



Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street
February 8, 2023 1:00 PM
MINUTES

February 8, 2023 Historic District Board of Review Meeting

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM at 112 East State Street. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted, and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received, and no votes were taken.

Members Present: Ellie Isaacs, Chair
Karen Guinn
Michael Higgins
Melissa Rowan
Nan Taylor
Thomas Thomson

Members Absent: David Altschiller
Melissa Memory

MPC Staff Present: Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director
Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation
Ethan Hagerman, Assistant Planner
James Zerillo, Assistant Planner
Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant
Roger Beall, System Analyst

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

[1. Petition of Jessica Jordan | 23-000135-COA | 505 Hartridge Street | Alterations](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review motioned to approve to replace the roof, windows, and doors of the contributing house located at 505 Hartridge Street as requested, because the proposed work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[2. Petition of ReJuicin8 Juice Bar, LLC | 22-000151-COA | 501 Montgomery Street | Illuminated Sign](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review motioned to approve the request for the installation of illuminated and non-illuminated signage at 501 Montgomery Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Note: This recommendation could change subject to new information provided at the Historic District Board of Review meetings. Final decisions will be made by the Historic District Board of Review at the public hearing based on information provided at the meeting, as well as information submitted for the staff recommendation.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

[3. Adopt the February 8, 2023 Agenda](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review motioned to adopt the February 8, 2023, HDBR Agenda as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

[4. Approve the January 11, 2023 Meeting Minutes](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review motioned to approve the January 11, 2023 HDBR Meeting Minutes as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Nan Taylor

Second: Michael Higgins

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

[5. Petition of Felder & Associates | 23-000140-COA | 250 Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard | Alterations](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review motioned to continue this petition.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas L. Thomson

Second: Karen Guinn

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

[6. Petition of Fulford Swinney, LLC | 23-000196-COA | 212 West Huntingdon Street | Porch addition](#)

Mr. James Zerillo presented the petitioner's request of approval for additions at 212 West Huntingdon Street. The applicant is proposing to remove the existing rear porch and install a new one and to construct a new 9'0 (nine feet) by 9'0 (nine feet) shed. The rear of the property is minimally visible from the public right of way. Only the top of the shed will be visible from the public right of way.

This historic building was constructed in 1889 and is a contributing resource within the Savannah Downtown Local Historic District. The 1916-1953 Sanborn Map shows that 216-212 West Huntingdon Street had three small wood structures in the rear yard. Two of which sit within the rear yard of 212 West Huntingdon. By the 1955-1973 Sanborn Map the wood accessory structures are no longer present on the property. The rear lane of this property is private property, meaning that this proposal is reviewed based on visibility from Tattnell Street and Barnard Street (see Staff Research packet) and not from the private lane. The parking lot adjacent to 212 West Huntingdon, which fronts Barnard, is also private property.

Within the immediate context there is a range of styles and materials utilized. 216-212 West Huntingdon Street is a row of connected, stucco townhomes. Adjacent to the rear of the property at 514-516 Tattnell Street there is a one (1) story wood clapboard home. To the East, fronting Barnard Street, there are two brick, one (1) story commercial buildings. Between these two buildings there is a large, private surface parking lot.

Staff recommends to approve the request for additions at 212 West Huntingdon Street with the following conditions to allow for the applicant to revise the petition and submit revisions to staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Revise the shed roof to be flat, to conform to the design standards.
2. Revise the exterior wall of the shed to not include Hardie panels, instead utilizing a material which meets the design standards such as horizontal Hardie boards or

horizontal wood boards.

3. Provide specifications on the color and finish of the shed exterior walls.
4. Provide specifications on the new gate door on the rear of the property.

PETITIONER'S COMMENTS:

Mr. Will Swinney, petitioner, stated he had no concerns making the requested changes.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board agreed with Staff recommendation.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for additions at 212 West Huntingdon Street with the following conditions to allow for the applicant to revise the petition and submit revisions to staff for final review, because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Revise the shed roof to be flat, to conform to the design standards.
2. Revise the exterior wall of the shed to not include Hardie panels, instead utilizing a material which meets the design standards such as horizontal Hardie boards or horizontal wood boards.
3. Provide specifications on the color and finish of the shed exterior walls.
4. Provide specifications on the new gate door on the rear of the property.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Melissa H. Rowan

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[7. Petition of Felder & Associates | 23-000197-COA | 27 Barnard Street | Alterations and Additions](#)

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request of approval for alterations to the property located at 27 Barnard Street. Per the applicant:

All exterior historic elements of the building will be retained and preserved. Existing non-historic fabric awnings ... will be removed. The rebuilt deck/canopy will be constructed of wood, steel and glass and will be distinguishable from the original building by an 18"-wide hyphen between the two structures. It will also be self-supported and independence from the main building. ...

