



Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street
July 10, 2024 1:00 PM
MINUTES

July 10, 2024 Historic District Board of Review Meeting

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted, and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received, and no votes were taken.

Members Present: Karen Guinn, Chair
Michael Higgins
Stan Houle

Thomas Thomson

Members Absent: Melissa Rowan, Vice Chair
Robert Becker
Sabrina Nagel

MPC Staff Present: Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director (virtually)
Jonathan Mellon, Director of Historic Preservation
Caitlin Chamberlain, Principal Planner
Kelli Mitchell, Senior Planner
Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant
Hind Patel, Information Technology
Edward Morrow, Director of Development Services

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

[1. Petition of Ward Architecture + Preservation, Josh Ward | 24-003289-COA | 210 West Wayne Street | Amendment to 24-002160-COA](#)

Jonathan Mellon prepared the Staff report for the applicant's request of approval to amend 24-002160-COA for alterations to the front and rear elevations, and an addition to the rear elevation of the property located at 210 West Wayne Street.

Per the applicant:

"This submittal seeks the approval for modifications to a previously approved COA (24-002160) for the property at 210 Wayne Street in Chatham Ward. 210 West Wayne is one of four rowhouses constructed ca. 1854 for William Kine. These modifications are a refinement to what was approved."

Modifications from previously approved COA:

1. 3rd Floor porch railing has been extended to the edge of the addition and the middle porch roof column removed.
2. 3rd Floor french doors over stoop will be replaced 'in kind' and not replaced with a new window.
3. 2nd Floor deck has been extended the full width of the addition and the exterior stairs removed.
4. 2nd Floor entry door will have two upper solid panels replaced with glass."

210 West Wayne Street was constructed in 1854 on a through lot on the north side of West Wayne Street between Barnard Street and Tatnall Street and is a contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. 210 West Wayne Street is part of a row of four three-story masonry (brick) rowhouses with covered entrance stoops, punched openings with stone lintels and sills, and wood cornices.

The surrounding context includes both contributing and non-contributing buildings around the perimeter of Chatham Square and to the west along Tatnall Street.

Staff recommended to approve the request for an amendment to 24-002160 for alterations to the front and rear elevations, and an addition to the rear elevation of the property located at 210 West Wayne Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby Approve the amendment to 24-002160-COA for alterations to the to the front and rear elevations, and an addition to the rear elevation of the property located at 210 West Wayne Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Michael Higgins

Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Not Present
Sabrina Nagel	- Not Present

[2. Petition of Eli Lurie | 24-003351-COA | 310 West Charlton Street | Alterations / Addition](#)

Jonathan Mellon prepared the applicant's request of approval for alterations and a rear addition to the property located at 310 West Charlton Street.

Per the applicant:

"We are seeking approval for a rear second floor addition and various alterations to 310 West

Charlton Street. Based on the multitude of historic images of this house, it is quite clear that this home has had a difficult past. This home has had several significant changes, including

multiple front porches, and many different sidings, window types, etc. This has left this home bearing many different non-conforming materials, which we are aiming to rectify. On the front street facing façade we plan on removing all non-conforming materials and replacing them with historically appropriate materials. This includes, real wood shutters, real wood windows and replacing the non-historic front porch structure. We are also proposing to add a rear addition to the home.”

310 West Charlton Street was constructed in 1839 on the north side of West Charlton Street between Jefferson Street and Montgomery Street and is a contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. 310 West Charlton Street is a two-story frame free-standing building with a covered front entrance porch, punched openings with multi-light window and shutters, a rear one-story addition with shed roof, and is topped by a side gable roof with two dormer windows.

Staff recommended to approve the alterations, rear addition, and garden shed for the property located at 310 West Charlton Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby Approve the alterations, rear addition, and garden shed for the property located at 310 West Charlton Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Michael Higgins

Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Not Present
Sabrina Nagel	- Not Present

[3. Petition of Wubbena Architects | 24-003292-COA | 301 West Jones Street | Addition](#)

Kelli Mitchell prepared the applicant's request of approval to construct a covered seating area at the property located at 301 West Jones Street. The proposed seating area will be constructed on the rear section of the building within the area indicated on the photograph below and will be facing an existing parking lot. The work will not be visible from West Jones and from much of Jefferson Street. It will only be visible at the rear corner of the lot.

