



Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street
December 14, 2022 1:00 PM
MINUTES

December 14, 2022 Historic District Board of Review

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM at 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted, and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received and no votes were taken.

Members Present: Ellie Isaacs, Chair
David Altschiller
Karen Guinn
Michael Higgins
Melissa Memory
Melissa Rowan
Thomas Thomson

Members Absent: Nan Taylor

MPC Staff Present: Melanie Wilson, Executive Director
Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director (virtually)
Caitlin Chamberlain, Senior Planner
Ethan Hagerman, Assistant Planner
James Zerillo, Assistant Planner
Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant
Julie Yawn, System Analyst

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

[1. Petition of Hallett & Co | 22-005002-COA | 110 West Harris Street | Alterations](#)

[☞ Staff Report - 22-005002-COA 110 West Harris Street](#)

[☞ Submittal Packet](#)

[☞ Staff Research](#)

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for alterations to the rear facade of the house located at 110 West Harris Street as requested, because the proposed work is

visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[2. Petition of Ethos Preservation | 22-005383-COA | 128 East Taylor & 411 Abercorn Street | Alterations](#)

🔗 [Staff Report - 22-005383-COA 128 East Taylor Street](#)

🔗 [Submittal Packet Part 1](#)

🔗 [Submittal Packet Part 2](#)

🔗 [Floor Plan](#)

🔗 [Staff Research](#)

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve, the request to amend 22-003309-COA for alterations to the building located at 128 East Taylor Street and light installation to the exterior of 411 Abercorn Street, as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

3. Adopt the December 14, 2022 Agenda

Motion

Adopt the December 14, 2022 HDBR Meeting agenda, with change of moving Item 9 (336 Barnard Street) to Item 10 (formerly 11 Jefferson Street).

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson

Second: Michael Higgins

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

4. Approval of November 9, 2022 HDBR Meeting Minutes

📎 [11.09.22 MEETING MINUTES.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review motioned to approve the November 9, 2022 HDBR minutes, with request for additional information to clarify discussion and timeline of course of action regarding 222 East Gwinnett and its two petitions on the November 9, 2022 HDBR agenda.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson

Second: David Altschiller

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

[5. Petition of Ward Architecture + Preservation | 22-005386-COA | 205 East Hall Street | New Construction: Small \(Parts I & II\)](#)

Motion

Defer.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Melissa Memory

Second: Karen Guinn

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

[6. Petition of Harley Krinsky | 22-005388-COA | 301 Alice Street | Change Status of Building from Contributing to Non-Contributing](#)

- 🔗 [Petitioner Request to Continue to January 11, 2023 HDBR meeting.pdf](#)
- 🔗 [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)
- 🔗 [Staff Report - 22-005388-COA 301 Alice St.pdf](#)
- 🔗 [Analysis of Buildings Eligible for Designation - 2010.pdf](#)
- 🔗 [City of Savannah Code of Ordinances - Section 3.17.6.pdf](#)
- 🔗 [Public Notice from 2010.pdf](#)
- 🔗 [Staff Site Photos.pdf](#)
- 🔗 [Z-101012-36582-2.pdf](#)
- 🔗 [Public Comment - Neighbor support.pdf](#)
- 🔗 [Public Comment - Raymond M. Masciarella II.pdf](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review motioned to approve the request to continue the petition to the January 11, 2023 Historic District Board of Review Meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: David Altschiller

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

[7. Petition of Gerald Chambers and Michael Gronebaum | 22-004727-COA | 222 East Gwinnett Street | New Construction, Small \(Parts I and II\)](#)

- 📎 [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Staff Research.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Petitioner's Presentation.pdf](#)
- 📎 [Staff Report - 22-004727-COA 222 E Gwinnett Street.pdf](#)

Mr. James Zerillo presented the petitioner's request of approval for New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) at 222 East Gwinnett Street. The new construction is an addition to an existing historic lane building, connected by a hyphen. The building will be a garage on the ground floor and a “bonus room” on the second floor and will be constructed over the existing paved parking pad. It is proposed to be connected internally to the existing historic lane building.

