

Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Chatham County Commission Chambers October 9, 2019 1:00 P.M. MINUTES

OCTOBER 9, 2019 SAVANNAH HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM in the Green Room of the Chatham County Commission Chambers at 124 Bull Street. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted, and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received and no votes were taken.

Members Present:	Becky Lynch, Chair Dwayne Stephens, Vice-Chair David Altschiller Scott Cook Kevin Dodge Stan Houle Ellie Isaacs Melissa Memory Nan Taylor
Members Absent:	Debra Caldwell
MPC Staff Present:	Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation Ryan Jarles, Cultural Resources Planner Alyson Smith, Historic Preservation Planner Bri Finau, Administrative Assistant Mary E. Mitchell, Administrative Assistant

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

1. Call to Order and Welcome

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

- 2. Petition of Karen Wilson | 19-005074-COA | 339 MLK Jr. Blvd. | Signs
 - @ 19-005074-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
 - Sign Package Drawings.pdf
 - Ø Aerial View.pdf
 - Submittal Packet Owner's Authorization 339 MLK Jr. Blvd 19-005074-COA.pdf
 - Ø Submittal Packet 339 MLK Jr. Blvd 19-005074-COA.pdf

Application - 339 MLK Jr. Blvd. 19-005074-COA Update.pdf

Checklist - 339 MLK Jr. Blvd. 19-005074-COA.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve a sign package at 339 Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard with the following conditions because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Ensure that the sign supports for the projecting and wall signs are installed within the mortar joints inbetween the brick;

2. Ensure the work is undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

oved)

Motion: Nan Taylor	
Second: David Altschiller	
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

3. Petition of Array Design | 19-005181-COA | 117 West Jones Street | Alterations

- Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Ø Submittal Packet.pdf
- Previously approved COA 117 West Jones Street 16-003712-COA.pdf
- Previously approved Drawings 16-003712-COA.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the proposed rear porch alterations at 117 West Jones Street with the following conditions to be approved by staff:

- 1. Provide a material specification for the retractable awning.
- 2. Ensure the railing height does exceed 36 inches.

Because otherwise the work meets the standards and is visually compatible.

Motion: Nan Taylor	
Second: David Altschiller	
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

4. Petition of Hallett & Co | 19-005184-COA | 124 Abercorn Street | Alteration

<u>19-005184-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf</u>

- Submittal Packet 19-005184.pdf
- Sanborn Maps and HABS Drawing.pdf
- Application 19-005184.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the amendment to a previously approved COA [19-000157-COA] to install a new door opening to the south facing garden wall on the Owens-Thomas House property at 124 Abercorn Street with the following conditions because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Ensure that the work is undertaken using the gentlest means possible so as not to damage the adjacent historic portion of the wall.

2. Ensure that the door is inset 3 inches from the exterior surface of the facade.

Motion: Nan Taylor	
Second: David Altschiller	
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Ave

Ellie Isaacs

- Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

5. Adopt October 9, 2019 Agenda

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby adopt October 9, 2019 Agenda.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Stan Houle	
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

6. Approve September 11, 2019 Briefing Minutes and September 11, 2019 Regular Meeting Minutes

September 11, 2019 HBR Briefing Minutes.docx

@ 09-11-2019 Minutes.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the Briefing and Regular Minutes of September 11, 2019.

Μ	otion: Dwayne Stephens	
S	econd: Ellie Isaacs	
B	ecky Lynch	- Abstain
S	cott Cook	- Aye
D	wayne Stephens	- Aye
Μ	elissa Memory	- Aye
D	avid Altschiller	- Aye
N	an Taylor	- Aye

Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

7. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay Architects | 16-006851-COA | 620 East River Street | Amendments to New Construction, Part I: Height Mass and Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Dwayne Stephens	
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

8. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006852-COA | 630 East River Street | New Construction Parking Garage: Part II, Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Dwayne Stephens	
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye

Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

9. Petition of LS3P | 18-006314-COA | 2 Whitaker Street | Demolition and New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Dwayne Stephens	
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

