

Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Chatham County Commission Chamber November 13, 2019 - 1:00 P.M. Meeting Minutes

NOVEMBER 13, 2019 SAVANNAH HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM in the Green Room of the Chatham County Commission Chambers at 124 Bull Street. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted, and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received and no votes were taken.

Members Present:	Becky Lynch, Chair Dwayne Stephens, Vice-Chair David Altschiller Debra Caldwell Scott Cook Kevin Dodge Ellie Isaacs Melissa Memory Nan Taylor
Member Absent:	Stan Houle
MPC Staff Present:	Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation Ryan Jarles, Cultural Resources Planner Alyson Smith, Historic Preservation Planner Candra Teshome, Historic Preservation and Development Services Planner Sandy Michel, Historic Preservation and Development Services Planner Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant Sabrina Finau, Administrative Assistant

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

1. Call to Order and Welcome

Ms. Lynch called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m. and welcomed everyone in attendance. She outlined the role of the Historic District Board of Review and explained the process for hearing the various petitions. Staff will present each application with a recommendation. The petitioner will have the opportunity to respond to the recommendation. The petitioners are asked to limit their presentation to 10 minutes or less and only address the items identified as inconsistent with the ordinance and questions raised by the Board. The public will have the same allotted time, 10 minutes, to comment. The petitioner will be given the opportunity to respond to the public comments.

II. SIGN POSTING

. .

_

III. CONSENT AGENDA

- 2. Petition of Kareem Simmons | 19-004293-COA | 348 Lincoln Street | Addition
 - Application 348 Lincoln Street 19-004293-COA.pdf
 - @ 19-004293-COA Drawings.pdf
 - Material Specifications.pdf
 - 19-004293-COA Recommendation.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the second story addition to the rear of the historic structure located at 348 Lincoln Street with the following condition because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

1.Ensure that the work is undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Debra Caldwell	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

3. Petition of Dawn Jones | 19-005406-COA | 520 East Gwinnett Street | New Construction Part I & II - COA expired

- Ø Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Ø 520 E Gwinett 4.9.2018 FINAL DRAWING SET.pdf
- Aerial View.pdf
- Mass Model-Revised.pdf
- Context Photos.pdf
- Sample Board Materials & Colors.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for New Construction Part I & Part II for a two-story single-family building at the vacant lot located at 520 East

Gwinnett Street with the following conditions:

1.Ensure that the Hardie siding has a smooth finish, and that the columns are constructed of word or wood composite and feature base molding.

2.Ensure that the window muntins are no wider than 7/8 inch and that the muntin profiles simulate traditional putty glazing.

3.Ensure that the hog pen beneath the front stairs is inset at least one inch.

4.Ensure that a parking variance is obtained from the Zoning Board of Appeals for the absence of the required off-street parking space.

5.Obtain an encroachment permit from the City for the front stoop.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Debra Caldwell	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

4. Petition of LS3P Associates LTD. | 19-005731-COA | 5 West Liberty Street | Amendment & Variance

- Staff Recommendation 19-005731.pdf
- Ø 2019-05-15 Project Narrative_5 W. Liberty St.pdf
- 20190809_5W Liberty St_Encroachment Dwg Set.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby recommend approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals from the following standard:

Installations extending above the public right-of-way shall have a minimum vertical clearance of eight feet (8') above the sidewalk.

Because the variance criteria have been met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs

Second: Debra Caldwell		
Debra Caldwell	- Aye	
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present	
Becky Lynch	- Abstain	
Scott Cook	- Abstain	
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye	
Melissa Memory	- Aye	
David Altschiller	- Aye	
Nan Taylor	- Aye	
Kevin Dodge	- Aye	
Stan Houle	- Not Present	
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye	

5. Petition of Roger McFarland | 19-005832-COA | 339 MLK Jr. Blvd. | Rehabilitation

- @ APP 19-005832.pdf
- @ 29605-0001 A6 MILLWORK DETAILS, SECTIONS.pdf
- @ 29605-0001 A15 ROOF PLAN.pdf
- @ 29605-0001 A16 EXTERIOR ELEVATIONS.pdf
- @ 29605-0001 A3 FLOOR PLANS.pdf
- @ 29605-0001 A2 DEMOLITION PLANS.pdf
- @ 29605-0001 A14 EXISTING PHOTOGRAPHS.pdf
- 19-005832-COA Recommendation.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve exterior alterations to the structure located at 339 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. with the following conditions because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible:

- 1. The windows proposed to be "painted out" remain unpainted to retain the transparency of the glazing.
- 2. Ensure that all work proposed is undertaken utilizing the gentlest means possible.

3.Provide a COA application for the proposed awning be submitted to staff for review and approval.4.Provide the brick and mortar specifications be to staff for review and approval.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Debra Caldwell	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye

David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

6. Petition of Pantheon ADC | 19-005907-COA | 15 East Liberty Street | Brick Replacement

<u>19-005907-COA Recommendation.pdf</u>

Application - 15 East Liberty Street 19-005907-COA.pdf

Project Description and Submittal Packet - 15 East Liberty Street 19-005907-COA.pdf

Ø Brick and Mortar Sample.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve replacement of the brick veneer over the entire structure located at 15 East Liberty Street as proposed because the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

- Aye
- Not Present
- Abstain
- Aye
- Not Present
- Aye

7. Petition of Demoiselle Smiley | 19-005941-COA | 134 Houston Street | Photovoltaic Panels

- Staff Recommendation 19-005941-COA.pdf
- Ecofoot 5D brochure.pdf
- Panel Claw Layout guide.pdf
- Sunpower X series.pdf
- HDBR_Submittal_134 Houston_2019-10-16.pdf
- Unirac 11inIRS 5° dimensions.pdf
- @ 19-005941-COA Photos.pdf

Ø Board Decision - Denial 19-002887-COA.pdf

Board Decision 19-004277-ZBA.pdf

Motion

Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the installation of photovoltaic panels on the roof of the 1925 main historic structure at 134 Houston Street as requested because the work meets the standards and will not be visible from the public right-of-way.

