SAVANNAH
savannahga.gov

Planning &
Urban Design

I, Bridget Lidy, Director of Planning and Urban Development Department of the City of Savannah, Georgia, do hereby certify this to be a true and correct copy of the Certificate of Appropriateness #18-002642-COA for 2115 Bull Street (Starland Village Multi-Family North) dated October 12, 2018, pages 1 through 14.

Signed,
October 17, 2018

Bridget Lidy, Director
Planning and Urban Design

P.O. BOX 1027, SAVANNAH, GA 31402
Phone: 912-651-6530 TDD: 912-651-6702 Fax: 912-651-6543 www.savannahga.gov

CITY OF SAVANNAH
MID-CITY
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

PETITIONER:	**Lynch Associates Architects** **409 East Liberty Street** **Savannah, GA 31401**
FILE NO.:	**18-002642-COA**
PROPERTY ADDRESS:	**2115 Bull Street (Starland Village Multi-Family North)**
PIN:	**2-0065 -29-007**
ZONING:	**TC-1 (with CIV exceptions)**
STAFF REVIEWER:	**Bridget Lidy**
DATE:	**October 12, 2018**

NATURE OF REQUEST:
The applicant is requesting approval for demolition of a non-contributing building and construction of a new five-story building on the three properties located at 2115 Bull Street. The site is surrounded by streets on three sides – Bull Street to the east, West 38th Street to the south, and De Soto Avenue to the west. The new building is known as "Building 4" on the applicant's architectural site plan. It will contain multi-family residential with structured parking; it will have a ground floor area of approximately 16,650 square feet. Its height is proposed to be 55 feet-11 inches; the elevator overrun extends above this height. The lot coverage will be 96.5 percent.

This building is one part of a larger proposed development called "Starland Village." The development is a total of five buildings; two of which are existing buildings – Epworth Church (Building 1) and its associated educational facility (Building 2). Buildings 1, 2, 3, and 5 are under separate COA applications [File Nos. 18-003483-COA, 18-002641-COA, 18-002644-COA, and 18-002645-COA].

On April 12, 2018, City Council adopted an amendment to the Mid-City zoning ordinance [File No. 18-000592-ZA]. The amendment focuses on changes to the CIV zoning district which specifically apply to each PIN within this project site.

FINDINGS:
Historically, this site contained three, 2-story, wood, single-family, residential buildings facing Bull Street with 2-story dwelling/garage buildings along De Soto Avenue. By 1954, one of these buildings had been changed to a Rooming House and by 1973 all three buildings had been demolished and replaced with the current building and associated parking lot.

The surrounding historic context consists of two-story wood residential buildings with a large portion of their lots uncovered (typically 40-50 percent undeveloped). Types of commercial buildings vary, but the vast majority of contributing commercial are either 1-story single store

buildings or a commercial use within a two-story wood building. Historic civic and institutional buildings are primarily located along Bull Street and have larger footprints covering 70-80 percent of their lots; these buildings are all typically 1-2 stories as well, however, because they are civic and institutional buildings they are monumental buildings with very tall floor-to-floor heights and other elements, such as spires, that make them even taller. It is appropriate for monumental buildings to have larger footprints, cover more of their lots, and be taller than their surrounding residential and commercial context because they are public buildings and should dominant the hierarchy of architecture in any urban environment.

The following standards from the Mid-City Zoning Ordinance (Article K) of the City of Savannah Zoning Ordinance apply:

> ***Demolition and relocation of structures.*** *In accordance with the purpose of this district, the VCO and the MPC, where requested, shall review all requests for the demolition of contributing structures or the relocation of structures into, within, and out of Mid-City.*

The existing building was most recently a City of Savannah Police Sub-Station and was constructed in 1964; it is listed as non-contributing on the Mid-City Historic Buildings Map. It was built between 1954-1973 as two store spaces and appears to be mostly intact from its original construction. The Period of Significance for the Thomas Square District ends in 1935; staff does not feel that this building contributes to the historic character of the neighborhood.

