

# Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Virtual Meeting October 14, 2020 - 1:00 PM MINUTES

## October 14, 2020 Savannah Historic Board of Review

### Members Present:

Dwayne Stephens, Chair Nan Taylor, Vice-Chair David Altschiller Stephen Bodek Kevin Dodge Stan Houle Ellie Isaacs Becky Lynch Melissa Memory

MPC Staff Present:

Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation Ryan Jarles, Cultural Resources Planner Olivia Arfuso, Assistant Planner Aislinn Droski, Assistant Planner Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant

### I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

### **II. SIGN POSTING**

### **III. CONSENT AGENDA**

### 1. Approve All Items on the Consent Agenda

### Motion

Approve

Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Stan Houle	
Second: Steven Bodek	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye

Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

2. Petition of Barnard Architects | 20-004480-COA | 127 West Congress Street | Alterations

Staff Recommendation - 20-004480-COA.pdf

Final Research Packet.pdf

DRAWINGS 127 W Congress 20-004480.pdf

@ APP 127 W Congress 20-004480.pdf

@ CHKLST 127 Congress 20-004480.pdf

#### Motion

Approval for the alteration of storefront windows, and new rear exterior doors at 127 West Congress Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval otherwise, the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Ensure that any necessary chemical, or physical, treatments performed on the exterior of the building be undertaken using the gentlest means possible, to avoid damage to any historic materials.

2. Ensure that the proposed rear door frame is inset no less than (3) inches from the exterior surface of the façade of the building.

3. Ensure the window glass has no dark tints or reflective effects.

#### Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Stan Houle	
Second: Steven Bodek	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

3. Petition of Ward Architecture | 20-004474-COA | 24 East Taylor Street | New Construction, Accessory Building (Parts I and II)

- @ INFO 24 EAST TAYLOR 20-004474.pdf
- Staff Recommendation 24 E Taylor St 20-004474-COA.pdf
- Ø DRAWINGS 24 E TAYLOR C20-004474.pdf

Historic Context - Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps.pdf

#### Monterey Ward.pdf

#### Motion

Approval for New Construction Parts I and II for a two-story carriage house and the installation of an entry gate on the eastern side of the carriage house for the property located at 24 East Taylor Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Provide the color of the downspouts and collector boxes to staff for review.
- 2. Provide the window muntin profile and type and spacer bar specifications to staff for review.

#### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle	
Second: Steven Bodek	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

### 4. Petition of Tim Geiken | 20-004488-COA | 317 Lorch Street | Roof Replacement with Special Exception Request

- Staff Right-of-Way Photos.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Staff Recommendation 20-004488-COA.pdf

#### Motion

Approval for roof replacement for the property located at 317 Lorch Street with the following condition:

1. Provide the specification and color selection of the asphalt shingle to staff for review and approval.

Approval for Special Exceptions from the following standards:

Secretary of the Interior's Standards 6– Deteriorated Features. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Roofs. Contributing Resources. Materials.

Original roof material shall be repaired rather than replaced, provided however, if the degree of degradation does not allow repair, the degradation shall be photographically documented and verified by the Planning Director, and the new roof shall be of the same material and configuration as the original (except wood or asbestos).

To allow for asphalt shingle to be used as a replacement material for standing seam metal roof on a contributing building because the Special Exception criteria are met.

### Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Stan Houle	
Second: Steven Bodek	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

### 5. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 20-004491-COA | 236 Drayton Street | Signs

- @ APP 236 Drayton 20-004491.pdf
- Zunzis Cheklist.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Staff Recommendation 20-004491-COA.pdf

#### Motion

Approval for the installation of (1) principal use, double-sided, externally lit, freestanding decorative pole sign, (1) principal use, double-sided, externally lit, projecting sign, and (1) single-sided, incidental wall-mounted sign, at 236 Drayton Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

#### Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Stan Houle	
Second: Steven Bodek	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye

David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

6. Petition of DeNyse Signs | 20-0004695-COA | 701 Montgomery Street | Signs

- Skylark REVISED Blade Signs v4.pdf
- Staff Rec 701 Montgomery Street 20-004695-COA.pdf
- Skylark Blade Engineer Drawings.pdf

#### Motion

Approval of the petition for an illuminated projecting wall sign on the Montgomery Street Façade of 701 Montgomery Street, as requested, because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

#### Vote Results (Voting)

Motion: Stan Houle	
Second: Steven Bodek	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Not Voted
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

#### **IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

#### 7. Adopt the October 14, 2020 Agenda

#### Motion

Approve October 14, 2020 Agenda as presented.

### Vote Results (Voting)

Motion: Nan Taylor	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain

Melissa Memory	- Not Voted
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

### **V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

### 8. Approval of September 9, 2020 Regular HDBR Meeting Minutes

@09.09.20	MEETING	MINUTES.pdf	

Motion		
Approve		
Vote Results ( Approved )		
Motion: Becky Lynch		
Second: Ellie Isaacs		
Becky Lynch	- Aye	
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye	
Melissa Memory	- Aye	
David Altschiller	- Aye	
Nan Taylor	- Aye	
Kevin Dodge	- Aye	
Stan Houle	- Aye	
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye	
Steven Bodek	- Aye	

# VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

### **VII. CONTINUED AGENDA**

### 9. Continue All Items on the Continued Agenda

Motion		
Continue.		
Vote Results ( Approved )		
Motion: Nan Taylor		
Second: David Altschiller		
Becky Lynch	- Aye	
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye	
Melissa Memory	- Aye	

David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

10. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006852-COA | 630 East River Street | New Construction Parking Garage: Part II, Design Details

Motion	
Continue.	
Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Nan Taylor	
Second:	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

11. Petition of Gunn, Meyerhoff, Shay | 17-002122-COA | 602 East River Street (Hotel Anne) | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Motion	
Continue.	
Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Nan Taylor	
Second: David Altschiller	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye

Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

### **VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION**

<u>12. Petition of Hartman-Cox Architects | 20-002695-COA | 125 Bull Street | 60-Day Application Deferral -</u> Rehabilitation, Alterations, and Additions

Staff Recommendation 20-002695-COA.pdf

Applicant Correspondence.pdf

**Ms. Michalak** informed the Board of the new deferral process as stated in NewZo. It can be deferred for 90 days. It can be deferred an additional 60 days, but with approval by the Board, which is the case with this time. It is valid until December 9, 2020. If it is not heard by end of 60 days, it will be considered withdrawn.

#### Motion

Approval for an additional 60-day deferral of the Certificate of Appropriateness application for alterations and additions to 125 Bull Street to be heard no later than the December 9, 2020, otherwise, the application is considered withdrawn.

### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle	
Second: Melissa Memory	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

#### IX. REGULAR AGENDA

13. Petition of GMSHAY Architecture | File No. 20-002646-COA | 225 East President Street | New Construction, Part II: Design Details

- Staff Recommendation 20-002646-COA.pdf
- Submittal Packet Materials and Specifications.pdf
- Submittal Packet Photos and Drawings.pdf
- Window and Material Samples.pdf
- Sample Panel Policy.pdf
- Part I Submittal Packet.pdf

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request for approval for New Construction, Part II: Design Details for a four-story hotel (with a basement) on the vacant Trust Lot facing Oglethorpe Square at 225 East President Street. The new development will expand the program of the existing Presidents' Quarters Inn. The new building features commercial uses at the ground floor with hotel rooms above. The existing vacant site is located within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the Savannah Local Historic District on a Trust Lot in Anson Ward. The site previously featured multiple townhomes ranging from 2 to 4 stories. Two townhomes fronted Abercorn Street at four stories tall from at least 1884 until sometime before 1974, when they were demolished. Surrounding contributing structures include the Owens-Thomas House (constructed in 1816-1819 - two stories with a raised foundation), The Cluskey Building, located across Oglethorpe Square, at 127 Abercorn Street, was constructed in 1859 and is four stories. At the corner of Abercorn and York Street is the former Marine Hospital (constructed in 1906 - 3 and 4 stories tall) and townhomes ranging between 3 and 4 stories. To the north of the site is the historic 1920s three story Graham apartment building with a parapet featuring engaged triangular pediments which likely was designed to reference the Owens Thomas House's triangular pediments. The old Chatham Courthouse Building is located further east which was constructed 1889 and is 3 and 4 stories tall. Further north from the subject site is the historic hotel, the Planters Inn, which was constructed around 1915 which is 7 stories.

On July 8, 2020, the Board approved Part I: Height and Mass for this project (with no conditions).

The following materials, textures, and colors are proposed (see photo of material samples attached):

-Field Brick: Acme Smooth "Twilight Rose" with mortar to match the brick color. -Accent Brick: Acme Smooth "Purple Sage" with mortar to match the brick color.

-Cast Stone Cornices, String courses, lintels, and sills: Corinthian "Terra Cotta

Red" with a sandstone finish.

The brick and cast stone colors are compatible with the Owen's Thomas house, the apartment building, the historic Presidents' Quarters building, and the brick townhouses to the south of the sight They pull colors from all of this context without creating a false sense of historical development and are visually compatible.

-Ornamental metal gates, railings, fences, canopies, stained glass accents: Merlot

-Window frames and storefront: Acacia Haze (RBG 170-170-145)

-Wood handrails, custom wood doors, wood soffits: Teak

-Leaded stained-glass tile transoms: Clear and Merlot

-Mechanical screen: aluminum louvers in white powdercoat.

-Hollow metal door and frame: to match "Twilight Rose" brick color.

-McNichols wire mesh: within courtyard

Staff recommends the following:

-Provide the accurate cast stone sample (physical sample provided is a different manufacturer).

-Reselect the "Merlot" color to be more visually compatible (more black).

-Reselect the "Acacia Haze" color to be more visually compatible (more gray).

-Provide a teak sample (that includes any proposed stain or clear finish).

-Clarify the proposed use and color for the McNichols wire mesh shown on page 30 of the Materials and Specifications submittal packet.

The building is on grade and, therefore, the foundation standards do not apply. The standards are met for exterior walls. The building is proposed to be brick. The following materials, textures, and colors are proposed (see photo of material samples attached) for finishes and treatments:

-Field Brick: Acme Smooth "Twilight Rose" with mortar to match the brick color.
-Accent Brick: Acme Smooth "Purple Sage" with mortar to match the brick color.
-Cast Stone Cornices, String courses, lintels, and sills: Corinthian "Terra Cotta Red" with a sandstone finish.

The brick and cast stone colors are compatible with the Owen's Thomas house, the apartment building, the historic Presidents' Quarters building, and the brick townhouses to the south of the sight. They pull colors from all of this context without creating a false sense of historical development and are visually compatible.

-Ornamental metal gates, railings, fences, canopies, stained glass accents: Merlot

-Window frames and storefront: Acacia Haze (RBG 170-170-145)

-Wood handrails, custom wood doors, wood soffits: Teak

-Leaded stained-glass tile transoms: Clear and Merlot

-Mechanical screen: aluminum louvers in white powdercoat.

-Hollow metal door and frame: to match "Twilight Rose" brick color.

-McNichols wire mesh: within courtyard

The standard is met for Entrances and Door for new construction and alterations to non-contributing resources and additions. The sections indicate an inset of 3 inches. The standards are met for Materials: Doors. They are proposed to be Mahogany (or aluminum storefront). The standard is met for Windows. They are proposed to be double hung and casement. The proposed window is "Pella, Reserve" which is a wood clad window. This window has not previously been approved by the Board; therefore, a full-sized sample was provided for review (see attached photo of the sample). The standard is met regarding Openings. The standard is met regarding Framing Members. Window openings are proposed to have pronounced cast stone headers and sills. For the sides of the opening, the brick returns to the framing members but changes brick color and brick pattern. The standard is met for Window Sashes. The sections indicate an inset of 3 inches. Material standards for Windows are met. The storefront has an 18-inch-

high base (at the entrances) of cast stone. The base increases to 30 inches where the grade changes, thereby meeting the standard. The standard is met for Storefront Glazing in Subdivided Sashes. The sections indicate an inset of 4 inches.

The storefront base is proposed to be cast stone which is not listed as a permitted material. Staff recommends approval of the cast stone material. The Board can consider the use of cast stone as a base since it is not a prohibited material. Per the ordinance: *Though certain building materials are prescribed herein, the Board may approve alternative materials that are not listed as prohibited upon a showing by the applicant that the material or product is visually compatible with historic building materials and has performed satisfactorily in the local climate.* 

No exterior burglar bars, fixed "riot" shutters, roll-down shutters, or similar security devices are proposed. The Baluster standards are met. The Awnings standard is met. 8'-2" clear is proposed. The Awning, Canopies (including lighting) standards are met, and does not connect two (2) facades. The awnings are proposed to be powder coated aluminum. The Parapet standard is met. The roof material is not visible behind the parapets. No exterior light fixtures are indicated on the drawings for roof. If exterior light fixtures are proposed, provide specifications for review.

The standard is met regarding Fences, Trellises and Walls. The side yard fences are proposed to vary from 8 feet to 10'-6" high. A front yard fence is proposed facing the square; this is a Trust Lot with a front garden. The front yard fence is proposed to be 5 feet high to the top of the piers. Reduce the height of the fence is a maximum of 48 inches high. The Material standards are met. The fences are proposed to have brick piers and base with ornamental metal between the piers/above the base.