Vote Results (Approved)

- Aye
- Not Present
- Abstain
- Aye
- Not Present
- Aye

8. Petition of Hansen Architects | 19-005948-COA | 509 East Charlton Street | Addition and Alterations

- 1970s Van Jones Martin Image.jpg
- Ø 509 charlton check list.pdf
- <u>509 E Charlton Evolution.pdf</u>
- <u>509 E Charlton History.pdf</u>
- @ coa 509 east charlton.pdf
- COA application for 509 E Charlton description of work.docx
- @ 2019.10.16_509 EAST CHARLTON_Review Set.pdf
- <u>19-005948-COA Recommendation.pdf</u>
- ø submittal packet.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the addition and alterations to the historic structure located at 509 East Charlton Street with the following condition because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. The window specification be submitted for review and approval prior to submitting drawings to be stamped for permit.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Debra Caldwell	
Debra Caldwell	- Ауе
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Ауе
Dwayne Stephens	- Ауе
Melissa Memory	- Ауе
David Altschiller	- Ауе
Nan Taylor	- Ауе
Kevin Dodge	- Ауе
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Ауе

9. Petition of Matthew Hallett | 19-005949-COA | 200 - 202 W Jones Street | Alterations

- <u>19-005949-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf</u>
- Submittal Packet_Agenda_1.pdf
- SADWITH 200 W JONES-EAST WALL 1.pdf
- SADWITH 200 W JONES-EAST WALL 2.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for exterior rehabilitation of the building located at 200 – 202 West Jones Street, with conditions, because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. The Sierra "Premium" windows shall include a simulated, putty-glazed profile.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Debra Caldwell	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye

David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

10. Adopt the November 13, 2019 Agenda

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby adopt the November 13, 2019 Agenda .

- Aye
- Not Present
- Abstain
- Aye
- Not Present
- Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

11. Approve October 9, 2019 Briefing Minutes and October 9, 2019 Regular Meeting Minutes

October 9, 2019 HBR Briefing Minutes.docx

10.09.19 Meeting Minutes.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the October 9, 2019 Briefing Minutes and Regular Meeting Minutes.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens Second: Nan Taylor Debra Caldwell

Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

12. Petition of W. Projects, LLC | 19-005893-COA | 12 West State Street | Mural

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby withdrawn the petition at the petitioner's request.

- Aye
- Not Present
- Abstain
- Aye
- Not Present
- Aye

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

13. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006852-COA | 630 East River Street | New Construction Parking Garage: Part II, Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

	-
Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: David Altschiller	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

14. Petition of Gunn, Meyerhoff, Shay | 17-002122-COA | 602 East River Street (Hotel Anne) | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: David Altschiller	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

15. Petition of Greenline Architecture | 17-002904-COA | 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

	-
Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: David Altschiller	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

16. Petition of LS3P | 18-006314-COA | 2 Whitaker Street | Demolition and New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: David Altschiller	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

17. Petition of Lott Barber | 18-006769-COA | 145 Montgomery Street | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs

Debra Caldwell- AyeKellie Fletcher- Not PresentBecky Lynch- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMelissa Memory- AyeDavid Altschiller- Aye
Becky Lynch- AbstainScott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMelissa Memory- Aye
Scott Cook- AyeDwayne Stephens- AyeMelissa Memory- Aye
Dwayne Stephens- AyeMelissa Memory- Aye
Melissa Memory - Aye
David Altschiller - Ave
Nan Taylor - Aye
Kevin Dodge - Aye
Stan Houle - Not Present
Ellie Isaacs - Aye

18. Petition of Ethos Preservation | 19-004724-COA | 219 East Charlton Street | Amendments and Alterations

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: David Altschiller	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

19. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 19-004089-COA | 313-316 West River Street | Rehabilitation and Alterations

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved) Motion: Ellie Isaacs Second: David Altschiller

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Not Present
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

20. Petition of Steven Bodek | 19-004739-COA | 446 Price Street | Porch Addition

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: David Altschiller	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

21. Petition of Sanders Architecture | 19-005929-COA | 144 Drayton Street | Alterations

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: David Altschiller	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present

Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

22. Petition of Homeline Architecture | 19-005942-COA | 314 East Charlton Street | Alterations

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: David Altschiller	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

23. Petition of Hansen Architects | 19-005943-COA | 226 East Bryan Street | Contributing Building Relocation and New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: David Altschiller	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain

- Aye
- Aye
- Not Present
- Aye

24. Petition of Hansen Architects | 19-005944-COA | 9 Lincoln Street | Contributing Building Relocation and New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: David Altschiller	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

25. Petition of Hansen Architects PC | 19-005945-COA | 220 East Bryan Street | New Construction Hotel: Part I, Height and Mass and Special Exception Request

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)Motion: Ellie IsaacsSecond: David AltschillerDebra Caldwell- AyeKellie Fletcher- Not PresentBecky Lynch- Abstain

Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

26. Petition of Tonya Meushaw for Coastal Contractors | 19-005822-COA | 11 East Gordon Street | Addition and Alterations

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Second: David Altschiller	
Debra Caldwell - Aye	
Kellie Fletcher - Not Present	
Becky Lynch - Abstain	
Scott Cook - Aye	
Dwayne Stephens - Aye	
Melissa Memory - Aye	
David Altschiller - Aye	
Nan Taylor - Aye	
Kevin Dodge - Aye	
Stan Houle - Not Present	
Ellie Isaacs - Aye	

27. Petition of HOS Management | 19-005955-COA | 321 Montgomery Street | Signs

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: David Altschiller	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye

Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

28. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects | 16-006851-COA | 620 East River Street | Amendments to New Construction, Part I: Height Mass and Part II: Design Details

- <u>16-006851-COA Staff recommendation.pdf</u>
- Submittal Packet Drawings and Photos.pdf
- Submittal Packet Design Logic.pdf
- Submittal Packet Narrative, Materials, and Specifications.pdf
- @ 7-12-17 Part I Approval Submittal Packet.pdf

Mr. Pat Shay was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for amendments to New Construction: Part 1, Height and Mass and Part II, Design Details for an eight-story hotel building to be located on the vacant parcel at 620 East River Street. The amendment includes:

- 1. A reduction in height of the rooftop architectural elements and the voids eliminated;
- 2. Reduction in the depth of the porte-cochere;
- 3. The central courtyard on the upper building mass has been reoriented to face west rather than east toward the Marriott.
- 4. Reduction in the upper building mass. The setback from the river has been increased to match that of the upper building mass setback on the west.
- 5. Additional details regarding sidewalks at the curb cuts and the elevator and stair on the rooftop have been provided.

Ms. Michalak stated that the above amendments are based on the conditions from the Board of the Part I: Height and Mass approval at the July 12, 2017 HDBR Meeting. She explained that also, further amendments, which reflect the staff's recommendation from the May 8, 2019 HDBR Meeting, are proposed. At that meeting, staff recommended a continuance in order for the petitioner to consider the following:

- Either reduce the overall building mass to the 2012 volume or increase the setback from River Street further, more similar to the 54-foot (+/-) setback from the west façade. [This has since been clarified to remove the word Street. The setback is intended to be from the river.]
- 2. Redesign/relocate the vertical amenities on the two-story portions of the building, such as trellises and cabanas, to be setback further from the west façade so they are not visible from the street. Include locations for light poles or other vertical objects that are proposed and not currently indicated on the drawings.

- 3. Ensure that the trellises do not exceed 11 feet in height (provide dimensions).
- 4. Revise window openings to meet the 5:3 ratio standard.
- 5. Revise the south elevation of the courtyard so that the distance between windows is not less than two times their width.
- 6. Redesign the sidewalk to continue across the driveways in materials, configuration, and height.
- 7. Locate all HVAC equipment on the drawings and, if visible from a public right-of-way, provide screening details.
- 8. Ensure that a 10-foot pedestrian setback is provided along the river's edge and on the north side of River Street.
- 9. Ensure that all mechanical and access structures are contained within the bonus story. A stair and elevator equipment penthouses are shown on the roof plan.