The building was constructed in 1900 and is a contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. The building first appears on the 1916 Sanborn Map, which shows only the current masonry corner building. The building was expanded between 1916 and 1950 and would later be conjoined with a neighboring two-story structure. The two-story structure appears to have been

demolished between 1973 and 2003. During that same time period, the side one-story element of the masonry building was either expanded or demolished and a new addition added. The rear extension beyond the masonry structure has also been added on to and altered. Staff could not find any Certificates of Appropriateness for this work.

Staff recommended to approve the construction of a covered seating area at the property located at 301 West Jones Street as requested because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

Motion

The Historic Downtown Board of Review does hereby approve the construction of a covered seating area at the property located at 301 West Jones Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Michael Higgins

Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Not Present
Sabrina Nagel	- Not Present

[4. Petition of Eli Lurie | 24-0003353-COA | 221 East Charlton Street | Addition](#)

Kelli Mitchell prepared the applicant's request of approval to demolish an existing rear deck and to construct a rear addition at the property located at 221 East Charlton Street. The western elevation and the garden/basement level will not be reviewed at this time as neither are visible from the public right of way.

The building was constructed in 1840 and is a contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. The Survey for the Ward Notebook indicates that the original owner was Mrs. Fitzgerald Pelot.

Sanborn Maps indicate that alterations have been made to the home overtime. The 1888 Sanborn Map shows the rear wall as being constructed of masonry but, by 1898, that same wall was frame construction. A front stoop was also constructed between 1888 and 1898. By 1916, the rear of the home appears to be two rooms that are the same height as the primary structure. The overall footprint does not appear to have been enlarged at that time. The rear portion at this time was also part frame and part masonry.

The State Survey indicates that there was a rear porch on either 221 or 223 East Charlton (or both) by the time that the survey was completed. The rear porch does appear on aerials as early as 2003.

Current photographs of the rear of the structure show two different types of masonry as well as two different joint widths, suggesting that the rear has been altered over time.

Staff recommended to approve the demolition of an existing rear deck and the construction

of a rear addition at the property located at 221 East Charlton Street with the following conditions because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Confirm that the balustrades on the side stairs on four inches (4") on center.
2. Confirm the paint color for the paneling and columns.
3. Confirm where siding and where wood paneling will be used.

Motion

The Downtown Historic Board of Review does hereby approve the demolition of an existing rear deck and the construction of a rear addition at the property located at 221 East Charlton Street with the following conditions because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Confirm that the balustrades on the side stairs on four inches (4") on center.
2. Confirm the paint color for the paneling and columns.
3. Confirm where siding and where wood paneling will be used.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion:

Second:

Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Not Present
Sabrina Nagel	- Not Present

[5. Petition of Chris Clarke | 24-002950-COA | 36 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard | Illuminated Sign Refacing](#)

Caitlin Chamberlain prepared the applicant's request for after-the-fact approval for a sign refacing on two previously existing illuminated signs, for the business located at 36 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard. 36 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard was constructed in 1875/1906 and is a contributing structure within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the Savannah Local Historic District.

On September 14, 2022, the HDBR approved the original request for one projecting illuminated signs at this location [22-003493-COA]. The HDBR decision was as follows:

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition to mount one illuminated sign at new restaurant, Folklore, located at 36 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard with the following condition because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. *Mount sign into the mortar joints instead of the brick faces to avoid altering or damaging the historic brick and to ensure if the sign is removed in the future that it will not compromise the history integrity of the building.*

Based on a photo provided by the applicant, and what can be seen on Google Street View, a second sign was installed without a COA by the previous business, who has since vacated

the building. The new business installed their logo on the illuminated portions of the same signs. Since only one sign was approved in the previous decision, staff will make note in the report of how the second sign is permissible and meets the ordinance.

