



Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street
October 12, 2022 1:00 PM
MINUTES

October 12, 2022 Historic District Board of Review

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM at 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted, and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received and no votes were taken.

Members Present: Ellie Isaacs, Chair
David Altschiller
Karen Guinn
Michael Higgins
Melissa Memory
Melissa Rowan
Nan Taylor
Thomas Thomson

Members Absent: Dwayne Stephens

MPC Staff Present: Melanie Wilson, Executive Director
Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director (virtually)
Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation
Caitlin Chamberlain, Senior Planner
Ethan Hagerman, Assistant Planner
James Zerillo, Assistant Planner
Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant
Julie Yawn, System Analyst

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

[1. Petition of 190 Octane Retail, LLC. | 22-003872-COA | 19 East Bay Street | Illuminated Sign](#)

[☞ Staff Recommendation - 22-003872-COA 19 East Bay Street](#)

[☞ Submittal Packet](#)

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for the

installation of an illuminated sign on the front façade of the building located at 19 East Bay Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because otherwise, the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. The part of the proposed sign which does not feature lettering must conform to an opaque background.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson

Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[2. Petition of Martin Luehrmann | 22-003984-COA | 10 Whitaker Street | Alterations](#)

📎 [Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

📎 [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations at 10 Whitaker Street as submitted because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson

Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[3. Petition of Patrick Phelps | 22-004121-COA | 308 East Hall Street | Alterations](#)

📎 [Staff Recommendation - 22-004121- COA 308 East Hall Street](#)

📎 [Submittal Packet](#)

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations at 10 Whitaker Street as submitted because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson

Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[4. Petition of Pantheon ADC | 22-004351-COA | 24 East Broughton Street | Storefront Alterations](#)

[☞ Submittal Packet- 22-004351-COA 24 East Broughton.pdf](#)

[☞ Staff Recommendation - 22-004351-COA 24 E Broughton St.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations for the property located at 24 East Broughton Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Submit exact door specifications.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson

Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[5. Petition of Pantheon ADC | 22-004368-COA | 15 West Broughton Street | Alterations](#)

[Staff Recommendation - 22-004368-COA 15 West Broughton Street](#)

[Submittal Packet](#)

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for alterations to the lane façade of the building located at 15 West Broughton Street as requested, because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson

Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

[6. Adopt the October 12, 2022 Agenda](#)

Motion

Adopt the October 12, 2022 Agenda as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: David Altschiller

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

[7. Approve September 14, 2022 HDBR Meeting Minutes](#)

[09.14.22 MEETING MINUTES.pdf](#)

Motion

Approve the September 14, 2022 HDBR Meeting Minutes as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

[8. Petition of Hansen Architects | 22-002279-COA | 220 East Bryan Street | New Construction: Part II, Design Details](#)

Motion

Continue.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: David Altschiller

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[9. Petition of Pantheon ADC | 22-002854-COA | 11 Jefferson Street | New Construction: Part II, Design Details](#)

Motion

Continue.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: David Altschiller

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[10. Petition of Gerald Chambers and Michael Gronebaum | 22-04372-COA | 222 East Gwinnett Street | Alterations and Porch Addition](#)

Motion

Continue.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: David Altschiller

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

[11. Petition of J. Elder Studio | 22-004370-COA | 30 Barnard Street | Rooftop Addition and Storefront Alteration](#)

🔗 [Staff Recommendation 22-004370-COA 30 Barnard Street](#)

🔗 [Submittal Packet](#)

🔗 [Material Specifications](#)

Mr. Ethan Hageman presented the petitioner's request of approval for a rooftop addition

and storefront alteration to the building located at **30 Barnard Street**. The project description is listed below per the petitioner: MINUTES

“The scope of this project includes a 2500 SF addition to the rooftop of 30 Barnard St. and alteration to the storefront at the bay addressed 38 Barnard St.”

The historic structure was constructed in 1920-1930 and is considered a contributing building within the Savannah Downtown Historic District and National Historic Landmark District.