Staff recommended to approve the request for New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) at 222 East Gwinnett Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Michael Groenbaum, petitioner, stated he had no comments. **Mr. Higgins** asked the purpose of the bonus room. **Mr. Groenbaum** responded for storage. Mr. Higgins asked why it is an addition rather than a separate structure. **Mr. Groenbaum** stated that per code, it is not allowed to have two lane building. The after-the-fact brick wall will be taken down as part of the new construction. **Mr. Gerald Chambers**, petitioner, stated the after-the-fact wall was for built for safety in the lane area; it will be either/or. If the addition of the garage is approved, the wall would not be needed and will not move forward with it, as the garage will secure the rear. The application for the after-the-fact wall/fence was submitted to be in compliance with Code Enforcement by November 30, 2022. **Mr. Higgins** asked why are there no drawings for the entire project. **Mr. Chambers** stated it was not financially beneficial and did not want to move forward with renovations to the carriage house, particularly if it would delay the overall project.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. James Hundsruker, 208 E Gwinnett stated this was a lengthy process. He stated conflicting information was presented by Ms. Wilson. He believes she favors developers rather than historic preservation.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Guinn expressed concern regarding the number of times and changes before Board for this project. Has waning faith in adherence to Board decisions. Suggests that if approved, approve with condition that work performed without permit be removed. **Mr. Higgins** stated he is not comfortable with project because of the multiple changes and not provided drawings of projects. He would like to see whole plans for the whole project, and thinks the petition is being heard prematurely. **Ms. Isaacs** allowed **Mr. Groenbaum** to express his disagreement with **Mr. Higgins** statements. He maintains that all pertinent renderings have been provided. **Mr. Thomson** agrees with **Guinn** regarding wall removal in the motion. The Board was not the issue regarding the number of times this project has been heard.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for New Construction, Small (Parts I and II) at 222 East Gwinnett Street with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final review because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Remove the 8ft brick wall constructed without a permit that is currently on the site.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Nay
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[8. Petition of Blutern Properties LLC, Timothy Gaudreau | 22-004867-COA | 214 West Jones Street | Alterations](#)

[☞ Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

[☞ Staff Research.pdf](#)

[☞ Staff Report - 22-004867-COA 214 West Jones Street.pdf](#)

Mr. James Zerillo presented the petitioner's request of approval for rehabilitations and alterations at 214 West Jones Street. Specifically, the applicant is requesting to replace a retractable awning with a shingled, rear porch roof. The new porch roof will be constructed of wood.

Staff recommended approval for alterations and additions to the rear porch at 214 West Jones Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Revise the pitch of the porch roof to be between 2:12 and 6:12.
2. Provide a dimension for the extension of the porch roof eaves; they must be a

minimum of 12 inches.

3. Indicate the location of the soffits; soffits shall be placed perpendicular to the building wall, not sloping in plane with the roof.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Timothy Daudreau, petitioner, had no comments.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD COMMENTS:

There were no Board comments.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve alterations and additions to the rear porch at 214 West Jones Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Revise the pitch of the porch roof to be between 2:12 and 6:12.
2. Provide a dimension for the extension of the porch roof eaves; they must be a minimum of 12 inches.
3. Indicate the location of the soffits; soffits shall be placed perpendicular to the building wall, not sloping in plane with the roof.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[9. Petition of Pantheon ADC | 22-002854-COA | 11 Jefferson Street | New Construction: Part II, Design Details](#)

📎 [Staff Report - 22-002854-COA 11 Jefferson St.pdf](#)

📎 [Part II - Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

📎 [HDBR Sample Panel Policy.pdf](#)

📎 [Staff Research.pdf](#)

📎 [Part I - Submittal Packet.pdf](#)

📎 [Petitioner's Presentation.pdf](#)

Ms. Caitlin Chamberlain presented the petitioner's request of approval for New Construction: Part II, Design Details for a 4-story parking structure for the vacant parcel

(surface parking lot) at 11 Jefferson Street. The building will contain a car elevator system that extends 18 feet underground (2 levels of cars); the portion of the building above ground is expressed in 4-stories but allows for 6 levels of cars. The building's footprint covers the entire tithing block; however, it is split into two buildings, per building code. The western portion has a footprint of 8,280sf and the eastern portion has a footprint of 13,500sf. The building(s) qualifies as Large-Scale Development; however, a bonus story is not sought.