Staff recommended approval for the after-the-fact refacing of two (2) previously existing projecting illuminated signs located at 36 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard as requested because the signs are visually compatible and meet the standards.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the after-the-fact refacing of two (2) previously existing projecting illuminated signs located at 36 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard as requested because the signs are visually compatible and meet the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Michael Higgins

Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Not Present
Sabrina Nagel	- Not Present

6. Petition of Hiru Patel | 24-003348-COA | 351 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard | Rehabilitation/Alterations

Caitlin Chamberlain prepared the applicant's request for approval to complete the work initially approved in 2021 [21-005431-COA], for the property located at 351 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard. The proposed scope of work includes:

- The addition of a wood cornice above storefront, painted Sherwin Williams "Tricorn" SW 6258
- Replacement of existing storefront system with a new wood storefront system, painted Sherwin Williams "Tricorn" SW 6258.
- All exterior doors to be repaired or replaced in kind
- Repainting the brick exterior walls
- Repair top cornice as needed
- Refurbish existing ventilation grills

351-355 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard was constructed in 1897 and is a contributing resource [within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District](#). 351 and 355 are within a row of three connected addresses; 347 is not part of the scope of the project. The building is situated on MLK between Jones Street and Charlton Street. There is another commercial contributing building adjacent to 315-355 MLK Blvd. and a row contributing buildings from the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries across the street as well.

On November 10, 2021, a COA was approved for the rehabilitation of 351-355 Martin Luther

King, Jr. Boulevard. The scope of work was the same as mentioned above in this report. The HDBR Decision was as follows:

"The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the petition for rehabilitation of the property located at 351 and 355 Martin Luther King, Jr., Blvd., as requested, because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards."

The project started but has only been partially completed. The COA expired on November 10, 2023, and thus, the Petitioner is reapplying for the same work that has already been approved, to complete the work.

Staff recommended to approve the request to renew the previously approved COA for 351-355 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard, as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request to renew the previously approved COA for 351-355 Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard, as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Michael Higgins

Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Not Present
Sabrina Nagel	- Not Present

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

[7. Adopt the July 10, 2024 HDBR agenda as presented.](#)

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board motioned to adopt the July 10, 2024 HDBR Agenda as presented. Addition of Item 24 - Stucco Text Amendment from 'Other Business' to 'Regular Agenda'.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Stan Houle

Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye

Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Not Present
Sabrina Nagel	- Not Present

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

8. Approve June 12, 2024 HDBR meeting minutes as presented.

Motion

Adopt the June 12, 2024 HDBR meeting minutes as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Michael Higgins

Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Not Present
Sabrina Nagel	- Not Present

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

9. Petition of LS3P Savannah, Michael Garcia | 24-002767-COA | 200 East Saint Julian Street | Rehabilitation & Alterations

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

10. Petition of Casa Guava, LLC | 24-0002729-COA | 314 Drayton St | Illuminated Sign

Kelli Mitchell presented the applicant's request for after the fact approval for one illuminated incidental sign and one illuminated wall sign at 314 Drayton Street. For the review, the 'Open' sign will be considered an incidental sign while the 'Cuban' sign will be considered a wall sign. The building is a noncontributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District.

Staff recommended to approve the illuminated incidental sign ('Open' Sign) at 314 Drayton Street with the following condition_because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Change the color of the illuminated portions of the signs to solid white.

And

Deny the illuminated window sign at 314 Drayton Street because it does not meet the

standards for sign illumination.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Emily Eversoll, petitioner, asked about Staff recommendation. **Kelli Mitchell** clarified that there can only be one of each kind of sign - incidental and window sign.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

The Board asked the applicant to clarify their plans. The petitioner stated they will leave the wording as it is and keep the 'Open' as the approved incidental. The window sign will come down.

Motion

The Historic Downtown Board of Review does hereby approve the illuminated incidental sign ('Open' Sign) at 314 Drayton Street with the following condition because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1.Change the color of the illuminated portions of the signs to solid white.

And

Deny the illuminated window sign at 314 Drayton Street because it does not meet the standards for sign illumination.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Not Present
Sabrina Nagel	- Not Present

[11. Petition of of VP2Design, LLC, Victor Pluznyk | 24-002765-COA | 427 East Jones Street | New Construction, Accessory Building, Parts I & II](#)

Jonathan Mellon presented the applicant's request of approval for New Construction, Accessory Building, Parts I & II for the construction of a two-story carriage house at the rear of the property located at 427 East Jones Street where there is currently a one-story garage.

