

Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Chatham County Commission Chambers, 124 Bull Street, 2nd Floor March 11, 2020 1:00 P.M. MINUTES

MARCH 11, 2020 SAVANNAH HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM in the Chatham County Commission Chambers, 124 Bull Street - 2nd Floor. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted, and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received and no votes were taken.

Members Present:

Dwayne Stephens, Chair Nan Taylor, Vice-Chair David Altschiller Debra Caldwell Scott Cook Kevin Dodge Stan Houle Ellie Isaacs Becky Lynch Melissa Memory

MPC Staff Present: Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation Ryan Jarles, Cultural Resources Planner Alyson Smith, Historic Preservation

Planner

Bri Finau, Administrative Assistant

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Approve All Items on the Consent Agenda

Motion

Approve Consent Agenda as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Becky Lynch	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

2. Petition of Sargenti Architects | 20-000211-COA | 103 W Broughton Street | Signs

- Application 20-000211-COA.pdf
- SavannahGA-A-2020_REVISED_1-24-2020.pdf
- Staff Recommendation 20-000211-COA.pdf

Motion

Approve the request to install two (2) awnings, one (1) principal use wall sign and one (1) under-awning sign on the building at 103 West Broughton Street, with the following conditions, because otherwise the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

 The petitioner shall use the gentlest means possible during the preparation of each surface for installation and during the installation of the signage and awnings.
The petitioner's plans contain reference to 45.7 square feet of signage. This reference shall be removed.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Becky Lynch	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye

Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

3. Petition of Marchese Construction, LLC | 20-000875-COA | 250 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard | Alterations

Staff Recommendation - 20-000875-COA.pdf

@ APP 20-000875 250 MLK.pdf

@ SUPP INFO 20-000875.pdf

Motion

Approve the request for alterations and the installation of signage on the building located at 250 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd, with the following conditions, because otherwise the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. The petitioner shall ensure the proposed window signs do not exceed 10% of the window area of each façade.

2. This approval does not include the alterations of the porch depicted in the petitioner's renderings.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Becky Lynch	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

4. Petition of J. Elder Studio | 20-000899-COA | 110 E Broughton Street | Signs

@ 110 EAST BROUGHTON_HOKULIA_HDBR_SIGNAGE.pdf

Staff Recommendation_20-000899-COA.pdf

Motion

Approve the request to install one (1) principal use wall sign and the face change of one existing underawning sign, with the following conditions, because otherwise the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards: 1. The petitioner shall use the gentlest means possible when preparing surfaces for installation and during the installation process.

2. The petitioner shall ensure historic materials are not damaged.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Becky Lynch	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

5. Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 20-000901-COA | 209 East Gaston Street | Alterations

COA - 209 East Gaston Street 15-002135-COA.pdf

@ Staff Rec - 20-000901.pdf

Motion

Approve the alterations to include a chimney on the rear façade of 409 East Liberty Street with the condition that the design be revised to differentiate the chimney details from the historic building because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Becky Lynch	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Abstain
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

Submittal packet and maps.pdf

6. Petition of Matt Follis | 20-000856-COA | 545 East Congress Street | Addition

- Staff Recommendation .pdf
- Project Description.pdf
- Photos.pdf
- Existing Rear Elevation .pdf
- Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Ø Drawings.pdf

Motion

Approval of the addition at 545 East Congress Street because the proposed addition is visually compatible and meets the design standards.

Note: This recommendation could change subject to new information provided at the Historic District Board of Review meetings. Final decisions will be made by the Historic District Board of Review at the public hearing based on information provided at the meeting, as well as information submitted for the staff recommendation.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Becky Lynch	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

7. Petition of Sushi Hana | 20-000774-COA | 18 E Broughton Street | Sign

Staff Recommendation- 20-000774.pdf

Submittal Packet.pdf

Motion

Approval for a wall sign for the property located 18 East Broughton Street as requested because the sign is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved) Motion: Becky Lynch

Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

8. Petition of Anthony Debreceny | 20-000752-COA | 9 Drayton Street | Signs

Staff Recommendation - 20-000752-COA.pdf

Ø Submittal Packet.pdf

Motion

Approval for a principal use projecting sign for the property located 9 Drayton Street as requested because the sign is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Becky Lynch	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

