



Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room
July 10, 2019 1:00 P. M.
MINUTES

JULY 10, 2019 HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

A Pre-Meeting will be held at 12:00 PM in the Jerry Surrency Conference Room, 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda will be presented by Staff, as time permits, and the Board may ask questions. No testimony will be received and no votes will be taken.

Members Present: Becky Lynch, Chair
 Dwayne Stephens, Vice-Chair
 Scott Cook
 Kevin Dodge
 Ellie Isaacs
 Melissa Memory

Members Absent: David Altschiller
 Debra Caldwell
 Stan Houle
 Nan Taylor

MPC Staff Present: Pamela Everett, Esq., Assistant Executive Director
 Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation
 Ryan Jarles, Cultural Resources Planner
 Alyson Smith, Historic Preservation Planner
 Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant
 Bri Finau, Administrative Assistant

City of Savannah Staff Present: Zachery Fangman, Urban Planning and Design

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

[1. Call to Order and Welcome](#)

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

[2. Petition of Scott Singeisen | 19-002943-COA | 519 East Gordon Lane | New Construction Part II: Design Details](#)

📎 [19-002943-COA Recommendation.pdf](#)

📎 [Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)

📎 [Part II Drawings 06-26-2019.pdf](#)

📎 [Application and submission packet - 519 East Gordon Lane 19-002943-COA.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for New Construction, Part II: Design Details to add a second story dwelling to an existing one-story garage at the rear of the property located at 519 east Gordon Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Provide specifications and color selections for the doors, windows, standing seam metal roof, and garage doors. Ensure that the selected products meet all standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[3. Petition of Barnard Architects | 19-003436-COA | 204 East Hall Street | Amendments to Alterations](#)

📎 [19-003436-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

📎 [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

📎 [Previous 3D Street Views.pdf](#)

📎 [Previous Drawings.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve amendments to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations and additions to the property located at 204 East Hall Street [File No. 17-005487-COA] with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

-Reduce the height of the trellis to a maximum of 11 feet.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present

Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[4. Petition of J. Elder Studio | 19-003464-COA | 513 East Jones Street | New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass](#)

- [☞ Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
- [☞ Aerial Map.pdf](#)
- [☞ Submittal Packet.pdf](#)
- [☞ Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for New Construction, Part 1: Height and Mass for a carriage house behind 513 East Jones Street with the following conditions to be submitted for review by the HDBR with Part II: Design Details:

- 1.Reduce the gap between the second story windows to be more consistent with spacing between windows on visually related contributing buildings.
- 2.Provide the pitch of the side gable roof; ensure it is between 4:12 and 8:12.
- 3.Provide the location of the HVAC equipment; ensure it is screened from the public right-of-way.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[5. Petition of Alchemy Restoration | 19-003466-COA | 216 West Jones Street | Rehabilitation and Addition](#)

- [19-003466-COA.pdf](#)
- [216 W Jones HDBR Submission-REVISED 062119 \(003\).pdf](#)
- [Submittal Packe - 216 West Jones Street 19-003466-COA.pdf](#)
- [Application - 216 West Jones Street 19-003466-COA.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a rehabilitation and addition at 216 West Jones Street with the following conditions because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.Ensure that the new windows and door are inset 3 inches from the exterior surface of the façade;
- 2.Provide the material specifications for the siding proposed on the storage portion of the porch addition for review and approval by staff.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[6. Petition of LS3P Associates, Ltd. | 19-003471-COA | 118 East Broughton Street | Sign & After-the-Fact Amendment](#)

- [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)
- [Staff Recommendation .pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a fascia sign and amendment to the storefront mullions at 118 East Broughton Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the design and sign standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Abstain
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[7. Petition of LS3P Associates, Ltd. | 19-003472-COA | 303 Tattnell Street | Amendment - Demolition](#)

[☞ Staff Recommendation .pdf](#)

[☞ Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

[☞ COA - 16-006855-COA- PT 1- January.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a revision to the condition of the approval for demolition at 303 Tattnell Street to state that a demolition permit shall not be issued until a COA for new construction is approved.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Abstain
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[8. Petition of LS3P Associates, Ltd. | 19-003475-COA | 611 West Jones Street | Amendment - Alterations & Addition](#)

