

Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room November 14, 2018 1:00 P.M. Meeting Minutes

NOVEMBER 14, 2018 SAVANNAH HISTORIC BOARD OF REVIEW REGULAR MEETING

A Pre-Meeting will be held at 12:00 PM in the Jerry Surrency Conference Room, 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda will be presented by Staff, as time permits, and the Board may ask questions. No testimony will be received and no votes will be taken.

Members Present: Becky Lynch, Chair

Dwayne Stephens, Vice-Chair

Debra Caldwell Scott Cook Jennifer Deacon Kevin Dodge Kellie Fletcher Mic Matson Melissa Memory Nan Taylor

Member Absent: David Altschiller

MPC Staff Present: Ellen Harris, Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation

Leah Michalak, Senior Historic Preservation Planner

Alyson Smith, Historic Preservation Planner Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

1. Call to Order and Welcome

Ms. Lynch called the meeting to order at 1:05 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. She outlined the role of the Historic District Board of Review and explained the process for hearing the various petitions. Staff will present each application with a recommendation. The petitioner will have the opportunity to respond to the recommendation. The petitioners are asked to limit their presentation to 10 minutes or less and only address the items identified as inconsistent with the ordinance and questions raised by the Board. The public will have the same allotted time, 10 minutes, to comment. The petitioner will be given the opportunity to respond to the public comments.

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

- 2. Petition of Smoke Life Savannah | 18-005149-COA | 111 West Congress Street | Sign
 - Staff Recommendation.pdf
 - Submittal Packet.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a projecting principal use sign as proposed at 111 West Congress Street because the sign is visually compatible and meets the sign standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye

3. Petition of Barnard Architects | 18-005782-COA | 314 Habersham Street | Addition

- Project Description.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Aerial View.pdf
- Historic Context Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Troup Ward.pdf
- Staff Recommendation.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for an addition at 314 Habersham Street with the following conditions to be reviewed and approved by staff:

- 1.Reduce the height of the addition's roofline to offset the new addition from the historic building's roofline.
- 2. Provide color samples for the window trim, columns, stucco, and fascia boards.
- 3.Provide a window manufacturer's specification for the new double hung wood windows. Ensure the muntins are no wider than 7/8 inch; the muntin profile shall simulate traditional putty glazing; the lower sash shall be wider than the meeting and top rails.
- 4. Provide a revised floor plan and section drawing to reflect the addition as approved.

Because otherwise the addition is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain - Aye Scott Cook **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

4. Petition of Wynne Mund | 18-005779-COA | 527 East Jones Street | Additions and Alterations

- @Research.pdf
- Submittal Packet Drawings.pdf
- Context Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Submittal Packet Photographs.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations and additions to 527 East Jones Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye
Kellie Fletcher - Aye
Becky Lynch - Abstain
Scott Cook - Aye
Dwayne Stephens - Aye
Mic Matson - Aye

Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

5. Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 18-005805-COA | 607 Drayton Street | Fence

- Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Aerial View.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the requested fence at 607 Drayton Street with the following conditions:

- 1. Provide vehicular gates to form a consistent wall of continuity along Goodwin Street.
- 2.Curb cuts shall not exceed 20 feet in width.
- 3.Ensure the sidewalk serves as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in material configuration and height.
- 4.Consult the City's Park and Tree Department regarding the removal of a large Oak tree on the lot. Because otherwise the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Abstain Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

6. Adopt the November 14, 2018 Agenda.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does herby adopt the November 14, 2018 Agenda.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain - Aye Scott Cook **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- 7. Approve October 10, 2018 Briefing Minutes and October 10, 2018 Regular Meeting Minutes.
 - October 10, 2018 HBR Briefing Minutes.docx
 - @ 10-10-2018 Minutes.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve October 10, 2018 Briefing Minutes and October 10, 2018 Regular Meeting Minutes .

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens Second: Melissa Memory

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

8. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 15-001384-COA | 600 East Bay Street | New Hotel Construction: Part II, Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the request as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye

9. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006851-COA | 620 East River Street (Hilton Hotel) | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the request as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Kevin Dodge - Aye

10. Petition of Gunn, Meyerhoff, Shay | 17-002122-COA | 620 East River Street (Hotel Anne) | New Construction Part 1: Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the request as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye

11. Petition of Greenline Architecture | 17-002904-COA | 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Kevin Dodge - Aye

12. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects | 17-003634-COA | 300 and 326 West Bay Street | New Construction Hotel: Part I, Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye - Abstain Becky Lynch Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye

13. Petition of General Services Administration | 17-006639-COA | 124 Barnard Street | New Construction Part 2: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the request as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Ave Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Kevin Dodge - Aye

14. Petition of Savannah WOB LLC | 18-005590-COA | 112 West Broughton Street | Signs

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the request as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye

VIII. REGULAR AGENDA

15. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006852-COA | 630 East River Street (Parking Garage) | Revisions to Part I: Height and Mass New Construction

- ∅ 16-006852-COA Staff Recommendation Revisions to Part 1.pdf
- Aerial.pdf
- 2017 Submittal Packet-drawings sm.pdf
- New Franklin Ward Wharf Lots MAP B.pdf
- Submittal Packet- Revised GDP.pdf
- Submittal Packet- solids and voids.pdf
- Submittal Packet- drawings.pdf

Mr. Patrick Shay was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for revisions to New Construction: Part 1, Height and Mass for a nine-story parking garage to be located on the vacant parcel at 630 East River Street. Due to the size and significance of this project, it was previously decided (in 2012) by the Review Board that the Part I, Height and Mass review would be considered in two phases. Phase A would consider height, proportion of structure's front façade, rhythm of structures on the street (setbacks and any parking standards that affect setbacks), massing including recesses and scale. Phase B would consider proportion of openings, rhythm of solids to voids, entrances and balcony/porch rhythm, any parking

standards that may affect these openings or entrances, walls of continuity, and roof shape. Directional character would be considered by both the building form and openings, and applies to both Part I and II reviews. This review includes both Part A and Part B.

Ms. Harris explained that the building is in the northeast corner of the Savannah Historic District. It is, roughly, triangular-shaped and has frontage along both River Street and General McIntosh Boulevard. The vehicular entrance is along River Street and there is a secondary automobile egress along General McIntosh Boulevard. The footprint of the building is 19,375 square feet. This proposed parking garage is part of a larger development which consists of four hotel buildings in addition to the garage. Across River Street, to the west, a portion of this development is already constructed and includes the Homewood Suites Hotel. To the west of Homewood Suites, the former SEPCO/Georgia Power building has been demolished and Part I, Height and Mass for new construction of a hotel has been approved by the Review Board. These parcels, in the northeast quadrant of the Savannah Historic District, flank River and Bay Streets. The project area is outside of the Savannah National Historic Landmark District but is within the local historic zoning overlay. There is little remaining historic context.