# SAMPLE PANEL POLICY:

The purpose of the sample panel is to provide an accurate physical representation of the materials, workmanship, and color palette of the proposed building's final design. It also depicts the relationship of the proposed building within its surrounding context.

The sample panel is required to be reviewed and approved by staff for all new construction projects prior to commencement of construction, with the exception of carriage houses, single, and two-family residential construction, or as otherwise specified by the HDBR.

**Ms. Isaacs** asked if the railings pattern was visually compatible with the area. **Ms. Michalak** stated they had no concerns with it.

# **PETITIONER COMMENTS**

**Ms. Meredith Stone**, petitioner, stated they referenced the surrounding buildings and the time period to design the building and its materials. The proposed colors are believed to compliment the colors of the neighborhood. Much attention was given to detail. They favor the staff decision and will comply with staff requests.

**Mr. Pat Shay**, petitioner, added that the wire mesh is proposed to be black (which is to be overtaken by vines) for the garden courtyard. He requests adequate time, possibly to the January 2021 HDBR meeting, to demonstrate compliance for staff requests.

## PUBLIC COMMENTS:

**Mr. Ryan Arvay,** of the Historic Savannah Foundation, complimented the project and the implemented changes. He believes it to be period appropriate; complimentary yet original. He suggests changing the design of the Juliette balconies; they conflict and carry over onto the patio. The diagonal layout is more Art Deco and not in keeping with the design intent of the building. He agrees with staff comments regarding the brick color palette. The rear stairwell should be carried all the way to the ground, enclosed, rather than sit on thin, open masonry piers.

**Mr. Bob Rosenwald**, of the Downtown Neighborhood Association, thanked Mr. Shay for involving the DNA in the project. They support staff recommendation and are pleased regarding its current course.

**Ms. Ardis Wood**, citizen, asked if there will be a tree lawn and trees to be planted. Also questioned the lights on the right-of-way. She stated there are too many different styles; pattern continuity needs to be had.

**Mr. Shay** stated there will be installed and improved tree lawns. York Street is too narrow for tree lawn, but will be tree lawns on the other two sides. The City of Savannah will be consulted for lighting. The railings incorporated in the project were decided on the diagonals to differentiate that it is not of the same era as the neighboring buildings, but to represent the era with consistency. Brick choice was deliberate; to differentiate between this building and the existing President's Quarters. Carrying the stairway to the ground increases the mass and was approved with Part I, Height and Mass.

## **BOARD DISCUSSION**:

**Ms. Isaacs** agreed with the staff recommendations and Mr. Arvay's regarding the stairwell. Believes that the iron railings are not visually compatible. **Mr. Bodek**, **Mr. Houle** had no comment. **Ms. Taylor** and **Ms. Memory** agreed with staff recommendations and finds the design pattern for the railings appropriate, as well as the proposed stairwell. **Mr. Dodge** agrees with staff recommendation and has no problem with the railings as presented. **Mr. Altschiller** agrees with staff recommendation, however does believe the railings to be not quite appropriate. **Ms. Lynch** agrees with staff recommendations and does agree with others about the back stair, however, the railings are visually compatible, with the colors already being addressed in staff recommendations. **Mr. Stephens** agrees with the railing patterns.

# **STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

Continue the request for New Construction, Part II: Design Details for a four-

story hotel (with a basement) on the vacant Trust Lot facing Oglethorpe Square at 225 East President Street <u>in order for the petitioner to</u> <u>consider/provide the following:</u>

1. For materials, textures, and colors:

-Provide the accurate cast stone sample (physical sample provided is a different manufacturer).

-Reselect the "Merlot" color to be more visually compatible (more black). -Reselect the "Acacia Haze" color to be more visually compatible (more gray).

Provide a teak sample (that includes any proposed stain or clear finish).
Clarify the proposed use and color for the McNichols wire mesh shown on page 30 of the Materials and Specifications submittal packet.

2. If exterior light fixtures are proposed, provide specifications for review.

3. Reduce the height of the front yard fence to a maximum of 48 inches.

# 4. Provide a sample panel per the Sample Panel Policy.

### Motion

Continue the request for New Construction, Part II: Design Details for a four-story hotel (with a basement) on the vacant Trust Lot facing Oglethorpe Square at 225 East President Street in order for the petitioner to consider/provide the following: JANUARY 2021.

1. For materials, textures, and colors:

- Provide the accurate cast stone sample (physical sample provided is a different manufacturer).
- Reselect the ";Merlot"; color to be more visually compatible (more black).
- Reselect the ";Acacia Haze"; color to be more visually compatible (more gray).
- Provide a teak sample (that includes any proposed stain or clear finish).

- Clarify the proposed use and color for the McNichols wire mesh shown on page 30 of the Materials and Specifications submittal packet.

- 2. If exterior light fixtures are proposed, provide specifications for review.
- 3. Reduce the height of the front yard fence to a maximum of 48 inches.
- 4. Provide a sample panel per the Sample Panel Policy.

## Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Stan Houle	
Second: Nan Taylor	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye

Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

- 14. Petition of Homeline Architecture | 20-004490-COA | 107 East Jones Street | Alterations
  - Sanborn Maps.pdf
  - @ APP 107 E Jones 20-004490.pdf
  - 107 East Jones Complete Drawing Set.pdf
  - Staff Rec 107 E Jones 20-004490.pdf

### Survey Card 107 East Jones.pdf

**Mr. Ryan Jarles** presented the applicant's request of approval for repairs and alterations to the exterior of 107 East Jones Street. The repairs include replacing the newel posts and floorboards on the front entry stair and stoop, replacing the double doors on the south facing façade, replacing the windows and shutters as well as repair any wood rot found on the second level of the rear addition.

The three story semi-attached townhouse was constructed in 1853. Sanborn maps illustrate the presence of multiple rear additions from the earliest map in 1888, showing a one-story masonry addition and a two-story wood frame addition on the easternmost portion of the rear of the house. One wood frame outbuilding is shown along East Jones Lane. Between 1916 and 1954, these rear additions were demolished and replaced with one two-story masonry addition located along the building's westernmost portion of the rear elevation. Currently, there is a non-historic third floor addition on top of the earlier addition which was constructed sometime after 1973. Staff was unable to locate any COAs for the third-floor addition. The secondary structure along the lane was demolished between 1954 and 1973. A carport has since been constructed along the lane. Staff was unable to locate a COA for the carport. The MPC survey card for the property states that the front stoop was enlarged in 1903. The windows on the building's front façade have also been altered.