[☞ Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

[☞ 611WJones_Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for an amendment to COA [File No. 18-006771-COA] for alterations and an addition at 611 West Jones Street with the following conditions:

1. Provide a manufacturer's specification to staff for review for the revised aluminum canopy.
2. Submit signage to the HDBR for review and approval.
3. Where intersected by a new driveway, the sidewalk shall serve as a continuous uninterrupted pathway across the driveway in materials, configuration, and height.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Abstain
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[9. Petition of Studio Architects | 19-003489-COA | 601 Indian Street | Amendments to New Construction](#)

[📎 Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

[📎 19-003489-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve amendments to the previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction of six-story building at 601 Indian Street [File No. 17-005582-COA] as requested because the proposed changes are visually compatible and meet the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain

Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

[10. Adopt July 10, 2019 Agenda](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby adopt the amended July 10, 2019 Agenda: removal of item #45 "Update on Ordinance Amendments" from the agenda.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

[11. Approve July 10, 2019 Briefing Minutes and July 10, 2019 Regular Minutes](#)

📎 [June 12, 2019 HBR Briefing Minutes.docx](#)

📎 [06-12-2019 Minutes.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve June 12, 2019 Briefing Minutes and June 12, 2019 Regular Minutes.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs

Second: Melissa Memory

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

[12. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects | 16-006851-COA | 620 East River Street | Amendments to New Construction](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[13. Petition of Gunn, Meyerhoff, Shay | 17-002122-COA | 620 East River Street \(Hotel Anne\) | New Construction Part 1: Height and Mass](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[14. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects | 17-003634-COA | 300 and 326 West Bay Street | New Construction Hotel: Part I, Height and Mass](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[15. Petition of LS3P | 18-006314-COA | 2 Whitaker Street | Demolition and New Construction Part II: Design Details](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[16. Petition of Lott Barber | 18-006769-COA | 145 Montgomery Street | New Construction Part II: Design Details](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[17. Petition of Kevan Hoerdoerfer Architects | 19-001532-COA | 7 MLK, Jr. Blvd. | Rehabilitation and Alterations](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[18. Petition of Hansen Architects PC | 19-003391-COA | 29 Abercorn Street | Windows](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested..

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[19. Petition of Flourish Collaborative | 19-003398-COA | 107 Whitaker Street | Signs](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs

Second: Dwayne Stephens	
Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[20. Petition of 4 Cast Signs LLC | 19-003437-COA | 630 Indian Street | Signs](#)

Motion	
The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.	
Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Dwayne Stephens	
Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[21. Petition of Reardon Design, LLC | 19-003478-COA | 510 East Jones Street | Additions, Alterations, Fence](#)

Motion	
The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.	
Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Dwayne Stephens	
Debra Caldwell	- Not Present

Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

VIII. REGULAR AGENDA

[22. Petition of Greenline Architecture | 17-002904-COA | 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass](#)

- 📎 [17-002904-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Submittal Packet - Drawings and Photos.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Previous Submittal Packet - Drawings and Photos.pdf](#)
- 📎 [63MLK-Concept Rendering.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Context - Sanborn Maps.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Franklin Ward.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Historical Photographs.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Liberty Ward.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Mass Model.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Aerial.pdf](#)

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request for approval for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass of a six (6) story hotel at 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. The building features a symmetrical front façade facing MLK with two floors of underground parking. The footprint is 26,992 square feet and the building is U-shaped, with an open valet/parking entrance area facing Zublely Street. Architecturally, the building is evocative of the Art Deco style. The project is classified as Large-Scale Development and the petitioner is requesting one bonus story above the Height Map (this is a 5-story height zone).

The applicant is also requesting a recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard that states: Access to parking shall be from lanes or north-south service streets. When a property does not front a lane or north-south service street, parking may be accessed from east-west connecting streets or trust streets. This is to allow access to parking from Zublely Street, which is an east-west street; this site has access to north-south streets.

