

# **Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission**

Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room June 4, 2019 ~ 1:30 PM MINUTES

# June 4, 2019 REGULAR MPC MEETING

Members Present: Joseph B. Ervin, Chairman

Ellis Cook, Vice-Chairman

Thomas Branch
Travis H. Coles
Karen Jarrett
Tanya Milton
Wayne Noha
Eula Parker
Lee Smith

Linder S. Suthers, Secretary

Tom Woiwode

Members Not Present: Joseph Welch, Treasurer

Roberto Hernandez Lacy Manigault

Staff Present: Melanie Wilson, Executive Director

Pamela Everett, Assistant Executive Director Marcus Lotson, Director of Development Services Matthew Lonnerstater, Development Services Planner Marcel Williams, Development Services Planner Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation

Alyson Smith, Preservation Planner Bri Finau, Administrative Assistant Julie Yawn, Systems Analyst

Advisory Staff Present: Bridget Lidy, Director of Planning and Urban Design

Jefferson Kirkland, Chatham County Environmental Program Coordinator

- I. Call to Order and Welcome
- II. Invocation and Pledge of Allegiance
- III. Approval of Agenda
  - 1. Approval of Agenda

**Motion** 

Approve June 4, 2019 Regular MPC Meeting Agenda as presented.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Travis Coles Second: Linder Suthers

Ellis Cook - Aye

Joseph Ervin - Aye

W. Lee Smith - Aye

Roberto Hernandez - Not Present

Linder Suthers - Aye
Tom Woiwode - Aye
Travis Coles - Aye

Joseph Welch - Not Present

Tommy Branch - Aye

Lacy Manigault - Not Present

Tanya Milton - Aye
Karen Jarrett - Aye
Eula Parker - Aye
Wayne Noha - Aye

### IV. Notices, Proclamations and Acknowledgements

2. June 25, 2019 Regular MPC Meeting, 1:30 P.M., Arthur A. Mendonsa Hearing Room, 112 E. State Street.

### **Proclamations and Acknowledgements**

3. Introduction of New MPC Staff by Melanie Wilson

Ms. Wilson introduced Ms. Pamela Everett to the Board.

# V. Item(s) Requested to be Removed from the Final Agenda

4. GENERAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN | Green Island Road | P-190417-00043-1

#### **Motion**

Staff has requested that this item be postponed to the June 25, 2019 Regular MPC Meeting.

### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellis Cook Second: Tanya Milton

Ellis Cook - Aye

Joseph Ervin - Aye

W. Lee Smith - Aye

Roberto Hernandez - Not Present

Linder Suthers - Aye

Tom Woiwode - Aye
Travis Coles - Aye

Joseph Welch - Not Present

Tommy Branch - Aye

Lacy Manigault - Not Present

Tanya Milton - Aye
Karen Jarrett - Aye
Eula Parker - Aye
Wayne Noha - Aye

5. DEMOLITION OF A CONTRIBUTING BUILDING: CUYLER-BROWNVILLE HISTORIC DISTRICT | 726 West Victory Drive | Petitioner: City of Savannah Code Compliance Department | File No. 19-002821-COA

#### **Motion**

Staff has requested that this item be postponed to the June 25, 2019 Regular MPC Meeting.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellis Cook Second: Tanya Milton

Ellis Cook - Aye

Joseph Ervin - Aye

W. Lee Smith - Aye

Roberto Hernandez - Not Present

Linder Suthers - Aye
Tom Woiwode - Aye
Travis Coles - Aye

Joseph Welch - Not Present

Tommy Branch - Aye

Lacy Manigault - Not Present

Tanya Milton - Aye
Karen Jarrett - Aye
Eula Parker - Aye
Wayne Noha - Aye

6. REZONING MAP AMENDMENT | 50 Old River Road | R-A (Residential - Agriculture) to B-N (Neighborhood Business) | File no. Z-190507-00052-1

#### Motion

Continue to June 25. 2019 Regular MPC Meeting.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellis Cook