> **Visual Compatibility Criteria.** Development or redevelopment activity shall be considered compatible with the contributing structures to which the structure is visually related in terms of the following requirements.
>
> > **Height.** The height of proposed structures shall be visually compatible with contributing structures on the same block face.
> >
> > **Proportion of Building's Front Façade.** The relationship of the width of the structure to the height of the front elevation shall be visually compatible with contributing structures to which it is visually related.

The height of the building and the proportions of the front façade are visually related to and compatible with the contributing structure located directly adjacent to this site, namely the former Epworth United Methodist Church. The building is within one story of the existing height of the former church and does not exceed any of the height or area development standards of the current zoning adopted by City Council specifically for the property within the project site.

Materials and step backs were included in the design of the building to lessen the impact of the overall height and proportions of the front façade. The building employs multiple terrace setbacks of five feet and ten feet along with roof line variation at the 3rd, 4th and rooftop penthouse level to breakdown the overall project mass and create the effect of a lower building. The building setbacks and roof line variation coincide with material changes to further breakdown the building mass into smaller volumes. The Bull Street elevation relates directly to the vertical proportions of the former church and its tower elements. Additionally, the scale of

the arched central portion of the building entry relates to a similar entry feature of the former church building.

> **Proportion of Openings Within the Facility.** The relationship of the width of the windows to height of windows in a building shall be visually compatible with contributing structures to which the structure is visually related.

The proportions of the openings are visually compatible. Throughout the building, aluminum clad, double hung casement type windows are proposed which taller than wide.

> **Rhythm of Buildings on Street.** The relationship of a structure to the open space between it and adjacent structures shall be visually compatible with the open spaces between contributing structures to which it is visually related.

The open spaces between this building and adjacent structures is visually compatible. Similar contributing buildings (apartment and monumental buildings) tend to extend lot line to lot line with little space between it and adjacent structures.

> **Rhythm of Entrance and Porch Projection.** Entrances, porch projections and walkways to the proposed structure shall be visually compatible with contributing structures to which they are visually related.

The intent of the rhythm of entrances and porch projections are visually compatible for this residential structure.

> **Relationship of Materials, Texture.** The relationship of materials, texture and color of the facade of a structure shall be visually compatible with the predominate materials used on contributing structures to which it is visually related.

The relationship of materials, texture is visually compatible. Materials proposed on this building are brick, stucco with a sand finish, smooth stucco with coursing (to appear as stone), cementitious composite shiplap siding, large expanses of glass, metal awnings, metal louvered screens, and aluminum clad windows and doors.

The frequent change in materials occur at vertical intervals is used to break down the large scale of the building; the joints between different exterior building materials are horizontal and continue around the corners of the building.

> **Roof Shapes.** The roof shape of a building shall be visually compatible with contributing structures to which it is visually related.

The roof shapes are visually compatible. The main roof has 3 foot high parapet walls; this is a common feature on contributing buildings. The 5th floor has roofs without a parapet wall and a minimal overhang; the applicant provided mid-century building examples within this district that have similar flat roof configurations.

Scale of a Building. The mass of a structure, and the size of window and door openings, porches and balconies shall be visually compatible with contributing structures to which they are visually related.

Generally, there is an architectural cohesiveness in the overall building. The intent of the design is to break up the large scale of the building through the use of a variety of materials.

Development Standards.

On April 12, 2018, City Council adopted an amendment to the Mid-City zoning ordinance [File No. 18-000592-ZA]. The amendment focuses on changes to the CIV zoning district which specifically apply to each PIN within this project site. Although this site is still zoned TC-1, some CIV standards now apply as can be seen below.

(1) **Civic and Institutional (CIV) District.** The CIV District is intended to provide for civic and institutional district uses that serve a large area or produce insensitive activities not readily assimilated into other districts.

(b) All commercial uses listed in table Sec. 8-3215(2)(a) shall be permitted only when associated with a public or civic facility except as provided in 8-3215(6).

Multi-family residential was added as a permitted use in the table as part of the April 2018 ordinance amendments.