Staff recommends approval for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass of a six (6) story hotel at 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II: Design Details for review and approval by the Board:

1. Reduce the overall building height;

2. Significantly shorten the length of the parking entrance area and the ramp within the building so that the pedestrian dead space created along Zubley Street is minimized;
3. Provide details for the through-wall HVAC systems;
4. Ensure the window sashes and door frames are inset not less than four (4) inches.

Staff recommends approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard that states: *Access to parking shall be from lanes or north-south service streets. When a property does not front a lane or north-south service street, parking may be accessed from east-west connecting streets or trust streets to allow access to parking from Zubley Street, which is an east-west street, because three of the variance criteria are met with the condition that the length of the parking entrance area and the ramp within the building be significantly shortened so that the pedestrian dead space created along Zubley Street is minimized.*

Keith Howington, petitioner, stated City traffic engineering will not allow drop off on Ann Street. He referenced the 2017 meeting minutes regarding the height of this project. He stated it was 79 feet at that time and deemed appropriate by some Board members. The petitioner stated it was lowered to 76 feet, and some on current Board still felt it was too tall. It is now reduced to 74 feet at the request of some Board members at the last (June) meeting. He stated there is nothing else to take away and still be in compliance with the floor minimum heights. He highlighted various building heights to indicate his effort to be iconic and visually compatible; the building is only three feet above the minimum. He stated he has done his diligence and requested approval of his petition. He assured that the vehicular court will be covered.

Public Comments: none.

Board Comments:

Ms. Isaacs stated she had no comments.

Mr. Dodge commended the petitioner for working with staff regarding the recommendations.

Ms. Memory stated she had no comments at this time.

Mr. Cook stated he previously had issue with the height of the building, however he now feels it is appropriate. He feels reducing the vehicular drive area is still an issue. He suggests the petitioner relocate some of the service functions of the building and the vehicular functions to make a better pedestrian experience and urban context by addressing Ann Street. He is open to approving the petition with these conditions.

Mr. Stephens stated he takes similar position as Mr. Cook, regarding concerns with service functions on Ann Street and minimize its foot traffic.

Chairperson Lynch stated she also has concern with Zubley Street, that the variance criteria have been met and functionality makes sense, but the drop off with ramp and wide panels create an unfriendly atmosphere. Ms. Lynch stated she has concerns with approving something with the condition of "significantly reducing the vehicular area". She stated she does not see progress, outside of asking for a variance, regarding the condition of a significant change of height and mass, and it may create issues in the future, if the Board agrees. It is a defining characteristic of the building as it's presented.

Mr. Howington asked if it should be changed to something specific rather than just

'significant'?

Chairperson Lynch replied she isn't sure. If the Board is in agreement, then a significant change may need to be made. Is it approval-appropriate?

Mr. Dodge stated he thinks the motion can address that.

Chairperson Lynch stated she wanted to make it a point of discussion before the motion is made; that approval is not granted because the intent is good, but because the design is appropriate.

Mr. Stephens stated the functionality is an issue; if it's modified too much to match, the functionality may be lost.

Mr. Dodge stated it may be as simple as moving all vehicular functions to Zublely Street and minimize length of vehicular traffic. This is what we were requesting at the last meeting, but now there's a variance request to be able to do it.

Chairperson Lynch stated staff recommended approval for the variance with the condition that this be modified. She stated she felt it needed to be addressed.

Mr. Howington stated they will work to reduce this. Stated they have to have a back of a building; will calculate to adjust to reduce. Traffic engineering will not allow traffic drop off on the back of Ann Street, but there will be limitations.

There were no additional comments from the Board. Chairperson Lynch requested a motion from the Board.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby:

Approve the request for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass of a six (6) story hotel at 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II: Design Details for review and approval by the Board:

1. Significantly shorten the length of the parking entrance area and the ramp within the building so that the pedestrian dead space created along Zublely Street is minimized and attempt to incorporate service functions from Ann Street within the Zublely Street façade;
2. Provide details for the through-wall HVAC systems;
3. Ensure the window sashes and door frames are inset not less than four (4) inches.