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends approval of the revisions to Part I Height and Mass with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II Design Details:

- 1. The subdivision of the parcel between the two proposed buildings (parking garage and hotel to the north) is approved.
- 2. Ensure the curb cut at River Street for the entrance/exit does not exceed 20 feet in width.
- 3. Provide HVAC screening, should they be visible from the public right-of-way. Because the project otherwise meets the design standards and is visually compatible.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Shay said they agree with the staff conditions. He entertained questions from the Board.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board was in agreement with the staff recommendations. Mr. Cook said from a previous review, one of the conditions was that the ground active use space be habitable. He questions today if the space is habitable. He is concerned that a bonus story is being granted based to a space that will be unoccupied. If so, it will become an empty parcel which defeats the purpose of the ground active use space. The Board discussed the ground floor active use space. The Board asked Mr. Shay to comment on this aspect.

Mr. Shay said the drawing that is before the Board today shows the condition. He stated that elevation changes which is why the ground floor entrances are configured the way they are.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the revisions to Part I Height and Mass with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II Design Details:

1. The subdivision of the parcel between the two proposed buildings (parking garage and hotel to the north) is

approved.

- 2.Ensure the curb cut at River Street for the entrance/exit does not exceed 20 feet in width.
- 3. Provide HVAC screening, should they be visible from the public right-of-way.
- 4. Provide additional details demonstrating the viability of the active use space.

Because the project otherwise meets the design standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Ave

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye

16. Petition of Barnard Architects | 18-005084-COA | 124 East Bay Street | Alterations

- Context Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Staff photo- 1990s.pdf
- Submittal Packet Elevations.pdf
- Submittal Packet Existing Opening Modifications.pdf
- Submittal Packet Ext Lintels.pdf
- Submittal Packet Application.pdf
- Submittal Packet- Scope of Work.pdf
- Submittal Packet Window Details.pdf
- Submittal Packet Photographs.pdf
- ∅ 18-005084-COA Staff Recommendation 2.pdf

Mr. Scott Barnard was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval to add four new window openings to the historic building at 124 East Bay Street, also known as the River Street Inn. Three of the windows will be located on the north, River Street second floor façade. One window will be located on the south, Upper Factor's Walk elevation. The window sills will be brick rowlock using brick removed from the openings. The windows will be custom built, six-over-six wood, single pane windows. This petition was originally scheduled for review on October 10, 2018 but was continued, at the request of the petitioner, prior to the HDBR review.

Ms. Harris explained that the historic building was constructed as part of a row of buildings in 1857 and is contributing within the local and National Historic Landmark District. Sanborn Maps indicate the buildings were historically used as warehouses and offices until their conversion into a hotel in the late twentieth century. The building has undergone multiple alterations over the years. On the north façade, four new window openings on the ground floor were added in 1995 (H-199507-620-2). Other alterations included the conversion of existing windows to doors on the upper three floors and the replacement of all window sashes. There is some interior evidence that some of the windows on the third floor on the River Street façade were once arched windows. On the south façade, four windows were converted into doors on the fourth floor and on the first floor, on lowers factors walk, one arched opening was infilled. The dates of these alterations are unclear.

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends:

- 1. Denial of the proposal to add three new windows to north façade of 124 East Bay Street because the preservation standards are not met.
- 2. Approval of the proposal to add one new window to the south façade of 124 East Bay Street because of its limited visibility on a secondary façade, the visual compatibility criteria and preservation standards are met.

PETITONER COMMENTS

Mr. Barnard said most of the staff's findings show that the standards were met. He wanted to address Standard 5 - Distinctive Features as it was shown as not met. He said they would argue that the removal of the Savannah Grey Brick from the three openings is not the removal of a distinctive feature. Mr. Barnard said regarding Standard 9 - New Additions. This standards states that new additions shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. He explained that they do not intend to destroy those bricks. The windows are roughly three feet wide, six feet high, 20 square feet of bricks. His client has said that they will be happy to store the bricks in the attic for reuse if necessary, Mr. Barnard said the standard also states that the new work shall be differentiated from the old. He said they will certainly comply with this. Standard 10 says that new additions shall be reversible. Mr. Barnard said that they contend that cutting three openings in this façade is completely reputable. There will be Savannah Greys and lime cement mortar. They have the technology and craftsmanship nowadays to take the windows out and repoint and replace the Savannah Greys.

Mr. Barnard said regarding the historical character of the building, there are several guidelines that the National Park Service gives them to gauge whether they are infringing upon the historic character of the building. They want to make the new function of the second floor as guest rooms. The meeting rooms were rendered dysfunctional when the Trade Center was built. Since that time, this is just empty space. He said that Guidelines, page 3 states that many historic buildings can be adapted for a new use. Guidelines, page 27, states that floor-to-floor only rehabilitation allows alterations under the construction of a new addition if necessary for a continuing or a new use. He said that Guidelines, page 78, some exterior and alterations to historic buildings are generally needed as a part of the rehabilitation project to ensure its continued use. But, it is most important that such operations do not radically change the development.

Mr. Barnard pointed out that there are 294 windows in these buildings. The windows shown in "green" have been infilled; the ones shown in "red" are non-historic; "blue" changed to doors; and "purple" shows modified existing openings. Ninety percent of the windows and fenestrations in these windows have been modified. They are only asking for three more windows.

Mr. Lee Grossbade said they are heavily vested in Savannah. They own the Westin. They operate all over the City of Savannah. They have been trying to purchase the River Street Inn for some time. Savannah is a great city and they have taken a great interest in Savannah because of its controlled growth. Mr. Grossbade said they are asking for a small variance, which adds value to the hotel and tax revenue to the City. He humbly asked the Board to recommend approval for their requested variance.

Mr. Glenn Anderson said they have gone through transformation over the years. They are pleased that Clearview has purchased their hotel and continue to make improvements on both sides of the river. The three windows are a small part of the multi-million dollars renovations that they are going to do to this hotel.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Ms. Victoria Smith, Executive Director of the Savannah Waterfront Association, came forward. They have reviewed the documents related to the proposed modifications of the River Street Inn and performed thorough on-site analysis of the interior and exterior of the inn. The Waterfront Association supports the proposed new windows at the River Street Inn. Ms. Smith said they sent a letter of support to Ms. Harris on behalf of this project.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussed the request for the three new windows. Most of the Board members were in agreement with the staff recommendations. The windows will change the character of the building. Ms. Deacon agreed with the petitioner regarding the windows. She believed that the continue idle of the building might outweigh the historic use as a warehouse. Mr. Dodge and Ms. Matson agreed with the petitioner, too, about the windows. Mr. Stephens said that the petitioner has shown the Board a document that shows where the modifications have been made, but his position is that these do maintain a consistent rhythm across the façade. The three added windows seems to be a little arbitrary and do not maintain the same rhythm. Enough changes have been made already to the windows.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby deny the proposal to add three new windows to north façade of 124 East Bay Street because the preservation standards are not met.

