The Bohemian Hotel | 17-005051-COA | 102 West Bay Street | Sign

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested due to incomplete application.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Keith Howington Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington- AyeBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMic Matson- Aye

VIII. REGULAR AGENDA

23. D1 - Petition of Greenline Architecture | 17-005048-COA | 630 West Bay Street | Part II: New Construction

- Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Drawings.pdf
- Specifications.pdf

NOTE: Mr. Howington recused himself from participating in this petition. He is an employee of Greenline Architecture.

Mr. John Deering was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Sara Farr-Newman gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting Part I: Height and Mass for a parking garage at 630 West Bay Street. Parts I and II (17-001565-COA) were previously approved for a parking garage at this location; however, the design has changed significantly. The parking garage is proposed to be located on the same site as the existing Comfort Inn and Suites. This proposal is part of a larger project to construct a hotel on the southeast portion of the lot, but these buildings were reviewed as

separate submittals.

Ms. Farr-Newman reported that staff recommends approval of Part I: Height and Mass for 630 West Bay Street with the following conditions:

- 1. The electrical meter location is specified in Part II;
- 2. A string course is incorporated;

because otherwise it meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for Part II, Design Details for 630 West Bay Street, because it meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Becky Lynch
Second: Debra Caldwell

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present
Keith Howington - Abstain
Becky Lynch - Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr. - Abstain
Scott Cook - Aye
Dwayne Stephens - Aye
Mic Matson - Aye

24. D2 - Petition of Studio Architects | 17-005582-COA | 601 Indian Street | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass

- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Context Sanborn Maps.pdf
- North Oglethorpe Ward.pdf
- @ Aerial.pdf

NOTE: Mr. Howington reported that he works for the firm who was working with Mr. Byron Cochran, co-owner of the property, who is now deceased. He disclosed that he does not have a conflict of interest in this petition. The property is now owned by a firm. Ms. Lynch also disclosed that Mr. Cochran was a past client of Lynch Associates. But, they are not working on any projects with the firm.

Mr. Brett Oliver, Mr. Chris Kacena and Ms. Caroline Lang were present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Harris gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval to demolish an existing non-contributing building and to construct a new six story building at the northwest corner of Indian and Fahm Streets. The project provides two levels of structured parking, one of which is underground. Access to the parking will be from both Indian and Fahm Streets. The building is essentially a "C" shape and the footprint is 41,000 square feet. The building features a variety of parapet heights and includes a circular tower and corner entrance at the intersection of Indian and Fahm Streets. There is a covered colonnade along Indian Street. The proposal also includes a request for variances from the following standards:

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends approval of the request to demolish the existing building on the site with the following conditions:

- -The building be documented prior to demolition, per the MPC Documentation Policy, and;
- -A demolition permit not be issued until a new construction permit is also submitted,

because the building is not contributing and does not meet the criteria for being considered contributing.

Ms. Harris additionally reported that staff recommends a continuance of Part I Height and Mass in order for the petitioner to address the following:

- 1. Revise the storefronts on the sixth floor be revised to punched openings more similar to other openings throughout the structure;
- 2. Restudy the circular tower element at the southwest corner of the building and the colonnade on the north facade to better relate to the historic industrial context:
- 3. Incorporate additional openings on the south and west elevations, which will be highly visible;
- 4. Restudy the balconies which wrap the northeast and southwest corners of the building to ensure the building corners stay prominent;
- 5. Reposition the building forward to the lot lines on both the north and east property lines to better establish the urban street pattern;
- 6. Reestablish Indian Lane (or semblance of) in order to provide a "back of house" area to accommodate parking access, utilities, and trash pick up;
- 7. Revise the balconies be partially recessed to provide greater useable space and only extend three feet from the face of the building to meet the standard;
- 8. Redesign the parapets to be no greater than four feet tall;
- Reduce the height of the ground floor and floors three through five to reduce the overall height of the building; increase the height of the second story three inches to meet the standard;
- 10. Revise the window and door alignments on the ground and sixth floor to ensure that the centerlines of all windows and doors align;
- 11. Increase the storefront areas along Fahm and Indian Streets to 55%;
- 12. Reduce curb cuts to no greater than 20 feet and ensure that the sidewalk serves as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration and height;
- 13. Incorporate additional variation in the roofline along Fahm Street;
- 14. Incorporate at least three primary entrances on both Fahm and Indian Streets;
- 15. Revise bay width to not exceed 15 feet or more than 20 feet;
- 16. Relocate all utilities on secondary or rear facades;
- 17. Ensure the height of the fence does not exceed 11 feet; the HVAC units are screened; and windows, doors and storefronts are inset a minimum of four inches.