Recommend approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard that states: Access to parking shall be from lanes or north-south service streets. When a property does not front a lane or north-south service street, parking may be accessed from east-west connecting streets or trust streets to allow access to parking from Zublely Street, which is an east-west street, because three of the variance criteria are met with the condition that the length of the parking entrance area and the ramp within the building be significantly shortened so that the pedestrian dead space created along Zublely Street is minimized.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Scott Cook

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[23. Petition of Niles Bolton & Associates | 19-001562-COA | 415 East Oglethorpe Avenue | New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass](#)

🔗 [19-001562-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

🔗 [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

🔗 [Previous Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

🔗 [Additional Staff Research.pdf](#)

🔗 [Aerial.pdf](#)

🔗 [Crawford Ward.pdf](#)

🔗 [1980s Rendering.pdf](#)

🔗 [Police Barracks - built 1869.pdf](#)

🔗 [Old Jail - 1887.pdf](#)

Ms. Michalak presented the petitioner's continued request for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass to construct apartment buildings (four buildings per building code) on the vacant property located at 415 East Oglethorpe Avenue. Staff recommends approval of the New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass to construct apartment buildings on the vacant property located at 415 East Oglethorpe Avenue with the following condition to be submitted with Part II: Design Details to be reviewed by the Board because the proposed project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

Revise the west facades of both buildings so that the roof line variation does not exceed 60 linear feet.

Jeffery Smith, the petitioner, stated the tower was removed from the Habersham Street side and the northwest corner of the site. Also, the vertical element on the southwest corner was reduced. The window proportion was adjusted, still respecting the 15-foot bay spacing, in effort to differentiate from adjacent buildings. He stated he was not aware this may be new territory of requesting different massing devices pending different street frontages, as this one has four. If not acceptable, it can be addressed. Balcony recession on the top floor of five or six feet is another solution for vertical modification, as it is employed on the north façade of the building. The buildings are to be consistent with the

Police Barracks (across the street). Mr. Smith explained the visuals presented, requesting approval for multiple volumes as second massing device. Conditions regarding Part II are being addressed, such as the request of differentiation between Buildings 1 East and West, and Buildings 2 East and West. All of the façade details are being addressed.

Public Comments:

Rebecca Fenwick, representative of the Historic Savannah Foundation, stating they are to the City grateful for restoration of the lane and HSF's involvement. The petitioner used the suggested elements by HSF and staff to visually present multiple structures.

David McDonald, representing the Downtown Neighborhood Association, stated the height and mass is very large for the area as there are no other buildings comparable to it in the area. They will support Board decision.

Mr. Smith responded that the buildings have different characteristics utilizing various windows, bricks, color and sizing sympathetic to the Police Parracks in hopes they are moving in the direction of the Board's conditions.

Board Discussion:

Mr. Stephens commended the petitioner's efforts of compliance. He stated there is still a lot to consider and digest, but he is in favor of the direction it's heading.

Mr. Cook stated roofline variation would hurt the massing on the Habersham and Price Streets side of the building. He stated he is in favor of allowing the distinct masses. The renderings were very helpful in visualizing the mass distinctions. He stated he is in favor of the project.

Ms. Memory stated she is in favor in Mr. Cook's comments and complimented the petitioner's efforts.

Mr. Dodge stated he agreed with the other Board members comments and commended the petitioner's efforts to use multiple volumes.

Ms. Isaacs stated she still has concerns regarding the overall height of the Oglethorpe-facing building. She stated she agreed that materiality will go a long way in this project in breaking up different masses so it does not appear as one huge mass.

Chairperson Lynch agreed that the renderings helped with understanding the materiality and differentiation of the buildings. She then requested the Board for a motion.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass to construct apartment buildings on the vacant property located at 415 East Oglethorpe Avenue because the proposed project is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Scott Cook

Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell

- Not Present

Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[24. Petition of Julian Smith | 19-002887-COA | 134 Houston Street | Variance Request for Solar Panels](#)

- 📎 [19-002887-COA Recommendation.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Application - 134 Houston Street 19-002887-COA.pdf](#)
- 📎 [134 Houston Drawings.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Submittal Packet - 134 Houston Street 19-002887-COA.pdf](#)
- 📎 [variance request.pdf](#)
- 📎 [variance criteria.pdf](#)

Mr. Ryan Jarles presented the petitioner's request for approval of installation of photovoltaic panels on the roof of the 1925 main historic structure and the east facing roof of the 1963 addition at 134 Houston Street. There are 12 panels proposed to be installed on the flat roof portion of the 1925 historic main structure and 6 panels proposed to be installed on the east facing sloped roof portion of the 1963 addition. The panels are 5'-4" long, 3'-3" wide, and will rise 0'-10" above the roof line.

