

# Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Virtual Meeting September 9, 2020 - 1:00 P.M. MINUTES

September 9, 2020 SAVANNAH HISTORIC DISTRICT BOARD OF REVIEW

# Members Present:

Dwayne Stephens, Chair Nan Taylor, Vice-Chair David Altschiller Stephen Bodek Kevin Dodge Stan Houle Ellie Isaacs Becky Lynch Melissa Memory

MPC Staff Present:

Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation Ryan Jarles, Cultural Resources Planner Olivia Arfuso, Assistant Preservation Planner Aislinn Droski, Assistant Preservation Planner Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant

## I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

### **II. SIGN POSTING**

### **III. CONSENT AGENDA**

### 1. Approve All Items on the Consent Agenda

Motion		
Approve as presented.		
Vote Results ( Approved )		
Motion: Ellie Isaacs		
Second: Becky Lynch		
Becky Lynch	- Aye	
Dwayne Stephens	- Aye	

Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

### 2. Petition of The House Doctor | 20-003282-COA | 423 Bull Street | Addition

- Ø Drawing updates for 9-9-2020.pdf
- SIGNED 20-003282-COA Board Decision.pdf
- Staff Recommendation 20-003282.pdf
- Application and Drawings.pdf

#### Motion

Approve the petition for a porch and spiral staircase addition to the rear of 423 Bull Street with the following condition, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Ensure the mounting of the porch to the historic garden wall is undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

#### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Becky Lynch	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

### 3. Petition of J. Elder Studio | 20-003447-COA | 204 East Gaston Street | Alterations and Addition

@ 204 EAST GASTON- ARCHITECTURAL DRAWINGS- REVISED.pdf

- @ 204 EAST GASTON- MATERIAL SPECIFICATIONS- REVISED.pdf
- @ Staff Rec 20-003447.pdf
- Motion

Approval for the proposed addition to the rear of 204 East Gaston Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Lower the rail height to be no more than 36 inches.

2. Revise the drawings to include a delineation between the existing and proposed brick fire walls, as well as a string course on the parapet portion of the brick firewall.

3. Ensure that the drawings are corrected to remove the notation for double doors within historic window openings on the fourth (4th) level of the rear facade.

### Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Becky Lynch	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

### 4. Petition of Ward Architecture | 20-003841-COA | 24 East Taylor Street | Addition and Alterations

- Historic Context Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps.pdf
- Colors and Materials for 24 East Taylor Street 20-003841.pdf
- Email from Petitioner regarding conditions.pdf
- Staff Recommendation 20-003841-COA 24 East Taylor Street.pdf
- DRAWINGS 24 E TAYLOR 20-003841.pdf

#### Motion

Approval of the in-kind repairs and alterations to the front façade, the demolition of a non-historic rear addition and replacement with a new addition at 24 East Taylor Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the preservation and design standards:

1. Revise the proposed alterations to the garden, second, and third level of the rear exterior wall to minimize the loss historic masonry.

2. Remove the side trim from the windows and doors of the rear addition; submit the material and color treatment of the window and door headers and sills, as well as the finish treatment of the cornice on the rear

Virtual Meeting September 9, 2020 - 1:00 P.M. MINUTES

addition.

3. If the existing double doors located in the northeast corner of the parlor level are original, retain on-site for possible reinstallation at a later date.

4. Ensure that any existing windows that require replacement are replaced with the same materials and configuration as the original and ensure that all replacement windows have true divided lites (TDL).

- 5. Ensure that hinges are installed for the fixed shutters on the elevator portion of the rear addition.
- 6. Ensure the distance between balusters does not exceed 4 inches.

#### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Becky Lynch	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

#### 5. Petition of John Sheather | 20-003851-COA | 214 East Liberty Street | Alterations

- Staff Recommendation 20-003851-COA.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf

#### Motion

Approval for the alteration and replacement of a window on the front façade, the replacement of shutters, and the replacement of the rear exterior door at 214 East Liberty Street with the following conditions to be submitted to Staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Ensure that any wood lap siding affected by the alteration and replacement of the proposed window be repaired in-kind.

