

Savannah Historic District Board of Review

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room - 112 East State Street September 11, 2024 1:00 PM MINUTES

September 11, 2024 Historic District Board of Review Meeting

A Pre-Meeting was held at 12:00 PM. Items on the Agenda were presented by Staff, as time permitted, and the Board asked questions. No testimony was received, and no votes were taken.

Members Present: Karen Guinn, Chair

Michael Higgins Stan Houle Sabrina Nagel Thomas Thomson

Members Absent: Melissa Rowan, Vice Chair

Robert Becker

MPC Staff Present: Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director (virtually)

Jonathan Mellon, Director of Historic Preservation

Caitlin Chamberlain, Principal Planner

Kelli Mitchell, Senior Planner

Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant Hind Patel, Information Technology

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

II. SIGN POSTING

III. CONSENT AGENDA

1. Petition of Hallett & Co., Matthew Hallett | 24-004374-COA | 412 East Taylor Street | Alterations

Jonathan Mellon presented the applicant's request of approval for alterations to a two-story carriage house at the rear of the property located at 412 East Taylor Street. Per the applicant:

"We are proposing to return the carriage house closer to its original use by reintroducing vehicle doors on the lane side. The entire carriage house is currently an apartment, with a kitchen and living area on the first floor and a bedroom and bath on the second. We will be removing partition walls on the first floor and portions of the exterior brick wall to add two 8' wide 7' tall openings with outswing 'carriage house' doors. This portion of the facade has been altered several times in the past- only the left foot or so of the facade appears to be original on the first floor, the rest is old brick but new mortar. We are roughly emulating the facade of the partner house at 414 e Taylor but even their facade was heavily changed so we don't know exactly what would have been there at construction. All changes to the masonry will reuse historic brick and the new doors will be recessed behind the brick face per standard."

Staff recommended to approve the alterations to the carriage house for the property located at 412 East Taylor Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby Approve the alterations to the carriage house for the property located at 412 East Taylor Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Stan Houle

Stan Houle - Aye
Karen Guinn - Abstain
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Aye

2. Petition of Edward A Pyrch Design and Planning, Ed Pyrch | 24-004327 | 514 East Oglethorpe Avenue | Fence

Caitlin Chamberlain prepared the applicant's request of approval to move the rear fence further back on the property, replace with new materials to match remaining fence, to allow for a parallel parking space at the rear of the property at 514 East Oglethorpe Avenue. The parking space will be on the property and not the lane, and the applicant intends to plant hedges around the parking area to partially screen it while still allowing space for the car to enter and exit.

Staff recommended to approve the request to move the fence further back on the property, replace with new materials to match remaining fence, to allow for a parallel parking space at the rear of the property at 514 East Oglethorpe Avenue as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request to move the fence further back on the property, replace with new materials to match remaining fence, to allow for a parallel parking space at the rear of the property at 514 East Oglethorpe Avenue as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Stan Houle

Stan Houle - Aye
Karen Guinn - Abstain

Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Aye

3. Petition of Signs of the South Inc., Deborah Bowen | 24-004393 | 110 East President Street | Non-illuminated & Illuminated Signs

This item was removed from the Consent Agenda by Michael Higgins, seconded by Stan Houle.

Caitlin Chamberlain presented the petitioner's request for approval to install one non-illuminated wall sign and one illuminated wall sign, on two different elevations, for the property located at 110 East President Street.

110 East President Street was built in 1924 and is a contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. It originally served as the district headquarters for the Standard Oil Company and is reported to be the first gas station in Savannah to incorporate the drive through gas pumps into the design of the building instead of under an attached canopy. The building has been home to several businesses over the years, most recently Cadence Bank and Samet Corporation.

Staff recommended to approve the request to install one wall sign on the Drayton Street elevation, and one illuminated wall sign on the President Street elevation, for the property located at 110 East President Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Higgins asked about the glue remains. **Chamberlain** stated it should be cleaned before new signage is put on it.

Higgins asked why approve if it causes further damage. **Chamberlain** responded that the proposed adhesive is removable. A condition be added to remove any glue without damage.

