

Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street
January 11, 2023 1:00 PM
MEETING MINUTES

January 11, 2023 Historic District Board of Review Meeting

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM at 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted, and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received, and no votes were taken.

Members Present: Ellie Isaacs, Chair

David Altschiller Michael Higgins Nan Taylor

Thomas Thomson

Members Absent: Karen Guinn

Melissa Memory Melissa Rowan

MPC Staff Present: Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director

Caitlin Chamberlain, Senior Planner Ethan Hagerman, Assistant Planner James Zerillo, Assistant Planner Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant

Julie Yawn, System Analyst

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

- 1. Petition of Ward Architecture + Preservation | 22-005840-COA | 118 East Jones Street | Rehabilitation

 - Staff Research.pdf
 - Submittal Packet.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic Board of Review motioned for approval for alterations & rehabilitation at 118 East Jones Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Michael Higgins

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor - Aye

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

2. Petition of Pantheon ADC | 22-005842-COA | 200 West Bryan Street | Amendment to Approved Brick 21-002857-COA

- Staff Report 22-005842-COA 200 W Bryan St.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic Board of Review motioned for approval to amend a previous approved Certificate of Appropriateness for a new 5-story building at 200 East Bryan Street [File No. 21-002857-COA] as requested because the proposed change is visually compatible.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Michael Higgins

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

3. Petition of Hansen Architects | 22-005843-COA | 226 East Bryan Street and 9 Lincoln Street | Demolition of Non-Contributing Addition and Fences

- Staff Report 22-005843-COA 226 E Bryan St.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic Board of Review motioned for approval for the demolition of a non-historic addition, rear facade restoration, a new door in an existing opening, and site fencing for the property located at 226 East Bryan Street \ 9 Lincoln Street as requested because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Michael Higgins

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor - Aye

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

4. Adopt the January 11, 2023 Agenda

Motion

The Savannah Historic Board of Review motioned to adopt the January 11, 2023 HDBR Agenda as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: David Altschiller Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

5. Approval of December 14, 2022 HDBR Meeting Minutes as presented.

Motion

Approve

Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson Second: Michael Higgins

Motion

The Savannah Historic Board of Review motioned for approval of the December 14, 2022 HDBR Meeting Minutes as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson Second: Michael Higgins

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

6. Approval of REVISED November 9, 2022 HDBR Meeting (222 East Gwinnett Petitions)

∅ 11.09.22 MEETING MINUTES.pdf

Motion

The Savannah Historic Board of Review motioned for approval of the revised (regarding 222 E. Gwinnett petitions) November 9, 2022 HDBR Meeting Minutes.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson Second: Michael Higgins

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present
Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson

- Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

7. Petition of Harley Krinsky | 22-005388-COA | 301 Alice Street | Change Status of Building from Contributing to Non-Contributing

- Staff Report 22-005388-COA 301 Alice St.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Alice St Structural Assessment Report R3.pdf
- Staff Site Photos.pdf
- Analysis of Buildings Eligible for Designation 2010.pdf
- Public Comment Neighbor support.pdf
- Public Comment Raymond M. Masciarella II.pdf
- Public Notice from 2010.pdf
- @Z-101012-36582-2.pdf
- City of Savannah Code of Ordinances Section 3.17.6.pdf
- Petition Presentation.pdf
- **Ms. Ellie Isaacs recused herself from this agenda item, as her company provided research regarding the petition.

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the applicant's request for approval to change the status of 301 Alice Street from a contributing to non-contributing structure in the Landmark District. Staff records show the building is circa 1940; appears on Sanborn Map in 1953 and 1955 aerial. Public notice records were mailed November 10, 2010, to inform of public meetings to list as a contributing building. It was listed as contributing by Mayor and Alderman in 2010 because it fit within context and maintained historic integrity.

Staff recommended that the Historic District Board of Review recommend denial to the Mayor and Aldermen to change the status of 301 Alice Street from a contributing to non-contributing building because the property remains eligible for contributing status under Section 3.16.4 Criteria for Designation 'Criterion i' and, structurally, the building appears to be intact.

