

Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room March 13, 2019 1:00 p.m. Meeting Minutes

MARCH 13, 2019 SAVANNAH HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW REGULAR MEETING

A Pre-Meeting will be held at 12:00 PM in the Jerry Surrency Conference Room, 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda will be presented by Staff, as time permits, and the Board may ask questions. No testimony will be received and no votes will be taken.

Members Present: Becky Lynch, Chair

Dwayne Stephens, Vice-Chair

David Altschiller Kevin Dodge Kellie Fletcher Stan Houle Ellie Isaacs Melissa Memory Nan Taylor

Members Absent: Debra Caldwell

Scott Cook

MPC Staff Present: Ellen Harris, Director of Urban Planning and Historic Preservation

Leah Michalak, Senior Historic Preservation Planner

Alyson Smith, Historic Preservation Planner Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

1. Call to Order and Welcome

Ms. Lynch called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. She outlined the role of the Historic District Board of Review and explained the process for hearing the various petitions. Staff will present each application with a recommendation. The petitioner will have the opportunity to respond to the recommendation. The petitioners are asked to limit their presentation to 10 minutes or less and only address the items identified as inconsistent with the ordinance and questions raised by the Board. The public will have the same allotted time, 10 minutes, to comment. The petitioner will be given the opportunity to respond to the public comments.

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

2. Petition of Coastal Canvas | 19-000329-COA | 319 West Broughton Street | Sign

Staff Recommendation.pdf

Submittal Packet.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a principal use fascia sign at 319 West Broughton Street with the following condition:

•Ensure the total sign area does not exceed 20 square feet.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: David Altschiller

Kellie Fletcher - Aye - Abstain Becky Lynch **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

3. Petition of Thomas A. Colgrove | 19-000499-COA | 215 Tattnall Street | Alterations

- ∅ 19-000499-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition to alter the lane facing façade for the lane building located at 215 Tattnall Street with the following conditions provided to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Ensure that the steel has a smooth finish and not a faux wood grain finish.
- 2. Provide a specification for the pedestrian door; ensure that it is wood, clad wood, glass, or steel.
- 3. Ensure that both doors are inset not less than 3 inches from the façade.
- 4.Ensure that the exterior finish is a true stucco and not an E.I.F.S. or other stucco-alternative product.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: David Altschiller

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor - Aye

Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

4. Petition of Sinisa Domazet | 19-000884-COA | 325 Bull Street | Signs

- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Staff Recommendation.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for two principal use fascia signs at 325 Bull Street because the proposed signs are visually compatible and meet the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: David Altschiller

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

5. Petition of Doug Bean Signs, Inc. | 19-000891-COA | 405 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd | Signs

- HSMC Murals.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for multiple signs for the new building under construction at 405 MLK, Jr. Blvd because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: David Altschiller

Kellie Fletcher - Aye
Becky Lynch - Abstain

Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

6. Petition of Adventure Tours in Motion | 19-000906-COA | 12 West State Street | Sign

- Staff Recommendation .pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a principal use projecting sign at 12 West State Street with the following conditions:

- 1.Relocate the sign next to the southeast edge of the building and the easternmost second floor window.
- 2. Ensure an encroachment permit is obtained from the City.
- 3. Ensure the sign projects no further than six feet.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: David Altschiller

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain - Aye **Dwayne Stephens** Melissa Memory - Aye David Altschiller - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

7. Petition of Roy Ogletree | 19-000908-COA | 34 Barnard Street | Signs

- Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for two signs and a color change for the property located at 34 Barnard Street with the following condition because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

-Ensure that the bolts proposed to be installed into the brick to mount the projecting sign are installed in the mortar joints and not in any brick faces.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: David Altschiller

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

8. Petition of the City of Savannah | 19-000933-COA | 201 Montgomery Street | Sign

- Submittal Package 201 Montgomery Street CAC Signage 19-000933-COA.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for signage at 201 Montgomery Street because the proposed sign is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: David Altschiller

Kellie Fletcher - Aye - Abstain Becky Lynch **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

9. Adopt March 13, 2019 Agenda

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the adoption of the March 13, 2019 agenda.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs

Second: Dwayne Stephens

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye David Altschiller - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

10. Approve February 13, 2019 Briefing Minutes and February 13, 2019 Regular Minutes

February 13, 2019 HBR Briefing Minutes.docx

@02-13-2019 Minutes.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve February 13, 2019 Briefing Minutes and February 13, 2019 Regular Minutes