Staff recommended approval for New Construction: Part II, Design Details for a 4-story parking structure for the vacant parcel (surface parking lot) at 11 Jefferson Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Reinstate the rear façade recessed panels (or an alternative design element).
2. Redesign storefront bases to have a contrasting design or material.
3. Provide specifications of all light fixtures.

Prior to the commencement of construction, provide a sample panel per the HDBR Sample Panel Policy.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. James Gallucci, petitioner, stated the condition regarding the rear facade, agrees with Staff that the elevation was stripped of a lot of its architectural detail. He will propose a revision and will work with Staff for final review. Regarding the storefront bases, agrees with Staff the lentil and bases were of different design and materials. He stated he is going back to panelized wood-based structure and will work with staff for final review. Regarding the cow wall - hope for approval of materials. The dark colors will look similar to a metal panel, an approved material, and hold up better. They have worked with product representatives to ensure quality.

Ms. Memory stated appreciation for the geo-technical studies and inquired about establishing thresholds. **Mr. Gallucci** stated they will work with labs, and any predetermined cracks will be monitored so as to not expand. Thresholds will be determined by a third party; general contractor will be automatically immediately notified if vibration fluctuations are too high, which will require them to immediately stop and evaluate.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Ms. Ardis Wood, citizen, stated the borders of squares are a focus. It is key to keep tree lawns, curb and sidewalks. There are no trees on east/west on Montgomery and Bryan. She asked the width of sidewalk. **Mr. Gallucci** stated it is about six to eight feet on Broughton Street. **Ms. Wood** asked for trees on Bryan, address lighting, and one type of light fixture to unify the downtown area.

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, supported the adaptability of the project. This is an opportunity to regain tithing lots, as it was previously ten.

Mr. Gallucci stated they would work with Staff regarding lighting on the building. He agrees with Ms. Wood regarding the trees; would like to put trees on around the building if pedestrian traffic allows.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Guinn commended petitioner's willingness to work with staff regarding recommendations. **Ms. Memory** requested to have the buildings recorded. **Ms. Rowan** expressed concerned with impact on surrounding structures.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for New Construction: Part II, Design Details for a 4-story parking structure for the vacant parcel (surface parking lot) at 11 Jefferson Street with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for final review and approval because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. File vibration monitoring report with staff prior to commencement of construction.
2. Reinstate the rear façade recessed panels (or an alternative design element).
3. Redesign storefront bases to have a contrasting design or material.
4. Provide specifications of all light fixtures.
5. Prior to the commencement of construction, provide a sample panel per the HDBR Sample Panel Policy.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Aye
David Altschiller	- Aye
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[10. Petition of Sottile & Sottile | 22-005355-COA | 336 Barnard Street | Special Exception Request](#)

- ☞ [Staff Report - 22-005355-COA 336 Barnard.pdf](#)
- ☞ [Submittal Packet.pdf](#)
- ☞ [Tithing Block Maps and Supplement.pdf](#)
- ☞ [336 Barnard St_22-003805-ZCL - Zoning Administrator Determination.pdf](#)
- ☞ [October 27, 2022 Meeting Minutes - ZBA.pdf](#)
- ☞ [20-005548-COA Submittal Packet 1.pdf](#)
- ☞ [20-005548-COA Submittal Packet 2.pdf](#)
- ☞ [Public Comment - Beehive Foundation.pdf](#)
- ☞ [Public Comment - Millenium Gate Museum.pdf](#)
- ☞ [Public Comment - National Monuments Foundation.pdf](#)
- ☞ [Public Comment - Rodney Mims Cook, Jr..pdf](#)
- ☞ [Public Comment - Anna Habersham Wright.pdf](#)
- ☞ [Public Comment - Bob Rosenwald.pdf](#)
- ☞ [Public Comment - Robert Becker.pdf](#)
- ☞ [Public Comment - Ardis Wood.pdf](#)