2. Ensure that the replacement window has a pronounced sill.

# Vote Results ( Voting ) Motion: Ellie Isaacs

Second: Becky Lynch

Becky Lynch	- Not Voted
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

### **IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

### 6. Adopt the September 9, 2020 Agenda

#### Motion

Adopt the September 9, 2020 HDBR Regular Agenda as Presented

#### Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Nan Taylor	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

### **V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

### 7. Approve the August 12, 2020 Regular HDBR Meeting Minutes

### @ 8.12.20 MEETING MINUTES.pdf

### Motion

Approve the August 12, 2020 Regular HDBR Meeting Minutes

### Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: David Altschiller	
Second: Stan Houle	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain

Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

### VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

### VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

#### 8. Continue All Items on the Continued Agenda

Motion		
Continue Consent Agenda as Presented		
Vote Results ( Approved )		
Motion: Steven Bodek		
Second: Ellie Isaacs		
Becky Lynch	- Aye	
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain	
Melissa Memory	- Aye	
David Altschiller	- Aye	
Nan Taylor	- Aye	
Kevin Dodge	- Aye	
Stan Houle	- Aye	
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye	
Steven Bodek	- Aye	

9. Petition of Gunn, Meyerhoff, Shay | 17-002122-COA | 602 East River Street (Hotel Anne) | New Construction Part II: Design Details

Notion	
Continue.	
/ote Results ( Approved )	
Notion: Steven Bodek	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Aelissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye

Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

10. Petition of Gunn Meyerhoff Shay | 16-006852-COA | 630 East River Street | New Construction Parking Garage: Part II, Design Details

Motion	
Continue.	
Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Steven Bodek	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

11. Petition of GMSHAY Architecture | File No. 20-002646-COA | 225 East President Street | New Construction, Part II: Design Details

Motion	
Defer.	
Vote Results ( Approved )	
Motion: Steven Bodek	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye

Steven	Bodek

12. Petition of Hartman-Cox Architects | 20-002695-COA | 125 Bull Street | Rehabilitation, Alterations, and Additions

Defer.

Motion: Steven Bodek	
Second: Ellie Isaacs	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Not Voted
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

### **VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION**

### IX. REGULAR AGENDA

- 13. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 20-003365-COA | 10 East Oglethorpe Avenue | Sign Package
  - Staff Rec 20-003365 September.pdf
  - Updated Decorative Pole Sign.pdf
  - Tree Lawn Signs in DHD.pdf
  - Board Decision 8-12-2020 signed.pdf
  - 10 East Oglethorpe Drawings.pdf
  - Downtown Neighborhood Association Comment.pdf
  - ø JGL Markers.pdf
  - Ø Bridget Lidy Determination.pdf
  - Ardis Wood Comment.pdf

**Mr. Ryan Jarles** presented the applicant's request of approval for a sign package of the Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace property located at 10 East Oglethorpe Avenue. The sign package is proposed to include: one (1) projecting sign, one (1) flat mounted wall directional sign, one (1) flat mounted wall sign, one (1) ground sign (decorative pole sign), and four (4) window vinyl signs. On November 13, 2020, the petition for alterations and additions for the Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace located at 10 East Oglethorpe Avenue was approved [19-005946-COA]. On March 11, 2020, the Board approved the petition for alterations to an historic wall/fence as well as the addition of vertical hardscaping elements for the Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace property located at 10 East Oglethorpe Avenue [20-000882-

COA]. On August 12, 2020, this current was continued to allow for the petitioner to revise the tree lawn sign to be a decorative pole sign. Staff received updated drawings with the sign within the tree lawn shown as a decorative pole sign.

The east outbuilding is believed to have been built in the early 1900s and the survey card states 1903 as the construction year; however, it is listed as a non-contributing building on the Contributing Resources Map and staff research indicates that the building was "largely reconstructed in the 1950s; only a portion of the south wall retains some original material." (Quote from the original National Register nomination in 1987.)

The attachment method for the mounting of the signs to the historic stucco and brick facades was not specified within the submittal: ensure that all mounting is undertaken within the mortar joints between the brick in order to retain and preserve the historic character and distinctive features of the building as well as making the work reversible. The projecting sign is proposed to be constructed of sandblasted HDU to be painted green and white; the incidental sign is proposed to be constructed of painted bent aluminum; the wall sign is proposed to be constructed of painted bent aluminum; the ground sign is proposed to be constructed of painted bent aluminum; the ground sign is proposed to be constructed of painted bent aluminum. These materials are compatible; none of the restricted materials listed are proposed within the submittal.