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle Second: Ellie Isaacs

Kellie Fletcher - Aye - Abstain Becky Lynch **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

11. Petition of Verizon Wireless | 19-000215-COA | 102 East Liberty Street | Telecommunications Equipment

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to withdraw the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs

Second: David Altschiller

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

12. Petition of Greenline Architecture | 17-002904-COA | 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue to the petition to the next meeting as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

13. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006851-COA | 620 East River Street (Hilton Hotel) | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

14. Petition of Gunn, Meyerhoff, Shay | 17-002122-COA | 620 East River Street (Hotel Anne) | New Construction Part 1: Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye David Altschiller - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

15. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects | 17-003634-COA | 300 and 326 West Bay Street | New Construction Hotel: Part I, Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Kellie Fletcher - Aye - Abstain Becky Lynch **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

16. Petition of General Services Administration | 17-006639-COA | 124 Barnard Street | New Construction Part 2: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

17. Petition of LS3P Associates Ltd. | 18-005087-COA | 110 Ann Street | New Construction Hotel: Part II, Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher

Second: Ellie Isaacs Kellie Fletcher - Aye - Abstain Becky Lynch **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

18. Petition of LS3P Associates | 18-005088-COA | 111 Ann Street | New Construction, Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

19. Petition of Savannah WOB LLC | 18-005590-COA | 112 West Broughton Street | Signs

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Kellie Fletcher - Aye
Becky Lynch - Abstain
Dwayne Stephens - Aye
Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

20. Petition of Felder & Associates | 18-005781-COA | 323 East Broughton Street and 115 Habersham Street | Addition and New Construction: Part II, Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye David Altschiller - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

21. Petition of LS3P | 18-006314-COA | 2 Whitaker Street | Demolition and New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Kellie Fletcher - Aye

Becky Lynch - Abstain

Dwayne Stephens - Aye

Melissa Memory - Aye

David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor - Aye

Kevin Dodge - Aye

Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

22. Petition of SHEDDarchitecture | 18-006335-COA | 504 East Liberty Street | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

23. Petition of SHEDDarchitecture | 18-006336-COA | 514-524 East Liberty Street | New Construction Part II Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye

Ellie Isaacs - Aye

24. Petition of Drayton Tower | 19-000322-COA | 102 East Liberty Street | Window Signs

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

25. Petition of Lutra Savannah 2, LLC | 19-000907-COA | 224 Houston Street | Signs

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Ellie Isaacs

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Aye **David Altschiller** - Aye Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

VIII. REGULAR AGENDA

26. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006852-COA | 630 East River Street | New Construction (Parking Garage): Amendment to Part I, Height and Mass

- Aerial.pdf
- New Franklin Ward Wharf Lots MAP B.pdf
- ∅ 16-006852-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Mr. Patrick Shay was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for amendments to New Construction: Part 1, Height and Mass for a 7-story parking garage (formerly 9-stories) to be located on the vacant parcel at 630 East River Street. The amendment includes: an overall building height reduction from 9-stories to 7-stories. This is an 8-story height zone; the petitioner is no longer seeking a bonus story but still maintains some active uses on the ground floor.

Ms. Michalak said due to the size and significance of this project, it was previously decided (in 2012) by the Review Board that the Part I, Height and Mass review would be considered in two phases. Phase A would consider height, proportion of structure's front façade, rhythm of structures on the street (setbacks and any parking standards that affect setbacks), massing including recesses and scale. Phase B would consider proportion of openings, rhythm of solids to voids, entrances and balcony/porch rhythm, any parking standards that may affect these openings or entrances, walls of continuity, and roof shape. Directional character would be considered by both the building form and openings and applies to both Part I and II reviews. This review includes both Part A and Part B.

Ms. Michalak stated that this building is in the northeast corner of the Savannah Historic District. It is, roughly, triangular-shaped and has frontage along both River Street and General McIntosh Boulevard. The vehicular entrance is along River Street and there is a secondary automobile egress along General McIntosh Boulevard. The footprint of the building is 19,375 square feet.

Ms. Michalak reported that staff recommends approval for amendments to New Construction: Part 1, Height and Mass for a 7-story parking garage (formerly 9-stories) to be located on the vacant parcel at 630 East River Street with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II Design Details:

- 1. The subdivision of the parcel between the two proposed buildings (parking garage and hotel to the north) is approved.
- 2. Ensure the curb cut at River Street for the entrance/exit does not exceed 20 feet in width.
- 3. Provide HVAC screening, should they be visible from the public right-of-way.