9. Adopt the March 11, 2020 Agenda

Motion

Adopt the March 11, 2020 Agenda as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: David Altschiller	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

10. Approve February 12, 2020 Briefing Minutes and February 12, 2020 Regular Meetings Minutes

@ 02.12.20 MEETING MINUTES.pdf

Motion

Approve February 12, 2020 Meeting Minutes as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Stan Houle	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

11. Continue All Items on the Continued Agenda

Motion

Approve March 11, 2020 HDBR Continued Agenda as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Debra Caldwell	
Second: Nan Taylor	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

12. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006852-COA | 630 East River Street | New Construction Parking Garage: Part II, Design Details

Motion	
Continue.	
Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Debra Caldwell	
Second: Nan Taylor	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

13. Petition of Greenline Architecture | 17-002904-COA | 63 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion

Continue.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Debra Caldwell

Second: Nan Taylor

Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

14. Petition of Gunn, Meyerhoff, Shay | 17-002122-COA | 602 East River Street (Hotel Anne) | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion		
Continue.		
Vote Results (Approved)		
Motion: Debra Caldwell		
Second: Nan Taylor		
Debra Caldwell	- Aye	
Becky Lynch	- Aye	
Scott Cook	- Aye	
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye	
Melissa Memory	- Aye	
David Altschiller	- Aye	
Nan Taylor	- Aye	
Kevin Dodge	- Aye	
Stan Houle	- Aye	
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye	

15. Petition of LS3P | 18-006314-COA | 2 Whitaker Street | Demolition and New Construction Part II: Design Details

Continue.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Debra Caldwell	
Second: Nan Taylor	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye

Scott Cook	- Abstain
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

16. Petition of Lott Barber | 18-006769-COA | 145 Montgomery Street | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion		
Continue.		
Vote Results (Approved)		
Motion: Debra Caldwell		
Second: Nan Taylor		
Debra Caldwell	- Aye	
Becky Lynch	- Aye	
Scott Cook	- Aye	
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye	
Melissa Memory	- Aye	
David Altschiller	- Aye	
Nan Taylor	- Aye	
Kevin Dodge	- Aye	
Stan Houle	- Aye	
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye	

17. Petition of Ethos Preservation | 19-004724-COA | 219 East Charlton Street | Amendments and Alterations

Motion	
Continue.	
Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Debra Caldwell	
Second: Nan Taylor	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye

Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

18. Petition of Barge Design Solutions | 20-000882-COA | 10 East Oglethorpe Avenue (Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace) | Site Alterations

- Project Narrative and Materials.pdf
- Site Demo Supplement.pdf
- Drawing of Lee Garden Design.pdf
- Ø Archaeology Article.pdf
- Historic Photographs.pdf
- @ 1954 and 1973 Sanborn Maps.pdf
- 2016 HALS Report JGLB Garden.pdf
- HDBR Response To Conditions of Approval for 19-005946-COA.pdf
- Staff Recommendation 20-000882-COA.pdf
- Ø Drawings.pdf

Letters of Opposition.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the applicant's request for approval of alterations to a historic wall/fence as well as the addition of vertical hardscaping elements for the Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace property located at 10 East Oglethorpe Avenue. The purpose is to provide a new iron gate at the east side of the garden to match the existing garden gate to increase site-wide functionality by shifting the primary visitor entrance to the garden.

The "garden and courtyard landscapes were designed in the 1950s by landscape architect Clermont Lee. Staff received a call from a citizen that the garden had been removed; staff visited the site and found that the majority of the garden has been removed for an archaeology dig that is occurring at this site. Staff was not first contacted by the applicant/owner before proceeding with the work inside the garden.

Per the HDBR ByLaws: "The jurisdiction of the Board shall include those elements of development, rehabilitation, preservation, or demolition that affect the exterior visual quality of the Historic District, specially including exterior appearance of structures within the Historic District. The Board shall not consider the interior arrangement of structures." Therefore, existing plants, trees, and other living landscaping elements and non-vertical hardscaping elements are not within the purview of the Historic District Board of Review. Although not within the Board's purview, staff is certainly concerned about the alterations to this cultural landscape.