427 East Jones Street is a two-story masonry (brick) building on a corner lot on the south side of Jones Street between Price Street and Habersham Street. It was constructed in 1879 originally as two separate units and is a contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District.

The rear of the property fronts onto East Jones Lane which includes several contributing two-story carriage houses as well as one-story non-contributing garages. The existing one-story garage at the rear of the property is a non-contributing building. The two-story rear ell of the building is a separate dwelling that sits on a separate lot and is not part of this application.

The Sanborn Map from 1916 shows that there was originally series of one-story frame buildings behind the subject property as well as numerous other structures fronting on East Jones Lane. The Sanborn Map from 1955 shows that the series of one-story frame buildings behind the subject property had been removed / demolished, while the majority of the other lane structures had been retained.

Staff recommended to continue the request for New Construction, Accessory Buildings (Parts I and II) at 427 East Jones Street, for a period not to exceed ninety (90) days to give the petitioner time to address the following concerns:

1. Restudy the proposed material for the railing and staircase of the second-floor balcony, as well as the design of the staircase, to have them be more in-keeping with the overall architectural composition of the accessory building and be visually compatible with the contributing building and East Jones Lane.
2. Examine the potential use of masonry (brick or stucco) for the exterior wall material to have the building be more in-keeping with the historic context on east Jones Lane.
3. Examine the potential use of a different roof design to have the building be more in-keeping with the historic context on east Jones Lane.
4. Restudy the proposed material for the doors to have them meet the standard.
5. Provide additional information / clarification on the proposed details for any proposed meter boxes and HVAC units to ensure that they would be screened from the public right-of-way. In addition, provide information on the refuse plan for the site.
6. Provide details on any proposed exterior lighting to ensure that the standards are met.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Victor Pluznyk, petitioner, stated the presentation has changed from previous proposal to include comments from board. Expressed question about the refuse and meter locations: everything currently sits in the face of the lane, will look into that, but not sure how much leeway there is for that. Spoke with homeowner: not thrilled about stair, prefer the circular stair on exterior and may remove if cannot be circular, as there is an interior stair for use. There is no preference on lights. The lighter brick would match the original house more and some of the carriage houses in the area.

Michael Higgins asked if petition should be continued to address stair issue. **Jonathan Mellon** stated the balcony and service yard would stay, possibly remove exterior stair, which can be reviewed at staff level rather than continued. The petitioner stated if removed, the only access to the balcony will be from the interior.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

Thomas Thomson asked about the preferred lights. Jonathan Mellon stated both are visually compatible. The petitioner added that they are not true white, but off white.

Michael Higgins stated he'd prefer seeing a more finalized petition; not wanting to have

choose building options and suggested to continue.

Stan Houle agreed with Higgins, however it seems all homeowner decisions are inconsequential.

Chair Guinn expressed appreciation for the applicant's compliance to Board comments. The Board should not provide personal preference. **Jonathan Mellon** clarified that currently they are asking for direction regarding visual compatibility given the context of the lane.

Michael Higgins agreed that personal preference should not be presented, however he expressed concern with the width/depth of balcony.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the New Construction, Accessory Buildings (Parts I and II) for the property located at 427 East Jones Street with the following conditions because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.Remove the proposed staircase and adjust the balcony depth in order to meet the standards of a maximum projection of 3 feet on the rear (north) elevation.
- 2.The architect is to submit to staff the preferred option for the color of the brick.
- 3.The architect is to submit to staff the preferred option for the lighting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Not Present
Sabrina Nagel	- Not Present

[12. Petition of Wubben Architects | 23-005347-COA | 409 West Taylor Street | Noncontributing Demolition | New Construction, Small: Part I](#)

Kelli Mitchell presented the applicant's request for approval to demolish a non-contributing structure and requesting approval of New Construction, Small: Part I for a three-story structure with a penthouse at the property located at 409 West Taylor Street. The structure was originally constructed as a duplex with the neighboring building being 407 West Taylor (later 405/407 West Taylor). Based on available information, it is possible that the structures were previously listed as 205 and 207 Taylor Street.