Ms. Michalak reported that staff recommends approval for amendments to New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass for an eight-story hotel building to be located on the vacant parcel at 620 East River Street as requested because the proposed amendments are visually compatible and meet the standards. She additionally reported that staff recommends approval for New Construction: Part II, Design Details for an eight-story hotel building to be located on the vacant parcel at 620 East River Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meet the standards:

1. Revise the frosted plastic awnings to be canvas, other equivalent cloth, metal, or glass to meet the standard and be visually compatible.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Shay came forward and introduced the individuals accompanying him today. Mr. Shay was in agreement with the staff recommendation. They will return and show the staff the glass panel that will be used instead of the plastic panel. He entertained questions from the Board.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board was in agreement with the staff recommendation. They believed the design has improved greatly. The revisions the petitioner made in Part I are good.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby:

Approve amendments to New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass for an eight-story hotel building to be located on the vacant parcel at 620 East River Street as requested because the proposed amendments are visually compatible and meet the standards.

Approve New Construction: Part II, Design Details for an eight-story hotel building to be located on the vacant parcel at 620 East River Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meet the standards:

1. Revise the frosted plastic awnings to be canvas, other equivalent cloth, metal, or glass to meet the standard and be visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Dwayne Stephens	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

29. Petition of Historic Savannah Foundation | 19-005906-COA | 217 East Charlton Street | Amendment

Staff Recommendation 19-005906-COA.pdf

Submittal Packet.pdf

Design Approved September 2019.pdf

Info. for HBR submitted November 8th.pdf

Mr. Ryan Arvay was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Alyson Smith gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval to amend a previously approved COA for a porch reconstruction at 217 East Charlton Street. The original approval included the demolition of the non-historic front porch and the reconstruction of the original front porch using historic photographic documentation. The covered stoop was incorrectly constructed and has been a pending violation case with the MPC and City since the construction commenced in the beginning of 2018. On September 11, 2019, [File No. 19-004726-COA] the HDBR approved an amendment for a simplified covered porch design that did not seek to reconstruct the original.

Ms. Smith explained that following the September hearing, the Historic Savannah Foundation [HSF] offered the owner assistance to go back to the original approved design to reconstruct the covered porch to match the original documented historic porch. The existing roof is proposed to be maintained; however, the columns, balustrade, stoop piers and newel posts will be removed and replaced with revised porch elements to more closely match the design of the original covered stoop.

Ms. Smith reported that staff recommends approval of the amendment to File No. 19-004726-COA to reconstruct the front portico to match the original historic configuration at 217 East Charlton Street because the design is visually compatible and meets the design standards, with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval:

• Revise the design of the balusters to more accurately depict the curved nature of the balusters by removing the center chamfered block element.

• Provide a detail drawing of the newel post, handrail, porch support columns and confirm the width

of the turned porch columns.

• Submit revised paint colors.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Arvay, Historic Property Coordinator, of the Historic Savannah Foundation [HSF] said that since the HDBR Agenda was sent on last Friday, they have submitted requests to staff showing more detailed drawings of the lower porch columns, the newel post, confirmed the width of the turn porch posts, and submitted the updated paint color. They are in agreement with all of staff's recommendations with the exception of the newel post.

Mr. Arvay showed the Board a drawing which showed a large mass in the center. He said this is the chamfered wood block. This is what was depicted in their autocad drawing and they have backed this up with the documented existing historic precedent of the style being used in the Landmark District. They believe that it is not only historically appropriate, but adds some weight and fullness to the design. The design will be dramatically improved thanks to HSF's involvement. As he has stated, they agree with the staff's recommendations, but ask the Board to consider the retention of the center block design which he believes is clear. If staff wants some revisions to the balusters to accentuate the more curvature nature as referenced in the old photo, adjustments can be made. Mr. Arvay entertained questions from the Board.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussed the balusters and chamfered blocks. They were in agreement with the staff recommendations with the exception of the removal of the chamfered block elements. The consensus of the Board is this element may remain with the condition that the dimensions and profile are submitted to validate that they are in keeping with the historic photo.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for an amendment to File No. 19-004726-COA to reconstruct the front portico to match the original historic configuration at 217 East Charlton Street because the design is visually compatible and meets the design standards, with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval:

•Provide a detail drawing of the newel post, handrail, porch support columns and confirm the width of the turned porch columns.

•Submit revised paint colors.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Scott Cook	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye

David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

30. Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 19-005933-COA | 27 Montgomery Street | Rehabilitation and Alterations

- Ø Drawings.pdf
- Marative and Specs.pdf
- MPC Research Historic Photos.pdf
- Sanborn Maps.pdf
- 19-005933-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf

NOTE: Ms. Lynch recused herself from participating in this petition. She is part owner of Lynch Associates Architects.

Mr. Stephens chaired the meeting.

Ms. Elizabeth Schminke was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Alyson Smith gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval to rehabilitate the historic building at 27 Montgomery Street. The following alterations are proposed:

- 1. The existing deteriorated stucco will be removed and replaced with new stucco. The existing brick parapet cap and cornice will be repaired as necessary.
- 2. At the second story: existing non-historic infill louvers will be removed and replaced with double hung windows.
- 3. Along West Saint Julian Street: The existing infilled openings at the ground floor will be reopened and new wood storefront windows and doors will be installed along with fixed canvas awnings. Two storefront entrances towards the western edge of the building are proposed to increase width-wise to accommodate for egress doors.
- 4. Along West Congress Street: The existing infilled openings at the ground floor will be reopened and new fixed wood storefront windows and doors will be installed.
- 5. Along Montgomery Street: Three new openings are proposed. A new metal arched canopy is proposed over the primary entrance. Retractable fabric awnings are proposed to be inset within the new wood storefront at the Montgomery Street façade.
- 6. A new elevator will be installed. The roof will be replaced.

Ms. Smith reported that staff recommends approval of the rehabilitation at 27 Montgomery Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval:

- 1. Revise the Marvin Ultimate Double Hung SDL window specification to a single pane window type.
- 2. Omit the increase in width to the existing historic openings along West Saint Julian Street.
- 3. Submit elevation drawings showing the height and visibility of the elevator overrun.
- 4. Submit drawings to staff prior to any upgrades to electrical and/or mechanical equipment for review and approval prior to installation.