The standards from Preservation Brief 14 are met. The proposed rooftop addition will preserve the character of the historic building while being compatible but differentiated from the historic building at 30 Barnard Street. The proposed rooftop addition will be 1-story in height and will be set back to where it is minimally visible from Barnard Street. The intent of Preservation Brief 2 is met; however, the petitioner has not provided staff enough information regarding the repointing of the bricks on the storefront of 38 Barnard Street. **Revise and send staff mortar specifications for final review and approval for repointing historic bricks of the storefront entrance addressed 38 Barnard Street.**

The historic character of 30 Barnard Street will be retained and preserved. The new rooftop addition at 30 Barnard Street will be differentiated from the historic building. The new rooftop addition will be constructed in a manner where if removed in the future, the integrity of the historic property will be retained. 30 Barnard Street falls within the four (4) story zone based off the Downtown Historic District Height Map. The proposed rooftop addition would make 30 Barnard Street three (3) stories tall. Due to its minimum visibility; the rooftop addition is visually compatible. Staff finds the proposed materials to be visually compatible with the surrounding contributing buildings of Decker Ward (Ellis Square). The proposed materials are listed below per the petitioner:

Siding- MetalTech Global Reveal Panel System

Color- Benjamin Moore: OC-15 Fawn

Roof- Roofing membrane over sheathing over metal deck system

Skylight- VELUX Modular

Lane Wall- Cast Stone Panels

First Floor Storefront- Custom Wood Marvin Ultimate Wood Window and Door

Addition Storefront- Western Windows Simulated Steel Storefront System

Color- Black Metal Finish

Roof shapes. *The roof shape of a building or structure shall be visually compatible with the contributing buildings and structures to which it is visually related.*

The proposed flat roof shape of the rooftop addition is visually compatible with the existing contributing building at 30 Barnard Street and the surrounding contributing buildings within Decker Ward (Ellis Square). The petitioner is proposing cast stone panels on the lane wall for the rooftop addition which will act as a parapet. Cast stone panels are a type of precast concrete which is permitted per the ordinance. The petitioner is proposing MetalTech Global Reveal Panels. Metal panels are not listed as permitted or prohibited materials for exterior walls within the Downtown Historic District. The Board may approve the metal panels given they are visually compatible and perform favorably in the local climate. Staff finds the proposed metal panels to meet the intent of the ordinance. Staff recommends approval; the metal panels differentiate the addition from the historic building. Staff finds the proposed exterior color to be visually compatible and similar to the existing color of the building located at 30 Barnard Street. See color details above underneath Visual Compatibility section. The door frame for the storefront doors on the proposed rooftop addition will be inset 4 inches. The door will be made of steel with glass panels. The petitioner is proposing storefront windows for the rooftop addition along with skylights on the roof. The proposed

window glass will be transparent.

A Certificate of Appropriateness (18-004952-COA) was approved for 38 Barnard Street on September 10, 2018. The previous COA allowed the petitioner to remove the existing awning and paint the brick at the base and trim to "Heath Gray". Staff finds the proposed color change of the bricks of the storefront to be appropriate to the historic context of the building. The proposed rooftop addition's storefront windows and door will be made of steel.

The proposed parapets on the proposed rooftop addition will have a stringcourse and coping, while the skylight will be integrated into roof design and minimally visible from the public right-of-way. The roof will be covered with roofing membrane over sheathing over metal deck system. The metal roof will have a formed metal drip edge.

The rooftop addition will not be visible from the front elevation on Barnard Street. It will be visible from Barnard when viewed from the side heading south. The addition will be distinguishable from the contributing building and reversible.

A site visit was done for the view from Ellis Square. The addition is more visible from Congress Street; a set back and planters added for existing curb cut.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Jerome Elder, petitioner, stated the visibility is minimal from Ellis Square and used vegetation also. The appropriate materials were used, and it will be visible from across the square.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Mr. Higgins stated the screening efforts are appreciated; still should be careful about rooftop additions.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approval for a rooftop addition and storefront alteration to the building located at 30 Barnard Street with the following condition because otherwise, the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Revise and send staff mortar specifications for final review and approval for repointing historic bricks of the storefront entrance addressed 38 Barnard Street.**

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for a rooftop addition and storefront alteration to the building located at 30 Barnard Street with the following condition because otherwise, the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Revise and send staff mortar specifications for final review and approval for repointing historic bricks of the storefront entrance addressed 38 Barnard Street.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Michael Higgins

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[12. Petition of J. Elder Studio | 22-004369-COA | 408 Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard | Rooftop Addition and Storefront Alteration](#)

[☞ Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

[☞ Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

Mr. Jamie Zerillo presented the petitioner's request of approval for a rooftop addition and storefront alterations for the property at 408 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard. The proposed scope of work is minimally visible from the public right-of-way, being only visible from I-16.