Second: Tanya Milton

Ellis Cook - Aye
Joseph Ervin - Aye
W. Lee Smith - Aye

Roberto Hernandez - Not Present

Linder Suthers - Aye
Tom Woiwode - Aye
Travis Coles - Aye

Joseph Welch - Not Present

Tommy Branch - Aye

Lacy Manigault - Not Present

Tanya Milton - Aye
Karen Jarrett - Aye
Eula Parker - Aye
Wayne Noha - Aye

# 7. REZONING MAP AMENDMENT | 104-114 DeRenne Avenue | R-6 (One-Family Residential) to B-N (Neighborhood Business) | File no. 19-002401-ZA

#### **Motion**

The petitioner has requested that this item be postponed to the Regular Meeting on June 25, 2019.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellis Cook Second: Tanya Milton

Ellis Cook - Aye

Joseph Ervin - Aye

W. Lee Smith - Aye

Roberto Hernandez - Not Present

Linder Suthers - Aye
Tom Woiwode - Aye
Travis Coles - Aye

Joseph Welch - Not Present

Tommy Branch - Aye

Lacy Manigault - Not Present

Tanya Milton - Aye
Karen Jarrett - Aye
Eula Parker - Aye
Wayne Noha - Aye

8. NORWOOD STABLES | PRELIMINARY PLAN | Major Subdivision | 2304 Norwood Avenue | File Number P-171201-00123-1

#### **Motion**

Staff has requested that this item be postponed to the June 25, 2019 Regular MPC Meeting.

#### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellis Cook Second: Tanya Milton

Ellis Cook - Aye

Joseph Ervin - Aye

W. Lee Smith - Aye

Roberto Hernandez - Not Present

Linder Suthers - Aye
Tom Woiwode - Aye
Travis Coles - Aye

Joseph Welch - Not Present

Tommy Branch - Aye

Lacy Manigault - Not Present

Tanya Milton - Aye
Karen Jarrett - Aye
Eula Parker - Aye
Wayne Noha - Aye

#### VI. Items Requested to be Withdrawn

The Consent Agenda consists of items for which the applicant is in agreement with the staff recommendation and for which no known objections have been identified nor anticipated by staff. Any objections raised at the meeting will result in the item being moved to the Regular Agenda. At a 12:30 briefing, the staff will brief the Commission on Consent Agenda items and, time permitting, Regular Agenda items. No testimony will be taken from applicants, supporters or opponents, and no votes will be taken at the briefing.

# VII. Consent Agenda

9. Approval of May 14, 2019 Briefing and Regular Meeting Minutes

Ø 05.14.19 MEETING MINUTES.pdf

Ø 05-14-19 MPC BRIEFING MINUTES.pdf

#### **Motion**

Approve May 14, 2019 Briefing and Regular Meeting Minutes

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Travis Coles Second: Linder Suthers

Ellis Cook - Aye

Joseph Ervin - Aye

W. Lee Smith - Aye

Roberto Hernandez - Not Present

Linder Suthers - Aye
Tom Woiwode - Aye
Travis Coles - Aye

Joseph Welch - Not Present

Tommy Branch - Aye

Lacy Manigault - Not Present

Tanya Milton - Aye
Karen Jarrett - Aye
Eula Parker - Aye
Wayne Noha - Aye

#### **VIII. Old Business**

10. NEW CONSTRUCTION: MID-CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT | 1512 Bull Street and 17 East 31st Street | Petitioner: Lat Purser & Associates, Inc. | File No. 19-001916-COA

- MPC Policy for Documenting Buildings Prior to Demolition.pdf
- Previously Reviewed Drawings.pdf
- Previously Reviewed Materials and Specifications.pdf
- Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Submittal Packet Drawings.pdf
- Submittal Packet Precedents, Materials, and Specifications.pdf

**Ms. Michalak** presented the petitioner's request for demolition of two existing non-contributing structures and mixed-use new construction at same location. Variances for height have been requested via ZBA, but without specification of number of feet. The concerns from first hearing of this petition at the April 23, 2019 MPC Meeting have been addressed. The issue of the brick is still of concern; the proposed brick by the petitioner is not appropriate. The preferred brick is the Savannah Gray brick to harmonize with the historical texture and time period. The demolition concern is sufficient, and staff requests that 1512 Bull Street be documented as a fine example of mid-century modern architecture. The request to lower the height to reduce visual domination has been addressed and staff requests approval of the 11.2 percent maximum height variance. Staff also requests that a note regarding storefront display windows are not covered beyond 15 percent is notated on the drawings/plans for staff to stamp, for the tenants to adhere to.