(6) **Redevelopment of CIV District Parcels with Civic and Institutional Uses.**
To encourage the re-use of parcels with contributing buildings originally-designed for religious or education-related uses, it may be desirable to allow for flexibility with regards to principal uses and development standards for such parcels and associated or adjacent parcels, when appropriate. Because these parcels are unique as to their location and surroundings, the extent to which flexibility may be allowed must be considered on an individual parcel basis. Associated and adjacent parcels may be included provided that their development or redevelopment is related to the parcel with the contributing building. Parcels include:

(a) **Former Epworth Methodist Church.**

iii. For the parcels with the parcel identification number of **2-0065 -21-007**, or any recombination thereof, the TC-1 principal uses and standards shall apply with the following exceptions:

Multi-family is permitted as a principal use.

(1) The ground floor area and residential density shall be the same as permitted by the CIV district.

The ground floor area permitted by the CIV district is not specifically identified and is, therefore, unlimited. The ground floor area is approximately 16,650 square feet and the lot coverage will be 96.5 percent.

(2) There shall be no minimum street or rear yard setbacks.

The setbacks are not dimensioned on the architectural site plan. The west and south setbacks appear to be zero feet, the east appears to be approximately 3 feet, and the front façade (east) setback varies from approximately 3 feet to zero feet with stoops projecting into the public right-of-way.

(3) Maximum building height shall be 5 stories, 58 feet maximum.

The height is proposed to be 55 feet-6 inches to the top of the flat roof; the elevator overrun and mechanical screening extend above the flat roof; however, per Section 8-3052 of the ordinance height limitations do not apply to "necessary mechanical appurtenances."

Traditional Commercial - Neighborhood (TC-1) District. The TC-1 District is intended to ensure the vibrancy of historic mixed use neighborhoods with traditional development patterns characteristic of Savannah from 1890 to 1930 during the streetcar and early automobile era. The district provides for commercial areas that are developed at a mass and scale harmonious with nearby residential neighborhoods.

Site.

Lot Area. 2,200 square feet minimum for attached residential.
3,000 square feet minimum for all other uses.

The lot area is approximately 16,650 square feet.

Lot Width. 30 feet minimum.

The lot is 149 feet-3 inches wide.

Building Frontage. 70% of lot width minimum (for lots less than 31 feet in width, provide either a five foot setback or 70% minimum building frontage)

The building frontage exceeds 70 percent of the lot width.

Height.

Floor Height. **Ground floor:** 13 feet minimum.

The standard is met. The ground floor height (floor-to-floor) is proposed to be 13 feet.

Upper floors: 9 feet minimum.

The standard is met. The second and third floors are 10'-7", the fourth floor is 11'-1½", and the 5th floor is 10'-1½".

Ground Floor Elevation.

Residential ground floor: 30 inches minimum, including slab construction.

The standard is not met. The ground floor elevation is proposed to be 24 inches. A variance is required.

Neighborhood Design Standards.

The intent of these standards is not to copy the architectural design of the past, but to create a set of contemporary standards that protect existing residential neighborhoods, address the existing character of commercial areas and reinforce the idea of a walkable community.

In order to convey a sense of place, buildings should be prominent in relation to the accommodation of vehicles, and should be situated in a manner consistent with historic development patterns. To promote pedestrian activity on both residential and commercial streets, buildings should be aligned and close to the streets they face.

Building height and vertical proportions of buildings should be in context with contributing structures in the same or adjacent block faces. The mass of the building should be broken-down both horizontally and vertically to convey a sense of human scale and visual interest that reflects the traditional size of buildings.

New construction, including accessory structures, shall comply with all of the standards of this section.

Where a material change in the exterior appearance of any existing building by addition, reconstruction or alteration is proposed, such change shall be consistent with the intent of each section below.

Foundations. Foundations that match the traditional pattern of construction in height and materials complement the craftsmanship of existing construction. The visual impression of separate piers is important to the look of traditional construction in the area.

Foundation Construction.
Piers that are constructed of brick, stone or stucco over concrete block are encouraged on new construction.

