

Savannah - Chatham County Historic Site & Monument Commission

Virtual Meeting June 4, 2020 - 4:00 P.M. MINUTES

JUNE 4, 2020 SAVANNAH - CHATHAM COUNTY HISTORIC SITE & MONUMENT COMMISSION

Members Present: Dr. Nicholas Henry, Chair

Kristopher Monroe, Vice-Chairman

Thomas Gensheimer

Sean Mannion Lisa Watson

MPC Staff Present: Leah Michalak, Director of Historic Preservation

Ryan Jarles, Cultural Resources Planner Bri Morgan, Administrative Assistant

I. Call to Order and Welcome

II. Approval of Meeting Minutes

1. Approve MARCH 5, 2020 Meeting Minutes

Ø 03.05.20 MEETING MINUTES.pdf

Motion

Approve March 5, 2020 Meeting Minutes as presented.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Sean Mannion

Second: Kristopher Monroe

Thomas Gensheimer - Aye
Dr. Nicholas Henry - Aye
Kristopher Monroe - Aye
Sean Mannion - Aye
Lisa D. Watson - Aye

III. Regular Agenda

2. Petition of Alan Boulton, Paradise Park-Oakhurst President | 20-002311-HM | 202 Chatham Street | Park

Naming Request

- ∅ 20-002311-HM Recommendation.pdf
- Harmon Creek Park Naming Request 051420.pdf
- @ AERIAL MAP 20-002311-HM.pdf

Mr. Ryan Jarles presented the request to name an unnamed park, located at 202 Chatham Street within the 4th District to "Harmon Creek Park".

The proposed location for the park is within (10) contiguous lots, and their canal easements bordering Atwood Street, Chatham Street, and Kandlewood Street. These lots were purchased by the City of Savannah under FEMA grants due to historical flooding issues, and therefore cannot be utilized for the construction of residences or other building types. The name of the park being "Harmon Creek Park" will strengthen the neighborhood identity and commemorate the place to which it is named after (the 'canal' that runs through the area of land is historically named 'Harmon Creek'). The proper considerations set forth by the Historic Site and Monument Commission Guidelines for Markers, Monuments and Public Art were made, as well as all application and review process requirements.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Joe Shearouse, City of Savannah, stated the name of the park was to reflect the natural features of the area, as it was unanimously agreed up by the neighborhood association. It will not have active equipment, as it will be a passive park at this time. It does not resemble any other City location in name. He stated he would research the origin of "Harmon".

Mr. Alan Bolton, association president, stated the park is backs up to Bartlett Middle School. The purpose is try to suppress crime in the area, which has been successful. The Fourth Precinct agreed to add extra patrolling in the area.

There was no public comment.

BOARD COMMENTS

The Board was complimentary of the petition.

Motion

The HSMC Board motioned to approve the request to name the park located at 202 Chatham Street "Harmon Creek Park" because the application meets all the standards.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas Gensheimer Second: Kristopher Monroe

Thomas Gensheimer - Aye
Dr. Nicholas Henry - Aye

Kristopher Monroe	- Aye
Sean Mannion	- Aye
Lisa D. Watson	- Aye

3. Petition of Alexa Frame | 20-001541-PA | 711 Wheaton Street | Murals

- Context Photo.pdf
- @ AERIAL MAP 20-001541-PA.pdf
- Mural_Wheaton Street UPDATE.pdf
- Comment from Neighbor.pdf
- @20-001541-PA Recommendation.pdf
- Member of public Comment.pdf

Mr. Ryan Jarles presented the applicant's request of an after-the-fact approval for the installation of a mural on the CMU wall located at 711 Wheaton Street and approval for a mural concept at 711 Wheaton Street. The after-the-fact mural is a "Panhandle Slim" mural and is painted onto a previously painted non-historic wall. The mural concept is to include a series of murals to be located on primarily interior facing walls within the storage facility and will be minimally visible from the public right-of-way. The series of murals is to be a community engagement piece working with residents from the area through local artists such as Scott Stanton, Jose Ray, Charles Boniface, and organizations (such as Loop It Up) to work with local students and veterans to assist the art direction of the muralist. The theme of the after-the-fact mural is described by the applicant as being a portrait of Amelia Boynton Robinson including a quote stating "A vote less people is a hopeless people. Remember, this is your day and your world."