The applicant informed that no existing permanent vertical hardscaping elements are/were present in the garden. The gravel paths were lined with tiles that were not mortared in. The tiles have been removed and salvaged and will not be put back in the garden. The garden fence, gates, and masonry base fronting the garden along Oglethorpe Avenue were installed

between 1820 and 1859 per the additional information provided for the conditions of the previous approval.

Staff recommends **approval** for alterations to an historic wall/fence as well as the addition of vertical hardscaping elements for the Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace property located at 10 East Oglethorpe Avenue as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Mr. Keith Howington, petitioner, stated they have returned at the request of the Board regarding the garden. The gate will not match the one on the western portion. The eightfoot panel will preserve as much historic fabric as possible, by cutting out what only is needed and adding a hinge. It will be one large gate. The approval of that will be similar to what has already be approved, which will improve accessibility. The accessibility for all is the main concern in this private garden.

Mr. Nick Laybourn, legal counsel for the petitioner, highlighted the Board's purview and the ADA.

Ms. Lara Ballock, petitioner, highlighted her qualifications as a landscape architect. She stated Clermont Lee's instruction to keep the use of the garden in harmony with the changing needs of the times. It has been observed the tiles pose a tripping hazard. The property owner has chosen to make the private garden accessible to all, rather than regress to the original restrictive design.

Mr. Spencer Tunnell, historic landscape architect, is opposed to the project. He stated there are other ways to achieve accessibility without opening another orifice. He requests the Board to deny the petition.

Mr. Mark McDonald, President of the Georgia Trust for Historic Preservation, stated his organization listed the Juliette Gordon Low Garden as 'Places in Peril' due to the changes being considered. They reached out to the agency in 2019, but they were not open to compromise for preservation of the garden while providing accessibility. He believes the Board does have purview of the vertical landscape elements. The vertical garden tiles, though small, are still significant. they were installed in 1956, reused from the Victorian era. They separate the hardscape from the landscape features. The removal of the tiles without the Board's permission was a violation of the law. It also sets in motion their plan to install a cast-in-place concrete wall.

Mr. Ryan Arvay, of the Historic Savannah Foundation, expressed his disapproval of the petition. The whole project is a disturbance of the historic fabric. The existing opening could be used for access; there is no necessity of a new opening. He requested denial of the petition. He feels it opens the way for other inappropriate alterations, and is contrary to the hard work of the City's efforts to preserve its historic integrity. He stated a movement to preserve historic pavement is in progress.

Mr. Gary Radke, Chair of the Architectural Review Committee of Historic Savannah Foundation, stated his organization is opposed to the petition. There is another gate that already exists. He expressed the objection of the Cultural Landscape Foundation of Savannah.

Ms. Linda Foreman, member of the Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace Advisory Committee, stated they are trying to maximize the accessibility for all, thus respect her legacy. They feel the proposed plan is in the best interest of the agency and all Girl Scouts.

Ms. Sue Else, CEO of the Girl Scouts of Georgia, stated the proposed plan benefits all Girl

Scouts, as many visit annually.

Ms. Taylor Rigsby, lifetime Girl Scout, stated she'd like for all to have the privilege to visit the site in its entirety, as she has. She supports the renovation.

Mr. Ryan Madsen, preservationist, landscape architect, former HSMC member, and current member of the Girl Scout Advisory Committee, stated they applied feedback from all, including Low descendants to the design. He stated the purpose of the garden was for viewing, and Ms. Lee did not advocate renovation, unless to its original design, but for total demolition to accommodate the Girl Scouts future needs. It was to be admired, not used for activity. The Committee is attempting to honor Ms. Lee and the past while securing the future of the Girl Scouts with this project.

Mr. Brinker Long, member of the Kay family, stated his grandfather, an original Advisory Committee member, stated they want to see the Girl Scouts continue to succeed. He and his family support the petition.

Mr. James Abramson, ADA Coordinator for Chatham County, stated he professionally believes that this renovation is positive. He supports the project.