Slab-on-grade foundations shall be allowed for new construction, provided they meet the minimum elevation requirements for the district.

The foundation is slab-on-grade; it is continuous and not designed to resemble piers. This is typical of foundations on contributing apartment buildings within the district.

> The crawl space area, if any, between the ground and the foundation shall be filled in with wood lattice, brick or stone, but shall not obscure the piers.
>
> Concrete block foundation walls may be installed between the piers, provided the walls are recessed at least three inches behind the front edge of the piers. Such foundation walls shall be stuccoed and painted black or dark green.
>
> Heavy-duty wood lattice, with at least 1/2 inch thick lattice boards, may be installed between the piers provided it is recessed at least three inches behind the front edge of the piers and is stained with a solid color stain.
>
> All of the forms of underpinning described above shall accentuate, rather than obscure, the piers, by recessing at least three inches behind the front edge of the pier.

No crawl space is proposed and, therefore, no piers or pier underpinning is proposed.

> **Exterior Building Walls.** Exterior building walls should reflect and complement the traditional materials and construction techniques of Savannah's historic regional architecture. Simple configuration and solid craftsmanship are favored over complexity in building form.
>
> > **Prohibited Materials.** Exterior building walls on all new structures or additions to existing structures shall not be constructed of the following materials:
> >
> > Corrugated metal; or
> >
> > Unpainted, exposed concrete block walls, not including rusticated split-face or architectural profile masonry block.

None of these prohibited materials are proposed.

> > **Configuration.** The following exterior building wall configurations and techniques shall be permitted.
> >
> > > **Walls.**
> > >
> > > Blank wall areas shall not exceed 15 feet in vertical direction and 30 feet in the horizontal direction along any street.

The standard is met along all three streets.

> Joints between different exterior building materials shall be horizontal and continue around corners except for towers, chimneys, and piers.

The standard is met. The joints between different exterior building materials change and occur horizontally and continue around corners.

Wood Simulation Materials.

> Materials shall be horizontal in configuration (lap siding).
>
> Materials shall be of a smooth or rough-sawn finish.

The standards are met.

Building Entrances.

> Building entrances shall face the primary street on which the structure is located (normally, the street from which it takes its address).

The standard is met. The main pedestrian entrance is located on Bull Street which is the street from which the building takes its address.

> There shall be a public building entrance along the primary street at intervals no greater than 50 feet, unless otherwise approved by the Design Administrator.

The intent of the standard is met. The one primary street is Bull Street and two additional entrances (not accessible to the public) are proposed on a façade that is 145 feet wide.

> Building entrances on corner lots shall be either oriented in the same direction as entrances of adjacent buildings or oriented toward the corner of the lot.

The standard is met. This is a corner lot; the primary entrance is located on Bull Street which is the same direction as entrances of adjacent buildings.

> Double-height or two-story entrances shall not be permitted.

The standard is met.

> Doors shall be of glass, wood, clad wood or steel.

Doors are proposed to be aluminum clad wood.

Front Porches. Front porches or covered or uncovered stoops shall be required on all entrances for new ground floor residential construction and redevelopment in accordance with the following requirements.

Single-Family and Two-Family. A front porch a minimum of six feet in depth shall be required over a minimum of 50 percent of the building width.

All Other Residential. A stoop extending a minimum of four feet in depth and six feet in width shall be required.

The standard is met. Uncovered stoops are provided at four of the residential entrances along the Bull Street façade; they are each 4'-4" deep and 10'-6" wide.

Front porches and stoops may encroach into the required street yard.

The front stoops encroach into the public right-of-way.

Front porches shall not be enclosed in any manner. Side and rear porches may be screened with fine wire mesh, lattice, or shutters.

The standard is met.

Awnings.

Awnings extending above public sidewalks or other public walkways shall be a minimum of ten feet above the street level.

Residential awnings shall be constructed of canvas, cloth or equivalent. Non-residential awnings may be constructed of canvas, other equivalent cloth, or metal or glass.

The standard is met. A cloth awning that extends above the public sidewalk is proposed above the main entrance on the front façade; it is more than ten feet above the street level.