Mr. Carey Sikes, representative of the petitioner, stated they are in agreement with staff recommendation.

**Mr. Daniel Carey**, Historic Savannah Foundation, stated they are in agreement with staff recommendation. He wanted to reiterate the importance of the brick choice, as it would be the most prominent feature on the building. They agree a wirecut brick would be best. They are open to dialogue with the petitioner.

**Mr. Branch** asked if the specific brick requirements were stated. He stated it should be in the staff recommendation as a condition.

#### **Motion**

Approval of the request for demolition of two non-contributing buildings with the following condition:

- Document 1512 Bull Street per the ";MPC Policy for Documenting Buildings Prior to Demolition"; (see

attached).

Approval of the request for new construction of a four-story mixed-use building with on-site parking at 17 East 31st Street and 1512 Bull Street with the following conditions because the proposed project is otherwise visually compatible and meets the standards:

- Revise the brick selection to be more compatible with the texture of the brick on visually related contributing buildings;
- Ensure that displays, shelving and signs cover no more than 15 percent of the total window area within three feet of the window's surface, unless display, shelving or signage is transparent for the retail spaces.

Approval of the 11.2% variance to the maximum building height standard because the proposed height, at 50'-4"; feet to its tallest roof feature, is visually compatible.

### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Travis Coles Second: Linder Suthers

Ellis Cook - Aye

Joseph Ervin - Aye

W. Lee Smith - Aye

Roberto Hernandez - Not Present

Linder Suthers - Aye
Tom Woiwode - Aye
Travis Coles - Aye

Joseph Welch - Not Present

Tommy Branch - Aye

Lacy Manigault - Not Present

Tanya Milton - Aye
Karen Jarrett - Aye
Eula Parker - Aye
Wayne Noha - Aye

# 11. MAJOR SITE PLAN GENERAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN | 1512 Bull Street | Lat Purser & Associates, Inc. | File no. 19-001510-PLAN

- Aerial Photo.pdf
- Application 1510-PLAN.pdf
- Staff Report 19-001510-PLAN Revised.pdf
- @GDP 5.6.19.pdf

**Mr. Williams** presented the petitioner's request. The parking requirement of 69 spaces has been met reducing the leased parking spaces from Bull Street Baptist Church and increased street parking on East 31st.

- **Mr. Gerdano** stated there is a one year parking lease for the residential units, assigned. The lease for parking with the church is for five years.
- Ms. Jarrett asked who will ensure the note regarding the trees is adhered to.
- Mr. Gerdano stated they've communicated with Park and Tree, Ted Bunkley, to make the details. There will

be ongoing construction inspection and Park and Tree will have staff monitoring the construction process as well.

#### **Motion**

Based on the plan provided, and in consideration of the entire review process, the applicant appears to have exhibited that standards can be met in conjunction with specific development plan review. Outstanding items associated with the Certificate of Appropriateness review appear to have been addressed. Therefore, staff recommends approval of the General Development Plan at 1512 Bull Street.

### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellis Cook Second: Travis Coles

Ellis Cook - Aye

Joseph Ervin - Aye

W. Lee Smith - Aye

Roberto Hernandez - Not Present

Linder Suthers - Aye
Tom Woiwode - Aye
Travis Coles - Aye

Joseph Welch - Not Present

Tommy Branch - Aye

Lacy Manigault - Not Present

Tanya Milton - Aye
Karen Jarrett - Nay
Eula Parker - Aye
Wayne Noha - Aye

# 12. REZONING MAP AMENDMENT | 5907 BEVERLY STREET | R-2 (TWO-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL) TO RMH (RESIDENTIAL MANUFACTURED HOME) | File No. Z-190422-00048-1

- Application 00048.pdf
- Maps\_combined revised.pdf
- Staff Report Z-190422-00048-1 revised.pdf

**Mr. Williams** presented the petitioner's request. The zoning classification permits manufactured homes, a maximum of three, one per acre. If approved, access easement would be a requirement and subject to the subdivision process.