Houle asked if hardship would be incurred without the signs placed at the requested locations. Chamberlain responded no hardship was discussed; just the desire for the two signs.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Deborah Bowen, petitioner, stated they are using an adhesive PL530 that holds 40 pounds and can be gotten off with a heat gun. The existing glue on Drayton St was not her doing. **Higgins** asked if PL530 has been used to try to remove from stone previously. **Bowen** responded no; does not think it would damage the building.

Chair suggested testing it and report findings back to board. **Bowen** stated she is confident of removal with heat gun to remove glue.

Nagel asked if they are willing to remove existing glue. **Bowen** responded no; they were initially planning to put on top of the old sign, but then the sign disappeared. They do not want the liability of removing the glue from the Lott & Barber sign that was recently removed.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There was no public comment.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

The Board recommended to continue as the applicant was not present. **Chair** was open to allowing staff to work with petitioner. **Higgins** stated he has concerns regarding further damage of adding additional/new glue.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby continue the request to install one wall sign on the Drayton Street elevation, and one illuminated wall sign on the President Street elevation, for the property located at 110 East President Street, to the October 9, 2024 Historic District Board of Review meeting so staff can work with the petitioner to determine alternate means of attachment and repair of the stonework.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Sabrina Nagel

Stan Houle - Aye
Karen Guinn - Abstain
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Aye

4. Petition of LS3P Savannah, Michael Garcia | 24-004415-COA | 7 East Congress Street | Amendment to 24-002769-COA

Caitlin Chamberlain presented the applicant's request for amendments based on design change directives for the property located at 7 East Congress Street, otherwise known as the Manger Building. The project was originally approved by the HDBR on August 10, 2023 [23-003676-COA] and the first set of amendments was approved on June 12, 2024 [24-002769-COA].

The requested amendments include:

Event Space Addition Revisions:

- -Change of second floor material from metal panel to brick
- -Simplified roof system/elimination of skylights
- -Reconfiguration of the mechanical equipment on roof/relocation of mechanical screen
- -Breezeway revision- removal of skylight roof assembly, and the exterior wall has been revised to be a custom wrought iron gate that is compatible to the existing buildings rail detailing notably present at the second floor windows and doors.

Existing Building Revisions

- -The ground floor storefront along Congress and Bull Streets were proposed to be demolished and replaced with a similar design. The proposed revision is to keep the existing storefronts except the main hotel lobby on Congress Street and the main restaurant entry on Bull Street. New storefront glazing is proposed in those areas.
- -Awnings are proposed to be incorporated within the existing bay spacing along Bull

Street.

-Roof deck railings along perimeter revised to be tube steel railings rather than previously approved glass railings.

Staff recommended to approve the amendment to the previously approved project at 7 East Congress Street [23-003676-COA] for changes to the event space addition as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the amendment to the previously approved project at 7 East Congress Street [23-003676-COA] for changes to the event space addition as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Stan Houle

Stan Houle - Aye
Karen Guinn - Abstain
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Aye

IV. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

5. Adopt the September 11, 2024 Historic District Board of Review Meeting

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review motioned to adopt the amended September 11, 2024 HDBR Meeting as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Michael Higgins

Stan Houle - Aye
Karen Guinn - Abstain
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Aye

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

6. Approve the August 14, 2024 Historic District Board of Review Meeting Minutes as presented.

Motion

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review motioned to approve the corrected August 14, 2024 HDBR meeting minutes as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Stan Houle - Aye
Karen Guinn - Abstain
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Aye

VI. ITEM(S) REQUESTED TO BE REMOVED FROM THE FINAL AGENDA

VII. CONTINUED AGENDA

7. Petition of Wubbena Architects | 23-005347-COA | 409 West Taylor Street | New Construction, Small: Part II, Design Details

Motion

Continue.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Stan Houle - Aye
Karen Guinn - Abstain
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Aye

8. Petition of Barnard Architects | 24-004406-COA | 39 Barnard Street | Door

Motion

Continue.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Stan Houle - Aye
Karen Guinn - Abstain
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Aye

VIII. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION

IX. REGULAR AGENDA

9. Petition of LS3P Savannah, Michael Garcia | 24-002767-COA | 200 East Saint Julian Street | Rehabilitation & Alterations

Jonathan Mellon presented the petitioner's request of approval for the rehabilitation and alterations to the property located at 200 East Saint Julian Street. The proposed scope of work would include alterations to the fenestration, material palette, and colors on all four elevations of the building that has frontage on East Saint Julian Street, Lincoln Street, Abercorn Street, and East Bryan Street.