- 5. Provide the location of refuse storage on the site plan.
- 6. Provide confirmation regarding the existence of any original windows and doors.
- 7. Submit shop drawings, material and color samples for the awnings and canopies and ensure the corrugated canopy option is not used.
- 8. Ensure the windows are inset not less than three inches and the storefront is inset not less than four inches.
- 9. Ensure an encroachment license from the City of Savannah is obtained.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Ms. Schminke thanked staff for their review. They are in agreement with the staff recommendation, but respectfully request that the Board consider allowing them to widen the openings. She explained that the reason they increased the openings were to allow the 36" clearance as they are a part of the egress path. Therefore, their thought is to have two equally sized doors that would create the required width. They were of the belief that this would be better than having one door and a sidelite to maintain the rhythm and design of the existing structure. Ms. Schminke said they will be happy to provide the information to staff. She entertained questions from the Board.

Mr. Altschiller asked if lights would only be on two doors. What is the reason?

Ms. Schminke explained that the lights on the front pieces would be an overflow. This is why they want to eliminate them. The two larger spaces where they are proposing to enlarge the doors are a part of their egress to the second story and also to the kitchen space.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Ryan Arvay of Historic Savannah Foundation [HSF] said that they are excited about this project. They all are aware that this building has been sitting and languishing for some time. When their Architectural Review Committee looked at the plans, they were unsure whether the openings on Montgomery Street were original or not. He believes that staff has concluded that the openings are not original. It appears that a lot of historic fabric has been lost.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Ms. Taylor asked the petitioner to explain the openings on the Montgomery Street side.

Ms. Schminke explained that the step parapet creates an asymmetrical building facade. Their intent was to always maintain the existing opening as it is. This will provide a connection beyond. The squares now are treated differently. When this building was constructed a giant water tower was here.

Ms. Memory asked if three separate entrances are here. It appears that the two entrances on the right are going to be used by the public on a regular basis. She asked what the entrance on the left would be used for.

Ms. Schminke said the entrance on the left is somewhat a private entrance. It will also allow the restaurant patrons overflow to go outside and eat.

Mr. Cook asked what was changing on the second floor.

Ms. Schminke answered that nothing was changing on the second floor with the exception of the removal of the existing double pane windows to single pane double-hung windows.

The Board was in agreement with the staff recommendation, but not in agreement with condition #2 which states "Omit the increase in width to the existing historic openings along West Saint Julian Street."

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for rehabilitation at 27 Montgomery Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval:

1. Revise the Marvin Ultimate Double Hung SDL window specification to a single pane window type.

2.Submit elevation drawings showing the height and visibility of the elevator overrun.

3.Submit drawings to staff prior to any upgrades to electrical and/or mechanical equipment for review and approval prior to installation.

4. Provide the location of refuse storage on the site plan.

5. Provide confirmation regarding the existence of any original windows and doors.

6.Submit shop drawings, material and color samples for the awnings and canopies and ensure the corrugated canopy option is not used.

7.Ensure the windows are inset not less than three inches and the storefront is inset not less than four inches.8.Ensure an encroachment license from the City of Savannah is obtained.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Dwayne Stephens	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Nay
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

31. Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 19-005937-COA | 30 & 32 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | Rehabilitation - Alterations and Additions

- <u>19-005937-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf</u>
- Submittal Packet Narrative and Specifications.pdf
- Submittal Packet Photos and Drawings.pdf
- Context Sanborn Maps.pdf

NOTE: Ms. Lynch recused herself from participating in this petition. She is part owner of Lynch Associates Architects.

Mr. Stephens chaired this hearing.

Ms. Jennifer Deacon was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Alyson Smith gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval to rehabilitate, including alterations and additions, the property at 30 and 32 MLK Jr. Blvd. and construct a one-story addition at the south portion of the lot. A fenced-in courtyard with a canopy and trellis is also proposed. New windows are proposed at the building's south elevation. Non-historic storefronts facing MLK Jr. Blvd. and W. St. Julian Street are proposed to be replaced with new windows and doors, while maintaining the existing masonry openings. Existing fabric awnings at these openings are proposed to be replaced with a continuous metal awning. Wood cladding is proposed to wrap the corner. At the east (rear) façade of the historic building, a non-historic porch structure and roof canopy is proposed to be removed and replaced with a metal and wood canopy and trellis structure, constructed in a similar configuration to the existing porch.

Ms. Smith stated the addition that is proposed at the south portion of the property consists of an outdoor dining and bar area that is surrounded by a fence constructed of stuccoed walls and pilasters, infilled with horizontal cedar fencing over a steel frame. The courtyard is covered with a steel framed roof canopy with a wood trellis. A small, one story covered structure at the southeast corner of the property houses restrooms, storage, and a refuse enclosure. This area also includes a metal stair and rail that connects to the second floor porch of the historic building. The development of these properties involves a recombination into a single lot: 30 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. Eight (8) existing non-historic windows at the second floor and eight (8) non-historic windows at the third floor will remain.

Ms. Smith reported that staff recommends approval of the rehabilitation including an addition and alterations at 30 and 32 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval:

- 1. Revise the Marvin Ultimate Double Hung SDL window specification to a single pane window type.
- 2. Ensure the windows are inset not less than three inches and the storefront is inset not less than four inches.
- 3. Ensure an encroachment license from the City of Savannah is obtained.
- 4. Wood fences shall be painted or stained.
- 5. Ensure storefront glazing is transparent.
- 6. If visible, HVAC units will require screening.

Ms. Issacs asked if the Board received a sample of the wood.

Ms. Alyson answered no, that it is wood and will be stained.

Ms. Issacs said that it is stated that the third floor door is to remain. She stated, however, the door does not lead to anything.

Ms. Alyson stated that this is a question that could be answered by the petitioner.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Ms. Deacon stated that they agree with all of the staff's recommendations. She explained that they intended initially to have a third floor wood deck. They will try to close the opening with a window to match or will work with staff on how to resolve this issue. She entertained questions from the Board.

Mr. Scott asked if the cedar will be stained.

Ms. Deacon explained that everything they are proposing will be cedar. The cedar is over a steel frame and, therefore, will be like an open horizontal screen that will be attached to a steel frame on the inside of the openings.

Mr. Scott asked the petitioner, therefore, this will be horizontal in plane.

Ms. Deacon answered yes.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board agreed with the staff recommendation. It was the consensus of the Board that the petitioner address the third floor door on the east elevation with staff.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for rehabilitation including an addition and alterations at 30 and 32 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval:

1. Revise the Marvin Ultimate Double Hung SDL window specification to a single pane window type.

2.Ensure the windows are inset not less than three inches and the storefront is inset not less than four inches. 3.Ensure an encroachment license from the City of Savannah is obtained.

4.Wood fences shall be painted or stained.

5.Ensure storefront glazing is transparent.

6.If visible, HVAC units will require screening.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

32. Petition of Homeline Architecture | 19-005939-COA | 111 East Jones Street | Addition

- @ 19-005939-COA Drawings
- @ 19-005939-COA Submittal Packet
- Exploratory Demolition Findings
- <u>19-005939-COA Recommendation.pdf</u>

Mr. John Deering was present on behalf of the petition.