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the proposal to add one new window to the south façade of 124 East Bay Street because of its limited visibility on a secondary façade, the visual compatibility criteria and preservation standards are met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Melissa Memory

Debra Caldwell - Aye Jennifer Deacon - Nay Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Ave Mic Matson - Nay Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Nay

17. Petition of LS3P Associates Ltd. | 18-005087-COA | 110 Ann Street | New Construction Hotel: Part I, Height and Mass

- ∅ 18-005087-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Mass Model Photographs.pdf
- Middle Oglethorpe Ward.pdf
- Context Sanborn Maps.pdf
- PREVIOUS Photographs and Drawings.pdf
- Submittal Packet Photographs and Drawings.pdf
- Mr. Neil Dawson was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass of a 6-story hotel at 110 Ann Street. The property is within a 5-story height zone per the Historic District Height Map; the applicant is requesting an additional story through the use of the bonus story criteria within the ordinance's Large-Scale Development Standards. The property is surrounded on all four sides by streets: Zubly Street to the north, Laurel Street to the east, Alton Street to the south, and Ann Street to the west. This building is one part of a larger project consisting of three adjacent sites [File Nos. 18-005086-COA and 18-005088-COA]. No on-site parking is required or provided for this building; parking for the development as a whole is provided elsewhere.

Ms. Michalak stated that the non-contributing building located on this site was approved by the Board for demolition on April 11, 2018 [File No. 18-001474-COA]. The Board attached two conditions to the approval:

- 1. The building is documented per the MPC Documentation Policy prior to demolition;
- 2. A demolition permit will not be issued until a COA is approved for the new building;

Neither of these conditions have yet been met.

Ms. Michalak stated that the property is located within the Savannah Local Historic District but outside the boundaries of the Savannah National Historic Landmark District; it is located within Middle Oglethorpe Ward which has very little historic context. Surrounding street configurations and street names have also changed significantly throughout the past. There are five contributing buildings within the ward: three along MLK and two along Bryan Street. These buildings vary in style and height from the one-story "The Grey" restaurant in the Streamline Moderne style to the Ships of the Sea Museum to First Bryan Baptist Church. The majority of the remaining non-contributing buildings consist of Yamacraw Village facilities. New construction, mostly consisting of hotels and parking garages, has been constructed in the vicinity; these include: the Fairfield Inn, the Aloft Hotel, the Fairfield and Aloft parking garage, the Embassy Suites Hotel and parking garage. The first three are on the sites directly to the south of this site.

Ms. Michalak explained that at the October 10, 2018 HDBR meeting the Board continued this project in order for the petitioner to consider the following:

- 1. Restudy the design of the sky bridge.
- 2. Restudy the "entrances" into the promenade to create a wall of continuity along Ann and Laurel Streets.
- Restudy the grand staircase, that is setback from the Laurel Street façade, to strengthen and define the corner of the building at this entrance and reinforce the wall of continuity.
- 4. Subdivide the façades horizontally into base, middle, and top. Ensure that the top story is distinguished from the stories below.
- 5. Revise the openings along Laurel Street to contain windows, doors, or storefront (if a variance is not granted for this standard).
- 6. Ensure that the distance between all windows is not less than two times the width of the windows (except on Zubley Street which meets the standard).
- 7. Ensure that the base below the storefront on the mansard roof section of the building is a contrasting design or material.

- 8. Provide more detailed drawings and information to better understand the design of the projecting parapet wall at the top of the building.
- 9. Redesign the railing at the pool deck to be a parapet wall to fully screen the deck.
- 10. Set the trellis/pergola on the pool deck further back from the parapet/wall face.
- 11. Lower the height of the sky bridge to create a one-half story height variation between this and the adjacent building forms; a change in parapet height alone does not constitute a one-half story height variation.
- 12. Redesign the ground floor uses to meet the standard within the "active uses" bonus story criterion, including both the interior arrangement of the spaces and the primary entrances, or choose another criterion.
- 13. Redesign the Alton Street façade to include a minimum of 30% quarried stone to meet the standard with the "masonry materials" bonus story criterion or choose another criterion.
- 14. Redesign the mansard roof portion of the building to no more than 60 feet in width.
- 15. Redesign the bays to all be not less than 15 feet nor more than 20 feet in width.
- 16. Redesign the primary entrances as required to meet the large-scale development "entrances" standard.
- 17. Provide the window and door calculation for the upper floors on the Alton Street façade; ensure that they cover a minimum of 20% surface area.

Ms. Michalak explained also that the Board continued a request from the standard that reads: "Openings shall contain windows, doors, or storefronts." However, the applicant is no longer requesting a variance from this standard.

Ms. Michalak reported that staff recommends approval for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass of a 6-story hotel at 110 Ann Street because the project is visually compatible and meets the standards.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Dawson thanked the Board and staff for working extensively with them on their request, which enabled them to make this a better project. He entertained questions from the Board.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board agreed with the staff recommendations. They commended the petitioner for working cooperatively with the staff. This is a nice project and the petitioner has demonstrated that they are meeting all of the requirements for a bonus story. The added detailing has been developed nicely.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass of a 6-story hotel at 110 Ann Street because the project is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Mic Matson

Debra Caldwell - Aye
Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Abstain **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye - Not Present **David Altschiller** Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

18. Petition of LS3P Associates | 18-005088-COA | 111 Ann Street | New Construction, Part I Height and Mass

- @aerial.pdf
- Mass Model Photographs.pdf
- Context Sanborn Maps.pdf
- @ 18-005088-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Packet- Drawings sm.pdf
- PREVIOUS Submittal Packet- Drawings.pdf

Mr. Brian Harder was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass of a 6-story apartment building at 111 Ann Street. The property is within a 5-story height zone per the Historic District Height Map; the applicant is requesting an additional story through the use of the bonus story criteria within the ordinance's Large-Scale Development Standards. The proposed building will provide two levels of underground parking and one level of above ground parking at the rear of the site. Vehicles will have access from both Ann and Youmans Streets.

Ms. Harris explained that according to the building code, the building is technically two buildings, separated by firewalls and with separate means of egress, but connected together. One building footprint is 38,240 square feet and the second building is 6,751 square feet. The property has frontage on Youmans and Ann Streets. To the west of the site are non-contributing industrial buildings. Because of their low height, the west façade will be very visible above the lower buildings. To the north of the site is a concrete loading ramp which provides access to the buildings to the west. Because of this, the north façade will be highly visible from Zubley Street. A 10' sewer access easement is located along Youmans Street and part of Ann Street, necessitating the building to be setback from the street in the southeast corner of the site. This building is one part of a larger project consisting of three adjacent sites; the rehabilitation of the buildings along MLK was approved on October 10, 2018 [File No. 18-005086-COA] and the new construction to the east will be reviewed separately [18-005087-COA].

Ms. Harris stated that the non-contributing building located on this site was approved by the Board for demolition on February 8, 2017 [File No. 17-00053-COA]. This property is located within the Savannah Local Historic District but outside the boundaries of the Savannah National Historic Landmark District; it is located within both the Middle Oglethorpe Ward and the South Oglethorpe Ward; both wards have very little historic context. Surrounding street configurations and street names have also changed significantly, throughout the past. There are five contributing buildings within Middle Oglethorpe ward: three along MLK and two along Bryan Street. These buildings vary in style and height from the one-story "The Grey" restaurant in the Streamline Moderne style to the Ships of the Sea Museum to First Bryan Baptist Church. The majority of the remaining non-contributing buildings consist of Yamacraw Village facilities. South Oglethorpe Ward features three historic buildings- one on MLK, the CAT Transfer Station, and the Thunderbird Inn. New construction, mostly consisting of hotels and parking garages, has been constructed in the vicinity; these include: the Fairfield Inn, the Aloft Hotel, the Fairfield and Aloft parking

garage, the Embassy Suites Hotel and parking garage.