10. Petition of Lott Barber | 18-006769-COA | 145 Montgomery Street | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Dwayne Stephens	
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye

David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

11. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 19-004089-COA | 313-316 West River Street | Rehabilitation and Alterations

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Dwayne Stephens	
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

12. Petition of Kareem Simmons | 19-004293-COA | 348 Lincoln Street | Addition

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Dwayne Stephens	
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye

David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

13. Petition of Steven Bodek | 19-004739-COA | 446 Price Street | Porch Addition

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to continue the petition as requested.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Dwayne Stephens	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

14. Petition of Gunn, Meyerhoff, Shay | 17-002122-COA | 602 East River Street (Hotel Anne) | New Construction Part II: Design Details

- @ 17-002122-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- New Franklin Ward Wharf Lots MAP B.pdf
- Previous Submittal Packet.pdf
- Staff Research Bridges.pdf
- Staff Research Trustees Garden Buildings.pdf
- Submittal Packet Hotel Anne Three as One.pdf
- Submittal Packet Model, Photos, and Drawings.pdf
- Submittal Packet Specifications and Samples.pdf
- Aerial.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request for approval of New Construction, Part II Design Details on the vacant parcel at 602 East River Street. There are three buildings to be connected by bridges and two courtyards. This was previously approved at with the previous ordinance; the 2018 version of the plans still apply. Part I was approved with conditions in 2017.

Later, at the November 14, 2018 HDBR Meeting, Part I was granted an extension (12-month extension approved).

Ms. Taylor asked if the bathrooms are elevator are not permitted, will the bridges be removed?

Ms. Michalak stated she believes the intent would be to have the bathrooms open air. A material board was presented to the Board to view.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of Part I Height and Mass <u>with the following condition</u> to be submitted with Part II Design Details because the project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards:

1. Eliminate all enclosed spaces on the roofs that are considered a story per the ordinance, including: restrooms and vestibules.

Staff recommends a <u>continuance</u> for Part II Design Details <u>in order for the petitioner to</u> <u>consider/provide/redesign the following:</u>

- 1. Provide clarification regarding the metal panel "pole" centered within each balcony.
- 2. Remove the folding screen panels that enclose the balconies and enclose portions of the rooftop trellises.
- 3. Reselect the brick to be less tumbled and with no colored/white finish.
- 4. Revise aluminum storefront to be wood so that the storefront material is consistent on all facades of all buildings.
- 5. Clarify what the substrate material is for the rooftop areas that are proposed to be painted "Panda White."
- 6. Clarify where the standing seam metal roof will be utilized.
- 7. Revise all window and "storefront" types to have an operable component (double or triple hung, awning, or casement).
- 8. Provide additional specification information and a full window sample for the "Dynamic" window.
- 9. Clarify if the storefront has a base or sill as required. Provide additional information, including a section through the storefront showing a base or sill.
- 10. Provide a section through the stoops (including the treads and risers); ensure that the treads and risers are brick, wood, precast stone, marble, sandstone or slate to meet the standard.
- 11. Redesign all railings to have a bottom rail.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Patrick Shay stated the enclosed spaces on the roof are not considered habitable space. The vestibule is only for the elevator; to keep the weather out of if. The bridges are being made to be as transparent as possible, they were moved to the middle to be set back from River Street. Much effort was used to select materials to compliment the area, though not a part of the National Historic Landmark District. The folding screen panel location is negotiable.

Ms. Lynch asked if the shutter panels reach to the roof. Mr. Shay stated they are almost flush to the balcony railing, with a balcony depth of 5'10 3/4".

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Bob Rosenwald, of the Downtown Neighborhood Association, expressed appreciation of all involved. Stated there are concerns of restaurants on the roof was precedes it becoming a bar or cocktail lounge, which clearly become floors, particularly as this one will be on a lower level. There are other instances in downtown Savannah of this. Support of staff recommendation.

Mr. Shay responded that rooftop spaces are a long-standing tradition in downtown Savannah. These spaces are not open to the public, only for hotels guests.