The historic building was constructed in 1906 and is a contributing structure within the Savannah Downtown Historic District. The proposed rooftop addition is compatible but differentiated and constructed in a densely-built urban area. It is not more than one story in height. The proposed scope of work is only visible from the I-16 overpass and not from Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard. The historic character of the structure is not altered as the characteristic features, materials, and spaces of the structure will not be impacted by the addition.

The proposed scope of work does not obscure distinctive features as it is setback from the front façade roofline. The building form and cornice, a major distinctive feature of the structure, are not obscured from the public right of way. The new addition does not damage historic materials visible from the public right of way. The new work is differentiated from the old and is compatible in massing and scale. The proposed scope of work may be removed without jeopardizing the historical integrity and form of the structure. Per the Savannah Downtown Historic District Height Map 5 stories is permitted in this area. The scope of work is not visible from the public right of way and does not alter the exterior expression of the height of the structure from the front façade.

The use of zinc paneling (as a materials) is appropriate and differentiates the new work from the old. However, staff recommends the proposed diamond texture/configuration of the paneling be revised to a horizontally aligned paneling configuration to be visually compatible to the horizontal expression of the structure and its features. The roof shape of the roof top addition is visually compatible. The setback of the addition from the front façade prevents the roof from being visible from Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard. The pitch of the roof makes it minimally visible, except from I-16 which is an elevated highway. cope of work is not visible from the public right of way and does not alter the exterior expression of the height of the structure from the public right of way. The rooftop addition has an exterior expression of 11 feet 6 inches. The exterior visual expression of the addition is distinctive from the stories below.

The proposed material is a zinc flat panel in a diamond pattern. It is not a prohibited

material. However, staff recommends the proposed diamond texture/configuration of the paneling be revised to a horizontally aligned paneling configuration to be visually compatible to the horizontal expression of the structure and its features. The proposed doors will not be visible from the public right of way. The rear balcony is recessed from the rear façade so that the door is not visible from I-16 as seen in the petitioner's renderings. The proposed entrances and doors are glass swinging doors. No prohibited materials are proposed. The windows which face a street are not visible due to the setback of the rooftop addition. The continuation of the historic framing on the rear façade of the building to the new addition would not be appropriate as it would create a false sense of historical development. The provided dimension shows an inset of 4 and ¼ inches. The distance between windows is not less than for adjacent contributing buildings.

The proposed windows visible from the public right of way are constructed of metal. The proposed windows are Marvin Signature Ultimate Awning Push-Out Narrow Frame windows and Marvin Signature Ultimate Picture Narrow Frame Windows. No tinting is proposed.

The proposed balcony on the rear façade does not extend from the face of the building, it is recessed.

The proposed balcony does not utilize vinyl.

The pitch for the standing seam metal roof was not provided. Provide the roof pitch and ensure it meets the standards.

No pergola or roof deck is proposed on the street façade. The proposed roof is a standing seam metal roof with a drip edge. The addition is not visible from the primary / front façade. It is only visible on the rear façade from I-16. The addition is subordinate in height and mass to the structure. No character-defining features are obscured or damaged by the addition. The addition is not visible from the front elevation. The addition is clearly an appendage in form and is distinguishable from the contributing building in design and form. The addition could be removed with minimal damage to the contributing building.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Jerome Elder, petitioner, stated they made the MLK facade not visible from across the street. It will be a residential structure. They think the diamond shape will be interesting and contemporary.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, stated the height of the building made diamond shape appropriate for this location but would not in another.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Mr. Higgins agrees with HSF. Helps to separate the old from the new elements. The Board agrees it is visually compatible.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approval for a rooftop addition at 408 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Revise the diamond texture/configuration of the paneling to a horizontally aligned paneling configuration.**
- 2. Provide the roof pitch for the roof and ensure it meets the standards.**