Ms. Harris explained that staff recommends denial to the Zoning Board of Appeals for variances from the following standards:

- -Non-habitable rooftop structures such as church spires; cupolas; chimneys; tanks and supports; parapet walls not over 4 feet high; and Mechanical or Access Structures [see Definitions (a)] shall not be considered a story.
- -Residential balconies shall not extend more than three feet in depth from the face of a building and shall be supported by brackets or other types of architectural support.

Because the variance criteria have not been met.

Mr. Kacena was in agreement with the continuance as recommended by staff.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request to demolish the existing building on the site with the following conditions because the building is non-contributing and does not meet the criteria to be considered contributing:

- 1.Document the building prior to demolition, per the MPC Documentation Policy, and
- 2.A demolition permit is not issued until a new construction permit is also submitted.

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the request for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass in order for the petitioner to consider the following:

- 1.Revise the storefronts on the sixth floor be revised to punched openings more similar to other openings throughout the structure;
- 2.Restudy the circular tower element at the southwest corner of the building and the colonnade on the north facade to better relate to the historic industrial context;
- 3.Incorporate additional openings on the south and west elevations, which will be highly visible;
- 4.Restudy the balconies which wrap the northeast and southwest corners of the building to ensure the building corners stay prominent;
- 5.Reposition the building forward to the lot lines on both the north and east property lines to better establish the urban street pattern;
- 6.Reestablish Indian Lane (or semblance of) in order to provide a "back of house" area to accommodate parking access, utilities, and trash pick up;
- 7.Revise the balconies be partially recessed to provide greater useable space and only extend three feet from the face of the building to meet the standard;
- 8. Redesign the parapets to be no greater than four feet tall;
- 9.Reduce the height of the ground floor and floors three through five to reduce the overall height of the building; increase the height of the second story three inches to meet the standard;
- 10. Revise the window and door alignments on the ground and sixth floor to ensure that the centerlines of all windows and doors align;
- 11.Increase the storefront areas along Fahm and Indian Streets to 55%;
- 12.Reduce curb cuts to no greater than 20 feet and ensure that the sidewalk serves as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration and height;
- 13.Incorporate additional variation in the roofline along Fahm Street;
- 14.Incorporate at least three primary entrances on both Fahm and Indian Streets;
- 15. Revise bay width to not exceed 15 feet or more than 20 feet;
- 16. Relocate all utilities on secondary or rear facades;
- 17. Ensure the height of the fence does not exceed 11 feet; the HVAC units are screened; and windows, doors and storefronts are inset a minimum of four inches.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Scott Cook

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington - Aye

Becky Lynch - Aye

Stephen Merriman, Jr. - Abstain

Scott Cook - Aye

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

- Aye

25. D3 - Petition of Homeline Architecture | 17-005598-COA | 520-522 East Harris Street | Carriage House New Construction Part 1: Height and Mass

Project Narrative.pdf

Mic Matson

- HBR Submittal Part I Drawings.pdf
- Model Photos.pdf
- Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Staff Context Photos.pdf
- Historic Building Map_Bartow Ward.pdf

NOTE: Mr. Howington recused himself from participating in this petition. He is an employee of Greenline Architecture.

Mr. John Deering was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Alyson Smith gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for new construction, Part 1: Height and Mass, for two attached carriage houses behind 520-522 East Harris Street. The two-story, two-bay carriage houses will orient north towards East Liberty Lane. The building's west elevation will be partially visible from the lane. No window openings are proposed on this elevation; however, it appears that the roofline of the adjacent historic cottage will obstruct views of the elevation. The carriage houses' south elevation will feature a second story porch that might be minimally visible from the lane. The lots currently feature open parking at the lane side of the property. An existing fence and gate along the rear of the property will be demolished with existing non-historic decks on the main houses. These features will be removed to make room for courtyard improvements that will not be visible from the public right-of-way.