Because the project otherwise meets the design standards and is visually compatible.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Shay came forward and explain that their client has decided to eliminate the parking from the project because the City of Savannah withdrew their support. The client cannot afford to build the public parking by themselves. They are eliminating two stories from the building. Mr. Shay stated that they have no problems with the staff's conditions.

Mr. Dodge asked Mr. Shay that with the changes, what is the proposed use for the bottom floor?

Mr. Shay answered that presently they are looking at two potential uses. Their client is considering moving their corporate office to the street level, but this is not definite.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation [HSF] said he appreciates and understand the change which facilitated the reduction of the building, but he wanted to ask the petitioner some questions for better understanding going forward. They are pleased to see that the building will be much smaller; they also believe that this will work better. However, the credit aspect is interesting. If things come up such as this in the future, it would help them to understand where they are negotiating from. What are the realities that exist that will allow them to say that maybe it could be smaller? The reduction is somewhat substantial, however, it is an improvement. He knows that this is not controlled by the petitioner, but is controlled by an outside force, which

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room March 13, 2019 1:00 p.m. Meeting Minutes

in this case is the City. Would there be any other impacts with the reduction on adjacent venues, such as Trustees Garden? Mr. Carey said he realizes that this is not the petitioner's concern to resolve this, but this is becoming a popular area. His general concern is that as a citizen, he is wondering how this would impact the public to come and enjoy the venues in this area if there is a reduction in parking. It would be helpful if the petitioner could share insights on this aspect.

Mr. Shay, in response to public comments, said the parking structure is going to provide all of the parking for this complex as stated in the master plan that they have followed since 2012. The parking structure that is here provides enough parking for four hotels, which will later be located here. When the master plan was presented to the City, the developer was told that they would do the same thing for them that was done for the project at the west end of River Street, which is the JW Marriott project, owned by Richard Kessler. He explained that the City participated in what he calls credit enhancements. Basically, the City helped to guarantee the financing in exchange of access to approximately 200 public parking spaces at that end of the river. Therefore, they were persuaded that if they did the same thing here, the City would participate in a similar way. But, with the caveat that it would only happen with a commitment for a full-service Hilton Hotel on the Riverfront. Mr. Shay said they dutifully came back before the Review Board and went through approximately a year long process in order to get the height and mass approved for the full service Hilton Hotel. They, then, went back to the City. They believed that they would be able to continue with the larger structure, but not without that bulk of the financing as it is not possible for the developer to fund the AC Hotel with all of the cost for the parking for the entire area, plus 150 or more parking spaces.

Mr. Shay explained by the zoning, no parking is required; this is a B-B zone. But, it does not make sense to spend a quarter of a million dollars on developing hotels in this area and not having a way for people to park. It will be entirely a valet parking garage here. Therefore, there will not be access for the general public unless they participate through valet.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board was appreciative that the building height was reduced from 9-stories to 7-stories. They agreed with the staff's recommendations.

Motion

Staff recommends approval for amendments to New Construction: Part 1, Height and Mass for a 7-story parking garage (formerly 9-stories) to be located on the vacant parcel at 630 East River Street with the following conditions to be submitted with Part II Design Details:

- 1. The subdivision of the parcel between the two proposed buildings (parking garage and hotel to the north) is approved.
- 2.Ensure the curb cut at River Street for the entrance/exit does not exceed 20 feet in width.
- 3. Provide HVAC screening, should they be visible from the public right-of-way.

Because the project otherwise meets the design standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kellie Fletcher Second: Kevin Dodge

Kellie Fletcher - Aye
Becky Lynch - Abstain
Dwayne Stephens - Aye
Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye

Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Nay

- 27. Petition of Lott Barber | 18-006769-COA | 145 Montgomery Street | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass
 - ∅ 18-006769-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
 - Submittal Packet- Drawings sm.pdf
 - Submittal Packet- Narrative.pdf
 - Submittal Packet- Comparison renderings.pdf
 - Submittal Packet- presentation.pdf
 - Mr. Todd Naugle was present on behalf of the petition.
 - **Ms. Ellen Harris** gave the staff report. The petitioner is requesting approval for New Construction: Part I Height and Mass, of the Chatham County Courthouse Expansion building on the south end of the property at 145 Montgomery Street. The new building is a monumental structure with a contemporary design expression and the principal entrance is located on Oglethorpe Avenue.
 - **Ms.** Harris gave the following background data: A similar petition was reviewed by the Historic District Board of Review on September 12, 2012 (12-000373-COA) and was approved with conditions. The approval was extended once, then subsequently expired. The petition for demolition of the Chatham County Jail was approved in 2012 and again in September 2017 (17-004984-COA). It was demolished earlier this year. It was not a contributing building. She explained that the petition for Part I Height and Mass was reviewed by the HDBR on January 9, 2019 and was continued in order for the petitioner to consider the following:
 - -Eliminate the recesses and revise the square window configuration on the east and west elevations.