The exact date of construction is unknown at this time. The Georgia Historic Resource Survey Form lists the structure as being constructed in 1900 while the Historic Savannah Inventory form (Ward Notebook) lists the year of construction as "c 1800?" A note on the latter states that it is "difficult to date [the home] with any accuracy because of tarpaper covering."

Staff believes that the duplex was likely constructed in the 1870s based on available information. The structure is not shown on an 1853 map of the city, but a structure is shown on the lot in 1871 (see fig. 1). Since there was no affiliated name or address shown, staff cannot confirm if this is 407 or 409 West Taylor.

Neither 207 nor 205 Taylor are listed in the 1871 or 1874/1875 City Directories. While there are properties listed as being on the corner or near the corner of Taylor Street and Montgomery or Broad St (currently MLK), staff cannot confirm that the referenced buildings are 409 or 407 West Taylor.

Staff was able to find physical copies of the 1870 and 1876 City Directories. Given that individual addresses were not listed, staff could not, at this time, confirm whether or not either address was listed. At this time, addresses were listed beside names. Glenn Thomas, the first person known to be affiliated with 207 Taylor does not appear in either Directory. Staff did not have the ability to thoroughly search the documents at the time of researching the property to determine if either address was listed.

Staff located a document entitled 'Reclaiming Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd., I-16 Exit Ramp Removal.' The document includes sketches that show the development of the area around the I-16 Flyover. The sketches represent the area circa 1875, 1925, and 1975. Staff cannot be certain that the 1875 sketch (see fig. 2) is the current building given the configuration, though a building with the same footprint is shown on the 1925 sketch which staff knows to be 407 and 409 West Taylor. So, it is possible that the building shown in the 1875 sketch is 407/409 West Taylor.

207 Taylor is first listed in the 1877 Directory, though 205 Taylor is not. The duplex appears on the 1888 Sanborn Map (see fig. 3), assuming that 205/207 Taylor are 407/409 West Taylor. The footprint of the structure on the 1888 map is different than what is seen on the 1898 map. This can suggest that the buildings were either altered or that these were different homes that were later replaced with 407/409 West Taylor.

Staff carried out thorough City Directory research on 409 West Taylor only, with the exception of searching for 407 West Taylor in the 1871, 1874/1875, and 1877 City Directories in an attempt to date the structure. Residents included laborers, a student, musician, cotton sampler, porters, cooks, and a reverend among others. Staff searched using the known address as well as the address of neighboring structures, mainly looking for photographs when dealing with the latter. Basic Google searches were also carried out for the property address, for information about I-16, and other related topics. At the time of writing this report, all historical information that staff could find has been provided with the staff research.

Note: The parking plan has been attached as a separate document. The parking shown on the plan is not what Traffic Engineering is considering for this project.

Staff recommended to approve the demolition of the non-contributing structure at 409 West Taylor Street with the following conditions because the building otherwise meets the criteria for non-contributing demolition.

1. The building must be documented per the MPC Policy for Documenting Buildings.
2. Rather than traditional demolition, the building be deconstructed, and the materials salvaged for reuse.

And

Approve the New Construction, Small (Part I): Height and Mass for a three story infill with a penthouse at 409 West Taylor with the following conditions to be submitted to the Board for review with Part II, Design Details because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

1. Adjust the porch design to meet the encroachment requirements and receive preliminary approval for the encroachment of the porch into the public right of way.
2. Provide material information and specifications for the handrails for the Juliet balconies, porch roof, and roof pavers.
3. Provide window specifics if muntins are being proposed
4. Provide light and fencing specifications if these elements are being proposed.
5. Provide information about the proposed parking on the neighboring property to include fencing and gates.