There are two neighboring properties which include decorative pole signs within the tree lawn; the proposed tree lawn sign within this submittal is subordinate in size to the neighboring tree lawn signs and is visually compatible. A 1.8 square foot directional sign is proposed to be located on the south facing façade. This sign is proposed to direct the public to the various secondary uses of the property. The three (3) window signs are proposed as vinyl cut letters and symbols and are not to exceed 10% of the window area. The projecting sign is proposed to be bracket mounted to the west facing façade of the west outbuilding (original stable/carriage house) and is to be the principal use sign for the Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace Store. The flat mounted wall sign is proposed for use as the principal use sign for the Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace Ticket building; this sign will be minimally visible from the public right of way. The ground sign is proposed for use as the principal use sign for the Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace Museum and Garden.

The linear footage of business frontage maintained by the store is 20'-5" allowing for a maximum of 12 square feet; the projecting sign is proposed to be 9.8 square feet. The linear footage of business frontage maintained by the ticket building is 82'-6" allowing for a maximum of 20 square feet; the wall mounted sign is proposed to be 7.3 square feet. The linear footage of business frontage maintained by the museum and garden is approximately 121'-2" allowing for a maximum of 12 square feet. The ground sign is proposed to be 6.8 square feet.

The ground sign is proposed as a non-illuminated decorative pole sign within the grass plat between the curb line and the sidewalk (tree lawn), and the sign is 6.8 square feet in size. There are two neighboring properties which include decorative pole signs within the tree lawn; the proposed tree lawn sign within this submittal is subordinate in size to the neighboring tree lawn signs and is visually compatible. Ensure that all appropriate approvals are received prior to submitting drawings to staff to be stamped for permitting. The proposed wall and projecting signs are to be within the signable areas of the buildings. The wall sign is proposed to be mounted flat to the façade of the building and the projecting sign is 8'-6" above the sidewalk.

## **PETITIONER COMMENTS:**

Mr. Doug Bean, petitioner, stated he believes the redesigned pole sign is what

the Board required. He stated he supported staff's recommendation.

# PUBLIC COMMENTS:

**Mr. Bob Rosenwald,** of the Downtown Neighborhood Association, stated they believe all tree lawns should be revisited by the Board. It is inappropriate and unnecessary, and it is next to the historical marker, therefore redundant. The revised sign does not compliment the home or marker. Commercialization of space with tree lawn signs should be discouraged. No other area uses tree lawn signs; they contribute to a cluttered, small tree lawn area. It is inappropriate and sets a precedent. He agrees a directional pole sign would be a less offensive configuration; the color needs to be carefully considered.

**Mr. Ryan Arvay**, of the Historic Savannah Foundation, in terms of signage aesthetically, he feels new sign is an improvement. The materials are a concern, due to lack of durability and fading. Cast iron should be considered for such a landmark. Allowance of a tree lawn sign should require more discussion: how does this sign drive more traffic to this landmark? Tree lawn signs do exist; their history should be considered before approving another.

**Mr. Jarles** stated the ordinance does allow for tree lawn signs as clarified by the Zoning Administrator. It prevails over other ordinances due to being in a Special Sign District, providing qualifications are met.

**Mr. Bean** stated he believes they have provided what has been asked. He stated the material will look like an iron sign. The sign is not for advertising; it is for directional purposes.

## **BOARD DISCUSSION**

**Ms. Lynch** stated she feels the sign it out of the Board's discretion. She believes it should be shortened to human scale. **Mr. Altschiller** suggested reducing the amount of words would contribute to the reducing the size of the sign: simply "Tickets". **Ms. Issacs** agrees it's too large, though more visually compatible. Is it really needed since a historical marker is there? **Mr. Dodge** agrees that it is too large. **Ms. Memory** stated she wonders how it would be visually compatible with a sign in every tree lawn because it is a special sign district. **Ms. Taylor** states the sign is too large and the colors are too bold. Prefers something more subdued and smaller. Trying to determine if setting a precedent with way finding signs. **Mr. Houle** agrees with the previous comments; it is much too big to advertise tickets and not visually compatible. Encourages relocation to the wall instead of in the tree lawn.