The petitioner also requested a variance from the standard that states:

-Alternative energy source devices, such as photo voltaic panels, may be permitted on new construction and non-historic buildings. Such devices may be permitted on historic buildings provided they are not visible from a street fronting elevation, excluding lanes.

This is to allow for the installation of photo voltaic panels on the roof of the historic contributing structure that will be visible from Houston Street, East Broad Street, and East York Street.

Staff has determined the panels will be visible from all three streets frontages. No supporting evidence was provided for the variance request for special conditions. Staff recommended denial for the installation of photo voltaic panels on the roof of the main historic structure and the east facing roof of the 1963 addition at 134 Houston Street because the preservation and design standards are not met, and the panel materials are not visually compatible with the materials of the historic building. Staff also recommended denial to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard that states:

-"Alternative energy source devices, such as photo voltaic panels, may be permitted on new construction and non-historic buildings. Such devices may be permitted on historic buildings provided they are not visible from a street fronting elevation, excluding lanes."

The variance criteria are not met and staff believes there is a better location for the panels.

Mr. Julian Smith, petitioner, stated there are two historic oak trees close to the property that

they don't want to cut down, thus the reason for the petition and variance request. They are trying to be as least intrusive as possible, and want to put the solar panels in another place but cannot. He stated York Street is one way and the panels will not be visible from that direction on the street. He stated there are drawn renderings that were submitted but not presented. There is already a 6-inch parapet existing, and though the panels will rise 10 inches, it will not be visible, as the panels will be 2 feet from the parapet. The panels would be visible walking down York Street.

Public Comment:

Ms. Leslie Anton, of the Beehive Foundation of Savannah, stated the two-foot recessed area around the solar panels is shown on the drawing on page four of the submittal packet. She said it's more recessed than the original drawing.

Board Discussion:

Ms. Isaacs stated she had no comment.

Mr. Dodge stated he does not see a problem with panels on the flat part of the roof with the barricade. Those on the back, though visible from the street and not meeting the requirement of the ordinance, he would support the petitioner's request for a variance. He stated he does not know how the system is sized or if they are even necessary.

Ms. Memory stated she had no comment at this time.

Mr. Cook stated he would not be in favor of allowing a variance because there is not enough information. He stated the rendering does not reassure that the panels are going to come out. The petitioner cannot prove they will not be visible from the site line on the street; there's not enough information in the submittal packet to discern that. Those ones on east end are an absolute no; though its a 1960s addition, but both parts are now contributing structures. He hopes there is room for panels on the south end of the building. He would like the petitioner to come back with more information.

Mr. Stephens stated the east side of the building is an absolute 'no'. If information could be provided to show the site lines would not reveal the panels on the flat part of the roof, that may be acceptable.

Ms. Isaacs stated she'd like to see renderings that would indicate what can and cannot be seen. She stated she'd be in favor of putting them on the flat roof portion if they are not visible. She stated her research shows full sun on the south end of the building and recommends considering that, as she definitely is not in favor of the east side.

Mr. Dodge stated he had no additional comments.

Ms. Memory stated she agrees with the Board's comments. However, she is sympathetic to making the building energy efficient, but it does not agree with the ordinance.

Mr. Cook and **Mr. Stephens** stated they had no comments.

Chairperson Lynch reminded the Board that this is not an application for approval, but to approve to request a variance.

Ms. Michalak stated an approval cannot be granted without a recommendation for a variance. Staff does not agree that the panels will not be visible from the main front of the

building. Staff has worked extensively with the petitioner, however no concrete evidence has been provided otherwise. She believes screening or the like will significantly change the roof form of the mansard roof. Solar panels are being requested and the ordinance strictly prohibits them, therefore a variance is being requested. If this Board does not deny, then Zoning Board of Appeals can approve the variance request. If the Board denies the solar panels, the petitioner could appeal the Board's decision rather than a variance request.