Other new elements include replacing non-historic wood and glass doors within the

existing unaltered masonry openings, adding wood door surrounds around three of the existing entrances, and adding wooden planters at the sills of the second floor-windows. A combination of gooseneck and sconce lighting will be used to illuminate the building façade and entrances. An existing project sign on the St. Julian St. elevation will be replaced with the new restaurant's brand images, and a similar sign will be added to the Barnard St. elevation.

This historic building was constructed in 1848 and is a contributing structure within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the Savannah Downtown Historic District. The building is part of a row (and collection) of similar buildings that make up City Market. They are all a vernacular "style" with basic masonry construction, simple headers and sills, and very little decoration.

Historically, this building has always been multiple commercial uses. Sanborn Maps from 1884-1973 (see attached) illustrate this. A (one-story?) wood porch or awning spans the width of the east façade (facing the original City Market) through the 1916 Sanborn Map. It is replaced by a one-story metal porch or awning by 1955 and is gone altogether in the 1973 map. A small metal canopy is present in the 1970s photographs. Clearly, the types and arrangements of awnings have changed many times on this building historically; the rest of the building arrangement (externally) appears to remain the same.

Staff located a COA from the late 1970s for a rehabilitation of this building (see attached); however, could not located any approvals for the porch that currently exists on the east side of the building. Staff has been told in the past, that it was constructed without a COA by Wild Wing when it moved into the space c.2005. Wild Wing recently vacated the space.

Staff recommended to continue alterations to the property located at 27 Barnard Street in order for the petitioner to address the following because the proposed work is not visually compatible and does not meet the preservation standards:

1. Significantly simplify the design of the porch addition.
2. Remove all new door surrounds from the design.
3. Provide information regarding the attachment of the flowerboxes; do not damage historic materials.
4. Provide all color selections.
5. Provide all necessary information to review the proposed signs.
6. Provide a specification for the gooseneck light fixture.

PETITIONER'S COMMENTS:

Mr. Ryan Klaus, agrees with nature of structure, not trying to create a false sense of history, but create something to be set apart from design era, better distinction. The existing deck floats above sidewalk, which was added after the fact. Canopy set apart detail; not attached to structure. This design will be the largest of the project and the smaller others will follow its design. The visual cues indicate it is not providing a false sense of history.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Andrew Jones, citizen, stated he supports Staff recommendation.

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, stated he will speak with the petitioner to let them know they are available to assist.

BOARD COMMENTS:

The Board supports Staff's recommendation. **Ms. Taylor** stated it is important to maintain the history of a building without presenting a false sense of history.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue alterations to the property located at 27 Barnard Street to the March 8, 2023, meeting in order for the petitioner to address the following because the proposed work is not visually compatible and does not meet the preservation standards:

1. Significantly simplify the design of the porch addition.
2. Remove all new door surrounds from the design.
3. Provide information regarding the attachment of the flowerboxes; do not damage historic materials.
4. Provide all color selections.
5. Provide all necessary information to review the proposed signs.
6. Provide a specification for the gooseneck light fixture.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Aye
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

[8. Petition of Harley Krinsky | 22-005388-COA | 301 Alice Street | Change Status of Building from Contributing to Non-Contributing](#)

Ms. Leah Michalak presented the petitioner's request for approval to change the status of 301 Alice Street from a contributing to non-contributing structure in the Landmark District.

301 Alice Street was added as a contributing building to the Historic Building Map in 2010 as part of a larger effort which, ultimately, added 112 buildings as contributing (age range of 1820 to 1964) [File No. Z-101012-36582-2 – TEXT] – see attached. The documentation provided in 2010 indicates that the building was constructed c.1940; however, research provided by a consultant in the Applicant's submittal packet, appears to demonstrate that the building was constructed in 1951 or 1952 as it does not appear on the 1950 Sanborn Map but is visible on the 1953 Sanborn Map and a 1955 aerial.

Contrary to the Applicant's assertion that the owner was not notified when the building was proposed to be added in 2010; Staff did locate a letter in our records entitled "Public Notice" which appears to have been mailed on November 5, 2010, to all property owners of the 112 buildings. Two mailing labels with Ralph Anderson's name, a PO Box and the PIN for 301 Alice Street appear in the document as well (see attached). This letter informs the recipients of two public meetings that were to take place later the same month. Additionally, there would have been a third opportunity for public comment when heard at City Council later the

same year. It is clear there was proper public notice made. In 2010 the Mayor and Aldermen voted to add the 112 buildings, including 301 Alice Street, as contributing because the buildings fit with the context and maintained historic integrity.

Staff's review of the Applicant's request was undertaken using *Sec. 3.16.7 Amendments to a Contributing Resources Map* (see below). Our research of the City's ordinance did not find authority for this Board to remove a historic designation under zoning ordinance *Sec. 3.17.6. Removal of a Local Historic Property Designation* which provides for the process to change the status of a building from contributing to non-contributing. The ordinance only makes this process available to the Historic Preservation Commission, not the Historic District Board of Review.

Staff recommends that the Historic District Board of Review recommend denial to the Mayor and Aldermen to change the status of 301 Alice Street from a contributing to non-contributing building because the property remains eligible for contributing status under Section 3.16.4 Criteria for Designation 'Criterion i' and, structurally, the building appears to be intact.