The condition has been met.

-Revise the ground floor window configuration on the north elevation.

The condition has been met.

-Incorporate voids into the east and west facades of the protruding portion of the north section of the building.

The condition has not been met. The petitioner states that, "We looked at adding windows to the east and west sides of the protruding portion of the north section of the building, but believe these façade elements read better without openings. The walls set back approximately 16' from the main edge of the building and are not readily visible from the street."

-Revise the design to better address MLK and Montgomery Streets, if not through additional entrances, then through other design features.

The condition has been met.

-Provide a more vertical expression.

The condition has been met.

-Provide additional subdivision of the building into base, middle and top, particularly on the north, east and west elevations.

The condition has been met.

-Revise the building to reestablish a more urban form and footprint. Reduce or eliminate the setbacks, allowing the portico and steps to encroach on the public right of way, if necessary. Consider greater height to offset a reduced footprint.

The condition has not been met. The petitioner states that, "the design of the Courthouse has each façade as

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room March 13, 2019 1:00 p.m. Meeting Minutes

close to the property edge as possible. Existing and proposed utilities and city alterations at the intersection of Oglethorpe and Montgomery do not allow the construction to get closer to the street. We cannot add height and only build on one side of the lane. This would create a poorly functioning 10 story building."

-Reconstruct York Lane. Consider reconstructing York Street. Do not bridge the lane by development.

The condition has been partially met. York Street is proposed to be reconstructed but York Lane is proposed to be built over. The petitioner states that, "We cannot reconstruct York Lane. This makes the entire property unusable as a courthouse. We can and will be creating the appearance of York Lane going into and through the building. Since this building sees heavy public traffic, we feel this would be a great opportunity to convey to the public through multiple displays in the atrium the history of Savannah, Oglethorpe's plan and the homage the atrium pays to the former York Lane."

Ms. Harris stated that the proposed site is located on two tithing blocks in the southwest corner of Liberty Ward. Liberty Square, once the centerpiece of the ward, was established in 1799. In 1935, the square was opened to vehicular traffic when Montgomery Street was realigned as part of the development of Highway 17. The ward configuration remained otherwise intact. Sanborn Maps indicate that this area was once rather densely developed with two to four story masonry residences by 1916. By 1954, more commercial had replaced residential along Oglethorpe Avenue. By 1973, most of the north tithing block had been demolished. The Chatham County Jail was built on the site in 1978 along with the existing courthouse and parking garage to create a civic complex, of sorts. Highway 17 was eventually rerouted which allowed for the restoration of Franklin Square to the north in 1985. Newspaper articles, public forums, even the establishment of The Liberty Square Restoration Society have also called for the restoration of Liberty Square.

Ms. Harris said another major alteration to Liberty Ward occurred in the 1990s when Oglethorpe Avenue was realigned. This alteration shifted the Oglethorpe Avenue right-of-way to the north, effectively encroaching into a significant portion of the tithing block. The existing historic context is extremely eroded. There are small scale contributing residences along York Street and more commercial buildings on Broughton Street. The only contributing monumental building within the context is the former BPA Synagogue (now the SCAD Student Center) at 120 Montgomery Street. The only large-scale development is the Slotin Building at 101 MLK and 217 MLK Blvd., both built as commercial warehouses.

Ms. Harris explained that the petition also includes a variance request from the standard which states, "Streets and Lanes. Development shall preserve or reconstruct the historic ward pattern of streets and lanes within the Oglethorpe Plan Area bounded by the centerline of the following streets: Gaston Street on the South, Bay Street on the North, Martin Luther King, Jr., Boulevard on the West, and East Broad Street on the East as shown in Figure 2. Streets and lanes shall not be bridged by development, except on Factor's Walk." The building is divided into two distinct masses, one on each of the tithing blocks, and are connected by a four-story glass hyphen, serving as an atrium, at the former location of York Lane, setback approximately 20 feet from the east and west facades. The building is oriented to Oglethorpe Avenue and features a prominent three-story portico entrance.