Mr. Dodge asked what is the purpose of the restrooms if the rooftop is only for hotel guests, not the public.

Mr. Shay stated there may be hotel events and the health department requires it near swimming pools.

BOARD COMMENTS

Ms. Memory stated she agrees with staff recommendation, excepting the color of brick. Concerns of monochromatic color and get lost; opportunity to do something less distressed. Appreciates effort to differentiate.

Mr. Dodge states he agrees with most of staff's recommendation. He also shares Ms. Memory's concern regarding the brick color. He agrees also with Mr. Shay's definition of habitable space.

Ms. Taylor agrees with staff comments; struggles with the habitable space. Has concerns to what it may evolve into.

Mr. Stephens stated he agrees with staff recommendation. He is trying to process the bathroom situation.

Mr. Cook stated the bridges don't bother him. He stated the trellises give the impression of another story; do all three building need trellises? He stated he is not opposed to the restrooms as long as they don't give the impression of another story. He stated he agrees with staff regarding the brick; it should be a little less distressed and more contemporary. The River Street façade is usually expressed with punched openings with minimal shutters and screens; what's presented is not in keeping with the current River Street view.

Mr. Autschiller stated he agrees with staff recommendations. The roof structures are the main concern; they have maximized the roof space rather than minimized it.

Ms. Isaacs said she shares the same concerns and thoughts as Mr. Cook. The screening leads to a more enclosed space. Agrees with staff comments.

Mr. Houle stated he agrees with staff and the other comments.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby:

Approve Part I Height and Mass with the following conditions

1.Greatly reduce the amount of enclosed space on the rooftops to reduce the visual impact of all access structures and other spaces that are enclosed.

Continue Part II Design Details in order for the petitioner to consider/provide/redesign the following:

1. Provide clarification regarding the metal panel "pole" centered within each balcony.

2. Remove the folding screen panels that enclose the balconies and enclose portions of the rooftop trellises.

3.Reselect the brick to be less tumbled and with no colored/white finish.

4. Revise aluminum storefront to be wood so that the storefront material is consistent on all facades of all buildings.

5.Clarify what the substrate material is for the rooftop areas that are proposed to be painted "Panda White."

6.Clarify where the standing seam metal roof will be utilized.

7.Revise all window and "storefront" types to have an operable component (double or triple hung, awning, or casement).

8. Provide additional specification information and a full window sample for the "Dynamic" window.

9.Clarify if the storefront has a base or sill as required. Provide additional information, including a section through the storefront showing a base or sill.

10.Provide a section through the stoops (including the treads and risers); ensure that the treads and risers are brick, wood, precast stone, marble, sandstone or slate to meet the standard.

11.Redesign all railings to have a bottom rail.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Scott Cook	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

15. Petition of Greenline Architecture | 17-002904-COA | 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | New Construction Part I: Height and Mass Amendments

- 17-002904-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf

Mass Model.pdf

Ms. Michalak presented the petitioner's request for approval for amendments to New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass of a six (6) story hotel at 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. The building features a symmetrical front façade facing MLK with two floors of underground parking. The building is U-shaped, with a recessed vehicular drop-off area facing Zubley Street. Architecturally, the building is evocative of the Art Deco style. The project is classified as Large-Scale Development and the petitioner is requesting one bonus story above the Height Map (this is a 5-story height zone).

Because the proposed changes are visually compatible and meets all standards, staff recommends approval of the requested amendments.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approve amendments to New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass of a six (6) story hotel at 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. as requested because the proposed changes are visually compatible and meet the standards.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Keith Howington stated they wanted to be sure they were in compliance with staff and Board direction. He stated he in is agreement with staff recommendations.

