

**CITY OF SAVANNAH
HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW
REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

PETITIONER: Christian Sottile
Sottile & Sottile
10 West Taylor Street
Savannah, GA 31401

FILE NUMBER: 18-000298-COA

ADDRESS: 215 West Broughton Street

PIN: 2-0016-25-004

ZONING: B-C-1

STAFF REVIEWER: Ellen I. Harris

DATE: February 14, 2018

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The petitioner is requesting amendments to Part II: Design Details of a new six story building at 215 West Broughton Street. The amendments include:

- Revisions to the entrance configuration on Broughton Street- entry depth, columns added;
- Revised front canopy design;
- Revisions to the fenestration on the ground floor at Broughton Lane- two garage doors instead of one and different door configuration;
- Revised rear canopy and balcony design;
- Elimination of the restoration of the light wells;
- Elimination of the existing steel beam above the ground floor; and
- Replacing Hope's Steel Windows with Arcadia Steel Windows.

BACKGROUND:

The project was originally approved by the HDBR on July 8, 2015 (14-005509-COA) with the following conditions:

1. Restudy the material and design of the sculptural metal canopy for visual compatibility and bring back to the Board for review and approval; and
2. Reduce the height of the railing to 36 inches if permitted by the City's Development Services Department.

Subsequently a one-year extension was granted to extend approval to July 8, 2017.

On July 12, 2017 the HDBR approved a revision (17-003678-COA) to the project which included: removing the remaining brick wall on the east, the brick chimney on the west, and metal beam and columns at the north of the site. The petitioner proposed to reuse the columns on the new construction, but not the steel beam. The Board determined that both the columns and the metal beam should be retained and reused on the new construction because, in the original approval, the beam was an important component in the argument for a variance to allow a lower ground floor height than the ordinance allows. 14'6" is the minimum per the ordinance, a variance to allow 13'6" was granted, partially due to the existence and retention of the beam at 13'6". At the time, the beam was also an integral part of the design of the previous canopy.

HDBR discussions also included concern for the treatment of the light wells. The petitioner is eliminating their restoration from the plan and no longer proposing that the basement encroach into the public right-of-way. Staff is requesting that if any alterations are made to the sidewalks as part of the project that they be consistent with the Broughton Streetscape Plan which shows lightwells in this location.

CONTEXT:

The 1884 and 1888 Sanborn Maps indicate a three-story masonry building on the subject site functioning as storage. By 1889, the three-story masonry structure is being used as a hardware store, in connection with the adjoining building to the west. The 1916, 1954, and 1973 Sanborn maps indicate a four story masonry building on the site. The fourth story was added in 1904.

The building was damaged by a fire in 1973 and was subsequently demolished in the 1990s though a COA was not located.

FINDINGS:

The following standards from the Historic District Section (8-3030) of the City of Savannah Zoning Ordinance revised apply:

***Visual compatibility factors.** New construction and existing buildings and structures and appurtenances thereof in the historic district which are moved, reconstructed, materially altered, repaired or changed in color shall be visually compatible with structures, squares and places to which they are visually related. The following factors shall be considered in determining the visual compatibility of such a building, structure or appurtenance. These factors shall not be the basis for appeal of an adverse decision. Greater weight shall be given to adjacent historic structures.*

***Proportion of openings.** The relationship of the width of the windows to height of windows within a structure shall be visually compatible to the contributing structures to which the structure is Visually Related.*

The proportions of the openings are visually compatible.

Rhythm of solids to voids in front facades. *The relationship of solids to voids in the facades visible from the public right-of-way of a structure shall be visually compatible with the contributing structures to which the structure is Visually Related.*

The rhythm of solids to voids is visually compatible.

Rhythm of entrance and/or porch projection. *The relationship of entrances, porch projections, and walkways to structures shall be visually compatible with the contributing structures to which they are Visually Related.*

The rhythm of entrances is visually compatible.

Relationship of materials, texture and color. *The relationship of materials, texture and color of the facade of a structure shall be visually compatible with the predominate materials, textures, and colors used on contributing structures to which the structure is Visually Related.*

The proposed materials are visually compatible. The revised canopy design includes nine decorative recessed areas for low-relief steel casting of the Greek Muses.