Per the applicant:

"Project Description: The building's current use is class-a office space and is proposed to change to a Westin Vacation Club, which is part of Starwood's portfolio of hotel types, providing loyal customers with access to multiple properties in multiple locations. The current building was built for the Army Core of Engineers, with two floors added to the original structure sometime in the late 1970s/early 1980s. The stucco on the exterior of the building was also an addition to the original building, added sometime in the late 1970s/early 1980s. The building is not a contributing historic structure.

The program includes front-of-house and back-of-house spaces on the ground level along the Bryan Street façade that support the hotel, including engineering and housekeeping, laundry and trash facilities, and utility spaces. Check-in, food and beverage and lounge spaces are located along the Primary Entrance at St. Julian Street. The upper floors include a total of 73 keys (studio and one bedroom) and amenities include guest laundry and fitness.

Exterior improvements aim to soften the overall building presence and bring a familiar sense of scale with new operable windows and Juliet balconies throughout. A new building parapet completes the nod to a traditional expression of base, middle, and top façade composition, and additional contemporary detailing at the primary entrances playing off of the existing exterior stucco offer an elegant transition between the City of Savannah's historic fabric and the tranquil interiors that the Marriott brand is known for. "

200 East Saint Julian Street was constructed in 1959 on the northeast Trust Lot fronting Reynolds Square and is a non-contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District. The site had previously been the location of Cassell's Row which was described as "a cluster of small brick houses with high stoops and handsome iron banisters", and prior to that the location of The Filature, which was the headquarters of the silk industry in Savannah.

Staff recommended to continue the application for the rehabilitation and alterations to the property located at 200 East Saint Julian Street, for a period not to exceed ninety (90) days to give the petitioner time to address the following concerns:

- 1. Further study how the design of the building could be refined to strengthen the visual compatibility of the building by looking at the proposed fenestration, design details, material palette and treatment of the East Bryan Street elevation.
- 2. Provide details on the proposed exterior lighting to ensure that the standards are met.
- 3. Provide details on the proposed screening of the rooftop mechanical equipment to ensure that the standards are met.

Houle asked about the appearance, as the original was to be white, but now what is presented appears darker. **Mellon** stated he thinks it to be the two-tone redbrick.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Michael Garcia, LS3P, stated the color is to remain the same. He highlighted the changes made and revisions based on Board comments.

Thomson asked about the windows and sidewalks. Garcia stated they would be happy to lower windows and upgrade sidewalk.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Ellie Isaacs, Historic Savannah Foundation, stated they do not agree with painting of the masonry.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

The majority of the Board believed a continuance is best. Several thought to approve and resolve the final design with Staff, and agreeing with Staff regarding the windows, as visual compatibility will not be affected.

Motion

Continue the application for the rehabilitation and alterations to the property located at 200 East Saint Julian Street, for a period not to exceed ninety (90) days to give the petitioner time to address the following concerns:

Continue to study how the design of the building could be further refined to improve the visual compatibility with the contributing buildings to which it is related. In particular, look at the following:

Fenestration: Study how the existing window openings could have more of a vertical nature to them, as is found on the other contributing buildings, through looking at potentially increasing their height by the lowering of the openings as is proposed where the Juliet balconies are introduced.

Design Details: Study how the building could be given further visual depth / changes in planes, as is found on the other contributing buildings, through the introduction of additional projections.

Material Palette: Study how the existing brick façade, which is made up of two colors, could be addressed, perhaps through the painting of the brick or application of a compatible material which in turn

could serve to visually strengthen the proportions of the building.

Treatment of the East Bryan Street Elevation: Study how this ";rear"; elevation that is required to have back of house / access for service needs can be further enhanced to improve the pedestrian experience and compatibility with both the contributing buildings and new construction / non-contributing building to the north along East Bryan Street.

Provide details on the proposed exterior lighting to ensure that the standards are met.

Provide details on the proposed screening of the rooftop mechanical equipment to ensure that the standards are met.