BOARD COMMENTS

All of the Board agreed with the staff recommendation.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for amendments to New Construction: Part I, Height and Mass of a six (6) story hotel at 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. as requested because the proposed changes are visually compatible and meet the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

- Abstain
- Aye

16. Petition of J. Elder Studio | 19-003464-COA | 513 East Jones Street | New Construction: Part II: Design Details

- Staff Recommendation.pdf
- 513 East Jones Material Board.pdf
- ø 513 EAST JONES_HDBR Cover Letter.pdf
- Ø 513 EAST JONES_HDBR Part 2.pdf

@ 513 Material Cut Sheets.pdf

@ Part I -COA 19-003464 513 E JONES ST.pdf

Part I - Submittal Packet.pdf

Ms. Alyson Smith presented the petitioner's request for approval for New Construction, Part 2: Design Details, for a carriage house behind 513 East Jones Street. The two-story, two-bay carriage house orients south towards East Jones Lane. The building's east and west elevations will be partially visible from the lane. The proposed building was originally reviewed under a previous version of the Historic District Ordinance (2018 version); therefore, the prior version still applies.

The HDBR approved, on July 10, 2019 new construction Part I: Height and Mass with conditions.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approval of New Construction, Part II: Design Details for a carriage house at 513 East Jones Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff:

- 1. Relocate the fence further south to align with property line along the lane.
- 2. Specify the material and design of the proposed garage doors.
- 3. Add corner boards to the building.
- 4. The fiber cement siding shall be revised to have a smooth finish.
- 5. Ensure the fence is painted or stained.
- 6. Provide a material specification for the proposed shutters.

7. Confirm the proposed window specification with staff to ensure the specification is in compliance with the ordinance.

8. Provide the pitch of the side gable roof on permit plans. Ensure it is between 4:12 and 8:12.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Jerome Elder stated that the window is by the same manufacturer but is not a transom unit; it is a double-hung. He stated he agrees with the staff recommendations and conditions.

BOARD COMMENTS

Mr. Dodge stated he agrees with staff recommendations and accepts the petitioner's clarifications.

Mr. Cook encouraged providing any relocation of electrical meters to staff. The remainder of the Board agreed with staff recommendations.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for New Construction, Part II: Design Details for a carriage house at 513 East Jones Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff:

1.Relocate the fence further south to align with property line along the lane.

2. Specify the material and design of the proposed garage doors.

- 3.Add corner boards to the building.
- 4. The fiber cement siding shall be revised to have a smooth finish.
- 5.Ensure the fence is painted or stained.
- 6.Provide a material specification for the proposed shutters.

7.Confirm the proposed window specification with staff to ensure the specification is in compliance with the ordinance.

8. Provide the pitch of the side gable roof on permit plans. Ensure it is between 4:12 and 8:12.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Nan Taylor	
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

17. Petition of Ethos Preservation | 19-004724-COA | 219 East Charlton Street | Amendments and Alterations

- Ø Submittal Packet.pdf
- @ COA 219 East Charlton Street 18-002073-COA.pdf
- © COA Drawings 219 East Charlton Street 17-003633-COA.pdf
- @ COA 219 East Charlton Street 17-003633-COA.pdf
- COA Drawings 219 East Charlton Street 18-002073-COA.pdf
- Chisholm letter.pdf

<u>19-004724-COA Staff Recommendation.pdf</u>

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the applicant's request after-the-fact approval for amendments to a new construction carriage house located at the rear of the property at 219 East Charlton Street. Per the applicant: The project proposes two amendments to the previously approved carriage house design located at 219 East Charlton Street (17-003633-COA and 18-002073-COA). The carriage house has been constructed and the proposed amendments were necessitated by changing site conditions during construction.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

After-the-fact <u>denial</u> for amendments to a new construction carriage house located at the rear of the property at 219 East Charlton Street because neither the 29 inch deep wing walls or the unpainted concrete block wall are visually compatible with contributing buildings to which this building is visually related.

Mr. Cook asked if the building is against the rear property line.

Ms. Michalak replied yes.

Mr. Dodge asked if the original request (in 2017) was for larger wing walls but reduced by the Board.