Design standards. *The following design standards shall apply to new construction, additions, and alterations to historic and non-historic buildings and structures. Though certain building materials are prescribed herein, the Board may approve alternative materials that are not listed as prohibited upon a showing by the applicant that the material or product is visually compatible with historic building materials and has performed satisfactorily in the local climate.*

Entrances. *Building entrance locations shall comply with the following:*

Placement. *Door frames shall be inset not less than three (3) inches from the exterior surface of the façade of a building, excluding façades with wood siding.*

The standard is met.

Windows, Shutters, and Commercial Storefronts. *The following standards shall apply to all development.*

Windows.

Windows facing a street shall be double or triple hung, awning, casement or Palladian.

The standard is met. The proposed windows are casement.

Double glazed (simulated divided light) windows are permitted on nonhistoric facades and on new construction, provided, however, that the windows meet the following standards: the muntin shall be no wider than 7/8 inch; the muntin profile shall simulate traditional putty glazing; the lower sash shall be wider than the meeting and top rails; extrusions shall be covered with appropriate molding.

"Snap-in" or between-the-glass muntins shall not be used.

The centerline of window and door openings shall align vertically on the primary façade.

All windows facing a street, exclusive of storefronts, basement and top story windows, shall be rectangular and shall have a vertical to horizontal ratio of not less than 5:3; provided, however, nothing in this section precludes an arched window being used. Accent windows may be round or other shapes. Original openings in historic buildings are exempt.

Window sashes shall be inset not less than three inches from the exterior facade of a building, excluding exterior surfaces with wood siding.

In new construction windows shall be constructed of wood or wood clad or metal. Solid vinyl windows shall be prohibited.

The standards are met. While the Board has not approved Arcadia Steel windows previously, the petitioner has provided a full-size sample and staff finds the window to be visually compatible and meet the standards.

Commercial Storefronts.

Storefront windows and doors

Retail storefront area glazing shall be not less than 55 percent. Such glazing shall be transparent; provided, however, black glass may be used in the sign area above the storefront window transoms. Storefront glazing shall extend from the sill or from an 18 to 24 inch tall base of contrasting material, to the lintel.

Storefront glazing in subdivided sashes shall be inset a minimum of four inches from the face of the building; provided, however, that continuously glazed storefronts may be flush with the face of the building.

The standards are met.

Awnings. *Awnings shall be subject to the following criteria:*

Awnings extending above the public right-of-way shall have a minimum vertical clearance of eight feet (8') above the sidewalk.

The standard is met. The awnings 11 feet four inches from the sidewalk.

Non-residential awnings shall be constructed of canvas, other equivalent cloth, metal, or glass.

The standard is met. The awning is constructed of metal.

Awnings shall be integrated structurally and architecturally into the design of the façade and not obscure the character-defining features of historic façades.

The following shall be prohibited:

A single continuous awning that connects two buildings.

Back-lit or internally lit awnings.

The standard is met. While the project no longer includes the existing steel beam, the new design would render the beam non-visible. Therefore, staff is no longer requesting its incorporation.

Awnings within the public right-of-way shall be required to obtain an encroachment license from the City of Savannah.

An encroachment license may be required.

Balconies, stairs, stoops, porticos, and porches. *Balconies, stairs, stoops, porticos, and porches shall be subject to the following criteria:*

Wrought iron brackets shall not be used with wood balcony railings.

Residential balconies shall not extend more than three feet in depth from the face of a building and shall be supported by brackets or other types of architectural support.

The standards are met.

Balusters shall be placed between upper and lower rails, and the distances between balusters shall not exceed four inches. For one and two family dwellings the height of the railing shall not exceed 36”.

Staff requests that the railing not exceed 36” unless required for building code compliance.

Balconies, stoops, stairs (including basement stairs), porticos and porches within the public right-of-way shall be required to obtain an encroachment license from the City of Savannah.

An encroachment license may be required.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends **approval** of the revisions to **Part II: Design Details** with the following conditions:

- 1. Reduce the height of the railing to 36 inches unless required for building code compliance.**
- 2. Ensure that any alterations to the sidewalk in front of the building are consistent with the Broughton Streetscape Plan.**

EIH