Chairperson Lynch requested a motion from the Board.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby deny the petition for the installation of photovoltaic panels on the roof of the main historic structure and the east facing roof of the 1963 addition at 134 Houston Street because the preservation and design standards are not met, and the panel materials are not visually compatible with the materials of the historic building.

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review recommends denial to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard that states:

Alternative energy source devices, such as photo voltaic panels, may be permitted on new construction and non-historic buildings. Such devices may be permitted on historic buildings provided they are not visible from a street fronting elevation, excluding lanes.

Because the variance criteria are not met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs

Second: Scott Cook

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Nay
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[25. Petition of Homeline Architecture | 19-003463-COA | 109 East Jones Street | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass](#)

📎 [Part I Drawings.pdf](#)

📎 [aerial map.pdf](#)

📎 [Application - 109 East Jones Street 19-003463-COA.pdf](#)

📎 [Submittal Packet - 109 East Jones Street 19-003463-COA.pdf](#)

📎 [19-003463-COA Recommendation.pdf](#)

Mr. Ryan Jarles presented the petitioner's request for approval for New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass for a 2-story carriage house at 109 East Jones Street, constructed in 1853. A privacy fence is proposed on top of an existing courtyard wall. Two sections of existing brick walls on the east and west property lines will be demolished.

Staff recommends approval for New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass for a 2-story carriage house with the following conditions to be provided with New Construction, Part II: Design Details for review by the Board, because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible:

1. Provide locations for electric meter and refuse storage areas;
2. locate aprons within the garage;
3. reduce the height of the fence to 11'-0";
4. inset the doors and windows 0'-3"; and
5. ensure that the distances between the balusters not exceed 4 inches and the height of the railing does not exceed 36 inches.

Josh Bull, of Greenline Architecture, stated they will comply with any conditions set forth by staff.

Public Comment: none.

Board discussion: none.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass for a 2-story carriage house with the following conditions to be provided with New Construction, Part II: Design Details for review by the Board, because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible:

1. Provide locations for electric meter and refuse storage areas;
2. Locate aprons within the garage;
3. Reduce the height of the fence to 11'-0";
4. Inset the doors and windows 0'-3";
5. Ensure that the distances between the balusters not exceed 4 inches and the height of the railing does not exceed 36 inches.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kevin Dodge

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present

Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[26. Petition of Loan Tran | 19-003465-COA | 37 Whitaker Street | After-the-Fact Amendments & Variance Request](#)

- 📎 [19-003465-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Staff Site Visit Photographs.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Approved COA Submittal Packet - 11-3-17.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Approved COA Decision - 11-8-17.pdf](#)
- 📎 [10-16-18 Stamped Permit Drawings.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Letter from Electrician.pdf](#)
- 📎 [2016 Street Views.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Previous email and rendering about color change.pdf](#)

Ms. Alyson Smith presented the petitioner's request for after-the-fact approval for amendments to the previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness issued on November 8, 2017 for alterations to the property located at 37 Whitaker Street [File No. 17-005990-COA]. There were inconsistencies found on June 11, 2019, which prompts this petition.

Staff recommended after-the-fact approval for amendments to the previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness issued on November 8, 2017 for alterations to the property located at 37 Whitaker Street [File No. 17-005990-COA] with the following condition to be confirmed by staff in the field before the COA inspection is approved because the amendments are otherwise visually compatible and meet the standard: to remove the black paint from the exterior of the lane window glass.

Staff recommended approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the following standard:

Additions shall be constructed with the least possible loss of historic building material and without damaging or obscuring character-defining features of the building, including, but not limited to, rooflines, cornices, eaves, brackets.

To allow the after-the-fact amendments to remain in place as currently installed as described in Items #2 and 3 with the following condition to be confirmed by staff in the field before the COA inspection is approved because two of the variance criteria are met: remove the black paint from the exterior of the lane window glass.