Awnings shall be integrated structurally and architecturally into the design of the façade.

The following shall be prohibited:
Mansard awnings (awnings that cover more than 85 percent of the length of a facade or those that connect two facades).
Back-lit (internally lit) awnings.

The standards are met.

Windows and Doors. Correct use of windows and doors can enhance pedestrian activity at the street level and can provide a sense of rhythm in the architectural form

of both residential and nonresidential buildings. Nonresidential buildings with ground floor storefronts should provide a higher level of transparency and access for connection of outside and interior activities.

Residential Façades. Residential façades visible from the public right-of-way (not public lanes) shall incorporate transparent features (windows and doors) over at least 30 percent of the ground floor façade.

The standard is met. The Bull Street façade has 47%, the De Soto Avenue façade has 50%, and the West 38th Street façade has 31%.

Materials.

Window casings and screens on front façades and on sides where visible from the street (not including public lanes) shall be made of metal, wood, or clad wood material.

Window glass shall be transparent with no dark tints or mirror effects.

All windows are proposed to be aluminum clad wood and it appears that all glass is clear and transparent.

Where shutters are used, they shall consist of a durable wood species or PVC as approved by the Design Administrator.

No shutters are proposed.

Configuration. The following configurations are permitted.

All Windows. The following shall apply to all windows on building elevations visible from the street.

Windows shall be taller than they are wide, except for accent windows, which may be round or other shapes.

The standard is met. All windows are taller than they are wide.

Windows shall be single-hung, double-hung, awning or casement.

The standard is met. Double hung and casement type windows are proposed.

For residential façades, no large, single-pane, "picture window" panes of glass shall be permitted where visible from a public right-of-way (not including public lanes).

The standard is met. Double hung and casement type windows are proposed as well as French doors.

Storefront Display Windows. The following shall apply to all storefront display windows.

Displays, shelving and signs shall cover no more than 15 percent of the total window area within three feet of the window's surface, unless display, shelving or signage is transparent.

Single panes of glass shall be no larger than six feet vertically by four feet horizontally.

The standards do not apply. Storefront is proposed in several locations on the 5th floor; however, it is not a display/retail area.

Roofs. Roof forms should be designed to provide visual interest and coherence in a manner that is consistent with contributing structures.

Material. Roofs that are visible from the public street shall be constructed of the following materials:
Clay or concrete tile;
Standing seam (but not corrugated) metal;
Slate or equivalent synthetic; or
Asphalt or similar shingles.

None of the roof materials will be visible from the public street.

Configuration. The following configurations are permitted.

Buildings with frontage on Bull Street or Victory Drive may have a roof pitch of less than 4:12 when screened by a parapet wall a minimum of 24 inches high above the roof surface.

The standard is not met for the 5th floor flat roof which is 12 inches and less than the required 24 inches. A variance is required.

Skylights, roof decks, pergolas and roof vents are permitted only on the roof plane opposite the street-facing façade, or when screened from street view.

The 5th floor roof decks are screened from street view.

Mechanical Equipment. Mechanical equipment visible from the street increases visual clutter. The correct placement of equipment, screened and out of view, enhances the visual character of the area.

Air compressors, mechanical pumps, water heaters, water softeners, utility meters, utility boxes, air conditioners and other similar types of equipment shall be placed in rear and side yards, and screened from view if visible from the street.

Electrical meters are proposed on the De Soto Avenue façade.

Roof mounted equipment shall be screened from street view by a parapet wall.

The intent of the standard is met. The roof-mounted HVAC equipment is proposed to be screened with metal mesh, not a parapet wall. The 5th floor has a flat roof.

Parking. To create and protect contiguous, active pedestrian street fronts, parking areas should be located to the side and rear of structures.

Location. No parking area or parking structure shall be allowed in any required street yard.

The structured parking is not within the required street yard setback.

Parking Spaces. The following minimum space requirements may be met on-site or off-site, provided long-term access to any off-site spaces can be demonstrated.