Ms. Harris reported that staff recommends approval of Part I: Height and Mass provided that a variance is received in order to build over York Lane, because the building is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

Ms. Harris additionally reported that staff recommends approval of the variance which states: "Streets and Lanes. Development shall preserve or reconstruct the historic ward pattern of streets and lanes within the Oglethorpe Plan Area bounded by the centerline of the following streets: Gaston Street on the South, Bay Street on the North, Martin Luther King, Jr., Boulevard on the West, and East Broad Street on the East as shown in Figure 2. Streets and lanes shall not be bridged by development, except on Factor's Walk."

Because the variance criteria have been met.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Naugle said they understand and respect the Oglethorpe Plan. As Ms. Harris pointed out during her presentation, there has been a lot of deterioration of Liberty Ward; especially the tithing block that this site sits on. This is a very difficult site, but this is a needed structure for the County. They will be respectful to the original plan. They consider the current design and the use of a transparent a 4-story

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room March 13, 2019 1:00 p.m. Meeting Minutes

atrium at the same location of York Street Lane, a very strong visual representation of the past urban plan. It is not a street, but it will hearken back and it will be very visually dramatic, while at the same time achieving their client's goal for the county and the city. He said in addition to the improvements made to their past design submission that Ms. Harris presented, they will also highlight a few things that maybe aren't as apparent in her presentation.

Mr. Naugle said regarding the additional emphasis on the lane, they have additionally taken and actually recessed the vertical atrium face even further back and greater emphasized the masses. He said they have additionally taken the glass, the vertical face of the atrium, all the way down to grade. Previously, it was about four feet aligned with the granite base. Therefore, further emphasizing the presence of the urban plan. Mr. Naugle said lastly they have a plan that through hardscaping, they will make York Street appear to extend through the site. Further, the county is investigating what's required, as Ms. Harris pointed out, to improve upon what was York Street that will still be a pedestrian thoroughfare, but improve upon what is seen now. The plan is to continue going east and west to MLK, but will be much more pleasing with benches and landscaping.

Mr. Naugle said he would touch upon the two items that they did not address. He said one in particular is the Board's previous request to consider greater height, but only use one tithing block. He explained that as Ms. Harris pointed out, there are a lot of logistics at their site. They have an existing electrical transformer on the east side of Montgomery Street that dictates how far they can build to the east. There are utilities surrounding the site that keep them from putting the Oglethorpe porch further beyond the property line. As shown in their packet, they have studied the idea of the taller massing building on the north side of the site between the lane and the former York Street, which resulted in a 10-story building, 154 feet in height. In their opinion, this is the worse abomination of the design in the Historic District. In keeping with the district, the monumental building was made more urban.

Mr. Naugle introduced Jim Bates and said that Mr. Bates will emphasize the current uses in the existing courthouse. This new courthouse will not replace everything that is in the current courthouse. The building is being designed to fulfill the county's needs for the future.

Mr. Jim Bates came forward and said at the last meeting, questions surfaced about what would happen to the existing courthouse. The current courthouse is grossly overcrowded. There will be some vacant space that will allow for the expansion of courts in the future. The courthouse will be actively utilized by the courts. As Mr. Naugle has said, they believe this will be a very strong image building as you come into the City of Savannah. It will be at the crossroads of the Historic District coming in from South Carolina on Highway 17. A powerful elevation is on the south side with the colonnade. They can not make the lane work.

Mr. Bates said their goal is to take the exterior materials that are seen as you approach the 4-story glass atrium and carry them through the atrium. This will be in line with buildings such as the Jepson Center. The idea is it reads as two separate buildings, separated by the glass hyphen in the interior as well as the exterior. They will further illustrate this in their Part 2 submission. Today, they are seeking approval of the height and mass for this important civic building which is important to the county and will be in the City of Savannah. This will be a gateway into the City and he believes the entire county will be proud of this building. Mr. Bates entertained questions from the Board.

Mr. Houle asked because this is a courthouse, will the atrium area be secured so that persons not doing business would not have access through here.

Mr. Bates answered that any member of the public could enter the building from Oglethorpe Avenue and go through security just as they do now from Montgomery Street. They want this to be as transparent as it possibly can.

Ms. Fletcher questioned the transparency aspect. Will this glass be bullet proof?

Mr. Bates answered that bullet proof glass can be clear. They have not gotten to that level of detail at this time. Their sheriff department could have some concerns with this. This issue will be discussed further with the Board when they return.

Ms. Lynch stated in the comparison renderings, the petitioners show a bird's eye view of the building.

Will the roof materials on the hyphen be solid or transparent?