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve a rooftop addition at 408 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Provide the roof pitch for the roof and ensure it meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[13. Petition of Shauna Kucera | 22-003883-COA | 117 West Jones Street | Amendment to Previous COA \(Wall/Fence\)](#)

[☞ Staff Research.pdf](#)

[☞ Staff Recommendation.pdf](#)

[☞ Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

[☞ Submittal Packet Previous.pdf](#)

Mr. Jamie Zerillo presented the petitioner's request of approval for an amendment to a previous COA under 21-005430-COA to alter an existing masonry fence. On November 10th 2021, the Historic District Board of Review approved an application for a new masonry wall on West Jones Lane at 117 West Jones Street under file number 21-005430-COA. The application was approved with the condition to provide a brick and mortar sample. Permit drawings for this COA were stamped by Staff on November 17, 2021. On February 2, 2022 Staff conducted a final inspection of the property and found inconsistencies between the work completed and the stamped permit drawings. The south-facing masonry wall and gate did not match what was on the approve drawings. The refuse area was also changed from what was shown on the stamped drawings.

The historic building was constructed in 1851 and is a contributing structure within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the Savannah Local Historic District. Historic Savannah Foundation has an easement on this property. The historic character of the site and the existing masonry wall will not be altered by the proposed scope of work. The proposed scope of work will not damage the historic integrity of the property or impact any historic materials. The proposed scope of work may be reversed in the future without impacting the historical integrity of the property.

The proposed materials of wood and brick are visually compatible with the surrounding context. Within the surrounding visual context, wooden gates on masonry walls are

constructed of vertical boards or have a vertical board detail. This configuration would be more visually compatible than a paneled door, which reads as an interior door. Revise the design of the door to be more compatible to the surrounding visual context through the addition of this detail. The brick wall is 8 feet high. The fence extends from an existing masonry fence on the west of the property. The fence extends from an existing masonry fence, the use of masonry (brick) is appropriate. The proposed refuse storage area is screened from the public right of way behind the masonry wall. The proposed door is made of wood.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ms. Shauna Kucera, petitioner, stated they are proposing a solid wood mahogany door, rather than a gate with point.

Ms. Taylor asked if there are other doors that are the same as what is being proposed. **Ms. Kucera** stated there are those in the area that are similar.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, stated the door as proposed was appropriate as it is a modern door with modern design.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Mr. Thomson asked about the door design. **Mr. Zerillo** stated no design was stated, based on visibility from the lane. The Board thought the door to be compatible.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approval for an amendment to a previous COA under 21-005430-COA to alter an existing masonry fence at 117 West Jones Street with the following condition because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1. Revise the design of the gate to include vertical boards as seen in the surrounding visual context or utilize the previously approved gate design which was approved under file number 21-005430-COA.**

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition an amendment to a previous COA under 21-005430-COA to alter an existing masonry fence at 117 West Jones Street as submitted because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye

[14. Petition of Rose Architects | 22-004373-COA | 111 West Congress Street | Alterations, Additions, and Variance Recommendation Request](#)

📎 [Staff Recommendation - 22-004373-COA.pdf](#)

📎 [SUB PKCT 22-004373-COA 111 WEST CONGRESS.pdf](#)

****Ms. Guinn recused herself from this item.*

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the applicant's request for alterations to the property located at 111 West Congress Street. Proposed work includes reconfiguring the interior spaces, the addition of a roof deck and bar and indoor/outdoor operable patio, a roof replacement, and a marquee sign on the front façade.

The applicant is also requesting a recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard regarding marquees in the *Special Sign Districts 9.9.17, section f viii* that reads:

“...the lowest point of the marquee sign shall not be less than 10 feet above the established grade.”

to allow for 8'-9" of clearance from the underside of the marquee to the sidewalk.