Ms. Harris said the Board initially reviewed this project on October 10, 2018 and continued it in order for the petitioner to consider the following:

1. Add additional voids to the upper levels of all facades, particularly the north façade and the north and south facades adjacent to the main entrance. Ensure the distance between the openings does not exceed two times the width of the windows.

The condition has been met. Additional voids have been added in all areas.

2. Add a wall of continuity between the building and the loading dock to the north.

The condition has been met. A wall of continuity has been added.

3. Relocate the vehicular entrance on Ann Street, as the primary façade, to Youmans Street, as a secondary façade.

The condition has not been met. Discussions with Traffic Engineering and CAT are ongoing.

4. Reduce the height of the parapet walls to no more than four feet.

The condition has been met. Parapet walls have been reduced to three feet, four inches tall.

5. Revise the sidewalk to serve as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveways in materials, configuration and height.

The condition has been met.

6. Revise the pedestrian access to the garage to contain fenestration.

The condition has been met.

7. Incorporate additional differentiation between the two buildings in order to breakdown monolithic structures.

The condition has been met. The buildings will utilize different materials.

8. Incorporate additional articulation of the top story to better meet the standard of base, middle, top.

Additional articulation has been incorporated, however more articulation should be incorporated with Part II Design Details.

9. Remove one of the points of access above the bonus story.

The condition has been met.

10. Revise the sections of the building to not exceed 60 feet in width and the bay spacing to be not less than 15 nor more than 20 feet in width.

The condition has been partially met. The building has been redesign into architecturally distinct sections which do not exceed 60 feet in width, but the bay spacing does not meet the 15-20 feet width requirement in all areas.

11. Revise the meeting room on the east façade, and the fire pump room and lobby on the south façade to active uses.

The condition has been met.

12. Add an additional primary entrance on the Youmans Street façade.

The condition has been met.

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends approval of the request for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass of a 6-story apartment building at 111 Ann Street with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II: Design Details:

- 1. Relocate the vehicular entrance on Ann Street, as the primary façade, to Youmans Street, as a secondary façade, pending results of the discussion with Traffic Engineering and CAT.
- 2. Incorporate additional differentiation between the two buildings in order to breakdown monolithic structures.
- 3. Incorporate additional articulation of the top story to better meet the standard of base, middle, top.

Because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Harder thanked the staff for their comments. They will be able to address the staff's comments in Part II: Design Details. He entertained questions from the Board.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board was in agreement with the staff recommendations. They were appreciative that the petitioner is willing to work with the staff's recommendations

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass of a 6-story apartment building at 111 Ann Street with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II: Design Details:

- 1.Relocate the vehicular entrance on Ann Street, as the primary façade, to Youmans Street, as a secondary façade, pending results of the discussions with Traffic Engineering and CAT.
- 2.Incorporate additional differentiation between the two buildings in order to breakdown monolithic structures.
- 3.Incorporate additional articulation of the top story to better meet the standard of base, middle, top.

Because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Mic Matson Second: Kevin Dodge

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Jennifer Deacon - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Abstain

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

Mic Matson - Aye

Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Kevin Dodge - Aye

- 19. Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 18-005092-COA | 119 Bull Street and 10 West State Street | Additions and Alterations
 - ∅ 18-005092-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
 - Staff Research Historic Photos.pdf
 - Submittal Packet Materials and Specifications.pdf
 - Context Sanborn Maps.pdf
 - Submittal Packet Photographs and Drawings.pdf

NOTE:

Ms. Lynch recused herself from participating in this petition. She is part owner of the architectural firm.

Ms. Deacon recused herself from participating in this petition. She is an employee of the architecture firm.

Ms. Debra Caldwell left the meeting at 2:30 p.m.

Mr. Dwayne Stephens, Vice-Chair, chaired this meeting.

Mr. Justin Ferrick was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for alterations and additions to the property located at 119 Bull Street and 10 West State Street. The property contains two separate buildings on one parcel and will be internally connected at the ground floor. The Bull Street building is currently two-stories high and exterior work is limited to alterations of the three facades; the alterations will mostly return the facades to their 1920s configuration. The State Street building is currently three-stories high; the applicant proposes to remove and replace its front and rear facades and add a 4th-story and a mezzanine level to the top of the building.

Ms. Michalak reported that staff recommends approval for the alterations to 119 Bull Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Recess the transom area above the main entry door along Bull Street to match the 1920s photographs.
- 2. Change the divided lite configuration of the transom on the easternmost bay of the State Street façade to match the 1920s photographs.
- 3. Ensure that the metal door on the lane façade is insets a minimum of 3 inches from the façade.
- 4. Increase the height of the storefront base to 18-24 inches.
- 5. Locate the trash compactor inside the building or screen it from the right-of-way.

Ms. Michalak additionally reported that staff recommends to continue the request for alterations and additions to 10 West State Street in order for the petitioner to consider the following:

- 1. Revise the design and exterior expression of the 4th floor and mezzanine so that this top floor does not visually appear taller than the first story. The design could also be revised so that the mezzanine is between the 1st and 2nd floors where it is more visually appropriate to have taller floor-to-floor heights.
- 2. Subdivide the façade horizontally into base, middle, and top.
- 3. Ensure that the metal door on the lane façade is insets a minimum of 3 inches from the façade.
- 4. Revise the fixed windows at the 4th floor and mezzanine levels as well as those proposed between the double-hung windows

on the lower floors to be an operable type permitted in the ordinance and to have a vertical to horizontal ratio of not less than

5:3.

- 5. Revise the storefront base to be 18-24 inches in height.
- 6. Remove the faux carriage doors on the lane façade.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Ferrick introduced himself and Mr. Ben Massey who was accompanying him at today's meeting. He said regarding the staff's recommendations referencing 119 Bull Street: 1. Recess the transom area above the main entry door along Bull Street to match the 1920s photographs. He said they are in agreement to recess the transom area above the main entry door along Bull Street to match the 1920s photographs; 2. Change the divided lite configuration of the transom on the easternmost bay of the State Street façade to match the 1920s photographs. Mr. Ferrick said they agree with this, but they wanted to make it clear that they are talking about the transom portion and not the lower portion; 3. Ensure that the metal door on the lane façade is insets a minimum of 3 inches from the façade. He said they already have this noted on their drawings; 4. Increase the height of the storefront base to 18-24 inches. Mr. Ferrick said they are in agreement with increasing the height of the storefront base to 18-24 inches; and 5. Locate the trash compactor inside the building or screen it from the right-of-way. They take a little exception to locate the trash compactor inside the building or screen it from the right-of-way because it is their understanding that the trash compactor serves all the buildings on this block and the restaurant that faces Broughton Street. Therefore, this is beyond the scope of their project. Mr. Ferrick said they were asking the Board not to approve recommendation #5.