- ④ [Public Comment - Kyle Dwyer.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Change.org Petition.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Katie Glusica.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Georgia Trust for Historic Preservation.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - John Brown.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Andrew Savage.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Mary Reiter .pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - John McMasters.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Joa Kelly.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Andrew Jones.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Joshua Watson.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Andree Patterson.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Paul and Caren Cobet.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Ryan Madson.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - David Peterson and Linda Rawlings.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Susan Arden-Joly.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Oglethorpe Plan Coalition.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - James Hundsrucker.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Kathryn Tanner.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Kathy H. Rushing.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Susan Atkinson.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Michael Ploski.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Ted Eldridge.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Frank Arden.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Eric Parker.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Arthur Scinta.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Constance McCay.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Tim Coy.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Audrey Platt.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Kathy Ledvina.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Melanie Mirande.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Wes Jameson.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Nancy and Ivo Maia.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Vance Peacock.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Richard Coyle.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Tom Kohler.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - Debra Brewton Kessler.pdf](#)
- ④ [Public Comment - John Berendt.pdf](#)

🔗 [Public Comment - Sabrina Nagel.pdf](#)

🔗 [Presentation - Harold Yellen.pdf](#)

🔗 [Public Comment - Brent Watts.pdf](#)

🔗 [Public Comment - Erin Robey.pdf](#)

🔗 [Public Comment - Neil Dawson.pdf](#)

Ms. Melanie Wilson presented the petitioner's request for a Special Exception. Ms. Wilson highlighted the criteria of a Special Exception and informed that is the only discussion that will be had regarding the petitioned property.

The applicant is requesting approval for a Special Exception for the property located at 336 Barnard Street. The Special Exception is from the design standard that reads:

Sec.7.8.10.g.ii.1.b. Tithing Blocks: A building on a tithing block shall locate its primary entrance to front the east-west street.

To allow for the new building on the site to construct its entrance facing the north-south (Barnard) street.

Per the applicant, the Special Exception is for the following reasons:

- The legal parcel address is 336 Barnard Street.*
- The parcel has its primary frontage on Barnard Street, and its secondary frontage on West Charlton Lane, thus Barnard Street is the appropriate location for its primary address.*
- There are multiple historic contributing buildings in the immediate context with primary entrances on Barnard Street.*
- When a legal lot of record does not have frontage on an east-west street, a special exception is the appropriate mechanism to provide legal access from the primary street on which the lot has frontage.*

Staff recommended approval for the Special Exception for the property located at 336 Barnard Street. The Special Exception is from the design standard that reads:

Sec.7.8.10.g.ii.1.b. Tithing Blocks: A building on a tithing block shall locate its primary entrance to front the east-west street.

To allow for the new building on the site to construct its entrance facing the north-south (Barnard) street because the Special Exception criteria are met.

Ms. Memory asked if the integrity of the National Landmark is threatened; is it considered a detriment to the status. **Ms. Wilson** stated any special exception can compromise; should not be a detriment to the status. **Ms. Memory** concerned about precedent and if appropriate for entire district. **Ms. Wilson** stated Special Exceptions are to be reviewed on a case-by-case basis.

Mr. Higgins asked when the design standard regarding tithing blocks for this petition; before this petition or after. **Ms. Wilson** responded before. Subdivisions are through the Ordinance of the City, as written. If standards are met, then approved.

Mr. Higgins asked about primary entrances of modified structures and true historic structures. **Ms. Wilson** stated the challenge is that this project is on a separate, legal lot.

Ms. Isaacs asked when 344 Barnard Street was built. **Ms. Wilson** stated it was built in 1890.