Michael Higgins stated there is a significant, visual height difference by a full story and a half. Staff responded the penthouse was the concern, but the basement level makes them both effectively three stories, and no sideline views were provided. **Jonathan Mellon** stated the project architect can address the accuracy of the height models.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

James Wubbena, petitioner, determined project mass by others in the area - three stories are the majority. Agrees the penthouse goes above that but stays within the Ordinance's height limitations. Agreed with staff recommendation to move forward.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Ardis Wood, Chair of Scenic Chatham, stated the street is being treated like a lane and asked about room for tree lawns. **Thomas Thomson** stated there is a treelawn ordinance that needs to be considered.

Andrew Jones, Oglethorpe Plan Coalition, expressed his concerns with the petition. There were no pictures to show visual compatibility of request; should be a requirement.

Ellis Isaacs, HSF, regrets seeing another loss. Appreciation for Staff was expressed. Expressed concern with the balconies and windows of two over two in an area in which that is not common.

James Wubbena stated the windows could be addressed in Part; the transom above the doors would be recessed. Additional details will be in part 2. Regarding the landscaping uncertain because the sidewalk is narrow already. They will work with the City.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

Stan Houle and **Michael Higgins** stated they were not comfortable with approving height without sight line/elevation pictures for visual compatibility. The building looms and should be continued.

Thomas Thomson stated the Ordinance allows to have up to three stories.

Motion

The Downtown Board of Review does hereby approve the demolition of the non-contributing structure at 409 West Taylor Street with the following conditions because the building otherwise meets the criteria for non-contributing demolition.

- 1.The building must be documented per the MPC Policy for Documenting Buildings.
- 2.Rather than traditional demolition, the building be deconstructed, and the materials salvaged for reuse.

And

Approve the New Construction, Small (Part I): Height and Mass for a three story infill with a penthouse at 409 West Taylor with the following conditions to be submitted to the Board for review with Part II, Design Details because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.Adjust the porch design to meet the encroachment requirements and receive preliminary approval for the encroachment of the porch into the public right of way.
- 2.Provide material information and specifications for the handrails for the Juliet balconies, porch roof, and roof pavers.
- 3.Provide window specifics if muntins are being proposed
- 4.Provide light and fencing specifications if these elements are being proposed.
- 5.Provide information about the proposed parking on the neighboring property to include fencing and gates.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Nay
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Not Present
Sabrina Nagel	- Not Present

[13. Petition of LS3P Savannah, Michael Garcia | 24-003354 | 123 West Oglethorpe Avenue | Rehabilitation & Addition](#)

Jonathan Mellon presented the applicant's request of approval for Part II, Design Details for alterations and a three-story rear addition to the property located at 123 West Oglethorpe Avenue. It was constructed in 1820 and was originally located to the north across West Oglethorpe Avenue before being relocated to allow for the construction of the Juliette Gordon Low Federal Building.

123 West Oglethorpe Avenue is a three-story masonry (brick) building, four bays wide, with two ground floor entrances (one of which was altered from having been a window) punched openings with nine-over-nine wood windows and wood shutters and is topped by a side gable roof with two dormer windows. Simple detailing includes brick headers, stone lintels, and stone entrance stoop, which are characteristic of the Federal style.

123 West Oglethorpe has seen several alterations over the years, notably in the period following its relocation to the south side of West Oglethorpe Avenue that included the construction of a new foundation and alterations to the rear elevation.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Ryan Jarles, of Rhino Collective, shared his preservation background history. Used National Park Service Preservation Brief 14 as a basis of petition. He states they believe they have embodied all guidelines with their petition, as it is a secondary property. Would like to use as a transition building between the historic and modern.

Michael Garcia, LS3P and Rhino Collective, thanked Staff. Highlighted the actions they've take to be in compliance of all requirements, including using planters to help soften the structure.

Staff recommended to approve the Part II, Design Details for alterations and rear addition to the property located at 123 West Oglethorpe Avenue with the following conditions because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. To meet the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards 2– Historic Character*, the proposed installation of the metal canopy on the front elevation on West Oglethorpe Avenue above the first-floor entrance should be removed from the scope of work.
2. Additional information is needed on the proposed storefront system that is proposed to be used for the windows on the three-story rear addition to determine if the standards are met.
3. Additional information is needed on the proposed location of the refuse storage area to determine if the standards are met.