Ms. Michalak stated she does not recall.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Ms. Ellen Harris stated the wing wall was built at 29 inches to accommodate the electrical equipment. The whole building was set back; there is no encroachment in the right of way. She highlighted that the task before the Board is to determine visual compatibility. She stated the current configuration is not in violation of any design standards. There is no standard regarding wing wall depth, except visual

The adjacent property owner blocks the subject property owner's progress, although the adjacent property owner was consulted before the project was started. The lack of accessibility is resulting in lack of receiving the certificate of occupancy until the certificate of appropriateness is approved; the property is unusable. The Board direction of trespassing via a cherry picker is not appropriate. The owner is committed to completing the wall but is at an impasse. There is a precedent of painted and unpainted walls on lanes. Request approval.

Ms. Taylor asked if the wing wall to be reduced is adjacent to the conflicting neighbor, and will that be a problem.

Ms. Harris replied, yes it is and there is no way to reduce the wall to 12 inches. There are no records of original wing walls versus new ones. She visually indicated which were contributing and non-contributing structures.

Ms. Memory asked if staff was notified prior to or during construction of issues.

Ms. Smith replied no.

Ms. Michalak stated they were notified after the fact for final inspection.

BOARD COMMENTS

Mr. Houle stated he has concerns about the untreated concrete walls. He states he supports staff recommendations regarding the untreated wall.

Mr. Autschiller stated they are being asked to approve a blight due to a dispute; something the Board should not be involved in. The wing wall is of less concern than the unpainted concrete to him.

Mr. Cook stated the Board cannot approve an unfinished block wall when the ordinance states it has to be finished material. He stated the walls were approved at 12 inches. he agrees with the staff recommendation.

Mr. Stephens stated the stamped drawings with expectations of 12 inches was disregarded. He supports staff recommendations.

Ms. Taylor stated is was an obvious, deliberate decision to go beyond the approved 12 inches for the electrical. She agrees with staff recommendation.

Mr. Dodge stated he is aware it is not the purview of the Board to consider the hardship of the owner; visual compatibly is the issue. He stated he'd rather leave the wall at the size it is and have the finish obtained.

Ms. Memory stated she is concerned about the process. The fact that it was requested, denied, yet done, establishes a terrible precedent. It undermines the authority of the Board.

Ms. Smith stated staff was not notified about the wing wall. However, the owner did reach out regarding the inability to finish the wall. Staff advised they seek legal advice at that time.

Ms. Isaacs if they could apply or be referred for a variance.

Ms. Michalak replied no, there is not variance for undue hardship and visual compatibility cannot be varied.

Ms. Isaacs asked is the plan to resolve in court if the petition is denied.

Ms. Michalak stated possibly.

Ms. Harris stated the petitioner would like to request a continuance but with the understanding that the

Chatham County Commission Chambers October 9, 2019 1:00 P.M. MINUTES opinion of the City Attorney would be sought out on this matter: that staff and Board would get the opinion of the City attorney if the HDRB has authority to resolve the issue between the neighbors and any other legal aspect of the matter, such as what would happen next and what is in the Boards purview.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the petition for amendments to a new construction carriage house located at the rear of the property at 219 East Charlton Street per the petitioner's request.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Dwayne Stephens	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

18. Petition of LS3P Associates LTD. | 19-004729-COA | 303 Tattnall Street | Amendment to New Construction

- Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Packet- October.pdf
- Layla Lane HDBR Narrative .pdf
- Submittal Packet- September.pdf

Ms. Lynch and Mr. Scott recused themselves from this item. Mr. Stephens sat as Chair.

Ms. Smith presented the petitioner's request of approval for amendments to a previously approved COA for new construction at 303 Tattnall Street. The amendment seeks to address design revisions due to changes with the structural system, mechanical systems and façade detailing. The following amendments are proposed:

This project will be reviewed under the pre-2018 ordinance.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approve the request for an amendment to a previously approved COA for new construction at 303 Tattnall Street [File No. 16-006855-COA] with the following condition:

1. A COA application will need to be submitted for the signage.

Recommend approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the following standard:

All Mechanical or Access structures shall be contained within the additional story. Because the variance criteria have been met.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Neil Dawson stated they tried to work with the neighborhoods. A design was developed in relation to the variance request; more costly but better for the neighborhood. Considering public art and additional trees to keep Tattnall from being a drop off.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Bob Rosenwald complimented Mr. Dawson's efforts to be neighborhood-friendly.