Mr. Ryan Jarles gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for an addition and alterations

to the rear of 111 East Jones Street. The addition will project 12'-0" from the existing 2 story addition on the rear and will extend 14'-0" from the eastern corner towards the west; the remaining 9'-5" to the western corner of the existing 2 story addition will feature a sunken patio as well as a 2 story porch. A trellis roof structure is proposed for the parlor level porch. October 25, 2019 staff was provided with a document from the applicant describing the findings from an exploratory demolition in which the original portions of the rear walls were located. 9'-0" of the western portion of the rear wall, and 3'-8" of the eastern portion of the rear wall. These portions are proposed to be retained.

Mr. Jarles reported that staff recommends approval of the addition and alterations to the rear of 111 East Jones Street with the following conditions because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards;

- 1. Ensure that the work is undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
- 2. A full-sized window sample be provided to staff for review and approval. If staff finds the window to not be appropriate, the window will have to be seen by the board.
- 3. Revise the vertical siding as well as the flush wood panels to be horizontal lap siding.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Deering stated that they agree with the staff conditions one and two, but want to address staff condition three. They have found that the vertical siding does exist in historical structures. They have actually gotten the Board to approve the vertical siding at least twice. He showed the Board a picture of a structure at 110 East Oglethorpe Street which has the vertical wood siding. It is infilled in the low central bay and also on the third floor beneath the windows. The vertical siding is found throughout the Historic District in many houses. He pointed out that on Abercorn Street the vertical siding is minimal, but it exists here. It is a panel condition throughout the district. The Charlton Street building is what they were talking about earlier and the vertical siding is on the back. It occurs in the central bay of the bay window. Mr. Deering said he has found many situations like this. Therefore, they thought it would be a perfect solution to use the vertical siding on the rear end of this structure. He showed the Board another structure on East Jones and Lincoln Streets where vertical siding is used. This was approved by the Board approximately seven years. This building has the vertical wood siding within a porch like structure. He respectfully asked the Board to consider their use of the vertical siding.

Ms. Lynch asked Mr. Deering to provide some clarification on the flush wood exterior. Is this plywood?

Mr. Deering answered that it is butted boards.

Ms. Lynch asked Mr. Deering to clarify what the dimensions are for the boards.

Mr. Deering answered that they will be five inches.

Ms. Lynch, for clarity, asked Mr. Deering if the siding would be vertical.

Mr. Deering explained that it would be joint flush-type.

Mr. Stephens asked Mr. Deering what material is on the column as well as the beam for the trellis.

Mr. Deering explained that the beam is wood and the column is stucco.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Ryan Arvay of Historic Savannah Foundation [HSF] said they wanted clarification on which rear facade windows are original. He said there are two doors proposed for the new balcony that appear to be 6 over 6. One will become an interior door. The other two are proposed to become doors as well although they enter the same room. They want to minimize the loss of material fabric.

Mr. Deering explained that there are two dimensional French doors. The windows are not 1853, but some time after that period.

Mr. Deering explained that the width of the openings and height will remain the same. The only thing that will be removed is the infill below the window.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

Throughout Board discussion it was noted that all members of the Board would like the drawings to more clearly and accurately represent what the petitioner had verbally clarified to the Board during their presentation; the portion of the drawings shown as flush wood panels is actually supposed to be representing a vertical ship lap, and the positioning of the doors located on the second story rear facade is actually supposed to be represented as having the same height as the existing windows.

The Board expressed they did not have concerns about the vertical ship lap siding; they believe that the vertical ship lap siding differentiates historic from modern. The Board did express concern about the stucco porch column and recommended that the finish be changed to wood.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the addition and alterations to the rear of 111 East Jones Street until the December 11, 2019 Historic District Board of Review regular meeting date to allow for the petitioner to provide more information and to revise the drawings, including:

1. Revise the porch column material to wood.

2.Revise the drawings to accurately show the vertical ship lap siding and the proportion/location of the doors located on the second story rear façade within the context elevations.

3.Ensure that the work is undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

4.A full-sized window sample be provided to staff for review and approval. If staff finds the window to not be appropriate, the window will have to be seen by the board.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Melissa Memory	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

33. Petition of Greenline Architecture | 19-005946-COA | 10 East Oglethorpe Avenue | Alterations and Additions

@ 19-005946-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf

- Submittal Packet Drawings and Photos.pdf
- Submittal Packet Historic Photos.pdf
- 1954 and 1973 Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Submittal Packet Window Specifications.pdf
- Submittal Packet Project Narrative.pdf

Mr. Keith Howington was present on behalf of the petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak gave the staff report. The applicant is requesting approval for alterations (renovations) and additions for the Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace building located at 10 East Oglethorpe Avenue. The site is the property of the Girl Scouts of the United States of America and is used as a museum, as well as other activities dedicated to the Girl Scout troops. Per the applicant, the scope of work includes:

- -Restore existing garden gate at Oglethorpe Ave.; provide a new iron gate to match the existing at the eastern side of the garden. The gate will be in the same post- to post layout and modified to match the existing. The Main entrance to the property is proposed to be relocated to the Oglethorpe side, and into the garden.
- -Add accessible ramps at the courtyard, north of the main house, and in the garden east of the main house. The new ramps will take visitors to the ground level, and existing elevator of the main house so that visitors can all begin their tour on the same level.
- -Interior renovations of the main house include kitchen, adding accessible restrooms for all, and relocating the gift shop to the outbuilding west with a Bull Street presence.
- -Outbuilding West (west wall): Replace existing, non-historic metal framed storefront window and door with a more appropriate single/direct glazed wood window system and increase the entrance door to meet accessibility requirements. The storefront and west wall have been altered many times and not original (existing sill is concrete block infill).
- -Outbuilding West (east wall): Research has shown that little of the original fabric remains to the east wall, ground level. The addition of the 1950s mechanical room, and previous alterations have removed most of the original fabric. There is evidence of a large opening on this wall of which our new opening will primarily use. We will need to remove a portion of the east wall to allow for the floor differences (+/- 14 inches) and travel into a new 'connector' building. The upper level is impacted only by the removal of a window and small area of masonry below the window to allow for accessibility of the second level of both outbuildings.
- -Connector/infill building the new 2-story infill connector building acts similar to a bridge from one building to the other. Currently, children and users with mobility concerns can't access the upper levels of the outbuildings. The new connector will provide ramps and an elevator to meet these needs. We have followed the Secretary of Interior Standards for Additions- the new infill is simple and unobtrusive in design, contemporary in style to differentiate from the original buildings; located at the rear of the property; smaller than the historic outbuildings in effort to be compatible in height and mass; is setback and subordinate in size and design, and great care is taken to preserve original historical fabric. The new infill building will have a flat roof as to not be construed as historical and competing with the massing of the two outbuildings. The building is clad in metal/metal panel as a modern addition. Glazing exceeds 75% glazing and windows are fixed modern casement windows.
- -Outbuilding East: Remove non-original stairs and canopy to allow for new infill building; maintain original openings when possible with minimal expansion /loss of historic fabric. We are also proposing new doors on the south facade to allow for new ticketing / exhibit space. These new entrances will provide access from the garden and is important to the security at the site.