Mr. Ferrick said regarding 10 West State Street, the recommendations that are comfortable with are: 3. Ensure that the metal door on the lane façade is insets a minimum of 3 inches from the façade; #5. Revise the storefront base to be 18-24 inches in height; and #6. Remove the faux carriage doors on the lane façade. Mr. Ferrick said before he gets into the staff's remaining recommendations, he wanted to briefly inform the Board of the existing conditions and what they are proposing.

Mr. Ferrick explained that they are dealing with 1960's concrete structure that has increased limitations. Currently, this is a three-level building with the top level being behind a blank wall. The most important thing is they are dealing with a noncompliant floor-to-floor structure that they cannot really adjust without demolishing the entire building. He believes the most sensible approach would be to save this building as it is such a robust structure. Therefore, when they consider recommendations #1. Revise the design and exterior expression of the 4th floor and mezzanine so that this top floor does not visually appear taller than the first story. The design could also be revised so that the mezzanine is between the 1st and 2nd floors where it is more visually appropriate to have taller floor-to-floor heights. Mr. Ferrick said that they will argue that this is not a feasible approach. Therefore, they asked the Board not approve this recommendation as it would essentially mean removing a structure column from the front face of the façade.

Mr. Ferrick said if they look at a diagram of the way they understand the building's façade as developed [is that the expression of the first floor level are ganged windows together vertically that are not only in keeping with the contributing CVS building, but also bind together to create a sense of a taller building. Therefore, they feel that since they are dealing with a constrained building, then this is a great solution for this building. He said, therefore, they ask that staff give this some consideration. Also, when they compare this to the fourth level which does have a mezzanine, certainly the first level is taller than the

floor-to-floor. Mr. Ferrick said when you see it in respective looking up and down the street, you can see that the first level which ties into the horizontal articulation of the CVS building certainly reads as a first level and above that is the top. So because of this, they feel they are meeting the requirement. He said pertaining to #2. Subdivide the façade horizontally into base, middle, and top; they feel they are meeting this requirement.

Mr. Ferrick said regarding #4 - Revise the fixed windows at the 4th floor and mezzanine levels as well as those proposed between the double-hung windows on the lower floors to be an operable type permitted in the ordinance and to have a vertical to horizontal ratio of not less than 5:3. He pointed out that what is seen on the vertical line is actually the column grid of the building. This is actually a concrete column that falls behind the plane of the window. Therefore, it makes sense for this to help set the metering of the window across the facade. Otherwise, what you would end up with is a column right behind an open window which they feel would not be an appropriate expression for this building. Therefore, with taking this in account, it really helps dictate the light pattern on this façade. Mr. Ferrick said they have done their best to provide a consistent light pattern for these. If you look at the tripod light system, they have what they consider three windows join together unit with an operable section isle and a fixed section in the middle. They see this as one unit type. They believe this meets the ordinance for an operable section of the window because they have operable components. Therefore, in talking about what meets the ratio, the middle section window is close to what is allowed in the ordinance for new construction. Therefore, they are actually 5:3.5 for the proportion ratio. However, they are trying to balance the fenestration across the entire façade that the pattern is consistent from the fixed pane in the middle to the operable panes on either side, while also taking into account that the column grid is right behind the windows. They argue that this building is much related to the CVS building. Therefore, they believe they are within the language of the ordinance to give the Board an opportunity to accept the proposal they are providing. Mr. Ferrick said regarding the mezzanine levels, they are showing portions of them operable, but they are happy to meet whatever requirements staff may have with this. They are willing to work with staff regarding the mezzanine level.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussed 119 Bull Street. They agree with the staff recommendations for this building with the exception of the trash compactor. They discussed 10 West State Street. They voiced concerns about the operable windows and understood that the location of the mezzanine could not be changed. The Board discussed the base and top of the building. Their concern was the difference between the third and fourth floors. A spandrel divides this. This needs to be looked into further. Therefore, a continuance would be in order for 10 West State Street.

Mr. Stephens asked Mr. Ferrick if he was in agreement for a continuance for 10 West State Street.

Mr. Ferrick asked for the continuance for 10 West State Street.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby:

Approve alterations to 119 Bull Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.Recess the transom area above the main entry door along Bull Street to match the 1920s photographs.
- 2. Change the divided lite configuration of the transom on the easternmost bay of the State Street façade to

match the 1920s photographs.

- 3. Ensure that the metal door on the lane façade is insets a minimum of 3 inches from the façade.
- 4. Increase the height of the storefront base to 18-24 inches.

Continue the request for alterations and additions to 10 West State Street in order for the petitioner to consider the following:

- 1.Revise the design and exterior expression of the 4th floor and mezzanine so that this top floor does not visually appear taller than the first story. The design could also be revised so that the mezzanine is between the 1st and 2nd floors where it is more visually appropriate to have taller floor-to-floor heights.
- 2. Subdivide the façade horizontally into base, middle, and top.
- 3. Ensure that the metal door on the lane façade is insets a minimum of 3 inches from the façade.
- 4.Revise the fixed windows at the 4th floor and mezzanine levels as well as those proposed between the double-hung windows on the lower floors to be an operable type permitted in the ordinance and to have a vertical to horizontal ratio of not less than 5:3.
- 5. Revise the storefront base to be 18-24 inches in height.
- 6.Remove the faux carriage doors on the lane façade.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Mic Matson

Debra Caldwell - Not Present Jennifer Deacon - Abstain Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye

20. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects | 18-005651-COA | 545 Abercorn Street | Demolition

- Forsyth Ward.pdf
- Aerial View.pdf
- Context Aerials.pdf
- Historic Context- Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf
- MPC Policy- Documenting Prior to Demolition.pdf
- Mr. Patrick Shay was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Alyson Smith gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval to demolish a non-contributing building located at 545 Abercorn Street. This brick and concrete structure was constructed as a boiler house for Candler Hospital. The existing structure appears to have been constructed between 1954 and 1973. The Sanborn Map from 1954 illustrates the presence of a boiler house built in 1945 to the west of a two-story masonry constructed "contagious ward," and a one-story wood "paint storage" shed to the north. The subject structure does not appear on this map.

Ms. Smith stated the Sanborn map from 1973 shows the subject building with notes indicating the use of offices at the first floor, maintenance at the second floor, and a cooling tower on the roof. Additional notes indicate a date of construction as 1967, and the materials used to construct the building including concrete block, brick and concrete panels. The building appears to have been constructed in the previous location of the wood shed and contagious ward. The boiler house was constructed to abut the older boiler house (c.1945). The 1945 portion was demolished some time after 1973.

Ms. Smith reported that staff recommends Approval of the demolition of 545 Abercorn Street with the following conditions:

- 1. The building is documented per the MPC Documentation Policy prior to demolition;
- 2. A demolition permit will not be issued until a COA is approved for the new building;

Because otherwise the work meets the standards.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Shay came forward and said that Mr. Dickey Mopper was present also as he, too, represents the client. Mr. Shay explained that as far as documentation, the recommendation from the staff is not an issue. He said that when questioning demolition of a structure, they look at noncontributing and contributing. The building at 545 Abercorn Street is noncontributing. But, he wanted to say this building has another category which is 'hazardous." The building is certainly detrimental in light that there has been no improvements in the last 50 years. It is also detriment to the urban fabric on Abercorn Street has been transitioning more than 20 years into a commercial sector of the downtown area. This building is also a health hazard.