BOARD COMMENTS

The Board commended the petitioner's process with the project. All agreed with the staff recommendation.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for an amendment to a previously approved COA for new construction at 303 Tattnall Street [File No. 16-006855-COA] with the following condition:

1.A COA application will need to be submitted for the signage.

Recommend approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the following standard: All Mechanical or Access structures shall be contained within the additional story. Because the variance criteria have been met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Stan Houle	
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Abstain
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

19. Petition of Jason Bartek | 19-004720-COA | 317 East Jones Street | Staff Approved - Exterior Door

COA - 317 East Jones Street 19-004720-COA.pdf

@ SUPP 19-004720.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

20. Petition of Dan Bowman for JP Morgan Chase Bank NA | 19-004826-COA | 201 West Broughton Street Unit 101 | Staff Approved - Color Changes @ COA - 201 West Broughton St. - Unit 101 19-004826-COA.pdf

Submittal Packet - 201 West Broughton Street Unit 101 19-004826-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

21. Petition of Harley Krinsky | 19-004914-COA | 42 Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard | Staff Approved - Kitchen Hood

@ COA - 42 MLK Jr. Blvd 19-004914-COA.pdf

Submittal Packet - 42 MLK Jr. Blvd - 411 W. Congress Street 19-004914-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

22. Petition of Courtney Victor | 19-005070-COA | 3 East Perry Street | Staff Approved - Color Change

COA - 3 East Perry Street 19-005070-COA.pdf

Submittal Packet - 3 East Perry Street 19-005070-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

23. Petition of Tony Hensley for SCAD | 19-005114-COA | 503 Whitaker Street | Staff Approved - Stucco Repairs

© COA - 503 Whitaker Street 19-005114-COA.pdf

@ SUPP INFO 19-005114.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

24. Petition of Tony Hensley for SCAD | 19-005116-COA | 151 Bull Street | Staff Approved - Mechanical Screening

COA - 621 Drayton Street 19-005116-COA.pdf

@SUPP INFO 19-005116.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

25. Petition of Dennis Craven for Chatham Lodging Trust | 19-005124-COA | 150 Montgomery Street | Staff Approved - Vinyl Sign Graphics

COA - 150 Montgomery Street 19-005124-COA.pdf

Submittal Packet - 150 Montgomery Street 19-005124-COA.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

26. Petition of Tony Hensley for SCAD | 19-005179-COA | 229 Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard | Staff Approved -Signage

© COA - 229 Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard 19-005179-COA.pdf

@ SUPP IN 19-005179.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

27. Petition of Ethos Preservation | 19-005198-COA | 313-321 West River Street | Staff Approved - Repointing

@ COA - 313-321 West River Street 19-005198-COA.pdf

@ SUPP INFO19-005198.pdf

No action required. Staff approved.

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

NEW BUSINESS

28. 2020 Officers Nominating Committee

Nominees:

Dwayne Stephens - Chair Nan Taylor - Vice

Nominating Committee:

Becky Lynch Dwayne Stephens Scott Cook Melissa Memory

The Nominating Committee met on October 2, 2019.

XV. ADJOURNMENT

29. Next Case Distribution and Chair Review Meeting - Thursday, October 17, 2019 at 3:30pm in the Meyer Conference Room, MPC 110 East State Street

<u>30. Next Pre-Meeting - Wednesday, November 13, 2019 at 12:00pm in the Chatham County Commission</u> Chambers, 124 Bull Street - 2nd Floor

<u>31. Next Regular Meeting - Wednesday, November 13, 2019 at 1:00pm in the Chatham County Commission</u> Chambers, 124 Bull Street - 2nd Floor

32. Adjourned

There being no further business to present before the Board, the Savannah Historic District Board of Review was adjourned by Ms. Lynch at 3:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Leah G. Michalak, Director /bf

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.