Ms. Smith reported that staff recommends approval of new construction, Part 1: Height and Mass, for two attached carriage houses behind 520-522 East Harris Street because the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for new construction, Part 1: Height and Mass, for two attached carriage houses behind 520-522 East Harris Street because the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Mic Matson

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher- Not PresentKeith Howington- AbstainBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- Aye

Scott Cook - Aye

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

Mic Matson - Aye

26. D4 - Petition of Lat Purser and Associates | 17-005622-COA | 615 Montgomery Street | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass

- 17-005622-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Application 615 and 617 Montgomery Street 17-005622-COA.pdf
- Context Sanborn Maps.pdf
- @Gaston Ward.pdf
- Submittal Packet- drawings.pdf
- Submittal Packet- GDP.pdf
- Submittal Packet- narrative.pdf
- Submittal packet- revised model.pdf
- Aerial.jpg
- Mr. Carey Sikes was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for the demolition of an existing non-contributing building and new construction Part I: Height and Mass for a new four-story apartment building with an approximate footprint of 14,000 square feet. The project is being proposed as "Bowery II" in reference to the Bowery in the block to the north of the site which was approved by the HDBR on January 14, 2015 (14-005105-COA) and recently completed. The site within Gaston Ward, bordered by Huntingdon Street to the north, Montgomery Street to the east, and Ell Street to the west. Ell Street, which is only one block long, was historically referred to as Montgomery Lane. The building is oriented to face Montgomery Street. Parking is located partially beneath the building and is accessed from Ell Street.

Ms. Harris stated that the request also includes a variance from the 30-foot structured parking standard. The General Development Plan (GDP) is currently still under review by the relevant City of Savannah and MPC departments. Additional alterations to the design and site plan may still be required as result of that review process.

Ms. Harris explained that a similar project (17-005045-COA) was reviewed by the HDBR on September 20, 2017 and was denied based on the visual incompatibility of and non-compliance with design standards, as outlined below.

1. Step down in height adjacent to the contributing buildings to the south; *The petition has been revised to step down to the adjacent contributing building.*

- 2. Add voids to the north, Huntingdon Street façade on the ground floor; *Additional voids have been incorporated and façade revised.*
- 3. Add voids to the south façade on the upper two floors; *The windows are proposed to be enlarged*.
- 4. Provide a zero setback for the majority of the building along the property lines on both Montgomery and Huntingdon Streets; *The building maintains its originally proposed setbacks*.
- 5. Provide more building mass along Huntingdon Street; *The building has been extended along Huntingdon Street*.
- 6. Revise all sliding glass doors to regular doors; Complete.
- 7. Incorporate at least one primary entrance along Huntingdon Street; Complete.
- 8. Revise the protruding balconies on the east façade to be less heavy or to match the recessed balconies on the other bays; *The balconies have been revised.*
- 9. Increase the height of the first story to 11 feet to meet the standard and the height of the fourth story to ten feet; *Complete*.
- 10. Revise the access to the parking to be from Ell Street, rather than Huntingdon; *Complete*.
- 11. Revise the structured parking to be setback at least 30 feet from Huntingdon; *The structured parking has been revised but a portion sits within 10 feet of Huntingdon.*
- 12. Revise the north and east façade to meet the recess standard or select another massing standard to meet. *Another massing standard has been selected- Roofline Variation.*
- 13. Incorporate additional variation in the roofline to break up the continuous height along Montgomery Street; *The project steps down to the contributing building at the south end of the property thereby providing additional roofline variation.*
- 14. Ensure the storefronts extend from a sill, the building has a string course and coping, the balconies do not extend more than three feet from the face of the building and are supported by brackets or other types of architectural support, and window and doors are inset at least four inches; *Complete*.
- 15. Provide HVAC screening. Complete. Additional details will be provided with Part II: Design Details.

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends approval of the demolition of the existing building because it is not contributing and does not meet the criteria for contributing status, with the condition that the demolition permit not be issued until the new construction permit has been issued.