Mr. Shay said, therefore, the reason they are here today is because they want to remove a building that is detrimental to the overall safety and welfare of the surrounding area. He said he is not one to make requests for a building to be demolished, but this is a rare instance where he has seen that they can have what he calls "addition by subtraction." If this building is demolished, they would actually add to the character of the surrounding historic district. Mr. Shay said something much better will happen on this corner at some point in the future. This is a valuable piece of real estate and will not set idle for a long period of time. Whatever is put here, it will have to come before the Historic District Board of Review. Secondly, a Certificate of Appropriateness will have to be issued. Mr. Shay said, therefore, they are asking to demolish the detrimental building and allow them to come back and show them a compatible improvement at some point in the future.

Mr. Mopper said he agrees with what Mr. Shay has stated. He has been involved in the preservation of historic neighborhoods for many years. This is the first time in 50 years that he has stood before a board recommending the demolition of a building as he is always fighting to save buildings. But, this building is

an eyesore; it has been vacant and unused for more than 30 years. The building does not have any architectural significance; it needs to be demolished. He said he respects the historic preservation staff very much and believes that this is the first time that the staff has asked that a COA be issued before a non-historic building is torn down. This may not be so, but there are a lot of instances recently where this has not been required. When he looks at this space and he is sure the Board members went by and looked at this building, he knows they asked themselves if the visual compatibility of this neighborhood would be enhanced by the demolition. He argues that it is. If there was nothing there whatsoever it would be an immense improvement not only to Historic Savannah, but to the neighbors and people who live in the area. The quicker this building comes down, the better it is for the community.

Mr. Dodge asked Mr. Shay if they have come up with what the use will be for this space. In the Premeeting the Board was told that it would be a parking lot.

Mr. Shay stated that in the short term is very likely that it will be a parking lot. But, if it is a parking lot, the owner will have to come back and show the Review Board that it meets all the requirements.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Ms. Jacqueline Mason said she owns a home across from this building. They all are overjoyed to hear that this building will be demolished. They also talked about a parking lot here as long as it comes before the Review Board with design details.

Mr. Shay, in response to public comments, stated that what will come back to this Board will probably be surface parking for a while. But, it will not detract from the neighborhood.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mrs. Memory said she could not think of another building in Savannah like this building; therefore, she would call it a unique, architectural building. Ms. Fletcher said no upkeep of this building was disturbing for her. She does not want this to be an open lot for a long time. Ms. Deacon said a requirement for a COA to be issued before a demolition is submitted is the typical recommendation that the Board gets from the staff. Mr. Stephens said it is not an abnormal process for the staff to request a COA is approved prior to the demolition permit being issued. His concern is that a time is not given when some type of development will be here. Mr. Cook agreed with the staff recommendations. Maybe they could say that a COA is issued for a property and not necessarily for a building. Ms. Lynch said she believes the guidelines reads that a Certificate of Appropriateness is required for demolition of historic structures. She did not know if it is required for a demolition of any structure. Ms. Taylor agreed with staff recommendations. Mr. Dodge agreed with Mr. Stephens and Mr. Cook. Maybe the Board could request something other than a COA that would indicate what happens after the demolition. Ms. Matson lives in this area. She agrees with the staff recommendation.

Ms. Harris clarified that the Board has flexibility. She explained that the ordinance allows for the Board to impose any additional stipulations that they deem necessary. Therefore, staff's recommendation is for a COA as well as documentation as a part of the additional stipulations. If the Board, however, feels the COA is for something else, they have that flexibility. There is no requirement in the ordinance for demolition of a noncontributing building.

The Board discussed whether the wording new building be changed to new project.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for demolition of a non-contributing building at 545 Abercorn Street with the following conditions:

- 1. The building is documented per the MPC Documentation Policy prior to demolition;
- 2.A demolition permit will not be issued until a COA is approved for the new project;

Because otherwise the work meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Scott Cook

Debra Caldwell - Not Present

Jennifer Deacon - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Nay **David Altschiller**

- Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

21. Petition of Felder & Associates | 18-005781-COA | 323 East Broughton Street and 115 Habersham Street | Addition and New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass

- ∅ 18-005781-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Historic Photos.pdf
- Sanborn Maps.pdf
- @ 323 E. Broughton Lot Coverage Interpretation.pdf
- Submittal Packet Research, Photos, and Specifications.pdf
- Submittal Packet Drawings and Renderings.pdf

Mr. Brian Felder and Mr. Ryan Claus were present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for a rear addition to 323 East Broughton Street (Kennedy Pharmacy) and the construction of a new bathroom facility building (Part I, Height and Mass) at 115 Habersham Street; which is a parcel associated with the Davenport House. For the purposes of this review the Kennedy Pharmacy building is considered a Monumental Building since it will be used as a museum and preservation center. Etched glass signage is proposed within the transoms on the lane and east façade of the addition. The restroom building will be minimally visible from the rights-of-way; likely only the roof and one façade will be visible above and around the existing site walls. The applicant is also requesting a variance from the maximum lot coverage permitted in the RIP-A zoning district to allow the addition to the Kennedy Pharmacy building; the maximum permitted is 75% and they are requesting a recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for 90% coverage.

Ms. Michalak stated that the Kennedy Pharmacy was constructed in 1890 and is a contributing structure within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the Savannah Local Historic District. The Davenport House, although a contributing structure, will not be physically impacted by the construction of the bathroom facility building. The masonry fence surrounding the site was constructed in the 1970s and is not historic. The rear yard of the Davenport House, where the restroom facility is proposed, is a separate parcel from the main house. Currently a garden, the site contained a 2-story brick apartment building until between 1973-1977; staff could not locate a COA approving its demolition. Prior to the

apartment building, which first appeared on the 1916 map, a variety of 1 and 2-story wood and brick stables and sheds existed on this site. The Kennedy Pharmacy building also had a variety of 1-story wood structures on the rear portion of the lot over time; the rear yard has remained vacant since the 1954 map.

Ms. Michalak explained that the surrounding historic context consists of a variety of commercial and residential buildings including the Berrien House, the Kehoe House, and several wood and masonry buildings. There are also several vacant lots along Broughton Street; the Kennedy Pharmacy owner currently leases 20 parking spaces on the vacant lot directly to the west of the site. Although the Kennedy Pharmacy site is zoned RIP-A (which has a building coverage maximum of 75% and parking requirements), two of the other three corner lots at this intersection are zoned B-C-1 which permits 100% lot coverage and does not have parking requirements. In addition, all remaining parcels on the same block face are zoned B-C-1.

Ms. Michalak reported that staff recommends the following for 323 East Broughton Street (Kennedy Pharmacy):

- 1. Continue the request for a rear addition to 323 East Broughton Street in order for the petitioner to consider the following:
 - a. Resolve the lot coverage issue;
- b. Provide all items in the SIGNS checklist and ensure that the etched glass signs proposed in the transoms on the lane and east façade meet the standards with

the Broughton Street Ordinance;

- c. Redesign new penetrations on the rear façade of the historic building to utilize existing openings and minimize the loss of historic fabric.
 - d. Do not enclose the inside of the historic window openings on the east facade:
 - e. Relocate the elevator so that its overrun does not affect the roof shape of the historic building;
 - f. Incorporate architectural articulation on the west façade of the addition;
 - g. Provide material and color samples for all products proposed on the addition.
- 2. Recommends denial to the Zoning Board of Appeals [ZBA] to permit 90% lot coverage in the RIP-A zoning district because the variance criteria are not met.