The number of parking spaces for buildings with both residential and nonresidential floor space shall be determined by calculating the total floor area for each use separately and then applying the appropriate minimum and maximum requirements.

Residential Use. Minimum one space per 1,000 square feet of floor area. Maximum one space per 500 square feet of floor area if located on-site.

The standard is met. Per the information provided by the applicant, the building (not including the structured parking) has a floor area of 68,972 square feet. 69 parking spaces are provided.

Parking Structures.

This section shall apply only to a stand-alone parking structure, not to a parking structure that is integrated into another principal structure, provided the parking structure does not dominate the principal structure.

This section does not apply to this building because the structured parking is within another principal structure and does not dominate said structure.

Parking Access. To enhance pedestrian activity, access and safety, the number of curb cuts should be kept to a minimum.

> Where a site has access by way of a rear lane, the lane shall be the sole means of vehicular access to the site.

The standard is not met. Although the site is surrounded on three sides by streets, De Soto Avenue acts as a lane and the sole means of vehicular access to the building should be from De Soto. Currently, access to the parking structure is proposed from West 38th Street; within several blocks of the site along West 38th Street access to parking does not exist from this street. East 38th Street does have parking access; however, it does not align with West 38th Street and the character of East 38th Street is different than this location. A variance must be secured.

> On Bull Street and Victory Drive, new curb cuts shall be limited to one curb cut per 100 feet of street frontage.

No curb cuts are proposed on Bull Street.

> **Lighting.** Lighting shall be designed in a consistent and coordinated manner. Lighting fixtures should be integrated and designed to blend into the surrounding landscape.

No specifications or details were provided with the submittal packet.

VARIANCE

The applicant is requesting three variances.

1. The first variance is from the residential ground floor elevation of 30 inches including slab construction to 24 inches.
2. The second variance is from the building configuration which requires buildings with frontage on Bull Street or Victory Drive may have a roof pitch of less than 4:12 when screened by a parapet wall a minimum of 24 inches height above the roof surface to a 12 inch height.
3. The third variance is from the site having access by way of a rear lane (De Soto Avenue), where the lane shall be the sole means of vehicular access to the site to having access to De Soto Avenue and 38th Street.

Variances. *Where a variance to a requirement in the Mid-City Zoning District, or to a measurable standard in Mid-City Use Regulations is proposed, it shall be reviewed by the Board of Appeals in accordance with Article H. No use variances shall be considered.*

Staff recommends approval of the following variances:

1. The first variance is from the residential ground floor elevation of 30 inches including slab construction to 24 inches. This represents a six inch reduction from the required 30 inch minimum height requirement, so the variance is appropriate.
2. The second variance to reduce the parapet wall to 12 inches is supported.

3. The third variance will need to be vetted by Traffic Engineering to determine the safest access for the building based on the traffic impact analysis and other standards.

DECISION:

Approval for demolition of a non-contributing building and construction of a new five-story building on the three properties located at 2115 Bull Street which is visually compatible.

Staff requests specification on lighting and signage.

Because otherwise the work is visually compatible and meets the standards.

Recommend approval to the ZBA to allow:

1. **a reduction in the residential ground floor elevation from 30 inches to 24 inches;**
2. **a reduction in the parapet wall from 24 inches to 12 inches; and**
3. **access from both 38th Street and DeSoto Avenue contingent upon a recommendation from Traffic Engineering to determine the safest access for the building based on the traffic impact analysis and other standards.**

Roberto Hernandez **Date**
City Manager

This decision will expire on October 12, 2019.

****Petitioner may be required to obtain a building permit and/or encroachment agreement in addition to the Certificate of Appropriateness. (Note: Prior to the issuance of the building permit, both sets of plans submitted for the permit must display the Certificate of Appropriateness stamp certifying that they are consistent with the approved plans. It is the Petitioner's responsibility to submit plans for a permit to the Director of Planning and Urban Design for the Certificate of Appropriateness stamp.)**

****The Certificate of Appropriateness approval card must be posted at all times during construction in a location next to the building permit card and clearly visible to the public.**