Mr. Bates answered that the roof will be a mixture of both.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Robert Rosenwald of the Downtown Neighborhood Association [DNA] said they usually agree with the staff's recommendations, but in this case they do not agree. The DNA does not believe that the closure of York Lane should be approved. This reminds him of when the federal government came in and designed the Federal Courthouse Annex on President Street and Telfair Square. This, too, started with an atrium that covered President Street. They have now changed this as it will only be on one trust lot; President Street will remain open. He has heard a lot of commentary about the atrium will be reminiscent of York Lane, but actually and physically York Lane in his opinion is still do-able. Mr. Rosenwald said he heard the comments about the mechanical and electrical issues. He saw that the single building has to be 10-stories. But, he believes that some other things have not been considered.

Mr. Rosenwald stated that the current courthouse while it is not attractive to him, but a story or two could be added to this building. For example, the side that fronts Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard is setback from the lot line. Has any consideration been given to adding to the building in this area? This will dress up the building and also add more space. They could recreate York Street with a sidewalk pedestrian area and York Lane could go where it is supposed to be. The area between York and Oglethorpe Avenue could become a park. There would be greenspace where we have none and this would recreate York Lane. He said, for him, the City of Savannah and the federal government have started to try to recreate the Oglethorpe Plan with the opportunity of President Street. There is the Police Lot on East Oglethorpe Avenue and Price Street that was sent back to the drawing board that now will enable Oglethorpe Lane to come back. He said it will be a shame if they stop after two successes when there are probably some alternatives that he does not believe have been considered. Just to say they are going to close York Lane, put an atrium here, say what is here when actually it is not here. This will be a 100 hundred old building, or an 80 year old building and there is the possibility that there might be limestone. To him, the building looks like a big box and certainly does not look like it belongs in the Historic Landmark District. Mr. Rosenwald said he believes they can do better and should do better. He recommended that this petition be continued so more discussion can be held.

Mr. Daniel Carey of the Historic Savannah Foundation [HSF] complimented the staff and petitioner for a thorough review. The petitioner was open to suggested changes and held onsite meetings. He believes that the petitioners have been good partners in this for more than a decade. When he came to Savannah about ten years ago, the petitioners were at HSF talking about this project. Therefore, this is an old project. Mr. Carey said the county commissioners and the judges are anxious as they really want to bring this to closure and execute the building. The design is improving and he believes that many significant concessions have been made with respect of trying to honor York Lane. He believes what Mr. Rosenwald said in representing DNA is good and is valid information. What they know now is different than what they knew ten years ago or even five years ago. What he has to say is for the County officials and the judges who are the real clients for this in addition to the public. Ten years ago when they were looking at this, they did not have the sensitivity to the Oglethorpe Plan that they have today. A part of the sensitivity is raised by the National Park Service and their assessment of the National Historic Landmark [NHL] District in pointing out that the Oglethorpe Plan was paramount and that they are to honor it. Everything else that they do is built on that plan. Therefore, he believes that Mr. Rosenwald is right that they cannot say to the federal government that "no" it is not okay to do what you have planned on Telfair Square or to the city in selling out the lots next to the police barracks that it is not okay not to recognize and bring the lane back. Yet, they say it is okay for the county. The county will say that this is not what was said ten years ago or five years ago; this is a recent revelation. This is the difficult situation they are in. There is no easy way out of this and he believes the message is, are the parameters really as moveable as they understand them to be or as they are presented to them?

Mr. Carey said he is hopeful that the judges and the commissioners will take a hard look at this in 2019 terms and not in the terms of 2008 and 2009. He is aware that the rules cannot be changed as they go along. But the fact is what they are doing in their reviews are evolving. Their awareness is heightened with respect to the Oglethorpe Plan and what they are trying to achieve here because of the intensity has occurred within the NHL district. This is not the same district that it was. Therefore, they have to go with that; maybe the standards do get a little tougher; but he does not believe that they have become unfair.

Now, this appears to be sitting in the hands of the Zoning Board of Appeals [ZBA].

Mr. Carey said they all know that the petitioners are really appearing before the Review Board out of courtesy and respect as they do not really have to come before them. But, due to the fact that that they did, he believes they do want to be good citizens and they have been responsive. This shows good citizenship. He said one idea that came up with the representation of York Lane, he heard how materials may carry through on the interior. He would be interested to know if the lane could somehow be represented on the interior, not necessarily with curb as this would probably be ADA non-compliant, but it would be interesting to see if the lane could be represented all the way through the building. He said he tried to contact Commissioner Chairperson Al Scott and County Manager Lee Smith, but was unable to reach them.