On December 12, 2018, the Board approved alterations and an addition to the third story of an existing rear addition at 107 East Jones Street. The existing rear three story addition was altered by removing the third floor and altering the pre-1954 two-story portion. A new third floor addition was added to the rear of the building. An uncovered parlor level porch now projects from the rear addition. [18-006337-COA].On December 11, 2019, the Board approved a 12-month extension of the previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness [18-006337-COA].

The guideline is met regarding retaining historic characterizing materials and features. Secretary of the Interior's Standards 3– Physical Record. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Staff determined that the window type (Kolbe Heritage Series), as well as the 6/6 lite pattern chosen, differentiate the proposed windows from the historic, and do not

October 14, 2020 - 1:00 PM MINUTES create a false sense of history. The Distinctive Features guideline is met. The applicant is proposing the repair and replacement of the newel posts, porch floorboards, and any rotten wood features found throughout the period of work. The new window openings do not destroy historic materials that characterize the property and are compatible. The new openings are reversible. Staff determined that the window type (Kolbe Heritage Series), as well as the 6/6 lite pattern chosen, differentiate the proposed windows from the historic, and do not create a false sense of history. The new openings do not damage or destroy significant or character-defining features.

Virtual Meeting

The proportion of the new window openings are visually compatible with those found on the visually related contributing buildings. The proposed windows within the new window openings are shown as Kolby Heritage Series Windows with a 6/6 lite pattern. The windows on the second story rear addition are proposed to be replaced utilizing Kolby Ultra Series Sterling Windows with 1/1 lite patterns; this window has been previously approved by the Board. The shutters on the rear addition are proposed to be replaced with Atlantic Premium Architectural Series Shutters. This specific shutter series is constructed of PVC and is not compatible; the applicant will need to revise the shutter specification to a wood or wood composite material.

The rear double door is to be replaced in-kind with matching mahogany double doors. The color selections were not provided. Staff needs to be provided with the final color selections to be reviewed and approved. The non-historic rear double doors on the property are to be replaced in-kind using multi-lite mahogany doors. The doors are minimally visible and are compatible. The proposed windows within the new window openings are shown as Kolby Heritage Series Windows with a 6/6 lite pattern. This window is being placed in new window openings and the proposed window is compatible.

The windows on the second story rear addition are proposed to be replaced utilizing Kolby Ultra Series Sterling Windows with 1/1 lite patterns; this window has been previously approved by the Board. The shutters on the rear addition are proposed to be replaced with Atlantic Premium Architectural Series Shutters. This specific shutter series is constructed of PVC and is not compatible; the applicant will need to revise the shutter specification to a wood or wood composite material. The applicant is proposing the repair and replacement of the newel posts, porch floorboards, and any rotten wood features found throughout the period of work.

## PETITIONER'S COMMENTS:

**Mr. John Deering**, petitioner, stated he is in agreement to changing the rear shutter to a wooden shutter.

## PUBLIC COMMENT:

There was no public comment.

## BOARD DISCUSSION:

The Board stated they are in agreement with staff recommendations and had no comments.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**: Approval for repairs and alterations to the exterior of 107 East Jones Street with the following conditions to be provided to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Provide color selections.
- 2. Revise the shutter material specification to be either wood or wood composite.

### Motion

Approval for repairs and alterations to the exterior of 107 East Jones Street with the following conditions to be provide to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Redesign the proposed new window openings to be differentiated from historic openings, i.e.: different trim design than the stucco sill or utilize a different window/lite pattern.

2. Provide specifications for all windows, shutters, and color selections.

### Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Nan Taylor	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

### 15. Petition of Design + INC | 20-004219-COA | 615 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. | Alterations

- complete drawing set.pdf
- Sandborn Maps Wendys.pdf
- @ APP 615 MLK (Wendy's) 20-004219-COA.pdf

### Staff Rec - 615 MLK, Jr. Blvd (Wendy's) 20-004219-COA.pdf

**Mr. Ryan Jarles** presented the applicant's request of approval for alterations and additions to 615 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. (Wendy's). The applicant is proposing the removal of existing solariums on the eastern and northern portions of the building; a new addition will be constructed with an 11'-8 ½" projection off

October 14, 2020 - 1:00 PM MINUTES the front (east) façade, and will wrap the northeastern corner creating a projection from the north facing façade equaling 7'-8". The addition will be utilized to create a larger indoor seating area and will increase the total square footage from 3,345 to 3,458 square feet. A portion of the east facing façade (approximately 13'-6" in width) will be constructed at a height of 21'-0" to delineate the east facing main entry door for the dining room. The 21'-0" in height portion is proposed as a location for signage. Additional signage is shown on the north and south elevations.

Virtual Meeting

Additionally, the applicant is proposing alterations to existing portions of the main building, including an increase in wall height from 14'-8" to 19'-1/8"; two sections located on the south facing façade will be increased to a height of 20'-1/8" to delineate the drive through windows from the rest of the building. The increased 4'-4" parapet will screen the roof mounted equipment from all rights-of-way. The south façade features two canopies, one over each drive-thru window; the proposed awnings on the south facing façade reach a height of 11'-4" and are constructed of metal. The east facing façade features a large canopy over the main double door store front entry. The applicant is proposing the entire exterior to be finished with an EIFS material.

The applicant has included signage within the drawing set; however, the signage specifications were not provided. Therefore, the signage has been excluded from this review.

The surrounding historic context is extremely eroded. This building is located within Minis Ward, which does not have any contributing buildings. Garden Ward is located directly to the south and has one contributing building which faces MLK: St. Philips AME Church. The church, like all of MLK, Jr. Blvd. at one time, is pulled up to the sidewalk – addressing the pedestrian, instead of the vehicle, experience. Historic buildings across MLK, in Gaston Ward within the Landmark District, similarly address the pedestrian and generally span the width of the front of the property. A major impetus in the downfall of the MLK corridor was the construction of the I16 Flyover. (See attached Context - Sanborn Maps and Historic Photographs.)

There are no setback requirements for this zoning district, and the building is under the allowable height and lot coverage. The height of the building as well as the width of the structure are visually compatible with the contributing buildings to which this building is visually related. The window openings and their relationship to solid space along the façade is visually compatible. There is a portion of the building on the north facing façade that includes a large stretch of wall without openings; however, this is an existing condition proposed to remain.