Vote Results (Rejected)

Motion: Michael Higgins

Second: Stan Houle

Stan Houle - Aye
Karen Guinn - Nay
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Nay

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Nay

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby Approve the application for the rehabilitation and alterations to the property located at 200 East Saint Julian Street with the following conditions because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

- 1.Continue to study how the design of the building could be further refined to improve the visual compatibility with the contributing buildings to which it is related. In particular, look at the following:
- -Design Details: Study how the building could be given further visual depth / changes in planes, as is found on the other contributing buildings, through the introduction of additional projections.
- -Material Palette: Study how the existing brick façade, which is made up of two colors, could be addressed, perhaps through the painting of the brick or application of a compatible material which in turn could serve to visually strengthen the proportions of the building.

- -Treatment of the East Bryan Street Elevation: Study how this "rear" elevation that is required to have back of house / access for service needs can be further enhanced to improve the pedestrian experience and compatibility with both the contributing buildings and new construction / non-contributing building to the north along East Bryan Street.
- 2. Provide details on the proposed exterior lighting to ensure that the standards are met.
- 3. Provide details on the proposed screening of the rooftop mechanical equipment to ensure that the standards are met.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Sabrina Nagel

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Stan Houle - Nay
Karen Guinn - Aye
Michael Higgins - Nay

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Aye

10. Petition of LS3P Savannah, Michael Garcia | 24-003354 | 123 West Oglethorpe Avenue | Rehabilitation & Addition

Jonathan Mellon presented the applicant's request of approval for Part II, Design Details for alterations and a three-story rear addition to the property located at 123 West Oglethorpe Avenue.

Per the applicant:

"This petition is seeking approval for Part Two: Design Details for the property at 123 West Oglethorpe Avenue within the Downtown Savannah Historic District. The current property is zoned as D-CBD and in a 5-story height district. The D-CBD zoning allows for the property to be parking exempt and 100% lot coverage. The petitioner will not be seeking historic tax credits for the proposed rehabilitation of this contributing structure and the proposed scope of work outlined in this submission.

This petition proposes a change of use to the original building from a previous office use to a small hotel use (17 units) with exterior restoration of the existing historic structure and a rear addition of guestrooms that will create an enclosed courtyard within the property boundary."

At the July 10, 2024, HDBR meeting the Board continued the request in order for the petitioner to address the following:

1. Further refine and review the design for visual compatibility both for the building at 123 Oglethorpe Avenue and the surrounding contributing buildings.

The applicant returned with a revised submission that included changes to the four elevations.

Staff recommended to approve the Part II, Design Details for alterations and rear addition to the property located at 123 West Oglethorpe Avenue with the following condition because

the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

 Confirm the proposed scope of work related to exterior lighting as the only fixture shown on the submission is the proposed wall-mounted sconce above the main entrance on the on the front (north) / West Oglethorpe Avenue elevation of the 1820 building.

Nagel asked if the addition is going on the same lot; will it surpass the primary structure. **Mellon** responded it is not an accessory building; it is an addition to the building - standards are different.

Houle asked about the inset of the connector. **Mellon** responded the petitioner will provide that information.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Michael Garcia, LS3P, expounded on the details of the proposed addition. Explained they wanted to make the structure look less institutional. Details were added to the ground floor.

Higgins commended the proposed design modifications.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

James Hundsrucker, citizen, commended the amended proposal of the project.

Ellie Isaacs, Historic Savannah Foundation, thanked the petitioner for consideration of their comments and supports the proposed project.

Tony Abbot, area property owner, expressed concern with the elimination of parking spaces. Stated he is confident more than 75% of lot is covered.

Peter Galloway, area resident, stated this is the last original historic building on block. He asked why windows are being added and why demo the interior.

Garcia stated the windows are being proposed on a non-frontal facade. There will be rooms that will need light. This portion was added after period of significance. As there are no tax credits - interior can be dealt with as they desire.

Ryan Jarles, representative of the petitioner, stated the parking lot will eventually be removed, as parking is not required.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

One Board member expressed concern with addition of windows in the historic fabric of the building, along with the height. The remainder of the Board supported Staff recommendation.