Mr. Thomson asked about the zoning. Ms. Michalak replied mixed use.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Harley Krinsky, petitioner, provided research regarding the history of the structure, as post-WWII, currently with no historic value. It is a warehouse-, not an automobile-centric structure. He states the 2010 designation is incorrect. It did not and does not contribute to the urban landscape. He stated he questions Staff's desire to protect a blighted structure, as all historic materials have been removed.

Mr. Ralph Anderson, owner, stated he has 42 years of historic preservation experience. He stated Beth Reiter (former Historic Preservation Director) assured him that the building was eligible to be demolished, prior to purchasing the structure. He stated the change of status affects his rights and property value. He stated no notice to property owner was provided, as text amendments require none. If notice had been provided, he would have provided information that it was built in 1952, and it does not meet the criteria.

Mr. Thomson asked if any written documentation was provided from Ms. Reiter. **Mr. Anderson** replied no, it was a conversation had in the 1980's.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Jarles, of Historic Foundation of Savannah, supports denial of the petition. He stated there are not enough changes to warrant delisting.

Mr. Krinsky stated the north and south windows are aluminum, the garage door is different, and there have been other modifications to the structure.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Mr. Thomson stated he appreciated the petitioner's presentation, and the structure is detrimental to neighborhood, it should not have been built there to start with. He supports delisting the structure.

Mr. Higgins stated no significant changes have occurred. He supports Staff's recommendation.

Mr. Altschiller stated it was never used as automotive and it was erroneously established. He supports delisting the structure.

Ms. Taylor stated it has not been maintained over the years but that does not take away from its significance. It is in the period of significance for the Historic District; it was most likely a sub-building of a dealership. It does have part of the context of the neighborhood with historic significance still and supports Staff recommendation.

Mr. Thomson stated he was Executive Director at that time. He stated it was probably a public newspaper notice and not individual notice to each property owner; the owner may have missed the public newspaper notice. He stated it may have been a service station in the past.

Mr. Higgins stated this is an opportunity for creative reuse and supports Staff's recommendation.

Mr. Altschiller stated he wished it was used for industrial use rather than changing its character entirely - not our purview. He respects preservation, but sometimes things are erroneously preserved.

Ms. Taylor asked how was notice sent. **Ms. Michalak** stated no notice was required but record of a public notice letter was found regarding the listing proposal. Newspaper was probably also utilized.

A motion was made by Mr. Thomson to approve petitioner's request, which failed. A motion was made by Mr. Higgins to support Staff recommendation, which also failed. Mr. Thomson stated more of the Board is needed to be present to make a decision on this petition.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the request to change the status of 301 Alice Street from a contributing to non-contributing structure in the Landmark District to the February 8, 2023, meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson Second: Michael Higgins

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor - Abstain

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

- 8. Petition of Ward Architecture + Preservation | 22-005386-COA | 205 East Hall Street | New Construction, Small (Parts I & II) and Special Exception
 - Staff Report 22-005848-COA 205 East Hall Street
 - Submittal Packet
 - Staff Research
 - Mr. Ethan Hageman presented the applicant's request for approval for demolition of a non-contributing building and New Construction: Small (Parts I & II) of a carriage house located in the rear of 205 East Hall Street.

The petitioner is also requesting approval for a **special exception** for Sec. 7.8.10.s.i.4, Fences and Walls Configuration which reads:

"A minimum of five (5) feet must be provided between a fence and a building where they are parallel."

The project description is listed below per the petitioner:

"The construction type will be wood frame on a concrete slab. The main body will be painted brick veneer to match the main house. Our study of other historic carriage houses found that they utilized horizontal branding to break up the mass. Our design applies both soldier and rowlock horizontal branding for the same effect. The garage doors will be painted and paneled overhead rolling type. The human door, visible from the public right-of-way will be wood paneled. The windows will be aluminum clad wood double-hung type with a lite configuration similar to the main house's windows. The roof will be clad with solar shingles, allowing the carriage house to generate its own power. Behind the side gate, painted wood stairs will lead to a second-floor landing and entry into the living space. Above the landing will be a bracketed canopy with a standing seam metal roof."