Mr. Charles Granquist, member of the Birthplace Advisory Committee and preservationist, stated he supports the project. He stated he is impressed with the sensitivity shown in relation to this project.

Mr. Howington responded to the concerns presented by stating some of the suggestions are modifications, not preservation. He stated that at one time livestock were in the squares - do we revert back to that today? We have to adapt to modern day, and that is the goal with the JGLB Garden. He stated the tiles are not fixed, therefore not the purview of the Board. Vegetation has always been excluded. He stated knee walls are all over the City. The tiles are still on-site, will be repurposed. The gate is not being removed, only modified by cutting a part to get the visitors off of the sidewalk and into the site.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Houle thanked the Girl Scouts for their contribution to society. He stated he believes there may be some issue with the gate, but the owner has the right to do as they please with the garden.

Mr. Dodge agreed that the stakeholders have the right to proceed as they'd like with the garden, as there will be minimal loss per the petitioner.

Ms. Isaacs stated her issue is that just the existing gate is not being used, but altering historic material by adding another gate. It is a sensitive design, but she doesn't understand the purpose if there is already a gate there.

Ms. Memory stated she believes the Girl Scouts have put a lot of effort into the modification. However, it is a National Historic Landmark inside a Historic Landmark. The decision to pursue accessibility over preservation should be reconsidered.

Ms. Lynch stated landscapes are organic and change over time. However, in this instance, it is a loss for the element of the City's history, not to minimize the need for accessibility. She has some concern over creating a new gate rather than use the existing one.

Mr. Taylor stated the application was well done in providing the ADA compliance. She likes

it is evolving and more applicable to more people. It's tough to mesh historic preservation and accessibility. She stated she also has concern with a new gate; she prefers to see the original gate being used, along with the tiles.

Ms. Caldwell stated she would like to see the original gate being used. She has concern regarding the materials for the benches. She feels the renovation could be done in a more fitting way of a National Landmark. She feels the materials are too contemporary, and the layout should be more historic to complement the house.

Mr. Cook stated the vertical element materials of concrete makes sense for a low wall. In terms of the gate, it will be open to the public, rather than making it so private. He thinks it opens up the garden.

Mr. Altschiller stated this is a good practical attempt to accommodate the number of visitors. He stated he'd prefer a more historic design and not so contemporary. He does feel it is a better use of the space and believes it was a very thoughtful process.

Ms. Isaacs stated she still stands by her previous comment regarding using the original materials. She feels the planters are too modern and does a disservice to Ms. Lee. She feels historic landscapes are often overlooked and not valued.

Ms. Memory hopes the new garden has a maintenance plan so it does not become a barren wasteland.

Ms. Lynch stated she is in favor of the materials.

Mr. Stephens opened the floor for vote.

Motion

Approval for alterations to an historic wall/fence as well as the addition of vertical hardscaping elements for the Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace property located at 10 East Oglethorpe Avenue as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle	
Second: Becky Lynch	
Debra Caldwell	- Nay
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Nay
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Nay

^{19.} Petition of J. Elder Studio, LLC | 20-000312-COA | 5 E Perry Street | Signs

- Description of Signage request.pdf
- ø signage cover letter.pdf
- @ Staff Rec 20-000312.pdf

Map.pdf

Mr. Ryan Jarles presented the applicant's request for approval for (2) illuminated incidental signs, (1) vinyl window sign, and (1) principal use projecting sign at 5 East Perry Street. The illuminated incidental signs are proposed to be 7.2 square feet in size each, the vinyl window sign is proposed to be 10 percent of the window, and the principal use projecting sign is proposed to be 7.1 square feet.

Staff recommends **approval** for (1) vinyl window sign and (1) projecting sign at 5 East Perry Street with the condition that the material specification for the projecting sign be provided to staff for review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Staff also recommends <u>denial</u> for (2) illuminated incidental signs because the work is not visually compatible and does not meet the standards for incidental signs. Mr. Jarles noted this recommendation could change subject to new information provided at the Historic District Board of Review meetings. Final decisions will be made by the Historic District Board of Review at the public hearing based on information provided at the meeting, as well as information submitted for the staff recommendation.