**Mr. Randy Parrish**, petitioner, stated what he is seeking approval for is in harmony with zoning guidelines. He stated he is seeking to do what is less than the zoning allows. He stated there will be an access road and plenty of room for turnaround. Each will have an individual 20 to 30 foot rocked driveway, as the others are. He stated his goal is to elevate the area from the condition of the neighborhood now, using mobile homes as an economical method. Mr. Parrish stated he would also maintain the access road.

**Mr. Williams** stated the petitioner is able to build three stick-built homes as allowed; however, three duplexes will not be allowed per the ordinance guidelines. The limited acreage and septic requirements prohibit it.

**Ms. Sandra Sheeran**, area resident, opposes the petition. She presented a petition with numerous signatures in support of opposing this matter. She stated she's lived there for 23 years and believes it will devalue the property of neighboring residents. The current residents will feel a negative financial impact, per real estate

evaluators of the area. Ms. Sheeran contends the neighborhood is nice currently; there are some older homes that were grandfathered into the current zoning, but they are not the majority.

**Mr. David English**, area resident, stated the older homes have been grandfathered. He stated the additional housing and people will denigrate the community.

**Mr. Parrish** rebutted by stating regardless of the rezoning, he still has a right to have housing on the properties due to the current zoning.

#### **Motion**

The proposed rezoning is consistent with the definition of the RMH district and is compatible with adjacent patterns of land use. Since it also meets the various criteria for a map amendment established by the Chatham County Ordinance, staff recommends approval of the request to rezone the subject property from the R-2 district to the RMH district. The Board stated a cul-de-sac should be incorporated to provide emergency vehicle access.

## Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Ellis Cook Second: Travis Coles

Ellis Cook - Aye

Joseph Ervin - Aye

W. Lee Smith - Nay

Roberto Hernandez - Not Present

Linder Suthers - Nay
Tom Woiwode - Aye
Travis Coles - Aye

Joseph Welch - Not Present

Tommy Branch - Nay

Lacy Manigault - Not Present

Tanya Milton - Nay
Karen Jarrett - Aye
Eula Parker - Aye
Wayne Noha - Nay

# IX. Regular Business

13. DEMOLITION OF A CONTRIBUTING BUILDING: MID-CITY | 411 West 36th Street | Petitioner: Gary Thomas | File No. 19-002779-COA |

- Aerial View.pdf
- Staff Recommendation.pdf
- Submittal Packet.pdf
- ## 411 W 36th St. Appraisal.pdf
- Sanborn Maps.pdf
- Public Comment\_Walters.pdf
- Opposition Letter Historic Savannah Foundation Tharpe Enginnering Group.pdf

#### Opposition Letter - Thomas Square Neighborhood Association.pdf

**Ms. Alyson Smith**, presented the petitioner's request to demolish the registered contributing historic building located at 411 West 36th Street, between Montgomery Street and Martin Luther King, Jr., Blvd. Constructed in 1913, the footprint has been unaltered. It is planned to be rebuilt as a two unit residential structure. Damage to the structure and lack of repair has led the petitioner to request demolition. Staff maintains rehabilitation is applicable, thus denies the petitioner's request.

**Ms. Della Thomas**, representative of the petitioner, stated the demolition is requested because engineering reports indicate the cost to repair is significantly more than the value of the structure. She regrets the condition of the structure, but the circumstances were out of the petitioner's control. She showed pictures of the damaged structure: fire damage, holed roof, water damage, and vagrancy. The extensiveness of the damage has made the property difficult to sell. She stated they do not want the structure to fall, and it does not qualify for tax incentives because of its condition.