Ms. Harris additionally reported that staff recommends approval of Part I Height and Mass with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II: Design Details:

- 1. Revise to a more solid fence along Huntingdon Street to better screen the parking;
- 2. Ensure the proposed curb cut does not exceed 20 feet in width.
- 3. Add additional volume to the central bay on the Huntingdon Street façade in order to meet the roofline variation standard:
- 4. Incorporate an additional entrance beneath the awning structure on the north façade;
- 5. Ensure the bay spacing is between 15 and 20 feet in width, the building has a string course and coping, the balconies are supported by brackets or other types of architectural support, and window and doors are inset at least four inches;

Because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards.

Ms. Harris additionally reported that staff recommends approval of a variance from the standard which requires

Parking within the ground floor of a building shall be setback a minimum of 30 feet from property lines along all public rights-of-way (not including lanes). This standard does not apply to structured parking on the same lot as single family and two family residential dwellings that are on a corner lot with lane access or on a parcel that does not have access to a lane.

With the condition that an active use is incorporated along the full width of the building along the Huntingdon Street elevation, even at a reduced width, because the variance criteria are otherwise met.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the demolition of the existing building because it is not contributing and does not meet the criteria for contributing status, with the condition that the demolition permit not be issued until the new construction permit has been issued.

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve New Construction Part I Height and Mass with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II: Design Details:

- 1. Revise to a more solid fence along Huntingdon Street to better screen the parking;
- 2. Ensure the proposed curb cut does not exceed 20 feet in width.
- 3.Add additional volume to the central bay on the Huntingdon Street façade in order to meet the roofline variation standard;
- 4.Incorporate an additional entrance beneath the awning structure on the north façade;
- 5.Ensure the bay spacing is between 15 and 20 feet in width, the building has a string course and coping, the balconies are supported by brackets or other types of architectural support, and window and doors are inset at least four inches:

Because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards.

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby recommend approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard which requires

Parking within the ground floor of a building shall be setback a minimum of 30 feet from property lines along all public rights-of-way (not including lanes). This standard does not apply to structured parking on the same lot as single family and two family residential dwellings that are on a corner lot with lane access or on a parcel that does not have access to a lane.

With the condition that an active use is incorporated along the full width of the building along the Huntingdon Street elevation, even at a reduced width, because the variance criteria are otherwise met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Keith Howington Second: Jennifer Deacon

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Keith Howington	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Stephen Merriman, Jr.	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Mic Matson	- Aye

IX. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

- 27. Petition of Stacy Ritchie | 17-000380 | 122 East Liberty Street | Staff Approved New Awning
 - COA 122 East Liberty Street 17-000380 9-13-17.pdf
 - Board Decision Updated Version.doc

No action required. Staff approved.

- 28. Petition of Vijay Basireddy | 17-005454-COA | 225 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved Sign Face Change

 - 225 West Broughton Street photo.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 29. Petition of Eric O'Neill for Greenline Architecture | 17-005461-COA | 417 -421 East Broughton Street | Staff Approved Awning
 - © COA 417 421 East Broughton Street 17-005461-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 417 421 East Broughton Street 17-005461-COA SW6478-Watery (002).jpg
 - Submittal Packet 417 421 East Broughton Street 17-005461-COA Awnings_2017.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 30. Petition of Erik Puljung for Hansen Architects | 17-005481-COA | 457 & 459 Tattnall Street | Staff Approved Shutters
 - COA 457 & 459 Tattnall Street 17-005481-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 457 & 459 Tattnall Street 17-005481-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 31. Petition of Stephanie Bock for Bock Architects | 17-005495-COA | 611 West Jones Street | Staff Approved Stairs

 - Submittal Packet 611 West Jones Street 17-005495-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

32. Petition of Ray Hoover for Tech Roof Residential LLC | 17-005507-COA | 416 Price Street | Staff Approved - Asphalt Shingle Roof

- COA 416 Price Street 17-005507-COA.pdf
- Property Photo.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 33. Petition of Tony Hensley | 17-005560-COA | 322 Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard | Staff Approved Door
 - Submittal Packet 322 MLK Jr. Blvd 17-005560-COA.pdf
 - COA 322 MLK Jr. Blvd 17-005560-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 34. Petition of Seshu Kotcherlakota | 17-005621-COA | 114 East Broughton Street | Staff Approved Color Change