The special exception request is listed below per the petitioner:

"This special exception request seeks approval for the exterior wall of a proposed carriage house to be located less than 5' from an existing garden wall (fence). It will align with the

east and south property lines and will be approximately 3'-3" from the WEST property line (3'-7" from the existing garden wall).

Staff recommended approval for demolition of a non-contributing building and New Construction: Small (Parts I & II) of a carriage house located in the rear of 205 East Hall Street as requested, because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards. And approval for the special exception request of Sec. 7.8.10.s.i.4, Fences and Walls Configuration which reads:

"A minimum of five (5) feet must be provided between a fence and a building where they are parallel."

as requested, because the special exception will not be detrimental to the public interest, health, safety, welfare, function, and appearance of the adjacent uses of general vicinity.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Josh Ward stated he had no comments.

Mr. Higgins asked if there is any reason not to continue with consistent workable shutters, as they are by the bathroom. It presents an odd look. **Mr. Ward** stated they will study and adjust as possible.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Mr. Altschiller stated it appears to be in compliance with criteria and supports Staff's recommendation.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve for demolition of a non-contributing building and New Construction: Small (Parts I & II) of a carriage house located in the rear of 205 East Hall Street as requested, because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

AND

Approval for the special exception request of Sec. 7.8.10.s.i.4, Fences and Walls Configuration which reads: "A minimum of five (5) feet must be provided between a fence and a building where they are parallel." as requested, because the special exception will not be detrimental to the public interest, health, safety, welfare, function, and appearance of the adjacent uses of general vicinity.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: David Altschiller

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

- 9. Petition of Sawyer Design | 22-005859-COA | 301 West York Street | Amendment to 22-003325-COA
 - Staff Report 22-005859-COA 301 West York Street
 - Submittal Packet
 - Staff Research
 - Submittal Packet 22-003325-COA

Mr. Ethan Hageman presented the petitioner's request for approval to amend the previously approved 22-003325-COA 301 West York Street.

The amendment description is listed below per the petitioner:

"The proposed project is located at 301 West York Street. This project was to build (6) six new single family residential town homes. (3) three of the new townhomes were to utilize the existing two-story office structure currently built on site. The project has been modified to only add the third level to the existing structure and to only create (3) three townhome units in the existing structure. Other than removing the back steel stairs the remaining site and surroundings will remain as is."

Staff recommended approval to amend the previously approved 22-003325-COA at 301 West York Street as requested, because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards. All previous conditions were met.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Jon Leonard thanked staff and informed of changes: removal of adding three units on Jefferson Street; add the third level, and the existing steel stair will be removed.

Mr. Higgins asked if there was outreach to neighbors. Mr. Leonard replied not since the last petition. Will still meet with them prior to construction.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones, citizen, stated the windows changed on Jefferson Street must align with centerline vertically. Ms. Michalak responded it is only required on the front facade.

BOARD COMMENTS:

There were no Board comments.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve to amend the previously approved 22-003325-COA at 301 West York Street as requested, because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Nan Taylor

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present

MEETING MINUTES

Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye
Nan Taylor - Aye
Ellie Isaacs - Abstain
Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

10. Petition of Felder and Associates | 22-005856-COA | 313-316 West River Street | Alterations and Additions

- Submittal Packet.pdf
- Staff Report 22-005856-COA 313 West River St.pdf
- Staff Research.pdf

Mr. James Zerillo presented the applicant's request of approval for alterations and additions to the building located at **313 West River Street** as an amendment to a previous COA under file number 19-004089-COA.

The project description is listed below per the petitioner:

"This application is being submitted as an amendment to the previously approved design, HDBR file No. 19-004089-COA. Our proposed amendments include the following: redesigning the primary front entrance, omitting the centermost deck and 2nd floor access along Factor's Walk, and using steel windows and doors in lieu of the approved aluminum storefront type.