Ms. Michalak reported that staff recommends to continue the request for alterations (renovations) and additions for the Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace building located at 10 East Oglethorpe Avenue, to the December 11, 2019 HDBR Meeting, in order for the petitioner to consider and/or provide the following:

- 1. Provide evidence that the chimney proposed to be removed is not historic;
- Provide evidence that the majority of the east wall of the west contributing outbuilding is not historic;
- 3. Provide evidence that the ground floor storefront and decorative molding above on the west wall of the west contributing outbuilding is not historic;
- 4. Reduce the amount of historic fabric proposed to be removed at the historic window opening on the second floor of the east wall of the west contributing outbuilding;
- 5. Provide the history regarding the fence, gates, and masonry base fronting the garden along Oglethorpe Avenue;
- 6. Revise the metal panels proposed for the exterior walls of the addition to a material more compatible with the residential character of the site;
- 7. Provide all finish and color samples for the ramps and the addition;
- 8. Provide locations for electrical equipment and refuse storage areas on the site plan;
- 9. Provide locations and specifications for all new exterior lighting fixtures.

Ms. Michalak reminded the Board that regarding continuances, Sec. 3.1.7.c.i. of the City of Savannah Zoning ordinance states "...Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review ... shall have the authority to continue review of an application scheduled for public hearings to a date certain." In other words, the applicant is no longer required to ask for the continuance in order for the Board to continue the project.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Howington thanked the Board for hearing their petition. He also thanked the staff for a positive report. As staff reported, the comments are very clear. With the clarification that they will provide, the Board will see that there is minimal historic fabric that will be lost. Mr. Howington was accompanied by many representatives of the Girl Scouts of the USA. He gave some background accomplishments on the founder of the Girl Scouts, Ms. Julliette Gordon Low.

Mr. Howington reported that Greenline is very excited about being a part of this project. He explained that the garden is not a part of the review at this time. It is a feature that will be brought before the Board at a later time. The Girl Scouts have hired a landscape architect. The Girl Scouts have engaged a preservation architect to study the west outbuilding. The Girl Scouts have also engaged an archaeologist to review the area where the little building is to be demolished and the archaeologist will be involved in the garden area as well. The Girl Scouts want to know what has happened on these sites. As everyone knows, the Girl Scouts are very important to Savannah. More than 30,000 visitors visit this site each year. Therefore, the site requires accessibility and security transparency is part of the goal for this project.

Mr. Howington outlined that physical limitations, visual high sensitivity concerns, security, visual transparency, and maintain the historical integrity and equality are their concerns. He showed the Board the main portions between the two buildings. He showed the Board what would be seen from Oglethorpe Avenue and also what would be seen from Bull Street. He discussed some other areas that would be seen. Mr. Howington discussed what they are calling the connector bridge. This is a bridge between the two outbuildings. The goal of the project is to create equality for all. Therefore, they have revised the entrance. They will leave the gate up, but will cut the concrete from the bottom. They are proposing a new gate to the east to match exactly what is to the west and they are not losing any historic materials. They are doing this because the Girl Scouts of the USA would like to possibly open up the garden to public access. A new ramp will be here to create accessibility to the back door and to a secured courtyard. The shop in outbuilding west is 14 inches on the ground floor from the

Mr. Cook asked what is the metal panels material.

Mr. Howington answered they believe that the addition should be contemporary. They would like for the metal panels to match the window finish.

Mr. Cook asked if an ACM panel is attached to an aluminum clip. What is the panel configuration?

Mr. Howington answered that it is a metal composite panel. It is mainly proposed to be on the back elevation of the elevator. Pointing to an area, Mr. Howington explained that the reason for the wide horizontal band is because they have 14 inches between the floor of this building and that building. Therefore, they have an internal ramp. Pointing to another area, he said they have approximately 8 inches from this floor to that floor. The windows will be a custom color to match the metal composite panel.

Mr. Cook realizes that landscaping is not the purview of the this Board, but the wall is the Board's purview. Maybe this should be put on hold until a later date. He is concerned about the two entrances.

Mr. Howington explained that they need the two entrances. The current gate is close to the building. They want everyone to enjoy the site. In order not to lose any of the historic materials, they will make the existing section into a gate. It will be designed separately as the historic gate has scrolls. The new gate will be differentiated from the historic gate.

Ms. Taylor asked Mr. Howington if they will use the existing materials.

Mr. Howington replied that they will take the same material and make a gate. He explained that the only thing they need to add to is at the bottom of the concrete curb. This is approximately 16 inches.

Ms. Lynch asked Mr. Howington if he has any evidence that the existing gate was an active gate as it seems an odd condition.

Mr. Howington answered that it does seem like an odd condition, but it has hinges, a lock and is operable. He knows the fence is historic.

Ms. Lynch explained that some time in the past, the Board does not concern things that have not been submitted prior to the meeting, but at the same time some supplementary things can be considered. She asked staff to explain their thoughts on this as it seems that the Board's consideration of this project is dependent on the supplemental information.

Ms. Michalak explained in this case, it is not design changes, but just clarification on a lot of things that were not clear in the submittal packet. She feels comfortable with the Board considering it provided they are clear on the information.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Ms. Angela Olden, Chief Financial Officer of Girl Scouts of the USA stated that she was representing their CEO, Executive Management Team and National Board. Ms. Olden said she wanted the Board to know that the Finance Committee and National Board have approved the renovation and are in complete support of it. She was joined by colleagues from Girl Scouts of the USA and Girl Scouts of Historic Georgia. They all stand in support of this renovation. They have devoted million of dollars over the last 60 years in part raised by their girls to ensure that the birthplace continues to be a jewel for the Savannah community and visitors from across the USA and the world. They take great care to adhere to preservation expectations at all times.

Ms. Lisa Junkinlopez, Executive Director of Juliette Low Gordon Birthplace, stated that she has worked in historic sites and women's history for approximately 11 years. She believes the birthplace is

Ms. Rebecca Fenwick stated that she finds the accessibility mitigation measures to be very commendable. However, there are some things that she takes issues with in this project. There is one thing particularly that is very concerning to her regarding the carriage house conversion. It is a known fact that the family had slaves and acknowledging that there is no physical space in the house to make this determination, she understands the slave story, but currently, this seems like a missed opportunity particularly as they have only begun to scratch the surface in their understanding and interpretation of other slave story in American historic sites. The Owens-Thomas House's recent exhibition is evidence of this as was the current plan for the removal of the gift shop in the basement of the Davenport House in anticipation of a greater interpretation of the slave story there. While she considers these sites on par with the Juliette Gordon Low House, but the Juliette Gordon Low house is an individually listed Historic Landmark. She wanted to be sure that this made it into the record to bring this to the Girl Scouts' attention and to say that they are the Last Defense for the site and are stewards.