Ms. Jennifer Herman, Deputy City Attorney, explained the history of the project's petitions. She stated the discussion should be confined to the Special Exception.

PETITIONER'S COMMENTS:

Mr. Harold Yellin, petitioner, stated the project was approved for Part 1 in December 2020. It showed the primary entrance on Barnard Street, with height and mass. The project returned September 14, 2022 for design approval, Part 2, with address for Barnard Street, which was approved. He stated the Zoning Administrator determined a Special Exception was not needed, as it is on Barnard St. The ZBA questioned the petitioner why did they not ask for variance. Staff directed the petitioner had to return to HDBR for as Special Exception. He stated he requested Special Exception because of ZBA direction, to look at the position of the entranceway. Mr. Yellin stated the Preservation Officer stated there are 130 buildings on a tithing lots facing north/south streets, 113 are contributing buildings built during the period of significance; the entrance on Barnard Street is consistent with other contributing structures visually related; any other location than this north/south street would not be visually compatible. He stated they are doing all they can to be consistent with the Oglethorpe Plan.

Dr. David Gobel, SCAD professor, stated the Oglethorpe Plan was laid out in the 1733. Trustees was intended to for 240 homes, has expanded. First subdivision of a tithing lot was in 1733. The various versions of the plan all show six tithing lots, with garden and farm lots. Growth started in 1791. Mr. Gobel stated the intent was to be a small town, but grew because of mercantile industry, based on slave labor. The town leaders later decided to increase the wards to gain money by selling lots. The lots started to change, with the buildings starting to face the ward. He states the project is consistent with what is considered the Savannah Plan.

Mr. Craig Clemons, of Sottile and Sottile, stated there are only three options for entrance. The Barnard Street entrance is the most appropriate and visually compatible. He highlighted 344 Barnard Street as support to give life/activity on Barnard Street. Many instances of contributing building precedence with these types of entrances. He reiterated the project has been approved for height and mass, as well as visual compatibility. Barnard Street is the only visually compatible street for the front entrance.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Ms. Melanie Mirandi, area resident, is opposed. The reasons for the Special Exception have not been provided to support the request. Some examples provided by petitioner are not of contributing structures; the majority are secondary entrances. She provided examples based in the Oglethorpe Plan.

Ms. Ellen Harris, DNA, expressed concerns about the process. She suggested to revise subdivision process and public noticing. Thanked Staff for providing application packets prior to Staff recommendations. She requested implementation of the changes from the Stakeholder Meeting from October 2022.

Ms. Sabrina Nagel, area resident, opposes the project because it is detrimental to the historic City of Savannah. She asked that it complies with the Oglethorpe Plan regardless of its building materials. It should be on the lane, as it is not visually compatible. She stated there should not be precedence made on past mistakes. To approve is to contribute to the threat of landmark status. **Ms. Jarrett** of the MPC indicated the main entrance should be on the rear path.

Mr. Rob Becker, citizen, opposes the project as it is not in the public interest. Anything that jeopardizes the Landmark status of should not be approved; Savannah has been downgraded to threatened. He quoted parts of a letter from the National Park Service, which

cited the risk of 336 Barnard Street, including the door being located on Barnard Street, imperiling the character defining features of the Oglethorpe Plan.

Ms. Anna Wright, citizen, in opposition of the project, stated the dead zones and contempt for beauty Barnard Street and its rhythm and of the city based on structures not in the immediate area is appalling. She stated the ZBA articulated the premeditated design with the intent to violate the Ordinance.

Mr. James Hundsrucker, area resident, opposes the petition as it is not in public interest. He stated 427 nationally have signed petition of opposition, including the National Park Service, Georgia Trust for Historic Preservation, and the Beehive Foundation.

Ms. Audrey Platt, 50-year resident, former member of HSF, opposes the project. Beehive Foundation also opposes the project, as it allows what is expressly not allowed.

Ms. Dianna Grimes, area resident, stated the Georgia Trust expressed concerned the historic designation may be lost. Should not continue.