Ms. Michalak reported additionally that staff recommends the following for 115 Habersham Street (Restroom Facility:

3. Approve the request for part I, Height and Mass for the construction of a restroom facility at 115 Habersham Street with the following conditions to be

submitted with Part II, Design Details because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- a. Revise the mass model to show the correct design and location of the new building:
- b. Provide proposed lot coverage percentage;
- c. Screen the new refuse storage area;
- d. Provide the proposed location for the new electrical meter.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Claus thanked the staff for their guidance with the project. He explained that their request will be heard by the Zoning Board of Appeals [ZBA] in two weeks. They are presently requesting a variance rather than rezoning because they believe it is the easiest way to go. If the variance is not granted, then they will seek a rezoning classification.

Mr. Claus gave a brief background on the project. They do not want to do anything to the Davenport House nor the greenspace that surrounds it.

Mr. Felder explained that they agree with putting new fenestration on the façade. He believes that on the first floor they can reuse the existing opening. The elevator might have to be shifted a little; however, they would like to keep it within the pharmacy. If the elevator is put anywhere else, it will conflict with the roof. But, they do not believe it is a major issue because of where the existing parapet is located. They would like to

push it further north so that it will be further out of view. They want to have an opening on the second floor. An existing window is presently here and they would like to reduce this to 36 inches, which they believe it is minimal.

Mr. Felder discussed the west façade. They originally had some architectural articulation to this façade. They are in-between as to whether this would be required. This is such a small space. However, they are willing to consider putting in false windows or real windows and hyphens as well to address up the façade. When they return, they will address everything else.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Ms. Jamie Cradle, Director of the Davenport House museum, said they are anxious to move forward with their museum exhibit. This will enable them to tell a broader and richer story. They do not have a lot of space, but it is important for them to perpetuate their mission and talk about the history of Savannah and the preservation movement. They receive approximately 45,000 people a year. They believe they are contributing to the life of the community and they are excited about it. Ms. Cradle said they are highly grateful to the Felder and Associates. The Davenport House Museum supports the variance.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

The Board discussed 323 East Broughton Street and 115 Habersham Street. They are in agreement with staff's recommendation to continue 323 East Broughton Street. They are in agreement with staff's recommendation to approve 115 Habersham Street with the stated conditions. The Board discussed the variance request asking to permit 90% lot coverage in the RIP-A zoning district. The variance criteria are not met. They are in agreement with staff that the property should be rezoned. They discussed the elevator. They are concerned that the elevator would penetrate the existing roof.

Mr. Felder asked for a continuance and asked the Board for a recommendation on the variance.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby:

- 323 East Broughton Street (Kennedy Pharmacy):
- 1.Continue the request for a rear addition to 323 East Broughton Street in order for the petitioner to consider the following:
- a. Resolve the lot coverage issue;
- b. Provide all items in the SIGNS checklist and ensure that the etched glass signs proposed in the transoms on the lane and east façade meet the standards with the Broughton Street Sign Ordinance.
- c.Redesign the new penetrations on the rear façade of the historic building to utilize existing openings and minimize the loss of historic fabric.
- d.Do not enclose the inside of the historic window opening on the east façade.
- e.Relocate the elevator so that its overrun does not affect the roof shape of the historic building.
- f.Incorporate architectural articulation on the west façade of the addition.
- g. Provide material and color samples for all products proposed on the addition.
- 2.Recommend denial to the Zoning Board of Appeals to permit 90% lot coverage in the RIP-A zoning district because the variance criteria are not met.
- 115 Habersham Street (Restroom Facility):
- 3. Approve the request for Part I, Height and Mass for the construction of a restroom facility at 115 Habersham

Street with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II, Design Details because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- a.Revise the mass model to show the correct design and location of the new building;
- b. Provide proposed lot coverage percentage;
- c.Screen the new refuse storage area;
- d.Provide the proposed location for the new electrical meter.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Mic Matson

Debra Caldwell - Not Present Jennifer Deacon - Abstain Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Mic Matson - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye

22. Petition of Ward Architecture + Preservation | 18-005788-COA | 432 Abercorn Street and 210 East Gordon Street | Additions and Alterations

- <u>∅</u> 18-005788-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- SAGIS Aerials.pdf
- Submittal Packet Photographs and Drawings.pdf
- Submittal Packet Project Description.pdf
- Submittal Packet Specifications.pdf
- Submittal Packet Supporting Documents.pdf

Mr. Josh Ward was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Michalak gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for alterations and additions to the properties located at 432 Abercorn Street (main house) and 210 East Gordon Street (carriage house) which are on two different parcels. The scope of work for the main house includes: a 3-story rear addition, alterations to the side porch, and adding shutters. The scope of the work for the carriage house includes: removing the west porch and adding shutters. The historic main and carriage house buildings were constructed in 1868 and are contributing structures within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the Savannah Local Historic District. No historic photographs, earlier than 1966, could be located by the applicant or staff.

Ms. Michalak reported that staff recommends approval for alterations and additions to the properties located at 432 Abercorn Street (main house) and 210 East Gordon Street (carriage house) with the

following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Reduce the number of windows proposed to be altered into door openings on the rear façade of the main house where the addition is attached.
- 2. Do not alter the window on the parlor level of the side porch into a door opening.
- 3. Provide all color selections.
- 4. Ensure all doors and windows are inset not less than 3 inches from the building's façade.
- 5. Where intersected by a new driveway, ensure that the sidewalk serves as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration, and height.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Ward said they agree with the staff recommendations. He said after discussing the windows, they are fine with one main window. The windows on the parlor level will not be altered. He explained that there is some paneling on the south opening parlor level that they would like to remove. He showed the Board a picture of the paneling. They believe that with the 1888 addition, these were doors or passageways to the addition. Some brick infill is shown here. They want to create two passageways into the addition. Mr. Ward explained that he is not asking for something that has not already been covered in the staff's report. He is only making comments.

Ms. Lynch asked if the passageways is a condition.