Mr. Dana Braun, representative for the petitioner, Loan Tran, stated they agree with and willing to comply with staff's recommendation. He stated the electrical boxes are as far from Whitaker Street as possible. (Pictures were shown.)

Ms. Isaacs asked what will be seen when the black paint is removed from the windows.

Mr. Braun replied the back of the code-mandated firewall will be visible. The window was painted to obscure it. It is drywall with visible studs.

Ms. Isaacs asked if the window could be frosted.

Ms. Michalak stated the ordinance reads the windows should be transparent, thus the request to remove the paint from the existing window.

Public Comment: none.

Board Discussion:

Ms. Isaacs stated she agrees the black paint should be removed, but would like a frosting added to the window, recognizing that would require an additional variance.

Mr. Dodge stated he agreed a spray frosted coating that is reversible may be acceptable, rather than seeing a studded wall.

Ms. Memory asked if an insert behind the window sashes would be easier and acceptable.

Mr. Cook stated he is in favor of the variance to obscure the window, but should leave it because tenants change. He stated he thinks the black paint should be removed and leave it as it is, the electric panel is covering most of the glass. He stated he's rather see transparent than black painted glass because there will be a panel over most of it; one sees worse in lanes. Regarding the marble, the base going around helps a lot. It still reads as a storefront, and is supportive of the amendment.

Mr. Stephens agreed with supporting the amendment regarding the storefront being wrapped in wood and the header across the door. He stated he still struggles with the window issue. He feels there are few options and is concerned more with the studs showing through the window than the black paint. He suggested a matching shade rather than frosting or paint, so the rhythm is still there and reads as a window.

Ms. Michalak stated a variance would still be required.

The Board had no further comments. Chairman Lynch requested a motion from the Board. She stated though she was not voting, she recommends leaving the window transparent.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for After-the-fact approval for amendments to the previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness issued on November 8, 2017 for alterations to the property located at 37 Whitaker Street [File No. 17-005990-COA] with the following condition to be confirmed by staff in the field before the COA inspection is approved because the amendments are otherwise visually compatible and meet the standards:

1. Remove the black paint from the exterior of the lane window glass.

Recommend approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the following standard:

Additions shall be constructed with the least possible loss of historic building material and without damaging or obscuring character-defining features of the building, including, but not limited to, rooflines, cornices, eaves, brackets.

To allow the after-the-fact amendments to remain in place as currently installed as described in Items #2 and 3 with the following condition to be confirmed by staff in the field before the COA inspection is approved because two of the variance criteria are met:

1.Remove the black paint from the exterior of the lane window glass.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens

Second: Kevin Dodge

Debra Caldwell	- Not Present
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

IX. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

[27. Petition of James Kirton | 19-002966-COA | 109 West Perry Street | Staff Approved - Siding and Downspout Repairs](#)

📎 [COA - 104 West Broughton Street 19-000296-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

[28. Petition of Savannah Blinds | 19-3160-COA | 310 West St. Julian Street | Staff Approved - Awning](#)

📎 [COA - 310 West St. Julian Street 19-003160-COA.pdf](#)

📎 [Submittal Packet - 310 West St. Julian Street 19-003160-COA.jpg](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

[29. Petition of Jason Bartek | 19-003179-COA | 317 East Jones Street | Staff Approved - Window Repairs and Color Change](#)

📎 [COA - 317 East Jones Street 19-003179-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

[30. Petition of Heritage Construction Savannah, Inc. | 19-003186-COA | 210 Whitaker Street | Staff Approved - Stucco Repairs and Color Change](#)

📎 [COA - 210 Whitaker Street 19-003186-COA.pdf](#)

📎 [Submittal Packet - 210 Whitaker Street 19-003186-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

[31. Petition of Paul Sunderland | 19-003390-COA | 207 West Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

📎 [COA - 207 West Broughton Street 19-003390-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

[32. Petition of Helen Morgan for SCAD | 19-003394-COA | 217 Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard | Staff Approved - Window Replacement](#)

📎 [COA - 217 MLK Jr. Blvd 19-003394-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

