



S A V A N N A H H I S T O R I C D I S T R I C T
B O A R D O F R E V I E W

REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Petitioner: Harley Krinsky
MPC File No.: 22-005388-COA
Address: 301 Alice Street
PIN: 20045 16001
Zoning: D-C
Staff Reviewer: Leah G. Michalak
Date: January 11, 2022

NATURE OF REQUEST:

The Applicant is requesting approval to change the status of 301 Alice Street from a contributing to non-contributing structure in the Landmark District.

CONTEXT:

301 Alice Street was added as a contributing building to the Historic Building Map in 2010 as part of a larger effort which, ultimately, added 112 buildings as contributing (age range of 1820 to 1964) [File No. Z-101012-36582-2 – TEXT] – see attached. The documentation provided in 2010 indicates that the building was constructed c.1940; however, research provided by Landmark Preservation Consulting in the Applicant’s submittal packet, appears to demonstrate that the building was constructed in 1951 or 1952 as it does not appear on the 1950 Sanborn Map but is visible on the 1953 Sanborn Map and a 1955 aerial.

Contrary to the Applicant’s assertion that the owner was not notified when the building was proposed to be added in 2010; Staff did locate a letter in our records entitled “Public Notice” which appears to have been mailed on November 5, 2010, to all property owners of the 112 buildings (see attached). This letter informs the recipients of two public meetings that were to take place later the same month. Additionally, there would have been a third opportunity for public comment when heard at City Council later the same year. It is clear there was proper public notice made. In 2010 the Mayor and Aldermen voted to add the 112 buildings, including 301 Alice Street, as contributing because the buildings fit with the context and maintained historic integrity.

Staff’s review of the Applicant’s request was undertaken using *Sec. 3.16.7 Amendments to a Contributing Resources Map* (see below). Our research of the City’s ordinance did not find authority for this Board to remove a historic designation under zoning ordinance *Sec. 3.17.6. Removal of a Local Historic Property Designation* which provides for the process to change the

status of a building from contributing to non-contributing. The ordinance only makes this process available to the Historic Preservation Commission, not the Historic District Board of Review.

FINDINGS:

Relevant Ordinance: 3.16.7 Amendments to a Contributing Resources Map

a. Initiation of Amendment

The Mayor and Aldermen, Planning Director, Historic Preservation Commission, Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review or the property owner of the subject property within a designated local historic district may initiate the process of amending the Contributing Resources Map for a local historic district.

Finding: The property owner of the subject property has initiated the amendment. The standard is met.

b. Pre-application Conference

Prior to the request to amend a Contributing Resources Map, the applicant shall participate in a pre-application conference with the Planning Director. The Planning Director shall determine whether a complete survey of the local historic district is required. The property owner may be required to complete the survey and/or provide additional information verifying that the proposed contributing resource(s) meet the designation criteria provided in Sec. 3.16.4.b.

Finding: The future potential property owner held a pre-meeting with preservation staff. A complete survey of the district is not required. The standards are met.

c. Amendment Request

An application to amend a Contributing Resources Map shall be submitted to the Planning Director including any supporting documentation requested.

Finding: An application with supporting documentation, including a structural assessment report, has been received.

Relevant Ordinance:

d. Review by the Historic Preservation Commission (Sec. 2.5) or the Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review (Sec. 2.6)

i. Public Hearing and Public Notice

The Planning Director shall schedule the public hearing and give public notice in accordance with Sec. 3.2, Public Notice, that the revision to the Contributing Resources Map shall be considered by the Historic Preservation Commission or Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review, as applicable.

ii. Standards and Criteria

The Historic Preservation Commission or the Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review shall evaluate the request based upon the criteria in Sec. 3.16.4.b.

See the criteria below:

Relevant Ordinance:3.16.4 Criteria for Designation

The criteria below shall be applied by the review authority to determine whether the proposed local historic district is eligible for designation. At the time a new district is proposed, or the boundaries of an existing district are proposed for expansion, the review authority shall also determine whether existing buildings, structures, sites or objects within the proposed district are contributing or non-contributing. Contributing resources shall be shown on a Contributing Resource Map for the district.

a. Criteria for Local Historic District Designation

The proposed local historic district possesses integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association and at least one of the following:

- i. Is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or
- ii. Is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or
- iii. Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or that represents the work of a master, or that possesses high artistic values, or that represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or
- iv. Has yielded or may be likely to yield, information important in pre-history or history.

Finding: The Mayor and Aldermen voted in 2010 to add 301 Alice Street as a contributing building finding that the building fit with the context and that the building maintained historic integrity. Additionally, comparing the photograph from the 2010 “Analysis of Buildings Eligible for Designation” to the building today (see Staff Site Photos), the building has not changed in any significant manner. Therefore, Staff finds that 301 Alice Street still maintains the same integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association that it has when it was determined eligible in 2010 by the Preservation Officer. Further, according to the Preservation Officer in 2010, the building meets the criteria for its association with the broad patterns of development in Savannah.

Per the Preservation Officer at that time:

Automotive related properties:

The decades of the 20th century, between world wars, saw the rise of the dominance of the automobile. Early auto related structures blended into the urban landscape in a manner that contributed to, rather than detracted from the larger urban setting. Savannah is fortunate to retain a number of interesting auto related structures from the early to mid-1900s. ... Four structures were identified [including 301 Alice Street] that fit within this context, are over 50 years of age, maintain their historic integrity, and meet Criteria A [now criterion i] for the broad pattern of development to the district to include the automotive related development.”

Although it has now been discovered that the building dates from between c.1950 (as opposed to c.1940), the other facts remain the same and the building still falls within the local district’s period of significance which is 1733-1960. The National Register/National Landmark period of Significance is from 1733-1934.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the Historic District Board of Review recommend denial to the Mayor and Aldermen to change the status of 301 Alice Street from a contributing to non-contributing building because the property remains eligible for contributing status under Section 3.16.4 Criteria for Designation ‘Criterion i’ and, structurally, the building appears to be intact.

MW: LGM

Note: This recommendation could change subject to new information provided at the Historic District Board of Review meetings. Final decisions will be made by the Historic District Board of Review at the public hearing based on information provided at the meeting, as well as information submitted for the staff recommendation.