Mr. Jerome Elder, petitioner, stated his client would like to get approval for the two incidental signs as they were once sized and positioned historically. He believes in this instance, the building was created with this intent, as it fits within the façade. He asked if it could be granted as a variance. His client is open to just one of the incidental signs. The preference is to fill in the brick space and cover the holes and odd size within the brick.

Ms. Michalak stated there was no variance request submitted with the application. A variance is not necessarily out of line, but the incidental signs were not in compliance. Timing would require coming to the next meeting for proper legal notice. Formerly, the ordinance did allow what was once called Supplemental ID Signs; one, without lighting. Currently, they are referred to as Incidental Signs, but still one with illumination with a maximum size of four square feet. To get approval at this meeting, it will only be for the one sign restricted to the ordinance-allowable size. A variance will be needed for anything else. **Mr. Elder** asked can there be a continuance for the incidental but still have the other signs. **Mr. Stephens** agreed for two separate motions.

There was Board Discussion. Mr. Stephens opened the floor for Board motion and vote.

Motion

Approval for (1) vinyl window sign and (1) projecting sign at 5 East Perry Street with the condition that the

material specification for the projecting sign be provided to staff for review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Continue to the next meeting, (April 8, 2020) for (2) illuminated incidental signs because the work is not visually compatible and does not meet the standards for incidental signs.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Not Present
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

20. Petition of Sawyer Design | 20-000877-COA | 508 Tattnall Street | New Construction Accessory Building, Parts | and II

Submittal packet and maps.pdf

@ Staff Rec - 20-000877.pdf

Mr. Ryan Jarles presented the applicant's request for approval for New Construction of an accessory building, Parts I and II. The east and west facades are proposed to be 12'-0" wide and 15'-2" in height to the roof peak. The north and south facades are proposed to be 18'-0" in width; the north facing façade is proposed to include a pediment approximately 14'-6" in height at the peak. The pediment is proposed to have four columns supporting the entablature. The building is proposed to have a bathroom and no kitchen, meaning this building does not qualify as an accessory dwelling unit. The historic main structure was constructed in 1856 and is a contributing structure within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the Savannah Local Historic District.

Staff recommends **approval** for New Construction of an accessory building Parts I and II with the following underline conditions because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Ensure that the exterior shutters are constructed of a durable wood; are hinged and operable and sized to fit the window opening; and that the placement of the horizontal rails shall correspond to the location of the meeting rails of the window. 2. Provide staff with the column material specification.

Mr. Jon Leonard of Sawyer Design, petitioner, state he agrees with staff recommendation. He stated that the columns would be made of wood. The blacked out window is just a hatched pattern that didn't print well.

There were no Board comments. Mr. Stephens opened for Board vote.

Motion

Staff recommends approval for New Construction of an accessory building Parts I and II with the following conditions because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Ensure that the exterior shutters are constructed of a durable wood; are hinged and operable and sized to fit the window opening; and that the placement of the horizontal rails shall correspond to the location of the meeting rails of the window.

2. Provide staff with the column material specification.

Vote Results (Approved)	
Motion: Stan Houle	
Second: Kevin Dodge	
Debra Caldwell - Ay	/e
Becky Lynch - No	ot Present
Scott Cook - Ay	/e
Dwayne Stephens - Ay	/e
Melissa Memory - Ay	/e
David Altschiller - Ay	/e
Nan Taylor - Ay	/e
Kevin Dodge - Ay	/e
Stan Houle - Ay	/e
Ellie Isaacs - Ay	/e

21. Petition of Lynch Associates Architects | 20-000900-COA | 116 West Taylor Street | Addition & Alterations

- Ø Drawings.pdf
- Specifications.pdf
- Sanborn Maps.pdf

Staff Recommendation .pdf

Ms. Alyson Smith presented the applicant's request for approval of rehabilitation and alterations at 116 West Taylor Street. The windows at the front elevation are proposed to be replaced and the non-historic stoop will be demolished and reconstructed. An addition, including a covered porch, is proposed at the rear. 116 West Taylor Street was constructed in 1852 and is a contributing structure within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the Savannah Local Historic District. The existing stoop is non-historic and window openings at the main floor have been altered, and the brick façade has been previously painted. The rear elevation has undergone alterations over the years. The rear elevation previously featured a three-story wood constructed addition which projected from the northwest edge of the building.