The applicant is requesting a variance for vertical dimensions prevalent on the 100 block of West Congress Street.

Per the applicant:

“The ordinance states that all marquee signs shall be 10 feet or more from grade. We would like to align our marquee to neighboring structures. Many historic marquees in the Landmark District are below the 10-foot regulation: The Trustees Theatre on Broughton Street is nine feet from grade and the Historic Savannah Theatre is 9'8" above grade. We are proposing a marquee 8'9" above grade. Granting this request for variance would allow this building to blend better with the scale of its neighbors.”

Staff recommends that the applicant submit further specifications about the design of the marquee before proceeding with a variance request.

111 West Congress Street was constructed in 1969 and is a non-contributing structure within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the Savannah Downtown Historic District. The proposed side addition is shorter than the existing building and below the four (4) story maximum as per the Savannah Downtown Historic District Height Map. The height of the existing structure will not change. The proposed changes will not affect the proportion of the front façade on the existing building. The proposed addition is proportional to the main building and others in the surrounding vicinity. The applicant is proposing the removal and reconfiguration of the existing storefront, which will align with the second level windows that will remain the same.

The standard is met for the existing building where the rhythm of solids to voids in the front façade is symmetrical on both stories and is visually compatible with contributing buildings and structures in the vicinity. The standard is not met for the façade of the proposed side addition. While the building form of the proposed addition may be visually compatible, there is a prohibited door type on the first level. The standard is met for the existing building and proposed addition. The existing building footprint will remain the same amid the proposed changes. The proposed addition is visually compatible with the open spaces existing

building and surrounding contributing buildings. The proposed addition is on the space that is currently used by a restaurant as an outdoor dining patio and will fit within the same footprint. The entrances will remain within the same plane as the current configuration of the existing building and with an adjustment in the first story doors on the addition would also meet this standard. The standard is not met with regard to the folding doors showing from the street, as they are not visually compatible. The proposed materials for this project are similar in color and texture to the nearby contributing buildings and structures but will be analyzed further in the next sections. Materials include:

Existing building:

- New metal cornice
- Glazed brick veneer (running bond)- Endicott Manganese Ironspot
- Glazed brick veneer (stack bond)- Endicott Manganese Ironspot
- Painted steel channel header
- New storefront aluminum framed casement windows
- Metal panels to go beneath new storefront windows
- Marquee signage, tie rods and hardware

Proposed addition:

- New TPO Roof with metal flashing (Sherwin Williams Inkwell SW 6992)
- New CMU wall on top of existing CMU parapet wall
- Metal parapet cap (Sherwin Williams Inkwell SW 6992)
- Aluminum top rail
- Glass panel at railing
- Brick pilaster- Glazed brick veneer (running bond)- Endicott Manganese Ironspot
- Folding glass doors
- Hardcoat Portland cement
- New aluminum framed casement windows
- Pilkington Pyrostop Fireglass Curtain Wall Series
- YKK Storefront Mullion (black)

The roof shape on the new addition is flat and is visually compatible with the existing building and others in the vicinity. The scale standard is met for the existing building. The proposed marquee is not visually compatible. There are no other such signs on this stretch of Congress Street to visually relate to. Staff recommends a redesign to be visually compatible to the surrounding buildings. The reconfiguration of the storefront will still be visually compatible in directional character. Staff recommends a redesign of the first story façade with of the new addition to become visually compatible.

The intent of the standard is met. The heights of the first and second stories of the new addition are shorter than the above-mentioned provisions, however, they are lower to be aligned with the existing building. The height of the proposed addition is two stories and is not less than the exterior visual expression of the height of the second story. The first story is separated by a change in material of metal panels. It is designed as a storefront but has incompatible doors that must be changed. The proposed new addition will align with the existing building.