Staff recommends the use of a brick, concrete formed or assembled as stone, precast concrete panels with finish to simulate stucco texture, polished stone and glazed brick to meet the standards. The applicant proposes wall mounted lighting

similar in design to the existing wall mounted lighting; however, the material specification for the lighting was not included within the submittal. Staff should be provided with the lighting material specification. The canopy structures are proposed to be constructed of metal and are to be a neutral color, 'gray'. The TPO flat roof is proposed to remain on the existing main building, and a new TPO roofing is proposed to be included on the new addition. A metal safety rail is proposed around the entry door on the south facing façade and is visually compatible.

The low slope roof hidden behind a parapet wall is a compatible roof shape. The parapet walls of both the addition as well as the main building include a metal coping; however, they do not include a string course. Redesign the parapet walls to include a string course.

The mass of the building along with the size of the window and door openings is visually compatible. The foundation for the addition is to be a slab on grade to match the existing slab on grade foundation of the main building. Staff recommends the use of a brick, concrete formed or assembled as stone, precast concrete panels with finish to simulate stucco texture, polished stone and glazed brick to meet the standards for exterior walls.

An actual calculation was not provided but it appears that this standard is met on the front façade for finishes and treatment. Such glazing shall be transparent; provided, however, opaque glass may be used in the storefront window transoms. Storefront glazing shall extend from the sill or from an 18-24 inch base of contrasting design or material to the lintel. The storefront windows proposed on the new addition are shown as having a 0'-7" base of contrasting design. Increase the height of the base to be 18-24 inches.

The storefront material specification was not provided within the submittal. The material specification needs to be provided to staff.

The canopy structures are designed to be integrated structurally and architecturally into the design of the south and east facing façades of entry ways and the drive through windows. The canopy structures are proposed to be constructed of metal and are to be a neutral color, 'gray'. Staff recommends that the awnings on the south facing façade be lowered 4 inches to meet the standard.

The roof is proposed to be a low slope TPO roof with a parapet. The parapet walls of both the addition as well as the main building include a metal coping; however, they do not include a string course. Redesign the parapet walls to include a string course. The TPO flat roof is proposed to remain on the existing main building, and a new TPO roofing is proposed to be included on the new addition.

All existing mechanical, electrical, and refuse locations are to remain. The existing roof mounted mechanical equipment is proposed to be screened with the increased in wall height from 14'-8" to 19'-1/8" on the main building elevations, not

including the walls of the addition. Two sections located on the south facing façade will be increased to a height of 20'-1/8" to delineate the drive through windows from the rest of the building. The increased 4'-4" parapet will screen the roof mounted equipment from all rights-of-way.

The applicant proposes wall mounted lighting similar in design to the existing wall mounted lighting; however, the specification for the lighting was not included within the submittal. The lighting specification needs to be provided to staff.

## PETITIONER COMMENTS:

**Mr. Ken Brown**, petitioner, stated they were trying use the same exterior material on the Burger King next door and thought it was E.I. F. S. The exterior walls are currently 4 inch block up to 9'4". Upwards, it changes to an 8 inch block, which covers concrete block.

## PUBLIC COMMENTS:

**Ms. Ardis Wood**, citizen, asked about the bright red color proposed. She prefers it muted, and hopes the sign is also.

**Mr. Ryan Arvay**, HSF, stated they are in favor of staff recommendations, particularly with materiality. He feels the site plan can be improved to comply with the current ordinance. He suggests adding walls of continuity to the front of the property: that the thicker black line in his drawing be a brick wall, remove the curb cut from MLK and move to Allison Street, add an outdoor eating area. It's a major rehab and it should come in compliance with the ordinance as much as possible.

**Mr. Brown** stated he can take the site plan back to Wendy's. He stated the biggest obstacle would be moving the take-out window. He stated he would present moving the curb cut.

## **BOARD DISCUSSION**:

The Board stated they agree with staff recommendations. **Ms. Isaacs** supported Mr. Arvay's suggestion of streetscape connectivity.

**<u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>**: Continue the petition for alterations and additions to 615 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. (Wendy's) in order for the applicant to address the following:

1. Redesign the parapets to include a string course.

2. Redesign the EIFS exterior finish material to be of brick, concrete formed or assembled as stone, precast concrete panels

with finish to simulate stucco texture, polished stone and glazed brick to meet the design standard which strictly prohibits

EIFS.

3. Lower the awnings on the south facing façade 0'-4" to ensure the awnings are

no more than 11'-0" in height.

4. Increase the height of the storefront base to be 18-24 inches.

## 5. Provide a specification for the wall mounted lighting.

### Motion

Continue the petition for alterations and additions to 615 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd. (Wendy's) in order for the applicant to address the following:

1. Redesign the parapets to include a string course.

2. Redesign the EIFS exterior finish material to be of brick, concrete formed or assembled as stone, precast concrete panels with finish to simulate stucco texture, polished stone and glazed brick to meet the design standard which strictly prohibits EIFS.

3. Lower the awnings on the south facing façade 0'-4"; to ensure the awnings are no more than 11'-0"; in height.

4. Increase the height of the storefront base to be 18-24 inches.

5. Provide a specification for the wall mounted lighting.

The petitioner requested to return on the December 9, 2020 HDBR meeting.

#### Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Steven Bodek	
Second: Kevin Dodge	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

16. Petition of The City of Savannah, Samantha Gleason | 20-004481-COA | 201 Montgomery Street | Illuminated Sign and Variance Recommendation

- Application and Drawings 201 Montgomery Street.pdf
- Corner of MLK and Oglethorpe Sign Drawing.pdf
- @ Existing Signs.pdf
- Ø Brick Specifications.pdf

#### Staff Recommendation - 201 Montgomery St - 20-004481-COA.pdf

### Email from Applicant Changing Brick.png

**Ms. Aislinn Droski** presented the applicant's request for approval of an illuminated ground monument sign for the property located at 201 Montgomery Street, which is the Savannah Cultural Arts Center. The freestanding ground monument sign is to be a red brick structure with an enclosed internally lit manualchanging letter board. The sign is proposed to be installed at the corner of Martin Luther King Jr Boulevard and Oglethorpe Avenue. The applicant is also requesting a recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from Section 9.9.17.g.xii Manual Changeable Copy/Reader Board Sign which reads:

A manual changeable copy-reader board sign shall be permitted within a B-N, D-C, DX, I-L, I-LT or TC-2 zoning district within the Savannah Downtown Historic or Neighborhood Sign Districts as follows.