**Mr. Daniel Walters**, representative of the Thomas Square Neighborhood Association, stated the association is opposed to the demolition. He believes repairing the structure is more economical than rebuilding, yielding a better house.

**Mr. Cody Tharpe**, stated that building code and its amendments are often misapplied. He feels the 50 percent rule should be re-evaluated with the mindset that it can be rehabilitated in this petition. Repair and reconstruction are different avenues that are often included as one action. Costs can be reduced by understanding the definition of these two applications.

**Mr. Daniel Carey**, representative of the Historic Savannah Foundation, stated the property does not qualify for demolition. Mr. Carey stated many local organizations offer free assistance, including the HSF. Proper marketing can assist with selling the property. He stated there is no support to warrant demolition. Qualified engineers and contractors should be consulted.

**Mr. Gary Thomas**, petitioner, stated he inherited the responsibility of the property after his father's death. He stated he tries to maintain the property as best possible while living in Atlanta. He indicated the interior of the structure is dangerous; opponents of the demolition have only seen the exterior. He stated seven years of water damage has affected the foundation, and he is only following the recommendation of the structural engineers.

**Ms. Suthers** stated it will be very costly to rebuild a structure within the guidelines of the Mid-City Historic District.

**Ms. Thomas** stated this is a new experience for them and they are willing to work with the HSF and other agencies.

#### **Motion**

Denial of the demolition at 411 West 36th Street because the building does not meet the criteria established to demolish a contributing building.

If the MPC approves the demolition of the contributing building the following conditions shall apply:

The owner must receive a COA for new construction from preservation staff prior to receiving a demolition permit.

The building shall be documented per the ";MPC Policy for Documenting Buildings Prior to Demolition.";

#### Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Travis Coles Second: Linder Suthers Ellis Cook - Aye

Joseph Ervin - Not Present

W. Lee Smith - Aye

Roberto Hernandez - Not Present

Linder Suthers - Aye
Tom Woiwode - Aye
Travis Coles - Aye

Joseph Welch - Not Present

Tommy Branch - Aye

Lacy Manigault - Not Present

Tanya Milton - Aye
Karen Jarrett - Aye
Eula Parker - Aye
Wayne Noha - Aye

# 14. AMENDED GENERAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN | McClendon Surface Mine | 1775 Little Neck Road | File Number P-160119-00003-1

- Maps.pdf
- ∅ 06-04-19 Existing and Proposed Areas to be Mined.pdf
- ∅ 06-04-19 Proposed GDP.pdf
- @02-06-16 Current GDP.pdf
- @06-04-19 Staff Report P-160119-00003-1.pdf

**Mr. Lotson** presented the petitioner's request to amend a general development plan for McClendon Surface Mine at 1775 Little Neck Road. The approved GDP in 1998, with an extension in 2016. Only a 65 acre portion is currently being considered to increase the volume of material to be excavated and time of operation (a three-year extension to April 1, 2025). Staff is recommending fencing for security, responsible for maintaining and improving Little Neck Road, and a 75 foot undisturbed buffer. The staff report outlines additional specific conditions.

### **Motion**

The MPC staff recommends Approval of the proposed Amended General Development Plan subject to conditions identified in the staff report.

# Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Travis Coles Second: Wayne Noha

Ellis Cook - Aye

Joseph Ervin - Not Present

W. Lee Smith - Aye

Roberto Hernandez - Not Present

Linder Suthers - Aye
Tom Woiwode - Aye
Travis Coles - Aye

Joseph Welch	- Not Present
Tommy Branch	- Aye
Lacy Manigault	- Not Present
Tanya Milton	- Aye
Karen Jarrett	- Aye
Eula Parker	- Aye
Wayne Noha	- Aye

#### X. Presentations

### **XI. Other Business**

# XII. Adjournment

# 15. Adjourn

There being no further business to present before the Board, the June 4, 2019 Regular Metropolitan Planning Commission Meeting adjourned at 3:04 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Melanie Wilson Executive Director

MW/bf

# XIII. Development Plans Submitted for Review

16. Development Plans Submitted for Review

June 4th MPC Meeting Development Log.pdf

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.