The "mural requirements" sets forth by the applicant for the proposed mural concepts are to be chosen using "general color blocking schemes, natural scenic pieces local to Savannah and a selection of Historical Savannah Figures such as Amelia Boynton, Flannery O'Connor, Johnny Mercer, W.W. Law, and Tomochichi. The after-the-fact mural complies with the Georgia obscenity laws, and no obscene content is proposed within the additional mural concepts. The murals do not advertise any illegal activities under the laws of Georgia or the United States. The after-the-fact mural, as well as the proposed mural concepts are to be located on non-historic painted CMU walls. The proposed locations for the mural concepts are within he property on interior facing walls and will be minimally visible from the street. The area of which the murals are/are to be located is one that is primarily commercial featuring large single-color painted walls with very little historic resources and very little art. The after-the-fact mural and the proposed mural concepts add visually interesting features to a portion of the City of Savannah that for the most part does not hold a visual interest for the public. The after-the-fact mural and mural concepts are to be located within a commercial area. One letter of support was received from a neighboring business owner. The murals will be sited far enough away from other murals as to allow proper appreciation of it and will be minimally visible from the public right-of-way.

The scale of the after-the-fact mural is approximately 11'-0" in width and 7'-6" in height and the proposed mural concepts are to vary between 50'-0" by 7'-6" and 11'-0" by 5'-0". The proposed dimensions are appropriate to the building and the site and the after-the-fact mural and mural concepts are of original designs. The proposed paint types were not included within the submittal. Staff has requested that the proposed paint types are of superior quality and are intended for exterior use, and that the murals are to have a weatherproof or vandalism resistant coating. The applicant provided works of similar size and has demonstrated the various artist's capabilities. The mural application was proposed at an earlier meeting; timing did not allow for the petitioner to provide public notice as required, thus it is now an after-the-fact petition.

Mr. Monroe stated the paint types and the coatings need to be done as soon as possible. That should have been a part of this from the beginning, and the involved parties should have been aware of this.

Mr. Mannion asked if he had a clear understanding that the mural was painted with full knowledge that it was not approved to move forward, and when was the last after-the-fact mural by Pan Handle Slim came before the Board. **Mr. Jarles** confirmed Mr. Mannion's understanding and stated he would research the date of the requested information.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Ms. Frame, petitioner, stated the mural is located near Hitch Village; set back from the road, behind fencing. The paint used was acrylic for exteriors and the protective coating used was Min-Wax acrylic varnish. Additional information can be obtained, and additional sealants can be applied if required. She took responsibility for the mural; there was miscommunication on her part. There are other murals in the area that the current and proposed murals compliment.

Ms. Watson asked if it will be continued with other artists.

Ms. Frame stated it will be as simplistic as possible, and is hopeful each theme will be complimentary by the other artists and students. **Ms. Watson** stated she can notify Mr. Jarles of additional sealants.

Mr. Mannion stated he has issue and frustration with the after-the-fact mural; the thought process to put it up without approval. He stated this is a recurring problem with this artist and he continually flagrantly disregards the City's ordinance. He only receives a slap on the wrist and this needs to stop. **Ms. Frame** accepted responsibility by stating it was a miscommunication on her part; she initially thought no approval was needed. Afterwards, she became ill and was not able to post the public notice signs in a timely manner. **Mr. Mannion** stated he does not like to punish petitioners for the artist's actions, however, it was blatantly done without approval and the artist is fully aware of the process. Ignorance is not the issue here. It still went on no matter what the circumstances were.

Mr. Henry agreed that it is a problem and needs to be addressed.

Mr. Gensheimer stated he is disturbed by this and knows the artist is very well aware. He doesn't know if its worth penalizing the petitioner. He asked how to penalize the artist.

