

# Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room February 13, 2019 1:00 p.m. Meeting Minutes

# FEBRUARY 13, 2019 SAVANNAH HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW REGULAR MEETING

A Pre-Meeting will be held at 12:00 PM in the Jerry Surrency Conference Room, 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda will be presented by Staff, as time permits, and the Board may ask questions. No testimony will be received and no votes will be taken.

Members Present: Becky Lynch, Chair

David Altschiller
Debra Caldwell
Kevin Dodge
Kellie Fletcher
Stan Houle
Ellie Isaacs
Melissa Memory
Nan Taylor

Members Absent: Dwayne Stephens, Vice Chair

Scott Cook

MPC Staff Present: Ellen Harris, Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation

Leah Michalak, Senior Historic Preservation Planner

Alyson Smith, Historic Preservation Planner Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

#### I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

# 1. Call to Order and Welcome

**Ms. Lynch** called the meeting to order at 1:05 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. She outlined the role of the Historic District Board of Review and explained the process for hearing the various petitions. Staff will present each application with a recommendation. The petitioner will have the opportunity to respond to the recommendation. The petitioners are asked to limit their presentation to 10 minutes or less and only address the items identified as inconsistent with the ordinance and questions raised by the Board. The public will have the same allotted time, 10 minutes, to comment. The petitioner will be given the opportunity to respond to the public comments.

## **II. SIGN POSTING**

# **III. CONSENT AGENDA**

- 2. Petition of DJ Heaton | 18-006683-COA | 616 Price Street | Fence
  - Staff Recommendation.pdf
  - Site Photos.pdf
  - Drawings.pdf
  - Material & Color Specs.pdf

- Context Photos.pdf
- Mercer Ward.pdf

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the fence and gates at 616 Price Street with the following conditions:

- •Coordinate with the City's Traffic Engineering Department regarding the construction of the required apron for vehicular access at the rear of the lot;
- •Where intersected by a new driveway, the sidewalk shall serve as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration, and height.
- •Asphalt strips or tabs shall not be permitted. Loose paving materials, such as crushed shell or gravel, shall not be permitted within 18 inches of the public-right-of-way.

Because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

# 3. Petition of Hallett & Co. | 19-000157-COA | 124 Abercorn Street | Accessory Building Alterations

- @19-000157-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Packet Photos.pdf
- Submittal Packet Drawings.pdf

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations to the ticketing, mechanical, and restroom outbuildings located on the Owens-Thomas House property at 124 Abercorn Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

- 4. Petition of Sottile & Sottile | 19-000284-COA | 303 &305 Berrien Street | Amendments to New Construction
  - ∅ 19-000284-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
  - Application 303 and 305 Berrien Street 19-00284-COA.pdf
  - Submittal Packet- Drawings.pdf

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the revisions to new construction at 303-305 Berrien Street with the following conditions:

- 1. Provide a door specification.
- 2.Ensure that the Sierra Pacific windows are either Premium, and Monument Double-Hung Series (H3 2.0 not permitted).

Because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

## 5. Petition of Linda Ramsay | 19-000285-COA | 526 East Gordon Street | Alterations

- ∅ 19-000285-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Packet Drawings and Photos.pdf
- Submittal Packet Materials and Specs1.pdf

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition to replace the windows and add a front porch roof and columns for the property located at 526 East Gordon Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

## 6. Petition of Beacon Builders | 19-000292-COA | 552 East Liberty Street | Rehabilitation and Alterations

- ∅ 19-000292-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Staff Research.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for for rehabilitation and alterations to the property located at 552 East Liberty Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.Ensure that the window is inset not less than three inches from the façade or matches the inset of the existing windows.
- 2.Add a capital and base to the front porch column.
- 3.Add appropriately designed wood ceilings to the underside of the porch floors.
- 4.Reduce the rear deck and stair railing to a maximum of 3 feet high and ensure that the balusters are spaced a maximum of 4 inches apart.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

- 7. Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 19-000301-COA | 545 Abercorn Street | Fence
  - Staff Recommendation .pdf
  - Submittal Packet.pdf
  - Forsyth Ward.pdf

## **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a fence at 545 Abercorn Street with the following conditions:

- 1. Provide vehicular gates to form a consistent wall of continuity along Abercorn Street.
- 2.Staff requests that every effort be made to reduce the width of the existing curb cut.
- 3.Ensure the sidewalk serves as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in material configuration and height.