Previously approved elements that are to remain include two of the new decks and 2nd floor access and the canopy along Factor's Walk, and the proposed canopy and balcony at the North elevation. We are also showing a preliminary location for a proposed new corner blade sign. This signage will be submitted separately at a later date for HDBR review and approval."

Staff recommended approval of alterations and additions to the building located at 313 West River Street as an amendment to a previous COA under file number 19-004089-COA with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final approval, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Provide the total sign area for the proposed canopy sign and ensure it meets the standards.

Mr. Thomson asked if the sign ordinance allows having both signs on the same side. **Ms. Michalak** stated a principal use sign and an awning sign on the same side. **Mr. Zerillo** stateed the petitioner is proposing the awning sign but not the blade, as a condition that size is provided to staff before construction.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Klause, understand signage - not yet settled. Will provide footage and reduce scale.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, stated they hold an easement on this property. They have concerns regarding awning and brackets; the petitioner has agreed to work with HSF regarding this.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Ms. Taylor likes the design for the context of the location. **Ms. Isaacs** agrees.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve alterations and additions to the building located at 313 West River Street as an amendment to a previous COA under file number 19-004089-COA with the following condition to be submitted to staff for final approval, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Provide the total sign area for the proposed canopy sign and ensure it meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens - Not Present
Melissa Memory - Not Present

David Altschiller - Aye

Nan Taylor - Aye

Ellie Isaacs - Abstain

Karen Guinn - Not Present

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

11. Acknowledge and approve of Staff-approved decisions as presented.

The correct decision was attached to 407 Charlton Street (24 Drayton Street decision was incorrectly attached) agenda item. There were no other agenda items with incorrectly attached decisions, as erroneously stated in the meeting.

- 12. Petition of Donna Howard | 22-005338-COA | 24 Drayton Street | Telecommunications equipment upgrade
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 22-005338-COA 24 Drayton St.pdf
- 13. Petition of Virginia Hunter | 22-005486-COA | 407 W Charlton St | Re-shingle roof
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 22-005846-COA 407 W Charlton.pdf
- 14. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 22-005849-COA | 427 East River Street | Non-illuminated projecting sign above entrance
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 22-005849-COA 427 E River St.pdf
- 15. Petition of Hellcat Construction | 22-005553-COA | 304 E Hall Street | Amend 21-001547-COA: window brand
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 22-005553-COA 304 E Hall St.pdf
- 16. Petition of Ellsworth Design Build | 22-005686-COA | 317 West York St | Brick repointing and repainting
 - SIGNED Staff Decision 22-005686-COA 317 W York St.pdf

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 17. Report on Work Done Without a Certificate of Appropriateness for the January 11, 2023 HDBR Meeting
 - @ Report on Work Performed Without a COA HDBR January 2023.pdf
- 18. Report on Work Done Which Exceeds the Scope of an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the January 11, 2023 HDBR Meeting
 - @Report on Work that Exceeds the Scope of an Issued COA January 2023.pdf
- 19. Report on Work Done Which Is Inconsistent with an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the January 11, 2023 HDBR Meeting
 - Report on Work that is Inconsistent with an Issued COA January 2023.pdf

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

- 20. Items Deferred to Staff January Report
 - Items Deferred to Staff January Report.pdf
- 21. Stamped Drawings January Report
 - Stamped Drawings January.pdf
- 22. Inspections Completed by Staff January Report
 - January 2023 Inspections.pdf

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

23. Nominating Committee to Announce Chair and Vice-Chair Nominations for 2023

Ms. Ellie Isaacs was nominated to remain as Chair. Ms. Nan Taylor is to step down and Ms. Karen Guinn to be nominated as Vice Chair.

XV. ADJOURNMENT

- 24. Next HDBR Pre-Meeting Wednesday February 8, 2023 at 12pm 112 East State Street
- 25. Next HDBR Regular Meeting Wednesday February 8, 2023 at 1pm 112 East State Street
- 26. Adjourn

2:09

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.