The standard is met for the proposed new addition, as it forms a continuous parallel plane to the street. The standard is met for the existing structure and the proposed addition. Removal of the 1960s brick façade and replacement with a glazed brick on the front façade and proposed addition. Staff has a condition to ensure that any areas with exposed CMU blocks are painted. Though the existing building is not historic, the proposed new brick veneer, Endicott Manganese Ironspot is black. Since this is not a historic structure, the black is

compatible as a neutral color with the surrounding contributing resource. The front of the addition has proposed folding glass doors that are visible from Congress Street. Staff recommends a redesign of the front façade of the new addition without folding glass partition doors, as the standard is not met. The proposed windows are all rectangular casement windows, including the storefront windows on the existing building and proposed addition. No windows will be boarded. The standard is met for all windows on the primary façade. The standards do not apply as the proposed new windows are metal casement windows. The standard is met for the distance between windows. The second story of the proposed addition windows are listed as storefront windows. The window casings and sashes will be made of metal with clear, transparent glass.

The standards are met for the storefront windows on the existing building. The storefronts will include glazed brick veneer and will not have burglar bars. The configuration standards are met for the new addition. The roof design is flat, as is the existing building. The parapets will have a string course of glazed brick veneer and a metal parapet.

The material being used is thermoplastic polyolefin (TPO), but the roof is not visible from the public right of way.

The applicant needs to provide further details about the marquee including whether, and how, it will be illuminated. Staff recommends to continue the variance recommendation request in order to submit detailed drawings and specifications about the proposed marquee.

The standard is not met. The applicant proposes that their marquee sign will be 8'9" from the lowest point of the marquee sign to the established grade. The applicant has requested a variance recommendation request for this standard; however, staff recommends to continue the variance recommendation request in order to submit detailed drawings and specifications about the proposed marquee.

The applicant has not provided details about the marquee beyond its height. Staff recommends to continue the variance recommendation request in order to submit detailed drawings and specifications about the proposed marquee.

Mr. Higgins asked if there were concerns with door height. No; materials.

Ms. Taylor asked if folding glass door is acceptable on the side. **Ms. Chamberlain** stated if it is not visible from the road, yes.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Kevin Rose, petitioner, stated sliding doors were used to not confuse with the main entrance. The back elevation is covered and will be painted as best possible. If the marquee is raised ten feet, it meets the ordinance, but not the intent. Would like continuance to remain for the sign. Would like to use the other marquees as inspiration.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, stated they prefer a solid design. No caps on brick columns, please add. Thanked petitioner for efforts.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Rowan stated the doors look more like French doors. **Mr. Higgins** stated the project is premature and would like to see it continued in entirety to see the marquis plans. **Ms. Memory** stated she agrees. **Mr. Altschiller** stated he is concerned with doors and marquis. **Ms. Taylor** stated it's too contemporary and jarring. **Mr. Thomson** stated he would like to

continue item to have issues addressed.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approve the proposed alterations at 111 West Congress Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. **Redesign the front façade of the new addition without folding glass partition doors.**
2. **All exposed CMU blocks must be painted.**

AND

Recommend to continue the recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a variance from the standard that reads:

The height of a new or remodeled marquee sign shall not extend above the parapet wall of the building, and the lowest point of the marquee sign shall not be less than 10 feet above the established grade.

To allow for 8'-9" of clearance from the underside of the marquee to the sidewalk in order for the petitioner to:

1. **Submit detailed drawings and specifications about the proposed marquee.**

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic Board of Review does hereby continue the petition for proposed alterations at 111 West Congress Street to the November 9, 2022 HDBR Meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[15. Petition of GM Shay Architects | 22-004359-COA | 225 East President Street | Alterations and Addition](#)

📎 [Submittal Packet- 22-004359-COA- 225 E President Street.pdf](#)

📎 [Staff Photos- proposed dormer area.pdf](#)

📎 [Staff Recommendation - 22-004359-COA 225 E President St.pdf](#)

🔗 [Petitioner Presentation 225 E. President.pdf](#)

🔗 [Public Comment-Andrew Jones_225 E. President and the Loss of Unique Historic Features 10.10.22_.pdf](#)

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the applicant's request of approval for alterations and an addition for the property at 225 East President Street, including demolition of a 1980s addition and replacement with a new addition, in-kind roof replacement, and the addition of two dormers. In 2021, a New Construction, Parts I&II project was approved (20-002646-COA) for the vacant lot on the property to expand the capacity of the President's Quarters Inn. On July 8, 2020, the Board approved Part I: Height and Mass. Upon the approval of Part II, the applicant intended to submit alterations of the existing historic structure. 225 East President Street was constructed in 1855 and is a contributing building contributing building within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District or the Savannah Downtown Historic District.