Ms. Frame stated they want the art to look professional and it is a necessity to have an artist that can and is willing to work with students. It is important to her that children from the community are contributing artists; that will impact one of the pieces. **Mr. Mannion** asked if Pan Handle Slim will be used to complete the other murals. **Ms. Frame** stated it will be multiple artists.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Dietrich Leggett, alderman for the Second District, supports the mural as it adds character and a sense of hope. He stated he spoke with Ms. Wilder and they support the art as it complements both of their districts

Mr. Avril Stephenson and Ms. Linder Wilder Bryan were not able to connect through the web system. Mr. Jarles stated he would add their written statements to the file.

BOARD COMMENTS

Mr. Monroe suggested to discuss the artist's actions in another petition rather than this one. He believes the petitioner did everything right.

Ms. Watson stated perhaps this could be a good lesson for the children as to how things work: she would like a preliminary sketch of the mural. **Mr. Jarles** stated that is part of the conditions.

Mr. Mannion stated he is separating the issues; after-the-fact and the future murals. He regrets the one deserving of penalization cannot be.

Mr. Gensheimer stated he has no trouble approving the future mural. He is not sure how to discipline the artist.

Mr. Monroe motioned to separate the after-the-fact and the future mural. He asked if the after-the-fact was denied, would it have to be painted over. **Ms. Michalak** stated that is correct.

Motion

The HSMC Board motioned to approve the after-the-fact mural on the wall of 711 Wheaton Street with the following conditions because otherwise they meet all standards set forth within the Master Plan and Guidelines for Markers, Monuments, and Public Art.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Lisa D. Watson Second: Kristopher Monroe

Thomas Gensheimer

- Aye

Dr. Nicholas Henry	- Abstain
Kristopher Monroe	- Aye
Sean Mannion	- Nay
Lisa D. Watson	- Aye

Motion

The HSMC Board motioned to approve the mural concepts proposed at 711 Wheaton Street with the following conditions because otherwise they meet all standards set forth within the Master Plan and Guidelines for Markers, Monuments, and Public Art.

- 1. Provide staff with final mural designs to be reviewed and approved prior to installation.
- 2.Ensure that the proposed paint types are of superior quality and are intended for exterior use.
- 3. Ensure that the murals are to have a weatherproof or vandalism resistant coating.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas Gensheimer

Second: Sean Mannion

Thomas Gensheimer - Aye

Dr. Nicholas Henry - Abstain

Kristopher Monroe - Aye

Sean Mannion - Aye

Lisa D. Watson - Aye

- 4. Petition of Old Coast HVAC LLC | 20-002239-PA | 2200 Price Street | Mural
 - Mural App.pdf

 - Submittal Material.pdf
 - Mural photographs.pdf
 - @20-002239-PA Recommendation.pdf

Mr. Jarles presented the applicant's request for an after-the-fact approval for the installation of a mural on a CMU wall located at 2200 Price Street. The after-the-fact mural is painted onto a previously painted non-historic wall. The theme of the after-the-fact mural is described by the applicant as being an "atomic structure with vertical energy movement." The after-the-fact mural complies with the Georgia obscenity laws and does not advertise any illegal activities under the laws of Georgia or the United States. The after-the-fact mural is located on a non-historic painted CMU wall and does not cover or detract from any character defining features. The mural is located within a predominantly residential portion

of the City, however there are several commercial building within the neighborhood. The mural enhances a visually uninteresting non-historic white wall that would otherwise detract from the neighborhood and is located within a mixed-use area. No neighborhood support or opposition has been received by staff. The after-the-fact mural is located on a non-historic wall and there are no other murals within this block face, allowing for proper appreciation of the mural. The mural is proposed as having a vandalism resistant coating, however the specification for this coating is unknown to Staff. Staff requests that the vandalism resistant coating is provided to keep on file. The applicant provided works of similar size and has demonstrated the artist's capabilities.

Mr. Gensheimer asked the backstory of the mural; why did it not receive approval. **Mr. Jarles** stated its been there for multiple years; they've been notified by Code Enforcement that approval is necessary.