Mr. Andrew Jones, citizen, opposes the petition. He stated Part 1 expired December 9, 2022. The Board now has the authority to do the right thing. Part 2 is wrong by language. The ZBA minutes do not recommend obtaining Special Exception, those were side conversations. Highlighted Ms. Jarrett's comments that the structure could have been built in another way.

Ms. Herman stated Part 1 is not invalid. The ZBA motioned and approved to send the project back to the HDBR. It has been a consistent, moving forward project.

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, is concerned about status of Landmark district. Savannah's town plan did not dictate the orientation of a building within titling and trust lots. He provided various examples to support the primary entrance on Barnard as providing no detriment. Stand with Board decisions and Staff's recommendation.

Ms. Katie Glusica, SCAD professor, stated community need should be considered. The materials are not an issue but taking away four rental units for one resident is the issue. This project is classist. Affordable housing is not allowable with this project and minimal in historic district. Something that does not require Special Exception but meets needs of the community should be approved.

Mr. Kyle Dwyer, area resident in opposition to the project, stated Savannah is known globally because of adhering to the plan. He highlighted Ms. Reiter's letter. Exceptions will chip away at the historic district.

Ms. Kathy Ledvina, area resident, supports the ZBA decision, that was determined on rational basis based on enacted ordinances. Special Exceptions often become precedent. The Board now has an opportunity to correct a mistake by not approving the Special Exception.

Mr. Austin Hill, chair of Trustees for Savannah Historic Foundation, stated the letter from Mark McDonald, CEO of the Georgia Trust for Historic Preservation, was written by Mr. McDonald. He stated that Board is not aware of the position Mr. McDonald presented as that of the Board. He supports the comments of Ms. Harris regarding subdividing.

Ms. Isaacs reminded that subdividing is being revised now.

Mr. Andrew Jones requested the HDBR perform their own due diligence and not take Mr. Hill's word at face value.

Ms. Sue Adler, CEO of HSF, supported the project. Requested of Mr. McDonald to not get involved; should be handled locally, as it is a local issue. She feels his letter is inappropriate

Ms. Susan Arden-Joly, stated the prior approvals were mistakes. There was a confusing array of misconceptions. If approved, there will be a negative history with a negative impact in one of the most preserved wards in the city. Requests denial of the petition.

Mr. Vance Peacock, opposes the project, this should have been quelled a long time ago. It should look like a carriage house, not a McMansion.

Mr. John Brown, citizen, opposes he stated it violates the first criteria of restoration of the Oglethorpe Plan. Areas without lanes have problems of parking as there were no cars back then. Allowing exceptions from years ago should not be applied today. This will destroy the city and it will lose designation.

Mr. Ryan Madson, citizen, stated the willful misreading of threatened status from National Park Service. Understanding the spirit of the critique is essential: it is not from small structures like 336 Barnard, but large construction in the historic district. The larger issue is the codifying of the Savannah Plan. Zoning Ordinance is a living document, that needs to be changed with the times. Architecture built today may become contributing structures in the future.

Mr. Tim Coy, opposes the petition. Conceded his time to Andrew Jones: The Oglethorpe Plan Coalition opposes the request. The facts the petitioner presented are incorrect based on the MPC maps of contributing buildings. The compatibility standards are irrelevant for consideration in this matter. The Ordinance makes a difference regarding the vicinity. The MPS letter was ignored. Other suggestions were provided.

Ms. Ardis Wood encouraged looking at the context of the area. What is being proposed does not follow the context of the plan.

Mr. Yellin stated the Oglethorpe Plan has evolved. The National Park Service declined to come to Savannah. Cited letters of support from Patrick Shay, Tim Wilson, Rebecca Lynch, and Neal Dawson.

Mr. Craig Clemons stated the front door should be on the street.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Guinn stated she appreciated the passion of the residents, both sides. Prior decisions cloud the issues. It is a lot that has been legally subdivided, should have a primary entrance on a street. All need to remain focused on the issues.