To allow for the inclusion of a manual changeable reader board sign as part of a ground monument sign in the D-CBD zoning district. CONTEXT: On March 13, 2019, the Historic District Board of Review approved an application for two nonilluminated signs for 201 Montgomery Street (the Savannah Cultural Arts Center) [File No. 19000933-COA]. The wall mounted signs consist of individual, bronze letters that spell out "Savannah Cultural Arts Center." On August 20, 2019, staff approved an amendment to the previous COA [File No. 19-004609COA] to install an additional 5.5 square feet of signage on the Montgomery Street entrance to include the City of Savannah logo. The signs were installed, with one located adjacent to the Montgomery Street entrance and the other located on the façade fronting Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard. The top of the ground monument sign will have 1/4 inch thick, individually mounted brushed nickel aluminum letters that spell out "Savannah Cultural Arts Center", similar to the existing wall signs. Below these letters, a brushed nickel cabinet and retainer will be installed to hold an internally LED illuminated manual changeable letter board with four lines of ten (10) inch black zip on twelve (12) inch clear panels with vandal cover.

The base of the monument sign is to be constructed of ACME modular brick in "Richmond Red" with Holcim mortar in "Atlanta Red". The base was originally proposed to be a faux white brick material, however staff found that this material was not visually compatible. The petitioner agreed to alter the proposal to utilize the red brick that was used in the principal structure.

Staff requests that the petitioner submit revised drawings to staff that include the updated brick specifications for final review and to stamp for permitting. The materials, colors, and configuration of the proposed sign are otherwise visually compatible. Monument ground signs are allowed in the Savannah Downtown Historic District.

The internally illuminated portion of the sign is proposed to include "cutout" letters

as part of the manual-changing letter board.

standards are not met regarding the illuminated manual changeable reader board with a sign area of 8 square feet as part of the ground monument sign is to be in the D-CBD Zoning District, which is not listed as a permitted district. The applicant has requested a variance from this standard.

The ground sign will be 29.75 square feet and the building has 83.3 feet of lot frontage on Oglethorpe Avenue. A ground sign shall not exceed the following heights: D-C, D-CBD, D-X, I-L, I-LT Zoning Districts: 8 ft.: Monument The standard is met. The monument ground sign will be 3.5 feet high. Ground, projecting and wall signs in D-C, D-CBD, D-X, I-L, and I-LT districts may be illuminated in accordance with Sec. 9.9.6 and 9.9.17.g.i. The standard is met. The ground monument sign will be illuminated.

# VARIANCE RECOMMENDATION:

The applicant is also requesting a recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from Section 9.9.17.g.xii Manual Changeable Copy/Reader Board Sign which reads:

Staff finds that the variance is consistent with the intent of the Ordinance and the Comprehensive Plan and that it would not be injurious to the neighborhood nor would it be detrimental to public health, safety, or welfare.

Staff finds that the function of this property as a public institution and the necessity of such institutions to keep the public informed is a special circumstance for this variance. A manual changeable reader board in the proposed ground monument sign is required to publicly display information on the street for the Savannah Cultural Arts Center. The necessity to inform the public of operations and events at a cultural institution is a public good that is not financial in nature and did not result from the actions of the applicant.

The Savannah Civic Center, a property directly adjacent to the east of the Savannah Cultural Arts Center, also in the D-CBD zoning district, has a ground monument sign that includes a digital changeable reader board at the intersection of Montgomery Street and Liberty Street. This sign serves the purpose of informing the public of operations and events at the Savannah Civic Center. The proposed sign at the Savannah Cultural Arts Center would be serving the same service. Literal interpretation would deprive the applicant of the ability to provide this public good.

Staff finds that the variance would not confer any special privilege that is denied to other lands, buildings, or structures in the same zoning district. The inclusion of a manual changeable reader board sign in the proposed ground monument sign

## PETITIONER COMMENTS:

**Mr. Stuart Miller**, Director of Cultural Arts Center, stated he is in agreement with staff recommendation.

towards preferential treatment of applications submitted by the City.

## PUBLIC COMMENT:

**Ms. Ardis Wood**, citizen, states she believes the request is negatively precedentsetting.

**Mr. Bob Rosenwald**, Downtown Neighborhood Association, stated he believes the request is backwards - should go to ZBA first. He regrets the City is requesting a variance to its own updated ordinance. He feels the placement is ineffective for visibility. He is concerned that the request for the manual sign will later become an electronic sign. The current Civic Center sign should not be a standard for signage. The DNA requests denial of the petition.

Mr. Ryan Arvay, Historic Savannah Foundation, agreed with Mr. Rosenwald.

**Mr. Miller**, petitioner, stated there is no plan for an electronic or digital sign. The placement of the sign was done with strategic planning to attract pedestrian and motor traffic.

# BOARD COMMENTS:

**Mr. Altschiller** agreed that the sign is ill-placed and the City is in danger of being inundated with signs, as did **Ms. Memory** and **Ms. Isaacs**. **Mr. Dodge** asked if the City was petitioning out of courtesy or necessity. **Ms. Michalak** replied courtesy; if the decision requested is not granted, they can still move forward as they desire. They can opt out of COA process but not ZBA variance; only a recommendation is needed from HDBR. **Mr. Houle** stated it is not keeping with the compatibility of the neighborhood.

### Motion

Deny the petition (20-004481-COA) due to lack of visual compatibility for COA, and recommend denial of recommendation the ZBA.

Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Stan Houle	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Becky Lynch	- Nay
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye

David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Nay
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Nay

17. Petition of R. Vance Peacock & W. Darren Bryenton | 20-004449-COA | 120 West Jones Street | New Construction - Trellis / Open Storage Shed (After-the-Fact)

Staff Recommendation- 20-004449-COA.pdf

HBR garden shed .pdf

@ APP 120 W Jones 20-004449.pdf

Ms. Olivia Arfuso presented the applicant's request of an approval for an afterthe-fact new construction of a trellis (open storage shed) at 120 West Jones Street. The structure is proposed to be a garden shed constructed in the rear courtyard of the property. Only the top of the roof is visible from the public-right-ofway. It is not affixed to any other building or structure and is completely freestanding. It is one-story tall and measures 61-inches (5'-1") in width, by 61inches (5'-1") in length, by 216-inches (18-feet) in height. The total square footage of the accessory structure is 25.83-square-feet. The base, and frame, of the structure is constructed of pressure treated wood 4x4s, and 2x4s. The body is comprised solely of Southern Pine square privacy lattice, adorned with 19th Century arched exterior shutters. All wooden elements are painted with Rust-Oleum Professional High Performance Protective oil-based enamel, exterior industrial paint, in a black shade with a gloss finish. The pyramid hipped, steeply pitched, roof is created with galvanized roof panels that are plated in zinc. The roof is topped with a sphere-shaped zinc finial and there is a 20th Century iron collection box.