Because otherwise the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

## IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

# 8. Adopt February 13, 2019 Agenda

### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby adopt February 13, 2019 Agenda.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Stan Houle

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

## **V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

- 9. Approve January 9, 2019 Briefing Minutes and January 9, 2019 Regular Minutes
  - January 9, 2019 HBR Briefing Minutes.docx

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the Briefing Minutes and Regular Minutes of January 9, 2019.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs

Second: David Altschiller

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

# VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

#### VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

10. Petition of Greenline Architecture | 17-002904-COA | 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next meeting.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye

Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

# 11. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006851-COA | 620 East River Street (Hilton Hotel) | New Construction Part II: Design Details

# **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next meeting.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

# 12. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006852-COA | 630 East River Street (Parking Garage) | Part II: Design Details

# **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next meeting.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs Debra Caldwell - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain - Not Present Scott Cook **Dwayne Stephens** - Not Present Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye

# 13. Petition of Gunn, Meyerhoff, Shay | 17-002122-COA | 620 East River Street (Hotel Anne) | New Construction Part 1: Height and Mass

- Aye

#### Motion

Ellie Isaacs

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next meeting.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

# 14. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects | 17-003634-COA | 300 and 326 West Bay Street | New Construction Hotel: Part I, Height and Mass

## Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next meeting.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

# 15. Petition of General Services Administration | 17-006639-COA | 124 Barnard Street | New Construction Part 2: Design Details

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next meeting.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

#### **Details**

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next meeting.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Not Present **Dwayne Stephens** - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

# 17. Petition of LS3P Associates | 18-005088-COA | 111 Ann Street | New Construction, Part II: Design Details

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next meeting.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

**Dwayne Stephens** 

Debra Caldwell - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Not Present - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

# 18. Petition of Savannah WOB LLC | 18-005590-COA | 112 West Broughton Street | Signs

## **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next meeting.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

19. Petition of Felder & Associates | 18-005781-COA | 323 East Broughton Street and 115 Habersham Street | Addition and New Construction: Part II, Design Details

## **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next meeting.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

# 20. Petition of Lott Barber | 18-006769-COA | 145 Montgomery Street | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass

## **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next meeting.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

# 21. Petition of LS3P | 18-006314-COA | 2 Whitaker Street | Demolition and New Construction Part II: Design Details

# Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next meeting.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye - Abstain Becky Lynch Scott Cook - Not Present - Not Present **Dwayne Stephens** Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye

# 22. Petition of Verizon Wireless | 19-000215-COA | 102 East Liberty Street | Telecommunications Equipment

- Aye

- Aye

## **Motion**

Stan Houle

Ellie Isaacs

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next meeting.

## Vote Results (Voting)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain Scott Cook - Not Present **Dwayne Stephens** - Not Present Melissa Memory - Not Voted **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye

# 23. Petition of Drayton Tower | 19-000322-COA | 102 East Liberty Street | Window Signs

## **Motion**

Ellie Isaacs

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next meeting.

- Aye

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

## 24. Petition of Coastal Canvas | 19-000329-COA | 319 West Broughton Street | Sign

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition to the next meeting.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

# **VIII. REGULAR AGENDA**

25. Petition of Edward A. Pyrch | 18-006310-COA | 523 East Perry Street | Addition and Carriage House New Construction: Part II, Design Details

- Sanborn Maps.pdf
- December HDBR Meeting Drawings.pdf

- Submittal Packet Materials.pdf
- Submittal Packet Photos and Mass Model.pdf
- Submittal Packet Drawings and Rendering.pdf

NOTE: Mr. Dodge recused himself from participating in this petition as he owns the property.