The **Chair** expressed commendation for all involved, particularly the petitioner, for including previous Board, Staff, and public comments to present an agreeable proposal.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby Approve the Part II, Design Details for alterations and rear addition to the property located at 123 West Oglethorpe Avenue with the following condition because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1.Confirm the proposed scope of work related to exterior lighting as the only fixture shown on the submission

is the proposed wall-mounted sconce above the main entrance on the on the front (north) / West Oglethorpe Avenue elevation of the 1820 building.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Michael Higgins

Stan Houle - Aye
Karen Guinn - Abstain
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Aye

11. Petition of Noble Hardee House Condo Association | 24-002498-COA | 501 East Charlton Street | Alterations

Caitlin Chamberlain presented the applicant's request of approval for rehabilitation and alterations of the main house and carriage house at 501 East Charlton Street. It was built in 1853 and the carriage house was built in 1868. Both buildings are contributing resources within the Savannah National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District.

This property has had work done with and without COAs and is detailed below. Most recently, this was presented to the HDBR on June 12, 2024. It was originally continued to the August meeting, but more time was needed to prepare all the requested information. The HDBR Decision was as follows:

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby <u>continue</u> the petition to the <u>August 14, 2024</u>, Historic District Board of Review meeting so that the petitioner may present a full plan to address staff conditions; and to identify removal/repair/replacement/in-kind work that needs to be done.

1. Provide clarification about whether the windows on the main house and carriage house were replaced.

The applicant stated that the windows were repaired but not replaced.

2. Provide information about the window work that was done and ensure that the headers and framing will be the same as the historic configuration.

The existing windows were repaired but the framing had been replaced due to the condition of the wood. The applicant has provided a header sample, which is proposed to be PVC with the intent of preventing future wood rot. The appropriateness will be discussed in a later section of the report. Google Street View photos show that it was not just the headers that were replaced but the frames and sills.

- 3. Remove the non-compliant shutters.
- 4. Redesign the shutters to be either panel or louver style shutters. Ensure that the new shutters are hinged, operable and sized to fit each window opening. Also ensure that the shutters will be constructed of durable wood.

The current non-compliant shutters will be removed. The applicant has provided two similar shutter type options.

5. Provide clarification about the materials used in the work that was done on the front porch steps, railings and balusters as seen in the 2022 Google Street View photo.

The front porch was initially restored in the 1980s. Work done since 2022 appears to include all wood elements. The structural report provided gives details on the repairs to the front porch that should happen and are among the first of the repairs noted on the Repairs Timeline provided by the applicant.

6. Provide clarification about the chimneys that were removed from the carriage house. During the June HDBR meeting, the applicant explained that the chimneys were removed to remediate water infiltration originating on the roof. The applicant is proposing to rebuild the chimney on the west side of the carriage house. There is nothing suggesting that the center chimney would also be rebuilt, potentially due to the weight on the roof.

At the June 12, 2024, HDBR meeting, the Board requested that a new structural report be provided as well as a repair schedule. The applicant has provided both.

For further background, on July 13, 2016, this same proposed project was reviewed by the HDBR [16-003485-COA]. At the time, the applicant requested the ability to remove all siding and install sheathing underneath. The Board Decision was as follows:

The Savannah Historic District Board of Review does hereby:

- 1. <u>Approve</u> alterations, color change, shutters, and repairs for the building located at 501 East Charlton Street <u>with the following conditions</u> because the proposed work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the design standards:
- a. Remove the minimum siding necessary to inspect and repair/replace damaged structural elements.
- b. Repair/replace only siding that has deteriorated beyond repair with siding to match in materials, thickness, and design.
- c. Redesign the shutters to be either panel or louver style shutters. Ensure that the new shutters are hinged, operable and sized to fit each window opening. Also ensure that the shutters will be constructed of durable wood.
- 2. <u>Deny</u> the installation of ¾ inch thick sheathing on the entire exterior of the building located at 501 East Charlton Street because the proposed work does not meet the preservation standards.

The COA expired on July 13, 2017. Staff supports the same conditions as the previous COA. In 2023, the petitioner reapplied for a color change, which was approved [23-001479-COA]. However, the painting has not yet occurred on the whole building. The reason being that there is no active COA to first complete the siding repair work. Within the last few months, there have been complaints made to Code Compliance about the scaffolding that has been installed for years. The City Planning Manager noted that scaffolding is not allowed on a building without an active permit. Since the COA expired several years ago, the applicant recently applied again.