The applicant states the trellis structure was constructed to provide storage space for garden tools, ladders, and outdoor furniture. Its location in the southwest corner of the rear courtyard covers a sewage main and the electrical wires / pipes that run the height of the main, historic building. The trellis structure helps to direct rainwater away from the historic building's foundation and into the garden beds. It provides the owners a sense of privacy from the Airbnb guests at the adjacent property. The MPC was contacted at the end of August 2020 about the visibility of the roof of the structure (open storage shed) from Charlton Lane, above the side fence of the property. The applicants were made aware and promptly submitted an "After-the-Fact" application.

The historic building was constructed in 1871 and is a contributing structure within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the Savannah Local Historic District. The structure is proposed to be a garden shed constructed in the rear courtyard of the property. Only the top portion of the roof is visible from the public-right-of-way. It is not affixed to any other building or structure and is completely freestanding.

Since the trellis does not have sound walls and is not a true building or accessory structure, Staff believes that the standard of visual compatibility does not directly apply. Staff recommends that the height of the trellis (open storage shed), or the height of individual components of the structure, are decreased so that it is not visible from the public-right-of-way. The materials are visually compatible with the contributing buildings to which the structure is visually related, meeting the standard. Decrease the height of the trellis (open storage shed), or the height of individual components of the structure (specifically, the pitch of the roof), not to exceed 11 feet in height, so that it is not visible from the public-right-of-way. The new construction -trellis (open storage shed) does not extend beyond the façade of the building, meeting the standard. The material standards are met.

## PETITIONER COMMENTS:

**Mr. Darren Bryenton**, petitioner, stated he was advised a building permit was not required. When notified a COA was required, the application was promptly submitted. The goal was not to have a 'standard Home Depot' shed. A continuance was requested to provide alternative elevation options, for 60 days.

**Ms. Lynch** asked if decreasing the roof height is acceptable. **Mr. Bryenton** stated that would not be acceptable due to interior wiring and septic piping. The higher pitched roof allowed for a gutter to redirect excess water to gardens, eliminating the current problem of flooding. The roof will be dulled over time, or hard water to speed up the process. Modifying to a green roof is another option.

## PUBLIC COMMENT:

There was no public comment.

# BOARD DISCUSSION:

**Mr. Bodek** stated if this structure was proposed before being built, it would have been voted down. **Mr. Houle** agreed with Mr. Bodek; there are many issues and is glad of the continuance request. **Ms. Taylor** states she agrees with staff comments and does not understand how greenery will divert the eye from the height; she supports the continuance. **Ms. Memory** agreed with Ms. Taylor. **Mr. Dodge**, **Mr. Altshiller**, and **Ms. Lynch** supported the continuance and staff recommendation.

**Mr. Bodek** stated he does not see how delaying the petition affects the height issue. **Ms. Michalak** stated the petitioner could request a special exception. Mr. Bodek asked if the height requirements will be adhered to or not.

<u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>: <u>Approval</u> for an after-the-fact new construction of a trellis (open storage shed) at 120 West Jones Street <u>with the following</u> <u>condition</u> to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Decrease the height of the trellis (open storage shed) so that it does not

exceed 11 feet in height, or so it is not visible from the public-right-ofway.

### Motion

Continue to the December 9, 2020 HDBR meeting.

Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Nan Taylor	
Second: Kevin Dodge	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Nay

18. Petition of Zeno Moore Construction Co. | 20-004528-COA | 528 East Jones Street | Rear Window Alterations

Staff Recommendation- 20-004528-COA.pdf

<u>528 E Jones Street. 1996 COA.pdf</u>

Ø 1996 Photograph.pdf

Sanborn Maps.pdf

Window Brochure.pdf

Ø 528 E. Jones St - Application For COA - Updated.pdf

Ø 528 E. Jones St. - Checklist.pdf

**Ms. Olivia Arfuso** presented the applicant's request of approval for the alteration of (2) window openings, and installation of replacement windows on the rear façade of 528 East Jones Street. The existing windows are located on the rear, recessed, first-floor level of the north-facing façade. The existing window to the left of the rear door (pantry window), currently measures 2-feet, 4-inches *by* 4-feet, 8-inches. It is proposed to be shortened to 3-feet, 6-inches tall. The existing pantry window opening is, also, proposed to be raised to match the head of the window on the right of the rear door (kitchen window). The width of the pantry window is not proposed to be altered. The existing window to the right of the rear door (kitchen window), is currently a 6-over-6 double hung sash window that measures 2-feet, 10-inches *by* 3-feet, 6-inches. The proposed installation is a mulled twin window unit that (together) will measure 5-feet-across by 3-feet, 6-inches tall. All proposed windows are to be Ply Gem Builder Series 100, wood windows, 1-over-1 with double-hung sashes.

The historic building was constructed in 1885 and is a contributing structure within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the Savannah Downtown Historic District. The building is visible in the 1888 Sanborn Map and is shown as a two-story, wood constructed frame building. Staff could find only evidence of one opening, for either a window or door, on the first-floor level of the north-facing façade. This opening is no longer visible in the 1916 Sanborn Map. No major changes in openings appear to the property on either the 1954 or 1973 Sanborn Maps. An image *circa* 1996 does show two windows, on either side of a centrally located door, of a completely closed-in, first-floor level rear façade. Staff referred to a COA application that was approved on October 9, 1996 [File No. 96-0829] for an 8-foot privacy fence in the rear yard of 528 East Jones Street. A deck was proposed to be constructed, and a one-story addition is described as "already existing." After the COA approval in 1996, the rear façade was heavily altered. It is Staff's determination that the rear façade, current windows, and window openings, are non-historic.

It is Staff's determination that the rear of the first-floor level, on the north-facing façade, has been severely altered over the years. Staff believes that the rear façade, current windows, and window openings, are non-historic. No historic materials will be removed by the alteration and installation of the proposed rear windows, the historic character of the property shall be retained and preserved, meeting the standard.

The pantry window is proposed to follow a 5:3 ratio and be taller than it is wide, and the mulled twin kitchen windows individually meet the 5:3 standard. The relationship of window width to height is visually compatibility to the contributing building and structures to which the building is visually related. The proposed replacement windows are to be Ply Gem Builder Series 100, wood windows, 1/1 with double-hung sashes. Staff recommends changing the replacement window type to one previously approved by the Board for use on contributing buildings; this series has previously been denied by the Board, because it is not visually compatible and does not meet the standards. Staff determined that the current windows, and window openings, are non-historic. Although there are proposed alterations to the overall dimensions of the windows, the 5:3 ratio is kept. The new window opening dimensions and configurations will be minimally visible from the public-right-of way. Staff recommends changing the replacement window type to one previously approved by the Board for use on contributing buildings. Ensure that the replacement windows are painted in-kind.