Mr. Edward Pyrch was present on behalf of the petition.

**Ms. Leah Michalak** gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for an addition to the main building and for New Construction: Part II, Design Details for a one-story garage at the rear of the property located at 523 East Perry Street. The majority of the one-story porch addition will not be visible as it will be screened by the new brick fence/wall and garage; it will be 8 feet deep and the full width of the rear of the building (15 feet). She explained that at the December 12, 2018 meeting, the Board continued the request for an addition to the main building located at 523 East Perry Street in order for the petitioner to address the following:

- 1. Reduce the depth of the rear porch addition in order to reduce or eliminate the requested lot coverage variance.
- 2. With regard to materials:
  - Revise the proposed roof to be standing seam metal with a 1" seam height.
  - Revise the columns to be a wood or wood composite product.
  - Ensure that the new door is wood or wood clad.

**Ms. Michalak** stated the Board approved the request for alterations to the main building, the brick wall, and New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass for a one-story garage at the rear of the property located at 523 East Perry Street with the following conditions to be submitted to the Board for review with Part II: Design Details because the proposed work was otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Ensure that the windows are the Sierra Pacific "Premium" or "Monument" Series; the H3 2.0 series is not permitted.
- 2. Ensure that the wood human gate proposed within the brick wall is painted or stained.
- 3. Ensure that the garage window is inset not less than 3".
- 4. Add a string course to the garage parapet wall.

**Ms. Michalak** explained that the Board recommended <u>denial</u> to the Zoning Board of Appeals [ZBA] for a lot coverage variance to permit 80% because the variance criteria were not met. However, at the January 24, 2019 ZBA Meeting, they approved a 5% variance to the lot coverage maximum of 75% to permit 80% lot coverage [File No. 18-006878-ZBA]. Therefore, Condition #1 that the HDBR places on the continuance for the addition no longer applies.

**Ms. Michalak** reported that staff recommends approval of the request for an addition to the main building located at 523 East Perry Street as requested because the addition has received a lot coverage variance, is visually compatible and meets the design and preservation standards and recommends to approve the request for New Construction: Part II, Design Details for a one-story garage at the rear of the property located at 523 East Perry Street with the following condition because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards:

- 1. Provide a garage door specification to staff for final review an approval.
- 2. Ensure that the proposed door does not have a faux wood grain finish.

#### **PETITIONER COMMENTS**

**Mr. Pyrch** stated that they were in agreement with the staff's recommendations. They will ensure that they basically have a white door with smooth raised panels instead of wood grain.

## **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

None.

#### **BOARD DISCUSSION**

The Board was in agreement with the staff's recommendations.

#### Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby:

Approve the request for an addition to the main building located at 523 East Perry Street as requested because the addition has received a lot coverage variance, is visually compatible and meets the design and preservation standards.

Approve the request for New Construction: Part II, Design Details for a one-story garage at the rear of the property located at 523 East Perry Street with the following condition because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards:

-Provide a garage door specification to staff for final review and approval. Ensure that the proposed door does not have a faux wood grain finish.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs Second: Kellie Fletcher

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Abstain
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

# 26. Petition of SHEDDarchitecture | 18-006335-COA | 504 East Liberty Street | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass

- 18-006335-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Packet- drawings.pdf
- @aerial.pdf
- Crawford Ward.pdf
- Context Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Adjacent block image.pdf

Mr. Shedrick Coleman was present on behalf of the petition.

**Ms. Ellen Harris** gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval of new construction Part I: Height and Mass of a new three-story building at 504 East Liberty Street. This project is part of a larger project on the site, but because multiple buildings are involved, they will be reviewed individually. The additional building, located along the lane, will be reviewed under file 18-006336-COA. Standards which apply to the entire project, such as lot coverage, will be addressed under both petitions. The proposed building will be located on a vacant

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room February 13, 2019 1:00 p.m. Meeting Minutes

portion of a lot, adjacent to an existing non-contributing building. The adjacent building, known at 506-512 East Liberty Street, was approved earlier this year for alterations to the entrances and stoops (18-000285-COA).