The proposed new construction is more visually compatible than the 1980s post-modern addition that is currently on the west façade of the building. Since the addition is replacing another addition, it will not interfere with historic materials, features, or form and will be differentiated from the historic building. Due to the fact that the addition will be replacing another addition in the same space, material loss will be minimal. The new addition will avoid damaging or destroying significant materials and craftsmanship as this is already an altered portion of the building. The design of the new addition is respectful to the historic structure, and it is more visually compatible than the 1980s post-modern addition that is being replaced.

The proposed rehabilitation work is minimal and will not include removal of historic materials. The standard is not met regarding the proposed addition of two dormer windows on the roof of the east elevation as this is a conjectural feature creating a false sense of history. Staff inspected the proposed location from street level and determined that the dormers would be visible from Lincoln Street. The new addition is going in the space of the current 1980s addition and will not compromise the distinctive features of the historic structure.

The standards are met regarding the proposed cleaning of architectural features such as the sandstone window trim, sandstone stairs, existing stucco, and stone windowsills with water; and the restoration and painting of ornamental metalwork and ornamental metal downspout dolphins. Staff has a condition that the applicant ensures using the gentlest means possible while cleaning with water and that the ornamental metalwork is repainted in-kind, and that the applicant submits a paint sample before any work is done.

The standard is not met with regard to the in-kind roof replacement on the historic building. Staff requests photographic evidence of deterioration requiring replacement. The new addition will not destroy character defining historic materials because the addition is going on the same elevation of the 1980s addition. The removal of that addition is not anticipated to cause damage. The new addition will not affect the integrity of the historic structure to the degree of being irreversible.

The height of the new addition will not be taller than the existing historic building. The proportion of the front façade on the new addition is visually compatible to the rest of the building, as are the proportions of openings to the historic structure and other nearby contributing buildings. The relationship of materials, texture and color are visually compatible to the historic structure it is connected to and other surrounding historic structures. Proposed materials include:

- Taylor Brick- modular, wire cut brick in white and pink (physical samples provided)
- Argos- Mortar joints in color *Sahara* (physical samples provided)

- Finish wood panel, light mahogany (physical samples provided)
- Finish wood siding and trim- color Sherwin Williams SW 7040 Smokehouse (physical samples provided)
- EFCO- storefront Series 403, size 2"x4.5" thermal storefront framing; color-Mesa Brown (physical color sample provided)
- EFCO- storefront single door, Series D502 Wide Stile Doors, 2" ThermaStile Aluminum Swing Entrance Doors; color- Mesa Brown (physical color sample provided)
- AGC Energy Select R42 clear glazing
- Pella Reserve- Traditional combination casement/awning window; color-brown
- Oakridge asphalt shingles; color- *Brownwood*
- Pac-Clad Pac-Continuous Cleat Coping, Color- *Aged Bronze*
- Chapman & Meyers *Fresno* exterior wall lighting; finish- Al

The low-sloped roof of the building is a compatible design to help differentiate the addition from the historic structure, and will contain the rooftop mechanical equipment screened behind a masonry parapet. The mass of the addition is respectful to the visual compatibility of the existing historic building. The standard is met as per the height map, with the proposed new addition at four (4) stories. The height of the new addition conforms to the height of the existing building. The first story is designed as a storefront.

The standards are not met. There is no architectural feature or change in material after the first story, not meeting the standard. The first story is less than the exterior visual expression of the height of any single story above the first story. The exterior visual expression of the fourth story is not distinctive from the stories below it.