This was initially intended to be a staff level review, addressing the exact same items that had already been approved by the HDBR. However, upon further review, it was noticed by staff that more work had been done without a COA. This includes installation of a denied shutter type, partial siding installation seen on the carriage house, the changing of the window frames and on the historic house and on the carriage house, and more as mentioned in the beginning of the report. The shutters and siding were observed in person by staff and other work done without a COA was noticed on Google Street View images.

When the alterations were noticed, staff actions included researching past COAs on the property. In 2014, there was an application for various alterations to the building, including a

request to change the window frames to fiber cement [14-003946-COA]. This was denied because fiber cement is prohibited on historic buildings. It appears that the work in progress included the use of wood rather than fiber cement framing material.

The Google Street View pictures from March 2016 and March 2022 show exactly what happened, as the pictures show the work in progress. In this change of the window framing, some detail appears to have been lost. However, this work appears to be unfinished, as seen on the front elevation so it is unclear whether the intent is to accurately restore the window framing. Street View images also show what appears to be some siding replacement on the rear elevation of the carriage house, after the COA for siding repair work had already expired, as well as similar work to the windows.

Staff recommended to approve the request for rehabilitation and alterations of the main house and carriage house at 501 East Charlton Street, both proposed and after-the-fact, with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to starting the project, because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1. Remove the minimum siding necessary to inspect and repair/replace damaged structural elements, eliminating the total removal as proposed. Provide photographs to staff prior to starting the work. Repair/replace only siding that has deteriorated beyond repair with siding to match in materials, thickness, and design. Confirm with staff prior to starting the work.
- 2. Select a shutter type from the two designs provided and confirm the wood type.
- 3. Provide brick sample for the chimney.
- 4. Provide information about the mortar type and provide a sample prior to starting repointing work.
- 5. Ensure that all window framing and sills that were changed are repaired to reflect the historic configuration.

Higgins asked about use of faux brick - is there a precedent. **Chamberlain** responded she is not sure - would have to look into it.

Higgins asked if PVC has been approved. **Chamberlain** responded that's why its presented before the Board as not seen before - to get Board's input.

Chair stated it is hard to think faux brick would be acceptable. **Mellon** explained the proposed chimney will not be operational; a sample was provided to Staff. Question of visual compatibility but wanted to get Boards view of the proposed material.

Thomson asked why the removed chimney can't be replaced as functional chimney.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Richard Sioufi, petitioner, presented samples of his proposed brick, real brick, but only half inch thick. Part of chimney has to be repaired. The north section of the roof needs to be replaced with shingles. The portico will be replaced. They will add louvres. The north and south bottom of the structure, near the porch to be repaired. They plan to lift the AC units and extend the porch; less of the AC units will be showing from the street. The roof will be replaced, and chimney repaired; there will be headers on all windows on both floors.

Brick facing will be added to boards that will be around the chimney.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Ellie Isaacs, Historic Savannah Foundation, stated they have concerns with scope of work,

materials, and both chimneys should be replaced.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

The Board expressed discontent and concern with what has been and proposed.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for rehabilitation and alterations of the main house and carriage house at 501 East Charlton Street, both proposed and after-the-fact, with the following conditions to be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to starting the project, because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- 1.Remove the minimum siding necessary to inspect and repair/replace damaged structural elements, eliminating the total removal as proposed. Provide photographs to staff prior to starting the work. Repair/replace only siding that has deteriorated beyond repair with siding to match in materials, thickness, and design. Confirm with staff prior to starting the work.
- 2. Select a shutter type from the two designs provided and confirm the wood type.
- 3. Rebuild both chimneys using true brick.
- 4. Provide information about the mortar type and provide a sample prior to starting repointing work.
- 5. Ensure that all window framing and sills that were changed are repaired to reflect the historic configuration.
- 6.No use of PVC as a replacement material.
- 7. Provide full scope of work from a licensed contractor within 30 days of this meeting.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Stan Houle

Stan Houle - Aye
Karen Guinn - Abstain
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Aye

12. Petition of Anonymous Tattoo, Richard McGhee | 24-003792-COA | 209 East River Street / 212 East Lower Factors Walk | Illuminated Sign

Kelli Mitchell presented the applicant's request for approval of an externally illuminated wall sign at 212 E Lower Factors Walk/209 East River Street. The building was constructed in 1858 and is a contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District.