Staff recommended **approval** of the rehabilitation including a rear addition and reconstruction of the front covered stoop at 116 West Taylor Street with the following conditions:

1. Submit a specification for the brick piers.

2. Ensure the replacement wood windows are single paned and ensure wood single paned windows are installed along the historic rear elevation.

3. Horizontal wood lap siding shall be used along the rear elevation of the historic building instead of ship-lap.

Mr. Andy Lynch, petitioner, stated they have no issue with staff recommendation. He clarified that the current brick is painted and it may go back to that; has not yet been decided.

There was no Board comment. Mr. Stephens opened the floor to Board vote.

Motion

Approval of the rehabilitation including a rear addition and reconstruction of the front covered stoop at 116 West Taylor Street with the following conditions:

1. Submit a specification for the brick piers.

2. Ensure the replacement wood windows are single paned and ensure wood single paned windows are installed along the historic rear elevation.

3. Horizontal wood lap siding shall be used along the rear elevation of the historic building instead of ship-lap.

Vote Results (Voting)

Motion: Debra Caldwell	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Debra Caldwell	- Aye
Becky Lynch	- Not Present
Scott Cook	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Not Voted
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

22. Petition of Coastal Canvas | 20-000976-COA | 425 EAST RIVER STREET | AWNINGS

- 23. Petition of Barnard Architects | 20-000972-COA | 630 WEST BAY STREET | WINDOWS/DOORS
- 24. Petition of Dorhman Construction | 20-000892-COA | 106 EAST HARRIS STREET | BRICK REPOINTING

25. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 20-001039 | 241 DRAYTON STREET | COLOR CHANGE

26. Petition of Feltman, Inc. | 20-000979-COA | 5 WEST BROUGHTON STREET | COLOR CHANGE/ROOF REPAIR

27. Petition of Leprechauns | 20-000456-COA | 410 EAST GWINNETT STREET | COLOR CHANGE

28. Petition of Jesus Miranda | 20-000753-COA | 230 - 232 BULL STREET | NON-ILLUMINATED SIGNS

29. Petition of SCAD - AMENDMENT | 20-000859-COA (19-002852-COA) | 229 MLK, Jr. BLVD | PANELS

30. Petition of Daniel Johnson | 20-00488-COA | 445 WHITAKER STREET | ROOF REPAIR (Carriage House)

31. Petition of Jennifer McNamara | 20-000755 | 321 JEFFERSON STREET | COLOR CHANGE

32. Petition of Homeline Architecture | 20-000748-COA | 515 EAST TAYLOR STREET | COLOR CHANGE

33. Petition of Ellsworth Design (Amendment) | 20-000746-COA (19-005949-COA) | 200 WEST JONES STREET | SHUTTERS

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 34. Report on Work Performed Without a COA for the March 11, 2020 HDBR Meeting
 - @ 3-11-20 HDBR Report on Work Without a COA.pdf

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

35. Stamped Drawings - March Report

@ March 2020 REPORT.pdf

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

<u>36. Next Chair Review Meeting - Monday, March 16, 2020 at 3:30pm in the Meyer Conference Room, MPC Office,</u> <u>110 East State Street</u>

<u>37. Next Pre-Meeting - Wednesday, April 8, 2020 at 12:00pm in the Jerry Surrency Room, MPC Office, 112 East</u> State Street

<u>38. Next Regular Meeting - Wednesday, April 8, 2020 at 1:00pm in the Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, MPC</u> Office, 112 East State Street

39. Adjourned

The Chair acknowledged Ms. Caldwell's six years of service and Mr.Cook's three years of service. Their expertise will be missed.

There will be a Special Called Meeting on March 19, 2020, induced by delay of the City for the petition, at 8:30 a.m. The first Historic Preservation Meeting will be held at 10:00 a.m. on the same date.

There being no further business to present before the Board, the March 11, 2020 Historic District Board of

Review was adjourned at 3:30 p.m.

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.