Mr. Naugle said, in response to the past GSA project where it was agreed about President Street, he believes it is unfair to compare GSA's project, which is one bankruptcy court room, a trust lot, not on the same scale as their size of the building project. Now, you might not care about the size of the project, but he believes it is important that as a Board and as Savannahians care about the Oglethorpe Plan, that a monumental building such as this could never have been perceived by Oglethorpe 300 years ago, that there would be a need for a civic building larger than any parcel that he would have thought of in his plan.

Mr. Bates said they are putting back as much as they possibly can. There is not an option that they have not looked at and studied. They looked at all the existing conditions at the courthouse. The floor to floor heights are inadequate for today's courts need. The county actually looked at moving the entire court complex out of downtown. They did as much as they possibly could to bring back the features of the original site that were obliterated by this development in the 1970s. He appreciates all the comments that were said and he certainly understands the passion, but like the federal building, the lane does not exist. President Street in the federal complex is there. York Lane is already gone. They realize this is a tough vote and making a decision like this is not easy.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The majority of the Board members said they had conflicting issues with this project, but believed that it has come a long way. They discussed York Lane. If the lane went through the middle of the property, it would be odd. What the petitioner is proposing, feels like a lane, but it is not a lane. Some type of design features in the floor would be helpful. The structure is important and is a precursor when they have to deal with lanes in the future. A park here would be nice, but it would be bound by Oglethorpe Avenue and Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard and Montgomery Street which are high traffic streets. This would make accessing the park difficult. The Board appreciated that the petitioners met on site with staff. They discussed the atrium. These are tithing blocks flanked on a lane by two buildings. If one building was removed, it would not necessarily meet the intent of how the lots were initially established. Based on the design community and understanding how some of the challenges are presented, sometimes the only opportunity is to connect spaces visually. It was said that the atrium design with the recessed design was a very effective means of trying to come to terms with all the different challenges from a program and a visibility standpoint. The Board discussed the opening of the atrium on both ends, but knew that this would require more security.

Ms. Lynch believes all of the Board members are dedicated to the restoration of the Oglethorpe Plan. This site has already been damaged three or four different ways. It is not as simple as the site from the Police station, which is a blank canvas that has not been encroached upon. Given the realignment of Oglethorpe Street, the enroachment onto York Lane, is being eroded at three different sizes and putting back the lane, even if the building was located on the northern side of the tithing block, it would be a lane facade with a front facade. This is not a true application of the Oglethorpe Plan. It is important to keep the courts downtown.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for Part I: Height and Mass provided that a variance is received in order to build over York Lane, because the building is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review recommends approval of the variance which states,

"Streets and Lanes. Development shall preserve or reconstruct the historic ward pattern of streets and lanes within the Oglethorpe Plan Area bounded by the centerline of the following streets: Gaston Street on the South, Bay Street on the North, Martin Luther King, Jr., Boulevard on the West, and East Broad Street on the East as shown in Figure 2. Streets and lanes shall not be bridged by development, except on Factor's Walk." To the Zoning Board of Appeals because the variance criteria have been met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens Second: Kevin Dodge

Kellie Fletcher - Aye Becky Lynch - Abstain **Dwayne Stephens** - Aye Melissa Memory - Nay David Altschiller - Nay Nan Taylor - Aye Kevin Dodge - Aye Stan Houle - Aye Ellie Isaacs - Aye

IX. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

- 28. Petition of Criss Strain | 19-000331-COA | 13 West Bay Street | Staff Approved Retractable Window Awnings

 - Submittal Packet 13 West Bay Street 19-000331-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 29. Petition of Jonathan W. Collingsworth | 19-000536-COA | 215 West Liberty Street | Staff Approved Color Change and Light Fixture

 - Submittal Packet 215 West Liberty St. AwningMetalColor 19-000536-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet Baselite Deep Bowl Series 215 West Liberty St. 19-000536-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 30. Petition of Mark Fitzpatrick | 19-000681-COA | 22 Habersham Street | Staff Approved Shutters

 - McQuaid Residence Shutter Submittal.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 31. Petition of Alchemy Restoration | 19-000694-COA| 411 Whitaker Street | Staff approved Color Change

No action required. Staff approved.

32. Petition of Steve Cook | 19-000696-COA| 552 and 554 East Macon Street | Staff Approved - Replace Rotten Wood Siding

No action required. Staff approved.