Staff recommended to approve the wall sign 212 E Lower Factors Walk/209 East River with the following condition because the work is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards.

1. Confirm the materials for the goose neck lighting for staff review.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

There were no petitioner comments.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Ellie Isaacs, Historic Savannah Foundation, expressed there were no issues, however, what was previously proposed was less invasive to the materials. In the future, that should be a factor in the decision-making.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

There was no Board discussion.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the wall sign at 212 E Lower Factors Walk/209 East River as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Michael Higgins

Stan Houle - Aye
Karen Guinn - Abstain
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Aye

13. Petition of Hansen Architects, Patrick Phelps | 24-004416-COA | 401-409 East Bay Street | New Construction

Caitlin Chamberlain presented the applicant's request of approval for New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass, including rehabilitation and an addition for three properties located at 401- 409 East Bay Street. There is also a request to subdivide 401 East Bay Street back into two parcels, as they were originally. This report will consider the full request as Part I.

The applicant provided a highly detailed history of the three buildings that are part of the project. The three sites where the current buildings exist were noted as A, B, and C. The information provided is summarized below.

Site A

Site A is at the intersection of East Bay and Habersham Streets, and the current building is non-contributing building and was constructed sometime between 1954-1973.

-Proposed work includes demolition of the non-contributing building and construction of a four-story building with a two-story rear addition.

Site B

This one-story brick building was constructed between 1888-1898 and is a contributing building. It is in fair condition, except for the structural damage along the south wall facing Bay Lane.

-Proposed work is to renovate/restore the building and add a two-story rear addition.

Site C

The building on Site C is a one-story brick building in good condition. It is non-contributing and was constructed prior to 1937.

-Proposed work includes demolition of an existing non-contributing rear addition and construct a new three-story building and restore the existing single story building, adding a new roof terrace with stair.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Paul Hansen, petitioner, highlighted the proposed petition.

Ellen Harris, Ethos Preservation, gave a history of the structures. The middle structure (b) is the only contributing. "C" may have historic value as it was constructed in 1937.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Ellie Isaacs, Historic Savannah Foundation, expressed support for the petition.

Graham Sadler, area resident, supported the project.

Steve Edwards, Downtown Neighborhood Association, supported the project.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

The Board supported Staff's recommendation.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby approve the request for New Construction, Part I: Height and Mass, including rehabilitation and an addition for three properties located at 401- 409 East Bay Street, as well as the lot subdivision, as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle Second: Sabrina Nagel

Stan Houle - Aye
Karen Guinn - Abstain
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Aye

14. Petition of Treylor Park Hitch | 24-004018-COA | 300 Drayton Street | Illuminated Signs

Kelli Mitchell presented the applicant's request of an after the fact approval for an illuminated sign at 300 Drayton Street. For this project, the sign will be considered a window sign, instead of an incidental sign, as it is too large to be an incidental sign per the ordinance.

The building was constructed in 1927 and is a contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District.

Staff recommended to deny the after-the-fact approval of an illuminated sign at 300 Drayton Street because the sign does not meet the standards for illumination.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

The petitioner was not present.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

The Board questioned if the sign was not turned on, would it be acceptable. The Board would like clarification of sign ordinance, enforcement process, and notice to the business organization to remind of the sign ordinance and the City's plan to move forward to enforce.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby deny the after-the-fact approval of an illuminated sign at 300 Drayton Street because the sign does not meet the standards for illumination.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Michael Higgins Second: Stan Houle

Stan Houle - Aye
Karen Guinn - Abstain
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Aye

15. Petition of James Burnsed | 24-004391-COA | 116 Whitaker Street | Illuminated Sign

Kelli Mitchell presented the applicant's request of approval to install an illuminated projecting sign at 116 Whitaker Street.