Ms. Memory expressed concern with reluctance of MPC to assist in retaining the landmark status, it is important to Savannah. HSF designation of local districts. Consider implications of decisions. Concerns with project, and continued deterioration.

Mr. Higgins stated the Ordinance was in place regarding tithing blocks, in place before project. All knew this existed. Other avenues could have been explored, but it was not. 344 Barnard is only historic primary entrance. The other examples are modifications. Special Exceptions sets a precedence. A line has to be drawn and say no.

Mr. Altschiller thinks primary entrance should be on Barnard because of orientation but concerned with precedent. Looks better, but don't want to later regret. This will affect aesthetics. The exception will become the rule; may be destructive to the nature of who we are.

Mr. Thomson stated is appropriate that the locals weigh in. The true issue is the tithing lot was subdivided which provided opportunity for a door on Barnard. Subdivision process is being revised. The entryway is appropriate and visually compatible.

Ms. Rowan stated she supports staff recommendation.

Ms. Guinn stated Special Exceptions protect exceptions from becoming the norm. Stepping out of purview of the process creates the danger.

Mr. Higgins stated the Ordinance was put in place for a reason. Does not support the Special Exception.

Ms. Isaacs stated if the city does not follow the plan; it cannot destroy and rebuild city. There is precedent for this request. The issue was the process prior to coming to HDBR, which was handled legally. Subdivision was not provided under HDBR. Exceptions are granted often; the building across the lane provides precedent for approval of this project.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic Board of Review does hereby approve the request for a Special Exception for the property located at 336 Barnard Street. The Special Exception is from the design standard that reads: Sec.7.8.10.g.ii.1.b. Tithing Blocks: A building on a tithing block shall locate its primary entrance to front the east-west street.

To allow for the new building on the site to construct its entrance facing the north-south (Barnard) street because the Special Exception criteria are met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Nay
David Altschiller	- Nay
Nan Taylor	- Not Present
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Nay
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

[11. Acknowledgement and approval of Staff-approved decisions as presented.](#)

[12. Petition of THE PEACH COBBLER FACTORY, Bruce Baker | 22-005453-COA | 51 BARNARD STREET | Non-illuminated wall sign](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 22-005453-COA 51 Barnard St.pdf](#)

[13. Petition of GREENLINE ARCHITECTURE, Keith Howington | 22-005448-COA | 129, 131 EAST BROUGHTON STREET | AMEND 22-002282-COA: rooftop addition \(below previously approved height\)](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 22-005448-COA 129, 131 E Broughton St.pdf](#)

[14. Petition of DOUG BEAN SIGNS, Angela Bean | 22-00546245-COA | 514 BERRIEN STREET | Aluminum non-illuminated projecting sign](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 22-005462-COA 514 Berrien St.pdf](#)

[15. Petition of DOUG BEAN SIGNS, Angela Bean | 22-005345-COA | 108 WEST BROUGHTON STREET | Projecting sign replacement with new logo](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 22-005345-COA 108 W Broughton St..pdf](#)

[16. Petition of KARL TUCKER | 22-005463-COA | 515 EAST HUNTINGDON STREET | Color change](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision- 22-005463-COA 515 E Huntingdon St.pdf](#)

[17. Petition of ANTHONY DEBRECENY | 22-005130-COA | 411 EAST GASTON LANE | Color change](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 22-005130-COA 411 E Gaston Lane.pdf](#)

[18. Petition of DOUG BEAN SIGNS, Angela Bean | 22-005358-COA | 1201 HABERSHAM STREET | External illuminated sign](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 22-005358-COA 1201 Habersham St.pdf](#)

[19. Petition of STEVEN BODEK, INC., Ashley Field | 22-005065-COA | 114 EAST JONES STREET | Color change](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 22-005065-COA 114 E Jones St.pdf](#)

[20. Petition of EDWIN WALRAD | 22-005008-COA | 430 HABERSHAM STREET | Color change](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 22-005008-COA 430 Habersham St.pdf](#)