Ms. Luciama Spracher, member of the Birthplace Advisory Committee, said it is important that they have a representative of the committee that could look out for the interest of preservation in keeping with this project. She thought it would be helpful for the Board to know that as they were working on the plans for the renovation addition for this project that they were very thoughtful for the history of this site. She participated in a walk-through for the architectural investigation of the west building and looked at how they took the considerations for the plans that the Board saw today. She also believes that the archaeological investigations that are planned for the site will address some of the concerns that the Board just heard Ms. Fenwick speak of about the site. She wanted to ensure the Board that as she is a part of the process, they are being very considerate to the history of the site as they move forward to plan for the future.

Mr. Bob Rosenwald of the Downtown Neighborhood Association [DNA] said all the things being planned for the Juliette Gordon Low Girl Scouts location are great. But, the DNA has had only a short time to look at this vast undertaking. They would have appreciated a consultation. He said this is a key intersection and this is a key structure. Mr. Rosenwald said with regards to ADA, the ramps, and the other requirements for this, he has not heard anything about the step-up/step-down elevators that are at the African Art Museum. Were these considered for any of the areas where there is extensive ramping? Mr. Rosenwald said this is more personal than anything, but it appears that a lot of glass expansion will be used in connecting historic and nonhistoric buildings.

Mr. Ryan Arvay of Historic Savannah Foundation [HSF] thanked Mr. Howington and members of Juliette Gordon Low Girl Scouts for meeting with HSF. What they are trying to do is ambitious and may be subject to individual's interpretation, but the HSF believes that overall what they are trying to do is sensitive. The HSF wanted to go on record that, they, too, are concerned with the future design of the garden and will be anxious to look at the designs. They believe that Ms. Clermont Lee is an important individual and that her work should be referenced while they are performing certain ADA upgrades. They suggest that they try to reference the work on the National Mall at the Capitol Mall as it has been upgraded over the years, but is still honoring the design intent. Mr. Arvay said the HSF is also slightly worried about the intrusiveness of the ramps considering that they are below grade. They are hopeful that they will not clutter the landscape.

Mr. Arvay said he believes that staff may have hinted on this, but the HSF talked with the petitioner about the early 1900 building, easternmost carriage house, where the windows will be converted to doors. They are concerned about the loss of historic fabric here. They understand that the double doors are to make accessibility easier, considering to have two of them would necessitate the demolition of some of the brick lattice. He believes also that they are here thematically to talk about the four stories is also important to be considered as they continue to interpret the site.

Ms. Patti Lyons stated that she has been a girl scout her entire life. She wanted the Board to know that as a girl scout and a Savannahian, she is very proud to be present to talk about the renovations. They have worked with a lot of talented people, including a lot of females who are extremely qualified. They are renovating the site on behalf of Juliette Gordon Low on behalf of her desire for inclusiveness. Last month they received the funds for the renovation to partner with preservation,

Ms. Lynch invited Mr. Howington to respond to the public comments.

is an important piece of the story that needs to be told.

Mr. Howington in response to the public comments, stated that some of the information was not provided along with the submittal because some of the studies were ongoing and are still ongoing. The preservation architect is still doing their investigation. He said they are documenting what they can, the history of the building. A portion of their report identifies each of the east, west, south walls. They even identify the paint on the walls, etc. Mr. Howington said he just wanted to reeiterate the access for "all." They believe that the ramps they have included on the property is the least detrimental as you can imagine. The walls on the ramps are only 18 inches high; they are recessed in the ground, and are extremely minimal. They are in the courtyard and are not actually on the building. Savannah is a living, breathing city and the building should represent a 21st Century building, not a 19th Century addition.

Mr. Howington stated that he appreciates HSF's comments. He pointed out the area where the lattice will be removed. They were hopeful that the Board would consider their research.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board applauded the Girl Scouts of USA. They discussed the metal panels, ramps and gates. An issue was raised regarding the lack of involvement for the slave quarter's aspect. Ms. Lynch said while this issue is not within the Board's purview, but since the issue surfaced, the Board would allowed Ms. Bernice Johnson to make a presentation to the Board.

Ms. Johnson came forward and stated she is the Vice-President of Girl Scouts USA and is Black. She said the Girl Scouts have embraced the responsibility to address this issue programatically. Past studies have been conducted with no proof that slave quarters were found. Ms. Johnson said they could have stopped there and said the work has been done and nothing was found. But, this is not the girl scouts way and she was pleased to say that that is not an organization she would be a part of either. The Girl Scouts are all about being inclusive; this is why she is a part of the girl scouts. It is one of the most versatile organizations on the globe. The Girl Scouts are about inclusion throughout the world. She said specifically to the issue of slave quarters, they have commissioned one of the four experts and authority on slave quarters. A female who has the only recognized data base on slave laws has been commissioned by the Girl Scouts to go further to actually look at what is available within property with this particular renovation activity that speaks to slave quarters. They have looked at how the information will be interpreted if found and what they would do with the information programatically.

The Board continued to discuss this project. They believed the petitioner has done a good job in presenting the project. The staff has recommended a continuance, but has said that if the Board feels comfortable with the supplementary information because in this case it is not design changes, but clarification on a lot of things that were not clear in the submittal packet, staff felt comfortable with the Board applauded all the physical and disabilities navigating the experiences in the location. It was the consensus that the petition could be approved with the staff's recommendation with the exception of condition #4 - Reduce the amount of historic fabric proposed to be removed at the historic window opening on the second floor of the east wall of the west contributing outbuilding. Staff condition #5 was revised The history has been provided for the gates. But, the Board wanted the petitioner to provide details and configuration for the gates and also a proposed landscape plan when completed. The Board also revised staff's recommendation #6. The Board wanted the configuration to be of a smaller scale and for the petitioner to chose a smaller scale such as wood.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations (renovations) and additions for the Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace building located at 10 East Oglethorpe Avenue with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Provide evidence that the chimney proposed to be removed is not historic;

2. Provide evidence that the majority of the east wall of the west contributing outbuilding is not historic;

3. Provide evidence that the ground floor storefront and decorative molding above on the west wall of the west contributing outbuilding is not historic;

4.Provide the history regarding the fence, gates, and masonry base fronting the garden along Oglethorpe Avenue. Provide details regarding the proposed alterations to the fence and masonry base along with the proposed landscaping plan;

5.Revise the metal panels to have a smaller scale panel height or revise the material to a softer material that is more compatible with the residential character of the site;

6.Provide all finish and color samples for the ramps and the addition;

7. Provide locations for electrical equipment and refuse storage areas on the site plan;

8. Provide locations and specifications for all new exterior lighting fixtures.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Scott Cook	
Second: Kevin Dodge	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

<u>34. Petition of Lynch Associates Architects |19-005605-COA | 119 Bull Street and 10 West State Street | Staff Approved: Amendments</u>