**Ms. Michalak** stated tree lawn signs have been allowed since the 1980s in the special sign district. The majority of the existing tree lawn signs were properly executed; there are not a mass of illegal tree lawn signs. The Zoning Administrator, who has the final decision, has determined it is allowable. The HDBR can address visual compatibility. **Mr. Stephens** stated other avenues can be utilized if necessary.

**Mr. Bodek** stated they are being asked to decide on a cut-and-dry issue; it should be addressed in another form. **Mr. Altshiller** states it should just say "Tickets", as there are other GS signs, then it could be smaller. **Ms. Isaacs** stated it is not visually compatible and it is redundant. No other historic house has a sign; only businesses. The business part has its own sign in the back. **Mr. Dodge** stated it is not visually compatible. **Ms. Memory** stated a smaller sign would be more visually compatible.

**<u>STAFF RECOMMENDATION</u>**: Approval for a sign package for the Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace property located at 10 East Oglethorpe Avenue with the following conditions to be MINUTES submitted to staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meet the standards: 1. Ensure that all appropriate approvals are received by the City of Savannah for placing the ground sign within the grass plat between the curb and sidewalk. 2. Ensure all sign mounting upon a historic façade is undertaken within the mortar joints between the brick.

Virtual Meeting

September 9, 2020 - 1:00 P.M.

### Motion

Approval for a sign package for the Juliette Gordon Low Birthplace property located at 10 East Oglethorpe Avenue with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meet the standards:

1. Ensure all sign mounting upon a historic façade is undertaken within the mortar joints between the brick.

2. The tree lawn sign is omitted from the package due to lack of visual compatibility.

### Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Ellie Isaacs	
Second: Steven Bodek	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

14. Petition of LS3P Associates Architects | 20-003852-COA | 110 Ann Street | Amendments to New Construction

- Staff Recommendation 20-003852-COA.pdf
- Submittal Packet Drawings.pdf
- Submittal Packet Narrative.pdf
- Submittal Packet Previously Approved Material Samples.pdf
- Submittal Packet Specifications for New Products (not previously approved).pdf
- Submittal Packet Before and After Renderings.pdf

Public Comment.pdf

@ 110 ANN STREET\_AMENDMENT 4 STAFF RECOMMENDATION Responses.pdf

**Ms. Leah Michalak** presented the applicant's request of approval for amendments to the previously approved new construction for the property located at 110 Ann Street. Per the applicant, the proposed amendments are as follows:

1. Building Use

The 110 Ann Street project is now proposed to change use from a hotel to a multi- family apartment building. Many of the ground floor uses have been

# 10. Ann St. and Laurel St. Facades

- A. All metal canopies have been removed / replaced with fabric awnings in all locations on the Ann St. facade. This change reflects the change of use on the ground floor from commercial hotel to residential multi-family apartment building.
- B. Storefront/window/door locations have been revised to reflect the change of use. The revised locations cover over 25% of the ground floor at residential locations and cover over 55% of the ground floor at commercial locations. Upper floor windows still cover a minimum of 20% of the facade. Storefront & window glazing percentages are provided on elevation sheets for reference.
- C. Window locations and type have been revised due to the change in use.
- D. The "base" of the building has been revised. The 3rd floor brick banding has been relocated to the 2nd floor and removed from the center bays on both the Ann St. and Laurel St. facades. A common bond header course has been added to the 3rd floor.
- E. The recessed center bay of the brick masses has been revised to be narrower and stop at the 6th floor line. The recess depth of the center bay has been revised from 6" to 1-1/2" from the face of the side bays. The bay spacing continues to meet the requirements of the ordinance, as dimensioned on the floor plans.
- F. A dormer and window have been added to the mansard roof on both the Ann & Laurel St. facades to align with new window locations below.
- G. The stone base banding at the 3rd floor of the hyphen has been lowered to align with the brick banding at the 2nd floor. The 5th floor stone banding location has been revised.
- H. The landscape deck along Laurel Street has been relocated to the ground floor. A wall of continuity has been provided along Laurel Street at the new ground floor landscape courtyard. New openings have been added to Laurel Street wall, which consist of steel frame gates and screens with perforated metal panels. Reference window and door legend drawings.
- 1. The upper parapet coping has been revised from cast stone to matte black aluminum throughout the project. Section details have been provided illustrating this change.