 - NaaN Downtown Location- Historic District Specs.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 35. Petition of Metalcrafts, A Tecta America Company | 17-005667-COA | 202 West Bay Street | Staff Approved Roof
 - 202 West Bay Street Street View.pdf
 - Submittal Packet.pdf
 - COA 202 West Bay Street 17-005667-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 36. Petition of Doug Bean for Doug Bean Signs, Inc. | 17-005708-COA | 144 Lincoln Street | Staff Approved Fascia Sign
 - Submittal Packet 144 Lincoln Street 17-005708-COA.pdf
 - COA 144 Lincoln Street 17-005708-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 37. Petition of David Gunnells, Sr. for Coastal Roofing Company, Inc. | 17-005743-COA | 26 East Bryan Street | Staff Approved Asphalt Shingles

 - @colorchart10032017.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 38. Petition of K. Gordon Taylor for Whitlow Construction Co., Inc. | 17-005744-COA | 613 Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard | Staff Approved Brick Repair and Repointing
 - COA 613 MLK Jr. Blvd 17-005744-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 613 MLK Jr. Blvd 17-005744-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 39. Petition of Anthony Debrecency | 17-005782-COA | 9 Drayton Street | Staff Approved Window
 - COA 9 Drayton Street 17-005782-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 9 Drayton Street 17-005782-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 40. Petition of Matthew Weiner | 17-005814-COA | 222 East Gordon Street | Staff Approved Rear Porch Alteration

 - Submittal Packet 222 East Gordon Street 17-005814-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 41. Report on Work Performed Without a COA for the October 11, 2017 HDBR Meeting
 - <u>∅ 10-11-17 HDBR Report on Work Without a COA.pdf</u>

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 42. Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting Thursday, October 12, 2017 at 3:30 p.m. in the Meyer Conference Room, MPC 110 East State Street
- 43. Next Pre-Meeting Wednesday, November 8, 2017 at 12:00 p.m. in the Jerry Surrency Room, MPC, 112 East State Street
- 44. Next Regular Meeting Wednesday, November 8, 2017 at 1:00 p.m. in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, MPC, 112 East State Street

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

- 45. Review Proposed Revisions to the Savannah Historic District Ordinance 8-3030
 - ∅ 10-2017 DRAFT HDBR Ordinance Revisions.pdf
 - Charleston Workforce Housing Ordinance.pdf

The Board continued its discussion on the proposed revisions to the Savannah Historic District ordinance.

46. Update on Plant Riverside Sign Masterplan

Ms. Harris provided update on the Riverside Sign Masterplan. Plant Riverside is located in the River Street-Factors Walk Sign Ordinance and the Historic Sign Ordinance. On July 12, 2017, the Review Board approved the Sign Masterplan conceptually only for the signs which meet the current sign ordinances and continued the request for sign types that are not currently permitted. There are four sign types not presently permitted in the existing sign ordinances. They are banner signs, painted signs, freestanding signs, and rooftop signs. Ms. Harris said in discussing this matter with the petitioner, other persons, etc., it was determined that the most appropriate action would be to create a Sign District specifically for the Plant Riverside that would allow the different sign types. This is what the petitioner should do in order to possibly get the sign types they wanted, but this does not necessarily mean that staff agreed with this, but believed that this was the right approach. Consequently, the petitioner came up with an ordinance to create the Sign District which included what sign types were proposed.

Ms. Harris explained that it was verbally presented at the MPC meeting that the Historic District Board of Review unanimously recommended approval of the sign district and sign types.

The Review Board discussed that the presentation given to the MPC was incorrect. As Ms. Harris has stated, they approved the Sign Masterplan only for the signs which meet the current sign ordinances and continued the request for sign types that are not currently permitted.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby request that a letter be drafted clarifying the HDBR's action to City Council.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Mic Matson Second: Becky Lynch

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Keith Howington- AyeBecky Lynch- AyeStephen Merriman, Jr.- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AbstainMic Matson- Aye

47. Appointment of the Nominating Committee

Mr. Merriman, Mr. Howington, and Ms. Lynch will serve as the nominating committee to nominate persons to serve as chair, vice-chair, and parliamentarian for 2018.

XV. ADJOURNMENT

48. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 4:40 p.m.

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.