33. Amended Petition of Josh Ward for Ward Architecture + Preservation | 19-000703-COA | 219 East Charlton Street | Staff Approved - Amendments

No action required. Staff approved.

34. Petition of Cogdell & Mendrala Architects | 19-000762-COA | 123 Abercorn Street | Staff Approved - Roof and Siding Replacement

COA - 123 Abercorn Street 19-000762-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

35. Petition of Gregory Jacobs for Landmark Preservation LLC | 19-000763-COA | 342 Bull Street | Staff Approved - Masonry Repairs

No action required. Staff approved.

36. Petition of Kevin Quat | 19-000765-COA | 208 East Taylor Street | Staff Approved - Color Changes

@REVISED - 208 E. Taylor St Savannah paint colors.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

37. Petition of Mary Sanders | 19-000838-COA | 518 East Taylor Street | Staff Approved - Color Change

@ 19-000838-COA Colors.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

38. Petition of Michael Higgins | 19-000842-COA | 543-549 East Macon Street | Staff Approved - Replace Roof

@COA - 543 - 549 East Macon Street 19-000842-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

39. Petition of Frank Echezabal | 19-000845-COA | 610 Howard Street | Staff Approved - Remove Broken Glass and Concrete

COA - 610 Howard Street 19-000845-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

40. Petition of Shah Architecture | 19-000865-COA | 423 East River Street | Staff Approved - Amendment

Submjittal Packet - 423 East River Street 19-000865-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 41. Petition of Tony Hensley for SCAD | 19-000869-COA | 342 Bull Street | Staff Approved Gutters and Downspouts

 - Submittal Packet 342 Bull Street 18-000869-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 42. Petition of Tony Hensley for SCAD | 19-00870-COA | 342 Bull Street | Staff Approved install Up-Lights
 - @COA 342 Bull Street 19-000870-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 342 Bull Street 19-000870-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 43. Petition of Tony Hensley for SCAD | 19-000871-COA | 342 Bull Street | Staff Approved Storefront Windows
 - @COA 342 Bull Street 19-000871-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 342 Bull Street 19-000871-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 44. Petition of Andrew Barber for Coastal Canvas | 19-000892-COA | 420 East Broughton Street | Staff Approved Awning
 - COA 420 East Broughton Street 19-000892-COA.pdf
 - @ Revised awning drawing 2-21-19.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 45. Petition of Susie Bull for Dohrman Construction | 19-000893-COA | 24 West Taylor Street | Staff Approved Windows
 - COA 24 West Taylor Street 19-000893-COA.pdf
 - Submttal Packet 24 West Taylor Street 19-000893-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 46. Petition of Eric Brown | 19-001006-COA | 424 East Charlton Lane | Staff Approved Color Changes
 - COA 424 East Charlton Lane 19-001006-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet Color Samples 424 East Charlton Ln 19-001006-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 47. Petition of Kevin Quat | 19-001022-COA | 208 East Taylor Street | Staff Approved Garage Door

No action required. Staff approved.

- 48. Petition of Jane and Mike Elwell | 19-001024-COA | 446 Price Street | Staff Approved Color Change
 - COA 446 Price Street 19-001024-COA.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 446 Price Street 19-001024-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

49. Petition of Tony Hensley for SCAD | 19-001081-COA | 342 Bull Street | Staff Approved - Asphalt Shingle Roof

- COA 342 Bull Street 19-001081-COA.pdf
- Submittal Packet 342 Bull Street 19-001081-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

- 50. Petition of Virgil Scott | 19-001112-COA | 409 West Taylor Street | Staff Approved Color Change
 - COA 409 West Taylor Street 19-001112-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 51. Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting Thursday, March 14, 2019 at 3:30 p.m. in the Meyer Conference Room, MPC 110 East State Street
- 52. Next Pre-Meeting Wednesday, April 10, 2019 at 12:00 p.m. in the Jerry Surrency Room, MPC, 112 East State Street
- 53. Next Regular Meeting Wednesday, April 10, 2019 at 1:00 p.m. in the Arthur Mendonsa Hearing Room, MPC, 112 East State Street

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

54. Adjournment

Ms. Lynch said as reported during the Pre-meeting, today is Ms. Ellen Harris's last meeting. The Board expressed their gratitude to her for the many years of service to the City and to the Review Board. They wished Ms. Harris the best in her next endeavors.

**

There being no further business to come before the Historic District Board of Review, Ms. Lynch adjourned the meeting at 2:40 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Leah G. Michalak
Director of Historic Preservation

LGM:mem

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.