COA -119 Bull Street and 10 West State Street 19-005605-COA.pdf

I823.00_119 Bull St_Drawing Set.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

35. Petition of Andrew Barber for Coastal Canvas | 19-006094-COA | 219 West River Street | Staff Approved: Awnings

@ COA - 219 W. River Street [220 W. Bay St.] 19-006094-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

<u>36. Petition of Joe Wallace |19-006162-COA | 23 Montgomery Street | Staff Approved: Bell Tower Repairs,</u> <u>Stucco Repair, Roof Replacement</u>

COA - 23 Montgomery Street 19-006162-COA.pdf

Submittal Packet - 23 Montgomery Street 19-006162-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

37. Petition of Cora Bett Thomas Realty, LLC | 19-006196-COA | 230 Bull Street | Staff Approved: Signs

@ COA - 230 Bull Street 19-006196-COA.pdf

CBT_230 Bulll St_ Temporary Signage.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

38. Petition of Yu Colvard | 19-006200-COA | 228 East Huntingdon Street | Staff Approved: Roof Repair

© COA - 228 East Huntingdon Street 19-006200-COA.pdf No action required. Staff approved.

39. Petition of JOSH WATERS | 19-005409-COA | 418 E Broughton Street | Staff Approved: Windows, Doors

© COA 19-005409 418 E Broughton St.pdf

Application - 418 East Broughton Street 19-005409-COA.pdf

Checklist - 418 East Broughton Street 19-005409-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

40. Petition of NATALIE AIKEN | 19-005644-COA | 423 East River Street | Staff Approved:Windows, Doors

@ COA 19-005644 423 E River St.pdf

Application and Submittal Packet.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

41. Petition of TONY HENSLEY | 19-005562-COA | 118 West Hall Street | Staff Approved: Roof Repair, Replace

@ COA 19-005562 118 W Hall St.pdf

Submittal Packet.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

42. Petition of ERIK PULJUNG, Hansen Architects | 19-005261-COA | 509 East Charlton Street | Staff Approved: Color Change, Roof Repair, Shutters, Windows

© COA 19-005261 509 Charlton St.pdf

@ SUPP INFO 19-005261.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

43. Pettion of DONNIE RUSHING, Coastal Canvas | 19-005433-COA | 211 W St. Julian Street | Staff Approved: Awning

No action required. Staff approved.

- 44. Petition of DONNIE RUSHING | 19-005469-COA | 102 W McDonough Street | Staff Approved: Awning
 - @ COA 19-005469 102 W McDonough.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 102 West McDonough Street 19-005469-COA.pdf
 - No action required. Staff approved.
- 45. Petition of HOWARD STAFFORD | 19-005811-COA | 536 East State Street | Staff Approved: Color Change
 - @ COA 19-005811 536 E State St.pdf
 - @ APP 19-005811.pdf
 - No action required. Staff approved.
- 46. Pettion of ETHOS PRESERVATION | 19-005654-COA | 127 Abercorn Street | Staff Approved: Stucco Repair, Brick Repointing
 - @ COA 19-005654 127 Abercorn St.pdf
 - @ 127 Abercorn Street- submittal packet.pdf
 - No action required. Staff approved.
- 47. Petition of TONY HENSLEY | 19-005768-COA | 522 Indian Street | Staff Approved: Windows, Doors
 - @COA 19-005768 522 Indian St.pdf
 - @ APP 19-005768.pdf
 - No action required. Staff approved.
- 48. Petition of TONY HENSLEY | 19-005965-COA | 328 Barnard Street | Staff Approved: Windows, Doors
 - @ COA 19-005965 328 Barnard St1.pdf
 - @ APP 19-005965.pdf
 - No action required. Staff approved.
- 49. Petition of DOUG BEAN SIGNS | 19-005807-COA | 22 West Broad Street | Staff Approved: Signs
 - COA 19-005807 22 W Broughton St.pdf
 - @ <u>APP 19-005807.pdf</u>
 - No action required. Staff approved.
- 50. Petition of PLANTE'S HOTEL | 19-006009-COA | 412 West Bay Street | Staff Approved: Color Change

No action required. Staff approved.

- 51. Petition of KEVIN ROSE | 19-005905-COA | 660 East Broughton Street | Staff Approved: Windows, Doors
 - COA 19-005905 660 E BroughtonSt.pdf
 - Submittal Packet 660 East Broughton Street 19-005905-COA.pdf
 - No action required. Staff approved.
- 52. Petition of MATT DEACON, Alchemy Restoration | 19-005951-COA | 509 1/2 Tattnall Street | Staff Approved:Windows, Doors
 - No action required. Staff approved.

53. Petition of TONY HENSLEY | 19-005804-COA | 120 Montgomery Street | Staff Approved: Windows, Doors

© COA 19-005804 120 Montgomery St.pdf

Submittal Packet - 120 Montgomery Street 19-005804-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

54. Petition of DAN REEL, City of Savannah | 19-006253 | 121 East Oglethorpe Avenue | Staff Approved: Chimney Removal, Brick Repointing

COA SIGN- writable.pdf

<u>HDBR Application.pdf</u>
 No action required. Staff approved.

55. Petition of Danny Lankford for Henry Inc. | 19-006013-COA | 25 Bull Street | Staff Approved: Sign

© <u>COA - 25 Bull Street 19-006013-COA.pdf</u> No action required. Staff approved.

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

56. November 13, 2019 HDBR Meeting Report on Work Performed Without a COA

@ 11-10-2019 HDBR Report on Work Without a COA.pdf

Ms. Lynch stated that staff has given the Board the report on work performed without a COA.

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

57. Stamped Drawings - October & November Report

October and November Report.pdf

The stamped drawings for October and November 2019 have been done by staff.

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

58. 2020 HDBR Officers Election

Ms. Lynch reported that at the last meeting following members were nominated as the HDBR officers for 2020. The nominations were: Mr. Dwayne Stephens, Chair and Ms. Nan Taylor, Vice-Chair.

Motion

Approve HDBR Officers for 2020 - Dwayne Stephens, Chair and Nan Taylor, Vice-Chair

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Kevin Dodge Second: Melissa Memory Debra Caldwell

- Aye

Kellie Fletcher	- Not Present
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

XV. ADJOURNMENT

59. Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting - Thursday, November 14, 2019 at 3:30pm in the Meyer Conference Room, MPC 110 East State Street

60. Next Pre-Meeting - Wednesday, December 11, 2019 at 12:00pm in the Chatham County Commission Chambers, 124 Bull Street - 2nd Floor

<u>61. Next Regular Meeting - Wednesday, December 11, 2019 at 1:00pm in the Chatham County Commission</u> <u>Chambers, 124 Bull Street - 2nd Floor</u>

62. Adjourned

There being no further business to come before the HDBR, Ms. Lynch adjourned the meeting at 5:05 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation LGM:mem

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.