The petitioner was not present, but supported staff recommendation with vandalism conditions, per Mr. Jarles.

Ms. Watson and Mr. Mannion questioned if the hashtag on the mural was sort of business advertisement. Mr. Jarles stated it was not.

There were no public comments.

Motion

The HSMC motioned to approve the after-the-fact petition for the mural located at 2200 Price Street with the following condition that the weatherproof/vandalism resistant coating specification is provided to Staff to keep on file, because otherwise it meets all standards set forth within the Master Plan and Guidelines for Markers, Monuments, and Public Art, with the condition that the hashtag within the mural is not part of a business advertisement.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Sean Mannion

Second: Thomas Gensheimer

Thomas Gensheimer - Aye

Dr. Nicholas Henry - Abstain

Kristopher Monroe - Aye

Sean Mannion - Aye

Lisa D. Watson - Aye

5. Petition of Wells Anderson | 20-002240-PA | 660 East 39th Street | Mural

- @ AERIAL MAP 20-002240-COA.pdf
- @ APP 20-002240 660 E 39TH.pdf
- SUPP INFO 20-002240 660 East 39th Street.pdf

View From Street.pdf

Mr. Jarles presented the applicant's request for an after-the-fact approval for the installation of a mural on a CMU wall located at 660 East 39th Street. The after-the-fact mural is painted onto a previously painted CMU wall. The theme of the after-the-fact mural is described by the applicant as being a "Music and inspiration-based mural. It is designed to deliver a positive message for and to the community. It uses legendary musician Curtis Mayfield's image and classic quote from his 1971 hit song, *Move On Up*." quote being: "Move on up and keep on wishing. Remember your dream is your only scheme, so keep on pushing." The after-the-fact mural complies with the Georgia obscenity laws. The mural does not advertise any illegal activities under the laws of Georgia or the United States, painted CMU wall and does not cover or detract from any character defining features.

The mural is located within a predominantly residential portion of the City, however, is located upon a commercial building within the neighborhood. The mural enhances a visually uninteresting large green CMU wall that would otherwise detract from the neighborhood. The neighborhood the property is located in is zoned TR-1 and is a traditionally residential neighborhood, however, the building on which the mural is located upon is a pre-existing commercial building utilized as a business. No neighborhood support or opposition has been received by staff. The after-the-fact mural is located on a previously painted CMU wall and there are no other murals within this block face, allowing for proper appreciation of the mural. The scale of the after-the-fact mural is approximately 9'-0" in height and 11'-0" in width. The mural is located approximately 8 feet above the ground on the Atlantic Avenue façade. The proposed paint type was provided as being an oil based paint, covered in a polyurethane coating. The applicant provided works of similar size and has demonstrated the artist's capabilities.

Mr. Henry suggested recommending to City Council that fines be imposed upon non-conforming artists.

Ms. Watson stated its not fair to fine a person that repairs a wall without approval, yet the artist is not.

Mr. Monroe stated it be determined if the homeowner or the artist be fined.

The petitioner was not present nor were there any public comments.

Motion

The HSMC motioned to approve the after-the-fact petition for the mural located at 660 East 39th Street because it meets all standards set forth within the Master Plan and Guidelines for Markers, Monuments, and Public Art.

Vote Results (Approved)

Motion: Thomas Gensheimer

Second: Kristopher Monroe

Thomas Gensheimer - Aye

Dr. Nicholas Henry - Abstain

Kristopher Monroe - Aye

Sean Mannion - Nay

Lisa D. Watson - Aye

6. Petition of Tom Oxnard | 20-002264-PA | 742 East 39th Street | Mural

- Sanborn Maps.pdf
- @20-002264-PA Recommendation.pdf
- Suplemental info.pdf
- @application.pdf
- Mural Photographs.pdf
- @ AERIAL MAP 20-002264-COA .pdf