# 11. Zubley St. and Alton St. Facades

- A. The stone portion of the Zubley St. and Alton St. facades have been revised, shrinking in width and extending to the 6th floor. The revised stone complies to cover 30% of the facade. The stone calculations have been included in this submission on the elevation sheets.
- B. The "base" of the building has been revised. The 3rd floor brick banding has been relocated to the 2nd floor and removed from the center bays on both the Ann St. and Laurel St. facades. A common bond header course has been added to the 3rd floor facades.
- C. The stone banding at the 3rd floor has been revised to align with the brick banding at the 2nd floor. Stone banding has been added at the 5th floor, aligning with the brick soldier coursing. A projecting string course has been added below the parapet.
- D. Storefront/window/door locations have been revised to reflect the change of use. The revised locations cover over 25% of the ground floor at residential locations

along Zubley Street since the ground floor use is now residential. Upper floor windows still cover a minimum of 20% of both Zubley and Alton facades. Storefront & window glazing percentages are provided on elevation drawings for reference.

- E. Window locations and type have been revised due to the change in use.
- F. The upper parapet coping has been revised from cast stone to matte black aluminum throughout the project. Section details have been provided illustrating this change.

# 12. Exterior Material Revisions

- A. The B-2 Glazed Brick specification has been replaced with B-1, removing the glazed brick from the project.
- B. CI-1 has been removed from the project, refer to Ann St. facade revisions on removal of cast iron canopies.
- C. The parapet coping is now proposed to be matte black aluminum. A specification has been included in the submission.
- D. Steel gates and screens have been added to the project. The construction will consist of steel frames and perforated metal panels. The steel and perforated metal will have a matte black finish. A perforated metal specification has been included in the submission.

# SAMPLE PANEL POLICY:

The HDBR adopted the Sample Panel Policy on August 9, 2017. The purpose of the sample panel is to provide an accurate physical representation of the materials, workmanship, and color palette of the proposed building's final design. It also depicts the relationship of the proposed building within its surrounding context.

# **PETITIONER COMMENTS:**

**Mr. Scott Cook**, stated the façade on Laurel Street was a miscalculation on their end. They have no opposition to it; will present to staff. All ground floor sidings will be aluminum.

# PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Ms. Ardis Wood, stated by written letter, requested a tree lawn to be included in the project.

**Mr. Ryan Arvay**, HSF, stated visually the building was better before than the revised, due to the commercial use on the first floor. Believes it to be a missed opportunity to activate the street. Concerned about approving such a large amendment.

**Mr. Cook** stated they agree with Ms. Wood, however, the amount of utility use underneath the sidewalk makes that not possible. Responding to Mr. Arvay, Mr. Cook stated though the bonus floor criteria is changing, activating the area is still part of their intent.

# **BOARD COMMENTS**

**Mr. Houle** stated the project looks like big boxes; their appears to be no effort to provide interest to the building. **Ms. Taylor** stated she sees the concerns, but does not know how to suggest enhancing. Does prefer current color palette. **Ms. Memory** asked how much change can be accepted before it becomes a new project. **Ms. Isaacs** preferred the black brick and the double height brick base; it gave a strong base and made it more visually compatible. Requested the brick and inset be returned to the revised plans. **Mr. Altschiller** stated the building needs more personality. **Mr. Bodek**, **Mr. Dodge**, and **Ms. Lynch** had no comment. **Mr. Stephens** highlighted the impact of the design changes. He requested of **Ms. Pam Everett** to indicate if it needs to be a new application. It was determined the use is

not in the HDBR's purview.

**Ms. Isaacs** complimented the implementation of the courtyard to encourage public engagement. **Ms. Lynch** stated that the material change and material insets makes the building less visually compatible and more massive in scale. There was no further Board discussion.