PETITIONER'S COMMENTS:

Mr. Harley Krinsky, petitioner, stated he is representing Ralph Anderson. The structure is more appropriate as residential. Showed current zoning as support; it is a former auto structure. He stated it should not have been listed as a contributing structure in 2010. He stated it was built with inferior materials; City Engineering requires structural changes with appropriate materials to meet code. Current building materials are not allowed in the historic district. Has support of neighbors and DNA.

Mr. Ralph Anderson, property owner, bought the building as an office building. Stated notice was sent to wrong P. O. Box; would have appealed then if it was received.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Mr. Ray Masterbello, area resident, stated he supports the petitioner.

Ms. Ellen Harris, representing the Downtown Neighborhood Association, stated the DNA is neither opposed or in support of.

Mr. Ryan Jarles, HSF, stated beauty is relative and supported Staff recommendation.

Mr. Krinsky responded the structure was labeled incorrectly.

BOARD COMMENTS:

Mr. Thomson stated he supports the applicant.

Mr. Higgins stated he supports Staff recommendation. The Sanborn map shows an auto repair shop, which does have significance. Cannot see how the owner would not be aware. Beauty is in the eye of beholder, and this structure shows how the neighborhood progressed and grew. Opposes the delisting request.

Ms. Guinn stated she does not see the value that would support the decision for the building to remain contributing architecturally. Reads as warehouse not auto. She stated she supports the applicant.

Ms. Rowan stated she supports applicant.

Ms. Taylor stated she supports Staff.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby recommend approval to the Mayor and Aldermen to change the status of 301 Alice Street from a contributing to non-contributing building because the building:

1. Does not show the use of significant materials.
2. Does not show significant architectural features that read as automotive or the emergence of the automobile.

Therefore, it does not meet the criteria outlined in Section 3.17.4.i.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Karen Guinn

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Dwayne Stephens	- Not Present
Melissa Memory	- Not Present
David Altschiller	- Not Present
Nan Taylor	- Nay
Ellie Isaacs	- Abstain
Karen Guinn	- Aye
Michael Higgins	- Nay
Melissa H. Rowan	- Aye
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

[9. Acknowledgement of Staff-approved petitions.](#)

Motion

Acknowledge and approve of Staff-approved petitions.

Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion:

Second:

[10. Petition of Doug Bean Signs | 23-000378-COA | 402 E Broughton Street | Non-illuminated sign on the front facade](#)

[11. Petition of Southern Roof & Wood Care Corp. | 23-000371-COA | 323 W Jones St | Install new TPO system roof.](#)

[12. Petition of Byck Management | 23-000133-COA | 242 Bull St | Color change with conditions](#)

[13. Petition of Steven Bodek, Inc. | 22-005847-COA | 318 Habersham St | Color change \(windows/door\)](#)

[14. Petition of Roof Medics | 22-005995-COA | 401 E Broughton St | In-kind roof replacement](#)

[15. Petition of Justin Mangold | 22-005460-COA | 554 E Charlton St | After-the-fact color change \(porches, doors, and trim\)](#)

[16. Petition of AAA Sign Company | 23-000137-COA | 1501 Montgomery St | Wall sign](#)

[17. Petition of Courtland & Co. | 22-005998-COA | 250 Bull St | Color Change](#)

[18. Petition of Tony Hensley | 22-005845-COA | 328 Barnard St | Non-illuminated sign](#)

[19. Petition of Grant Rogers | 22-006003-COA | 14 W Hull St | Work to stop water intrusion \(replace gutter, soffit, fascia boards, four windows, deteriorated mortar on 3rd level, and re-install time period mortar\)](#)

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

[20. Report on Work Done Without a Certificate of Appropriateness for the February 8, 2023 HDBR Meeting](#)

[21. Report on Work Done Which Exceeds the Scope of an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the February 8, 2023 HDBR Meeting](#)

[22. Report on Work Done Which Is Inconsistent with an Issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the February 8, 2023 HDBR Meeting](#)

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

[23. Items Deferred to Staff - February Report](#)

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

[24. Stamped Drawings - February Report](#)

[25. Inspections Completed by Staff - February Report](#)

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

[26. Rowan](#)

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

[27. Vote for Chair \(Ellie Isaacs\) and Vice-Chair \(Karen Guinn\)](#)

Motion

Isaacs

Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion: Melissa H. Rowan

Second: Karen Guinn

XV. ADJOURNMENT

[28. Next HDBR Pre-Meeting - Wednesday March 8, 2023 at 12pm - 112 East State Street](#)

[29. Next HDBR Regular Meeting - Wednesday March 8, 2023 at 1pm - 112 East State Street](#)

[30. Adjourn](#)

There being no further business to present before the Board, the February 8, 2023 Historic District Board of Review adjourned 2:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted.

Leah G. Michalak
Director of Historic Preservation

/bm

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.