**Ms. Harris** explained that the project was initially reviewed by the Board on December 12, 2018 and was continued in order for the petitioner to consider the following:

- 1. Revise the unusually tall and narrow window configuration on the front façade. The condition has been met.
  - 2. Provide additional articulation on the west façade and add fenestration to the east façade.

The condition has been met.

- 3. Revise the uncovered stoop to a covered stoop with greater height from the ground. The condition has been partially met. The proposed stoop is now covered but remains at ten inches above grade.
- 4. Eliminate or substantially redesign the very deep cornice, three feet, two inches, on the south, east and north façades; ensure that a string course is incorporated.

  The deep cornice has been eliminated.
- 5. Locate the refuse storage area.
  The refuse storage area has not been located.
  - 6. While materials are not part of Part I: Height and Mass review, the Board provides the following recommendations so that they may be incorporated in Part II: Design Details. Revise changes in material to occur in correspondence in changes to architectural features (such as bay windows or cornices) rather than on flat, vertical planes. Eliminate the stucco trim on the sides of the windows and doors as this is not typical on contributing masonry buildings. Revise the painted CMU blocks on the east facade to a different material.

The materials will be addressed in Part II: Design Details.

**Ms.** Harris reported that staff recommends approval for New Construction Part I- Height and Mass at 504 East Liberty Street with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II- Design Details:

- 1. On the south, primary elevation, the window spacing should be consistent.
- 2. Increase the height of the stoop.
- 3. Locate the electric meter and storage refuse area.

Because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

## **PETITIONER COMMENTS**

**Mr. Coleman** stated that he was in agreement with the staff's recommendations and they will make the changes as appropriate.

## **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Ms. Lori Swanner of 516 East Liberty Lane wanted clarification on what will be in the front on Liberty Street.

Ms. Lynch explained that the next petition concerns the Liberty Street project.

## **BOARD DISCUSSION**

The Board was in agreement with the staff's recommendations and appreciated the petitioner's willingness to comply with the staff's recommendations.

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for New Construction Part I-Height and Mass at 504 East Liberty Street with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II- Design Details:

- 1.On the south, primary elevation, the window spacing should be consistent.
- 2.Increase the height of the stoop.
- 3.Locate the electric meter and storage refuse area.

Because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Stan Houle

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

# 27. Petition of SHEDDarchitecture | 18-006336-COA | 514-524 East Liberty Street | New Construction Part I Height and Mass

- Submittal Packet- drawings.pdf
- @aerial.pdf
- Crawford Ward.pdf
- Context Sanborn Maps.pdf
- ∅ 18-006336-COA Staff Recommendation1.pdf
- Perry Lane image.pdf

Mr. Shedrick Coleman was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Ellen Harris gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for New Construction Part I: Height and Mass for six three-story townhomes/carriage houses along Liberty Lane. The buildings will have stoops along Liberty Lane. This project is part of a larger project on the site, but because multiple buildings are involved, they will be reviewed individually. The additional building, located along at the street, will be reviewed under file 18-006335-COA. Standards which apply to the entire project, such as lot coverage, will be addressed under both petitions.

**Ms. Harris** explained that the project was initially reviewed by the Board on December 12, 2018 and was continued at the request of the petitioner. The Board's discussion focused primarily on the height of three stories at the lane and whether the buildings were considered "accessory buildings" or not. The project has been revised to set the buildings back approximately six feet from the lane and incorporate individual stoops

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room February 13, 2019 1:00 p.m. Meeting Minutes

along the lane. Ms. Harris said she contacted the Zoning Administrator for an interpretation if the buildings could be subject to the accessory building standard requiring two stories. The Zoning Administrator gave an answer today, but not in time to be added to the agenda, therefore, a copy was given to the Board members. At the meeting held in December, the Board approved the demolition of the non-contributing building on the site with the condition that it be documented per the MPC's Document Policy prior to the issuance of a demolition permit.