[33. Petition of Helen Morgan for SCAD | 19-003396-COA | 228 Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard | Staff Approved - Window Replacements](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

[34. Petition of Helen Morgan for SCAD | 19-003401-COA | 115 East York Street | Staff Approved - Window Replacements](#)

📎 [COA - 115 East York Street 19-003401-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

[35. Petition of Heath Shelton for EH Fortitude | 19-003403-COA | 552 East Liberty Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

📎 [COA-19-003403-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

[36. Petition of Doug Bean for Doug Bean Signs, Inc. | 19-003407-COA | 101 West Liberty Street | Staff Approved - Sign](#)

📎 [COA - 101 West Liberty Street 19-003407-COA.pdf](#)

📎 [Submittal Packet - 101 West Liberty St..pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

[37. Petition of Donnie Rushing | 19-003432-COA | 207 East River Street | Staff Approved - Awning](#)

📎 [COA - 207 East River Street 19-003432-COA.pdf](#)

📎 [Submittal Packet - 207 East River Street 19-003432-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

[38. Amended Petition of Keith Howington for Greenline Architecture | 19-003434-COA | 630 West Bay Street | Staff Approved - Design for New Parking Garage](#)

📎 [COA - 630 West Bay Street 19-003434-COA.pdf](#)

📎 [Submittal Packet - 630 West Bay Street 19-003434-COA.pdf](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

[39. Petition of Charles Morgensen | 19-003580-COA | 206-208 W. Gwinnett Street | Staff Approved - Color Change](#)

No action required. Staff approved.

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

[40. Report on Work Performed Without a COA for the July 10, 2019 HDBR Meeting](#)

[7-10-2019 HDBR Report on Work Without a COA.pdf](#)

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

[41. July Report on Stamped Drawings for HDBR](#)

[JULY REPORT.pdf](#)

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

[42. New COA Application and Checklists](#)

[HDBR Application-2019 \(revised 7-2019\).pdf](#)

[Checklist - Additions, Board Reviews \(created 7-2019\).pdf](#)

[Checklist - Demolition, Board Reviews \(created 7-2019\).pdf](#)

[Checklist - Fences, Board Reviews \(created 7-2019\).pdf](#)

[Checklist - New Construction Part I, Board Reviews \(created 7-2019\).pdf](#)

[Checklist - New Construction Part II, Board Reviews \(created 7-2019\).pdf](#)

[Checklist - Rehabilitation and Alterations, Board Reviews \(created 7-2019\).pdf](#)

[Checklist - Signs, Board Reviews \(created 7-2019\).pdf](#)

[Checklist - All Staff Reviews \(created 7-2019\).pdf](#)

[City of Savannah - Applications and Checklists Website.pdf](#)

[HB 493 effective 070119.pdf](#)

[HB 493 Summary.pdf](#)

Ms. Michalak informed the Board of the new process of a checklist attached with applications, per House Bill 293. This is to keep application process timely and accurate, eliminating completeness checks. If the checklist and its needed items are not provided at submission, it will be rejected. Applications and checklists will be available online also. The Savannah-Chatham County Historic Preservation Department has implemented the process that is to take effect August 14, 2019.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to amend application policy to combine Part 1 and Part 2 for carriage houses.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Scott Cook

Second: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell - Not Present

Kellie Fletcher - Not Present

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Scott Cook - Aye

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

[43. Update on Ordinance Amendments](#)

[44. Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting - Thursday, July 18, 2019 at 3:30 p.m. in the Meyer Conference Room, MPC 110 East State Street](#)

[45. Next Pre-Meeting - Wednesday, August 14, 2019 at 12:00 p.m. in the Jerry Surrency Room, MPC, 112 East State Street](#)

[46. Next Regular Meeting - Wednesday, August 14, 2019 at 1:00 p.m. in the Arthur Mendonsa Room, MPC, 112 East State Street](#)

[47. Alternate Meeting Location - Location to be Determined](#)

XV. ADJOURNMENT

[48. Adjourned](#)

There being no further business to present before the Board, Chairperson Lynch adjourned the July 10, 2019 Historic Board of Review meeting at 3:51 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Leah Michalak
Director of Historic Preservation
/bf

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.