## PETITIONER COMMENTS:

The petitioner was not present at the meeting.

# PUBLIC COMMENTS:

**Mr. Ryan Arvay**, of Historic Savannah Foundation, stated HSF holds an easement on this property, with no plans to object to the petition. He asked if there was any historic fabric to the rear of the building. **Ms. Arfuso** stated staff believes most is later alterations based on prior COA's. He asked the reasoning

October 14, 2020 - 1:00 PM MINUTES behind the one over one instead the six over six. **Ms. Michalak** responded that was the request of the petitioner and it is visually compatible. She also apologized as staff was not aware there were easements held by HSF.

Virtual Meeting

## **BOARD DISCUSSION**:

The Board agreed with staff recommendations, though there was visual preference to the six-over-six windows, rather than the one-over-one. **Ms. Arfuso** stated the windows are only visible from the back lane.

## **RECOMMENDATION:**

Approval for the alteration and installation of (2) windows on the rear façade of 528 East Jones Street with the following conditions to be submitted to Staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Ensure that the replacement windows are painted in-kind.
- 2. Ensure that any wood lap siding affected by the alteration, and replacement, of the proposed windows be repaired in-kind.
- 3. Change replacement window type, to one previously approved by the Board for use on contributing buildings.

### Motion

Approval for the alteration and installation of (2) windows on the rear façade of 528 East Jones Street with the following conditions to be submitted to Staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Ensure that the replacement windows are painted in-kind.
- 2. Ensure that any wood lap siding affected by the alteration, and replacement, of the proposed windows be repaired in-kind.

3. Change replacement window type, to one previously approved by the Board for use on contributing buildings.

4. CHANGE TO 6 OVER 6 DESIGNED WINDOW.

### Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Nan Taylor	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

#### Motion

Approval for the alteration and installation of (2) windows on the rear façade of 528 East Jones Street with the following conditions to be submitted to Staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Ensure that the replacement windows are painted in-kind.

2. Ensure that any wood lap siding affected by the alteration, and replacement, of the proposed windows be repaired in-kind.

3. Change replacement window type, to one previously approved by the Board for use on contributing buildings.

### Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: David Altschiller	
Second: Stan Houle	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

### X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

- 19. Approve Staff-Approved Reviews
- 20. Petition of SOTTILE & SOTTILE, Christian Sottile | 200-500 WEST RIVER STREET | 20-004263-COA |Signs # SIGNED 200 - 500 W River St 20-004263-COA Decision.pdf
- 21. Petition of TOWER ENGINEERING, Denise Vliet | 24 DRAYTON STREET | 20-004379-COA | Alterations
  - SIGNED Staff Decision 24 Drayton St 20-004379-COA.pdf
- 22. Petitin of TIMOTHY MINTON | 110 EAST TAYLOR STREET | 20-004386-COA | COLOR CHANGE

SIGNED 20-004386-COA Decision.pdf

23. Petition of HILTON DISPLAYS, Chris Grubbs | 2 WEST BROUGHTON STREET | 20-004412-COA | Signs

SIGNED Staff Decision - 20-004412 - 2 West Broughton.pdf

24. Petition of HILTON DISPLAYS, Chris Grubbs | 33 BULL STREET | 20-004415-COA | Signs

SIGNED Staff Decision - 20-004415-COA - 33 Bull Street.pdf

25. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 20-004492-COA | 134 Whitaker St | Staff Approved - installation of two projecting signs with conditions

Staff Signed Decision - 20-004492-COA - 134 Whitaker Street.pdf

26. Petition of YOUR EXTERIOR PROS | 20-004514-COA | 507 E. Perry St. | Staff Approved - In-Kind exterior repair and roof replacement

Staff SIGNED Decision 20-004514-COA.pdf

27. Petition of Georgia Historical Society | 20-004552-COA | 501 Whitaker St. | Staff Approved non-illuminated sign

Staff SIGNED Decision 20-004552-COA.pdf

28. Petition of 911 Glass & Door Service | 20-004753-COA | 10 Whitaker Street | Staff Approved - installation of new glass door with condition

Staff SIGNED Decision - 10 Whitaker St - 20-004753-COA.pdf

29. Petition of Adam Gnall | 20-004818-COA | 101 West Perry Street | Staff Approved - In Kind roof replacement

20-004818-COA Signed Decision.pdf

30. Petition of Rick Sammons | 20-004820-COA | 609-611 Tattnall Street | Staff Approved - Roof Replacement with conditions

31. Petition of Xian Wu | 20-004576-COA | 18 East Broughton Street | Staff Approved - Illuminated, projecting sign with conditions

@ 20-004576-COA SIGNED Decision.pdf

32. Petition of Susan Gorecki | 20-004789-COA | 318 E. Hall Street | Staff Approved - screens for windows.

Staff SIGNED Decision - 20-004789-COA.pdf

33. Petition of AAA Sign Co. Inc | 20-004545-COA | 630 W. Bay Street | Staff Approved - Sign Face Change

Staff SIGNED Decision - 20-004545-COA.pdf

<u>34. Petition of Bell Roofing Co. | 20-004839-COA | 17, 19 East Bay Street | Staff Approved - in-kind roof repair</u> with condition.

20-004839-COA SIGNED Decision.pdf

35. Petition of Your Exterior Pros | 20-004836-COA | 536 East Harris Street | Staff Approved - Roof Replacement

Staff SIGNED Decision - 536 E Harris St - 20-004836-COA.pdf

<u>36. Petition of Dohrman Construction, Preservation & Consulting | 20-004822-COA | 41 MLK Jr. Blvd | Staff</u> <u>Approved - Roof Stucco Repairs</u>

<u>20-004822-COA SIGNED Staff Decision.pdf</u>

### XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

37. Report on Work Performed Without a COA for the October 14, 2020 HDBR Meeting

@ 10-14-20 HDBR Report on Work Without a COA.pdf

### XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

38. Stamped Drawings - October Report

Ø October REPORT.pdf

### XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

#### XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

#### **NEW BUSINESS**

39. 2021 Officers Nominating Committee

The following volunteered to be part of the Nominating Committee: Stan Houle David Altshiller Melissa Memory

Ms. Michalak will create a meeting for the committee. She reminded that Mr. Stephens and Ms. Taylor are eligible for another term.

### XV. ADJOURNMENT

<u>40. Next Regular HDBR Meeting - November 12, 2020 (\*Note the change in date due to the Veteran's Day</u> <u>Holiday</u>)

### 41. Adjourn

There being no further business to present before the Board, the October 14, 2020 Historic District Board of Review meeting was adjourned at 3:57 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Leah Michalak Director of Historic Preservation and Urban Development /bm

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.