Ms. Michalak explained that condition #1 is still recommended because they are asking that the window be retained on the top level.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

BOARD DISUCSSION

The Board was in agreement with staff recommendations and thanked the petitioner for his willingness to work with staff.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations and additions to the properties located at 432 Abercorn Street (main house) and 210 East Gordon Street (carriage house) with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1.Reduce the number of windows proposed to be altered into door openings on the rear façade of the main house where the addition is attached.
- 2.Do not alter the window on the parlor level of the side porch into a door opening.
- 3. Provide all color selections.
- 4. Ensure all doors and windows are inset not less than 3 inches from the building's façade.
- 5. Where intersected by a new driveway, ensure that the sidewalk serves as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration, and height.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell - Not Present

Jennifer Deacon - Not Present

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Aye

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

Mic Matson - Aye

Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye

IX. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

23. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects, PC | 17-002122-COA | 620 East River Street (Hotel Anne) | One Year Extension

- Extension Request.pdf
- Staff Recommendation Extension 17-002122-COA.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a 12-month extension for the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) issued on November 8, 2017, for New Construction: Part 1, Height and Mass for a two-story hotel known as Hotel Anne, with the previous conditions to be met, to expire on November 8, 2019.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Mic Matson

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell - Not Present

Jennifer Deacon - Not Present

Kellie Fletcher - Aye
Becky Lynch - Abstain
Scott Cook - Aye
Dwayne Stephens - Aye
Mic Matson - Aye
Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Not Present

Nan Taylor - Aye

Kevin Dodge - Not Present

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

- 24. Petition of James Gallucci for LS3P | 18-005451-COA | 118 East Broughton Street | Staff Approved Trim Details

 - Submittal Packet Drawings 118 East Broughton Street 18-005451-COA.pdf

- 25. Petition of John Post for Commonwealth Construction | 18-005520-COA | 202 East Gaston Street | Staff Approved Wall

 - Submittal Packet 202 East Gaston Street 18-005520-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 26. Petition of Lee Smith for Smith Properties | 18-005521-COA | 150-152 Price Street | Stff Approved Color Change
 - @COA 150-152 Price Street 18-005521-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 150-152 Price Street 18-005521-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 27. Petition of Nancy Beskar | 18-005523-COA | 111 East Jones Street | Staff Approval After-the-fact Window Replacement
 - COA 111 East Jones Stree 18-005523-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 111 East Jones Street 18-005523-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 28. Petition of Susie Bull for Dohrman Construction | 18-005524-COA | 204 East Jones Street | Staff Approved Windows, Shutters, Railings/Fences, Cornice

 - Submittal Packet 204 East Jones Street 18-005524-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 29. Amended Petition of Andrew Lynch for Lynch Associates Architects | 18-005531-COA | 1 East Gordon Street | Staff Approved Modification to the balconies after-the-fact

 - Inspection Photos- September.docx
 - @ 2_Handrails_Drawing.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 30. Petition of Clif Cooper for Pantheon ADC | 18-005587-COA | 110 West Congress Street | Staff Approved Rehabilitation

 - Submittal Packet 110 West Congress Street 18-005587-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 2 110 West Congress Street 18-005587-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 31. Petition of JAK Homes | 18-005589-COA | 301 West Jones Street | Staff Approved Extending Fence

 - Submittal Packet 301 West Jones Street 18-005589-COA.pdf

- 32. Petition of Paul Robinson | 18-005609-COA | 18-20 West State Street | Staff Approved Color Change
 - COA 18-20 West State Street 18-005609-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 33. Petition of John Moore for Pier and Beam LLC | 18-005673-COA | 102 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved Wood Shutters

No action required. Staff approved.

- 34. Petition of Tony Hensley for SCAD | 18-005674-COA | 516 Drayton Street [607 Abercorn Street] Staff Approved Storefront Windows and Door

No action required. Staff approved.

- 35. Petition of Andrew Barber for Coastal Canvas | 18-005758-COA | 215 West River Street | Staff Approved Awning

 - Submittal Packet 215 West River Street 18-005609-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 36. Petition of Tony Hensley for SCAD | 18-005806-COA | 342 Bull Street | Staff Approved Storefront Restoration

 - Submittal Packet 342 Bull Street 18-005806-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 37. Petition of Harley Krinsky | 18-005859-COA | 411 West Congress Street | Staff Approved Fence Alteration

 - Submittal Packet 411 West Congress Street 18-005859-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 38. Petition of John Robert [Bob] Turner | 18-005860-COA | 19 East River Street | Staff Approved Awning Recover + Color Change

 - Submittal Packet.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

39. Petition of Amanda Nelson | 18-005876-COA | 213 East Gaston Street | Staff Approved - Sidelite and Transom Restoration

- Application and Submittal Packet 213 East Gaston Street 18-005876-COA.pdf

- 40. Petition of Alex King for Providence Real Estate Consulting | 18-005977-COA | 516 Abercorn Street | Staff Approved Filters
 - COA 516 Abercorn Street 18-005977-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 516 Abercorn Street 18-005977-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 41. Petition of Joseph B. Mitchell | 18-006026-COA | 302-308 West Hall Street | Staff Approved In-kind Reairs: Fascia boards, wood ceiling members and rear window
 - © COA 30002-308 West Hall Street 18-006026-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 302-308 West Hall Street 18-006026-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 42. Amended Petition of Jodie Quinter | 18-006044-COA | 23 West Gordon Street | Staff Approved Repointing
 - COA 23 West Gordon Street 18-006044-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 23 West Gordon Street 18-006044-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 43. Petition of Peter and Gail Connolly | 18-006093-COA | 212 East Liberty Street | Staff Approved Color Change

 - Submittal Packet 212 East Liberty Street 18-006093-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 44. Petition of Gary Sanders | 18-006094-COA | 306-316 West Jones Street | Staff Approved In-kind Stucco Replacement
 - COA 306-316 West Jones Street 18-006094-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 306 316 West Jones Street 18-006094-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 45. Petition of Frank and Teresa Smeeks | 18-006095-COA | 206 East Liberty Street | Staff Approved Color Change

 - Submittal Packet 206 East Liberty Street 18-006095-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 46. Petition of Andy Holmes for Churchill's Pub | 18-006132-COA | 13 West Bay Street | Staff Approved Color Change
 - COA 13 West Bay Street 18-006132-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 13 West Bay Street 18-006132-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 47. Petition of Amy Schultz for Metalcrafts, a Tecta America Co., LLC | 18-006144-COA | 302 East Gordon Street | Staff Approved Roof Replacement

 - Submittal Packet 302 East Gordon Street 18-006144-COA.pdf

- 48. Pettion of Matthew Deacon for Alchemy Restoration | 18-006146-COA | 20 West Taylor Street | Staff Approved Replace Front Door Assembly

 - Submittal Packet 20 West Taylor Street 18-006146-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 49. Report on Work Performed Without a COA for the November 14, 2018 HDBR Meeting.

Ms. Lynch explained that staff has already given Board the report on work performed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 50. Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting Thursday, November 15, 2018 at 3:30 p.m. in the Meyer Conference Room, MPC 110 East State Street
- 51. Next Pre-Meeting Wednesday, December 12, 2018 at 12:00 p.m. in the Jerry Surrency Room, MPC, 112 East State Street
- 52. Next Regular Meeting Wednesday, December 12, 2018 at 1:00 p.m. in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, MPC, 112 East State Street

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

53. Adjournment

Ms. Lynch said the nominating committee still needs to meet. A number of the present Board members term will be up for reappointment at the end of the year, but if they want to be considered for reappointment by City Council, they need to submit their application. Ms. Lynch said she will call the City to find out when they are accepting applications for reappointments.

The Nominating Committee members are Ms. Matson and Mr. Stephens. They will meet early in December, 2018.

There being no further business to come before the Historic District Board of Review, Ms. Lynch adjourned the meeting at 5:10 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Ellen I. Harris Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation

EIH:mem

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.