The setback standards are met. The foundation does not project forward of the building plane. Portions of the stucco walls on the historic building are slated to be cleaned gently with water. The applicant stated that there will be areas patched and painted to match the existing. Staff has a condition that the applicant submit a paint sample for approval prior to starting work. The new addition walls will be finished with a combination of white and reddish-pink brick. No prohibited materials are proposed. The color of the brick is visually compatible to the historic structure without creating a sense of false history. The new addition entrance faces the front of Oglethorpe Square. The single storefront door is made of glass with aluminum framing. The proposed windows are rectangular, metal casement windows. The centerline of the windows align vertically on the primary façade of the new addition. The new addition is distinctly different from the historic building, which also includes the visual compatibility of the widow distance. No bay windows are proposed. The windows are made of metal with clear, transparent glass. No vinyl is proposed. The roof parapet has a string course and coping. The roof will consist of asphalt shingles and metal coping. The new addition is on the rear façade of the resource and in an inconspicuous location. The design is subordinate in mass and height to the historic structure. The addition will not obscure or damage any character defining features. It will be distinguishable from the contributing building and is reversible with minimal damage to the contributing building.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Pat Shay and **Ms. Meredith Stone** stated they understand the reasoning behind dormers, although they prefer them. Care will used to be within National Park standards. **Mr. Shay** further supported his petition.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones stated concern with loss of historic features.

Ms. Ellen Harris, DNA, expressed concerned with the addition's visual compatibility, it is contrasting and overwhelms the facade. There will be loss of historic fabric and porch configuration.

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, stated he agrees with Mr. Jones and Ms. Harris that this is an opportunity to restore the historic porch continuation. He requested to lessen the intent of moving historic materials.

Mr. Shay stated the windows are not historic. Standards state it is permissible to enclose them, and they are not removing historic fabric.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Memory stated she has visual compatibility concerns. **Mr. Altschiller** stated the nature of the building is being more obscured. **Ms. Taylor** stated the design is visually incompatible. Would like porch retained in some fashion. Concerned about building materials removed. **Ms. Guinn** agrees the visual compatibility is lacking. Would like to see a study of historical materials remaining. Put in window openings. **Ms. Rowan** stated she agrees with staff recommendation. Preserve historic materials. **Mr. Higgins** expressed visual incompatibility concerns. **Mr. Altschiller** stated it is visually incompatible.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Approve alterations and an addition for the property at 225 East President Street at with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the work is otherwise compatible and meets the standards:

1. **Omit the addition of two dormers on the historic roofline.**
2. **Provide color samples of the paint for repairs to stucco and ornamental metalwork.**
3. **Ensure that the gentlest means possible will be utilized when cleaning historic features on the building.**
4. **Provide photographic evidence of roof deterioration on the historic building.**

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic Board of Review does hereby continue the petition for alterations and an addition for the property at 225 East President Street to the November 9, 2022 HDBR Meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

[16. Report on Work Performed Without a Certificate of Appropriateness for the October 12, 2022 HDBR Meeting](#)

☞ [Report on Work Performed Without a COA - October 2022.pdf](#)

[17. Report on Work Inconsistent with an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the October 12, 2022 HDBR Meeting](#)

☞ [Report on Work that is Inconsistent with an Issued COA - October 2022.pdf](#)

[18. Report on Work that Exceeds the Scope of an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the October 12, 2022 HDBR Meeting](#)

☞ [Report on Work that Exceeds the Scope of an Issued COA - October 2022.pdf](#)

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

[19. Items Deferred to Staff - October Report](#)

☞ [Items Deferred to Staff - October Report.pdf](#)

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

[20. Inspections Completed by Staff - October 2022 Report](#)

☞ [October 2022 - Inspections - REPORT.pdf](#)

[21. Stamped Drawings - October Report](#)

☞ [Stamped Drawings - October.pdf](#)

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

XV. ADJOURNMENT

[22. Next HDBR Pre-Meeting - Wednesday November 9, 2022 at 12pm - 112 East State Street, Mendonsa Hearing Room](#)

[23. Next HDBR Regular Meeting - Wednesday November 9, 2022 at 1pm - 112 East State Street, Mendonsa Hearing Room](#)

[24. Adjourn](#)

There being no further business to present before the Board, October 12, 2022 Historic District Board of Review adjourned at 2: 43 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Leah G. Michalak
Director of Historic Preservation

/bm

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.