Mr. Jarles presented the applicant's request for an after-the-fact approval for the installation of a mural on a CMU wall located at 742 East 39th Street. The afterthe-fact mural is painted onto a previously painted CMU wall. The applicant provided the following statement regarding the theme of the mural: "The mural depicts lyrics from Louis Armstrong's song, 'What a Wonderful World.' I chose this particular song because it is one of my favorites and I love the message. The message is one of positivity and compassion for others." The after-the-fact mural complies with the Georgia obscenity laws and does not advertise any illegal activities under the laws of Georgia or the United States. The after-the-fact mural is located on a painted wood clapboard facade and does not cover or detract from any character defining features. Most of the mural is painted directly onto the wood clapboard siding, while the head of Louis Armstrong is affixed with screws into the siding. The mural is located within a predominantly residential portion of the City upon a street facing façade. Murals are an uncommon feature upon historic residential structures, specifically street facing facades, however historically this structure has always been utilized for commercial purposes up until at least the 1970s according to Sanborn Map research. The inclusion of a mural upon this building may increase the ability to differentiate the historic use of the structure without interfering with the historic character of the rest of the neighborhood. The property is in a TR-1 zone and is a traditionally residential neighborhood, however, the building on which the mural was historically utilized for commercial purposes. The inclusion of a mural upon this building may increase the ability to differentiate the historic use of the structure without interfering with the historic character of the rest of the neighborhood. No neighborhood support or opposition has been received by staff. There are no other murals within this block face, allowing for proper appreciation of the mural. The scale of the after-the-fact mural is approximately 5'-0" in height and 13'-5" in width. The mural is located approximately 9 feet above the ground on the Paulsen Street façade.

The Board comments were reserved for the petitioner.

PETITIONER COMMENTS

Mr. Tom Oxnard stated the head is being varnished and will be reinstalled within days, if approved. He stated he was not aware approval was needed when installed in 2018.

Ms. Watson asked if the head is on weather-treated wood. Mr. Oxnard replied yes and both sides will be coated. He stated the artist did not inform that approval was needed.

Mr. Monroe asked if there was discussion regarding approval. **Mr. Oxnard** said no; he'd read things in the paper but thought it only applied to murals within the Historic District. **Mr. Monroe** stated it's not a complicated process and a discussion needs to be had about it.

Ms. Watson suggested using galvanized screws to reinstall the head.

There were no public comments.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Mannion stated this puts all in a bad situation. He stated it cannot continue to happen. Many issues are created with the non-compliance; what if a person is hurt from the head falling off because it's not attached properly. This cannot be continued to be allowed to happen.

Mr. Gensheimer stated beautification is not the issue. The issue is that the artist knew the process in 2018 and chose to ignore it; he worked with him personally. He regrets it penalizes the homeowner, however this time there was even effort made to do the right thing in regard to this project.

Motion

The HSMC Board motioned to approve the after-the-fact petition for the mural located at 660 East 39th Street with the following condition because otherwise it meets all standards set forth within the Master Plan and Guidelines for Markers, Monuments, and Public Art.

- 1. Ensure that a weatherproof and vandalism resistant coating is applied to the mural.
- Mr. Oxnard stated it does not seem fair that the petition prior to him was approved though the petitioner was not present.
- Mr. Mannion stated he understands Mr. Oxnard's frustration, however, the wrong cannot continue.
- Ms. Watson stated she voted 'no' was because of lack of structural integrity.
- Mr. Gensheimer stated the other petition appeared to have intent to follow the process, whereas this petition showed no intent to adhere to the process.

Vote Results (Rejected)

Motion: Kristopher Monroe Second: Sean Mannion

Thomas Gensheimer - Nay

Dr. Nicholas Henry - Abstain

Kristopher Monroe - Aye

Sean Mannion - Nay

Lisa D. Watson - Nay

IV. Other Business

V. Adjournment

7. Next Regular Meeting - July 2, 2020 at 4pm - Location TBD

8. Adjourned

There being no further business to present before the Board, the June 4, 2020 HSMC meeting was adjourned at 5:55 .pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Leah Michalak Director of Historic Preservation

/bm

The Chatham County - Savannah Metropolitan Planning Commission provides meeting minutes which are adopted by the respective Board. Verbatim transcripts of minutes are the responsibility of the interested party.