The building was constructed in 1866 and is a contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

James Burnsed, petitioner, stated only the center parts of the letters light up; very opaque. The goal is to reflect the lighting of the past.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public comments.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

There was no Board discussion.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby Approve the proposed illuminated wall sign at 116 Whitaker Street as requested because the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Michael Higgins

Stan Houle - Aye
Karen Guinn - Abstain
Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Aye

16. Petition of House of Strut, Erica Natirbuff | 24-0003364-COA | 20 West State Street | Illuminated Sign

Kelli Mitchell presented the applicant's request of an after the fact approval for illuminated signs at 20 West State Street. The building was constructed in 1916 and is a contributing resource within the National Historic Landmark District and the local Savannah Downtown Historic District.

Staff recommended to deny the after-the-fact approval of an illuminated sign at 20 West State Street because the sign does not meet the standards for illumination.

PETITIONER COMMENTS:

Erica Nortirboff, petitioner, stated she was not aware she was out of compliance. There was an illuminated sign in the window upon her signing her lease. She only changed a word to reflect that her business is 'vintage' not 'antique'. It is real neon tubing; had made by a neon craftsman in pink, not red. It is non-permanent; the transom is translucent. No historic fabric was altered. It is inside transom, not outside. Many of the architectural elements are blocked by neighboring businesses.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Ellie Isaacs, Historic Savannah Foundation, admitted it does not meet the standard, but should be allowed to remain as it causes no detriment as it is in the interior.

BOARD DISCUSSION:

The Board stated to be in harmony with the ordinance, the sign be turned off until ordinance changes are made that will possibly make the sign compliant.

Motion

The Savannah Downtown Historic District Board of Review does hereby deny the after-the-fact approval of an illuminated sign at 20 West State Street because the sign does not meet the standards for illumination.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second: Thomas L. Thomson

Stan Houle - Aye

Karen Guinn - Abstain Michael Higgins - Aye

Melissa H. Rowan - Not Present

Thomas L. Thomson - Aye

Robert Becker - Not Present

Sabrina Nagel - Aye

X. APPROVED STAFF REVIEWS

17. Acknowledgement of Staff-approved petitions.

Motion

Acknowledgement

Vote Results (Not Started)

Motion: Stan Houle

Second:

- 18. Petition of Sottile & Sottile, Christian Sottile | 24-004378-COA | 202 East Gwinnett Street | Window Replacement
- 19. Petition of Rafila Lewonki | 24-0002768-COA | 1 Bull Street | Exterior Lights
- 20. Petition of Baker Roofing, Hannah Wierenga | 24-0004538-COA | 25 Bull Street | Reroof
- 21. Petition of Your Exterior Pros | 24-0004515-COA | 23 East 38th Street | Reroof
- 22. Petition of The Rhino Collective, LLC, Ryan Jarles | 24-0004582-COA | 116 Whitaker Street | Awnings
- 23. Petition of Pantheon ADC, Caitlin Corliss | 24-004585-COA | 15 West Broughton Street | Amendment to 23-000422-COA and 22-004368-COA
- 24. Petition of Glenn Keyes | 24-004110-COA | 18 East Oglethorpe Avenue | Amendment to 23-003204-COA
- 25. Petition of LS3P | 24-004514-COA | 10 East Bay Street | Amendment to 24-0000212-COA
- 26. Petition of Fast Signs | 24-0004033-COA | 1 West River Street | Non-Illuminated Signs
- 27. Petition of LS3P | 24-0004536-COA | 245 Montgomery St/234 MLK Jr Blvd | Window Replacement
- 28. Petition of Doug Bean Signs, Angela Bean | 24-0004333-COA | 27 Barnard Street | Non-Illuminated Signs

XI. WORK PERFORMED WITHOUT A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

XII. REPORT ON ITEMS DEFERRED TO STAFF

XIII. NOTICES, PROCLAMATIONS, AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

29. Stamped Drawing Report - September 2024

XIV. OTHER BUSINESS

30. Discussion of proposed review and procedure process for curb cuts within Historic Overlay Districts

XV. ADJOURNMENT

- 31. Next HDBR Pre-Meeting Wednesday, October 9, 2024 at 12 pm 112 East State Street
- 32. Next HDBR Meeting Wednesday, October 9, 2024 at 1 pm 112 East State Street

33. Adjourn

There being no further business to present before the Board, the September 11, 2024 Historic District Board of Review adjourned at 4:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jonathan Mellon Director of Historic Preservation

/bm

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.