**Ms.** Harris said that just prior to this meeting, the petitioner informed her that his client is willing to eliminate the third story and move forward with two story buildings. He will confirm this when he makes his presentation to the Board.

**Ms.** Harris stated that staff recommends a continuance of the petition for New Construction Part I: Height and Mass at 504 East Liberty Street in order for the petitioner to reduce the height of the buildings to no greater than two stories, because the project is not visually compatible and does not meet the design standards. Staff also recommends denial of the variance from the standard which states, "Accessory buildings which front a lane shall be no taller than two stories," because the variance criteria have not been met.

**Ms.** Harris explained that since the petitioner has agreed to eliminate the third story, the Board could approve the petition for New Construction Part I: Height and Mass at 504 East Liberty Street with the condition that the height of the buildings is reduced to two stories, because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards.

#### **PETITIONER COMMENTS**

**Mr. Coleman** confirmed that after speaking with his client, they feel that removing the third floor will work economically for him. Therefore, they are eliminating the third floor. This will be a two-story project.

**Mr.** Dodge confirmed with Mr. Coleman that that they would not be making any other changes to the first two floors, but will only be eliminating the third floor.

**Mr. Coleman** answered that a comment was made about the aligning of the doors and windows on the rear elevation, they will adjust this in phase two. The windows on the second floor will be modulated to be aligned vertically as staff has commented.

### **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Mr. Bob Rosenwald of the Downtown Neighborhood Association appreciates the petitioner eliminating the third floor. Mr. Rosenwald, said as he looks at the project, it appears that the front doors will be facing Perry Lane. He is curious if the addresses will be Perry Lane or Liberty Street. Does this matter with the approval? What really are these buildings?

**Ms.** Lori Swanner said their concern was the third story, but now that this has been eliminated, this is no longer an issue for them.

**Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation (HSF)** understood that the petitioner has removed the third floor. Mr. Carey said with the elimination of the third floor will be more in keeping with the visual compatibility of the neighborhood.

**Mr. Coleman** in response to the public's comments, explained that the project will have addresses on the lane. Originally, they were on the court which is why the addresses were shown on Liberty Street, but once they moved it to the lane, they looked at having lane addresses. He explained that they will have no surprises coming forth, the design will be as he has stated. They have always been willing to do what is best for the city and the Historic District and they will continue to do so

#### **BOARD DISCUSSION**

The Board was appreciative that the petitioner eliminated the third floor.

**Mr. Dodge** stated that it appears that the Board has a choice to either approve Part I - Height and Mass with the elimination of the third floor or continue the project. He asked if the Board votes to continue the project, would this add another month to the process? Or, when the petitioner comes before the Board with Phase II - Design Details, could the Board approve Part I and II at that time?

Ms. Harris explained that technically, the petitioner has the right to ask the Board to vote for or against the petition. The Board could only continue the petition if the petitioner is willing to request a continuance. Therefore, if the Board is uncomfortable with approving the petition with the condition that the third floor be removed, they could make a motion to deny the three floor project which was the official submittal. If the Board denied it or if the petitioner agrees to a continuance, they would have to come back before the Board with Part I again. The Board could decide if they would like to hear Part I - Height and Mass and Part II - Design Details together. But, this would need to be made as a part of the

motion.

#### **Motion**

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for New Construction Part I: Height and Mass at 504 East Liberty Street with condition that the height of the buildings is reduced to two stories, because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards.

#### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: David Altschiller

Debra Caldwell - Aye

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Not Present

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

#### IX. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

#### X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

- 28. Petition of Karen Wilson for DeNyse Signs | 18-006827-COA | 120 Drayton Street | Staff Approved Sign Face Changes
  - COA 120 Drayton Street 18-0006827-COA.pdf
  - Cadence Bank Drayton St Production.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 29. Petition of Greg Spence for Verizon Wireless | 18-006978-COA | 321 West Bay Street | Staff Approved Telecommunications Equipment
  - COA 321 West Bay Street 18-006978-COA.pdf
  - Submittal Packet 321 West Bay Street 15-005811-COA.pdf
  - Submittal Packet CD 321 West Bay St. 18-006978-COA.pdf
  - Submittal Packet Owner's Authorization 321 West Bay St. 18-006978-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 30. Amended Petition of Craig W. Clements for Sottile & Sottile | 19-000150-COA | 447 Bull Street | Staff Approved Addition
  - COA 447 Bull Street 19-000150-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 31. Petition of Amber Then | 19-000220-COA | 15 East Macon Street | Staff Approved Color Change

  - Submittal Packet 15 East Macon Street 19-000220-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 32. Petition of Elisa McCaffrey | 19-000266-COA | 102 West Jones Street | Staff Approved Color Change

  - Submittal Packet 102 West Jones Street 19-000266-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 33. Petition of Kenneth Richards | 19-000296-COA | 104 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved Repoint Brick

No action required. Staff approved.

- 34. Petition of James R. Hare | 19-000321-COA | 515 East Gordon Street | Staff Approved Pergola

  - Photo 1.jpg
  - Photo-2.jpg

No action required. Staff approved.

- 35. Petition of Daniel Winters for the Pinyan Company | 19-000431-COA | Staff Approved Rehabilitation After Fire

  - Savannah's Olde Pink House damaged, but...pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 36. Petition of Anthony Cissell for Sottile & Sottile | 19-000371-COA | 700 Drayton Street | Staff Approved Historic Wall/Fence Alterations

No action required. Staff approved.

- 37. Petition of Tony Hensley for SCAD | 19-000373-COA | 218 West Hall Street | Staff Approved In-kind Repairs
  - COA 218 West Hall Street 19-000373-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 38. Petition of Samantha Meier | 19-000527-COA | 420 West Bryan Street | Staff Approved Roof Repair

No action required. Staff approved.

- 39. Petition of Steven Bodek | 19-000533-COA | 548-550 East Macon Street | Staff Approved Siding Repair/Replacement
  - © COA 548-550 East Macon Street 19-000533-COA.pdf

Submittal Packet - 548 East Macon St. 19-000533-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 40. Petition of Steven Bodek | 19-000534-COA | 446 Price Street | Staff Approved Partial In-Kind Siding Replacement
  - COA 446 Price Street 19-000534-COA.pdf
  - Submittal Packet 446 Price Street 19-000534-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 41. Petition of Matt Deacon for Alchemy Restoration | 19-000545-COA | 427 East President Street | Staff Approved Awning and Side Door Replacement

No action required. Staff approved.

- 42. Petition of Richard Johnson | 19-000559-COA | 223 East Charlton Street | Staff Approved Rebuild Garden Wall

No action required. Staff approved.

# XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 43. Report on Work Performed Without a COA for the February 13, 2019 HDBR Meeting.
  - 2-13-19 HDBR Report on Work Without a COA.pdf

Ms. Lynch stated that staff has given the Board the report on work performed without a COA.

Ms. Michalak explained that 12 East Perry lane and 111 East Jones Street are in compliance after one and one-half years.

#### XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

# XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 44. Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting Thursday, February 14, 2019 at 3:30 p.m. in the Meyer Conference Room, MPC 110 East State Street
- 45. Next Pre-Meeting Wednesday, March 13, 2019 at 12:00 p.m. in the Jerry Surrency Room, MPC, 112 East State Street
- 46. Next Regular Meeting Wednesday, March 13, 2019 at 1:00 p.m. in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, MPC, 112 East State Street

#### XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

#### XV. ADJOURNMENT

## 47. Adjournment

There being no further business to come before the Board, Ms. Lynch adjourned the meeting at 1:45 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room February 13, 2019 1:00 p.m. Meeting Minutes

Ellen Harris, Director Urban Planning and Historic Preservation

EIH:mem

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.