# **STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

<u>Approval</u> for amendments to the previously approved new construction for the property located at 110 Ann Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed amendments are otherwise visually compatible and meet the standards:

- 1. Continue the brick banding across the full width of the facades to reinforce the building base.
- 2. Provide fabric awning details.
- 3. If, during construction, roof equipment is visible from the public ROW provide screening.
- 4. Add a third primary entrance on the Laurel Street façade.
- 5. Provide a sample of the limestone and associated mortar.
- 6. Provide a sample panel per the Sample Panel Policy.

revised due to this change in use. The drawings included in the submission show this change in use on the ground floor, which now include apartments, lounges, business center, restaurant, gallery and lobby. The second floor, which previously held event spaces and hotel rooms, has now become apartments.

## 2. Building Footprint

Generally, the building footprint is very similar to the previously approved design, with a couple of revisions:

- -The landscape deck along Laurel Street has been relocated to the ground floor. This revision reduced the square footage of the building footprint to 23,313 SF. A wall of continuity has been provided along Laurel Street at the new ground floor landscape courtyard. The west stone "hyphen" façade along Ann Street has shifted 2'-2" outward. This change does not affect the massing device standard since we are still using multiple volumes and roofline variation as our chosen devices (the setback and recess devices are not being used). Along Zubley and Alton facades, the stone portion of the facades have been revised to set back 1'-2". The previously approved design projected forward at these areas. The basement has been removed from the project.
- 2. Building Height

The overall building height has been reduced from 84'-6" to 79'-4", a total reduction of 5'-2" from the previously approved height. The drawings included in this submission reflect this change. The floor level heights have been revised as follows:

- 3. Second Floor: Increased from 18'-0" to 18'-6". Third Floor: Reduced from 16'-0" to 12'-0". Fourth Floor: Reduced from 11'-2" to 10'-8". Fifth Floor: Reduced from 11'-2" to 10'-8".
- 4. Mezzanine Level

The ground floor apartments include a new mezzanine loft level over a

# 5. Bonus Story Criteria

The bonus story criteria for the project is now to be achieved by pursuing LEED Gold certification and incorporating 100% modular masonry materials. The project was previously approved for a bonus story by meeting the ground floor active use criteria. Substantial completion of LEED Gold will be provided to the MPC staff prior to applying for certificate of occupancy. Some revisions are required as part of this criteria change:

5. Solar PV array will be provided on the roof. The array will be screened if visible from the public right-of-way. Ground floor active uses have been omitted. Entrances have been provided in compliance with the large-scale development standard. The distances between the entrances are shown on the ground floor plan.

# 6. The Bridge and Promenade Revisions

- A. The exterior steel stairs within the promenade connecting to the 2nd floor have been removed from the project.
- B. The 2nd floor of the bridge has been enclosed and reduced in size, similar to the upper floors. A section drawing has been included in the submission to illustrate this change.
- C. Planters and an outdoor dining area have been added within the promenade. The outdoor dining area will be raised, due to the grade change within the promenade. A detail has been provided for the wall and railing of this area.
- D. The location of the bridge has shifted 3" away from Ann Street to align with interior circulation.7.

# 7. Windows and Storefronts

- A. The change in use from a hotel to apartments required revision to window and storefront placement and type throughout the project. The required percentage of glazing on the ground floor and upper floors continues to be met, as shown on the elevation drawings. Windows are now located on the ground floor at residential locations, replacing previous storefront locations.
- B. All windows will be set inset 4" from all façade surfaces.
- C. All windows continue to meet the standard in regard to distance between windows, as shown on elevation drawings.
- D. All casement windows have been revised from 4'-0" x 7'-0" overall dimensions to 3'-6" x 6'-0".

A. Commercial Storefronts. Storefront bases have been removed at ground floor residential window locations and the sill height has been revised from 1'-6" to 2'-0" throughout the project. The base material has been revised from limestone to brick, utilizing a recessed, stacked bond coursing. We feel the revised base creates a contrasting design per the ordinance. The storefront assemblies are still proposed to be constructed of mulled, aluminum clad wood windows. Window and storefront legend drawings have been included in this submission to reflect these changes.