[21. Petition of SOUTH SHORE ROOFING, Kyle Patrick | 22-004995-COA | 536 EAST STATE STREET | Roof replacement](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 22-004995-COA 536 E State St.pdf](#)

[22. Petition of COMPLETE PROPERTY SERVICES, Janessa Antione | 22-004998-COA | 102 WEST BAY STREET | Repair, replace, and waterproof concrete slabs, mortar joints, roof terrace, windows, and curtain walls.](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision- 22-004998-COA 102 West Bay St_.pdf](#)

[23. Petition of JAMES BEASLEY | 22-004739-COA | 405 WHITAKER STREET | Non-illuminated sign](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 405 Whitaker Street - 22-004739-COA.pdf](#)

[24. Petition of KENT PLEMMONS | 22-005001-COA | 509 TATTNALL STREET | AMEND 22-000173-COA: Awning installation and front door color change](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision - 22-005001-COA 509 Tattnall St.pdf](#)

[25. Petition of METALCRAFTS, Katie Lee | 22-004990-COA | 4 EAST JONES STREET | In-kind replacement of roof and gutter](#)

[☞ SIGNED Staff Decision- 22-004990-COA 4 East Jones Street.pdf](#)

[26. Petition of COASTAL CANVAS, Jennifer Wells | 22-005055-COA | 28 DRAYTON STREET | Recover two](#)

awnings

[☺ SIGNED Staff Decision - 22-005055-COA 28 Drayton St.pdf](#)

27. Petition of THE UPS STORE #1355 | 22-004991-COA | 108 EAST YORK STREET | AMEND 21-006160-COA: New awning and non-illuminated blade sign

[☺ SIGNED Staff Decision - 22-04991-COA 108 E York St.pdf](#)

28. Petition of J. ELDER STUDIO, Jerome Elder | 22-00545198-COA | 306 EAST LIBERTY STREET | Shutter installation land curb/paver improvements

[☺ SIGNED Staff Decision - 22-005451-COA 306 E Liberty St.pdf](#)

29. Petition of REID HENNIGER | 22-005474-COA | 609 TATTNALL STREET | AFTER-THE-FACT Rear staircase repair

[☺ SIGNED Staff Decision - 22-005474-COA 609 Tattnall St.pdf](#)

30. Petition of REID HENNIGER | 22-005479-COA | 611 TATTNALL STREET | AFTER-THE-FACT Rear staircase repair

[☺ SIGNED Staff Decision - 22-005479-COA 611 Tattnall.pdf](#)

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

31. Report on Work Done Without a Certificate of Appropriateness for the December 14, HDBR Meeting

[☺ Report on Work Performed Without a COA HDBR December 2022.pdf](#)

32. Report on Work Inconsistent with an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the December 14, HDBR Meeting

[☺ Report on Work that is Inconsistent with an Issued COA - December 2022.pdf](#)

33. Report on Work Done Which Exceeds the Scope of an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the December 14, 2022 HDBR Meeting

[☺ Report on Work that Exceeds the Scope of an Issued COA - December 2022.pdf](#)

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

34. Items Deferred to Staff - December Report

[☺ Items Deferred to Staff - December Report.pdf](#)

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

35. Stamped Drawings - December Report

[☺ Stamped Drawings - December.pdf](#)

36. Inspections Completed by Staff - December Report

[☺ December 2022.pdf](#)

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

37. Chairwoman to Appoint 3-Person Nominating Committee for 2023 Chair and Vice-Chair

Thomas L. Thomason
David Altschiller
Karen Guinn

XV. ADJOURNMENT

[38. Next HDBR Pre-Meeting - Wednesday January 11, 2023 at 12pm - 112 East State Street, Mendonsa Hearing](#)

[39. Next HDBR Regular Meeting - Wednesday January 11, 2023 at 1pm - 112 East State Street, Mendonsa Hearing Room](#)

[40. Adjourn](#)

4:20 Guinn

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.