Michael Higgins stated it seems institutional.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Ardis Wood, citizen, expressed her disapproval of the petition.

Ellie Isaacs, Historic Savannah Foundation, supported by David McDonald of the Downtown Neighborhood Association, expressed opposition of the petition, and supports staff recommendation. It is not secondary in scale or design and would appreciate a more refined design.

Andrew Jones, Oglethorpe Plan Coalition, objects to the aesthetics and scale of the project.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

Thomas Thomson stated he is not a fan of design/visual compatibility and location.

Michael Higgins stated it could be made to read a lot less heavy; less institutional. It could be pushed more to set apart as architecture of 2024. He stated he would like more of the board present to make a decision and give petitioner opportunity to adjust his petition.

Stan Houle acknowledged the work done, however compatibility is the issue and recommended a continuance.

Chair Guinn stated the project warrants more time and cautioned that personal preference is not to be considered; should be based on Secretary of Interior Standards. The Chair agreed that a full diverse board to represent community is best.

Motion

BOARD DECISION:

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the request for alterations and rear addition to the property located at 123 West Oglethorpe Avenue for 90 days to allow the applicant time to address the following condition:

1. Further refine and review the design for visual compatibility both for the building at 123 Oglethorpe Avenue and the surrounding contributing buildings.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Stan Houle

Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Not Present
Sabrina Nagel	- Not Present

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

[14. Acknowledge Staff-approved petitions as presented.](#)

Motion

Approve

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Michael Higgins

Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Not Present
Sabrina Nagel	- Not Present

[15. Petition of James Ciminillo | 606 Abercorn Street | 241-003661-COA | Amend 23-005880-COA: Color Change](#)

[16. Petition of SpeediSign | 412 Whitaker Street | 24-0033576-COA | Roof Replacement](#)

[17. Petition of Lott & Barber | 429 Abercorn Street | 24-003154-COA | Stucco Repair](#)

[18. Petition of LKS Architects | 319 Abercorn Street | 24-003285-COA | In-kind replacements/repair to first floor windows](#)

[19. Petition of Farrell Click | 11 West Gordon Street | 24-002737-COA | Color Change](#)

[20. Petition of Michael Broadway | 601 Tattnall Street | 24-003591-COA | Color Stucco Repair](#)

[21. Petition of South Shore Roofing | 317 West Huntingdon Street | 241-003583-COA | Roof Replacement](#)

[22. Petition of Southern Flame | 1915 Bull Street | 24-003375-COA | Mounted Ground Sign](#)

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

[23. Stamped Drawing Report - July](#)

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

[24. Stucco Text Amendment](#)

Jonathan Mellon presented proposed text amendment. The Board supported the proposed text amendment.

Motion

Stucco Amendments

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Stan Houle	- Aye
Karen Guinn	- Abstain
Michael Higgins	- Aye
Melissa H. Rowan	- Not Present
Thomas L. Thomson	- Aye
Robert Becker	- Not Present
Sabrina Nagel	- Not Present

[25. Chair Comments regarding Board Member training and communication processes](#)

Chair Guinn requested clarification as to how notice is provided to Board for HDBR appeals.

Edward Morrow, Director of Development Services, stated appeal applications are received by the City, not as the Historic applications are received and processed in-house. They are not always notified prior to deadline, expounding that his department is not always aware until after the deadline oftentimes. The department does not have the luxury of pre-meetings as had with Historic applications. He requested the HDBR make motions directly supported in the Ordinance, so they can be directly understood and supported by other departments.

Chair Guinn expressed concern with an appeal going before ZBA, with HDBR as the decision-making body not being notified. The Board should have been notified so a board representative could appear to represent the board decision. **Chair Guinn** also expressed

again the lack of board training - that it is a lot to ask for new members to understand process, scope, purview of the Board, and how to properly present motions with the guidelines, as well as insight as to what is appealable, etc.

XV. ADJOURNMENT

26. Adjourn

There being no further business to present before the Board, the July 10, 2024 Historic District Board of Review motioned to adjourn at 3:43 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jonathan Mellon

Director of Historic Preservation and Urban Design

/bm

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.