# 8. Refuse and Loading (Alton Street)

- A. The internal configuration of the loading/trash rooms has been revised.
- B. Door locations have been revised to these service areas.
- C. The Loading door has been revised from an overhead coiling door to a custom,

# 9. Exterior Lighting

Exterior Lighting has been relocated on all facades due to changes in entrance locations.

### Motion

Approval for amendments to the previously approved new construction for the property located at 110 Ann Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed amendments are otherwise visually compatible and meet the standards:

- 1. If, during construction, roof equipment is visible from the public ROW provide screening.
- 2. Add a third primary entrance on the Laurel Street facade. Review at staff level.
- 3. Provide a sample panel per the Sample Panel Policy.

4. Restudy base two floors with black brick detailing for staff review for visual compatibility, in keeping with previous submission.

### Vote Results ( Approved )

Motion: Steven Bodek	
Second: Kevin Dodge	
Becky Lynch	- Aye
Dwayne Stephens	- Abstain
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Kevin Dodge	- Aye
Stan Houle	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Steven Bodek	- Aye

### X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

15. Petition of GO SOLAR POWER, Dean Hodge | 20-003633-COA | 205 EAST HALL STREET | Solar Panels

SIGNED Staff Decision - 20-003633-COA.pdf

16. Petition of RICK DiNARDIO | 20-003635-COA | 108 WEST HALL ST | Paint/Roof Replacement/Replace Gutters/In-Kind Stucco Repair

- SIGNED Staff Decision 20-003635-COA.pdf
- 17. Petition of COASTAL CANVAS, Andrew Barber | 20-003692-COA | 1 WEST LIBERTY STREET | Awning

SIGNED 20-003692-COA Staff Decision.pdf

18. Petition of GSI, Michael Taylor | 20-003701-COA | 300 WEST RIVER STREET (13 Secrets) | Signs

SIGNED Staff Decision - 20-003701-COA.pdf

19. Petition of GSI, Michael Taylor | 20-003703-COA | 300 WEST RIVER STREET (Byrd) | Signs

SIGNED Staff Decision - 20-003703-COA.pdf

- 22. Petition of GSI, Michael Taylor | 20-003708-COA | 300 WEST RIVER STREET (Sweet Charlie's) | Sign SIGNED Staff Decision - 20-003708-COA.pdf
- 23. Petition of GSI, Tom Woods | 20-003715-COA | 300 WEST RIVER STREET (Perimeter) | Sign

SIGNED Staff Decision 20-003715-COA.pdf

- 25. Petition of CHRISTIAN SOTTILE | 20-003791-COA | 200 300 WEST RIVER STREET | Amend Awning

SIGNED Staff Decision - 20-003791-COA.pdf

26. Petition of JUSTIN VAN HYKE | 20-003809 -COA | 227 WEST BROUGHTON | Windows (in-kind repair)

SIGNED Staff Decision - 20003809 - 227 West Broughton Street.pdf

27. Petition of GSI, Tom Woods | 20-003974-COA | 300 WEST RIVER STREET (Myrtle & Rose) | Amend SIGNS

28. Petition of GSI, Tom Woods | 20-003976-COA | 300 WEST RIVER STREET (Starbucks) | Amended COA for Illuiminated Sign

SIGNED Staff Decision 20-003976-COA.pdf

29. Petition of STEVEN BODEK | 20-004013-COA | 540 EAST TAYLOR STREET | Shutter Installation

SIGNED Staff Decision - 20-004013 - 540 East Taylor Street.pdf

30. Petition of ASHER & RYE, Erika Snayd | 20-004061-COA | 346 & 348 WHITAKER STREET | Color Change

SIGNED Staff Decision - 20-004061-COA - 348 Whitaker Street.pdf

31. Petition of Jonathan Tabakian | 20-004064-COA | 23 East Gordon Street | Staff Approved in-kind roof repairs, replacement, paint trim

20-004064-COA SIGNED Decision.pdf

# XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

32. Report on Work Performed Without a COA for the September 9, 2020 HDBR Meeting

9-9-20 HDBR Report on Work Without a COA.pdf

## **XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF**

33. Stamped Drawings - September Report

September REPORT.pdf

# XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

#### XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

#### **XV. ADJOURNMENT**

34. Next Regular HDBR Meeting (Virtual) - October 14, 2020

#### 35. Adjourn

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.